

This is very helpful indeed Jenny, thank you for being so clear and direct. I've forwarded onto lawyers too.

I would like to explicitly capture your personal views on the policy in the submission – would you be happy that the summary in yellow broadly reflects your thinking on this? Is there any of your other particular concerns you'd like me to highlight to help Ministers make their decision?

Julie

---

**From:** Harries, Jenny <[Jenny.Harries@dhsc.gov.uk](mailto:Jenny.Harries@dhsc.gov.uk)>

**Sent:** 15 February 2021 22:34

**To:** Laughton, Julie <[Julie.Laughton@dhsc.gov.uk](mailto:Julie.Laughton@dhsc.gov.uk)>; [Name Redacted] [Name Redacted]

**Cc:** [Name Redacted] [Name Redacted] Miller, Stuart <[Stuart.Miller@dhsc.gov.uk](mailto:Stuart.Miller@dhsc.gov.uk)>;

[Name Redacted] [Name Redacted] [Name Redacted] [Name Redacted]

**Subject:** RE: FOR 10 AM - Off sen - Submission - mandating vaccination in care homes

Julie

I have been quite outspoken on the attached. I am hugely supportive of getting care homes protected but I have seen no evidence to suggest that this policy is going to result in more benefit than harm. My personal gut feeling (agreed not a scientific parameter!) is that it is hugely risky with the workforce we are dealing with in areas with the most deprivation and likely issues with attracting staff.

I have added lots of tracked comments:

- Coverage: we actually cant measure this effectively at the moment so it is not sensible to be legislating for a quantum we cant measure. The important percentage is *within* a care home protection NOT the total workforce across England or even a region, although regional differences will provide some clues
- I am not legally trained but I carry huge reservations that most of the suggested criteria on which mandation would be based could reasonably be met within the current context of new vaccine, unclear effectiveness, religious freedoms, definition of an appropriate offer, timeframe, comparisons for handling other diseases etc etc
- Of most significance is my concern on potential racial 'antagonism' when such a large proportion of the workforce in critical areas are from minority ethnic backgrounds and particularly when low rates of uptake are not being addressed in this way in doctors and nurses. So the black African GP that visits the care home does not need to be vaccinated but the care worker does...I cant see this holding legal water. Most of all I am concerned about the impact on wider vaccine uptake and subsequent health inequalities. If Covid goes well we could boost vaccine uptake for ethnic minorities in all communities and gain years of life now and in the future. If it goes wrong we lose children and parents and the communities spiral down with ever increasing inequalitie

Apologies for late night, passionate public health professional rant but you will get the drift  
In short I don't think we can measure it and.

LAP

LAP