

Message

**From:** Orford, Rob (HSS - Primary Care & Health Science) [/O=EXCHANGELABS/OU=EXCHANGE ADMINISTRATIVE GROUP (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=7D38A628177A448789839F37A51FAF75-ORFORD, ROB]  
**Sent:** 18/10/2020 22:19:48  
**To:** [REDACTED] (OFM - WEFO) [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=815f30cb391548fbb78a7ef0afcec3d [REDACTED]  
**Subject:** Re: Official - Sensitive: Cabinet Agenda and Papers - Sunday 18 October, 16:00

Thanks [REDACTED]

Get [Outlook for iOS](#)

---

**From:** [REDACTED] (OFM - WEFO) [REDACTED]@gov.wales>  
**Sent:** Sunday, October 18, 2020 9:59:28 PM  
**To:** Orford, Rob (HSS - Primary Care & Health Science) <Rob.Orford@gov.wales>; Collins, Brendan (HSS - Finance) <Brendan.Collins001@gov.wales>; [REDACTED] (KAS) [REDACTED]@gov.wales>; Solomons, Craiger (KAS) <Craiger.Solomons@gov.wales>; Hoyle, Robert (ESNR- Science) <Robert.Hoyle@gov.wales>; [REDACTED] HSS - DHP - R&D [REDACTED]@gov.wales>; Bennee, Fliss (HSS-Technology, Digital & Transformation Directorate) <Fliss.Bennee@gov.wales>  
**Subject:** RE: Official - Sensitive: Cabinet Agenda and Papers - Sunday 18 October, 16:00

Hi Rob,

See below copied from SAGE paper last week from in case it helps:

- JBC data shows that incidence rates in 0 – 15 year olds are low. Higher incidence rates have been documented among older children and young adults. (16-29) In this age category, there is some evidence of increased incidence for 15-17 year olds, but this is dwarfed by incidence in 18-21 year olds.
- The increased incidence in these age groups may be caused by the social behaviours of this age group, with young people of this age having a wider network of contacts.
- Schools not being “fully open” seems to be associated with community incidence – possibly implying this is not driven by transmission within schools (weak evidence).
- The ONS testing data finds the highest prevalence of infection in School Year 12 – Age 24. The higher than expected prevalence in School 7 to 11 may provide some indication (low confidence) that a higher percentage of asymptomatic cases in older secondary school aged pupils. – but this has not led to any major outbreaks in schools
- There are limited indications that secondary schools and schools with certain characteristics are seeing bigger impacts (higher percentage of schools not being fully open) over recent weeks
- DfE will continue to investigate this as data improves (via better access to JBC testing data and the improved school attendance collection)
- The DHSC school infection survey will improve understanding of the role of schools in transmission.

From SAGE notes:

24. Evidence suggests that children and young people have a limited role in transmission of SARS-CoV-2, with very limited transmission from children in educational settings (medium confidence). The majority of available data relate to children of or below primary school age. Evidence for the role of children in transmission within households is more mixed.

25. Further studies are needed to understand the impact of activities and contact rates outside of school settings. Evidence suggests that mixing outside of the home during school closures continued to occur, despite guidance in place. Some studies highlighted more activities and contacts among older children, particularly those aged 16-18 years, compared to younger age groups.

Thanks,

NR

---

**From:** Orford, Rob (HSS - Primary Care & Health Science) <Rob.Orford@gov.wales>

**Sent:** 18 October 2020 21:32

**To:** Collins, Brendan (HSS - Finance) <Brendan.Collins001@gov.wales>; [NR] (KAS) <[NR]@gov.wales>; Solomons, Craiger (KAS) <Craiger.Solomons@gov.wales>; Hoyle, Robert (ESNR- Science) <Robert.Hoyle@gov.wales>;

[Name Redacted] (HSS - DHP - R&D) <[Name Redacted]@gov.wales>; Bennee, Fliss (HSS-Technology, Digital & Transformation Directorate) <Fliss.Bennee@gov.wales>; [NR] (OFM - WEFO) <[NR]@gov.wales>

[NR]@gov.wales>

**Subject:** FW: Official - Sensitive: Cabinet Agenda and Papers - Sunday 18 October, 16:00

Hi all, would welcome your thoughts on this action from Cabinet.

The question is unresolved e.g. should secondary school children (above yr7/8) be asked to stay in school and be looked after or be asked to stay at home and undertake blended learning... it will be discussed again tomorrow at 11am. So I need to be able to send an email or write a short note.. tbh I'm struggling!!

Looking at the England testing data – I would say there an argument for keeping older secondary school children at home... (yr 12-13 ages 17-18) and FE. With clear instruction to stay at home and do not mix either inside or outside. The other side would be how much adult mixing around, or because of secondary schools is there?

[NR] – is there any data on compliance and adherence in young people – I think they consistently get a bad rap!

Happy to discuss  
Rob

England data – older teenagers

<< OLE Object: Picture (Device Independent Bitmap) >>

---

**From:** Smithson, Thomas (OFM - Trade Policy) <Thomas.Smithson@gov.wales>

**Sent:** 18 October 2020 20:32

**To:** Orford, Rob (HSS - Primary Care & Health Science) <Rob.Orford@gov.wales>

**Subject:** RE: Official - Sensitive: Cabinet Agenda and Papers - Sunday 18 October, 16:00

Rob,

The discussion you may have missed parts of was:

## What is the relative impact on chains of transmission between secondary schools being open or closed to children from years 9, 10 and 11?

Arguments made in the meeting:

- These are older pupils (schools will be open for younger children) so likely to travel to school on their own (limited associated parental mixing). This would be unlikely to lead to greater parental mixing.
- Messages to parents and better social distancing will be needed in any case for schools as younger children will be attending.
- The school setting is a controlled environment so the time spent there may not be high risk in of itself.
- Not being in school, and with parents potentially not a home (e.g. if a key worker or not able to work from home), there may be a risk of these pupils meeting up with each other.
- These pupils may have a lot more free time if not under a school timetable which may lead to them engaging in riskier behaviour (e.g. meeting with friends).

The balance of harms and the impact on children, particularly those already facing disadvantage, means that Ministers would like to be clear there was a more than marginal benefit to keeping these pupils at home, even if just for a week.

Seems there is a question about the degree of compliance we might expect from children aged 13-16 to a stay at home request (and again that proportion may only be those that do not have parents working from home). Also a question about whether even if there was poor compliance by pupils, would it be worse in terms of the impact than sending them to school.

Regards,

Tom

Thomas Smithson

NR

- COVID-19 - Project Team

Llywodraeth Cymru / Welsh Government

Irrelevant & Sensitive

From: NR (OFM - Cabinet Division) NR @gov.wales>

Sent: 18 October 2020 17:53

To: Orford, Rob (HSS - Primary Care & Health Science) <Rob.Orford@gov.wales>; Bennee, Fliss (HSS-Technology, Digital & Transformation Directorate) <Fliss.Bennee@gov.wales>; Smithson, Thomas (OFM - Trade Policy) <Thomas.Smithson@gov.wales>

Cc: PS FirstMinister <PS.FirstMinister@gov.wales>; PS Minister Economy & Transport <PSMET@gov.wales>; PS Minister Education <PSME@gov.wales>; PS Minister Environment Energy and Rural Affairs <PSMEERA@gov.wales>; PS Minister Finance & Trefnydd <PSMFT@gov.wales>; PS Minister Health & Social Services <PSMHSS@gov.wales>; PS Minister Housing & Local Government <PSMHLG@gov.wales>; PS Minister Mental Health, Wellbeing and Welsh Language <PSMMHWWL@gov.wales>; PS Counsel General & Minister for European Transition <PS.CounselGeneral@gov.wales>; PS Deputy Minister & Chief Whip <psdmcw@gov.wales>; PS Deputy Minister Culture, Sport & Tourism



<[PSDMCST@gov.wales](mailto:PSDMCST@gov.wales)>; PS Deputy Minister Economy & Transport <[PSDMET@gov.wales](mailto:PSDMET@gov.wales)>; PS Deputy Minister Health & Social Services <[PSDMHSS@gov.wales](mailto:PSDMHSS@gov.wales)>; PS Deputy Minister Housing & Local Gov <[PSDMHLG@gov.wales](mailto:PSDMHLG@gov.wales)>; PS Permanent Secretary <[PS.PermanentSecretary@gov.wales](mailto:PS.PermanentSecretary@gov.wales)>; PS Chief Medical Officer <[PSChiefMedicalOfficer@gov.wales](mailto:PSChiefMedicalOfficer@gov.wales)>; Special Advisers <[Ps.Special.Advisers@gov.wales](mailto:Ps.Special.Advisers@gov.wales)>; Runeckles, Jane (OFM - Special Adviser) <[Jane.Runeckles@gov.wales](mailto:Jane.Runeckles@gov.wales)>; Whiteley, William (OFM - Cabinet Division) <[William.Whiteley@gov.wales](mailto:William.Whiteley@gov.wales)>; Morgan, Christopher W (OFM - Cabinet Division) <[Christopher.Morgan@gov.wales](mailto:Christopher.Morgan@gov.wales)>; Goodall, Andrew (HSS - DG - NHS Wales Chief Executive) <[Andrew.Goodall@Gov.Wales](mailto:Andrew.Goodall@Gov.Wales)>; Atherton, Frank (HSS - Chief Medical Officer) <[Frank.Atherton@gov.wales](mailto:Frank.Atherton@gov.wales)>; Clifford, Desmond (OFM - Director General) <[Desmond.Clifford@gov.wales](mailto:Desmond.Clifford@gov.wales)>; Burke, Tracey (EPS - Director General) <[Tracey.Burke@gov.wales](mailto:Tracey.Burke@gov.wales)>; Slade, Andrew (ESNR - Director General) <[Andrew.Slade@gov.wales](mailto:Andrew.Slade@gov.wales)>; Kilpatrick, Reg (EPS - LG Director) <[Reg.Kilpatrick@gov.wales](mailto:Reg.Kilpatrick@gov.wales)>; Brindley, Madeleine (OFM - Special Adviser) <[Madeleine.Brindley@gov.wales](mailto:Madeleine.Brindley@gov.wales)>; Edmunds, Kate (OFM - Special Adviser) <[Kate.Edmunds003@gov.wales](mailto:Kate.Edmunds003@gov.wales)>; [NR] (OFM - Special Adviser) <[NR]@gov.wales>; Butler, Ian (OFM - Special Adviser) <[Ian.Butler001@gov.wales](mailto:Ian.Butler001@gov.wales)>; Jenkins, Clare (OFM - Special Adviser) <[Clare.Jenkins010@gov.wales](mailto:Clare.Jenkins010@gov.wales)>; [NR] (OFM - Special Adviser) <[NR]@gov.wales>; Griffiths, Paul (OFM - Special Adviser) <[Paul.Griffiths003@gov.wales](mailto:Paul.Griffiths003@gov.wales)>; Faye, Sara (OFM - Special Adviser) <[Sara.Faye@gov.wales](mailto:Sara.Faye@gov.wales)>; Woodward, Tom (OFM - Special Adviser) <[Tom.Woodward@gov.wales](mailto:Tom.Woodward@gov.wales)>; Williams, Gareth (OFM - Special Adviser) <[Gareth.Williams32@gov.wales](mailto:Gareth.Williams32@gov.wales)>; [NR] (OFM - Special Adviser) <[NR]@gov.wales>; Bevan, Alex (OFM - Special Adviser) <[Alex.Bevan@gov.wales](mailto:Alex.Bevan@gov.wales)>; [NR] (OFM - Special Adviser) <[NR]@gov.wales>; DS FirstMinister (OFMCO) <[DS.FirstMinister@gov.wales](mailto:DS.FirstMinister@gov.wales)>; Mason, Toby (OFM - Communications) <[Toby.Mason@gov.wales](mailto:Toby.Mason@gov.wales)>; Evans, Carys (Office of the First Minister) <[Carys.Evans@gov.wales](mailto:Carys.Evans@gov.wales)>; Morgan, Shan (PSG - Permanent Secretary's Office) <[Shan.Morgan@gov.wales](mailto:Shan.Morgan@gov.wales)>; Trott, Jo (Project Team - C19) <[Jo.Trott@gov.wales](mailto:Jo.Trott@gov.wales)>; Project COVID-19 <[ProjectCovid-19@gov.wales](mailto:ProjectCovid-19@gov.wales)>; Brindle, Simon (OFM - European Transition) <[Simon.Brindle@gov.wales](mailto:Simon.Brindle@gov.wales)>; [NR] (Project Team - C19) <[NR]@gov.wales>; [NR] (ESNR - Economy, Skills and Natural Resources) <[NR]@gov.wales>; [NR] (PSG - Recovery and Restart) <[NR]@gov.wales>; [NR] (OFM - Cabinet Division) <[NR]@gov.wales>; [NR] (OFM - Cabinet Office) <[NR]@gov.wales>; Lalley, Liz (PSG - Recovery and Restart) <[Liz.Lalley@gov.wales](mailto:Liz.Lalley@gov.wales)>; Jeffreys, Andrew (PSG - Welsh Treasury) <[Andrew.Jeffreys@gov.wales](mailto:Andrew.Jeffreys@gov.wales)>; Lentle, Helen (OFM - Legal Services Department) <[Helen.Lentle@gov.wales](mailto:Helen.Lentle@gov.wales)>; [NR] (OFM - Office of the Legislative Counsel) <[NR]@gov.wales>; Buffin, Neil (OFM - Legal Services Department) <[Neil.Buffin@gov.wales](mailto:Neil.Buffin@gov.wales)>

**Subject:** RE: Official - Sensitive: Cabinet Agenda and Papers - Sunday 18 October, 16:00

**Importance:** High

All,

The action agreed at Cabinet today to be addressed immediately was for a note to be circulated about the risk of secondary school aged pupils being in school and potentially creating chains of transmission, as opposed to them not being in school but congregating elsewhere and spreading the virus.

The Communications lines mentioned by Toby are attached again below for reference.

<< File: PRE-BRIEF.docx >>

Thanks,

[NR]

[NR]

Ysgrifenyddiaeth y Cabinet, Cabinet Secretariat,  
Is-adran y Cabinet / Cabinet Division,  
Llywodraeth Cymru / Welsh Government  
Bae Caerdydd / Cardiff Bay

Irrelevant & Sensitive

[See recipients listed above]

**Subject:** RE: Official - Sensitive: Cabinet Agenda and Papers - Sunday 18 October, 16:00

**Importance:** High

All, please see attached note on handling for this afternoon below. In addition, to flag that Annex A TAC paper has been updated to reflect the latest R number consensus range, which is 1.1 - 1.4.

In light of the considerable information presented to Cabinet, the First Minister intends to focus the meeting as follows:

**1. Content of the circuit break**

- FM will invite MHSS to introduce.
- Annex B is for discussion by exception.

- Annex C is for substantive discussion with a focus on secondary school options: FM will invite the Education Minister to introduce the issues.
- Local government views: FM will invite MHLG to update on her discussions with leaders.

## **2. Business support during the circuit break**

- FM will invite METNW and MFT to introduce.

## **3. Work to be taken forward during the circuit break**

- Annex E outlines how we could use the circuit break period. FM would be grateful for suggestions for additions to this paper.

## **4. After the circuit break**

- Annex D sets out key issues about the restrictions that should apply in the immediate post-‘circuit-break’ period. These are difficult questions and FM proposes that Cabinet consider this paper for information at this stage and return to it later this week.

## **5. Comms**

- Toby Mason will provide a short form of words to be agreed that can go out to stakeholders this evening.

## **6. Other items**

- Cabinet will be updated on:
- Self isolation payments
- Shielding

## **7. Next steps**

- The FM has asked for a further meeting to be scheduled provisionally tomorrow at 11am, should further discussion be needed.

Thanks,

NR

NR

Ysgrifenyddiaeth y Cabinet, Cabinet Secretariat,  
Is-adran y Cabinet / Cabinet Division,  
Llywodraeth Cymru / Welsh Government  
Bae Caerdydd / Cardiff Bay

Irrelevant & Sensitive

From: NR (OFM - Cabinet Division)

Sent: 18 October 2020 12:28

[See recipients listed above]

**Subject:** Official - Sensitive: Cabinet Agenda and Papers - Sunday 18 October, 16:00

**Importance:** High

***The contents of this email is 'official - sensitive Cabinet' and is intended for Ministers only.  
Therefore, the contents of this email should not be forwarded to anyone else.***  
Private Secretaries,

Please find attached Cabinet agenda and papers for the meeting at 16:00 today. A short paper on how the FM intends to handle the meeting will also follow shortly.

The meeting will take place via Teams. A separate Teams meeting invitation has been issued by the First Minister's office and the link to join is here: [Join Microsoft Teams Meeting](#)

INQ000385752\_0007

All Ministers, including Deputies, are invited to attend.

**Agenda:**

<< File: ANNEX I - ECHR analysis for Cabinet paper 18 October 2020.docx >>

Item 1: First Minister's items

Item 2: Update from the Chief Medical Officer, Frank Atherton

Item 3: Coronavirus Regulations - Fire-break considerations, with Annexes A – I.

<< File: ANNEX H - Fire Break - Legal Advice.docx >>

ANNEX A: TAC paper

ANNEX B: Proposals for shape of firebreak

ANNEX C: Issues to resolve on firebreak

ANNEX D: Options for post firebreak national regime – key issues

ANNEX E: Options for utilisation of firebreak period

ANNEX F: Children's rights and Firebreak options

ANNEX G: Equality impact work

ANNEX H: Legal Advice

ANNEX I: ECHR Analysis

<< File: ANNEX G - Fire break - equality impacts.docx >> << File: ANNEX F - Firebreak children's rights.docx >> << File: ANNEX E - Options for utilisation of firebreak period.docx >> << File: ANNEX D - Options for post-firebreak period.docx >> << File: ANNEX C - Issues to resolve for firebreak.docx >> << File: ANNEX B - Shape of firebreak.docx >> << File: Fire-break - Cabinet discussion paper.docx >> << File: CAB Agenda - 18.10.2020.docx >> << File: ANNEX A - 20201017 TAC Fire Break\_v3.docx >>

Item 4: Any Other Business

Thanks,

NR

NR

**Ysgrifenyddiaeth y Cabinet, Cabinet Secretariat,  
Is-adran y Cabinet / Cabinet Division,  
Llywodraeth Cymru / Welsh Government  
Bae Caerdydd / Cardiff Bay**

**Irrelevant &  
Sensitive**