140	Monday, 4 March 2024
•	0.00 am) R POOLE: If I can call Sir Frank Atherton, please.
IVIT	SIR FRANK ATHERTON (sworn)
	Questions from LEAD COUNSEL TO THE INQUIRY for MODULE 2B
	DY HALLETT: Thank you for coming back to help again,
L/1	Sir Frank.
тн	E WITNESS: Pleasure.
	POOLE: Could you please start by giving us your full
	name.
A.	Yeah, I'm Dr Frank Atherton, Sir Frank Atherton, the
	Chief Medical Officer for Wales.
Q.	Sir Frank, thank you for attending today and assisting
	the Inquiry. If I could ask you whilst you're giving
	your evidence to keep your voice up so we can hear you,
	but also so it can be recorded.
	Sir Frank, you have provided a witness statement for
	Module 1 of this Inquiry. You gave evidence also at
	Module 1 and you've provided a witness statement for
	this module, which is dated 18 December 2023, and we see
	it on screen under INQ000391115.
	We don't need to go to it, but at page 70 of that
	witness statement you have signed it, and are the
	contents of that statement true to the best of your
	knowledge and belief?
	I think it's right to say you have a long and distinguished career in the field of public health and modicine
	medicine.
	Thank you.
Q.	Just some questions, if I may, to start with the role of the Chief Medical Officer for Wales.
	I'm right, aren't I, that although the CMO is
	a member of Welsh Government staff, and as such bound by
	the Civil Service Code, in practice you are afforded
	a high degree of independence when you come to advise
	the Welsh Government and a high degree of separation
	from their day-to-day concerns; is that right?
Α.	That's right, yeah. By custom and practice I do have
7.1	a degree of independence which some other civil servants
	perhaps don't enjoy.
Q.	If we can, please, have on screen INQ000668086.
	Sir Frank I think this is page 72 in your bundle if
	you would rather hard copy.
	This is an organisational chart of the Welsh
	Government as at November 2019, so just going into the
	pandemic. We can see the four director generals, and
	underneath Andrew Goodall, who at the time was director
	general of Health and Social Services Group, we can see
	the CMO post there.
	At the start of the pandemic, you therefore reported

Inquir	У	4 March 2024
1	Α.	They are.
2	Q.	Sir Frank, I'm going to be referring you to some
3		documents during the course of your evidence. I will
4		give the references so that they can be brought up on
5		the screen, but I understand you've also got hard
6		copies, so what I will try to do is provide you with
7		references to your hard copy bundle as well. But if at
8		any stage you don't know which document I'm referring
9		to, just tell me and we will sort it out.
10	Α.	Thank you.
11	Q.	Now, Sir Frank, as you said, you are currently the Chief
12		Medical Officer for Wales and you have been in post
13		since 2016; is that right?
14	Α.	That's right, yes.
15	Q.	As regards your professional background, you studied
16		medicine at Leeds University, followed which you worked
17		in a broad range of medical areas, in particular
18		paediatrics. You then completed your training in
19		general practice. You worked as director of public
20		health in Lancashire and Cumbria between 1 August 2002
21		and 1 May 2012. And you served as president of the
22		Association of Directors of Public Health between
23		1 August 2008 and 1 May 2012. I understand you were
24		also Deputy Chief Medical Officer for Health in
25		Nova Scotia between 1 May 2012 to 1 August 2016, so
		2
1		to Dr Andrew Goodall as director general of the HSSG; is
2		that right?
3	Α.	That's correct, yeah.
4	Q.	And I think those reporting lines changed in
5		November 2021 when Dr Goodall was appointed as permanent
6		secretary and the director general post was filled by
7		Judith Paget?
8	Α.	Correct, yeah.
9	Q.	Now, as regards your role during the pandemic, would it
10		be right to say that your main function was to provide
11		advice to Welsh ministers and Welsh Government policy
12		officials about the public health implications of
13		Covid-19 and the measures implemented to deal with it?
14	Α.	Yeah, that would be a fair fair comment, I think,
15	~	yeah. And af a sure that a sure that a new sure of a duite me
16	Q.	And of course you had access to a range of advisory
17		systems which we'll come to look at in a moment, but
18		would I be right in saying the ultimate responsibility
19 20		for that provision of public health advice sat with you
20		as CMO?
21	Α.	Yes, I provided that alongside the chief science adviser
22		for health and others, but and of course ministers
23		were taking advice from various sources but, from
24 25		a public health point of view, I would be the principal
25		adviser.

(1) Pages 1 - 4

8

1	Q.	The CMO is supported by a Deputy CMO, and since 2010	1	certainly in the earlier months, January, say, through
2	-	that post has been held by Dr Chris Jones; is that	2	March/April, there was a lack of support around me to be
3		right?	3	able to enable me to manage the amount of information
4	Α.	That's correct, yeah.	4	that I was receiving that was coming in through various
5	Q.		5	routes. To put it in context, I felt I kind of lost
6		Adviser for Health, we're going to hear evidence from	6	control of emails towards the end of January. So it was
7		him later, that's Dr Robert Orford, and he held that	7	the administrative support that was lacking. Yeah.
8		post throughout the pandemic; correct?	8	LADY HALLETT: Could you keep your voice up a little more,
9	Α.	Yes.	9	Sir Frank.
10	Q.	Prior to the pandemic, the CMO business unit, so your	10	A. I shall try, my Lady, thank you, yes.
11		unit, consisted of, I understand, a senior executive	11	LADY HALLETT: You're very softly spoken.
12		officer and a higher executive officer, both providing	12	A. I shall try.
13		you with administrative support; is that right?	13	MR POOLE: I think I'm right in saying that you continued to
14	Α.	Mm-hm.	14	express some concerns about that lack of, as you say,
15	Q.	You describe in your statement that the pandemic put, in	15	administrative support, because in August you wrote
16		your words, an unprecedented level of pressure on the	16	a letter to Dr Goodall.
17		CMO private office and the wider Health Protection Team,	17	We can see that letter, it's INQ000066192, and it's
18		and such were the demands of you in February 2020 that	18	the second paragraph of that letter.
19		you raised this with Dr Goodall; is that right?	19	You say:
20	Α.	I did. Yes, I did raise that, yes.	20	"[I'm] writing to flag significant concerns
21	Q.	-	21	about our ability to manage the next phase of the
22		not provided until May 2020, when you were provided with	22	pandemic in Wales."
23		some temporary support; is that right?	23	Now, I'm going to come back to other concerns you
24	Α.	There was a gradual evolution of support during the	24	express in that letter a little while later in your
25		pandemic. I did feel at the beginning of the pandemic,	25	evidence, but for present purposes, and focusing on the
		5		6
1		concerns about lack of support and resource in the	1	early in the pandemic, when things were starting to
2		CMO unit, we can look, please, at the penultimate	2	emerge in about February, February or late January/early
3		paragraph on page 2 of this letter.		
		paragraph on page 2 of this letter.	3	February, I presented to the Executive Committee of
4		You say:	3 4	February, I presented to the Executive Committee of Welsh Government that there was an issue arising, and at
4 5				
		You say: "You are aware that our public health team is heavily reliant on a small number of key [Document	4	Welsh Government that there was an issue arising, and at
5		You say: "You are aware that our public health team is	4 5	Welsh Government that there was an issue arising, and at that point I was hopeful that there might have been more
5 6		You say: "You are aware that our public health team is heavily reliant on a small number of key [Document	4 5 6	Welsh Government that there was an issue arising, and at that point I was hopeful that there might have been more support, administrative support, diverted from other
5 6 7		You say: "You are aware that our public health team is heavily reliant on a small number of key [Document read] challenges we now face"	4 5 6 7	Welsh Government that there was an issue arising, and at that point I was hopeful that there might have been more support, administrative support, diverted from other parts of Welsh Government.
5 6 7 8		You say: "You are aware that our public health team is heavily reliant on a small number of key [Document read] challenges we now face" You say in your statement, Sir Frank, that	4 5 6 7 8	Welsh Government that there was an issue arising, and at that point I was hopeful that there might have been more support, administrative support, diverted from other parts of Welsh Government. Now, to be fair, there were other issues around in
5 6 7 8 9		You say: "You are aware that our public health team is heavily reliant on a small number of key [Document read] challenges we now face" You say in your statement, Sir Frank, that Dr Goodall agreed with the overall concerns raised in	4 5 7 8 9	Welsh Government that there was an issue arising, and at that point I was hopeful that there might have been more support, administrative support, diverted from other parts of Welsh Government. Now, to be fair, there were other issues around in Wales at the time. There was significant floodings.
5 6 7 8 9 10		You say: "You are aware that our public health team is heavily reliant on a small number of key [Document read] challenges we now face" You say in your statement, Sir Frank, that Dr Goodall agreed with the overall concerns raised in this letter and that Public Health Wales re-deployed	4 5 7 8 9 10	Welsh Government that there was an issue arising, and at that point I was hopeful that there might have been more support, administrative support, diverted from other parts of Welsh Government. Now, to be fair, there were other issues around in Wales at the time. There was significant floodings. But at the time it was not seen as possible to kind of
5 6 7 8 9 10 11		You say: "You are aware that our public health team is heavily reliant on a small number of key [Document read] challenges we now face" You say in your statement, Sir Frank, that Dr Goodall agreed with the overall concerns raised in this letter and that Public Health Wales re-deployed some staff to support the response in the coming months.	4 5 7 8 9 10 11	Welsh Government that there was an issue arising, and at that point I was hopeful that there might have been more support, administrative support, diverted from other parts of Welsh Government. Now, to be fair, there were other issues around in Wales at the time. There was significant floodings. But at the time it was not seen as possible to kind of move resources into the health sector and specifically
5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12		You say: "You are aware that our public health team is heavily reliant on a small number of key [Document read] challenges we now face" You say in your statement, Sir Frank, that Dr Goodall agreed with the overall concerns raised in this letter and that Public Health Wales re-deployed some staff to support the response in the coming months. As regards your own office, you say you had more	4 5 7 8 9 10 11	Welsh Government that there was an issue arising, and at that point I was hopeful that there might have been more support, administrative support, diverted from other parts of Welsh Government. Now, to be fair, there were other issues around in Wales at the time. There was significant floodings. But at the time it was not seen as possible to kind of move resources into the health sector and specifically into my office to be able to support the administrative
5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15		You say: "You are aware that our public health team is heavily reliant on a small number of key [Document read] challenges we now face" You say in your statement, Sir Frank, that Dr Goodall agreed with the overall concerns raised in this letter and that Public Health Wales re-deployed some staff to support the response in the coming months. As regards your own office, you say you had more support from May 2020 through to February 2022, but it	4 5 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	Welsh Government that there was an issue arising, and at that point I was hopeful that there might have been more support, administrative support, diverted from other parts of Welsh Government. Now, to be fair, there were other issues around in Wales at the time. There was significant floodings. But at the time it was not seen as possible to kind of move resources into the health sector and specifically into my office to be able to support the administrative needs.
5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 13		You say: "You are aware that our public health team is heavily reliant on a small number of key [Document read] challenges we now face" You say in your statement, Sir Frank, that Dr Goodall agreed with the overall concerns raised in this letter and that Public Health Wales re-deployed some staff to support the response in the coming months. As regards your own office, you say you had more support from May 2020 through to February 2022, but it would have been helpful to have that resource sooner in	4 5 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	 Welsh Government that there was an issue arising, and at that point I was hopeful that there might have been more support, administrative support, diverted from other parts of Welsh Government. Now, to be fair, there were other issues around in Wales at the time. There was significant floodings. But at the time it was not seen as possible to kind of move resources into the health sector and specifically into my office to be able to support the administrative needs. I think I do say in the statement as well that
5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	А.	You say: "You are aware that our public health team is heavily reliant on a small number of key [Document read] challenges we now face" You say in your statement, Sir Frank, that Dr Goodall agreed with the overall concerns raised in this letter and that Public Health Wales re-deployed some staff to support the response in the coming months. As regards your own office, you say you had more support from May 2020 through to February 2022, but it would have been helpful to have that resource sooner in that initial period January to April 2020; is that right?	4 5 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	 Welsh Government that there was an issue arising, and at that point I was hopeful that there might have been more support, administrative support, diverted from other parts of Welsh Government. Now, to be fair, there were other issues around in Wales at the time. There was significant floodings. But at the time it was not seen as possible to kind of move resources into the health sector and specifically into my office to be able to support the administrative needs. I think I do say in the statement as well that the from a professional point of view, we were able
5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	A. Q.	You say: "You are aware that our public health team is heavily reliant on a small number of key [Document read] challenges we now face" You say in your statement, Sir Frank, that Dr Goodall agreed with the overall concerns raised in this letter and that Public Health Wales re-deployed some staff to support the response in the coming months. As regards your own office, you say you had more support from May 2020 through to February 2022, but it would have been helpful to have that resource sooner in that initial period January to April 2020; is that right?	4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	 Welsh Government that there was an issue arising, and at that point I was hopeful that there might have been more support, administrative support, diverted from other parts of Welsh Government. Now, to be fair, there were other issues around in Wales at the time. There was significant floodings. But at the time it was not seen as possible to kind of move resources into the health sector and specifically into my office to be able to support the administrative needs. I think I do say in the statement as well that the from a professional point of view, we were able to bring in other professional advisers, which was
5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19		You say: "You are aware that our public health team is heavily reliant on a small number of key [Document read] challenges we now face" You say in your statement, Sir Frank, that Dr Goodall agreed with the overall concerns raised in this letter and that Public Health Wales re-deployed some staff to support the response in the coming months. As regards your own office, you say you had more support from May 2020 through to February 2022, but it would have been helpful to have that resource sooner in that initial period January to April 2020; is that right? That is correct, yeah. And in terms of the impact, I think, as you've just described, it was more administrative support, so would	4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19	 Welsh Government that there was an issue arising, and at that point I was hopeful that there might have been more support, administrative support, diverted from other parts of Welsh Government. Now, to be fair, there were other issues around in Wales at the time. There was significant floodings. But at the time it was not seen as possible to kind of move resources into the health sector and specifically into my office to be able to support the administrative needs. I think I do say in the statement as well that the from a professional point of view, we were able to bring in other professional advisers, which was extremely helpful. Q. On this issue of lack of administrative support, does this perhaps explain the lack, then, of formal minutes
5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20		You say: "You are aware that our public health team is heavily reliant on a small number of key [Document read] challenges we now face" You say in your statement, Sir Frank, that Dr Goodall agreed with the overall concerns raised in this letter and that Public Health Wales re-deployed some staff to support the response in the coming months. As regards your own office, you say you had more support from May 2020 through to February 2022, but it would have been helpful to have that resource sooner in that initial period January to April 2020; is that right? That is correct, yeah. And in terms of the impact, I think, as you've just described, it was more administrative support, so would I be right in saying, as you've alluded to, dealing with	4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	 Welsh Government that there was an issue arising, and at that point I was hopeful that there might have been more support, administrative support, diverted from other parts of Welsh Government. Now, to be fair, there were other issues around in Wales at the time. There was significant floodings. But at the time it was not seen as possible to kind of move resources into the health sector and specifically into my office to be able to support the administrative needs. I think I do say in the statement as well that the from a professional point of view, we were able to bring in other professional advisers, which was extremely helpful. Q. On this issue of lack of administrative support, does this perhaps explain the lack, then, of formal minutes and notes of a number of meetings that you attended in
5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21		You say: "You are aware that our public health team is heavily reliant on a small number of key [Document read] challenges we now face" You say in your statement, Sir Frank, that Dr Goodall agreed with the overall concerns raised in this letter and that Public Health Wales re-deployed some staff to support the response in the coming months. As regards your own office, you say you had more support from May 2020 through to February 2022, but it would have been helpful to have that resource sooner in that initial period January to April 2020; is that right? That is correct, yeah. And in terms of the impact, I think, as you've just described, it was more administrative support, so would I be right in saying, as you've alluded to, dealing with the number of emails, if you went to a meeting having	4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	 Welsh Government that there was an issue arising, and at that point I was hopeful that there might have been more support, administrative support, diverted from other parts of Welsh Government. Now, to be fair, there were other issues around in Wales at the time. There was significant floodings. But at the time it was not seen as possible to kind of move resources into the health sector and specifically into my office to be able to support the administrative needs. I think I do say in the statement as well that the from a professional point of view, we were able to bring in other professional advisers, which was extremely helpful. Q. On this issue of lack of administrative support, does this perhaps explain the lack, then, of formal minutes and notes of a number of meetings that you attended in this initial period? So, for example, we know you had
5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22		You say: "You are aware that our public health team is heavily reliant on a small number of key [Document read] challenges we now face" You say in your statement, Sir Frank, that Dr Goodall agreed with the overall concerns raised in this letter and that Public Health Wales re-deployed some staff to support the response in the coming months. As regards your own office, you say you had more support from May 2020 through to February 2022, but it would have been helpful to have that resource sooner in that initial period January to April 2020; is that right? That is correct, yeah. And in terms of the impact, I think, as you've just described, it was more administrative support, so would I be right in saying, as you've alluded to, dealing with the number of emails, if you went to a meeting having someone attend that meeting with you in order to take	4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	 Welsh Government that there was an issue arising, and at that point I was hopeful that there might have been more support, administrative support, diverted from other parts of Welsh Government. Now, to be fair, there were other issues around in Wales at the time. There was significant floodings. But at the time it was not seen as possible to kind of move resources into the health sector and specifically into my office to be able to support the administrative needs. I think I do say in the statement as well that the from a professional point of view, we were able to bring in other professional advisers, which was extremely helpful. Q. On this issue of lack of administrative support, does this perhaps explain the lack, then, of formal minutes and notes of a number of meetings that you attended in this initial period? So, for example, we know you had regular meetings with other UK CMOs, including
5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23		You say: "You are aware that our public health team is heavily reliant on a small number of key [Document read] challenges we now face" You say in your statement, Sir Frank, that Dr Goodall agreed with the overall concerns raised in this letter and that Public Health Wales re-deployed some staff to support the response in the coming months. As regards your own office, you say you had more support from May 2020 through to February 2022, but it would have been helpful to have that resource sooner in that initial period January to April 2020; is that right? That is correct, yeah. And in terms of the impact, I think, as you've just described, it was more administrative support, so would I be right in saying, as you've alluded to, dealing with the number of emails, if you went to a meeting having someone attend that meeting with you in order to take notes, that type of support that was lacking in that	4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	 Welsh Government that there was an issue arising, and at that point I was hopeful that there might have been more support, administrative support, diverted from other parts of Welsh Government. Now, to be fair, there were other issues around in Wales at the time. There was significant floodings. But at the time it was not seen as possible to kind of move resources into the health sector and specifically into my office to be able to support the administrative needs. I think I do say in the statement as well that the from a professional point of view, we were able to bring in other professional advisers, which was extremely helpful. Q. On this issue of lack of administrative support, does this perhaps explain the lack, then, of formal minutes and notes of a number of meetings that you attended in this initial period? So, for example, we know you had regular meetings with other UK CMOs, including Professor Whitty, sometimes up to three times a week,
5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22		You say: "You are aware that our public health team is heavily reliant on a small number of key [Document read] challenges we now face" You say in your statement, Sir Frank, that Dr Goodall agreed with the overall concerns raised in this letter and that Public Health Wales re-deployed some staff to support the response in the coming months. As regards your own office, you say you had more support from May 2020 through to February 2022, but it would have been helpful to have that resource sooner in that initial period January to April 2020; is that right? That is correct, yeah. And in terms of the impact, I think, as you've just described, it was more administrative support, so would I be right in saying, as you've alluded to, dealing with the number of emails, if you went to a meeting having someone attend that meeting with you in order to take	4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	 Welsh Government that there was an issue arising, and at that point I was hopeful that there might have been more support, administrative support, diverted from other parts of Welsh Government. Now, to be fair, there were other issues around in Wales at the time. There was significant floodings. But at the time it was not seen as possible to kind of move resources into the health sector and specifically into my office to be able to support the administrative needs. I think I do say in the statement as well that the from a professional point of view, we were able to bring in other professional advisers, which was extremely helpful. Q. On this issue of lack of administrative support, does this perhaps explain the lack, then, of formal minutes and notes of a number of meetings that you attended in this initial period? So, for example, we know you had regular meetings with other UK CMOs, including

7

(2) Pages 5 - 8

1		this period?
2	Α.	It is, and I remember discussing this with other my
3		colleagues, the other CPOs, you know, who did have that
4		kind of support alongside them, people to take minutes,
5		to take records, to really help them manage the volume
6		of traffic, and I did feel a bit of an outlier in terms
7		of how I sat alongside my colleagues.
8	Q.	Sir Frank, I want to ask you next some questions about
9		sources of information upon which you drew during the
10		pandemic and start if I may with UK-wide sources.
11		So, as I mentioned a moment ago, CMO discussions, it
12		is right to say you had regular meetings with the other
13		CMOs in the UK, and the Inquiry has heard evidence
14		already about the structures that existed at
15		UK Government level and the key individuals involved,
16		not least your counterpart in England Professor Whitty.
17		Now, Professor Whitty's background is in public
18		health and infectious disease. You have already
19		helpfully told us that you came from a general practice
20		background before taking up various public health roles.
21		You also make a point in your witness statement of
22		saying that your background is not in virology or
23		epidemiology. Would it be fair to say that, given the
24		particular requirements and the difficulties faced in
25		the pandemic, that your background and experience meant
		9
1	Α.	It was never it never came to me as a problem at all,
2		it never no, no.
3	Q.	Now, prior to the pandemic, the UK CMOs tended to meet
4		guarterly with the chairman of that meeting being
5		rotated, and I understand during the pandemic those
6		meetings became much more frequent and you describe in
7		your statement that during the initial phase of the
8		pandemic the UK CMOs would sometimes meet daily before
9		you settled into a rhythm of weekly Friday morning
10		meetings from around August 2020; is that right?
11	Α.	That's correct, yeah.
12	Q.	Now, those meetings, as I understand it, would be
13		chaired by Professor Whitty. His office would act in
11		offect as appreteriat. As Lunderstand it any minutes

- effect as secretariat. As I understand it, any minutes
 or notes taken were not shared with other CMOs, so we
 don't have a joint agreed record of those meetings. Is
 that right?
 A. We do not.
 Q. Assuming that you would have relayed those CMO
- 20 discussions back to Welsh ministers and officials,
- 21 didn't the absence of an agreed record of those meetings22 make that more difficult?
- 23 A. I don't think it was a direct relay of the content of
- 24 those discussions to ministers. What those meetings
- 25 were about, they were fairly informal, and we were

	that you perhaps required, more than Professor Whitty,
	to translate the advice of others more expert in the
	matters at hand? Would that be fair?
Α.	Well, I would certainly not have the level of
	understanding of infectious disease epidemiology that
	Professor Sir Chris Whitty would have, but I suppose
	I would argue that I was the only CMO who had formal
	public health training who had been involved, perhaps,
	in managing some of the previous incidents, epidemics,
	outbreaks, et cetera.
	So I think when you look at the skills of chief
	medical officers, they can come from a range of
	backgrounds, of course. But what's really important is
	that you know the limits of your knowledge and can draw
	on knowledge that you don't personally have.
Q.	The Inquiry heard evidence in Module 1 from Mr Gething
	that, as far as Wales was concerned, he said the
	relationship with the other CMOs was complicated by the
	fact that the CMO in England is not just a UK CMO but he
	or she advises the UK Government. So particularly in
	relation to areas that have UK-wide ramifications.
	Did you encounter any problems in that regard,
	namely by the virtue that Professor Whitty was
	effectively wearing two hats, English CMO and
	UK Government adviser?
	10

1		sharing information, it was about sharing intelligence
2		information across the four nations. It wasn't if
2		there were issues which arose which needed to be fed
4		into ministers or into decision-making processes, then
5		we would take those. But I would agree with your point
6		that it would have been useful to have a record of them.
7	Q.	So as a sort of lessons learned going forward, perhaps
8		formal agreed minutes or records of those meetings would
9		be useful?
10	Α.	Some note would be useful.
11	Q.	Now, we'll look at specific meetings that you attended
12		in due course but is it right that the first meeting of
13		the UK CMOs in relation to Covid that took place on
14		24 January 2020?
15	Α.	That's my recollection.
16	Q.	And having first heard about a novel coronavirus,
17		I think in your statement you say, some time between
18		Christmas and New Year 2019. Did you have any liaison
19		with your CMO counterparts in the period between then
20		and 24 January 2020?
21	Α.	Well, really I can't remember, but I feel we must have
22		done. I do remember, you know, Professor Sir
23		Jonathan Van-Tam was leading on health protection issues
24		in Chris Whitty's office, and I looking back, I feel

25 sure he would have spoken to us or somehow communicated 12

(3) Pages 9 - 12

Q.

Α.

Q.

Α.

Q.

Α.

Q.

	with us about the issue in China. So I'm sure there was	1		started to get invitations, we made sure that we were
	some soft sharing of information before that time, but	2		represented through Professor Orford, of course, yeah.
	the first formal meeting, as you say, seems to be	3		It may well be, and I think in Module 1
	towards the end of January.	4		Professor Vallance gave evidence on this, it may well be
Q.	Now, SAGE is another important body about which much was	5		that an invitation may have come through the chief
	heard in Module 2. We understand that SAGE was first	6		science officer, Welsh Government office. I don't know
	convened on 22 January 2020. You were not invited to	7		if that happened or not, but if it did, it didn't reach
	attend SAGE until 11 February 2020. Do you think that	8		me.
	you should have been invited to attend SAGE earlier than	9	Q.	Perhaps we can explore that with Dr Orford, who we will
	11 February?	10		be hearing from next.
Α.	I think it would have been helpful for Welsh Government	11		The Joint Biosecurity Centre was established by the
	to be represented. Whether it was me personally or not	12		UK Government in June 2020, as I understand it, to
	is a separate matter, but I do think it would have been	13		provide evidence-based analysis and advice to inform
	useful to have Welsh representation.	14		local government and national decision-making in
Q.	Were requests made prior to 11 February for there to be	15		response to Covid.
•	a Welsh representative at a SAGE meeting, do you know?	16		You were a member of the JBC technical advisory
A.	Do you mean requests from Wales to Absolutely.	17 19	•	board; is that right? That's correct, ves.
Q. A.	SAGE? I'm not aware of that, no.	18 19	A. Q.	Jo Trott, who's head of Covid-19 project team in the
	What steps did you take prior to 11 February,	20	ω.	Welsh Government, says in her evidence to the Inquiry
ч.	recognising that it would have been helpful for there to	20		that data and intelligence received through the JBC was
	have been a Welsh representative at these earlier SAGE	22		England-centric. Is that something you're able to
	meetings, what steps did you take to ensure that there	23		comment on? Do you agree with those comments?
	was such a Welsh representative?	24	Α.	I feel it may well have been in the early stages. JBC
Α.		25		was set up as a completely new organisation, it built on
	13			14
	some of the work that the former Public Health England	1		close working relationships, so I'm not sure that having
	had done, so, you know, initially I would agree with	2		a record of the informal catch-up information-sharing
	that. But I felt that as time went on during the	3		type meetings would be necessarily no, I'm not sure
	pandemic the team, who I think were excellent, in JBC,	4		that would would be necessary. I think every time
	technically excellent people, did go the distance to try	5		I meet Public Health Wales senior management, to have
	to incorporate data from the other the other nations.	6		a record of that would be probably overly burdensome.
	So I feel it may have been an initial issue which was	7	Q.	Presumably these meetings in February and moving into
	certainly resolved towards the latter stages of the	8		March with Public Health Wales, they were discussing the
	pandemic.	9		evolving picture of the pandemic?
Q.	Moving away now from UK-wide sources of information and	10	Α.	Yes, it was really situational awareness, thinking about
	consider Welsh-specific sources. Start with Public	11		what was coming our way, thinking about how we might
	Health Wales. You say in your statement you had	12		need to respond to it, yes.
	a series of ad hoc meetings with Public Health Wales	13	Q.	And, as you say, they were sort of information-sharing
	colleagues in February 2020. I assume, therefore, you	14		meetings. Would it not, in those circumstances, these
	didn't have any of those kind of meetings in	15		fairly extraordinary circumstances, have been beneficial
	January 2020; is that right?	16		to have kept a record of those meetings?
A.	I really can't remember.	17	Α.	With the benefit of hindsight it may well have been
Q.	Was there any record kept of those ad hoc meetings that	18	~	useful.
^	started in February 2020 and continued into March?	19 20	Q.	Did it become apparent when the pandemic struck that
A. Q.	No. Do you think a record should have been kept or would it	20 21		because the SAGE arrangement was a UK arrangement there was a need within the Welsh Government for
α.	have been useful to keep a record of those meetings?	21		a Welsh-specific scientific advice to be given to Welsh
Δ	It was always my practice to meet fairly frequently with	22		ministers?
д.	the senior senior leaders in Public Health Wales.	23	Α.	That was essentially the conclusion we reached and that
	We're a small nation, we have very I would say very	25		was led to the set-up of the Technical Advisory Cell
	15			16

(4) Pages 13 - 16

1		and Technical Advisory Group that Professor Orford	1
2		and	2
3	Q.	As I understand it, TAC was set up in late February and	3
4		sort of TAG followed on soon thereafter.	4
5		l just want to take you to an annual report, it's	5
6		a 2018/2019 report entitled "Valuing our health".	6
7		I'm grateful. We can see that it's INQ000066189.	7
8		And it's page 3, please, in the penultimate paragraph of	8
9		that page we can zoom in there.	9
10		You say, and it's about five lines down on the	10
11		right-hand side:	11
12		"We live in inter-connected world and recent events,	12
13		such as the rise [Document read] need to	13
14		strengthen this aspect of our public health system."	14
15		Was consideration ever given to establishing	15
16		a structure such as TAG or TAC prior to the pandemic?	16
17	Α.	The TAG or TAC, no. The arrangements that we looked to	17
18		strengthen included putting additional investment into	18
19		Public Health Wales to boost their capacity. So that	19
20		was the main outcome, I think, of this annual report,	20
21		which looking back was quite prescient really.	21
22		As regards TAG and TAC, I've always seen those as	22
23		more akin to part of the emergency response, a technical	23
24		group which you step up when you're managing an incident	24
25		such as Covid. 17	25
		17	
1		to March 2020.	1
2		Now, as we've already touched on, you say in your	2
3		statement that you first heard about the novel	3
4		coronavirus some time between Christmas and New Year	4
5		2019, you had some high level discussions with the UK	5
6		CMOs about what was happening in China and I think at	6
7		that stage, you say in your witness statement, you saw	7
8		the virus as very much contained in China, at that	8
9		period; is that right?	9
10	Α.	Yes, early days, yeah.	10
11	Q.	And early January you say that there were three	11
12		potential outcomes, so: first, the virus could just	12
13		fizzle out; second, it could lead to limited regional	13
14		spread in other Asian countries; or, thirdly, it could	14
15		become a more widespread global issue. And your view at	15
16		that stage, and one you say was shared with the other	16
17		CMOs, was, based on experience of SARS, the virus most	17
18 19		likely would fizzle out or be limited to Asia; is that right?	18 19
20	Α.	It is. One caveat would be that that construct was	20
20	А.	really developed by Professor Sir Chris Whitty and	20
21		shared with us and we all agreed that.	21
22	Q.	On 24 January Dr Orford sent you an email.	22
24	- -	If we could, please, have it on screen. It's	20
25		INQ000252498. I'm grateful.	25
		19	_0

Inquiry	'	4 March 2024
1		Whether you need a standing arrangement for TAG or
2		TAC I think is a different point.
3	Q.	In your view would it be beneficial to have a standing
4		basis for TAG and TAC?
5	Α.	I think I'm fairly neutral on that point at the moment.
6		I think having an arrangement which you can step up when
7		it's needed is probably a better use of resources.
8	Q.	Now, the Inquiry understands that TAG and TAC provided
9		advice to you as CMO and that you would then advise
10		Welsh ministers. Just help us, then, was your advice
11		independent of TAG and TAC or were you a conduit of TAG
12		and TAC advice?
13	Α.	I think it evolved over time. I think in the initial
14		phases, when TAG and TAC were set up, it tended to route
15		to me and I would tend to pass that through to
16 17		ministers. Later in the pandemic, not much later,
17		probably by August or September in the first year, 2020, it became much more the process that TAG and TAC advice
10		would go directly to ministers and I would, of course
20		taking account of that advice, provide my separate
20		account. But my advice tended, certainly to the Cabinet
22		in the formal meetings, to be much more concise than the
23		detail which TAG and TAC was providing to ministers.
24	Q.	Sir Frank, I want to ask you some questions next about
25		your initial understanding in this early period January
		18
1		This email attached the minutes of the precautionary
2		SAGE meeting that was held two days previously on
3		22 January.
4		Now, we know there were no Welsh representatives at
5		that meeting but the minutes were then shared with
6		Dr Orford two days later. We see from the bottom
7		email please, it's the third paragraph:
8		" it was decided that the [DAs] devolved
9		administrations would go through their respective
10		CMOs"
11		Prior to receiving that email from Dr Orford, were
12		you aware of the decision that effectively
13		intergovernmental liaison would be via the CMOs?
14	Α.	I I wasn't really. I mean, I don't recognise the
15		statement, "devolved CMOs will be liaising directly
16		with the UK CMO", going through I don't really
17		recognise what that's saying, as I look at it now.
18		Yeah.
19	~	Sorry, can you repeat the question.
20	Q.	So this is an email Dr Orford has passed on to you on
21		24 January, and this is the email reporting back from
22		the precautionary SAGE on 22 January, and in that email
23 24		it is saying:
24 25		"Today a COBR [has taken place] and it was decided
25		that the devolved administrations would go through their 20

20

2

3

4 5

6 7

8

9 10

11

12

13

1		respective devolved CMOs as they will be liaising
2		directly with the UK CMO, Chris Whitty."
3		My question was, simply, prior to being sent this
4		email by Dr Orford, did you know that what was being
5		envisaged was effectively liaison happening
6		intergovernmentally via the CMOs of the four nations?
7	Α.	My simple answer would be no.
8	Q.	No.
9		If we can have a look, please, at those minutes from
10		that precautionary SAGE meeting.
11		So it's INQ000383581.
12	Α.	Is there a
13	Q.	It's tab 7, I hope, in that hard copy in front of you.
14	Α.	Thank you. Yeah.
15	Q.	I'm going to look at page 2 of those minutes, and it's
16		paragraph 23.
17	Α.	Yeah.
18	Q.	Under the heading "UK head readiness and planning", the
19		actions that were being taken at this time were testing,
20		and the minutes read:
21		"The UK currently has [Document read] tract
22		sampling."
23		Then the next paragraph, paragraph 24:
24		"DHSC is developing advice for UK healthcare workers
25		on testing potentially infected individuals." 21
1	•	not reliant on the Colindale testing.
2	Q.	The Inquiry heard evidence at the end of last week from
2 3	Q.	The Inquiry heard evidence at the end of last week from Dr Chris Williams. He said, talking about this stage,
2 3 4	Q.	The Inquiry heard evidence at the end of last week from Dr Chris Williams. He said, talking about this stage, so late January 2020, most of the big decisions were
2 3 4 5	Q.	The Inquiry heard evidence at the end of last week from Dr Chris Williams. He said, talking about this stage, so late January 2020, most of the big decisions were being led by Public Health England and that the
2 3 4 5 6		The Inquiry heard evidence at the end of last week from Dr Chris Williams. He said, talking about this stage, so late January 2020, most of the big decisions were being led by Public Health England and that the overarching plan was a UK one. Do you agree with that?
2 3 4 5 6 7	Q. A.	The Inquiry heard evidence at the end of last week from Dr Chris Williams. He said, talking about this stage, so late January 2020, most of the big decisions were being led by Public Health England and that the overarching plan was a UK one. Do you agree with that? Do you mean the overarching plan for testing or for
2 3 4 5 6 7 8	А.	The Inquiry heard evidence at the end of last week from Dr Chris Williams. He said, talking about this stage, so late January 2020, most of the big decisions were being led by Public Health England and that the overarching plan was a UK one. Do you agree with that? Do you mean the overarching plan for testing or for managing the coronavirus pandemic?
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9		The Inquiry heard evidence at the end of last week from Dr Chris Williams. He said, talking about this stage, so late January 2020, most of the big decisions were being led by Public Health England and that the overarching plan was a UK one. Do you agree with that? Do you mean the overarching plan for testing or for managing the coronavirus pandemic? Managing so the bullet points from this, these SAGE
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	А.	The Inquiry heard evidence at the end of last week from Dr Chris Williams. He said, talking about this stage, so late January 2020, most of the big decisions were being led by Public Health England and that the overarching plan was a UK one. Do you agree with that? Do you mean the overarching plan for testing or for managing the coronavirus pandemic? Managing so the bullet points from this, these SAGE minutes, it was, you're right, testing, but also
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11	А.	The Inquiry heard evidence at the end of last week from Dr Chris Williams. He said, talking about this stage, so late January 2020, most of the big decisions were being led by Public Health England and that the overarching plan was a UK one. Do you agree with that? Do you mean the overarching plan for testing or for managing the coronavirus pandemic? Managing so the bullet points from this, these SAGE minutes, it was, you're right, testing, but also isolation, so general management in this early stage of
2 3 4 5 7 8 9 10 11 12	А.	The Inquiry heard evidence at the end of last week from Dr Chris Williams. He said, talking about this stage, so late January 2020, most of the big decisions were being led by Public Health England and that the overarching plan was a UK one. Do you agree with that? Do you mean the overarching plan for testing or for managing the coronavirus pandemic? Managing so the bullet points from this, these SAGE minutes, it was, you're right, testing, but also isolation, so general management in this early stage of the coronavirus was a UK plan, is what Dr Williams said,
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	А.	The Inquiry heard evidence at the end of last week from Dr Chris Williams. He said, talking about this stage, so late January 2020, most of the big decisions were being led by Public Health England and that the overarching plan was a UK one. Do you agree with that? Do you mean the overarching plan for testing or for managing the coronavirus pandemic? Managing so the bullet points from this, these SAGE minutes, it was, you're right, testing, but also isolation, so general management in this early stage of the coronavirus was a UK plan, is what Dr Williams said, and I just want to know whether you would agree with
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 13	A. Q.	The Inquiry heard evidence at the end of last week from Dr Chris Williams. He said, talking about this stage, so late January 2020, most of the big decisions were being led by Public Health England and that the overarching plan was a UK one. Do you agree with that? Do you mean the overarching plan for testing or for managing the coronavirus pandemic? Managing so the bullet points from this, these SAGE minutes, it was, you're right, testing, but also isolation, so general management in this early stage of the coronavirus was a UK plan, is what Dr Williams said, and I just want to know whether you would agree with that?
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	А.	The Inquiry heard evidence at the end of last week from Dr Chris Williams. He said, talking about this stage, so late January 2020, most of the big decisions were being led by Public Health England and that the overarching plan was a UK one. Do you agree with that? Do you mean the overarching plan for testing or for managing the coronavirus pandemic? Managing so the bullet points from this, these SAGE minutes, it was, you're right, testing, but also isolation, so general management in this early stage of the coronavirus was a UK plan, is what Dr Williams said, and I just want to know whether you would agree with
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	A. Q.	The Inquiry heard evidence at the end of last week from Dr Chris Williams. He said, talking about this stage, so late January 2020, most of the big decisions were being led by Public Health England and that the overarching plan was a UK one. Do you agree with that? Do you mean the overarching plan for testing or for managing the coronavirus pandemic? Managing so the bullet points from this, these SAGE minutes, it was, you're right, testing, but also isolation, so general management in this early stage of the coronavirus was a UK plan, is what Dr Williams said, and I just want to know whether you would agree with that? Yeah, I would agree with that in broad terms, yes.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	A. Q.	The Inquiry heard evidence at the end of last week from Dr Chris Williams. He said, talking about this stage, so late January 2020, most of the big decisions were being led by Public Health England and that the overarching plan was a UK one. Do you agree with that? Do you mean the overarching plan for testing or for managing the coronavirus pandemic? Managing so the bullet points from this, these SAGE minutes, it was, you're right, testing, but also isolation, so general management in this early stage of the coronavirus was a UK plan, is what Dr Williams said, and I just want to know whether you would agree with that? Yeah, I would agree with that in broad terms, yes. The same day, so this is 24 January 2020, Chris Whitty
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	A. Q.	The Inquiry heard evidence at the end of last week from Dr Chris Williams. He said, talking about this stage, so late January 2020, most of the big decisions were being led by Public Health England and that the overarching plan was a UK one. Do you agree with that? Do you mean the overarching plan for testing or for managing the coronavirus pandemic? Managing so the bullet points from this, these SAGE minutes, it was, you're right, testing, but also isolation, so general management in this early stage of the coronavirus was a UK plan, is what Dr Williams said, and I just want to know whether you would agree with that? Yeah, I would agree with that in broad terms, yes. The same day, so this is 24 January 2020, Chris Whitty convened a UK CMOs call and it was at that point,
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	A. Q.	The Inquiry heard evidence at the end of last week from Dr Chris Williams. He said, talking about this stage, so late January 2020, most of the big decisions were being led by Public Health England and that the overarching plan was a UK one. Do you agree with that? Do you mean the overarching plan for testing or for managing the coronavirus pandemic? Managing so the bullet points from this, these SAGE minutes, it was, you're right, testing, but also isolation, so general management in this early stage of the coronavirus was a UK plan, is what Dr Williams said, and I just want to know whether you would agree with that? Yeah, I would agree with that in broad terms, yes. The same day, so this is 24 January 2020, Chris Whitty convened a UK CMOs call and it was at that point, 24 January, you say in your statement that Covid-19 was
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19	A. Q.	The Inquiry heard evidence at the end of last week from Dr Chris Williams. He said, talking about this stage, so late January 2020, most of the big decisions were being led by Public Health England and that the overarching plan was a UK one. Do you agree with that? Do you mean the overarching plan for testing or for managing the coronavirus pandemic? Managing so the bullet points from this, these SAGE minutes, it was, you're right, testing, but also isolation, so general management in this early stage of the coronavirus was a UK plan, is what Dr Williams said, and I just want to know whether you would agree with that? Yeah, I would agree with that in broad terms, yes. The same day, so this is 24 January 2020, Chris Whitty convened a UK CMOs call and it was at that point, 24 January, you say in your statement that Covid-19 was discussed as a real potential threat to the UK.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	A. Q.	The Inquiry heard evidence at the end of last week from Dr Chris Williams. He said, talking about this stage, so late January 2020, most of the big decisions were being led by Public Health England and that the overarching plan was a UK one. Do you agree with that? Do you mean the overarching plan for testing or for managing the coronavirus pandemic? Managing so the bullet points from this, these SAGE minutes, it was, you're right, testing, but also isolation, so general management in this early stage of the coronavirus was a UK plan, is what Dr Williams said, and I just want to know whether you would agree with that? Yeah, I would agree with that in broad terms, yes. The same day, so this is 24 January 2020, Chris Whitty convened a UK CMOs call and it was at that point, 24 January, you say in your statement that Covid-19 was discussed as a real potential threat to the UK. Now, do you think at this stage, late January, that
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	A. Q.	The Inquiry heard evidence at the end of last week from Dr Chris Williams. He said, talking about this stage, so late January 2020, most of the big decisions were being led by Public Health England and that the overarching plan was a UK one. Do you agree with that? Do you mean the overarching plan for testing or for managing the coronavirus pandemic? Managing so the bullet points from this, these SAGE minutes, it was, you're right, testing, but also isolation, so general management in this early stage of the coronavirus was a UK plan, is what Dr Williams said, and I just want to know whether you would agree with that? Yeah, I would agree with that in broad terms, yes. The same day, so this is 24 January 2020, Chris Whitty convened a UK CMOs call and it was at that point, 24 January, you say in your statement that Covid-19 was discussed as a real potential threat to the UK. Now, do you think at this stage, late January, that the potential threat posed by Covid-19 was recognised
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	A. Q.	The Inquiry heard evidence at the end of last week from Dr Chris Williams. He said, talking about this stage, so late January 2020, most of the big decisions were being led by Public Health England and that the overarching plan was a UK one. Do you agree with that? Do you mean the overarching plan for testing or for managing the coronavirus pandemic? Managing so the bullet points from this, these SAGE minutes, it was, you're right, testing, but also isolation, so general management in this early stage of the coronavirus was a UK plan, is what Dr Williams said, and I just want to know whether you would agree with that? Yeah, I would agree with that in broad terms, yes. The same day, so this is 24 January 2020, Chris Whitty convened a UK CMOs call and it was at that point, 24 January, you say in your statement that Covid-19 was discussed as a real potential threat to the UK. Now, do you think at this stage, late January, that the potential threat posed by Covid-19 was recognised sufficiently quickly within Wales and the Welsh
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	A. Q. A. Q.	The Inquiry heard evidence at the end of last week from Dr Chris Williams. He said, talking about this stage, so late January 2020, most of the big decisions were being led by Public Health England and that the overarching plan was a UK one. Do you agree with that? Do you mean the overarching plan for testing or for managing the coronavirus pandemic? Managing so the bullet points from this, these SAGE minutes, it was, you're right, testing, but also isolation, so general management in this early stage of the coronavirus was a UK plan, is what Dr Williams said, and I just want to know whether you would agree with that? Yeah, I would agree with that in broad terms, yes. The same day, so this is 24 January 2020, Chris Whitty convened a UK CMOs call and it was at that point, 24 January, you say in your statement that Covid-19 was discussed as a real potential threat to the UK. Now, do you think at this stage, late January, that the potential threat posed by Covid-19 was recognised sufficiently quickly within Wales and the Welsh Government?

23

10		realin England at 1 often Down were developing tests. So
14		that was certainly the case in January.
15		Into February, and as testing started to come
16		onstream, because it was, initially it's true, available
17		at UK-level only, in early in February and into
18		March, we in Wales did look to develop our own testing
19		processes. I had some reservations about that, because
20		I wanted assurance from Public Health Wales that the
21		testing that we were developing in Wales was robust,
22		that it was as robust as the testing that was currently
23		being done at Colindale. Sorry, I said Porton Down,
24		I meant Colindale, in England. So the action in Wales
25		was to develop our own testing processes so that we were 22
1		not going to happen. So from a technical point of view
2		it looked more likely that there was going to be spread
3		beyond the boundaries of China and that was already
4		starting to happen.
5		I think as I said earlier, my I my response to
6		that was to discuss this with, obviously with my
7		director general, Andrew Goodall, and he then suggested
8		we take the issue to the Executive Committee of Welsh
9		Government. So we did have a discussion with the
10		Executive Committee of the Welsh Government about
11		coronavirus. It was determined that it would be as
12		I recall at that meeting, it was determined that we
13		would continue to manage this as a health issue and keep
14		an eye on what was happening. Of course by that time
15		there were no cases yet. Certainly in Wales. I don't
16		think there were any cases in the UK either.
17	Q.	Now, the First Minister, Mr Drakeford, has said in his
18		evidence to the Inquiry that on this day, so on
19		24 January, you advised him that there was a significant
20		risk the virus would arrive in Wales. Do you recall
21		giving that advice to the First Minister?
22	Α.	I don't recall it, but I'm sure that's correct.
23	Q.	Now, despite that advice about a significant risk of the
24		virus arriving in Wales, Covid-19 is not discussed by
25		the Welsh Cabinet until 25 February. Does that surprise 24
		(6) Pages 21 - 24

Then skip a paragraph, paragraph 26:

preparing plans for isolating potentially infected

Wales at this time? So this is 22 January 2020. A. So the initial -- this is about the development of

initially that really was a UK-based process, as is

testing and testing capacity and testing capability, and

recorded there, quite rightly. The colleagues in Public Health England at Porton Down were developing tests. So

individuals and the follow up of contacts."

"DHSC and PHE [Public Health England] were also

Now, the actions referred there are all at UK level and also refer specifically to Public Health England.

What, if any, equivalent actions were being taken in

		•	-	
1	you?	1		doesn't mean that it's going to be a pandemic. We
2 A .	I don't set the agendas for the Cabinet. I think the	2		didn't know by that point that it was going to be
3	from what you're saying it's obviously the case that	3		a pandemic. We had to prepare for something. I think
	there were informal discussions between me I was	4		the language we often used at that time was we needed to
5	keeping Andrew Goodall involve informed, the health	5		hope for the best but prepare for the worst.
6	minister informed and the First Minister informed	6	Q.	Now, at this stage and wearing your lead director of
7	informally. So it doesn't particularly surprise me,	7		HEPU, which the Inquiry heard quite a lot about in
8	given everything else that was happening in Wales,	8		module 2, so that's the HSSG Health Emergency
9	including the management of the flooding. But of course	9		Preparedness Unit, so wearing your HEPU hat, did you
0	I wasn't a member of Cabinet, I didn't go to Cabinet.	10		have any concerns regarding the capacity of the NHS to
1 Q .	Given the significant risk, as you saw it and advised	11		respond to a high-consequence infectious disease?
2	the First Minister about it, that the virus would arrive	12	Α.	I'm not lead of the Health Emergency Preparedness Unit.
3	in Wales, what infection control measures were put in	13		I think that's you're referring to a colleague of
4	place at this stage, so we're still end of January 2020	14		mine that this sits within the the I'm not the
5	to minimise the public health risk in Wales?	15		technical lead of the HEPU.
6 A .	I can't point to specific protections that were put in	16	Q.	So
7	place, but really this was a time when, in Wales, and	17	Α.	Sorry, there is an officer within the Office of the
8	I'm sure in the other nations as well, we were starting	18		Chief Medical Officer who does report to me on that.
9	to think about what the possible consequences might be.	19	Q.	So in your position as CMO, did you have any concerns
0	We were thinking about how we might manage individual	20		regarding the capacity of the NHS to respond to a high
1	outbreaks, how we might scale up any response that we	21		infectious disease at this stage, late January 2020?
2	needed to have. So it was at the start of that we	22	Α.	I suppose I had two two concerns. I think late
3	were at the start of that journey of thinking of how we	23		January was before we were seeing the issues arising in
4	actually scale up responses.	24		Italy, where when Covid first broke out of China, of
5	Of course saying that it's going to arrive in Wales	25		course, it appeared in Italy, and later in the pandemic,
	25			26
1	but it was into late February really, we were starting	1		in other nations, I think that was probably the case at
2	to see issues of capacity there, and at that point	2		UK level as well to a degree.
3	I think it's fair to say we all got very worried about	3	Q.	Now, I think the First Minister in his written evidence
	the NHS capacity. Yes.	4		has would tend to agree with what you've just said.
Q.	Dr Sandifer, who as you know between January and	5		He has rather candidly said in January to February 2020,
6	November 2020 he was the lead strategic director in	6		Covid-19 was not a priority, and he talks about the
7	Public Health Wales for Covid-19, he's told the Inquiry	7		flooding that you've also spoken about.
3	that, with the exception of yourself, the CMO and your	8		Going back to your comment that it was managed too
9	staff, he did not see the same awareness of and urgency	9		long as a purely health issue, when do you think it
0	about Covid across the rest of the Welsh Government, and	10		should have been recognised that this was
1	he says what he thinks was missing in those first	11		a cross-government issue that needed to be handled
2	few weeks between 8 January and 20 February was, in his	12		differently?
3	words, national strategic leadership and co-ordination	13	Α.	I think once we started to see cases appearing once
4	from the Welsh Government, do you share those views?	14		we started to see pictures in Italy of hospitals really
5 A .	I think, looking back, I do share the view that the	15		running into stress and you know, so probably towards
6	issue was managed too long as a health issue rather than	16		the middle, you know, middle of February probably, if
7	as a cross-government issue, and that that I think,	17		you were to ask me to pin down a time.
8	looking back, was a mistake.	18	Q.	On 5 February you received an email from [redacted] that
9	I think as I've already said, in fairness, there	19		followed on from a UK CMO's call.
0	were other major issues going on in Wales. There were	20		If we can, please, have INQ000383585.
21	significant floodings, there was the consequences of	21		Sir Frank, if you want it in hard copy it's tab 10
2	Brexit, et cetera. So there were other issues, but it	22		of your bundle.
3	was, I believe, managed too long as a purely health	23	Α.	Thank you.
4	issue.	24	Q.	This email provides a write-up of a call that Chris,
				• • • • • •
25	Now, interestingly, I think that was the case also	25		presumably Chris Whitty, had with the directors of

1		public health, and I'm just looking at the first bullet	1		There was a parallel strand, of course, around
2		point, it says:	2		keeping chief executives of the health boards aware of
3		"CMO outlined current epidemiology of outbreak	3		the situation. That was led by Andrew Goodall and he
4		[Document read] reasonable worst case scenario	4		would invite me to meet with the chief executives, often
5		planning."	5		by telephone, as well. I'm sure there's records of
6		Do you think that the use of pandemic flu for	6		those discussions.
7		reasonable worst-case scenario planning was reasonable	7		So mitigation planning for the what might be
8		at this stage, so again this is early February,	8		coming would have been was starting about the same
9		5 February 2020?	9		time in Wales, yes.
10	Α.	Yes, I do.	10	Q.	If I could ask you, please, to have a look at another
11	Q.	The email goes on to state that the CMO agrees that	11		email, it's an email of 20 February 2020.
12		planning for mitigation now is wise. Am I right that	12		It's INQ000383626.
13		mitigation in this context refers to a set of actions	13		It's an email from Dr Orford providing you with
14		and measures aimed at reducing the spread of the virus	14		an update on SAGE. It's tab 109, I hope, in your hard
15		and minimising its impact obviously on public health?	15		copy bundle, but we can probably enlarge it on the
16	Α.	Yes.	16		screen for you.
17	Q.	Was mitigation planning being undertaken by the Welsh	17		It's the sixth bullet point that I am interested in.
18		Government at this stage, early February 2020?	18		So this is Dr Orford updating you from SAGE, he says:
19	Α.	So in the same way that Chris Whitty was having	19		"Likely that UK testing has missed 40% of positives,
20		discussions with the directors of public health in	20		due to delay in testing versus detectability of virus."
21		England, we were alerting the system in Wales. I don't	21		Then the next bullet point, please:
22		have a record of them, but I used to meet with the	22		"75-80% likelihood that virus is already in
23		and I still do meet with the directors of public health	23		circulation."
24		on a regular basis. So we had been having discussions	24		Now, pausing there, this is 20 February, would you
25		there. 29	25		agree this meant containment had failed by 20 February? 30
1	Α.	I'm not sure I would agree that containment had failed.	1		initially we thought that asymptomatic infection was
2		The plan, of course, that was developed, you know, had	2		unlikely but that proved not to be the case, that people
3		containment as the initial step and then mitigation	3		could be infected but not know it, not have symptoms.
4		later, but, you know, we hadn't had a lot of cases in	4		Asymptomatic transmission I think became apparent later
5		the UK at this point, and early in a pandemic, early in	5		on.
6		any infection, when you have sporadic cases, you have	6		I think that this line actually says that 30 to 50%
7		an aspiration and a hope that you can contain them by	7		of the I think this is about asymptomatic infection
8		contact tracing around the patients, and that was the	8		as opposed to transmission, but I could be wrong.
9		initial approach we took in Wales. As you get more and	9	Q.	
10		more cases, then that becomes untenable and then you	10		Welsh Government considered asymptomatic transmissio
11		move to the delay phase and what became the coronavirus	11		but concluded that there was insufficient evidence upon
12		control plan.	12		which to base operational decisions, but as the risk
13	Q.	Just a couple of bullet points up, I think it's the	13		became more well understood operational decisions were
14		fifth bullet point, it says:	14		adapted accordingly.
15		"From cruise ship 30-50% asymptomatic mild."	15		Would you agree that, on a precautionary basis,
16		This is a reference to the Diamond Princess. Do you	16		asymptomatic transmission should have been considered
17		consider that there was sufficient evidence as of	17		a likelihood as early as 20 February and operational
18		20 February to consider asymptomatic transmission was at	18		decisions adapted accordingly?
19		least likely?	19	Α.	I can only really repeat what I say, which is that our
20	Α.	I think our understanding of asymptomatic	20		understanding grew gradually. I'm not quite sure I know
21		transmission are you talking about asymptomatic	21		what operational decisions might have been differently
22		infection or asymptomatic transmission?	22		managed, when you talk about the precautionary
23	Q.	Transmission.	23		principle.
24	Α.	Our understanding grew gradually throughout the	24	Q.	We could, please, look at the Welsh Cabinet meeting that
25		pandemic. At the early stages of the pandemic,	25		I mentioned earlier. It's 25 February.
		21			22

Vales, yes. d ask you, please, to have a look at another s an email of 20 February 2020. INQ000383626. an email from Dr Orford providing you with te on SAGE. It's tab 109, I hope, in your hard ndle, but we can probably enlarge it on the or you. the sixth bullet point that I am interested in. s Dr Orford updating you from SAGE, he says: ely that UK testing has missed 40% of positives, elay in testing versus detectability of virus." n the next bullet point, please: 80% likelihood that virus is already in on." v, pausing there, this is 20 February, would you is meant containment had failed by 20 February? 30 ve thought that asymptomatic infection was but that proved not to be the case, that people e infected but not know it, not have symptoms. omatic transmission I think became apparent later nk that this line actually says that 30 to 50% I think this is about asymptomatic infection sed to transmission, but I could be wrong. t Minister in his written evidence has said the Government considered asymptomatic transmission cluded that there was insufficient evidence upon base operational decisions, but as the risk more well understood operational decisions were accordingly. uld you agree that, on a precautionary basis, matic transmission should have been considered as ood as early as 20 February and operational s adapted accordingly? ly really repeat what I say, which is that our anding grew gradually. I'm not quite sure I know erational decisions might have been differently d, when you talk about the precautionary ld, please, look at the Welsh Cabinet meeting that I mentioned earlier. It's 25 February. 32

(8) Pages 29 - 32

		TI			
1		The minutes of that are at INQ000129852.	1		by
2		Sir Frank, it's hard copy bundle, if you want it,	2		U
3		it's tab 17.	3	A.	F
4		Looks as though from these minutes there were five	4	Q.	S
5		items on the agenda, and if we can please go to the	5		pr
6		penultimate page, page 6, under "Any other business",	6		m
7		there is here the first mention of Covid-19. It's	7		th
8		addressed as the last item on the agenda.	8		ha
9		Paragraph 5.1:	9	A.	F
10		"The Minister for Health and Social Services	10	Q.	Lo
11		provided an update on the Coronavirus"	11		C
12		Then paragraph 5.3, Mr Gething informed Cabinet	12		fre
13		that:	13		to
14		"The worldwide response was still in the containment	14		th
15		stage and there had been no imported cases into the UK."	15		th
16		Now, that's not correct, is it? At the COBR meeting	16		C
17		you attended with the First Minister on 18 February,	17	Α.	N
18		that confirmed that there were nine positive cases in	18		ro
19		the UK.	19		C
20	Α.	That may well be the case. I really don't recall.	20		te
21 22	~	I don't think I was at this particular Cabinet meeting.	21 22		de th
	Q.	No, Sir Frank, you weren't at the Cabinet meeting, you			th
23		were at a COBR meeting on 18 February where it was	23	~	w
24		confirmed that there were nine positive cases in the UK,	24	Q.	Y.
25		and I just wanted your views here, where it's being said 33	25		fir
1		We've got the minutes of this meeting.	1	Q.	0
2		It's INQ000056217. I'm grateful.	2		th
3		Sir Frank, if you wanted a hard copy, it's tab 22,	3		С
4		but again I think we'll try to zoom in.	4		
5		It's page 5, paragraph 2 I'd like to take you to,	5		
6		please. Paragraph 2 on that page, starting:	6		pl
7		"The CHAIR invited the Government Chief Medical	7		w
8		Officer and the GCSA to provide a situation	8		re
9		[Document read] there was now sustained community	9		
10		transmission."So this is now 2 March. It's nearly	10		al
11		a week since the first Covid was first discussed by the	11		d
12		Welsh Cabinet, in the minutes we've just seen. It's	12		С
13		ten days after the lockdowns imposed in northern Italy	13	Α.	10
14		that you've mentioned. There have been cases in the UK	14		st
15		since late February, and in fact the first case in Wales	15		be
16		on 28 February. And COBR is being told here that	16		he
17		contact tracing for the source of infection for the last	17		
18		two cases had not been successful and there was	18		do
19		sustained community infection both in France and	19		w
20		Germany.	20		ta
21		Did you understand, attending this meeting, that	21		th
22		containment had been lost, the virus was now in the UK	22		th
23		and was spreading?	23		а
24	Α.		24	Q.	١١
25		we were certainly moving in that direction. 35	25		cł

	by Mr Gething that there were no imported cases into the
	UK; that's just not right, is it?
Α.	From what you say, it can't be.
Δ	So it looks as though the Welsh Covernment appear to be

- So it looks as though the Welsh Government appear to be
- proceeding on the mistaken basis on this 25 February
- meeting, first Cabinet meeting to discuss Covid, that
- he virus had not yet hit these shores when it plainly
- nad. Would you agree?
- From what you say, that seems to be the case.
- _ooking at these minutes there's no consideration by
- Cabinet of what steps should be taken to stop the virus
- rom spreading, what infection control measures needed
- to be thought about and put in place. Does it surprise
- hat those type of discussions are not minuted, being
- his, the first discussion about Covid by the Welsh
- Cabinet?
- No, as I say, I'm not a -- at that stage I didn't
- outinely attend Cabinet, I wasn't at this particular
- Cabinet. My reading of Cabinet minutes is that they
- end to be fairly anodyne notes, they don't contain the
- depth of discussion, often, which -- which goes into
- hem, they tend to be rather terse summaries, which is
- what I would interpret this as being.
- You attended a COBR meeting on 2 March. That was the irst COBR meeting that was chaired by Mr Johnson. 34
- On 3 March, so this is the day after these minutes and his meeting of COBR, saw the publication of the coronavirus action plan. I'm grateful, INQ000066061. If we could have a look at page 10, paragraph 3.9, please. The plan sets out the four nations approach with which we're all very familiar: contain, delay, esearch, mitigate. Did you consider the degree to which containment had already been lost and therefore a strategy in this document being published on 3 March referring to containment was a failed strategy? don't know that containment had been lost by that stage. I think there was still an ambition that we may be able to contain it by the normal methods of public nealth management, that that was still an aspiration. The other point I would make is, of course, these documents -- this was a UK-wide document, of course, which was developed at a UK level, and they sometimes ake, you know, time to appear, time to go from the hinking to the actual publication. And of course at his time, as you doubtless know, things are moving at a very fast pace. want to -- still trying to move through this period chronologically, but just take us -- a step to the side 36
 - (9) Pages 33 36

1	to deal with mass gatherings if I may.	1	" Scottish [Gov] minded to advise
2	On 11 March, the Inquiry has seen evidence that	2	[Document read] more than 500 people."
3	Gareth Davies, the then chairman of the Welsh Rugby	3	Yes, I'm grateful.
4	Union contacted the First Minister's office to express	4	" minded to advise against gatherings of more
5	his concerns about the Six Nations rugby match between	5	than 500 people."
6	Wales and Scotland that was scheduled for that Saturday	6	So as to ensure frontline emergency workers were
7	14 March here in Cardiff at the Principality Stadium.	8 7	able to prioritise the response to the pandemic.
8	He was concerned about that match going ahead.	8	Then if we can go to page 8 of these minutes,
9	I understand that you were invited to speak to the Welsh	9	please, at paragraph 15.
10	Rugby Union. And before we sort of look at the advice	10	The UK Government took the decision not to prohibit
10	that you gave them if we can just put this in context.	10	mass gatherings but it is noted here, it's about
12	On 12 March you had dialled into a COBR meeting at	12	four lines in, that the Prime Minister "respected the
12		12	Scottish Government's decision to cancel mass
	which this issue of mass gatherings was discussed. If		
14 15	we can please have those minutes, it's a hard copy	14	gathering[s] to manage pressure on emergency
15	tab 30, Sir Frank.	15	responders".
16	But it's INQ000056221, and particularly I'd like	16	Now, my question is simply this: would you agree
17	page 5, paragraph 5 and the third bullet point towards	17	that banning mass gatherings so that public emergency
18	the bottom of the page pulled up, please, thank you very	18	services are not displaced would seem to be a pragmatic
19	much.	19	approach?
20	Now, this notes that:	20 A	5 5
21	"The hardest intervention to call was whether to	21	that, and I would also think that there may well have
22	cancel mass gatherings as the evidence was not there,	22	been an advantage in terms of public communication,
23	especially for outdoor events."	23	because it would have given a signal to the public.
24	Then if we can go over the page, page 6, and I think	24	But the context of this, of course, was twofold.
25	it's the ninth bullet point, it starts: 37	25	First of all, in the pandemic flu planning, which we 38
1	were to some degree still following, the issue of	1	might not have occurred had the events been cancelled?
2	cancelling mass gatherings had been considered, but	2	So you wouldn't get, for example, the 20,000 Scottish
3	in the flu plan, that was discounted as not likely to	3	rugby fans that arrived in Cardiff ahead of the match
4	be affected.	4	that was scheduled for that Saturday. So do you agree
5	And I believe that SAGE had also looked at mass	5	it would have been prudent to have advised against ass
6	gatherings and the both the benefits of cancelling	6	gatherings going ahead?
7	them and the potential downsides, the potential risks of	7 A	. With the benefit of hindsight I think that would have
8	cancelling them, and that people might gather in small	8	been a useful thing to do, I think that's a lesson that
9	numbers in pubs, restaurants, clubs, on trains,	9	we should learn into future pandemics, yeah.
10	whatever.	10 Q	. Now, the decision to lock down, as we all know, was made
11	So I think, you know, that's a long way of saying	11	on 23 March, it was announced that evening by Mr Johnson
12	yes. I do think that there may preserving the	12	and then the First Minister of Wales. You say in your
13	pressures on the emergency services should have been	13	witness statement:
14	a factor, it should have been a consideration.	14	"I was not consulted on the UK national lockdown
15	Communications with the public should have been	15	I do not recall a CMO discussion or formal change in our
16	a consideration, but we were following the SAGE advice.	16	advice which led to this decision."
17 C	. What about the impact on public behaviour? If you allow	17	And you say:
18	a mass gathering to go ahead, doesn't it rather send	18	"This was a decision by ministers at COBR led,
19	a message to the public that everything's fine?	19	I understand, by the UK Government. The reality was
20 A	. That's the point I was making.	20	that people were dying, we were looking at what was
21 C		21	happening in Europe and in particularly in Italy at that
22	recognised in these minutes, that the science science	22	time and had no choice but to act on the modelling that
23	wasn't there. But even if the events themselves were	23	was being presented."
24	not major vectors for transmission, isn't the	24	Do you think you should have been consulted about
25	foreseeable issue people attending pubs and bars, which	25	the decision to lock down?
	39		40

(10) Pages 37 - 40

Α.	I do think Welsh Government should have been consulted.	1		agree we agreed with the advice, ministers agreed
	This was a time when things were moving exceptionally	2		with the decision, but yeah, that's how it played
	fast and up till quite a late point in the run-up to	3		out, I believe.
	23 March the assumption that we were all working to was	4	Q.	Had different actions been taken in the months leading
	that we needed to reduce the amount of infection but not	5		up to 23 March could a national lockdown have been
	to reduce it to a level where there would be	6		avoided in your view?
	a bounce-back. There was a kind of famous graphic that	7	Α.	l don't believe so, no.
	was used I think by Professor Sir Chris Whitty and	8	Q.	Sir Frank, I want to just change topic slightly and ask
	Sir Patrick Vallance, which showed that the possible	9		you some short questions just about the 21-day review
	negative effects of flattening the curve too much and	10		process, because, as we know, once the Health
	suppressing viral transmission too much, and there was	11		Protection (Coronavirus Restrictions) (Wales)
	a visceral fear that if we did that the virus would	12		Regulations were made, they were required to be reviewed
	bounce back and bounce back in the winter months, when	13		every 21 days, and you describe in your witness
	we were even less able to deal with it.	14		statement you contributed to that 21-day review process
	So that was the thinking, up till quite a late	15		by providing advice to the Welsh Government based on
	period leading up to 23 March. It was really in those	16		an assessment of how any amendments to the restrictions
	few days, probably between 16 and 23 March, I think,	17		would impact on the four harms that had been identified
	that the pictures from Italy, the looking at what was	18		by Professor Whitty, those four harms being: first,
	happening in Italy, looking at the rate of trans of	19		direct harm to individuals; second, indirect harm;
	increase of infection in the UK led to the realisation	20		third, harms from non-Covid illness; and fourth,
	at a UK level that that way of managing the pandemic was	21		socioeconomic and other societal harms.
	untenable, and so it felt like an emergency handbrake	22		Now, it's right, isn't it, that in Wales a fifth
	being pulled. But it was pulled by the Welsh by	23		harm was added to that last, namely the way Covid has
	the UK Government and we were we certainly felt that it was appropriate to do that by that stage, so we would	24 25		exacerbated existing or introduced new inequalities into Welsh society, that's right
	41	23		42
Δ		1	Δ	
	That's right, yes.	1		It was later than that, sorry, I beg your pardon.
	That's right, yes. Now, that fifth harm, as I understand it, was added in	2	LA	It was later than that, sorry, I beg your pardon. DY HALLETT: Sir Frank had understood.
Q.	That's right, yes. Now, that fifth harm, as I understand it, was added in July 2021 on the advice of TAC, is that right?	2 3	LA A.	It was later than that, sorry, I beg your pardon. DY HALLETT: Sir Frank had understood. I missed that. Thank you.
Q. A.	That's right, yes. Now, that fifth harm, as I understand it, was added in July 2021 on the advice of TAC, is that right? Correct.	2 3 4	LA A.	It was later than that, sorry, I beg your pardon. DY HALLETT: Sir Frank had understood. I missed that. Thank you. POOLE: No, Sir Frank, my understanding is it was
Q. A.	That's right, yes. Now, that fifth harm, as I understand it, was added in July 2021 on the advice of TAC, is that right? Correct. Now, the Inquiry heard evidence last week about concerns	2 3	LAI A. MR	It was later than that, sorry, I beg your pardon. DY HALLETT: Sir Frank had understood. I missed that. Thank you.
Q. A.	That's right, yes. Now, that fifth harm, as I understand it, was added in July 2021 on the advice of TAC, is that right? Correct.	2 3 4 5	LAI A. MR	It was later than that, sorry, I beg your pardon. DY HALLETT: Sir Frank had understood. I missed that. Thank you. POOLE: No, Sir Frank, my understanding is it was July 2021.
Q. A.	That's right, yes. Now, that fifth harm, as I understand it, was added in July 2021 on the advice of TAC, is that right? Correct. Now, the Inquiry heard evidence last week about concerns being raised in early April 2020 about the	2 3 4 5 6	LAI A. MR A.	It was later than that, sorry, I beg your pardon. DY HALLETT: Sir Frank had understood. I missed that. Thank you. POOLE: No, Sir Frank, my understanding is it was July 2021. Yeah.
Q. A.	That's right, yes. Now, that fifth harm, as I understand it, was added in July 2021 on the advice of TAC, is that right? Correct. Now, the Inquiry heard evidence last week about concerns being raised in early April 2020 about the disproportionate impact that the pandemic was having on	2 3 4 5 6 7	LAI A. MR A.	It was later than that, sorry, I beg your pardon. DY HALLETT: Sir Frank had understood. I missed that. Thank you. POOLE: No, Sir Frank, my understanding is it was July 2021. Yeah. In light of now realising it was now 2021, would you
Q. A.	That's right, yes. Now, that fifth harm, as I understand it, was added in July 2021 on the advice of TAC, is that right? Correct. Now, the Inquiry heard evidence last week about concerns being raised in early April 2020 about the disproportionate impact that the pandemic was having on vulnerable and at-risk groups and those with protected	2 3 4 5 6 7 8	LAI A. MR A. Q.	It was later than that, sorry, I beg your pardon. DY HALLETT: Sir Frank had understood. I missed that. Thank you. POOLE: No, Sir Frank, my understanding is it was July 2021. Yeah. In light of now realising it was now 2021, would you want to change your answer?
Q. A.	That's right, yes. Now, that fifth harm, as I understand it, was added in July 2021 on the advice of TAC, is that right? Correct. Now, the Inquiry heard evidence last week about concerns being raised in early April 2020 about the disproportionate impact that the pandemic was having on vulnerable and at-risk groups and those with protected characteristics. Why did it take until July 2021 to add	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	LAI A. MR A. Q.	It was later than that, sorry, I beg your pardon. DY HALLETT: Sir Frank had understood. I missed that. Thank you. POOLE: No, Sir Frank, my understanding is it was July 2021. Yeah. In light of now realising it was now 2021, would you want to change your answer? So it would have been, it would have been better to
Q. A. Q.	That's right, yes. Now, that fifth harm, as I understand it, was added in July 2021 on the advice of TAC, is that right? Correct. Now, the Inquiry heard evidence last week about concerns being raised in early April 2020 about the disproportionate impact that the pandemic was having on vulnerable and at-risk groups and those with protected characteristics. Why did it take until July 2021 to add that fifth harm which dealt with those concerns about	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	LAI A. MR A. Q.	It was later than that, sorry, I beg your pardon. DY HALLETT: Sir Frank had understood. I missed that. Thank you. POOLE: No, Sir Frank, my understanding is it was July 2021. Yeah. In light of now realising it was now 2021, would you want to change your answer? So it would have been, it would have been better to recognise that formally earlier, but we it's not that
Q. A. Q.	That's right, yes. Now, that fifth harm, as I understand it, was added in July 2021 on the advice of TAC, is that right? Correct. Now, the Inquiry heard evidence last week about concerns being raised in early April 2020 about the disproportionate impact that the pandemic was having on vulnerable and at-risk groups and those with protected characteristics. Why did it take until July 2021 to add that fifth harm which dealt with those concerns about disproportionate impact?	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11	LAI A. MR A. Q.	It was later than that, sorry, I beg your pardon. DY HALLETT: Sir Frank had understood. I missed that. Thank you. POOLE: No, Sir Frank, my understanding is it was July 2021. Yeah. In light of now realising it was now 2021, would you want to change your answer? So it would have been, it would have been better to recognise that formally earlier, but we it's not that we didn't recognise it or we weren't working on those
Q. A. Q.	That's right, yes. Now, that fifth harm, as I understand it, was added in July 2021 on the advice of TAC, is that right? Correct. Now, the Inquiry heard evidence last week about concerns being raised in early April 2020 about the disproportionate impact that the pandemic was having on vulnerable and at-risk groups and those with protected characteristics. Why did it take until July 2021 to add that fifth harm which dealt with those concerns about disproportionate impact? I think it was probably because TAC was extremely busy	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12	LAI A. MR A. Q.	It was later than that, sorry, I beg your pardon. DY HALLETT: Sir Frank had understood. I missed that. Thank you. POOLE: No, Sir Frank, my understanding is it was July 2021. Yeah. In light of now realising it was now 2021, would you want to change your answer? So it would have been, it would have been better to recognise that formally earlier, but we it's not that we didn't recognise it or we weren't working on those fronts, there was a lot of activity going on, of course,
Q. A. Q.	That's right, yes. Now, that fifth harm, as I understand it, was added in July 2021 on the advice of TAC, is that right? Correct. Now, the Inquiry heard evidence last week about concerns being raised in early April 2020 about the disproportionate impact that the pandemic was having on vulnerable and at-risk groups and those with protected characteristics. Why did it take until July 2021 to add that fifth harm which dealt with those concerns about disproportionate impact? I think it was probably because TAC was extremely busy on a range of fronts, and it was something which	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	LAI A. MR A. Q.	It was later than that, sorry, I beg your pardon. DY HALLETT: Sir Frank had understood. I missed that. Thank you. POOLE: No, Sir Frank, my understanding is it was July 2021. Yeah. In light of now realising it was now 2021, would you want to change your answer? So it would have been, it would have been better to recognise that formally earlier, but we it's not that we didn't recognise it or we weren't working on those fronts, there was a lot of activity going on, of course, around specific aspects of inequality, not least around
Q. A. Q.	That's right, yes. Now, that fifth harm, as I understand it, was added in July 2021 on the advice of TAC, is that right? Correct. Now, the Inquiry heard evidence last week about concerns being raised in early April 2020 about the disproportionate impact that the pandemic was having on vulnerable and at-risk groups and those with protected characteristics. Why did it take until July 2021 to add that fifth harm which dealt with those concerns about disproportionate impact? I think it was probably because TAC was extremely busy on a range of fronts, and it was something which itself was June really that late? It doesn't seem to	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	LAI A. MR A. Q.	It was later than that, sorry, I beg your pardon. DY HALLETT: Sir Frank had understood. I missed that. Thank you. POOLE: No, Sir Frank, my understanding is it was July 2021. Yeah. In light of now realising it was now 2021, would you want to change your answer? So it would have been, it would have been better to recognise that formally earlier, but we it's not that we didn't recognise it or we weren't working on those fronts, there was a lot of activity going on, of course, around specific aspects of inequality, not least around trying to make sure that we protected the interests of
Q. A. Q.	That's right, yes. Now, that fifth harm, as I understand it, was added in July 2021 on the advice of TAC, is that right? Correct. Now, the Inquiry heard evidence last week about concerns being raised in early April 2020 about the disproportionate impact that the pandemic was having on vulnerable and at-risk groups and those with protected characteristics. Why did it take until July 2021 to add that fifth harm which dealt with those concerns about disproportionate impact? I think it was probably because TAC was extremely busy on a range of fronts, and it was something which itself was June really that late? It doesn't seem to me that late, given the given the pressures that were	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	LAI A. MR A. Q.	It was later than that, sorry, I beg your pardon. DY HALLETT: Sir Frank had understood. I missed that. Thank you. POOLE: No, Sir Frank, my understanding is it was July 2021. Yeah. In light of now realising it was now 2021, would you want to change your answer? So it would have been, it would have been better to recognise that formally earlier, but we it's not that we didn't recognise it or we weren't working on those fronts, there was a lot of activity going on, of course, around specific aspects of inequality, not least around trying to make sure that we protected the interests of people from black, Asian and minority ethnic groups but
Q. A. Q.	That's right, yes. Now, that fifth harm, as I understand it, was added in July 2021 on the advice of TAC, is that right? Correct. Now, the Inquiry heard evidence last week about concerns being raised in early April 2020 about the disproportionate impact that the pandemic was having on vulnerable and at-risk groups and those with protected characteristics. Why did it take until July 2021 to add that fifth harm which dealt with those concerns about disproportionate impact? I think it was probably because TAC was extremely busy on a range of fronts, and it was something which itself was June really that late? It doesn't seem to me that late, given the given the pressures that were on TAC and TAG to do other work, particularly around the	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	LAI A. MR A. Q.	It was later than that, sorry, I beg your pardon. DY HALLETT: Sir Frank had understood. I missed that. Thank you. POOLE: No, Sir Frank, my understanding is it was July 2021. Yeah. In light of now realising it was now 2021, would you want to change your answer? So it would have been, it would have been better to recognise that formally earlier, but we it's not that we didn't recognise it or we weren't working on those fronts, there was a lot of activity going on, of course, around specific aspects of inequality, not least around trying to make sure that we protected the interests of people from black, Asian and minority ethnic groups but also other socio and economically deprived groups. So
Q. A. Q.	That's right, yes. Now, that fifth harm, as I understand it, was added in July 2021 on the advice of TAC, is that right? Correct. Now, the Inquiry heard evidence last week about concerns being raised in early April 2020 about the disproportionate impact that the pandemic was having on vulnerable and at-risk groups and those with protected characteristics. Why did it take until July 2021 to add that fifth harm which dealt with those concerns about disproportionate impact? I think it was probably because TAC was extremely busy on a range of fronts, and it was something which itself was June really that late? It doesn't seem to me that late, given the given the pressures that were on TAC and TAG to do other work, particularly around the modelling and the thinking of where the pandemic was	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	LAI A. MR A. Q.	It was later than that, sorry, I beg your pardon. DY HALLETT: Sir Frank had understood. I missed that. Thank you. POOLE: No, Sir Frank, my understanding is it was July 2021. Yeah. In light of now realising it was now 2021, would you want to change your answer? So it would have been, it would have been better to recognise that formally earlier, but we it's not that we didn't recognise it or we weren't working on those fronts, there was a lot of activity going on, of course, around specific aspects of inequality, not least around trying to make sure that we protected the interests of people from black, Asian and minority ethnic groups but also other socio and economically deprived groups. So there was a lot of work going on, but I agree with you
Q. A. Q.	That's right, yes. Now, that fifth harm, as I understand it, was added in July 2021 on the advice of TAC, is that right? Correct. Now, the Inquiry heard evidence last week about concerns being raised in early April 2020 about the disproportionate impact that the pandemic was having on vulnerable and at-risk groups and those with protected characteristics. Why did it take until July 2021 to add that fifth harm which dealt with those concerns about disproportionate impact? I think it was probably because TAC was extremely busy on a range of fronts, and it was something which itself was June really that late? It doesn't seem to me that late, given the given the pressures that were on TAC and TAG to do other work, particularly around the modelling and the thinking of where the pandemic was going. I think it was to Wales' credit that we did add	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	LAI A. MR A. Q.	It was later than that, sorry, I beg your pardon. DY HALLETT: Sir Frank had understood. I missed that. Thank you. POOLE: No, Sir Frank, my understanding is it was July 2021. Yeah. In light of now realising it was now 2021, would you want to change your answer? So it would have been, it would have been better to recognise that formally earlier, but we it's not that we didn't recognise it or we weren't working on those fronts, there was a lot of activity going on, of course, around specific aspects of inequality, not least around trying to make sure that we protected the interests of people from black, Asian and minority ethnic groups but also other socio and economically deprived groups. So there was a lot of work going on, but I agree with you it would have been better to recognise it formally at an
Q. A. Q.	That's right, yes. Now, that fifth harm, as I understand it, was added in July 2021 on the advice of TAC, is that right? Correct. Now, the Inquiry heard evidence last week about concerns being raised in early April 2020 about the disproportionate impact that the pandemic was having on vulnerable and at-risk groups and those with protected characteristics. Why did it take until July 2021 to add that fifth harm which dealt with those concerns about disproportionate impact? I think it was probably because TAC was extremely busy on a range of fronts, and it was something which itself was June really that late? It doesn't seem to me that late, given the given the pressures that were on TAC and TAG to do other work, particularly around the modelling and the thinking of where the pandemic was going. I think it was to Wales' credit that we did add that fifth element, and it speaks to the fact that we take inequality very seriously in Wales, but I don't think that that was an undue delay.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	LAI A. MR Q. A.	It was later than that, sorry, I beg your pardon. DY HALLETT: Sir Frank had understood. I missed that. Thank you. POOLE: No, Sir Frank, my understanding is it was July 2021. Yeah. In light of now realising it was now 2021, would you want to change your answer? So it would have been, it would have been better to recognise that formally earlier, but we it's not that we didn't recognise it or we weren't working on those fronts, there was a lot of activity going on, of course, around specific aspects of inequality, not least around trying to make sure that we protected the interests of people from black, Asian and minority ethnic groups but also other socio and economically deprived groups. So there was a lot of work going on, but I agree with you it would have been better to recognise it formally at an earlier stage. Now, Sir Frank, before we take a break in 15 minutes' time I just want to deal with, if I can, a topic, face
Q. Q. A.	That's right, yes. Now, that fifth harm, as I understand it, was added in July 2021 on the advice of TAC, is that right? Correct. Now, the Inquiry heard evidence last week about concerns being raised in early April 2020 about the disproportionate impact that the pandemic was having on vulnerable and at-risk groups and those with protected characteristics. Why did it take until July 2021 to add that fifth harm which dealt with those concerns about disproportionate impact? I think it was probably because TAC was extremely busy on a range of fronts, and it was something which itself was June really that late? It doesn't seem to me that late, given the given the pressures that were on TAC and TAG to do other work, particularly around the modelling and the thinking of where the pandemic was going. I think it was to Wales' credit that we did add that fifth element, and it speaks to the fact that we take inequality very seriously in Wales, but I don't think that that was an undue delay. Y HALLETT: Was the fifth harm added in July '21?	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	LAI A. MR Q. A.	It was later than that, sorry, I beg your pardon. DY HALLETT: Sir Frank had understood. I missed that. Thank you. POOLE: No, Sir Frank, my understanding is it was July 2021. Yeah. In light of now realising it was now 2021, would you want to change your answer? So it would have been, it would have been better to recognise that formally earlier, but we it's not that we didn't recognise it or we weren't working on those fronts, there was a lot of activity going on, of course, around specific aspects of inequality, not least around trying to make sure that we protected the interests of people from black, Asian and minority ethnic groups but also other socio and economically deprived groups. So there was a lot of work going on, but I agree with you it would have been better to recognise it formally at an earlier stage. Now, Sir Frank, before we take a break in 15 minutes' time I just want to deal with, if I can, a topic, face coverings, which is an area where there was a difference
Q. A. Q. A.	That's right, yes. Now, that fifth harm, as I understand it, was added in July 2021 on the advice of TAC, is that right? Correct. Now, the Inquiry heard evidence last week about concerns being raised in early April 2020 about the disproportionate impact that the pandemic was having on vulnerable and at-risk groups and those with protected characteristics. Why did it take until July 2021 to add that fifth harm which dealt with those concerns about disproportionate impact? I think it was probably because TAC was extremely busy on a range of fronts, and it was something which itself was June really that late? It doesn't seem to me that late, given the given the pressures that were on TAC and TAG to do other work, particularly around the modelling and the thinking of where the pandemic was going. I think it was to Wales' credit that we did add that fifth element, and it speaks to the fact that we take inequality very seriously in Wales, but I don't think that that was an undue delay. Y HALLETT: Was the fifth harm added in July '21? POOLE: 2021, my Lady.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	LAI A. MR Q. A.	It was later than that, sorry, I beg your pardon. DY HALLETT: Sir Frank had understood. I missed that. Thank you. POOLE: No, Sir Frank, my understanding is it was July 2021. Yeah. In light of now realising it was now 2021, would you want to change your answer? So it would have been, it would have been better to recognise that formally earlier, but we it's not that we didn't recognise it or we weren't working on those fronts, there was a lot of activity going on, of course, around specific aspects of inequality, not least around trying to make sure that we protected the interests of people from black, Asian and minority ethnic groups but also other socio and economically deprived groups. So there was a lot of work going on, but I agree with you it would have been better to recognise it formally at an earlier stage. Now, Sir Frank, before we take a break in 15 minutes' time I just want to deal with, if I can, a topic, face coverings, which is an area where there was a difference of opinion between the four nations on this issue and
Q. A. Q. A. MR A.	That's right, yes. Now, that fifth harm, as I understand it, was added in July 2021 on the advice of TAC, is that right? Correct. Now, the Inquiry heard evidence last week about concerns being raised in early April 2020 about the disproportionate impact that the pandemic was having on vulnerable and at-risk groups and those with protected characteristics. Why did it take until July 2021 to add that fifth harm which dealt with those concerns about disproportionate impact? I think it was probably because TAC was extremely busy on a range of fronts, and it was something which itself was June really that late? It doesn't seem to me that late, given the given the pressures that were on TAC and TAG to do other work, particularly around the modelling and the thinking of where the pandemic was going. I think it was to Wales' credit that we did add that fifth element, and it speaks to the fact that we take inequality very seriously in Wales, but I don't think that that was an undue delay. Y HALLETT: Was the fifth harm added in July '21?	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	LAI A. MR Q. A.	It was later than that, sorry, I beg your pardon. DY HALLETT: Sir Frank had understood. I missed that. Thank you. POOLE: No, Sir Frank, my understanding is it was July 2021. Yeah. In light of now realising it was now 2021, would you want to change your answer? So it would have been, it would have been better to recognise that formally earlier, but we it's not that we didn't recognise it or we weren't working on those fronts, there was a lot of activity going on, of course, around specific aspects of inequality, not least around trying to make sure that we protected the interests of people from black, Asian and minority ethnic groups but also other socio and economically deprived groups. So there was a lot of work going on, but I agree with you it would have been better to recognise it formally at an earlier stage. Now, Sir Frank, before we take a break in 15 minutes' time I just want to deal with, if I can, a topic, face coverings, which is an area where there was a difference

Q.

Α.

(11) Pages 41 - 44

1		consider wearing face coverings in enclosed public
2		spaces such as shops, trains, buses, to obviously help
3		reduce the spread of coronavirus.
4		Now, you issued a statement the following day in
5		which you confirmed that you did not recommend the
6		compulsory wearing of face coverings by everyone when
7		they leave home and indicated that that should be
8		a matter of personal choice. In your witness statement
9		to the Inquiry you give three reasons for that. You
10		say, first, you were concerned about the stock of PPE,
11		and the priority was to ensure that there was sufficient
12		face masks for hospital and care staff. Second, you say
13		that you thought the use of face coverings would promote
14		risky behaviours. And third, you say you were concerned
15		that the face coverings being used in the UK did not
16		generally meet WHO standards.
17		Now, as to your first point about a concern about
18		a stock of PPE, had there been sufficient PPE would your
19		advice have been different, Sir Frank?
20	Α.	There were a number of issues around face coverings.
21		The risk around PPE was not so much about face
22		coverings, it was about face masks. I was very
23		concerned and it was actually earlier than 20 than
24		July, I think you mentioned. But my concern is early in
25		the pandemic, when we were at risk of running out of
		45
1	Α.	It's an issue I believe that the TAC did look at as part
2		of their assessment. What we did with face coverings
3		was we repeatedly asked TAC, and scanned the
4		international literature of course, for the evidence
5		about the effectiveness of face coverings, and the
6		answer continually came back that there was weak
-		

7 evidence of a small benefit.
8 So our approach in Wales, my approach in Wales was
9 much more focused on working to maximise the benefit of
10 the things which we absolutely knew would break viral
11 transmission. So, yeah.

- 12 Q. In June 2020 the Minister for Health and Social Services
 13 and the First Minister requested specific advice on face
 14 coverings. That advice was sought in light of
- requirements being introduced in England mandating the
- use of face coverings in hospital settings and publictransport.

18	Can I just look, please, at an entry from your
19	notebooks, it appears to be dated 7 June.
20	It's INQ000327541. Yes, I'm grateful. It's page 61
21	of the notebook, and it's excellent.
22	There we can see it in front of you, it looks like
23	it's dated top right "7/6/20", so June 2020. It

- 24 appears to query whether there was sufficient evidence
- 25 to suggest mandatory use. Is that what you're referring

47

- 1 PPE -- and I stress at risk, we never actually ran out 2 of PPE in hospitals in Wales, but my concern was that 3 there could be a leaching of a scarce resource towards 4 face coverings in the community, use in the community which would have been inappropriate because it wouldn't 5 6 have provided very much protection and could potentially 7 denude the health and social care system from the vital 8 resources that they needed. **Q.** Had there not been a shortage, though, of PPE, would you 9 10 have been advising that it was advisable to wear a face 11 mask? No, they're two completely different things. The PPE 12 Α. 13 that was being used in hospitals is medical grade 14 face masks. The cloth coverings that we used in the 15 community settings were a completely different thing. 16 What I'm saying is that I was worried that insisting on
- 17 face coverings in the community could in the early stage
- 18 of the pandemic, when we were potentially short -- might
- 19 face running out of PPE in hospitals, could have led to
- 20 face masks being diverted into face coverings.
- Q. As to your second point, namely the promotion of risky
 behaviours, what was the basis of that assumption? Did
 you seek advice from any behavioural scientists about
- 24 concluding that mask wearing could promote such risky
- 25 behaviours?
 - 46

1		to in this entry?
2	Α.	It probably is. I'm asking myself is there enough
3		evidence to support mandatory use, yes.
4	Q.	Sir Frank, as this is the first time that we've looked
5		at a passage from your notebooks perhaps you can just
6		help the Inquiry in this regard. Were these
7		contemporaneous notes that you took personally? So,
8		for example, would this have been something that you had
9		written on 7 June 2020?
10	Α.	It would have been something that I wrote then, but it's
11		important to recognise these are not it wasn't
12		a diary, it wasn't a it was really, I keep notebooks,
13		if I'm going to meet with the First Minister or the
14		health minister, just to kind of shape my thoughts and
15		to create my thoughts as to what I need to brief them
16		on, what I need to say to them, so it's very informal
17		notes, yeah.
18	Q.	If we could just have a look whilst we're here at the
19		next page, page 62, at the top of the page, please.
20		There's a reference to I think it reads "political
21		chazi" and "alignment". Can you help us, what are you
22		referring to there? Were you concerned about Wales
23		adopting a different approach to face coverings than the
24		other nations?
25	•	It's "political choice"

- 25 A. It's "political choice".
- 48

1 Q .		1		about face coverings, I do wonder whether it would have
2 A .	It's really pointing out that, although I had	2		been a better decision just to simply align.
3	reservations the political choice issue is about me	3		I did have one personal issue, which is around the
4	saying I think, this is thinking back four years you	4		use of the 1984 Public Health Act, because I believe,
5	understand that although I couldn't see a good	5		having used the 1984 Act in my career, that you need
6	argument for mandating public health mandating on	6		very good evidence in order to place restrictions under
7	a public health basis the use of face coverings,	7		that Act. But I'm not a lawyer, something for which
В	mandating as opposed to recommending I couldn't see	8		I occasionally give thanks.
9	it but I was recognising, and I was very clear with	9	Q.	Now, Wales was obviously later than the other three
0	ministers, that there was a political choice to be made.	10		nations when it came to advising or mandating face
1	And it was extremely difficult. I felt I was putting	11		coverings, in large part, as I think you would
2	ministers in actually quite a difficult position because	12		acknowledge, based on your advice being given to Welsh
3	I was taking perhaps a slightly different position to my	13		ministers and the First Minister.
4	other CMO colleagues on this one. And the alignment	14		Just some dates: 28 April 2020, Nicola Sturgeon
5	issue is exactly that, the fact that it became confusing	15		advised the use of cloth face masks in enclosed spaces
6	for the public that we were not aligned and that we were	16		on public transport; 7 May, Northern Ireland Executive
7	doing something slightly different on face coverings.	17		recommended face coverings in enclosed spaces where
8	So it was me, really, trying to make sure that ministers	18		social distancing not possible; similar advice in
9	understood that this was their decision but my advice	19		England on 11 May; and yet it was not until 9 June 2020
0	was that the evidence was not robust.	20		that the Welsh Government recommended face coverings
1 Q.	Do you think that taking this stance, as you rightly	21		Now, a number of your colleagues took a different
2	observe different stance to your CMO colleagues in the	22		view to you on face coverings. I mean, the Inquiry
3	other three nations, weakened public messaging?	23		heard last week from Dr Chris Williams. He said he
4 A .	I think it probably did. And when I look back at all	24		verbally argued in TAG in favour of mandatory face
5	the time and energy that was spent in Wales thinking	25		coverings and the First Minister has also said in his
1	written evidence that he thought that they were useful	1		point of view it became very problematic and it became
2	in reinforcing the continued seriousness of the Covid-19	2		difficult I think for ministers to hold the line and
3	position. And we've heard in written evidence from	3		eventually we moved along that axis from advisory to
4	Rebecca Evans, a Welsh minister at the time, taking	4	_	mandatory.
5	a similar position.	5	Q.	
6	Now, in a WhatsApp of 15 July 2020 we don't need	6		any stage?
7	it on screen, I'll just read it to you she said:	7		l don't recall it, no.
В	"One benefit of masks is that they are [Document	8	Q.	
9	read] can't see it."	9		a note.
0	I mean, to what extent did you consider and test	10		It's hard copy tab 96, Sir Frank.
1	those arguments and perhaps test them with the CMOs of	11		But this is a note from Jane Runeckles, Jane
2	the other three nations, or indeed the RCBI behavioural	12		Runeckles being the First Minister's senior special
3	scientists that we heard about, for example	13		adviser. It's dated 10 August 2020. Now, the second
4	Professor Ann John that we heard evidence from last	14		bullet point is recording a briefing given by yourself
5	week?	15		and Dr Orford to the First Minister on face coverings.
6 A .	Extensively, I would say. You know, I joined	16		As we see there:
7	I didn't normally join TAC, but I did join for the	17		"Face coverings [Document read] really
8	discussion on face coverings about that time, and it was	18		is your choice FM."
9	quite clear, and I think it's clear in the TAC advice,	19		First Minister.
20	that opinion within TAC was divided, there were various	20		So this was obviously recognising that Wales is out
1	opinions, so there was no very clear recommendation	21		of step with the rest of the UK but, as you say there,
	coming out of TAC?	22		this was although you were providing the advice, as
2				
3	As regards the WhatsApp from Rebecca Evans, I wasn't	23		far as you're concerned this was a political choice for
	As regards the WhatsApp from Rebecca Evans, I wasn't a party to any of that. But I would agree, and I think	23 24		far as you're concerned this was a political choice for the First Minister and the Welsh Cabinet to make; is

52

(13) Pages 49 - 52

	A. That's correct, yeah.	1	advice on that decision, that was advice from the
2 Q	• • • •	2	Deputy CMO, Chris Jones, Dr Jones. In summary, Dr Jone
3	First Minister remarks that the public were "completely	3	advised that as incidence has increased it was
4	mystified" that face masks were not mandated in	4	appropriate to move away from an advisory to a mandatory
5	supermarkets. I mean, was that taken into account in	5	requirement to wear face coverings in indoor
6	the advice that you were giving the First Minister on	6	environments where social distancing is not possible or
7	this issue?	7	difficult to observe. At that stage, this is
8 A	I think that's the point I was making about I recognise	8	11 September 2020, did you agree with Dr Jones' advice?
9	that the position that we were taking in Wales was	9	A. I don't think I was around at the time. I think my
10	confusing to the public, and yes.	10	personal view hadn't changed but I felt that Dr Jones
11 Q). If you had your time again, Sir Frank, would you have	11	was giving the ministers a way of resolving the problem
12	effectively mandated the wearing of face masks at the	12	that you just described about public communications,
13	same time as, for example, the UK Government did in	13	yeah.
14	England?	14	MR POOLE: My Lady, if that's an appropriate point.
15 A	. I think I probably would, with the caveat that I suspect	15	LADY HALLETT: Yes, certainly. I shall return at 11.30.
16	it would have been subject to legal challenge because	16	(11.13 am)
17	there wasn't very good evidence to support it. But yes,	17	(A short break)
18	I think from all the time and energy that was spent on	18	(11.30 am)
19	face coverings, it would have been better to align.	19	LADY HALLETT: Mr Poole.
20 Q	0. On 11 September 2020 the First Minister issued	20	MR POOLE: Sir Frank, on 3 June 2020 Kirsty Williams
21	a statement which confirmed that from the following	21	announced that schools would re-open in Wales on
22	Monday, 14 September, all residents in Wales over the	22	29 June. The day after that announcement you gave
23	age of 11 would be required to wear face coverings in	23	a press conference in which you stated that your
24	public spaces such as shops.	24	preferred option would have been to re-open schools in
25	Now, the Inquiry understands you did not provide	25	August to allow more time but that the unions did not
	53		54
1	anne to this and as you asid the second bast suffice		
	agree to this, and so you said the second best option	1	that we needed to make an intervention. With all the
2	for re-opening schools in June was the one that was	1 2	that we needed to make an intervention. With all the interventions we made when the virus was on the rise,
2	for re-opening schools in June was the one that was	2	interventions we made when the virus was on the rise,
2 3	for re-opening schools in June was the one that was being adopted.	2 3	interventions we made when the virus was on the rise, the approach that I was recommending was "go early and
2 3 4	for re-opening schools in June was the one that was being adopted. Why did you consider it necessary to make a public	2 3 4	interventions we made when the virus was on the rise, the approach that I was recommending was "go early and go hard". We learnt that really through the first wave
2 3 4 5	for re-opening schools in June was the one that was being adopted. Why did you consider it necessary to make a public statement to the effect that the second best option of opening schools was re-opening on 29 June?	2 3 4 5	interventions we made when the virus was on the rise, the approach that I was recommending was "go early and go hard". We learnt that really through the first wave and into the second wave.
2 3 4 5 6	for re-opening schools in June was the one that was being adopted. Why did you consider it necessary to make a public statement to the effect that the second best option of opening schools was re-opening on 29 June?	2 3 4 5 6	interventions we made when the virus was on the rise, the approach that I was recommending was "go early and go hard". We learnt that really through the first wave and into the second wave. So the simple answer is that the sooner it was
2 3 4 5 6 7 A	for re-opening schools in June was the one that was being adopted. Why did you consider it necessary to make a public statement to the effect that the second best option of opening schools was re-opening on 29 June? I think I was asked to do that by our communications	2 3 4 5 6 7	interventions we made when the virus was on the rise, the approach that I was recommending was "go early and go hard". We learnt that really through the first wave and into the second wave. So the simple answer is that the sooner it was implemented the better, and the length of it was quite
2 3 4 5 6 7 A 8	 for re-opening schools in June was the one that was being adopted. Why did you consider it necessary to make a public statement to the effect that the second best option of opening schools was re-opening on 29 June? I think I was asked to do that by our communications team. I can't remember the exact circumstances. The detailed discussions with politicians on this, and with 	2 3 4 5 6 7 8	interventions we made when the virus was on the rise, the approach that I was recommending was "go early and go hard". We learnt that really through the first wave and into the second wave. So the simple answer is that the sooner it was implemented the better, and the length of it was quite important, because I think Public Health Wales at that time was advising that three weeks would have been
2 3 4 5 6 7 A 9 10	 for re-opening schools in June was the one that was being adopted. Why did you consider it necessary to make a public statement to the effect that the second best option of opening schools was re-opening on 29 June? I think I was asked to do that by our communications team. I can't remember the exact circumstances. The detailed discussions with politicians on this, and with the unions indeed, was held by my deputy, Chris Jones, 	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	interventions we made when the virus was on the rise, the approach that I was recommending was "go early and go hard". We learnt that really through the first wave and into the second wave. So the simple answer is that the sooner it was implemented the better, and the length of it was quite important, because I think Public Health Wales at that time was advising that three weeks would have been preferable, but two weeks was the absolute minimum, and
2 3 4 5 6 7 A 9 10	 for re-opening schools in June was the one that was being adopted. Why did you consider it necessary to make a public statement to the effect that the second best option of opening schools was re-opening on 29 June? I think I was asked to do that by our communications team. I can't remember the exact circumstances. The detailed discussions with politicians on this, and with the unions indeed, was held by my deputy, Chris Jones, but I was asked to front the media, the media aspect of 	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11	interventions we made when the virus was on the rise, the approach that I was recommending was "go early and go hard". We learnt that really through the first wave and into the second wave. So the simple answer is that the sooner it was implemented the better, and the length of it was quite important, because I think Public Health Wales at that time was advising that three weeks would have been preferable, but two weeks was the absolute minimum, and that's the advice I passed on to ministers. It
2 3 4 5 6 7 A 9 10 11	 for re-opening schools in June was the one that was being adopted. Why did you consider it necessary to make a public statement to the effect that the second best option of opening schools was re-opening on 29 June? I think I was asked to do that by our communications team. I can't remember the exact circumstances. The detailed discussions with politicians on this, and with the unions indeed, was held by my deputy, Chris Jones, but I was asked to front the media, the media aspect of that, yeah. 	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12	interventions we made when the virus was on the rise, the approach that I was recommending was "go early and go hard". We learnt that really through the first wave and into the second wave. So the simple answer is that the sooner it was implemented the better, and the length of it was quite important, because I think Public Health Wales at that time was advising that three weeks would have been preferable, but two weeks was the absolute minimum, and that's the advice I passed on to ministers. It certainly did have an impact in terms of reducing
2 3 4 5 6 7 A 9 10 11 12 13 Q	 for re-opening schools in June was the one that was being adopted. Why did you consider it necessary to make a public statement to the effect that the second best option of opening schools was re-opening on 29 June? I think I was asked to do that by our communications team. I can't remember the exact circumstances. The detailed discussions with politicians on this, and with the unions indeed, was held by my deputy, Chris Jones, but I was asked to front the media, the media aspect of that, yeah. Changing topic again, just briefly on the 	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	interventions we made when the virus was on the rise, the approach that I was recommending was "go early and go hard". We learnt that really through the first wave and into the second wave. So the simple answer is that the sooner it was implemented the better, and the length of it was quite important, because I think Public Health Wales at that time was advising that three weeks would have been preferable, but two weeks was the absolute minimum, and that's the advice I passed on to ministers. It certainly did have an impact in terms of reducing transmission, but the impact was relatively short lived.
2 3 4 5 6 7 A 9 10 11 12 13 Q 14	 for re-opening schools in June was the one that was being adopted. Why did you consider it necessary to make a public statement to the effect that the second best option of opening schools was re-opening on 29 June? I think I was asked to do that by our communications team. I can't remember the exact circumstances. The detailed discussions with politicians on this, and with the unions indeed, was held by my deputy, Chris Jones, but I was asked to front the media, the media aspect of that, yeah. Changing topic again, just briefly on the circuit-breaker, now, we know a circuit-breaker was 	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	 interventions we made when the virus was on the rise, the approach that I was recommending was "go early and go hard". We learnt that really through the first wave and into the second wave. So the simple answer is that the sooner it was implemented the better, and the length of it was quite important, because I think Public Health Wales at that time was advising that three weeks would have been preferable, but two weeks was the absolute minimum, and that's the advice I passed on to ministers. It certainly did have an impact in terms of reducing transmission, but the impact was relatively short lived. Q. Sir Frank, moving forward quite considerably in the
2 3 4 5 6 7 A 8 9 10 11 12 13 Q 14 15	 for re-opening schools in June was the one that was being adopted. Why did you consider it necessary to make a public statement to the effect that the second best option of opening schools was re-opening on 29 June? I think I was asked to do that by our communications team. I can't remember the exact circumstances. The detailed discussions with politicians on this, and with the unions indeed, was held by my deputy, Chris Jones, but I was asked to front the media, the media aspect of that, yeah. Changing topic again, just briefly on the circuit-breaker, now, we know a circuit-breaker was first recommended by SAGE on 21 September 2020. That 	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	 interventions we made when the virus was on the rise, the approach that I was recommending was "go early and go hard". We learnt that really through the first wave and into the second wave. So the simple answer is that the sooner it was implemented the better, and the length of it was quite important, because I think Public Health Wales at that time was advising that three weeks would have been preferable, but two weeks was the absolute minimum, and that's the advice I passed on to ministers. It certainly did have an impact in terms of reducing transmission, but the impact was relatively short lived. Q. Sir Frank, moving forward quite considerably in the chronology to 27 November 2021, which is when Omicron
2 3 4 5 6 7 A 9 10 11 12 13 Q 14 15 16	 for re-opening schools in June was the one that was being adopted. Why did you consider it necessary to make a public statement to the effect that the second best option of opening schools was re-opening on 29 June? I think I was asked to do that by our communications team. I can't remember the exact circumstances. The detailed discussions with politicians on this, and with the unions indeed, was held by my deputy, Chris Jones, but I was asked to front the media, the media aspect of that, yeah. Changing topic again, just briefly on the circuit-breaker, now, we know a circuit-breaker was first recommended by SAGE on 21 September 2020. That advice was reiterated by TAC in later September and then 	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	 interventions we made when the virus was on the rise, the approach that I was recommending was "go early and go hard". We learnt that really through the first wave and into the second wave. So the simple answer is that the sooner it was implemented the better, and the length of it was quite important, because I think Public Health Wales at that time was advising that three weeks would have been preferable, but two weeks was the absolute minimum, and that's the advice I passed on to ministers. It certainly did have an impact in terms of reducing transmission, but the impact was relatively short lived. Q. Sir Frank, moving forward quite considerably in the chronology to 27 November 2021, which is when Omicron was identified as a variant of concern.
2 3 4 5 6 7 A 9 10 11 12 13 Q 14 15 16 17	 for re-opening schools in June was the one that was being adopted. Why did you consider it necessary to make a public statement to the effect that the second best option of opening schools was re-opening on 29 June? I think I was asked to do that by our communications team. I can't remember the exact circumstances. The detailed discussions with politicians on this, and with the unions indeed, was held by my deputy, Chris Jones, but I was asked to front the media, the media aspect of that, yeah. Changing topic again, just briefly on the circuit-breaker, now, we know a circuit-breaker was first recommended by SAGE on 21 September 2020. That advice was reiterated by TAC in later September and then early October. 	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	 interventions we made when the virus was on the rise, the approach that I was recommending was "go early and go hard". We learnt that really through the first wave and into the second wave. So the simple answer is that the sooner it was implemented the better, and the length of it was quite important, because I think Public Health Wales at that time was advising that three weeks would have been preferable, but two weeks was the absolute minimum, and that's the advice I passed on to ministers. It certainly did have an impact in terms of reducing transmission, but the impact was relatively short lived. Q. Sir Frank, moving forward quite considerably in the chronology to 27 November 2021, which is when Omicron was identified as a variant of concern. If I could, please, ask you to look at, again, your
2 3 4 5 6 7 A 9 10 11 12 13 Q 14 15 16 17 18	 for re-opening schools in June was the one that was being adopted. Why did you consider it necessary to make a public statement to the effect that the second best option of opening schools was re-opening on 29 June? I think I was asked to do that by our communications team. I can't remember the exact circumstances. The detailed discussions with politicians on this, and with the unions indeed, was held by my deputy, Chris Jones, but I was asked to front the media, the media aspect of that, yeah. Changing topic again, just briefly on the circuit-breaker, now, we know a circuit-breaker was first recommended by SAGE on 21 September 2020. That advice was reiterated by TAC in later September and then early October. 	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	 interventions we made when the virus was on the rise, the approach that I was recommending was "go early and go hard". We learnt that really through the first wave and into the second wave. So the simple answer is that the sooner it was implemented the better, and the length of it was quite important, because I think Public Health Wales at that time was advising that three weeks would have been preferable, but two weeks was the absolute minimum, and that's the advice I passed on to ministers. It certainly did have an impact in terms of reducing transmission, but the impact was relatively short lived. Q. Sir Frank, moving forward quite considerably in the chronology to 27 November 2021, which is when Omicron was identified as a variant of concern. If I could, please, ask you to look at, again, your notebook, there was an entry from 10 December 2021 that
2 3 4 5 6 7 A 8 9 10 11 12 13 Q 14 15 16 17 18 19	 for re-opening schools in June was the one that was being adopted. Why did you consider it necessary to make a public statement to the effect that the second best option of opening schools was re-opening on 29 June? I think I was asked to do that by our communications team. I can't remember the exact circumstances. The detailed discussions with politicians on this, and with the unions indeed, was held by my deputy, Chris Jones, but I was asked to front the media, the media aspect of that, yeah. Changing topic again, just briefly on the circuit-breaker, now, we know a circuit-breaker was first recommended by SAGE on 21 September 2020. That advice was reiterated by TAC in later September and then early October. Given the advice that had been received as early as mid-September that a circuit-breaker was needed and 	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19	 interventions we made when the virus was on the rise, the approach that I was recommending was "go early and go hard". We learnt that really through the first wave and into the second wave. So the simple answer is that the sooner it was implemented the better, and the length of it was quite important, because I think Public Health Wales at that time was advising that three weeks would have been preferable, but two weeks was the absolute minimum, and that's the advice I passed on to ministers. It certainly did have an impact in terms of reducing transmission, but the impact was relatively short lived. Q. Sir Frank, moving forward quite considerably in the chronology to 27 November 2021, which is when Omicron was identified as a variant of concern. If I could, please, ask you to look at, again, your notebook, there was an entry from 10 December 2021 that appears to relate to measures in response to Omicron.
2 3 4 5 6 7 A 9 10 11 12 13 Q 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	 for re-opening schools in June was the one that was being adopted. Why did you consider it necessary to make a public statement to the effect that the second best option of opening schools was re-opening on 29 June? I think I was asked to do that by our communications team. I can't remember the exact circumstances. The detailed discussions with politicians on this, and with the unions indeed, was held by my deputy, Chris Jones, but I was asked to front the media, the media aspect of that, yeah. Changing topic again, just briefly on the circuit-breaker, now, we know a circuit-breaker was first recommended by SAGE on 21 September 2020. That advice was reiterated by TAC in later September and then early October. Given the advice that had been received as early as mid-September that a circuit-breaker was needed and would be most effective if implemented early and deeply, 	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	 interventions we made when the virus was on the rise, the approach that I was recommending was "go early and go hard". We learnt that really through the first wave and into the second wave. So the simple answer is that the sooner it was implemented the better, and the length of it was quite important, because I think Public Health Wales at that time was advising that three weeks would have been preferable, but two weeks was the absolute minimum, and that's the advice I passed on to ministers. It certainly did have an impact in terms of reducing transmission, but the impact was relatively short lived. Q. Sir Frank, moving forward quite considerably in the chronology to 27 November 2021, which is when Omicron was identified as a variant of concern. If I could, please, ask you to look at, again, your notebook, there was an entry from 10 December 2021 that appears to relate to measures in response to Omicron. Now, your notebook entry, it's INQ000327548, please, in
2 3 4 5 6 7 A 9 10 11 12 13 Q 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	 for re-opening schools in June was the one that was being adopted. Why did you consider it necessary to make a public statement to the effect that the second best option of opening schools was re-opening on 29 June? I think I was asked to do that by our communications team. I can't remember the exact circumstances. The detailed discussions with politicians on this, and with the unions indeed, was held by my deputy, Chris Jones, but I was asked to front the media, the media aspect of that, yeah. Changing topic again, just briefly on the circuit-breaker, now, we know a circuit-breaker was first recommended by SAGE on 21 September 2020. That advice was reiterated by TAC in later September and then early October. Given the advice that had been received as early as mid-September that a circuit-breaker was needed and would be most effective if implemented early and deeply, do you think that the Welsh Government should have 	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	 interventions we made when the virus was on the rise, the approach that I was recommending was "go early and go hard". We learnt that really through the first wave and into the second wave. So the simple answer is that the sooner it was implemented the better, and the length of it was quite important, because I think Public Health Wales at that time was advising that three weeks would have been preferable, but two weeks was the absolute minimum, and that's the advice I passed on to ministers. It certainly did have an impact in terms of reducing transmission, but the impact was relatively short lived. Q. Sir Frank, moving forward quite considerably in the chronology to 27 November 2021, which is when Omicron was identified as a variant of concern. If I could, please, ask you to look at, again, your notebook, there was an entry from 10 December 2021 that appears to relate to measures in response to Omicron. Now, your notebook entry, it's INQ000327548, please, in hard copy it's 77. On page 79, it's about nine lines
2 3 4 5 6 7 A 9 10 11 12 13 Q 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	 for re-opening schools in June was the one that was being adopted. Why did you consider it necessary to make a public statement to the effect that the second best option of opening schools was re-opening on 29 June? I think I was asked to do that by our communications team. I can't remember the exact circumstances. The detailed discussions with politicians on this, and with the unions indeed, was held by my deputy, Chris Jones, but I was asked to front the media, the media aspect of that, yeah. Changing topic again, just briefly on the circuit-breaker, now, we know a circuit-breaker was first recommended by SAGE on 21 September 2020. That advice was reiterated by TAC in later September and then early October. Given the advice that had been received as early as mid-September that a circuit-breaker was needed and would be most effective if implemented early and deeply, do you think that the Welsh Government should have implemented a firebreak lockdown sooner than they did? 	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	 interventions we made when the virus was on the rise, the approach that I was recommending was "go early and go hard". We learnt that really through the first wave and into the second wave. So the simple answer is that the sooner it was implemented the better, and the length of it was quite important, because I think Public Health Wales at that time was advising that three weeks would have been preferable, but two weeks was the absolute minimum, and that's the advice I passed on to ministers. It certainly did have an impact in terms of reducing transmission, but the impact was relatively short lived. Q. Sir Frank, moving forward quite considerably in the chronology to 27 November 2021, which is when Omicron was identified as a variant of concern. If I could, please, ask you to look at, again, your notebook, there was an entry from 10 December 2021 that appears to relate to measures in response to Omicron. Now, your notebook entry, it's INQ000327548, please, in hard copy it's 77. On page 79, it's about nine lines down. The note reads:
2 3 4 5 6 7 A 8 9 10 11 12 13 Q 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 A	 for re-opening schools in June was the one that was being adopted. Why did you consider it necessary to make a public statement to the effect that the second best option of opening schools was re-opening on 29 June? I think I was asked to do that by our communications team. I can't remember the exact circumstances. The detailed discussions with politicians on this, and with the unions indeed, was held by my deputy, Chris Jones, but I was asked to front the media, the media aspect of that, yeah. Changing topic again, just briefly on the circuit-breaker, now, we know a circuit-breaker was first recommended by SAGE on 21 September 2020. That advice was reiterated by TAC in later September and then early October. Given the advice that had been received as early as mid-September that a circuit-breaker was needed and would be most effective if implemented early and deeply, do you think that the Welsh Government should have implemented a firebreak lockdown sooner than they did? 	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	 interventions we made when the virus was on the rise, the approach that I was recommending was "go early and go hard". We learnt that really through the first wave and into the second wave. So the simple answer is that the sooner it was implemented the better, and the length of it was quite important, because I think Public Health Wales at that time was advising that three weeks would have been preferable, but two weeks was the absolute minimum, and that's the advice I passed on to ministers. It certainly did have an impact in terms of reducing transmission, but the impact was relatively short lived. Q. Sir Frank, moving forward quite considerably in the chronology to 27 November 2021, which is when Omicron was identified as a variant of concern. If I could, please, ask you to look at, again, your notebook, there was an entry from 10 December 2021 that appears to relate to measures in response to Omicron. Now, your notebook entry, it's INQ000327548, please, in hard copy it's 77. On page 79, it's about nine lines down. The note reads:
2 3 4 5 6 7 A 9 10 11 12 13 Q 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	 for re-opening schools in June was the one that was being adopted. Why did you consider it necessary to make a public statement to the effect that the second best option of opening schools was re-opening on 29 June? I think I was asked to do that by our communications team. I can't remember the exact circumstances. The detailed discussions with politicians on this, and with the unions indeed, was held by my deputy, Chris Jones, but I was asked to front the media, the media aspect of that, yeah. Changing topic again, just briefly on the circuit-breaker, now, we know a circuit-breaker was first recommended by SAGE on 21 September 2020. That advice was reiterated by TAC in later September and then early October. Given the advice that had been received as early as mid-September that a circuit-breaker was needed and would be most effective if implemented early and deeply, do you think that the Welsh Government should have implemented a firebreak lockdown sooner than they did? 	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	 interventions we made when the virus was on the rise, the approach that I was recommending was "go early and go hard". We learnt that really through the first wave and into the second wave. So the simple answer is that the sooner it was implemented the better, and the length of it was quite important, because I think Public Health Wales at that time was advising that three weeks would have been preferable, but two weeks was the absolute minimum, and that's the advice I passed on to ministers. It certainly did have an impact in terms of reducing transmission, but the impact was relatively short lived. Q. Sir Frank, moving forward quite considerably in the chronology to 27 November 2021, which is when Omicron was identified as a variant of concern. If I could, please, ask you to look at, again, your notebook, there was an entry from 10 December 2021 that appears to relate to measures in response to Omicron. Now, your notebook entry, it's INQ000327548, please, in hard copy it's 77. On page 79, it's about nine lines down. The note reads:

(14) Pages 53 - 56

	helpfully for us, thank you.	1
		2
	of the likely severity of the Omicron outbreak and the	3
	restrictions that were required?	4
Α.	No, I don't. I think at that point we were looking at	5
	Omicron, we didn't know an awful lot about the Omicron,	6
	we understood it to have a high transmissibility	7
	advantage over previous strains of the virus, so we	8
	could see it starting to spread very rapidly. What we	9
	didn't know, what we couldn't know at that point was how	10
	path you know, the severity of the illness that it	11
	would cause. So I think that at that point I was	12
	obviously this note seems to suggest to me that I was	13
	thinking that we would have to go in towards a more	14
	of a lockdown sort of situation. As it transpired to	15
	, your point about, you know, whether I was unduly	16
	pessimistic I was pessimistic but my pessimism was	17
		18
	better to be wise than lucky.	19
Q.	If we can, sticking with your notebook, have a look at	20
	page 101, please.	21
	At the very bottom of the page there is an entry	22
	from 21 December 2021, it's the word, in capitals,	23
	"PROBLEM"	24
Α.	Yeah.	25
	57	
	is mid-March 2020?	1
Α.	Sorry, I missed your question, they should have been	2
		3
Q.	No, they were advised to take steps but they weren't at	4
	that point in time contacted, mid-March.	5
Α.	Well, the shielding process was managed in the early	6
	phase certainly as a four nations construct, really, so	7
	we were all trying to stay aligned on shielding, but	8
	I think you're right, it moved from advisory to it	9
	was never instruction, it was never a directorate, but	10
	the writing out process. Is that what you're asking	11
	about, about the formal writing out?	12
Q.	So on the perhaps if I can help you. So I was asking	13
	you about 16 March, and then on 24 March that is when	14
	you wrote to almost 100,000 people who had been	15
	identified as most vulnerable, and advised them to stay	16
	at home for 12 weeks. How were those people identified,	17
	those 100,000?	18
Α.	Yeah, it was quite a difficult, quite a complex process.	19
	The people in that group were identified initially at	20
	a UK level in England actually, an England level,	21
	through their information their informatics systems.	22
	Q. A. Q. Q.	 restrictions that were required? A. No, I don't. I think at that point we were looking at Omicron, we didn't know an awful lot about the Omicron, we understood it to have a high transmissibility advantage over previous strains of the virus, so we could see it starting to spread very rapidly. What we didn't know, what we couldn't know at that point was how path you know, the severity of the illness that it would cause. So I think that at that point low as obviously this note seems to suggest to me that I was thinking that we would have to go in towards a more of a lockdown sort of situation. As it transpired to your point about, you know, whether I was unduly pessimistic I was pessimistic but my pessimism was unjustified, and so we were lucky. But sometimes it's better to be wise than lucky. Q. If we can, sticking with your notebook, have a look at page 101, please. At the very bottom of the page there is an entry from 21 December 2021, it's the word, in capitals, "PROBLEM". A. Yeah. 57 A. Sorry, I missed your question, they should have been you said they were contacted or Q. No, they were advised to take steps but they weren't at that point in time contacted, mid-March. A. Well, the shielding process was managed in the early phase certainly as a four nations construct, really, so we were all trying to stay aligned on shielding, but I think you're right, it moved from advisory to it was never instruction, it was never a directorate, but the writing out process. Is that what you're asking about, about the formal writing out? Q. So on the perhaps if I can help you. So I was asking you about 16 March, and then on 24 March that is when you wrote to almost 100,000 people who had been identified as most vulnerable, and advised them to stay at home for 12 weeks. How were those people identified, those 100,000? A. Yeah, it was quite a difficult, quite a complex process. The people in that group w

- 22 through their information -- their informatics systems.
- 23 Our informatics systems were slightly different, and not
- aligned, and so it was actually quite a mammoth task for
- 25 our IT folks and to clinicians to work -- to develop

1	Q.	"I have given clear [advice] that L4 [so level 4]
2		restrictions are needed. Ministers stuck on financial
3		implications can afford L2 but not L4."
4		First of all, have I read that correctly?
5	Α.	You have read it correctly, if I can read it correctly,
6		but yes, that's what it says.
7	Q.	Can you just explain to us that entry, was your view in
8		effect that level 4 restrictions were needed but
9	Α.	Yeah.
10	Q.	because of the economic or financial implications,
11		the political decision was that they couldn't afford,
12		effectively, to move to level 4?
13	Α.	I have to confess I don't remember it well but that's
14		what it reads like to me.
15	Q.	Sir Frank, I would like to ask you next some questions
16		now about shielding.
17		Now, on 16 March 2020, the Welsh Government, in
18		conjunction with the UK Government, announced a package
19		of measures advising those who were at increased risk of
20		severely illness from Covid to be particularly stringent
21		in following social distancing measures, and that group
22		was then not contacted but were advised to take steps to
23		reduce social interactions.
24		Do you think that group, that vulnerable group,
25		should have been contacted at that stage, in so this
		58
1		a similar list in Wales. So we identified them in that
2		way, that's how we created our shielded group.
3	Q.	I think I'm right in saying you also asked GPs to make
4		clinical judgements in relation to their patients in
5		order to identify the most vulnerable patients. Can
6		I ask you this: do you think that ran a risk of
7		inconsistent practices being adopted in relation to
8		identifying who were the most vulnerable in society?
9	Α.	Yes, but we were keen that, given the risk of missing
10		people off the list, and given the fact that GPs know
11		their patients far better than a computer system run at
12		national level does, that GPs had the power to add
40		where the standard light is the standard stand

- 3 people to the list if they -- in their judgement, that
- 14 person was at significant risk.
- 5 **Q.** Now, just by way of chronology, there were changes to 6 the shielding policy introduced on 4 June 2020. On
- 7 22 June England announced that those shielding could
- 18 meet in groups of six outdoors and could form a bubble
- 9 with an extended household from 6 July. And then on
- 0 29 June it was announced that those shielding in Wales
- would be able to form part of an extended household from
- 22 6 July. Shielding was then paused in England on
- 23 1 August. I think in Wales shielding continued until at
- 24 least 16 August. Can I just ask you to, please, look at
- 25 a notebook entry.

1		It's INQ000327541.
2		It's page 56, and we see in the middle of that
3		page it's a sort of spike diagram, you see the words
4		"Shielded group" in the centre, and one of the options
5		or one of the references is to continue until 16 August.
6		What is being considered here? Is this whether
7		shielding should continue in Wales beyond that in
8		England?
9	Α.	Again, it's difficult to recall from that note, but my
10		recall of the issue was that we tried, as
11		a four nations, to make common decisions on this, on
12		when to pause shielding, and so, as you rightly say,
13		England went on 1 August. I think ministers had had
14		some discussion with patient interest groups it was
15		either that or it was with the social forum, and had
16		made a commitment to continue to the 16th. So I think
17		that was the I think, if I recall correctly, that was
18		the reason why we went we paused it a little bit
19		later in Wales than in England.
20	Q.	If we can just finally turn over the page, I think it's
21		page 57 I'm grateful we see there there's another
22		spider diagram, and in the middle the word
23		"Omnishambles"?
24	Α.	Yes.
25	Q.	What's that referring to?
		······································
		61
		-
1		-
1 2		61
		61 CTI asked you about a moment ago, and I want to go back
2		61 CTI asked you about a moment ago, and I want to go back again to that press release of May 2020 that CTI just
2 3		61 CTI asked you about a moment ago, and I want to go back again to that press release of May 2020 that CTI just asked you about.
2 3 4		61 CTI asked you about a moment ago, and I want to go back again to that press release of May 2020 that CTI just asked you about. So just to be clear, this was at a time when Wales
2 3 4 5		61 CTI asked you about a moment ago, and I want to go back again to that press release of May 2020 that CTI just asked you about. So just to be clear, this was at a time when Wales was the only nation in the United Kingdom not to
2 3 4 5 6		61 CTI asked you about a moment ago, and I want to go back again to that press release of May 2020 that CTI just asked you about. So just to be clear, this was at a time when Wales was the only nation in the United Kingdom not to recommend the use of face coverings and, as we've just
2 3 4 5 6 7		61 CTI asked you about a moment ago, and I want to go back again to that press release of May 2020 that CTI just asked you about. So just to be clear, this was at a time when Wales was the only nation in the United Kingdom not to recommend the use of face coverings and, as we've just heard, on 11 May Chris Whitty and the UK Government
2 3 4 5 6 7 8		61 CTI asked you about a moment ago, and I want to go back again to that press release of May 2020 that CTI just asked you about. So just to be clear, this was at a time when Wales was the only nation in the United Kingdom not to recommend the use of face coverings and, as we've just heard, on 11 May Chris Whitty and the UK Government advised the public not to wear face coverings sorry,
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9		CTI asked you about a moment ago, and I want to go back again to that press release of May 2020 that CTI just asked you about. So just to be clear, this was at a time when Wales was the only nation in the United Kingdom not to recommend the use of face coverings and, as we've just heard, on 11 May Chris Whitty and the UK Government advised the public not to wear face coverings sorry, to wear face coverings in enclosed public spaces, and
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10		CTI asked you about a moment ago, and I want to go back again to that press release of May 2020 that CTI just asked you about. So just to be clear, this was at a time when Wales was the only nation in the United Kingdom not to recommend the use of face coverings and, as we've just heard, on 11 May Chris Whitty and the UK Government advised the public not to wear face coverings sorry, to wear face coverings in enclosed public spaces, and Sir Chris publicly stated that his advice was on the
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11		CTI asked you about a moment ago, and I want to go back again to that press release of May 2020 that CTI just asked you about. So just to be clear, this was at a time when Wales was the only nation in the United Kingdom not to recommend the use of face coverings and, as we've just heard, on 11 May Chris Whitty and the UK Government advised the public not to wear face coverings sorry, to wear face coverings in enclosed public spaces, and Sir Chris publicly stated that his advice was on the advice of SAGE.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12		61 CTI asked you about a moment ago, and I want to go back again to that press release of May 2020 that CTI just asked you about. So just to be clear, this was at a time when Wales was the only nation in the United Kingdom not to recommend the use of face coverings and, as we've just heard, on 11 May Chris Whitty and the UK Government advised the public not to wear face coverings sorry, to wear face coverings in enclosed public spaces, and Sir Chris publicly stated that his advice was on the advice of SAGE. Now, I'm just going to quote from your press
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13		CTI asked you about a moment ago, and I want to go back again to that press release of May 2020 that CTI just asked you about. So just to be clear, this was at a time when Wales was the only nation in the United Kingdom not to recommend the use of face coverings and, as we've just heard, on 11 May Chris Whitty and the UK Government advised the public not to wear face coverings sorry, to wear face coverings in enclosed public spaces, and Sir Chris publicly stated that his advice was on the advice of SAGE. Now, I'm just going to quote from your press statement from the Welsh Government website in part.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 13		CTI asked you about a moment ago, and I want to go back again to that press release of May 2020 that CTI just asked you about. So just to be clear, this was at a time when Wales was the only nation in the United Kingdom not to recommend the use of face coverings and, as we've just heard, on 11 May Chris Whitty and the UK Government advised the public not to wear face coverings sorry, to wear face coverings in enclosed public spaces, and Sir Chris publicly stated that his advice was on the advice of SAGE. Now, I'm just going to quote from your press statement from the Welsh Government website in part. What you state is this:
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15		CTI asked you about a moment ago, and I want to go back again to that press release of May 2020 that CTI just asked you about. So just to be clear, this was at a time when Wales was the only nation in the United Kingdom not to recommend the use of face coverings and, as we've just heard, on 11 May Chris Whitty and the UK Government advised the public not to wear face coverings sorry, to wear face coverings in enclosed public spaces, and Sir Chris publicly stated that his advice was on the advice of SAGE. Now, I'm just going to quote from your press statement from the Welsh Government website in part. What you state is this:
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16		CTI asked you about a moment ago, and I want to go back again to that press release of May 2020 that CTI just asked you about. So just to be clear, this was at a time when Wales was the only nation in the United Kingdom not to recommend the use of face coverings and, as we've just heard, on 11 May Chris Whitty and the UK Government advised the public not to wear face coverings sorry, to wear face coverings in enclosed public spaces, and Sir Chris publicly stated that his advice was on the advice of SAGE. Now, I'm just going to quote from your press statement from the Welsh Government website in part. What you state is this: "I am not recommending the compulsory wearing of face coverings by everyone wherever they leave home
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17		CTI asked you about a moment ago, and I want to go back again to that press release of May 2020 that CTI just asked you about. So just to be clear, this was at a time when Wales was the only nation in the United Kingdom not to recommend the use of face coverings and, as we've just heard, on 11 May Chris Whitty and the UK Government advised the public not to wear face coverings sorry, to wear face coverings in enclosed public spaces, and Sir Chris publicly stated that his advice was on the advice of SAGE. Now, I'm just going to quote from your press statement from the Welsh Government website in part. What you state is this: "I am not recommending the compulsory wearing of face coverings by everyone wherever they leave home this should be a matter of personal choice."
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18		CTI asked you about a moment ago, and I want to go back again to that press release of May 2020 that CTI just asked you about. So just to be clear, this was at a time when Wales was the only nation in the United Kingdom not to recommend the use of face coverings and, as we've just heard, on 11 May Chris Whitty and the UK Government advised the public not to wear face coverings sorry, to wear face coverings in enclosed public spaces, and Sir Chris publicly stated that his advice was on the advice of SAGE. Now, I'm just going to quote from your press statement from the Welsh Government website in part. What you state is this: "I am not recommending the compulsory wearing of face coverings by everyone wherever they leave home this should be a matter of personal choice."
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19		G1 CTI asked you about a moment ago, and I want to go back again to that press release of May 2020 that CTI just asked you about. So just to be clear, this was at a time when Wales was the only nation in the United Kingdom not to recommend the use of face coverings and, as we've just heard, on 11 May Chris Whitty and the UK Government advised the public not to wear face coverings sorry, to wear face coverings in enclosed public spaces, and Sir Chris publicly stated that his advice was on the advice of SAGE. Now, I'm just going to quote from your press statement from the Welsh Government website in part. What you state is this: "I am not recommending the compulsory wearing of face coverings by everyone wherever they leave home tis should be a matter of personal choice." Then you said a second time: " I support the public's right to choose whether
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20		CTI asked you about a moment ago, and I want to go back again to that press release of May 2020 that CTI just asked you about. So just to be clear, this was at a time when Wales was the only nation in the United Kingdom not to recommend the use of face coverings and, as we've just heard, on 11 May Chris Whitty and the UK Government advised the public not to wear face coverings sorry, to wear face coverings in enclosed public spaces, and Sir Chris publicly stated that his advice was on the advice of SAGE. Now, I'm just going to quote from your press statement from the Welsh Government website in part. What you state is this: "I am not recommending the compulsory wearing of face coverings by everyone wherever they leave home tis should be a matter of personal choice." Then you said a second time: " I support the public's right to choose whether to wear them."
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21		CTI asked you about a moment ago, and I want to go back again to that press release of May 2020 that CTI just asked you about. So just to be clear, this was at a time when Wales was the only nation in the United Kingdom not to recommend the use of face coverings and, as we've just heard, on 11 May Chris Whitty and the UK Government advised the public not to wear face coverings sorry, to wear face coverings in enclosed public spaces, and Sir Chris publicly stated that his advice was on the advice of SAGE. Now, I'm just going to quote from your press statement from the Welsh Government website in part. What you state is this: "I am not recommending the compulsory wearing of face coverings by everyone wherever they leave home tis should be a matter of personal choice." Then you said a second time: " I support the public's right to choose whether to wear them."

25 that press statement, but will you take it from me that

63

1	A.	Well, reading at the side, the pieces off to the side,
2		I mean, this represents a degree of frustration I think
3		I had, which is that sometimes information came from
4		UK level into Wales very late and left us on the back
5		foot on some issues. So if I read down that list
6		I mean, it seemed odd to me that at some point we
7		were you know, the virus was relatively contained at
8		this point, but we were lifting restrictions but
9		other restrictions were being put in place, including
10		face coverings, for example. Why were we doing that?
11		Why was Scotland moving more on face coverings than
12		at a time when we were relaxing other things? So it was
13		a sense of frustration, I think, that were there things
14		happening, that information was not being properly
15		shared between policy leads in the different countries.
16	MR	POOLE: Sir Frank, I'm grateful, they're all the
17		questions I've got for you but there are some questions
18		from the core participants.
19	LAI	DY HALLETT: Ms Heaven
20		Questions from MS HEAVEN
21	MS	HEAVEN: My Lady, let me just pull this forward.
22		Good morning, Sir Frank, I represent the Covid-19
23		Bereaved Families for Justice Cymru. Just a few short
24		topics, please.
25		Can we start with the topic of face coverings, which 62
1 2	A.	you made those comments in that press statement? Yes.
3	Q.	Thank you.
4		Now, we know that the science that you were looking
5		at at this time was no different from the science being
6		looked at by all the other CMOs, and nevertheless you
7		advised the Welsh Government to diverge.
8		You have just accepted to CTI that your stance
9		weakened public messaging in Wales and was probably
10		confusing, and of course you made that note in your
11		diary on 7 June regarding political choice and aligned,
12		and CTI took you to the Jane Runeckles note from
13		10 August which referenced the Welsh Government being
14		an outlier and the public being completely mystified
15		that you won't mandate face coverings in supermarkets.
16		So, Sir Frank, you made reference a number of times

- So, Sir Frank, you made reference a number of times
- in your evidence to CTI to hindsight, but, reflecting on
- 18 the evidence that I've just put to you, will you not
- accept to me that it was clearly obvious to you, as CMO 19 20 at the time, that your divergent approach to face
- 21 coverings was in fact confusing and indeed mystifying
- 22 the Welsh public, and that this must have undermined the
- 23 four nations response to this rapidly evolving threat?
- 24 So will you accept that from me?

17

25 A. No, I won't. I come back to the point that the evidence 64

1	was very weak, the evidence for face coverings was very	1		be clear and so that you understand, Ann John, who
2	weak, and that was the evidence that we were all looking	2		headed up the TAG behavioural subgroup RCBI, who gave
3	at.	3		evidence to my Lady last week, suggested that the
4 Q .		4		divergent approach that Wales took was confusing and she
5	putting to you is that you knew at the time that your	5		thought it was damaging to public trust, and she gave
6	advice, which was that Wales should diverge, was in fact	6		the example of when you could wear a mask on the train
7	confusing the Welsh public, because here we have in	7		in Wales but as you left Newport you could take it off.
8	a note from August that the public were mystified; so	8		We can't see any evidence in the disclosure that you
9	you had appreciated that at the time, hadn't you?	9		commissioned anybody to give you behavioural advice and
10 A .	I had not. I think what you have to remember is that	10		to think about the theories that you had come up with to
11	for every person, every group, that was advocating more	11		justify this divergent approach. So just to be
12	mandation of masks, there was an equal and opposite	12		absolutely clear, did you task Ann John to provide you
13	group advocating that masks should not be used. The	13		with behavioural science advice on your theories and in
14	public was not aligned on that issue, there was no	14		particular risk behaviour and this risk of mask
15	single public voice.	15		discrimination?
16	So, you know, if I look back to where I was at that	16	Α.	That was the role I gave to TAC. TAC was commissioning
17	time, I believe that my advice was appropriate.	17		the advice. Ann John I think was a member of TAG, the
18 Q .	Your role was to provide leadership to the public,	18		TAG, the broader Technical Advisory Group, and there was
19	wasn't it, and to be that single voice?	19		a behavioural science group that a subgroup of TAG.
20 A .	My role was to provide advice to the ministers on the	20		So I believe that they did adequately look at that
21	best approach to	21		issue.
22 Q .	All right. Let's move on then.	22	Q.	Well, we haven't found it in the disclosure, so can you
23	You have been asked by CTI about what behavioural	23		give us a bit more assistance: do you know when you got
24	science and other expert advice you received and from	24		that advice from TAG, behavioural science advice?
25	whom to justify your advice on face coverings. Just to	25	Α.	The advice I got from TAG was generally on face
	65			66
1	coverings as a whole and I would expect that that	1		this guidance, it was eventually signed off by yourself
2	covered the behavioural science aspects which would have	2		and Albert Heaney. Let me just read to you what it
3	been dealt with by their subgroup.	3		said:
4 Q .	Okay.	4		"Negative tests are not required prior to
5	You have been asked about face mask militancy and	5		transfers/admissions into the residential setting."
6	the reason you have been asked about it is because we	6		"Some of these patients may have COVID-19, whether
7	can see in the WhatsApps that this issue comes up from	7		symptomatic or asymptomatic these patients can be
8	Welsh Government officials, this concern about not	8		safely cared for in a care home if this guidance is
9	wanting to promote what's called face mask militancy.	9		followed."
10	Was this concept something that came from you?	10		So in other words, the Welsh Government introduced
11 A .	It's not a concept I've ever come across, really,	11		guidance that you signed off, envisaging and indeed
12	I don't really know what it means.	12		requiring care homes from 9 April to admit people from
13 Q .	Well, the idea that policy should be informed by	13		hospitals where they had symptoms of Covid-19 without
14	a concern around people without masks being	14		a test being required.
15	discriminated against by other people in public?	15		Now, the day before this policy was signed off by
16 A .	No.	16		yourself, deputy chief inspector of Care Inspectorate
17 Q .	Okay.	17		Wales, Margaret Rooney, wrote an email raising concerns
18	Let's move on to my next topic, please, and it's	18		about this policy and you were copied in to this.
	care homes, and I'm going to show you a document in	19		So if we could look at this document, please,
19		20		INQ000336393, and it's the second page.
19 20	a moment, but before I do, let me just give you			
	a moment, but before I do, let me just give you an introduction.	21		If you just indicate when you can see that,
20		21 22		If you just indicate when you can see that, thank you.
20 21	an introduction.			
20 21 22	an introduction. So we're going back now to the beginning of April,	22		thank you.
20 21 22 23	an introduction. So we're going back now to the beginning of April, and this is the 8 April 2020 guidance for care homes	22 23		thank you. So this is an email from Margaret Rooney, which is

(17) Pages 65 - 68

Now, the other thing to remember, which is guite important, is that of course infection was coming into care homes from many directions, it was coming in largely from the community, and so it was really important that we provided that general advice on infection control to the care homes so they could manage people -- safely manage people coming in from the community and from hospitals. Now, that was not an easy task for the care homes, I absolutely accept that, that was not an easy task, but there was no safer alternative

1		cc'd into that, Frank Atherton.	1		that was being given in the community, and it obviously
2		I won't read it all out. She's talking about the	2		created a significant risk to life for this vulnerable
3		policy:	3		cohort in care homes. Do you agree?
4		"Hi all,	4	Α.	So the advice note that you refer to that was sent out
5		"I can see this will go out from the [CMO] and	5		to the system was an advice note developed by Public
6		Deputy Director General of Social Services and	6		Health Wales on how to effectively manage this
7		Integration. I have provided some comments"	7		situation.
8		If we go down to the last paragraph, that's what	8		We have to remember where we were at this point
9		I want to ask you about:	9		the pandemic, that we were watching Italy hospitals
10		"I think it is quite tricky to align the	10		filling up and falling over, and we were very anxious to
11		[Document read] say if the virus was to spread in	11		avoid that in Wales and in the UK. The advice that
12		such a care home?"	12		Public Health Wales put together, which included the
13		Okay, so before I ask you about this, context: we	13		advice about how care homes could receive patients w
14		know at this stage Covid-19 was rapidly spreading	14		had either been in contact with patients in hospital
15		through care homes, no doubt my Lady will be looking at	15		with Covid-19 or who had who were symptomatic, that
16		it shortly, but it had come up in the Covid-19 core	16		advice took account of advice which was issued, I think
17		group meeting. The Welsh Government Local Association	17		it's you know, I think it was advice, from the
18		was so concerned that they demanded a meeting with	18		British Geriatrics Society. So the common view was the
19		Vaughan Gething, which happened on 3 April. And as we	19		care homes ought to be able to manage cases of
20		know, community transition at this stage is sustained in	20		infectious disease by isolating people within there.
21		Wales.	21		Now, that's not an easy that was not an easy
22		So the first question is this: Margaret Rooney was	22		decision, I think, for ministers or for anybody to make.
23		right, wasn't she? Requiring hospitals sorry,	23		But it was in the context of the hospitals absolutely
24		care homes to accept patients with Covid from hospitals	24		risking being overloaded and it was in the context of
25		was completely inconsistent with the shielding advice 69	25		patients elderly people who were not affected by 70
1		Covid, who were asymptomatic in hospital but potentially	1		to PPE, although their prime responsibility, hopefully,
2		staying in hospital and becoming infected.	2		the providers, was to provide PPE. So that was
3		So it was an absolute imperative to get people back	3		happening.
4		to the safest place where they could be. Now, these	4		Public Health Wales had been very deeply involve
5		were difficult choices, but they were not easy choices,	5		with the care home sector in providing infection control
6		and the alternative of keeping everybody from	6		advice. So those were the measures which were in pla
7		a care home in a hospital setting would have led to	7		to enable people with any infectious disease, let alone
8		negative consequences in a different direction.	8		whether it's coronavirus or any other infectious
9 10		So was the advice from Margaret absolutely wrote	9		disease, to be managed safely in a care home.
10		to us and rightly flagged the issue, but that had been	10		Now, the other thing to remember, which is quite
11		taken into account by Public Health Wales as they	11		important, is that of course infection was coming into
12 13		drafted the guidance and by the British Geriatrics Society as they provided advice to us as well.	12 13		care homes from many directions, it was coming in
13	Q.	Okay. But just finally, then, this was at a time when	13		largely from the community, and so it was really
14	ч.	Covid-19 was rapidly spreading in care homes, there was	14		important that we provided that general advice on
16		no PPE, there was no testing, and this was going to be	15		infection control to the care homes so they could mana people safely manage people coming in from the
			10		
17 19		symptomatic individuals being put into care homes,			community and from hospitals. Now, that was not an e
18 19		potentially in large numbers. So how did you, as CMO,	18 19		task for the care homes, I absolutely accept that, that
20		signing off this policy, satisfy yourself that the	20		was not an easy task, but there was no safer alternative that we could see.
20 21		rights of vulnerable people in care homes were protected	20	0	
21		and their lives were not being put at risk? How did you satisfy yourself?	21	Q.	Finally, it wasn't long, was it, before this policy was reversed? I think it was about a week and a half. It's
22	Α.	satisfy yourself? The first thing is the numbers were not large, they were	22		in the statement of Albert Heaney. That's correct,
23 24	д.	not large. There was PPE, government had worked with	23 24		isn't it?
24 25		the care home sector to make sure that they had access	24 25	Α.	I haven't read that statement.
20		71	20	<i>.</i>	72

71

(18) Pages 69 - 72

1 N	IS HEAVEN: Thank you, my Lady.	1
2 L	ADY HALLETT: Thank you, Ms Heaven.	2
3	Ms Foubister.	3
4	Questions from MS FOUBISTER	4
5 N	IS FOUBISTER: Thank you, my Lady.	5
6	Good morning, Sir Frank, I represent John's Campaign	6
7	and Care Rights UK.	7
8	In May 2020 you expressed a concern about indirect	8
9	harm caused to young people and socially disadvantaged	9
10	groups in particular, and you suggested more information	10
11	was needed. Did you take any steps to investigate	11
12	indirect harms relating to other groups such as those	12
13	suffering from dementia or those suffering from	13
14	non-Covid medical conditions?	14
15 A	. I'm sorry, when you say I expressed a concern, where did	15
16	I express that concern? And can you	16
17 C	. So my reference is to paragraph 160 of your witness	17
18	statement. Perhaps we can pull it up or I can read out	18
19	what you say.	19
20	About halfway down paragraph 160 you said:	20
21	"I informed Ministers [this is around 7 May 2020, at	21
22	one of the 21-day reviews] that I was concerned about	22
23	indirect harms, especially for the young and for	23
24	socially disadvantaged groups and I suggested that we	24
25	needed more information on the nature of the indirect 73	25
1 N	IS FOUBISTER: Thank you.	1
1 N 2	IS FOUBISTER: Thank you. Thank you, my Lady.	1 2
2		
2	Thank you, my Lady.	2
2 3 L 4	Thank you, my Lady. ADY HALLETT: Thank you.	2 3
2 3 L 4 5 N	Thank you, my Lady. ADY HALLETT: Thank you. Does that complete the questions for Sir Frank?	2 3 4
2 3 L 4 5 N	Thank you, my Lady. ADY HALLETT: Thank you. Does that complete the questions for Sir Frank? IR POOLE: My Lady, it does.	2 3 4 5
2 3 L 4 5 N 6 L 7 8	Thank you, my Lady. ADY HALLETT: Thank you. Does that complete the questions for Sir Frank? IR POOLE: My Lady, it does. ADY HALLETT: Thank you for your help, Sir Frank.	2 3 4 5 6
2 3 L 4 5 N 6 L 7 8	Thank you, my Lady. ADY HALLETT: Thank you. Does that complete the questions for Sir Frank? IR POOLE: My Lady, it does. ADY HALLETT: Thank you for your help, Sir Frank. I'm afraid I can't, again, give you a guarantee I won't	2 3 4 5 6 7
2 3 L 5 N 6 L 7 8 9 T 10 L	Thank you, my Lady. ADY HALLETT: Thank you. Does that complete the questions for Sir Frank? IR POOLE: My Lady, it does. ADY HALLETT: Thank you for your help, Sir Frank. I'm afraid I can't, again, give you a guarantee I won't ask for your help again HE WITNESS: Thank you, my Lady. ADY HALLETT: because of course we have the health	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9
2 3 L 5 M 6 L 7 8 9 T 10 L 11	Thank you, my Lady. ADY HALLETT: Thank you. Does that complete the questions for Sir Frank? IR POOLE: My Lady, it does. ADY HALLETT: Thank you for your help, Sir Frank. I'm afraid I can't, again, give you a guarantee I won't ask for your help again HE WITNESS: Thank you, my Lady.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11
2 3 4 5 6 4 7 8 9 T 10 11 12 T	Thank you, my Lady. ADY HALLETT: Thank you. Does that complete the questions for Sir Frank? IR POOLE: My Lady, it does. ADY HALLETT: Thank you for your help, Sir Frank. I'm afraid I can't, again, give you a guarantee I won't ask for your help again HE WITNESS: Thank you, my Lady. ADY HALLETT: because of course we have the health module to come, but thank you for your help so far. HE WITNESS: Thank you.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12
2 3 4 5 8 9 10 11 12 13	Thank you, my Lady. ADY HALLETT: Thank you. Does that complete the questions for Sir Frank? IR POOLE: My Lady, it does. ADY HALLETT: Thank you for your help, Sir Frank. I'm afraid I can't, again, give you a guarantee I won't ask for your help again HE WITNESS: Thank you, my Lady. ADY HALLETT: because of course we have the health module to come, but thank you for your help so far. HE WITNESS: Thank you. (The witness withdrew)	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12
2 3 4 5 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	Thank you, my Lady. ADY HALLETT: Thank you. Does that complete the questions for Sir Frank? IR POOLE: My Lady, it does. ADY HALLETT: Thank you for your help, Sir Frank. I'm afraid I can't, again, give you a guarantee I won't ask for your help again HE WITNESS: Thank you, my Lady. ADY HALLETT: because of course we have the health module to come, but thank you for your help so far. HE WITNESS: Thank you. (The witness withdrew) IR POOLE: My Lady, if I can call Dr Robert Orford, please.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14
2 3 4 5 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 N 15	Thank you, my Lady. ADY HALLETT: Thank you. Does that complete the questions for Sir Frank? IR POOLE: My Lady, it does. ADY HALLETT: Thank you for your help, Sir Frank. I'm afraid I can't, again, give you a guarantee I won't ask for your help again HE WITNESS: Thank you, my Lady. ADY HALLETT: because of course we have the health module to come, but thank you for your help so far. HE WITNESS: Thank you. (The witness withdrew) IR POOLE: My Lady, if I can call Dr Robert Orford, please. DR ROBERT ORFORD (affirmed)	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15
2 L 3 L 5 N 6 L 7 8 9 T 10 L 11 12 T 13 N 15 16	Thank you, my Lady. ADY HALLETT: Thank you. Does that complete the questions for Sir Frank? IR POOLE: My Lady, it does. ADY HALLETT: Thank you for your help, Sir Frank. I'm afraid I can't, again, give you a guarantee I won't ask for your help again HE WITNESS: Thank you, my Lady. ADY HALLETT: because of course we have the health module to come, but thank you for your help so far. HE WITNESS: Thank you. (The witness withdrew) IR POOLE: My Lady, if I can call Dr Robert Orford, please. DR ROBERT ORFORD (affirmed) Questions from LEAD COUNSEL TO THE INQUIRY for MODULE 2B	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16
2 L 3 L 5 M 6 L 7 8 9 T 10 L 11 L 12 T 13 M 15 16 17 M	Thank you, my Lady. ADY HALLETT: Thank you. Does that complete the questions for Sir Frank? IR POOLE: My Lady, it does. ADY HALLETT: Thank you for your help, Sir Frank. I'm afraid I can't, again, give you a guarantee I won't ask for your help again HE WITNESS: Thank you, my Lady. ADY HALLETT: because of course we have the health module to come, but thank you for your help so far. HE WITNESS: Thank you. (The witness withdrew) IR POOLE: My Lady, if I can call Dr Robert Orford, please. DR ROBERT ORFORD (affirmed) Questions from LEAD COUNSEL TO THE INQUIRY for MODULE 2B IR POOLE: Could you start by giving us your full name,	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17
2 L 3 L 5 M 6 L 7 8 T 10 L 11 12 T 13 N 14 N 15 16 N 17 N	Thank you, my Lady. ADY HALLETT: Thank you. Does that complete the questions for Sir Frank? IR POOLE: My Lady, it does. ADY HALLETT: Thank you for your help, Sir Frank. I'm afraid I can't, again, give you a guarantee I won't ask for your help again HE WITNESS: Thank you, my Lady. ADY HALLETT: because of course we have the health module to come, but thank you for your help so far. HE WITNESS: Thank you. (The witness withdrew) IR POOLE: My Lady, if I can call Dr Robert Orford, please. DR ROBERT ORFORD (affirmed) Questions from LEAD COUNSEL TO THE INQUIRY for MODULE 2B IR POOLE: Could you start by giving us your full name, please.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18
2 I I I I I I I I I I I I I I I I I I I	Thank you, my Lady. ADY HALLETT: Thank you. Does that complete the questions for Sir Frank? IR POOLE: My Lady, it does. ADY HALLETT: Thank you for your help, Sir Frank. I'm afraid I can't, again, give you a guarantee I won't ask for your help again HE WITNESS: Thank you, my Lady. ADY HALLETT: because of course we have the health module to come, but thank you for your help so far. HE WITNESS: Thank you. (The witness withdrew) IR POOLE: My Lady, if I can call Dr Robert Orford, please. DR ROBERT ORFORD (affirmed) Questions from LEAD COUNSEL TO THE INQUIRY for MODULE 2B IR POOLE: Could you start by giving us your full name, please. Yes, Robert Leslie Orford.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18
2 L 3 L 5 M 6 L 7 8 9 T 10 L 11 12 T 13 14 N 15 16 17 M 18 4 20 C	Thank you, my Lady. ADY HALLETT: Thank you. Does that complete the questions for Sir Frank? IR POOLE: My Lady, it does. ADY HALLETT: Thank you for your help, Sir Frank. I'm afraid I can't, again, give you a guarantee I won't ask for your help again HE WITNESS: Thank you, my Lady. ADY HALLETT: because of course we have the health module to come, but thank you for your help so far. HE WITNESS: Thank you. (The witness withdrew) IR POOLE: My Lady, if I can call Dr Robert Orford, please. DR ROBERT ORFORD (affirmed) Questions from LEAD COUNSEL TO THE INQUIRY for MODULE 2B IR POOLE: Could you start by giving us your full name, please. Yes, Robert Leslie Orford. Dr Orford, thank you for coming today and giving your	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20
2 L 3 L 5 M 6 L 7 8 9 T 10 L 11 12 T 13 M 15 16 17 M 18 A 20 C 21	Thank you, my Lady. ADY HALLETT: Thank you. Does that complete the questions for Sir Frank? IR POOLE: My Lady, it does. ADY HALLETT: Thank you for your help, Sir Frank. I'm afraid I can't, again, give you a guarantee I won't ask for your help again HE WITNESS: Thank you, my Lady. ADY HALLETT: because of course we have the health module to come, but thank you for your help so far. HE WITNESS: Thank you. (The witness withdrew) IR POOLE: My Lady, if I can call Dr Robert Orford, please. DR ROBERT ORFORD (affirmed) Questions from LEAD COUNSEL TO THE INQUIRY for MODULE 2B IR POOLE: Could you start by giving us your full name, please. . Yes, Robert Leslie Orford. . Dr Orford, thank you for coming today and giving your evidence to the Inquiry.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21
2 I 3 I 5 I 6 I 7 8 7 10 I 11 12 T 13 I 14 I 15 I 16 I 17 I 18 9 20 C 21 22	Thank you, my Lady. ADY HALLETT: Thank you. Does that complete the questions for Sir Frank? IR POOLE: My Lady, it does. ADY HALLETT: Thank you for your help, Sir Frank. I'm afraid I can't, again, give you a guarantee I won't ask for your help again HE WITNESS: Thank you, my Lady. ADY HALLETT: because of course we have the health module to come, but thank you for your help so far. HE WITNESS: Thank you. (The witness withdrew) IR POOLE: My Lady, if I can call Dr Robert Orford, please. DR ROBERT ORFORD (affirmed) Questions from LEAD COUNSEL TO THE INQUIRY for MODULE 2B IR POOLE: Could you start by giving us your full name, please. . Yes, Robert Leslie Orford. . Dr Orford, thank you for coming today and giving your evidence to the Inquiry. If I could just remind you to keep your voice up so	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22
2 3 4 5 M 5 M 7 8 9 T 10 L 11 12 T 13 14 N 15 16 N 17 N 10 L 11 13 14 N 10 20 21 22 23	Thank you, my Lady. ADY HALLETT: Thank you. Does that complete the questions for Sir Frank? IR POOLE: My Lady, it does. ADY HALLETT: Thank you for your help, Sir Frank. I'm afraid I can't, again, give you a guarantee I won't ask for your help again HE WITNESS: Thank you, my Lady. ADY HALLETT: because of course we have the health module to come, but thank you for your help so far. HE WITNESS: Thank you. (The witness withdrew) IR POOLE: My Lady, if I can call Dr Robert Orford, please. DR ROBERT ORFORD (affirmed) Questions from LEAD COUNSEL TO THE INQUIRY for MODULE 2B IR POOLE: Could you start by giving us your full name, please. . Yes, Robert Leslie Orford. Dr Orford, thank you for coming today and giving your evidence to the Inquiry. If I could just remind you to keep your voice up so we can hear you, but also so your evidence can be	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23
2 I 3 I 5 I 6 I 7 8 7 10 I 11 12 T 13 I 14 I 15 I 16 I 17 I 18 9 20 C 21 22	Thank you, my Lady. ADY HALLETT: Thank you. Does that complete the questions for Sir Frank? IR POOLE: My Lady, it does. ADY HALLETT: Thank you for your help, Sir Frank. I'm afraid I can't, again, give you a guarantee I won't ask for your help again HE WITNESS: Thank you, my Lady. ADY HALLETT: because of course we have the health module to come, but thank you for your help so far. HE WITNESS: Thank you. (The witness withdrew) IR POOLE: My Lady, if I can call Dr Robert Orford, please. DR ROBERT ORFORD (affirmed) Questions from LEAD COUNSEL TO THE INQUIRY for MODULE 2B IR POOLE: Could you start by giving us your full name, please. . Yes, Robert Leslie Orford. . Dr Orford, thank you for coming today and giving your evidence to the Inquiry. If I could just remind you to keep your voice up so	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20

quir	у	4 March 2024
1		harm to these groups for future reviews."
2		So my question is around what other groups you were
2		considering, in particular those suffering from dementia
4		or other non-Covid medical conditions, and what steps
5		you took to think about and investigate indirect harms
6		for those groups?
7	Α.	So there was a very real concern throughout the pandemic
8	7.1	about the harms to you know, the non-Covid harms,
9		which is what you're referring to, which could fall on,
10		you know, many parts of the of society. We were
11		worried about people's access to routine healthcare in
12		particular. So there was quite a lot of work thinking
13		about how we could boost general practice, how we could
14		get back into you know, as the infections waves
15		started to recede, how we could restart services for
16		those vulnerable people that you're talking about.
17	Q.	And so, in around May, what steps were taken in relation
18		to those groups?
19	Α.	I can't tell you any specific steps, but there were
20		there was a socioeconomic subgroup of which was set
21		up under the TAC, I believe, which was led by our chief
22		economist, and that was looking at the needs of
23		particular groups such as that and trying to find ways
24		to ameliorate the impacts, the negative impacts that
25		lack of services might have on them.
		74
1		You have been good enough to provide two witness
2		statements to this module: your individual witness
3		statement dated 19 December of last week, we can see
4		that displayed, and also a corporate statement on behalf
5		of TAG and TAC, which is dated 23 November, and we can
6		also see that displayed on screen.
7		You have signed both of those statements with
8		a statement of truth. Can you please confirm that the
9		contents of those statements are true to the best of
10		your knowledge and belief?
11	A.	They are.
12	Q.	I'm grateful.
13 14		Dr Orford, you are currently the Chief Scientific Adviser for Health in Wales and you have held that post
14 15		since 2017; is that right?
16	A.	That's correct.
17	Q.	As regards your professional background, you hold an
18	- -	honours degree and PhD in molecular biology, you
19		completed a post doctoral fellowship with the Imperial

Cancer Research Fund, before working as an investigator

scientist with the Medical Research Council for

England, and you are a visiting professor of

evidence-based health policy at the University of

76

five years. For eight years you worked for the Health

Protection Agency, which later became Public Health

(19) Pages 73 - 76

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

25

1	South Wales; is all of that correct?

- 2 A. That's correct.
- 3 Q. Throughout the pandemic, you were obviously Chief
- 4 Scientific Adviser for Health in Wales. I understand
- 5 that your roles and your responsibilities changed during
- 6 the pandemic, we'll obviously be looking at how they
- 7 changed in due course, but in terms of your role as the
- 8 Chief Scientific Adviser for Health and your key
- 9 responsibilities at the start of the pandemic, would it
- 10 be right to say that you play a crucial role in advising
- 11 the Welsh Government on scientific and technical matters
- 12 related to health policy and healthcare delivery?
- 13 A. That's correct.
- 14 Q. And in terms of decision-making, part of your role is to
- 15 ensure that the Welsh Government decisions related to
- healthcare are grounded in scientific evidence and bestpractices, is that right?
- 18 **A.** That's correct.
- 19 Q. As regards your role when it comes to crisis management,
- 20 such as pandemics or major disease outbreaks, would it
- 21 be right to say that the CSAH plays a critical role in
- 22 providing guidance and expertise to help manage and
- 23 mitigate the impact of such crises?
- 24 A. I think prior to the pandemic, that wasn't part of the
- role description, but during the pandemic it was.77
- 1 A. That's correct.
- 2 Q. You had a significant role to play in developing
- 3 scientific intelligence during the pandemic, so,
- 4 for example, collating local, national and international
- 5 information on the virus for use in various data
- 6 dashboards and modelling forecasts; is that right?
- 7 A. That's correct.
- 8 Q. You chaired the Covid-19 Intelligence Cell, CIC, and
 9 were a member of the Health Protection Advisory Group
- 10 outbreak subgroup; is that right?
- 11 A. That's correct.
- 12 **Q.** And you also led work to prepare for and deliver the
- 13 First Minister's weekly briefings, and in that capacity
- 14 I understand your job was to ensure that they were
- 15 significantly -- sorry, scientifically robust evidence
- 16 bases for all Welsh Government decisions; is that right?
- 17 A. That's correct.
- 18 Q. How did your role, Dr Orford, intersect with the Chief19 Medical Officer, Dr Atherton, during the pandemic?
- 20 A. Professor Sir Atherton and myself worked very closely
- together throughout the pandemic, we corresponded
 frequently. My role was to collate, synthesise, present
 understandable scientific technical information.
- 24 **Q.** You say in your witness statement that you did not work
- 25 closely with the Chief Scientific Adviser for Wales,

79

- Q. Would I be right in saying that although you are a member of the Welsh Government, you describe your role as being independent in the sense that you are free to provide advice without regard to government policy or direction; is that right?
 A. That is partially correct, in that some of my role is more policy oriented, but the adviser part of my role was more an officer role, but part of my role, the adviser role, is exactly that.
 Q. I'm grateful. Now, you explain in your witness statement from mid
- 11Now, you explain in your witness statement from mid12to late February 2020 your work became entirely focused
- 13 on Covid-19 and the scientific response to Covid-19; is
- 14 that right?
- 15 A. That's correct.

right?

- 16 **Q.** Now, a key part of the response was the development of
- 17 TAC and TAG which the Inquiry has heard quite a lot
- 18 about already and we'll come back to that in the course
- 19 of your evidence in due course. In addition to
- 20 establishing and developing TAG and TAC, if I can just
- 21 run through a few of your other key responsibilities
- 22 during the pandemic. It's right you represented Wales
- 23 at SAGE meetings and meetings of subgroups of SAGE and
- 24 other important four nation expert meetings; is that

78

- 1 Professor Halligan, certainly in respect of the pandemic 2 response, as it was agreed that you would lead from 3 a science perspective; is that fair? 4 A. That's correct. 5 **Q.** We understand that there were no governance arrangements 6 in place at the start of the pandemic between the Chief 7 Scientific Adviser and yourself. Did that present 8 difficulties in terms of the share of responsibility between yourself and Professor Halligan at the start of 9 10 the pandemic? 11 A. Fairly early on in the decisions around the formation of 12 the Technical Advisory Cell I'd had conversations with Professor Halligan around who was best to lead that work 13 14 and I was -- had the best fit. We obviously kept in 15 contact throughout the period of the pandemic, once 16 a month. Q. On 22 January 2020, you emailed the senior private 17 18 secretary to the UK Government, Chief Scientific 19 Adviser, Sir Patrick Vallance, asking to be included in 20 the read-out of a precautionary SAGE meeting that was 21 held on that day, 22 January. I don't need to bring up 22 the email on screen. 23 Did you consider it strange that you had to ask to 24 be included in the read-out from that first
- 25 precautionary SAGE meeting?

n that day. The second	1		participate in those conversations, as did my colleague
ed nature of health, and	2	_	at the time.
nber of that group.	3	Q.	
it you had to prompt	4		timely access to SAGE documents?
eceive a read-out of that	5		
g?	6	Q.	At paragraph 41 of your witness statement, you say:
strating that it	7		"SAGE tended to only be interested in the actions of
C 1	8		the Welsh Government when there were differences in
your first	9		policy approaches"
vas not until 11 February,	10		Then you give examples of the Welsh firebreak or
AGE, and then that was	11		local interventions in the autumn of 2020. Then you
nment, and even then	12		say:
er, which meant that	13		"Unfortunately it appeared as though the devolved
iscussions. Is all	14		nations were a second order priority."
	15 16		Can you just help us with that, what made you form
peen invited to SAGE	10		that view?
Seen Invited to SAGE	17	Α.	I think probably there's two points there. Firstly, the priorities of SAGE were to understand what was coming,
Vee	18		to be able to describe the nature of the onslaught that
, yes. to have been able to	19 20		5
in an observer	20 21		was going to arrive fairly swiftly with us. But also,
III all observer	21		you know, England is a lot bigger than Wales and the devolved governments, devolved nations, so very clearly
hether I was knowingly	22		there was a focus on challenges within England, as
o be, so I may well	23		there's not a separate administration of England, so as
ved. I mean, I did	25		time progressed and perhaps we'll come on to that
	20		82
the devolved	1	Α.	So at different points of the pandemic, when scientific
king the opinion of the	2		information became available, it may have been it may
, but certainly at the	3		have gone through other eyes, it may have gone through
was on the position in	4		civil servant or ministerial eyes before it met
that was probably the	5		advisers' eyes. I hope that makes sense. So I would
ntinel surveillance,	6		like to see unfiltered advice before it becomes public.
in England because of the	7	Q.	l understand.
	8		You say also in your witness statement:
made to SAGE being too	9		"It might be helpful and timely to revisit the
e just said, do you not	10		current SAGE guidance from a four nations perspective
o much of a criticism	11		and also the UK Government scientific advisory code of
nic, so February/March?	12		practice to better reflect the extraordinary experience
ntingencies Act, where	13		that the pandemic has brought to bear of the provision
n, I think that really	14		of scientific advice for government."
om the beginning.	15		To the best of your knowledge, has such a review of
seen greater UK	16		SAGE guidance taken place?
on SAGE from the start?	17	Α.	There has been a review of SAGE but I've not been privy
	18		to the findings of that. That may have been promulgated
nt there may have also	19		through the CSA network, but I'm unaware of that.
nt influences on the	20	Q.	
se as there were with	21		NERVTAG. Wales were able to have an observer status on
nt pandemic response.	22		NERVTAG, but I think you say in your evidence it took
ical or civil servant	23		several attempts to join. Can you help us, when were
e scientific response	24		Welsh representatives permitted to join NERVTAG as
	25		observers? 84
			U T

1	Α.	I believe there were two emails on that day. The second
2		email was describing the devolved nature of health, and
3		why it was important to be a member of that group.
4	Q.	And so did you find it strange that you had to prompt
5		the UK Government in order to receive a read-out of that
6		first precautionary SAGE meeting?
7	Α.	Yeah, I think I found it slightly frustrating that it
8		took time to access the group.
9	Q.	l mean, l think l'm right in saying your first
10		attendance at a SAGE meeting was not until 11 February,
11		which was the sixth meeting of SAGE, and then that was
12		at the invitation of the UK Government, and even then
13		you were attending as an observer, which meant that
14		you're not able to participate in discussions. Is all
15		of that right?
16	Α.	That's correct, yes.
17	Q.	Do you think you ought to have been invited to SAGE
18		prior to 11 February?
19	Α.	I think it would have been helpful, yes.
20	Q.	Would it also have been helpful to have been able to
21		participate, so not simply attend in an observer
22		capacity?
23	Α.	I can't remember from memory whether I was knowingly
24		quiet as an observer, I tend not to be, so I may well
25		have not observed, solely observed. I mean, I did 81

there was more involvement with 2 governments, with the chair seeking 3 advisers in the devolved nations, 4 beginning more of the emphasis w 5 England and the UK, and I think th 6 right thing to do for things like sent 7 where the numbers were bigger in 8 size of the population. 9 Q. So although reference has been m 10 England-centric, from what you've 11 necessarily see that as a -- as too 12 in the early stages of the pandemi A. I think, you know, in the Civil Conti 13 14 it describes SAGE as a UK forum, 15 should have been a UK forum fron 16 Q. So you would have liked to have s 17 representation and governance on 18 Α. Yes. 19 Q. You say in your witness statement 20 been other political or civil servant 21 UK nature of the science response 22 other parts of the UK Government 23 What do you mean by other politic 24 influences on the UK nature of the

25 or the science response?

1

83

(21) Pages 81 - 84

1	Α.	I can't remember the exact dates, it may have been	1		conversations.
2		around May/June, and those observers would have come	2	Q.	The Inquiry understands that from June 2020 a Science
3		from Public Health Wales.	3		Co-ordination Group was established by GO-Science, the
4	Q.	Do you know why it took so long for Wales to be	4		Government Office for Science in the UK. Can you help
5		permitted to join or have observer status on NERVTAG?	5		us, what was the purpose of that group?
6	Α.	I think that question is best asked of the secretariat	6	Α.	So the Science Co-ordination Group was to understand
7		and chair of NERVTAG. I'm aware that there were	7		what's coming down the track and the type of papers that
8		sensitivities regarding leaks to the media and I think	8		were in development, and the kind of conversations that
9		probably best to orient those questions that way.	9		would be had in forthcoming SAGE meetings and to
0	Q.	Catherine Moore, a lead scientist for Public Health	10		generally share intelligence of what work is happening,
1		Wales, describes that Public Health Wales' role on	11		for example, work that we were leading in Wales.
2		NERVTAG was purely observatory but Public Health England	12	Q.	What did that group add to the structures that were
3		were very active participants and this skewed the data	13		already in place at that stage?
4		being presented to very much a UKHSA view of the	14	Α.	I think they added more informal intelligence sharing,
5		pandemic. Have you got any views on that comment?	15		situational awareness of what was going to happen next.
6	Α.	I mean, Catherine was a member of the Technical Advisory	16	Q.	In terms of your liaison with UK Chief Scientific
17		Group and she was excellent, you know, she's	17		Advisers, so obviously outside SAGE, is it right that
8		an international expert in virology. In NERVTAG they	18		you had limited communication with Sir Patrick Vallance
9		have the best people in virology, and it's like drinking	19		and Professor Whitty?
20		from a fire hydrant when you hear the conversations, so	20	Α.	Yeah, most of my interactions with Sir Patrick and
21		on those groups you absolutely want the best people	21		Sir Whitty were through SAGE.
22		there.	22	Q.	Was there any formal arrangement for meetings betweer
23		As to whether the conversations can be translated	23		yourself and Sir Patrick Vallance and Sir Chris Whitty?
24		from what's happening in England to what's happening in	24	Α.	No, but I'm, you know, fully aware of Professor Whitty
25		Wales I think is depends on the nature of the	25		having the dual role of Chief Scientific Adviser for
		85			86
1		Health and CMO at that point and most of those	1		assigned to specific government departments, and those
2		interactions happening between the CMOs.	2		CSAs will advise ministers and officials within their
3	Q.	You met regularly, as we understand it, with	3		own department. I think you've described that in your
4		Professor Young and Professor Crossman, so your	4		witness statement as a "CSA Network", and you say that
5		counterparts in respectively Northern Ireland and	5		establishing meaningful connections between CSAs
6		Scotland. Are those the bi-monthly meetings that you	6		obviously should be of paramount importance, but am
7		mention in your TAC witness statement?	7		I right that the devolved administration governments,
8	Α.	That's correct.	8		they're not recognised within that CSA network?
9	Q.	Were minutes taken of those meetings?	9	Α.	They're recognised as a department and so the CSA for
10	Α.	I don't believe they were, unfortunately.	10		government, Welsh Government, is the only member fro
11	Q.	Do you think it would have assisted to have minutes	11		Wales.
12		taken of those meetings?	12	Q.	What, if anything, is the consequence of that sort of,
13	Α.	I really like to have minutes of meetings.	13		if you like, partial recognition?
14		Unfortunately having the right staffing for secretariat	14	Α.	I mean, the purpose of having a network is to ensure
15		support didn't always I mean, there were very many	15		that you've got good connections between people within
16		meetings and so to have the requisite number of	16		the network and on the network, and so take,
17		administrative support people was not always possible.	17		for example, the Health and Safety Executive has a CSA
18		I would have much preferred to have minutes.	18		being familiar with that person and the work that
19	Q.	Dr Orford, if I can just ask you, you're fairly quietly	19		they're leading is, I think, probably better directly
20		spoken, so if I can just ask you to keep your voice up,	20		rather than second-hand.
21		please.	21	Q.	Has communication and co-ordination between all the Uk
22	Α.	Of course, sorry.	22		chief scientific advisers for health changed since the
	Q.	Thank you.	23		pandemic?
23			04	•	Na
23 24		Now, the Inquiry understands that within	24	Α.	No.

1		the Covid Intelligence Cell, which I think you	1
2		co-chaired with Fliss Bennee during the pandemic; is	2
3		that right?	3
4	Α.	That's correct.	4
5	Q.	Just tell us briefly, what's the purpose of the Covid	5
6		Intelligence Cell?	6
7	Α.	So probably best described as a forum to provide	7
8		an ongoing risk assessment narrative, so to be able to	8
9		receive intelligence and data coming in from different	9
10		parts of Wales, synthesise that and be able to produce	10
11		an ongoing assessment of what will happen next, what's	11
12		happening now.	12
13	Q.	5	13
14	Α.	From memory, yes.	14
15	Q.	Why was it established then? Was there a need, do you	15
16		think, for it to have been established earlier in the	16
17		pandemic?	17
18	Α.	I think it was established then as other parts of the	18
19		machinery of dealing with a pandemic in a steady state	19
20		were happening, so we were iterating our approach within	20
21		government. The risk management part of Health	21
22		Protection Advisory Group was being established	22
23		alongside the Covid Intelligence Cell. Up until that	23
24		time, most of the situational awareness that I was	24
25		involved in came to the Technical Advisory Group, so it 89	25
1		updates for the Minister for Health and Social Services	1
2		and also the First Minister.	2
3		Then if we can have a look, please, at pages 3 and	3
4		4, I think it's yes, it's paragraph 6 that runs over	4
5		the page, we have there a list of TAG members.	5
6		Dr Orford, obviously neither TAG nor TAC had been	6
7		established prior to the pandemic. Why was it thought	7
8		necessary to establish TAG and TAC during a public	8
9		health emergency?	9
10	Α.	As mentioned earlier, lots of the work there's far	10
11		more capacity and capability within England to deal with	11
12		these kind of events. Trying to understand the meaning	12
13		of what was coming into a Welsh context was quite	13
14		important. So when would the wave arrive? How big	14
15		would the wave be? What kind of NHS capacity did we	15
16		have available to deal with that? So it was important	16
17		to be able to translate the really important UK level	17
18		work into a Welsh-specific context. So the yeah.	18
19	Q.	I understand that April 2020 saw the first two TAG	19
20		subgroups were formed and then we see gradual evolution.	20
21		I think by the time we get to October 2020 there are	21
22		nine subgroups. You say in your witness statement that	22
23		each subgroup was limited to no more than ten experts in	23
24		a given field. Can you just help me with why that was	24
25		and how those experts were chosen.	25
		91	

	made sense to uncouple that conversation and bring it to
	one discrete forum.
Q.	Now, you've mentioned the Technical Advisory Cell, so
	perhaps we can move to some questions about that. That
	was established much earlier, that was around
	27 February 2020, I think I'm right in saying?
Α.	That's correct, yes.
Q.	If we can have a look at INQ000068504, please.
	These are, in fact, the terms of reference for the
	Technical Advisory Group. If we can have a look at
	page 2 and the second paragraph there, we see
	a description of the respective functions. So TAG, the
	Technical Advisory Group, the group of scientific and
	technical experts who provide advice and guidance to the
	Welsh Government in response to COVID-19."
	Then:
	"TAC is the [cell] core team of public servants
	who [Document read] and evidence on COVID-19 to
	the wider public as needed."
	So they are the functions of the two bodies.
	If we can please have a look at paragraph 3, just in
	terms of reporting and commissioning, so I'm right TAC
	sits within the Health and Social Services Group. As it
	says here, provides advice to the CMO, director general
	for Health and Social Services, and provided regular
	90
Α.	So I think it's probably that was an optimum level. The
7.0	reason that came about, prior to my work in Welsh
	Government, I'd worked with Public Health England, with
	European Commission co-funded programmes on serious
	cross-border threats to health, on chemicals, and in
	that work we established networks of experts, and some
	of the work packages looked at the number of experts
	that you might need in a particular area to derive
	evidence and derive advice in a fairly swift manner to
	respond to emerging challenges. So, you know, whilst
	the ambition was to have a set number, I think there was
	some degree of variation between the groups as there was
	independence of the chair of the group to decide who
	they wanted and who they needed to help them best answer
	the questions that were posed of them.
Q.	Did you ever find it difficult filling sort of the
ખ.	capacity? There was some evidence that the Inquiry
	heard at the end of last week that there weren't perhaps

enough scientists in Wales. Was that a problem that you

A. I'm not --- I'm not sure. I think different groups had different challenges. Different groups had different makeup, just because of the nature of the material that they were talking about. For example, the socioeconomic harms group had more economic advisers from within

92

encountered?

1		government than perhaps external experts, whilst the	1	
2		virology and testing group had more Public Health Wales	2	
3		experts, because of the nature of the material and where	3	
4		those experts sat within within Wales, whether	4	
5		universities or the public health authority.	5	
6	Q.	You mention there the economic harm subgroup. Something	6	Q.
7		that you say in your witness statement is:	7	
8		"One mistake I feel SAGE made was, unlike in TAG,	8	
9		economic and health, economic advice did not play	9	
10		a significant role. One of the key harms arising from	10	
11		the pandemic was economic damage and therefore economic	11	
12		evidence should have been a key consideration that was	12	Α.
13		explored and shared publicly, as opposed to this being	13	
14		solely a consideration of the UK Treasury."	14	
15		Am I right in saying thinking the economic harms	15	
16		subgroup was the group responsible then for providing	16	
17		economic and health economic advice to TAG?	17	
18	Α.	Yeah, that's correct.	18	
19	Q.	And did economic evidence play a significant role in the	19	
20	ч.	advice that TAG provided to the Welsh Government?	20	
20	Α.	It did. I mean, if you look at the advice that we	20	
22	Π.	shared with policy colleagues and ministers, there was	21	
23		always many times we provided information from the	22	Q.
23		socioeconomic harms group and there were sometimes	23	ω.
24		bespoke pieces of advice, for example the social cost of	24	
20		93	20	
1	Α.	I mean, we certainly took the advice of SPI-B and SAGE	1	
1 2	Α.	I mean, we certainly took the advice of SPI-B and SAGE very seriously in Wales, and you can see that in my	1 2	
2	Α.	very seriously in Wales, and you can see that in my	2	
2 3	Α.	very seriously in Wales, and you can see that in my briefing notes to CMO and officials and ministers	2 3	
2 3 4	Α.	very seriously in Wales, and you can see that in my briefing notes to CMO and officials and ministers throughout that period. Understanding what the public	2 3 4	
2 3 4 5	Α.	very seriously in Wales, and you can see that in my briefing notes to CMO and officials and ministers throughout that period. Understanding what the public and the population would do during the first lockdown,	2 3 4 5	
2 3 4 5 6		very seriously in Wales, and you can see that in my briefing notes to CMO and officials and ministers throughout that period. Understanding what the public and the population would do during the first lockdown, for example, was, you know, ever so important.	2 3 4 5 6	
2 3 4 5 6 7	A. Q.	very seriously in Wales, and you can see that in my briefing notes to CMO and officials and ministers throughout that period. Understanding what the public and the population would do during the first lockdown, for example, was, you know, ever so important. The Inquiry received evidence from Professor Ann John,	2 3 4 5 6 7	
2 3 4 5 6 7 8		very seriously in Wales, and you can see that in my briefing notes to CMO and officials and ministers throughout that period. Understanding what the public and the population would do during the first lockdown, for example, was, you know, ever so important. The Inquiry received evidence from Professor Ann John, who stated that across all the groups that she	2 3 4 5 6 7 8	
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9		very seriously in Wales, and you can see that in my briefing notes to CMO and officials and ministers throughout that period. Understanding what the public and the population would do during the first lockdown, for example, was, you know, ever so important. The Inquiry received evidence from Professor Ann John, who stated that across all the groups that she participated in during the pandemic response, including	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10		very seriously in Wales, and you can see that in my briefing notes to CMO and officials and ministers throughout that period. Understanding what the public and the population would do during the first lockdown, for example, was, you know, ever so important. The Inquiry received evidence from Professor Ann John, who stated that across all the groups that she participated in during the pandemic response, including the RCBI subgroup and TAG itself, she said there was	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10		very seriously in Wales, and you can see that in my briefing notes to CMO and officials and ministers throughout that period. Understanding what the public and the population would do during the first lockdown, for example, was, you know, ever so important. The Inquiry received evidence from Professor Ann John, who stated that across all the groups that she participated in during the pandemic response, including the RCBI subgroup and TAG itself, she said there was a lack of representation from ethnic minorities and from	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11	
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12		very seriously in Wales, and you can see that in my briefing notes to CMO and officials and ministers throughout that period. Understanding what the public and the population would do during the first lockdown, for example, was, you know, ever so important. The Inquiry received evidence from Professor Ann John, who stated that across all the groups that she participated in during the pandemic response, including the RCBI subgroup and TAG itself, she said there was a lack of representation from ethnic minorities and from those of more deprived background. And she said as	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12	
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13		very seriously in Wales, and you can see that in my briefing notes to CMO and officials and ministers throughout that period. Understanding what the public and the population would do during the first lockdown, for example, was, you know, ever so important. The Inquiry received evidence from Professor Ann John, who stated that across all the groups that she participated in during the pandemic response, including the RCBI subgroup and TAG itself, she said there was a lack of representation from ethnic minorities and from those of more deprived background. And she said as a result those advising policymakers had little direct	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14		very seriously in Wales, and you can see that in my briefing notes to CMO and officials and ministers throughout that period. Understanding what the public and the population would do during the first lockdown, for example, was, you know, ever so important. The Inquiry received evidence from Professor Ann John, who stated that across all the groups that she participated in during the pandemic response, including the RCBI subgroup and TAG itself, she said there was a lack of representation from ethnic minorities and from those of more deprived background. And she said as a result those advising policymakers had little direct understanding of experiences which may underpin	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 13	
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15		very seriously in Wales, and you can see that in my briefing notes to CMO and officials and ministers throughout that period. Understanding what the public and the population would do during the first lockdown, for example, was, you know, ever so important. The Inquiry received evidence from Professor Ann John, who stated that across all the groups that she participated in during the pandemic response, including the RCBI subgroup and TAG itself, she said there was a lack of representation from ethnic minorities and from those of more deprived background. And she said as a result those advising policymakers had little direct understanding of experiences which may underpin behaviours and also their direct impacts. These	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16		very seriously in Wales, and you can see that in my briefing notes to CMO and officials and ministers throughout that period. Understanding what the public and the population would do during the first lockdown, for example, was, you know, ever so important. The Inquiry received evidence from Professor Ann John, who stated that across all the groups that she participated in during the pandemic response, including the RCBI subgroup and TAG itself, she said there was a lack of representation from ethnic minorities and from those of more deprived background. And she said as a result those advising policymakers had little direct understanding of experiences which may underpin behaviours and also their direct impacts. These included, for example, living in cramped conditions,	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17		very seriously in Wales, and you can see that in my briefing notes to CMO and officials and ministers throughout that period. Understanding what the public and the population would do during the first lockdown, for example, was, you know, ever so important. The Inquiry received evidence from Professor Ann John, who stated that across all the groups that she participated in during the pandemic response, including the RCBI subgroup and TAG itself, she said there was a lack of representation from ethnic minorities and from those of more deprived background. And she said as a result those advising policymakers had little direct understanding of experiences which may underpin behaviours and also their direct impacts. These included, for example, living in cramped conditions, being unable to order food online, not understanding	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18		very seriously in Wales, and you can see that in my briefing notes to CMO and officials and ministers throughout that period. Understanding what the public and the population would do during the first lockdown, for example, was, you know, ever so important. The Inquiry received evidence from Professor Ann John, who stated that across all the groups that she participated in during the pandemic response, including the RCBI subgroup and TAG itself, she said there was a lack of representation from ethnic minorities and from those of more deprived background. And she said as a result those advising policymakers had little direct understanding of experiences which may underpin behaviours and also their direct impacts. These included, for example, living in cramped conditions, being unable to order food online, not understanding perhaps the mistrust of vaccines and masks. And in her	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19		very seriously in Wales, and you can see that in my briefing notes to CMO and officials and ministers throughout that period. Understanding what the public and the population would do during the first lockdown, for example, was, you know, ever so important. The Inquiry received evidence from Professor Ann John, who stated that across all the groups that she participated in during the pandemic response, including the RCBI subgroup and TAG itself, she said there was a lack of representation from ethnic minorities and from those of more deprived background. And she said as a result those advising policymakers had little direct understanding of experiences which may underpin behaviours and also their direct impacts. These included, for example, living in cramped conditions, being unable to order food online, not understanding perhaps the mistrust of vaccines and masks. And in her view this lack of ethnic and also social diversity can	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19	
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20		very seriously in Wales, and you can see that in my briefing notes to CMO and officials and ministers throughout that period. Understanding what the public and the population would do during the first lockdown, for example, was, you know, ever so important. The Inquiry received evidence from Professor Ann John, who stated that across all the groups that she participated in during the pandemic response, including the RCBI subgroup and TAG itself, she said there was a lack of representation from ethnic minorities and from those of more deprived background. And she said as a result those advising policymakers had little direct understanding of experiences which may underpin behaviours and also their direct impacts. These included, for example, living in cramped conditions, being unable to order food online, not understanding perhaps the mistrust of vaccines and masks. And in her view this lack of ethnic and also social diversity can result in inappropriate policy responses.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	Q.	very seriously in Wales, and you can see that in my briefing notes to CMO and officials and ministers throughout that period. Understanding what the public and the population would do during the first lockdown, for example, was, you know, ever so important. The Inquiry received evidence from Professor Ann John, who stated that across all the groups that she participated in during the pandemic response, including the RCBI subgroup and TAG itself, she said there was a lack of representation from ethnic minorities and from those of more deprived background. And she said as a result those advising policymakers had little direct understanding of experiences which may underpin behaviours and also their direct impacts. These included, for example, living in cramped conditions, being unable to order food online, not understanding perhaps the mistrust of vaccines and masks. And in her view this lack of ethnic and also social diversity can result in inappropriate policy responses. I mean, do you accept those criticisms?	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22		very seriously in Wales, and you can see that in my briefing notes to CMO and officials and ministers throughout that period. Understanding what the public and the population would do during the first lockdown, for example, was, you know, ever so important. The Inquiry received evidence from Professor Ann John, who stated that across all the groups that she participated in during the pandemic response, including the RCBI subgroup and TAG itself, she said there was a lack of representation from ethnic minorities and from those of more deprived background. And she said as a result those advising policymakers had little direct understanding of experiences which may underpin behaviours and also their direct impacts. These included, for example, living in cramped conditions, being unable to order food online, not understanding perhaps the mistrust of vaccines and masks. And in her view this lack of ethnic and also social diversity can result in inappropriate policy responses. I mean, do you accept those criticisms? I do and I don't. I'm not sure what the code of	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	Q.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	Q.	very seriously in Wales, and you can see that in my briefing notes to CMO and officials and ministers throughout that period. Understanding what the public and the population would do during the first lockdown, for example, was, you know, ever so important. The Inquiry received evidence from Professor Ann John, who stated that across all the groups that she participated in during the pandemic response, including the RCBI subgroup and TAG itself, she said there was a lack of representation from ethnic minorities and from those of more deprived background. And she said as a result those advising policymakers had little direct understanding of experiences which may underpin behaviours and also their direct impacts. These included, for example, living in cramped conditions, being unable to order food online, not understanding perhaps the mistrust of vaccines and masks. And in her view this lack of ethnic and also social diversity can result in inappropriate policy responses. I mean, do you accept those criticisms? I do and I don't. I'm not sure what the code of practice for scientific advisory committees says around	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	Q.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	Q.	very seriously in Wales, and you can see that in my briefing notes to CMO and officials and ministers throughout that period. Understanding what the public and the population would do during the first lockdown, for example, was, you know, ever so important. The Inquiry received evidence from Professor Ann John, who stated that across all the groups that she participated in during the pandemic response, including the RCBI subgroup and TAG itself, she said there was a lack of representation from ethnic minorities and from those of more deprived background. And she said as a result those advising policymakers had little direct understanding of experiences which may underpin behaviours and also their direct impacts. These included, for example, living in cramped conditions, being unable to order food online, not understanding perhaps the mistrust of vaccines and masks. And in her view this lack of ethnic and also social diversity can result in inappropriate policy responses. I mean, do you accept those criticisms? I do and I don't. I'm not sure what the code of	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	Q.

a case where we explored costs and impacts associated
with the cases at different junctures of the pandemic.
You know, papers on health inequalities were really
important foundation pieces for the group as well that
came from that group.
The TAG Risk Communication and Behavioural Insights
subgroup we understand held its first meeting on
22 July 2020, and provided advice to the Welsh
Government for the first time in October 2021. Do you
know why it took so long for that subgroup to produce
its first advice to the Welsh Government?
I mean, there's two reasons there. From the very
beginning stages of the SAGE group, probably the three
most important groups were SPI-M, NERVTAG and SPI-B, and
we had access to the outputs of those groups and as we
were following a UK plan fairly closely in that period,
then we didn't really need RCBI at that point. But as
we became different in our policy choices then we needed
greater capacity and capability in that area, and
I described the need for this broadened set of subgroups
in a paper that was written in the summer of 2020 about
the approaching difficult winter.
Do you consider there to have been sufficient regard or
focus on behavioural science and behavioural scientific
evidence in Wales particularly during the first wave?
94
94
94 doing things in partnership, and it's really important
94 doing things in partnership, and it's really important that you do that on wicked problems, and usually policy
94 doing things in partnership, and it's really important that you do that on wicked problems, and usually policy formation happens slowly, not in a matter of hours and days, and we've got very good examples of patient public
94 doing things in partnership, and it's really important that you do that on wicked problems, and usually policy formation happens slowly, not in a matter of hours and days, and we've got very good examples of patient public involvement in areas like genomics.
94 doing things in partnership, and it's really important that you do that on wicked problems, and usually policy formation happens slowly, not in a matter of hours and days, and we've got very good examples of patient public involvement in areas like genomics. I think on the matter around the composition of the
94 doing things in partnership, and it's really important that you do that on wicked problems, and usually policy formation happens slowly, not in a matter of hours and days, and we've got very good examples of patient public involvement in areas like genomics. I think on the matter around the composition of the Technical Advisory Group, I'm not aware that there was
94 doing things in partnership, and it's really important that you do that on wicked problems, and usually policy formation happens slowly, not in a matter of hours and days, and we've got very good examples of patient public involvement in areas like genomics. I think on the matter around the composition of the Technical Advisory Group, I'm not aware that there was a survey done on the breakdown of the background of the
94 doing things in partnership, and it's really important that you do that on wicked problems, and usually policy formation happens slowly, not in a matter of hours and days, and we've got very good examples of patient public involvement in areas like genomics. I think on the matter around the composition of the Technical Advisory Group, I'm not aware that there was a survey done on the breakdown of the background of the participants. I myself am from a working class
94 doing things in partnership, and it's really important that you do that on wicked problems, and usually policy formation happens slowly, not in a matter of hours and days, and we've got very good examples of patient public involvement in areas like genomics. I think on the matter around the composition of the Technical Advisory Group, I'm not aware that there was a survey done on the breakdown of the background of the participants. I myself am from a working class background, I know my other colleagues were. In terms
94 doing things in partnership, and it's really important that you do that on wicked problems, and usually policy formation happens slowly, not in a matter of hours and days, and we've got very good examples of patient public involvement in areas like genomics. I think on the matter around the composition of the Technical Advisory Group, I'm not aware that there was a survey done on the breakdown of the background of the participants. I myself am from a working class background, I know my other colleagues were. In terms of ethnic diversity, again we didn't survey the group or
94 doing things in partnership, and it's really important that you do that on wicked problems, and usually policy formation happens slowly, not in a matter of hours and days, and we've got very good examples of patient public involvement in areas like genomics. I think on the matter around the composition of the Technical Advisory Group, I'm not aware that there was a survey done on the breakdown of the background of the participants. I myself am from a working class background, I know my other colleagues were. In terms of ethnic diversity, again we didn't survey the group or actively look. I think if I was to start again, ideally
94 doing things in partnership, and it's really important that you do that on wicked problems, and usually policy formation happens slowly, not in a matter of hours and days, and we've got very good examples of patient public involvement in areas like genomics. I think on the matter around the composition of the Technical Advisory Group, I'm not aware that there was a survey done on the breakdown of the background of the participants. I myself am from a working class background, I know my other colleagues were. In terms of ethnic diversity, again we didn't survey the group or actively look. I think if I was to start again, ideally prior to a pandemic, I definitely would have looked at
94 doing things in partnership, and it's really important that you do that on wicked problems, and usually policy formation happens slowly, not in a matter of hours and days, and we've got very good examples of patient public involvement in areas like genomics. I think on the matter around the composition of the Technical Advisory Group, I'm not aware that there was a survey done on the breakdown of the background of the participants. I myself am from a working class background, I know my other colleagues were. In terms of ethnic diversity, again we didn't survey the group or actively look. I think if I was to start again, ideally prior to a pandemic, I definitely would have looked at representation and a fuller understanding of how we
94 doing things in partnership, and it's really important that you do that on wicked problems, and usually policy formation happens slowly, not in a matter of hours and days, and we've got very good examples of patient public involvement in areas like genomics. I think on the matter around the composition of the Technical Advisory Group, I'm not aware that there was a survey done on the breakdown of the background of the participants. I myself am from a working class background, I know my other colleagues were. In terms of ethnic diversity, again we didn't survey the group or actively look. I think if I was to start again, ideally prior to a pandemic, I definitely would have looked at
94 doing things in partnership, and it's really important that you do that on wicked problems, and usually policy formation happens slowly, not in a matter of hours and days, and we've got very good examples of patient public involvement in areas like genomics. I think on the matter around the composition of the Technical Advisory Group, I'm not aware that there was a survey done on the breakdown of the background of the participants. I myself am from a working class background, I know my other colleagues were. In terms of ethnic diversity, again we didn't survey the group or actively look. I think if I was to start again, ideally prior to a pandemic, I definitely would have looked at representation and a fuller understanding of how we
94 doing things in partnership, and it's really important that you do that on wicked problems, and usually policy formation happens slowly, not in a matter of hours and days, and we've got very good examples of patient public involvement in areas like genomics. I think on the matter around the composition of the Technical Advisory Group, I'm not aware that there was a survey done on the breakdown of the background of the participants. I myself am from a working class background, I know my other colleagues were. In terms of ethnic diversity, again we didn't survey the group or actively look. I think if I was to start again, ideally prior to a pandemic, I definitely would have looked at representation and a fuller understanding of how we would get that important information on these very
94 doing things in partnership, and it's really important that you do that on wicked problems, and usually policy formation happens slowly, not in a matter of hours and days, and we've got very good examples of patient public involvement in areas like genomics. I think on the matter around the composition of the Technical Advisory Group, I'm not aware that there was a survey done on the breakdown of the background of the participants. I myself am from a working class background, I know my other colleagues were. In terms of ethnic diversity, again we didn't survey the group or actively look. I think if I was to start again, ideally prior to a pandemic, I definitely would have looked at representation and a fuller understanding of how we would get that important information on these very difficult policy choices. But there was work looking,
94 doing things in partnership, and it's really important that you do that on wicked problems, and usually policy formation happens slowly, not in a matter of hours and days, and we've got very good examples of patient public involvement in areas like genomics. I think on the matter around the composition of the Technical Advisory Group, I'm not aware that there was a survey done on the breakdown of the background of the participants. I myself am from a working class background, I know my other colleagues were. In terms of ethnic diversity, again we didn't survey the group or actively look. I think if I was to start again, ideally prior to a pandemic, I definitely would have looked at representation and a fuller understanding of how we would get that important information on these very difficult policy choices. But there was work looking, you know, with focus groups and different surveys that
94 doing things in partnership, and it's really important that you do that on wicked problems, and usually policy formation happens slowly, not in a matter of hours and days, and we've got very good examples of patient public involvement in areas like genomics. I think on the matter around the composition of the Technical Advisory Group, I'm not aware that there was a survey done on the breakdown of the background of the participants. I myself am from a working class background, I know my other colleagues were. In terms of ethnic diversity, again we didn't survey the group or actively look. I think if I was to start again, ideally prior to a pandemic, I definitely would have looked at representation and a fuller understanding of how we would get that important information on these very difficult policy choices. But there was work looking, you know, with focus groups and different surveys that were done through Ipsos MORI and Public Health Wales to
94 doing things in partnership, and it's really important that you do that on wicked problems, and usually policy formation happens slowly, not in a matter of hours and days, and we've got very good examples of patient public involvement in areas like genomics. I think on the matter around the composition of the Technical Advisory Group, I'm not aware that there was a survey done on the breakdown of the background of the participants. I myself am from a working class background, I know my other colleagues were. In terms of ethnic diversity, again we didn't survey the group or actively look. I think if I was to start again, ideally prior to a pandemic, I definitely would have looked at representation and a fuller understanding of how we would get that important information on these very difficult policy choices. But there was work looking, you know, with focus groups and different surveys that were done through Ipsos MORI and Public Health Wales to capture that type of information. But I think
94 doing things in partnership, and it's really important that you do that on wicked problems, and usually policy formation happens slowly, not in a matter of hours and days, and we've got very good examples of patient public involvement in areas like genomics. I think on the matter around the composition of the Technical Advisory Group, I'm not aware that there was a survey done on the breakdown of the background of the participants. I myself am from a working class background, I know my other colleagues were. In terms of ethnic diversity, again we didn't survey the group or actively look. I think if I was to start again, ideally prior to a pandemic, I definitely would have looked at representation and a fuller understanding of how we would get that important information on these very difficult policy choices. But there was work looking, you know, with focus groups and different surveys that were done through Ipsos MORI and Public Health Wales to capture that type of information. But I think Ann John's point was very valid, that we really need to

a case where we explored costs and impacts associated

- Deputy CMO, who has provided written evidence to the
- Inquiry, he has expressed discomfort at the number of
- government officials in TAG and the lack of independence

that resulted from this. So he said in his written 1 2 evidence to the Inquiry that each TAG meeting was 3 chaired by Welsh Government officials with several 4 officials contributing actively in the advice, and in 5 his view that risked influencing professional and 6 academic advice. Is that something that you recognise 7 or what comment do you have on that evidence? 8 A. I'm not sure there was much active participation from 9 policy observers. I actually think it's really 10 important to have observers, to be able to listen to the discourse and the debate and, you know, the weight of 11 12 evidence. So I'm an advocate for non-scientists to be 13 part of the conversations, however, not to be able to 14 restrict the conversation with policy. Again, the Inquiry heard from Professor Gravenor last 15 Q. 16 week, he and members of the Swansea modelling team were 17 working voluntarily for a large part of the pandemic, as 18 were a number of other members of TAG and TAC, so were 19 having to juggle that work alongside their professional 20 commitments. 21 Were you concerned at the time about the pressure 22 that that may place on them but also how it may 23 negatively impact on the quality or the timeliness of 24 their work product? 25 Α. You know, can I start by saying how grateful I am for 97 1 This, as I understand it, is the TAC summary advice 2 actually from 5 May 2020, but we're not, for present 3 purposes, concerned with the contents. I just want to 4 know: what was the purpose of these advice summaries. 5 A. So there were actually two types of advice summary, 6 there was an internal summary that contained more 7 official sensitive information, for example unpublished 8 discussions and papers from SAGE, and that went to the 9 CMO, senior officials within health and across 10 government and ministers, and that was a weekly 11 publication. 12 It was a bit of a misnomer to say that it was 13 a brief, that these would sometimes run to 50 or 9-14 pages long. And then there was a publicly accessible 15 version, and this may be one of the earliest examples of 16 a condensed public version that was able to share more 17 broadly what we were observing and the information that 18 was accessible to us at that time. 19 So the internal, more expansive version, so say, Q. 20 for example, if it was commenting on SAGE, that would 21 contain, would it, within that briefing pack, the particular SAGE minutes or the SPI-M minutes or 22

23 documents?

24 Α. Yeah, the key points from those papers. I mean, we were

25 summarising and simplifying abstruse technical

99

1		Professor Gravenor's work and all of the academic
2		contributors to Technical Advisory Group, and there were
3		over 200 who gave their time freely. In our lessons
4		learned, we've identified this as an area that would
5		require improvement, so we can reimburse people for
6		their time. We were able to write ref letters to say
7		that their research was contributing to policy and
8		actions within Wales, which was important, but on the
9		matter that Professor Gravenor raises around policy, we
10		didn't have a call-off contract in place that we could
11		easily fund universities, and I think procurement was
12		difficult, we didn't have the staff to be able to put
13		business justification cases in at that time, so that
14		would be something I'd like to see addressed in the
15		future.
16	Q.	If I can just now identify some documents and TAG and
17		TAC documents with you, as I understand it there were
18		some three regular briefing documents that went to the
19		Welsh Government, so I just want to identify what those
20		are and ask you to perhaps briefly explain each of them.
21		The first is a document called a TAC summary of
22		advice, so we've got an example up on the screen.
23		It's INQ000066418. You see the first page of it
24		there, and perhaps we can just go over to the second
25		page.
		98
1		information that should be accessible for people without

2		a scientific degree.
3		The first update to CMO, and my first SAGE meeting,
4		this was really a continuation and an evolution of that
5		update. I think there were 131 of them in the course of
6		the pandemic.
7	Q.	The second document was the Covid-19 Wales situational
8		report. We've got an example of that on the screen.
9		What was the purpose of these situational reports?
10	Α.	So this again evolved over time where the TAC summary
11		had more situational assessment information from a range
12		of indicators. This then became the alert level
13		assessment that then evolved into the Covid situational
14		report, which essentially was a risk assessment bringing
15		together different strands of evidence to say: this is
16		the picture in Wales against these indicators and
17		circuit-breakers.
18	Q.	And is this an externally facing document or is this
19	Α.	That's correct, yes
20	Q.	an internal Welsh Government
21	Α.	publish.
22	Q.	If we can then identify perhaps the third document, the
23		TAG contribution for 21-day review of measures, so we've
24		got this at INQ000048838. We can just stick on this,

which is the index page. What was the purpose of this 25 100

1	document?	1		TAG and TAC and advice coming from the CMO would have
2 A .	5 1 5	2		been understood by Welsh Government and Welsh Governmer
3	from policy colleagues involved in the national	3		ministers?
4	protections and policies that would then supplement and	4	Α.	
5	support ministerial advice and CMOs' advice at that	5	Q.	
6	period.	6		from TAG and TAC and they received advice from the CMO
	. As well as these types of documents that we've just	7		would they think this was of a piece or would they think
8	looked at, I assume that ad hoc requests could be made	8		that these are different
9	of TAG and TAC for advice; is that right?	9	Α.	I mean, we met with ministers really frequently and
10 A .		10		Sir Frank and I and Fliss Bennee, you know, they knew
11	beginning. That process, like these documents, evolved	11		that the advice was coming from ourselves and TAG and
12	and were iterated over time, so a more formalised	12	_	TAC or CMO, yeah.
13	approach to commissioning was adopted over time.	13	Q.	
14 Q .		14		been repurposed; is that right?
15	between TAG and TAC and the CMO. Was TAG and TAC	15	Α.	I wouldn't well, the emergency response has obviously
16	independent of the CMO and his office?	16		been rescinded, but at the capacity and capability to
17 A .		17		respond is now within the science evidence advice
18	official and so everything was routed through CMO, but	18		division. TAG is still extant although not currently
19	conversations with my co-chair and myself, we thought	19		sitting.
20	there was a need to be to be able to report to the	20	Q.	
21	director general of Health and Social Care in case our	21		pandemic?
22	advice conflicted with the CMO, which it didn't actually	22	Α.	
23	in that period. It was more detailed but it didn't	23	Q.	
24	conflict.	24		your initial understanding in January to March 2020.
25 Q .	. Do you think the difference between advice coming from 101	25		You say in your witness statement that you didn't send 102
1	any papers related to Covid to the First Minister in	1	Q.	Do you consider that Dr Atherton and the Welsh
2	January 2020 because that was not within your roles or	2		Government decision-makers took sufficient heed of
3	responsibilities during this period. As far as you were	3		warnings such as the warning contained in your email of
4	aware, did the First Minister have access to SAGE papers	4		25 February?
5	in January 2020?	5	Α.	At the time I didn't have access, I wasn't exposed to
6 A .	Oh, I don't know, you'd have to ask the First Minister.	6		a Cabinet level or Executive Group conversation, so it's
7 Q.	. Now, Mr Drakeford said in his written evidence to	7		very difficult for me to comment from my view at the
8	the Inquiry that it was 24 January when Dr Atherton	8		time.
9	advised him that there was a significant risk that the	9	Q.	Does it surprise you that if the First Minister is being
10	virus would arrive in Wales.	10		told by the Chief Medical Officer on 24 January that
11	Did you share the CMO's view?	11		there is a significant risk that the virus would arrive
12 A .	At that point, at that juncture, I wasn't involved in	12		in Wales, that it takes until 25 February for Covid to
13	health protection matters, my work was more facing the	13		be discussed at Cabinet level?
14	NHS.	14	Α.	Again, I wasn't privy to agenda setting with Cabinet, or
15 Q .	If we move then into February, 25 February you send	15		those conversations. My advice was at that point being
16	an email to Dr Atherton in which you said, and we don't	16		promulgated through the CMO, so I wasn't privy to those
17	need to get the email up on the screen you said:	17		conversations.
18	"Based on current models demand will significantly	18	Q.	On 27 February you sent an email to Dr Atherton.
19	outstrip NHS bed capacity for about 8 weeks during	19		If we could please display this, it's INQ000087032.
20	epidemic peak."	20		This is an email sent, as I say, on 27 February. If we
21	Would it be right to say in late February this is	21		could have a look at the fourth paragraph, please, of
22	an email on 25 February that you were concerned about	22		your email yes it reads:
23	the capacity in the health service in Wales, how it	23		"The SAGE papers add further detail on the
24	would respond to a high-consequence infectious disease?	24		[reasonable worse case] and start to quantitate the
				notential symptoms of non-sub-ot-o-LUC layed non-vising
25 A .	. Yes. 103	25		potential numbers of people at a UK level requiring

(26) Pages 101 - 104

1		hospital support and ventilation. Most of the pan-flu
2		assumptions hold but some figures (eg duration of
3		hospital stay) will have a significant impact on NHS
4		planning when combined with the numbers of people
5		requiring hospital support. If we estimate the numbers
6		for Wales as being 5% of the UK totals we will see very
7		significant impacts for NHS Wales that would far
, 8		outstrip capacity for a number of weeks."
9		So at this point, 27 February, were you clear that
10		unless action was taken, the NHS in Wales would be
11		overwhelmed?
12		Yes.
13		The First Minister in his written evidence to the
14		Inquiry has said that although the Welsh Government was
15		aware of Covid-19 in January and February, it was not
16		a priority. I mean, do you think that the Welsh
17		Government appreciated the threat of Covid-19 in January
18		and February 2020, or is that not something you can
19		comment on?
20		Yeah, I guess, you know, those reflections are probably
21		best placed with ministers and more senior officials,
22		but certainly from my perspective the advice was: this
23		is coming. How big will it be and when will it arrive
24		were obviously first order questions for me at that
25		point.
20	•	105
1		we didn't know whether people were who were infected
2		with no symptoms or pre-symptoms or paucisymptomatic, in
3		that they had mild symptoms, were able to transmit. So
4		that wasn't until a lot later that there was sufficient
5		evidence to say asymptomatic people could transmit,
6		because certainly that was different from SARS-CoV-1.
7		In your update to Dr Atherton of 20 February if we
8		could perhaps have this on display, INQ000310085
9		sorry, it's the same document. Seventh bullet point
10)	though now you state that there was a 75 to 80%
11		likelihood that the virus is already in circulation. In
12	2	your view, what were the implications of this regarding
13	3	next steps to be taken by the Welsh Government in
14		response to Covid-19?
15		So, again, this is information flowing from SAGE and at
16		the time the sentinel surveillance system was not
17		particularly sensitive, so it was guesswork as to how
18		many infected or infectious people were in the UK at
19		that time. And I suspect it was from the genomic
		······································

- that time. And I suspect it was from the genomicevidence there were probably a handful of people in the
- 21 UK with the virus and, when was that, 20 February,
- so ... so, yeah, it was a commentary on likelihood of
- people being, you know, the virus already being here inthe UK.
- 25 **Q.** Sticking with this same document but going up to the 107

1	Q.	In late January/February 2020, although you say that
2		there was uncertainty about asymptomatic transmission
3		and viral shedding before symptoms developed, you say in
4		your statement that you considered it a possibility.
5		That's right, isn't it?
6	Α.	Yeah, it's patients or people being asymptomatic and
7		asymptomatic transmission are different. So I think we
8		just need to be very careful in how we're defining that.
9	Q.	If we can have a look, please, at an update that you
10		sent Dr Atherton on 20 February. This is following
11		a SAGE meeting of the same date.
12		Yes, it's INQ000310085.
13		The email at the top of the chain, fifth bullet
14		point, please, it refers to the yes, it says:
15		"From cruise ship 30-50% asymptomatic-mild."
16		Reference then obviously to the Diamond Princess
17		cruise ship.
18		So is it right that by late February 2020 you and
19		Dr Atherton were aware that there was asymptomatic
20		transmission and that the rate might be as high as 30%
21		to 50%?
22	Α.	Again, I think we need to be really careful here. So
23		this information is coming from SAGE. This is saying
24		whether people are infected, so testing positive, and
25		whether or not they've got symptoms, and at that point
		106
1		fourth bullet point:
2		"Contact tracing to continue until trigger event
3		detected eg local transmission not linked to travel.
4		Number likely to be increased."
5		Were you confident in the contact tracing
6		arrangements that were established in Wales at this
7		time?
8	Α.	So we had very few molecular tests to be able to detect
9		people carrying the virus at that time, so, you know, to
10		have the sufficient numbers of contact tracers available
11		I think would have been difficult.
12	Q.	In his witness statement to this module
13		Dr Quentin Sandifer from Public Health Wales states that
14		by 12 March it was clear that Public Health Wales'
15		capacity to conduct contact tracing was reaching a limit
16		without a large expansion in the workforce to undertake
17		this activity. Do you agree with Dr Sandifer's
18		assessment? Was this your view at the time?
19	Α.	Dr Sandifer would be far better placed than I to comment
20		on the capacity of contact tracing in Wales at that
21		juncture, so if he says it's correct then I assume it is
22		correct as I wasn't directly involved in

- 23 operationalisation of contact tracing at that point.
- 24 MR POOLE: My Lady, we're about to move into March 2020, so
- 25 that might be an appropriate moment.

108

1	LA	DY HALLETT: Certainly. I hope you were warned you may go	1	
2		over lunch.	2	
3	TH	E WITNESS: Thank you.	3	
4	LA	DY HALLETT: 1.45, please.	4	
5	(12	.45 pm)	5	
6		(The short adjournment)	6	
7	(1.4	45 pm)	7	Q
8	LA	DY HALLETT: Mr Poole.	8	
9	MR	POOLE: Dr Orford, the UK Coronavirus: action plan was	9	
10		published on 3 March 2020. In your witness statement,	10	
11		you say:	11	
12		" prior to its publication I had commented by	12	
13		email on 1 March that the document was Anglocentric	13	Α.
14		and needed to better reflect the devolved nature of	14	
15		Health and the responsible organisations in Wales."	15	
16		First of all, I suppose, did the final version take	16	Q
17		on board your comments?	17	
18	Α.	That's a good question. I can't recollect reading the	18	
19		last version, but I recollect seeing comments from other	19	
20		colleagues, a summary of comments back from devolved	20	
21		governments, making the same comment, that it needed to	21	
22		reflect the UK rather than the position in England.	22	
23	Q.	Why do you feel the action plan was Anglocentric?	23	
24	Α.	I mean, quite often if you see documents that have been	24	
25		drafted fairly swiftly I think that email probably	25	
1		and now having a look at this document, given the	1	
2		worsening clinical picture do you think the advice	2	
3		should have gone further than recommending further	3	
4		control measures simply being considered? Should the	4	Α.
5		advice have actually recommended the introduction of	5	
6		further control measures at this stage?	6	
7	Α.	That's a good question. Hypothetically, should we have	7	
8		urged a lockdown sooner? I think that's what we were	8	
9		saying here, that you needed to go sooner.	9	Q
10		And just to try to fit this into context of what was	10	
11		happening, I believe there was a SAGE meeting on	11	
12		16 March where there was a discussion that the doubling	12	Α.
13		time was shorter than previously thought, and perhaps	13	
14		there were more cases in the community than possibly had	14	
15		been picked up through the ICU sentinel surveillance.	15	
16		So the picture was pretty bleak at this time that we	16	
17		were some way down the track.	17	
18	Q.	Could we, please, have a look at an email that you sent	18	
19		to Dr Atherton on 22 March. It's INQ000350513.	19	
20		This was an email in response to an email he had	20	Q
21		sent with information from Sir Chris Whitty on the	21	
22		UK Government strategy.	22	
23		You say at page 1, first or second substantive	23	
24		paragraph:	24	Α.
25		"I'm not sure I agree [Document read] needs 111	25	

1		came on a Sunday night to about 200 people often
2		you'll find references to "the NHS"; well, there's four
2		NHS organisations within the UK, so unless you're
4		looking through a telescope from devolved government
5		perspective, it's not easy to capture all those nuances
6		of the differences in devolved governance.
7	Q.	On 12 March Wales like the rest of the UK moved from
8		contain to delay and then on 17 March the First Minister
9		advised that the public should limit non-essential
10		contact, work from home where possible and avoid social
11		venues. In your view, did that advice go far enough on
12		17 March?
13	Α.	I think probably from 17 well, before 17 March it was
14		looking pretty precarious and actually we probably
15		should have gone further then.
16	Q.	If we have a look please on 20 March, it's a TAC
17		Covid-19 briefing document. INQ000083241, thank you.
18		If we can look at page 1, first paragraph, TAC
19		advised that the risk of exceeding NHS capacity was
20		higher than previously considered.
21		Then paragraph 2, please:
22		"TAC [recommended] that further [Document read]
23		and decrease the risk of exponential growth in
24		demand."
25		Picking up on your answer to the previous question 110
		110
1		to be done as soon as possibleeg tomorrow (2-3)."
2		Why did you disagree with the UK position on the
2 3	_	Why did you disagree with the UK position on the second wave, the bounce-back as some have called it?
2 3 4	А.	Why did you disagree with the UK position on the second wave, the bounce-back as some have called it? I'm not sure I'm disagreeing at that point. I haven't
2 3 4 5	A.	Why did you disagree with the UK position on the second wave, the bounce-back as some have called it? I'm not sure I'm disagreeing at that point. I haven't got the document from Chris Whitty to refer to, but
2 3 4 5 6	A.	Why did you disagree with the UK position on the second wave, the bounce-back as some have called it? I'm not sure I'm disagreeing at that point. I haven't got the document from Chris Whitty to refer to, but I think at that point I'm highlighting the need for more
2 3 4 5 6 7	A.	Why did you disagree with the UK position on the second wave, the bounce-back as some have called it? I'm not sure I'm disagreeing at that point. I haven't got the document from Chris Whitty to refer to, but I think at that point I'm highlighting the need for more testing, more contact tracing, as well as the
2 3 4 5 6 7 8		Why did you disagree with the UK position on the second wave, the bounce-back as some have called it? I'm not sure I'm disagreeing at that point. I haven't got the document from Chris Whitty to refer to, but I think at that point I'm highlighting the need for more testing, more contact tracing, as well as the suppression methodology.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	A. Q.	Why did you disagree with the UK position on the second wave, the bounce-back as some have called it? I'm not sure I'm disagreeing at that point. I haven't got the document from Chris Whitty to refer to, but I think at that point I'm highlighting the need for more testing, more contact tracing, as well as the suppression methodology. As we know, the UK, including Wales, entered lockdown on
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9		Why did you disagree with the UK position on the second wave, the bounce-back as some have called it? I'm not sure I'm disagreeing at that point. I haven't got the document from Chris Whitty to refer to, but I think at that point I'm highlighting the need for more testing, more contact tracing, as well as the suppression methodology. As we know, the UK, including Wales, entered lockdown on 23 March. Do you consider the lockdown in Wales was
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11	Q.	Why did you disagree with the UK position on the second wave, the bounce-back as some have called it? I'm not sure I'm disagreeing at that point. I haven't got the document from Chris Whitty to refer to, but I think at that point I'm highlighting the need for more testing, more contact tracing, as well as the suppression methodology. As we know, the UK, including Wales, entered lockdown on 23 March. Do you consider the lockdown in Wales was imposed early enough?
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12		Why did you disagree with the UK position on the second wave, the bounce-back as some have called it? I'm not sure I'm disagreeing at that point. I haven't got the document from Chris Whitty to refer to, but I think at that point I'm highlighting the need for more testing, more contact tracing, as well as the suppression methodology. As we know, the UK, including Wales, entered lockdown on 23 March. Do you consider the lockdown in Wales was imposed early enough? At the time, the discussion was that we were possibly
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	Q.	Why did you disagree with the UK position on the second wave, the bounce-back as some have called it? I'm not sure I'm disagreeing at that point. I haven't got the document from Chris Whitty to refer to, but I think at that point I'm highlighting the need for more testing, more contact tracing, as well as the suppression methodology. As we know, the UK, including Wales, entered lockdown on 23 March. Do you consider the lockdown in Wales was imposed early enough? At the time, the discussion was that we were possibly a couple of weeks behind London, and that London was
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	Q.	Why did you disagree with the UK position on the second wave, the bounce-back as some have called it? I'm not sure I'm disagreeing at that point. I haven't got the document from Chris Whitty to refer to, but I think at that point I'm highlighting the need for more testing, more contact tracing, as well as the suppression methodology. As we know, the UK, including Wales, entered lockdown on 23 March. Do you consider the lockdown in Wales was imposed early enough? At the time, the discussion was that we were possibly a couple of weeks behind London, and that London was further advanced than us because of the nature of the
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	Q.	Why did you disagree with the UK position on the second wave, the bounce-back as some have called it? I'm not sure I'm disagreeing at that point. I haven't got the document from Chris Whitty to refer to, but I think at that point I'm highlighting the need for more testing, more contact tracing, as well as the suppression methodology. As we know, the UK, including Wales, entered lockdown on 23 March. Do you consider the lockdown in Wales was imposed early enough? At the time, the discussion was that we were possibly a couple of weeks behind London, and that London was further advanced than us because of the nature of the seeding of the infection into the UK. In hindsight,
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	Q.	Why did you disagree with the UK position on the second wave, the bounce-back as some have called it? I'm not sure I'm disagreeing at that point. I haven't got the document from Chris Whitty to refer to, but I think at that point I'm highlighting the need for more testing, more contact tracing, as well as the suppression methodology. As we know, the UK, including Wales, entered lockdown on 23 March. Do you consider the lockdown in Wales was imposed early enough? At the time, the discussion was that we were possibly a couple of weeks behind London, and that London was further advanced than us because of the nature of the seeding of the infection into the UK. In hindsight, scientific papers suggest a week earlier would have been
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	Q.	Why did you disagree with the UK position on the second wave, the bounce-back as some have called it? I'm not sure I'm disagreeing at that point. I haven't got the document from Chris Whitty to refer to, but I think at that point I'm highlighting the need for more testing, more contact tracing, as well as the suppression methodology. As we know, the UK, including Wales, entered lockdown on 23 March. Do you consider the lockdown in Wales was imposed early enough? At the time, the discussion was that we were possibly a couple of weeks behind London, and that London was further advanced than us because of the nature of the seeding of the infection into the UK. In hindsight, scientific papers suggest a week earlier would have been better, so if the UK had gone into lockdown on the 15th
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	Q.	Why did you disagree with the UK position on the second wave, the bounce-back as some have called it? I'm not sure I'm disagreeing at that point. I haven't got the document from Chris Whitty to refer to, but I think at that point I'm highlighting the need for more testing, more contact tracing, as well as the suppression methodology. As we know, the UK, including Wales, entered lockdown on 23 March. Do you consider the lockdown in Wales was imposed early enough? At the time, the discussion was that we were possibly a couple of weeks behind London, and that London was further advanced than us because of the nature of the seeding of the infection into the UK. In hindsight, scientific papers suggest a week earlier would have been better, so if the UK had gone into lockdown on the 15th then that would have been better than the date it did go
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	Q. A.	Why did you disagree with the UK position on the second wave, the bounce-back as some have called it? I'm not sure I'm disagreeing at that point. I haven't got the document from Chris Whitty to refer to, but I think at that point I'm highlighting the need for more testing, more contact tracing, as well as the suppression methodology. As we know, the UK, including Wales, entered lockdown on 23 March. Do you consider the lockdown in Wales was imposed early enough? At the time, the discussion was that we were possibly a couple of weeks behind London, and that London was further advanced than us because of the nature of the seeding of the infection into the UK. In hindsight, scientific papers suggest a week earlier would have been better, so if the UK had gone into lockdown on the 15th then that would have been better than the date it did go into lockdown, in hindsight.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19	Q.	Why did you disagree with the UK position on the second wave, the bounce-back as some have called it? I'm not sure I'm disagreeing at that point. I haven't got the document from Chris Whitty to refer to, but I think at that point I'm highlighting the need for more testing, more contact tracing, as well as the suppression methodology. As we know, the UK, including Wales, entered lockdown on 23 March. Do you consider the lockdown in Wales was imposed early enough? At the time, the discussion was that we were possibly a couple of weeks behind London, and that London was further advanced than us because of the nature of the seeding of the infection into the UK. In hindsight, scientific papers suggest a week earlier would have been better, so if the UK had gone into lockdown on the 15th then that would have been better than the date it did go
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	Q. A.	Why did you disagree with the UK position on the second wave, the bounce-back as some have called it? I'm not sure I'm disagreeing at that point. I haven't got the document from Chris Whitty to refer to, but I think at that point I'm highlighting the need for more testing, more contact tracing, as well as the suppression methodology. As we know, the UK, including Wales, entered lockdown on 23 March. Do you consider the lockdown in Wales was imposed early enough? At the time, the discussion was that we were possibly a couple of weeks behind London, and that London was further advanced than us because of the nature of the seeding of the infection into the UK. In hindsight, scientific papers suggest a week earlier would have been better, so if the UK had gone into lockdown on the 15th then that would have been better than the date it did go into lockdown, in hindsight. I think you refer in your witness statement to a modelling study that showed that introducing measures
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	Q. A.	Why did you disagree with the UK position on the second wave, the bounce-back as some have called it? I'm not sure I'm disagreeing at that point. I haven't got the document from Chris Whitty to refer to, but I think at that point I'm highlighting the need for more testing, more contact tracing, as well as the suppression methodology. As we know, the UK, including Wales, entered lockdown on 23 March. Do you consider the lockdown in Wales was imposed early enough? At the time, the discussion was that we were possibly a couple of weeks behind London, and that London was further advanced than us because of the nature of the seeding of the infection into the UK. In hindsight, scientific papers suggest a week earlier would have been better, so if the UK had gone into lockdown on the 15th then that would have been better than the date it did go into lockdown, in hindsight. I think you refer in your witness statement to
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	Q. A.	Why did you disagree with the UK position on the second wave, the bounce-back as some have called it? I'm not sure I'm disagreeing at that point. I haven't got the document from Chris Whitty to refer to, but I think at that point I'm highlighting the need for more testing, more contact tracing, as well as the suppression methodology. As we know, the UK, including Wales, entered lockdown on 23 March. Do you consider the lockdown in Wales was imposed early enough? At the time, the discussion was that we were possibly a couple of weeks behind London, and that London was further advanced than us because of the nature of the seeding of the infection into the UK. In hindsight, scientific papers suggest a week earlier would have been better, so if the UK had gone into lockdown on the 15th then that would have been better than the date it did go into lockdown, in hindsight. I think you refer in your witness statement to a modelling study that showed that introducing measures one week earlier would have reduced by 745% the number
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	Q. A. Q.	Why did you disagree with the UK position on the second wave, the bounce-back as some have called it? I'm not sure I'm disagreeing at that point. I haven't got the document from Chris Whitty to refer to, but I think at that point I'm highlighting the need for more testing, more contact tracing, as well as the suppression methodology. As we know, the UK, including Wales, entered lockdown on 23 March. Do you consider the lockdown in Wales was imposed early enough? At the time, the discussion was that we were possibly a couple of weeks behind London, and that London was further advanced than us because of the nature of the seeding of the infection into the UK. In hindsight, scientific papers suggest a week earlier would have been better, so if the UK had gone into lockdown on the 15th then that would have been better than the date it did go into lockdown, in hindsight. I think you refer in your witness statement to a modelling study that showed that introducing measures one week earlier would have reduced by 745% the number of Covid cases in England by 1 June. Is that right?
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24	Q. A. Q.	Why did you disagree with the UK position on the second wave, the bounce-back as some have called it? I'm not sure I'm disagreeing at that point. I haven't got the document from Chris Whitty to refer to, but I think at that point I'm highlighting the need for more testing, more contact tracing, as well as the suppression methodology. As we know, the UK, including Wales, entered lockdown on 23 March. Do you consider the lockdown in Wales was imposed early enough? At the time, the discussion was that we were possibly a couple of weeks behind London, and that London was further advanced than us because of the nature of the seeding of the infection into the UK. In hindsight, scientific papers suggest a week earlier would have been better, so if the UK had gone into lockdown on the 15th then that would have been better than the date it did go into lockdown, in hindsight. I think you refer in your witness statement to a modelling study that showed that introducing measures one week earlier would have reduced by 745% the number of Covid cases in England by 1 June. Is that right? That's correct, yeah. It's not my work, but that is the

(28) Pages 109 - 112

So this is an email that was sent on 9 March from the principal private secretary to the First Minister. The email asks for advice in relation to cancelling major events due to coronavirus. Your reply is at the top of page 11, I think, and it's dated 11 March.

So you send a technical briefing on mass gatherings, and we can see that briefing -- I don't -- perhaps if we

Bottom of page 3 of this briefing, in answer to the question "Should I continue to attend or run sports

"There is presently no scientific evidence ...

can bring up that briefing. It's INQ000271447.

events?" the briefing advises that:

[Document read] ... the situation evolves."

1	Q.	And that would have resulted in approximately 21,000	1	
2		fewer hospital deaths and 34,000 fewer total deaths, and	2	
3		also the total time spent in lockdown would have been	3	
4		halved, from 69 days to 35 days?	4	
5		According to the model, yes.	5	
6	LA	DY HALLETT: But what happens if you do then get another	6	
7		high wave?	7	
8	Α.	I think we did get another high wave.	8	
9		DY HALLETT: Exactly.	9	
10		Yes.	10	
11	LA	DY HALLETT: So how does one look at those figures? If	11	
12		you've had those figures for the length of the lockdown	12	
13		and then you get another high wave, the number of deaths	13	
14 15		overall, can one say whether there was any impact on those?	14 15	
16	Α.	Depends when you intervene on that second wave, I guess.	15	
17		POOLE: So timing of further restrictions in, say,	10	
18	WIN	autumn/winter 2020 would have been critical?	17	
19	Α.	Yes.	10	
20	Q.	Before we leave March, can I just ask some questions	20	
20	ч.	about the advice you provided to the Welsh Government as	20	
22		regards transmission risks of allowing mass gatherings	22	
23		to go ahead.	23	
24		If we could have a look, please, at INQ000271446, at	24	
25		page 13. I'm grateful.	25	Α.
		113		
1		I'm not certain that this document is one that	1	A.
2		I drafted, I think it was probably drafted by comms	2	А.
2		colleagues with some advice from myself within it, and	3	
4		the advice that I gave was the advice of SAGE and the	4	Q.
5		calculations from the modellers regarding the impact,	5	ч.
6		the potential impact of those events.	6	
7	Q.	I mean, the events foreseeably entailed people	8 7	
8	.	travelling for the match, so we've heard that 20,000	8	
9		Scottish rugby fans travelled to Cardiff in advance of	9	
10		the rugby match, and they foreseeably would have	10	
11		entailed people meeting in pubs and bars ahead of the	11	
12		match. From a public health perspective, would it not	12	
13		have been prudent to advise against mass gatherings	13	
14		going ahead?	14	
15	Α.	I think in the benefit of hindsight, it would have made	15	
		-	16	
		sense, just the optics of this, to stop the events going	10	
16 17		sense, just the optics of this, to stop the events going ahead. But from an epidemiological perspective, then	10	
16				
16 17		ahead. But from an epidemiological perspective, then	17	
16 17 18		ahead. But from an epidemiological perspective, then perhaps closing all bars at the same time to stop	17 18	
16 17 18 19		ahead. But from an epidemiological perspective, then perhaps closing all bars at the same time to stop displacement activities. So whilst the risk of these	17 18 19	
16 17 18 19 20		ahead. But from an epidemiological perspective, then perhaps closing all bars at the same time to stop displacement activities. So whilst the risk of these individual events were negligible compared to the whole	17 18 19 20	
16 17 18 19 20 21		ahead. But from an epidemiological perspective, then perhaps closing all bars at the same time to stop displacement activities. So whilst the risk of these individual events were negligible compared to the whole population where transmission happens all of the time	17 18 19 20 21	
16 17 18 19 20 21 22	Q.	ahead. But from an epidemiological perspective, then perhaps closing all bars at the same time to stop displacement activities. So whilst the risk of these individual events were negligible compared to the whole population where transmission happens all of the time everywhere, actually what the what they presented to	17 18 19 20 21 22	

(29) Pages 113 - 116
116
Do you agree with Sir Chris Whitty's views I do.
reasonably".
words "logically incoherent to the general public, quite
continue and mass gatherings to remain open" was, in his
closure of schools "whilst allowing sporting events to
Professor Whitty also stated that debating the
you're trying to signal is anything but normality."
impression it gives of normality at a time that what
has had a major material effect directly, but the
themselves, which I don't think there's good evidence
"So I think that the problem was not the gatherings
and he stated:
public that the government couldn't be that worried",
sporting events to go ahead "signalled to the general
Sir Chris Whitty said there allowing mass gatherings and
So internal page 189, lines 13 to 19, so
transcript of his evidence, it's I'm grateful.
If we can just, please, see a passage of the
of allowing mass gatherings to go ahead.
The evidence that Sir Chris Whitty has given to the Inquiry on 21 November, he spoke about the consequences
responsibility, to provide public health advice.
their advice but, you know, that is their
I don't think I was aware at the time that that was
114
Yeah, that's correct. The advice that I was giving
for transmission?
that the events themselves would not be major vectors
that TAC was giving at this time was based on the view
Is it right that the advice that you were giving and
decisions"
[Document read] bodies to make their own
"The 4 CMOs position on the science not supporting
going ahead this weekend?" the briefing states:
answer to the question "Why is the Six Nations [rugby]
Then over the page, page 4, first paragraph, in

Q.

Q.

Α.

Α.

Q.

Q.	as expressed there?	1		level.
	Yes, I do.	2	Q.	Did you have concerns at this point in time, so this is
Q.	We can change topic, Dr Orford, talk about testing.	3		22 March, about whether Wales would be able to rely on
	Now, from 22 March 2020 you were the senior responsible	4		UK-wide initiatives to scale up testing capacity in
	officer for testing; is that right?	5		Wales?
Α.	That's correct, yeah.	6	Α.	So I was unaware at that time if there was or wasn't
Q.	If we could, please, have on display INQ000309871.	7		a UK testing plan, and so on 23 March, the next day, or
	Which is an email of 22 March, Quentin Sandifer from	8		on the 22nd, I asked who was responsible for
	Public Health Wales emailing you and Tracey Cooper	9		co-ordinating testing in Wales, it turned out to be me,
	regarding testing.	10		I was given that privilege, and by the 23rd we'd
	Now, in this email Dr Sandifer expresses concern	11		assembled a group, including Public Health Wales, to
	about Wales losing out in relation to testing kits.	12		draft a high-level testing plan to scale up testing,
	Dr Sandifer says:	13		partly because of this problem.
	"Above all else I am really worried that National	14	Q.	On 27 March you were asked questions about the testing
	politics could trump public safety and need in Wales and	15		strategy on behalf of Mr Gething.
	we end up losing out badly in Wales."	16		The email that I'd like displayed is INQ000383998,
	What did you understand to be Dr Sandifer's concern	17		thank you.
	about national politics trumping public safety?	18		So on the second page we can see there:
Α.	,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,	19		"The Minister [Mr Gething] has a number of
	understanding that the whole of the world were looking	20		questions he would like answered before the testing plan
	for tests for Covid, including UK Government, and	21		can be published."
	including Welsh Government, including Public Health	22		And the email refers to concerns regarding testing
	Wales, and Public Health Wales were concerned that	23		capacity and concerns about being reliant on UK
	an agreement had been struck with a company that wasn't	24		initiatives. Now, your reply is the text that we can
	honoured because of other power plays going on at UK 117	25		see in red in this email. 118
	Middle of that name the amail anapifically	1		there. I'm reading from (a)
	Middle of that page, the email specifically	1		there, I'm reading from (a):
	references being let down by Roche, and that is what	2		"It is clear that the situation is rather chaotic
	references being let down by Roche, and that is what	2		"It is clear that the situation is rather chaotic and the [Document read] will be met "
	you've just alluded to a moment ago, if I can perhaps	3		and the [Document read] will be met."
	you've just alluded to a moment ago, if I can perhaps give a summary of the situation and you can tell me	3 4		and the [Document read] will be met." Would it be fair to say that there was little trust
	you've just alluded to a moment ago, if I can perhaps give a summary of the situation and you can tell me whether I've got it right.	3 4 5		and the [Document read] will be met." Would it be fair to say that there was little trust that UK-wide testing initiatives could be relied upon at
	you've just alluded to a moment ago, if I can perhaps give a summary of the situation and you can tell me whether I've got it right. There was an announcement made by Mr Gething on	3 4	А.	and the [Document read] will be met." Would it be fair to say that there was little trust that UK-wide testing initiatives could be relied upon at this stage?
	you've just alluded to a moment ago, if I can perhaps give a summary of the situation and you can tell me whether I've got it right. There was an announcement made by Mr Gething on 21 March that the Welsh Government would have access to	3 4 5 6	А.	and the [Document read] will be met." Would it be fair to say that there was little trust that UK-wide testing initiatives could be relied upon at this stage? I think there was a great deal of uncertainty at that
	you've just alluded to a moment ago, if I can perhaps give a summary of the situation and you can tell me whether I've got it right. There was an announcement made by Mr Gething on	3 4 5 6 7		and the [Document read] will be met." Would it be fair to say that there was little trust that UK-wide testing initiatives could be relied upon at this stage?
	you've just alluded to a moment ago, if I can perhaps give a summary of the situation and you can tell me whether I've got it right. There was an announcement made by Mr Gething on 21 March that the Welsh Government would have access to 6,000 Covid tests a day by 1 April. That appears to	3 4 5 6 7 8		 and the [Document read] will be met." Would it be fair to say that there was little trust that UK-wide testing initiatives could be relied upon at this stage? I think there was a great deal of uncertainty at that stage.
	you've just alluded to a moment ago, if I can perhaps give a summary of the situation and you can tell me whether I've got it right. There was an announcement made by Mr Gething on 21 March that the Welsh Government would have access to 6,000 Covid tests a day by 1 April. That appears to have been based on an agreement that the Welsh	3 4 5 6 7 8 9		 and the [Document read] will be met." Would it be fair to say that there was little trust that UK-wide testing initiatives could be relied upon at this stage? I think there was a great deal of uncertainty at that stage. DY HALLETT: I think it's right to say for those that
	you've just alluded to a moment ago, if I can perhaps give a summary of the situation and you can tell me whether I've got it right. There was an announcement made by Mr Gething on 21 March that the Welsh Government would have access to 6,000 Covid tests a day by 1 April. That appears to have been based on an agreement that the Welsh Government believed it had or at least was negotiating	3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10		 and the [Document read] will be met." Would it be fair to say that there was little trust that UK-wide testing initiatives could be relied upon at this stage? I think there was a great deal of uncertainty at that stage. DY HALLETT: I think it's right to say for those that haven't followed this that this incident involving Roche
	you've just alluded to a moment ago, if I can perhaps give a summary of the situation and you can tell me whether I've got it right. There was an announcement made by Mr Gething on 21 March that the Welsh Government would have access to 6,000 Covid tests a day by 1 April. That appears to have been based on an agreement that the Welsh Government believed it had or at least was negotiating with the Swiss pharmaceutical company Roche, however	3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11	LA	 and the [Document read] will be met." Would it be fair to say that there was little trust that UK-wide testing initiatives could be relied upon at this stage? I think there was a great deal of uncertainty at that stage. DY HALLETT: I think it's right to say for those that haven't followed this that this incident involving Roche and the number of tests has been highly controversial as
	you've just alluded to a moment ago, if I can perhaps give a summary of the situation and you can tell me whether I've got it right. There was an announcement made by Mr Gething on 21 March that the Welsh Government would have access to 6,000 Covid tests a day by 1 April. That appears to have been based on an agreement that the Welsh Government believed it had or at least was negotiating with the Swiss pharmaceutical company Roche, however Roche ended up supplying tests to the UK Government for	3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12	LAI	 and the [Document read] will be met." Would it be fair to say that there was little trust that UK-wide testing initiatives could be relied upon at this stage? I think there was a great deal of uncertainty at that stage. DY HALLETT: I think it's right to say for those that haven't followed this that this incident involving Roche and the number of tests has been highly controversial as to whose memory is accurate.
	you've just alluded to a moment ago, if I can perhaps give a summary of the situation and you can tell me whether I've got it right. There was an announcement made by Mr Gething on 21 March that the Welsh Government would have access to 6,000 Covid tests a day by 1 April. That appears to have been based on an agreement that the Welsh Government believed it had or at least was negotiating with the Swiss pharmaceutical company Roche, however Roche ended up supplying tests to the UK Government for use in England, and then, after agreement, with the	3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	LAI	 and the [Document read] will be met." Would it be fair to say that there was little trust that UK-wide testing initiatives could be relied upon at this stage? I think there was a great deal of uncertainty at that stage. DY HALLETT: I think it's right to say for those that haven't followed this that this incident involving Roche and the number of tests has been highly controversial as to whose memory is accurate. Yeah, absolutely. DY HALLETT: Is that fair?
A.	you've just alluded to a moment ago, if I can perhaps give a summary of the situation and you can tell me whether I've got it right. There was an announcement made by Mr Gething on 21 March that the Welsh Government would have access to 6,000 Covid tests a day by 1 April. That appears to have been based on an agreement that the Welsh Government believed it had or at least was negotiating with the Swiss pharmaceutical company Roche, however Roche ended up supplying tests to the UK Government for use in England, and then, after agreement, with the devolved administrations. Is that more or less	3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	LAI A. LAI	 and the [Document read] will be met." Would it be fair to say that there was little trust that UK-wide testing initiatives could be relied upon at this stage? I think there was a great deal of uncertainty at that stage. DY HALLETT: I think it's right to say for those that haven't followed this that this incident involving Roche and the number of tests has been highly controversial as to whose memory is accurate. Yeah, absolutely. DY HALLETT: Is that fair?
A.	you've just alluded to a moment ago, if I can perhaps give a summary of the situation and you can tell me whether I've got it right. There was an announcement made by Mr Gething on 21 March that the Welsh Government would have access to 6,000 Covid tests a day by 1 April. That appears to have been based on an agreement that the Welsh Government believed it had or at least was negotiating with the Swiss pharmaceutical company Roche, however Roche ended up supplying tests to the UK Government for use in England, and then, after agreement, with the devolved administrations. Is that more or less an accurate summary?	3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	LAI A. LAI	 and the [Document read] will be met." Would it be fair to say that there was little trust that UK-wide testing initiatives could be relied upon at this stage? I think there was a great deal of uncertainty at that stage. DY HALLETT: I think it's right to say for those that haven't followed this that this incident involving Roche and the number of tests has been highly controversial as to whose memory is accurate. Yeah, absolutely. DY HALLETT: Is that fair? But I think Tracey's emails are fairly you know, are
A.	you've just alluded to a moment ago, if I can perhaps give a summary of the situation and you can tell me whether I've got it right. There was an announcement made by Mr Gething on 21 March that the Welsh Government would have access to 6,000 Covid tests a day by 1 April. That appears to have been based on an agreement that the Welsh Government believed it had or at least was negotiating with the Swiss pharmaceutical company Roche, however Roche ended up supplying tests to the UK Government for use in England, and then, after agreement, with the devolved administrations. Is that more or less an accurate summary? I think that agreement would have been with Public	3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	LAI A. LAI A.	 and the [Document read] will be met." Would it be fair to say that there was little trust that UK-wide testing initiatives could be relied upon at this stage? I think there was a great deal of uncertainty at that stage. DY HALLETT: I think it's right to say for those that haven't followed this that this incident involving Roche and the number of tests has been highly controversial as to whose memory is accurate. Yeah, absolutely. DY HALLETT: Is that fair? But I think Tracey's emails are fairly you know, are accurate at the time, they were captured with the
A.	you've just alluded to a moment ago, if I can perhaps give a summary of the situation and you can tell me whether I've got it right. There was an announcement made by Mr Gething on 21 March that the Welsh Government would have access to 6,000 Covid tests a day by 1 April. That appears to have been based on an agreement that the Welsh Government believed it had or at least was negotiating with the Swiss pharmaceutical company Roche, however Roche ended up supplying tests to the UK Government for use in England, and then, after agreement, with the devolved administrations. Is that more or less an accurate summary? I think that agreement would have been with Public Health Wales and Roche rather than the Welsh Government,	3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	LAI A. LAI A.	 and the [Document read] will be met." Would it be fair to say that there was little trust that UK-wide testing initiatives could be relied upon at this stage? I think there was a great deal of uncertainty at that stage. DY HALLETT: I think it's right to say for those that haven't followed this that this incident involving Roche and the number of tests has been highly controversial as to whose memory is accurate. Yeah, absolutely. DY HALLETT: Is that fair? But I think Tracey's emails are fairly you know, are accurate at the time, they were captured with the knowledge at the time.
A. Q.	you've just alluded to a moment ago, if I can perhaps give a summary of the situation and you can tell me whether I've got it right. There was an announcement made by Mr Gething on 21 March that the Welsh Government would have access to 6,000 Covid tests a day by 1 April. That appears to have been based on an agreement that the Welsh Government believed it had or at least was negotiating with the Swiss pharmaceutical company Roche, however Roche ended up supplying tests to the UK Government for use in England, and then, after agreement, with the devolved administrations. Is that more or less an accurate summary? I think that agreement would have been with Public Health Wales and Roche rather than the Welsh Government, was my understanding. And I don't think that was	3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	LAI A. LAI A.	and the [Document read] will be met." Would it be fair to say that there was little trust that UK-wide testing initiatives could be relied upon at this stage? I think there was a great deal of uncertainty at that stage. DY HALLETT: I think it's right to say for those that haven't followed this that this incident involving Roche and the number of tests has been highly controversial as to whose memory is accurate. Yeah, absolutely. DY HALLETT: Is that fair? But I think Tracey's emails are fairly you know, are accurate at the time, they were captured with the knowledge at the time.
_	you've just alluded to a moment ago, if I can perhaps give a summary of the situation and you can tell me whether I've got it right. There was an announcement made by Mr Gething on 21 March that the Welsh Government would have access to 6,000 Covid tests a day by 1 April. That appears to have been based on an agreement that the Welsh Government believed it had or at least was negotiating with the Swiss pharmaceutical company Roche, however Roche ended up supplying tests to the UK Government for use in England, and then, after agreement, with the devolved administrations. Is that more or less an accurate summary? I think that agreement would have been with Public Health Wales and Roche rather than the Welsh Government, was my understanding. And I don't think that was a written agreement, I think it was a verbal agreement.	3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19	LAI A. LAI A.	 and the [Document read] will be met." Would it be fair to say that there was little trust that UK-wide testing initiatives could be relied upon at this stage? I think there was a great deal of uncertainty at that stage. DY HALLETT: I think it's right to say for those that haven't followed this that this incident involving Roche and the number of tests has been highly controversial as to whose memory is accurate. Yeah, absolutely. DY HALLETT: Is that fair? But I think Tracey's emails are fairly you know, are accurate at the time, they were captured with the knowledge at the time. POOLE: Was there a concern that you would be competing with the UK Government in the supply of testing
_	you've just alluded to a moment ago, if I can perhaps give a summary of the situation and you can tell me whether I've got it right. There was an announcement made by Mr Gething on 21 March that the Welsh Government would have access to 6,000 Covid tests a day by 1 April. That appears to have been based on an agreement that the Welsh Government believed it had or at least was negotiating with the Swiss pharmaceutical company Roche, however Roche ended up supplying tests to the UK Government for use in England, and then, after agreement, with the devolved administrations. Is that more or less an accurate summary? I think that agreement would have been with Public Health Wales and Roche rather than the Welsh Government, was my understanding. And I don't think that was a written agreement, I think it was a verbal agreement. We have a look, please, at page yes, page 2, paragraph 4 of let me just check. If we can have actually, please, INQ000309905	3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	LAI A. LAI A.	 and the [Document read] will be met." Would it be fair to say that there was little trust that UK-wide testing initiatives could be relied upon at this stage? I think there was a great deal of uncertainty at that stage. DY HALLETT: I think it's right to say for those that haven't followed this that this incident involving Roche and the number of tests has been highly controversial as to whose memory is accurate. Yeah, absolutely. DY HALLETT: Is that fair? But I think Tracey's emails are fairly you know, are accurate at the time, they were captured with the knowledge at the time. POOLE: Was there a concern that you would be competing with the UK Government in the supply of testing materials? Yes. Now, we know that a testing plan was published in Wales
_	you've just alluded to a moment ago, if I can perhaps give a summary of the situation and you can tell me whether I've got it right. There was an announcement made by Mr Gething on 21 March that the Welsh Government would have access to 6,000 Covid tests a day by 1 April. That appears to have been based on an agreement that the Welsh Government believed it had or at least was negotiating with the Swiss pharmaceutical company Roche, however Roche ended up supplying tests to the UK Government for use in England, and then, after agreement, with the devolved administrations. Is that more or less an accurate summary? I think that agreement would have been with Public Health Wales and Roche rather than the Welsh Government, was my understanding. And I don't think that was a written agreement, I think it was a verbal agreement. We have a look, please, at page yes, page 2, paragraph 4 of let me just check. If we can have actually, please, INQ000309905 displayed. This is an email from Tracey Cooper to you	3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	LAI A. LAI A. MR	 and the [Document read] will be met." Would it be fair to say that there was little trust that UK-wide testing initiatives could be relied upon at this stage? I think there was a great deal of uncertainty at that stage. DY HALLETT: I think it's right to say for those that haven't followed this that this incident involving Roche and the number of tests has been highly controversial as to whose memory is accurate. Yeah, absolutely. DY HALLETT: Is that fair? But I think Tracey's emails are fairly you know, are accurate at the time, they were captured with the knowledge at the time. POOLE: Was there a concern that you would be competing with the UK Government in the supply of testing materials? Yes. Now, we know that a testing plan was published in Wales on 7 April 2020. The Inquiry understands that the Welsh
_	you've just alluded to a moment ago, if I can perhaps give a summary of the situation and you can tell me whether I've got it right. There was an announcement made by Mr Gething on 21 March that the Welsh Government would have access to 6,000 Covid tests a day by 1 April. That appears to have been based on an agreement that the Welsh Government believed it had or at least was negotiating with the Swiss pharmaceutical company Roche, however Roche ended up supplying tests to the UK Government for use in England, and then, after agreement, with the devolved administrations. Is that more or less an accurate summary? I think that agreement would have been with Public Health Wales and Roche rather than the Welsh Government, was my understanding. And I don't think that was a written agreement, I think it was a verbal agreement. We have a look, please, at page yes, page 2, paragraph 4 of let me just check. If we can have actually, please, INQ000309905 displayed. This is an email from Tracey Cooper to you and others yes, I'm grateful, thank you.	3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24	LAI A. LAI A. MR	and the [Document read] will be met." Would it be fair to say that there was little trust that UK-wide testing initiatives could be relied upon at this stage? I think there was a great deal of uncertainty at that stage. DY HALLETT: I think it's right to say for those that haven't followed this that this incident involving Roche and the number of tests has been highly controversial as to whose memory is accurate. Yeah, absolutely. DY HALLETT: Is that fair? But I think Tracey's emails are fairly you know, are accurate at the time, they were captured with the knowledge at the time. POOLE: Was there a concern that you would be competing with the UK Government in the supply of testing materials? Yes. Now, we know that a testing plan was published in Wales on 7 April 2020. The Inquiry understands that the Welsh Government published the document "Test, Trace, Protect"
_	you've just alluded to a moment ago, if I can perhaps give a summary of the situation and you can tell me whether I've got it right. There was an announcement made by Mr Gething on 21 March that the Welsh Government would have access to 6,000 Covid tests a day by 1 April. That appears to have been based on an agreement that the Welsh Government believed it had or at least was negotiating with the Swiss pharmaceutical company Roche, however Roche ended up supplying tests to the UK Government for use in England, and then, after agreement, with the devolved administrations. Is that more or less an accurate summary? I think that agreement would have been with Public Health Wales and Roche rather than the Welsh Government, was my understanding. And I don't think that was a written agreement, I think it was a verbal agreement. We have a look, please, at page yes, page 2, paragraph 4 of let me just check. If we can have actually, please, INQ000309905 displayed. This is an email from Tracey Cooper to you	3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	LAI A. LAI A. MR	 and the [Document read] will be met." Would it be fair to say that there was little trust that UK-wide testing initiatives could be relied upon at this stage? I think there was a great deal of uncertainty at that stage. DY HALLETT: I think it's right to say for those that haven't followed this that this incident involving Roche and the number of tests has been highly controversial as to whose memory is accurate. Yeah, absolutely. DY HALLETT: Is that fair? But I think Tracey's emails are fairly you know, are accurate at the time, they were captured with the knowledge at the time. POOLE: Was there a concern that you would be competing with the UK Government in the supply of testing materials? Yes. Now, we know that a testing plan was published in Wales on 7 April 2020. The Inquiry understands that the Welsh

(30) Pages 117 - 120

1		surveillance in the community on 13 May, so that	1		Ther
2		strategy was published four months after the global	2		"Sus
3		emergency was evident. Why did it take four months for	3		right of a
4		that testing strategy to be developed?	4		Is it i
5	Α.	So the first test plan wasn't published but it was	5		measure
6		finalised and agreed by the then Minister for Health and	6		try to elin
7		Social Services on 27 March, so four days later than we	7		as to ma
8		brought the group together, and the principal	8		available
9		objectives they've had six work packages, with the	9	Α.	That wou
10		first one being to scale tests. That plan was then	10		writing th
11		shared with devolved governments and UK Government.	11		addresse
12	Q.	Dr Orford, change of topic. I'd like to ask you some	12		here.
13		questions about discharging patients from hospital to	13	Q.	Do you a
14		care homes next and also the related question of testing	14		vulnerab
15		as well.	15		presents
16		On 13 March 2020 the minister for health and	16	Α.	Oh, I thin
17		social care made a public statement announcing	17		around h
18		a framework of actions aimed at allowing health and	18	Q.	If we cou
19		social care providers to make decisions to assist with	19		is an em
20		the timely preparation for the expected number of	20		Dr Jones
21		confirmed cases, and we can see that on the screen	21		If we
22		there.	22		already,
23		At point 4 of that announcement we can see it said:	23		of the pa
24		"Expedite discharge of vulnerable patients from	24		"I wo
25		acute and community hospitals."	25		the next.
		121			
1		Did you or TAG or TAC advise on this?	1		the testin
2	Α.	No.	2		care hom
3	Q.	On 9 April 2020 Public Health Wales issued guidance on	3	Α.	Again, I v
4		the admission and care of care home residents. The	4		I'm not si
5		advice was that negative tests were not required prior	5	Q.	The date
6		to transfer and admission into a residential setting.	6	Α.	No, I was
7		Again, did you or TAG or TAC advise on that?	7	Q.	Please c
8	Α.	No.	8		This
9	Q.	On 17 April 2020 there was a meeting of the closed	9		between
10		settings group which was a Public Health Wales group as	10		Health W
11		I understand it, albeit, I think I'm right in saying, it	11		page 6.
12		had some overlap with TAG and TAC membership; is that	12		you expla
13		right?	13		has com
14	Α.	It's possible that members of that group I'm not sure	14		to Wales
15		who was on the group, so it's difficult for me to answer	15		If we
16		but, you know, we're a relatively small organisation, so	16		chain, the
17		there may have been some overlap.	17		l think it's
18	Q.	If we could, please, have INQ000336421, thank you.	18		line in
19		This is an email sent following the meeting of that	19		"In tł
20		closed settings group on 17 April. Page 2 of the email	20		[Docume
21		chain, at "Action 3" reads:	21		useful."
22		"[Welsh Government] Policy officials verbally	22		So D
23		outlined a clear [Document read] communication.	23		might ha
24		Lead WG policy officials."	24		a particu
25		Did you agree with the change of policy regarding	25	Α.	Yeah.
		123			

-	-	
1		Then at point 7:
2		"Suspending the current protocol which gives the
2		right of a choice of home."
4		Is it right to understand the purpose of these
5		measures was to ensure timely discharges and basically
6		try to eliminate delays related to care home choice so
7		as to maximise the number of hospital beds that were
8		available in the event of a surge in hospital demand?
9	Α.	That would make absolute sense. I'd no involvement in
9 10	А.	writing these policies, so those questions might be best
11		addressed to those involved in the policy decisions
12		here.
12	Q.	Do you agree though that expediting the discharge of
14	ω.	vulnerable patients from hospital into care homes
14		presents a clear risk that obviously had to be managed?
16	Α.	Oh, I think there were, you know, significant risks
17	А.	around hospitals and care homes throughout the pandemic.
18	Q.	If we could, please, have INQ000336353 on screen, which
19	ω.	is an email exchange on 31 March between the Deputy CMO,
20		Dr Jones, and various HSSG officials.
20		If we can, please, go to page 3 we're there
21		already, thank you Dr Jones replies, right at the top
22		of the page:
23 24		"I would think [Document read] be positive
24 25		the next."
25		122
1		the testing of patients discharged from hospitals to
2		care homes?
3	Α.	Again, I wasn't involved in these policy discussions,
4		I'm not sure I was included. What was the date, sorry?
5	Q.	The date of this is 17 April.
6	Α.	No, I was no longer involved in testing at that point.
7	Q.	Please can we have INQ000228309 displayed, please.
8		This is an email thread from 31 March and 1 April
9		between you, Dr Thomas Connor, Chris Williams, Public
10		Health Wales, and other members of TAC. We can go to
11		page 6. We can see that the conversation begins with
12		you explaining that the issue of nosocomial transmission
13		has come up at SAGE and that it had come up in relation
14		to Wales due to the Aneurin Bevan outbreak.
15		If we can, please, go up to page 3 of this email
16		chain, there's an email from Dr Connor. He writes,
17		I think it's the fourth paragraph, second line second
18		line in thank you. So, second line:
19		"In this case we have a cluster of 50-70
20		[Document read] such testing has to be rapid to be
~ 1		

So Dr Connor's there saying that weekly testing

- ght have missed all of the transmission of
- articular outbreak, isn't he?
- ah.

124

1	Q.	Then if we can go right up to the top of the chain,	1		re
2		page 1, you state, first paragraph:	2		ir
3		"As Tom suggests a sequential approach to testing	3		s
4		[Document read] if sounds like a sensible	4	Α.	S
5		approach?"	5		S
6		I just want to take you on the same theme just to	6		е
7		a document that you emailed two hours later or,	7		W
8		sorry, Chris Williams emailed you this document	8		
9		two hours later. It's the CDC, Centers for Disease	9		S
10		Control, prevention study.	10		ir
11		I'm grateful, we've got it on the screen there.	11		V
12		That study looked at asymptomatic and presymptomatic	12		1
13		Covid-19 infections in residents of a long-term care	13		n
14		nursing facility.	14		1
15		We could have a look, please, at page 2 of that	15		S
16		study, looking at the top left-hand box:	16		S
17		"What is already known? Once Covid is introduced in	17		8
18		[Document read] contribute to SARS-Cov-2	18		S
19		transmission."	19		b
20		Now, this is the report that Mr Hancock in his	20		
21		evidence to Module 2 described as a game-changer in	21		С
22		terms of the scientific evidence underpinning testing	22		a
23		policy advice in the UK.	23		h
24		This was emailed to you. Did you view this study in	24		р
25		the same way as Mr Hancock, namely a game-changer as 125	25		e
1		was more about how you establish that sentinel	1	Α.	Y
2		surveillance system within staff groups rather than	2		tł
3		asymptomatic or presymptomatic testing per se. But	3		b
4		there were plenty of papers that came through NERVTAG	4	Q.	Α
5		around asymptomatic and presymptomatic people and	5		W
6		testing.	6		а
7	Q.	Now, on 16 April England introduced mandatory testing of	7		W
8		all patients prior to discharge to a care home, and as	8		r
9		we know that policy was not introduced in Wales until	9	Α.	Y
10		a couple of weeks later. I just want to show you if	10		С
11		I can the ministerial advice that was submitted to	11		la
12		Mr Gething on 30 April.	12		а
13		If we could have a look at page 2 of the ministerial	13		s
14		advice, it's the fifth paragraph and the second bullet	14		C
15		point, right down at the bottom:	15	Q.	V
16		"We also intend to increase testing within care	16		р
17		homes [Document read] capacity becomes	17		tł
18		available."	18		
19		Then page 4, please, paragraph 16, impact of	19		
20		asymptomatic care home residents:	20		C
21		"Whilst it is unclear what [Document read]	21		
22		half of residents with Covid-19."	22		tł
23		Were you aware that that study had been discussed in	23		h
24		the Public Health England meeting on 20 April and,	24		I
25		later, a NERVTAG meeting on 24 April? 127	25		

1		regards asymptomatic transmission and the need to
2		introduce routine testing, especially in environments
3 4	•	such as care homes?
4 5	Α.	So, you know, tend not to have game changing papers in
6		science, it tends to be the accumulation of pieces of
7		evidence to then form a consensus, and then you can say whether you're confident in that consensus or not.
8		Just on the practicalities, if I can go back ever so
8 9		slightly, I think probably around that time there were
9 10		in the region of a thousand tests a day available in
11		Wales within hospitals generally. There are
12		105,000 staff in the NHS in Wales. 36,000 of those are
13		nurses and 9.000 of those are doctors and dentists, and
14		15.000 are allied health professionals and healthcare
15		scientist, who I'm responsible for. There are 23
16		sorry, there are 10,000 beds within the NHS. There are
17		80,000 social care workers and 23,000 residential beds.
18		So that's excluding other key workers. So there would
19		be a huge demand for tests to test everyone.
20		So the conversation with Chris Williams and
21		colleagues was more about how you can create a web that
22		acted as a kind of surveillance system, where you didn't
23		have to seek test everybody once a week, so you could
24		pick up where outbreaks were and manage them
25		effectively. So I think Chris's sharing of this paper
		126
1	А.	Yeah, I think that was the "Easter six", it was called
1 2	A.	Yeah, I think that was the "Easter six", it was called the Easter six care home outbreak analysis that was
	A.	
2	A. Q.	the Easter six care home outbreak analysis that was
2 3		the Easter six care home outbreak analysis that was brought from NERVTAG to SAGE a couple of days later.
2 3 4		the Easter six care home outbreak analysis that was brought from NERVTAG to SAGE a couple of days later. And the preliminary results were that 75% of residents
2 3 4 5		the Easter six care home outbreak analysis that was brought from NERVTAG to SAGE a couple of days later. And the preliminary results were that 75% of residents were positive for Covid but only 25% were symptomatic,
2 3 4 5 6		the Easter six care home outbreak analysis that was brought from NERVTAG to SAGE a couple of days later. And the preliminary results were that 75% of residents were positive for Covid but only 25% were symptomatic, and 50% of staff were positive but only 29% of those
2 3 4 5 6 7		the Easter six care home outbreak analysis that was brought from NERVTAG to SAGE a couple of days later. And the preliminary results were that 75% of residents were positive for Covid but only 25% were symptomatic, and 50% of staff were positive but only 29% of those were symptomatic. You were aware of those preliminary
2 3 4 5 6 7 8	Q.	the Easter six care home outbreak analysis that was brought from NERVTAG to SAGE a couple of days later. And the preliminary results were that 75% of residents were positive for Covid but only 25% were symptomatic, and 50% of staff were positive but only 29% of those were symptomatic. You were aware of those preliminary results?
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	Q.	the Easter six care home outbreak analysis that was brought from NERVTAG to SAGE a couple of days later. And the preliminary results were that 75% of residents were positive for Covid but only 25% were symptomatic, and 50% of staff were positive but only 29% of those were symptomatic. You were aware of those preliminary results? Yeah, and again the conversation around whether somebody
2 4 5 6 7 8 9	Q.	the Easter six care home outbreak analysis that was brought from NERVTAG to SAGE a couple of days later. And the preliminary results were that 75% of residents were positive for Covid but only 25% were symptomatic, and 50% of staff were positive but only 29% of those were symptomatic. You were aware of those preliminary results? Yeah, and again the conversation around whether somebody could be asymptomatic and transmit hadn't quite been
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11	Q.	the Easter six care home outbreak analysis that was brought from NERVTAG to SAGE a couple of days later. And the preliminary results were that 75% of residents were positive for Covid but only 25% were symptomatic, and 50% of staff were positive but only 29% of those were symptomatic. You were aware of those preliminary results? Yeah, and again the conversation around whether somebody could be asymptomatic and transmit hadn't quite been landed. I think probably WHO advice was still the same
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12	Q.	the Easter six care home outbreak analysis that was brought from NERVTAG to SAGE a couple of days later. And the preliminary results were that 75% of residents were positive for Covid but only 25% were symptomatic, and 50% of staff were positive but only 29% of those were symptomatic. You were aware of those preliminary results? Yeah, and again the conversation around whether somebody could be asymptomatic and transmit hadn't quite been landed. I think probably WHO advice was still the same around symptomatic individuals and a case definition was
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	Q.	the Easter six care home outbreak analysis that was brought from NERVTAG to SAGE a couple of days later. And the preliminary results were that 75% of residents were positive for Covid but only 25% were symptomatic, and 50% of staff were positive but only 29% of those were symptomatic. You were aware of those preliminary results? Yeah, and again the conversation around whether somebody could be asymptomatic and transmit hadn't quite been landed. I think probably WHO advice was still the same around symptomatic individuals and a case definition was still around people with the cardinal symptoms of Covid-19. We can back to this ministerial advice, if I can,
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	Q. A.	the Easter six care home outbreak analysis that was brought from NERVTAG to SAGE a couple of days later. And the preliminary results were that 75% of residents were positive for Covid but only 25% were symptomatic, and 50% of staff were positive but only 29% of those were symptomatic. You were aware of those preliminary results? Yeah, and again the conversation around whether somebody could be asymptomatic and transmit hadn't quite been landed. I think probably WHO advice was still the same around symptomatic individuals and a case definition was still around people with the cardinal symptoms of Covid-19. We can back to this ministerial advice, if I can, please, ask for page 5, paragraph 19 to be pulled up,
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	Q. A.	the Easter six care home outbreak analysis that was brought from NERVTAG to SAGE a couple of days later. And the preliminary results were that 75% of residents were positive for Covid but only 25% were symptomatic, and 50% of staff were positive but only 29% of those were symptomatic. You were aware of those preliminary results? Yeah, and again the conversation around whether somebody could be asymptomatic and transmit hadn't quite been landed. I think probably WHO advice was still the same around symptomatic individuals and a case definition was still around people with the cardinal symptoms of Covid-19. We can back to this ministerial advice, if I can, please, ask for page 5, paragraph 19 to be pulled up, thank you:
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	Q. A.	the Easter six care home outbreak analysis that was brought from NERVTAG to SAGE a couple of days later. And the preliminary results were that 75% of residents were positive for Covid but only 25% were symptomatic, and 50% of staff were positive but only 29% of those were symptomatic. You were aware of those preliminary results? Yeah, and again the conversation around whether somebody could be asymptomatic and transmit hadn't quite been landed. I think probably WHO advice was still the same around symptomatic individuals and a case definition was still around people with the cardinal symptoms of Covid-19. We can back to this ministerial advice, if I can, please, ask for page 5, paragraph 19 to be pulled up, thank you: "The current position in care homes was to isolate
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19	Q. A.	the Easter six care home outbreak analysis that was brought from NERVTAG to SAGE a couple of days later. And the preliminary results were that 75% of residents were positive for Covid but only 25% were symptomatic, and 50% of staff were positive but only 29% of those were symptomatic. You were aware of those preliminary results? Yeah, and again the conversation around whether somebody could be asymptomatic and transmit hadn't quite been landed. I think probably WHO advice was still the same around symptomatic individuals and a case definition was still around people with the cardinal symptoms of Covid-19. We can back to this ministerial advice, if I can, please, ask for page 5, paragraph 19 to be pulled up, thank you: "The current position in care homes was to isolate [Document read] everyone was positive for
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	Q. A.	the Easter six care home outbreak analysis that was brought from NERVTAG to SAGE a couple of days later. And the preliminary results were that 75% of residents were positive for Covid but only 25% were symptomatic, and 50% of staff were positive but only 29% of those were symptomatic. You were aware of those preliminary results? Yeah, and again the conversation around whether somebody could be asymptomatic and transmit hadn't quite been landed. I think probably WHO advice was still the same around symptomatic individuals and a case definition was still around people with the cardinal symptoms of Covid-19. We can back to this ministerial advice, if I can, please, ask for page 5, paragraph 19 to be pulled up, thank you: "The current position in care homes was to isolate [Document read] everyone was positive for Covid."
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	Q. A.	the Easter six care home outbreak analysis that was brought from NERVTAG to SAGE a couple of days later. And the preliminary results were that 75% of residents were positive for Covid but only 25% were symptomatic, and 50% of staff were positive but only 29% of those were symptomatic. You were aware of those preliminary results? Yeah, and again the conversation around whether somebody could be asymptomatic and transmit hadn't quite been landed. I think probably WHO advice was still the same around symptomatic individuals and a case definition was still around people with the cardinal symptoms of Covid-19. We can back to this ministerial advice, if I can, please, ask for page 5, paragraph 19 to be pulled up, thank you: "The current position in care homes was to isolate [Document read] everyone was positive for Covid." Then the ministerial advice expresses concerns about
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	Q. A.	the Easter six care home outbreak analysis that was brought from NERVTAG to SAGE a couple of days later. And the preliminary results were that 75% of residents were positive for Covid but only 25% were symptomatic, and 50% of staff were positive but only 29% of those were symptomatic. You were aware of those preliminary results? Yeah, and again the conversation around whether somebody could be asymptomatic and transmit hadn't quite been landed. I think probably WHO advice was still the same around symptomatic individuals and a case definition was still around people with the cardinal symptoms of Covid-19. We can back to this ministerial advice, if I can, please, ask for page 5, paragraph 19 to be pulled up, thank you: "The current position in care homes was to isolate [Document read] everyone was positive for Covid." Then the ministerial advice expresses concerns about the number of tests that would be required to test care
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	Q. A.	the Easter six care home outbreak analysis that was brought from NERVTAG to SAGE a couple of days later. And the preliminary results were that 75% of residents were positive for Covid but only 25% were symptomatic, and 50% of staff were positive but only 29% of those were symptomatic. You were aware of those preliminary results? Yeah, and again the conversation around whether somebody could be asymptomatic and transmit hadn't quite been landed. I think probably WHO advice was still the same around symptomatic individuals and a case definition was still around people with the cardinal symptoms of Covid-19. We can back to this ministerial advice, if I can, please, ask for page 5, paragraph 19 to be pulled up, thank you: "The current position in care homes was to isolate [Document read] everyone was positive for Covid." Then the ministerial advice expresses concerns about the number of tests that would be required to test care home residents and staff on a routine basis, which is
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	Q. A.	the Easter six care home outbreak analysis that was brought from NERVTAG to SAGE a couple of days later. And the preliminary results were that 75% of residents were positive for Covid but only 25% were symptomatic, and 50% of staff were positive but only 29% of those were symptomatic. You were aware of those preliminary results? Yeah, and again the conversation around whether somebody could be asymptomatic and transmit hadn't quite been landed. I think probably WHO advice was still the same around symptomatic individuals and a case definition was still around people with the cardinal symptoms of Covid-19. We can back to this ministerial advice, if I can, please, ask for page 5, paragraph 19 to be pulled up, thank you: "The current position in care homes was to isolate [Document read] everyone was positive for Covid." Then the ministerial advice expresses concerns about the number of tests that would be required to test care

128

(32) Pages 125 - 128

obviously constrained by capability -- capacity? Is it 1 2 your view that had capacity been increased, there would 3 have been a sound evidential basis for regular testing 4 of asymptomatic care home staff and residents? In other 5 words, would the policy have been adopted sooner if 6 capacity was greater? 7 A. So hypothetically would we start at the position we 8 ended at? I mean, logically, I would say yes. However, 9 there was much more testing in the UK than there were in 10 other countries. So, I mean, the logistics at the time, not just the scale of the need, was actually to bring 11 12 testing to care homes themselves where we couldn't 13 reasonably expect care home residents to go to testing, 14 as well as knowing who lived in care homes and who 15 worked in care homes. There was quite a demand, 16 a logistical demand and a digital demand, on colleagues 17 to operationalise the policies that came thick and fast. 18 So it was a real challenge for colleagues. 19 Q. Dr Orford, was the change in policy on care home testing 20 driven by what was happening in England rather than the 21 scientific advice provided in Wales in your view? 22 A. That's a very good question and I think probably best 23 aimed at colleagues who were leading on testing at this 24 time, which, you know, again was a significant 25 operational challenge with many people needing to work 129 1 groups. 2 Q. On 18 September TAC advised that more needed to be done 3 to bring the R rate back down below 1. We can see the 4 summary advice of 18 September on the screen. If we 5 have a look at page 2, the fourth bullet point, please, 6 it says: 7 "A package of non-pharmaceutical interventions 8 (NPIs) on local and national scale may be needed to 9 bring ... [Document read] ... length of time for which 10 they are required." 11 So TAC there advising action would be most effective 12 if implemented early; correct? 13 Α. Correct. 14 Q. Circuit-breaker or firebreak, so in other words, as we 15 all know, a short period of lockdown, that was 16 recommended by SAGE on 21 September. I don't think you 17 attended, but Fliss Bennee attend on behalf of TAC. We 18 can see those minutes there. 19 If we could have a look at page 2.2, please: 20 "SAGE advice was that a package of interventions 21 would need to be adopted to ... [Document read] ... to low levels." 22 23 If we can have a look, please, at point 6 on that 24 page:

"The more rapidly interventions are ... [Document 131

25

) Inquiry	/	4 March 2024
1		together at a national level to get things right.
2		And again, you know, comparing England and Wales is
3		difficult because there's greater capacity and
4		capability in England as it's 20 size times bigger,
5		but I honestly don't know the details around any
6		differences in that policy and the timings of the
7		policies therein.
8	Q.	We move into August. That saw the start of the Eat Out
9		to Help Out scheme, and we know that's a scheme
10		implemented by the UK Government. Were you asked to
11		advise on that initiative?
12	Α.	No.
13	Q.	I want to ask you some questions next about firebreak.
14		Before, I would just like to ask you a question about
15		data, if I may.
16		On 18 September 2020, the ONS released data that
17		demonstrated that 68% of deaths from Covid-19 between
18		2 March and 14 July 2020 were among disabled people.
19		Following the release of those statistics, was any
20		research carried out in Wales as to why that mortality
21		figure was so high?
22	Α.	We wrote several papers on mortality statistics, working
23		closely with colleagues in Knowledge and Analytical
24		Services, as well as papers on health inequalities of
25		the absolute and relative impact on different population
		130
1		read] geographical area."
2		Presumably, as Fliss Bennee attend on the behalf of
3		TAC, you were made aware of that SAGE advice?
4	Α.	Absolutely. I may well have been at SAGE, that meeting,
5		but it's not recorded.
6	Q.	Four days later, so this is 25 September, the need for
7		early intervention was reiterated by TAC. I don't need
8		to go to the advice, I'll just read a summary:
9		"If the current measures do not bring R below 1 then
10		further restrictions will be needed to control the
11		epidemic in [Document read] the more effective

- i ... [Document read] ... the more effective 12 they will be." 13 Then on 2 October there was a rather more stark 14 warning from TAC. We see the advice there, if we can 15 have a look at page 2, please, fifth bullet point: 16 "Unless measures bring R below 1 ... [Document read] 17 ... scenario planning levels." 18 So, in other words, the NHS would become 19 overwhelmed; correct? 20 Α. Yeah. 21 Are you aware at this stage of any planning undertaken Q. 22 for further restrictions to be implemented? 23 A. I mean, I can't remember the interactions with the Covid
- policy colleagues at that time regarding -- sorry,
- 25 I can't remember the conversations that were going on at 132

1		that time.	1
2	Q.	If we have a look at 9 October, please, this is another	2
3		TAC summary advice we can see at INQ000066397 thank	3
4		you very much.	4
5		If we have a look at page 2, "Current situation in	5
6		Wales", in the middle of the page:	6
7		"For the first time in this [Document read]	7
8 9		test positivity. "We are continuing to monitor how the [Document	8 9
9 10		read] planning scenarios."	9 10
11		Notwithstanding the clear direction from SAGE that	10
12		we saw in the minutes a bit earlier, the obviously	12
13		deteriorating picture, why at this stage wasn't TAC	13
14		clearly recommending the need for a firebreak?	10
15	Α.	So can I go back to the last question, please? Is that	15
16		okay?	16
17	Q.	Of course.	17
18	Α.	At the time there were local interventions, so	18
19		understandably there were challenges around national	19
20		interventions and concerns and there was a great deal of	20
21		interest around hyperlocal interventions and local	21
22		interventions to reduce harm, reduce economic harm, and	22
23		not to put areas that had lower incidence into protected	23
24		measures at that time.	24
25		So, you know, I can't remember which local	25
		133	
1		authorities. So I think in hindsight, you know, perhaps	1
1 2		authorities. So I think in hindsight, you know, perhaps they weren't the best idea.	1 2
1 2 3	Q.	they weren't the best idea.	
2	Q.	they weren't the best idea.	2
2 3	Q.	they weren't the best idea. Whilst I appreciate there may have been different policy	2 3
2 3 4	Q.	they weren't the best idea. Whilst I appreciate there may have been different policy initiatives being pursued, so we have local lockdowns at	2 3 4
2 3 4 5	Q.	they weren't the best idea. Whilst I appreciate there may have been different policy initiatives being pursued, so we have local lockdowns at this time going on, but looking at what we've looked at	2 3 4 5
2 3 4 5 6	Q.	they weren't the best idea. Whilst I appreciate there may have been different policy initiatives being pursued, so we have local lockdowns at this time going on, but looking at what we've looked at so the SAGE minutes, the TAC advice that's getting more	2 3 4 5 6
2 3 4 5 6 7	Q.	they weren't the best idea. Whilst I appreciate there may have been different policy initiatives being pursued, so we have local lockdowns at this time going on, but looking at what we've looked at so the SAGE minutes, the TAC advice that's getting more and more stark, culminating in this advice of 9 October,	2 3 4 5 6 7
2 3 4 5 6 7 8	Q.	they weren't the best idea. Whilst I appreciate there may have been different policy initiatives being pursued, so we have local lockdowns at this time going on, but looking at what we've looked at so the SAGE minutes, the TAC advice that's getting more and more stark, culminating in this advice of 9 October, so, going back to my question, why wasn't TAC	2 3 4 5 6 7 8
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	Q.	they weren't the best idea. Whilst I appreciate there may have been different policy initiatives being pursued, so we have local lockdowns at this time going on, but looking at what we've looked at so the SAGE minutes, the TAC advice that's getting more and more stark, culminating in this advice of 9 October, so, going back to my question, why wasn't TAC recommending clearly at this stage the need for	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12	Q.	they weren't the best idea. Whilst I appreciate there may have been different policy initiatives being pursued, so we have local lockdowns at this time going on, but looking at what we've looked at so the SAGE minutes, the TAC advice that's getting more and more stark, culminating in this advice of 9 October, so, going back to my question, why wasn't TAC recommending clearly at this stage the need for a firebreak lockdown or a short lockdown across the whole of Wales? I think they had, through this period, you know, the	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11		they weren't the best idea. Whilst I appreciate there may have been different policy initiatives being pursued, so we have local lockdowns at this time going on, but looking at what we've looked at so the SAGE minutes, the TAC advice that's getting more and more stark, culminating in this advice of 9 October, so, going back to my question, why wasn't TAC recommending clearly at this stage the need for a firebreak lockdown or a short lockdown across the whole of Wales? I think they had, through this period, you know, the preceding documents had said we need a national	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 13		they weren't the best idea. Whilst I appreciate there may have been different policy initiatives being pursued, so we have local lockdowns at this time going on, but looking at what we've looked at so the SAGE minutes, the TAC advice that's getting more and more stark, culminating in this advice of 9 October, so, going back to my question, why wasn't TAC recommending clearly at this stage the need for a firebreak lockdown or a short lockdown across the whole of Wales? I think they had, through this period, you know, the preceding documents had said we need a national intervention and a SAGE document said the same thing and	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15		they weren't the best idea. Whilst I appreciate there may have been different policy initiatives being pursued, so we have local lockdowns at this time going on, but looking at what we've looked at so the SAGE minutes, the TAC advice that's getting more and more stark, culminating in this advice of 9 October, so, going back to my question, why wasn't TAC recommending clearly at this stage the need for a firebreak lockdown or a short lockdown across the whole of Wales? I think they had, through this period, you know, the preceding documents had said we need a national intervention and a SAGE document said the same thing and I think broadly throughout the pandemic Wales followed	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	A.	they weren't the best idea. Whilst I appreciate there may have been different policy initiatives being pursued, so we have local lockdowns at this time going on, but looking at what we've looked at so the SAGE minutes, the TAC advice that's getting more and more stark, culminating in this advice of 9 October, so, going back to my question, why wasn't TAC recommending clearly at this stage the need for a firebreak lockdown or a short lockdown across the whole of Wales? I think they had, through this period, you know, the preceding documents had said we need a national intervention and a SAGE document said the same thing and I think broadly throughout the pandemic Wales followed SAGE advice.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17		they weren't the best idea. Whilst I appreciate there may have been different policy initiatives being pursued, so we have local lockdowns at this time going on, but looking at what we've looked at so the SAGE minutes, the TAC advice that's getting more and more stark, culminating in this advice of 9 October, so, going back to my question, why wasn't TAC recommending clearly at this stage the need for a firebreak lockdown or a short lockdown across the whole of Wales? I think they had, through this period, you know, the preceding documents had said we need a national intervention and a SAGE document said the same thing and I think broadly throughout the pandemic Wales followed SAGE advice. Can we, please, have INQ000385719 displayed.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	A.	they weren't the best idea. Whilst I appreciate there may have been different policy initiatives being pursued, so we have local lockdowns at this time going on, but looking at what we've looked at so the SAGE minutes, the TAC advice that's getting more and more stark, culminating in this advice of 9 October, so, going back to my question, why wasn't TAC recommending clearly at this stage the need for a firebreak lockdown or a short lockdown across the whole of Wales? I think they had, through this period, you know, the preceding documents had said we need a national intervention and a SAGE document said the same thing and I think broadly throughout the pandemic Wales followed SAGE advice. Can we, please, have INQ000385719 displayed. Which is an email sent to you by someone at Public	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19	A.	they weren't the best idea. Whilst I appreciate there may have been different policy initiatives being pursued, so we have local lockdowns at this time going on, but looking at what we've looked at so the SAGE minutes, the TAC advice that's getting more and more stark, culminating in this advice of 9 October, so, going back to my question, why wasn't TAC recommending clearly at this stage the need for a firebreak lockdown or a short lockdown across the whole of Wales? I think they had, through this period, you know, the preceding documents had said we need a national intervention and a SAGE document said the same thing and I think broadly throughout the pandemic Wales followed SAGE advice. Can we, please, have INQ000385719 displayed. Which is an email sent to you by someone at Public Health Wales on 11 October. So this is shortly ahead of	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	A.	they weren't the best idea. Whilst I appreciate there may have been different policy initiatives being pursued, so we have local lockdowns at this time going on, but looking at what we've looked at so the SAGE minutes, the TAC advice that's getting more and more stark, culminating in this advice of 9 October, so, going back to my question, why wasn't TAC recommending clearly at this stage the need for a firebreak lockdown or a short lockdown across the whole of Wales? I think they had, through this period, you know, the preceding documents had said we need a national intervention and a SAGE document said the same thing and I think broadly throughout the pandemic Wales followed SAGE advice. Can we, please, have INQ000385719 displayed. Which is an email sent to you by someone at Public Health Wales on 11 October. So this is shortly ahead of a scheduled meeting to discuss Welsh strategy and	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	A.	they weren't the best idea. Whilst I appreciate there may have been different policy initiatives being pursued, so we have local lockdowns at this time going on, but looking at what we've looked at so the SAGE minutes, the TAC advice that's getting more and more stark, culminating in this advice of 9 October, so, going back to my question, why wasn't TAC recommending clearly at this stage the need for a firebreak lockdown or a short lockdown across the whole of Wales? I think they had, through this period, you know, the preceding documents had said we need a national intervention and a SAGE document said the same thing and I think broadly throughout the pandemic Wales followed SAGE advice. Can we, please, have INQ000385719 displayed. Which is an email sent to you by someone at Public Health Wales on 11 October. So this is shortly ahead of a scheduled meeting to discuss Welsh strategy and a potential firebreak. The email highlights key areas	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	A.	they weren't the best idea. Whilst I appreciate there may have been different policy initiatives being pursued, so we have local lockdowns at this time going on, but looking at what we've looked at so the SAGE minutes, the TAC advice that's getting more and more stark, culminating in this advice of 9 October, so, going back to my question, why wasn't TAC recommending clearly at this stage the need for a firebreak lockdown or a short lockdown across the whole of Wales? I think they had, through this period, you know, the preceding documents had said we need a national intervention and a SAGE document said the same thing and I think broadly throughout the pandemic Wales followed SAGE advice. Can we, please, have INQ000385719 displayed. Which is an email sent to you by someone at Public Health Wales on 11 October. So this is shortly ahead of a scheduled meeting to discuss Welsh strategy and a potential firebreak. The email highlights key areas for discussion at this meeting.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	A.	they weren't the best idea. Whilst I appreciate there may have been different policy initiatives being pursued, so we have local lockdowns at this time going on, but looking at what we've looked at so the SAGE minutes, the TAC advice that's getting more and more stark, culminating in this advice of 9 October, so, going back to my question, why wasn't TAC recommending clearly at this stage the need for a firebreak lockdown or a short lockdown across the whole of Wales? I think they had, through this period, you know, the preceding documents had said we need a national intervention and a SAGE document said the same thing and I think broadly throughout the pandemic Wales followed SAGE advice. Can we, please, have INQ000385719 displayed. Which is an email sent to you by someone at Public Health Wales on 11 October. So this is shortly ahead of a scheduled meeting to discuss Welsh strategy and a potential firebreak. The email highlights key areas for discussion at this meeting. Do you agree that there remained just looking at	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	A.	they weren't the best idea. Whilst I appreciate there may have been different policy initiatives being pursued, so we have local lockdowns at this time going on, but looking at what we've looked at so the SAGE minutes, the TAC advice that's getting more and more stark, culminating in this advice of 9 October, so, going back to my question, why wasn't TAC recommending clearly at this stage the need for a firebreak lockdown or a short lockdown across the whole of Wales? I think they had, through this period, you know, the preceding documents had said we need a national intervention and a SAGE document said the same thing and I think broadly throughout the pandemic Wales followed SAGE advice. Can we, please, have INQ000385719 displayed. Which is an email sent to you by someone at Public Health Wales on 11 October. So this is shortly ahead of a scheduled meeting to discuss Welsh strategy and a potential firebreak. The email highlights key areas for discussion at this meeting.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22

authorities were in what state during that period, but there was a lot of policy activity around intervening and monitoring and measuring, but still the epidemic was growing in Wales. Reference to local interventions, we know that in sort of late September early October there were effectively local lockdowns within Wales within some of
the councils there?
Yes.
Is that what you're referring to by local
I am, yeah. And there was work done that was led by
Fliss Bennee in Wales looking at the impact of those
local interventions to see whether or not they were
having the desired effect. So, you know, to be able to
change policy, realistically you need to bring evidence
to show whether or not things are working.
The First Minister in his written evidence to this
module has described those local interventions as his
words were a "failed experiment"; do you agree with

that?

A. I'm not sure where the origin of the idea around local interventions came from, whether that was UK Government

- or Welsh Government, but certainly I felt it made things
- more complicated, that you had to have more legislation,
- more policies in place, across different local 134

1		remained a lack of clarity in respect of what the
2		strategy for Wales should be at this point in time and
3		who was responsible for identifying that strategy?
4	Α.	Yeah, I think this email's from Giri Shankar, who was
5		a member he's director of health protection in Public
6		Health Wales and, you know, a really excellent member of
7		the Technical Advisory Group. Not being able to
8		remember word for word the policies, but certainly lots
9		of conversation around balancing harm, that every
10		intervention had associated harms and benefits, so
11		whether that was relieving pressure on the NHS but that
12		would incur economic harm and other associated indirect
13		harms. So I think it would have been very difficult for
14		a minister to stand up and say "These are the absolute
15		levels of harms that we're willing to tolerate or that
16		we're working to", so I think it was very difficult to
17		be clear on what balanced harms look like.
18	Q.	Can I ask you to have a look, please, at an email of
19		15 October that you sent to the First Minister,
20		Mr Gething and Dr Atherton as well as some others.
21		Yes, thank you, that's the email on the display.
22		You effectively provide a summary of the
23		epidemiological modelling work that had been undertaken
24		to analyse the effect of a firebreak, and in that second
25		paragraph there we can see you say: 136

1		"There are some key conclusions that we would like	1
2		to share [Document read] message is the need to	2
3		find ways to sustainably lower R following any	3
4		firebreak."	4
5		So although your email comes with the caveat that	5
6		this is a work in progress, is the reason that you're	6
7		sharing this with the First Minister and the minister	7
8		for health and social care because the situation in your	8
9		view called for immediate action?	9
10	Α.	Yeah.	10
11	Q.	This is 15 October.	11
12		Absolutely.	12
13	Q.		13
14		Implementation Group was established on 14 October and	14
15		the purpose of that group was to consider advice	15
16		regarding a potential firebreak in Wales.	16
17		If we could have a look, please, at INQ000315913.	17
18		It's an email from you to Reg Kilpatrick on	18
19		18 October. The subject is "Covid Fire Break	19
20		[Implementation Group]". You open by saying that:	20
21		"The other side of the firebreak needs a look a lot	21
22		different to now re: testing and isolation."	22
23		And then point 5 you say:	23
24		"Would very much welcome sight of a [Document	24
25		read] been missing this." 137	25
1		this point in time?	1
2	Α.	No.	2
3	Q.	There was advice produced, further advice from TAG	3
4		produced on the firebreak measures on 18 October.	4
5		I don't want to go that to advice, other than to just	5
6		note that TAG recommended a two to three-week hard	6
7		firebreak to bring R below 1 in order to lessen the	7
8		impact and slow the growth of the epidemic in Wales, and	8
9		then a firebreak was announced on 19 October.	9
10		Given everything we've just looked at, the	10
11		increasing infection rates, the anticipated impact on	11
12		health services, do you think a firebreak should have	12
13		been implemented earlier than it was?	13
14	Α.	I think with the benefit of hindsight, yeah, earlier	14
15		would have been better. It would have got the	15
16		prevalence lower, but, you know, it did what it intended	16
17		to do and pushed the epidemic back.	17
18	Q.	Do you think the firebreak was of sufficient duration?	18
19	Α.	I think that's a question around in the modelling	19
20		there was some difference between two weeks and	20
21		three weeks, there were marginal gains of having three	21
		the state of the second st	

weeks, and four weeks was better than three weeks, so

that was from the modelling. But from the actuals, from

the observed information post-firebreak, it probably

worked as well as a three-week firebreak in that it 139

22

23

24

25

1		So do I take it from that that your view was that
2		economic considerations had not been factored into
3		decision-making regarding the firebreak up to this point
4		in time?
5	Α.	So can I just go back on the phasing of the firebreak?
6		Is that okay?
7		There was some advice around, and I think it came
8		from SAGE, around the timings of firebreaks, that if you
9		got them to coalesce with harm term or school holidays
10		then you'd lessen the educational impact, and so there
11		was some logic in phasing the Welsh firebreak around
12		autumn half term. And that was something that we'd
13		considered much earlier in the pandemic, around school
14		holiday phasing, but I think the way in which the
15		pandemic was progressing, in terms of its doubling time,
16		where small numbers become very large numbers very
17		swiftly, that phasing didn't obviously didn't work as
18		well as it could have.
19		The affordability of turning the economy off was
20		a separate set of conversations that I was aware of, but
21		being presented with the economic argument that those
22		figures weren't as easy to come by as perhaps
23		projections around direct harms.
24	Q.	From a public health perspective, did you consider that
25		there was any other option than to impose a firebreak at
		138
1		pushed the pandemic back probably 38 days in Wales and
2		then slowed the next period of growth for the next
3		couple of weeks.
4	Q.	
-		In your one of your witness statements your LAG and
5	-	In your one of your witness statements, your TAG and TAC witness statement, you describe the period leading
5 6		TAC witness statement, you describe the period leading
6		TAC witness statement, you describe the period leading up to and after the firebreak and the subsequent
6 7		TAC witness statement, you describe the period leading up to and after the firebreak and the subsequent lockdowns in England and Wales as a key moment where
6 7 8		TAC witness statement, you describe the period leading up to and after the firebreak and the subsequent lockdowns in England and Wales as a key moment where there was a significant difference between Wales and
6 7 8 9		TAC witness statement, you describe the period leading up to and after the firebreak and the subsequent lockdowns in England and Wales as a key moment where there was a significant difference between Wales and England. You then go on to say:
6 7 8 9 10		TAC witness statement, you describe the period leading up to and after the firebreak and the subsequent lockdowns in England and Wales as a key moment where there was a significant difference between Wales and England. You then go on to say: "England did not follow SAGE's advice to intervene
6 7 8 9 10 11		TAC witness statement, you describe the period leading up to and after the firebreak and the subsequent lockdowns in England and Wales as a key moment where there was a significant difference between Wales and England. You then go on to say: "England did not follow SAGE's advice to intervene early and also did not support Wales to do so
6 7 8 9 10		TAC witness statement, you describe the period leading up to and after the firebreak and the subsequent lockdowns in England and Wales as a key moment where there was a significant difference between Wales and England. You then go on to say: "England did not follow SAGE's advice to intervene early and also did not support Wales to do so financially. Given the subsequent number of infections,
6 7 9 10 11 12 13		TAC witness statement, you describe the period leading up to and after the firebreak and the subsequent lockdowns in England and Wales as a key moment where there was a significant difference between Wales and England. You then go on to say: "England did not follow SAGE's advice to intervene early and also did not support Wales to do so financially. Given the subsequent number of infections, hospitalisations and deaths in the autumn/winter of
6 7 9 10 11 12 13 14	-	TAC witness statement, you describe the period leading up to and after the firebreak and the subsequent lockdowns in England and Wales as a key moment where there was a significant difference between Wales and England. You then go on to say: "England did not follow SAGE's advice to intervene early and also did not support Wales to do so financially. Given the subsequent number of infections, hospitalisations and deaths in the autumn/winter of 2020/21 arising from the circulation of [different
6 7 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	-	TAC witness statement, you describe the period leading up to and after the firebreak and the subsequent lockdowns in England and Wales as a key moment where there was a significant difference between Wales and England. You then go on to say: "England did not follow SAGE's advice to intervene early and also did not support Wales to do so financially. Given the subsequent number of infections, hospitalisations and deaths in the autumn/winter of 2020/21 arising from the circulation of [different variants, including] Alpha variant the policies proved
6 7 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	-	TAC witness statement, you describe the period leading up to and after the firebreak and the subsequent lockdowns in England and Wales as a key moment where there was a significant difference between Wales and England. You then go on to say: "England did not follow SAGE's advice to intervene early and also did not support Wales to do so financially. Given the subsequent number of infections, hospitalisations and deaths in the autumn/winter of 2020/21 arising from the circulation of [different variants, including] Alpha variant the policies proved to accrue significant harm in Wales."
6 7 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	-	TAC witness statement, you describe the period leading up to and after the firebreak and the subsequent lockdowns in England and Wales as a key moment where there was a significant difference between Wales and England. You then go on to say: "England did not follow SAGE's advice to intervene early and also did not support Wales to do so financially. Given the subsequent number of infections, hospitalisations and deaths in the autumn/winter of 2020/21 arising from the circulation of [different variants, including] Alpha variant the policies proved
6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	Α.	TAC witness statement, you describe the period leading up to and after the firebreak and the subsequent lockdowns in England and Wales as a key moment where there was a significant difference between Wales and England. You then go on to say: "England did not follow SAGE's advice to intervene early and also did not support Wales to do so financially. Given the subsequent number of infections, hospitalisations and deaths in the autumn/winter of 2020/21 arising from the circulation of [different variants, including] Alpha variant the policies proved to accrue significant harm in Wales." Can you just explain how the different approach in England accrued significant harm in Wales?
6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18		TAC witness statement, you describe the period leading up to and after the firebreak and the subsequent lockdowns in England and Wales as a key moment where there was a significant difference between Wales and England. You then go on to say: "England did not follow SAGE's advice to intervene early and also did not support Wales to do so financially. Given the subsequent number of infections, hospitalisations and deaths in the autumn/winter of 2020/21 arising from the circulation of [different variants, including] Alpha variant the policies proved to accrue significant harm in Wales." Can you just explain how the different approach in
6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19		TAC witness statement, you describe the period leading up to and after the firebreak and the subsequent lockdowns in England and Wales as a key moment where there was a significant difference between Wales and England. You then go on to say: "England did not follow SAGE's advice to intervene early and also did not support Wales to do so financially. Given the subsequent number of infections, hospitalisations and deaths in the autumn/winter of 2020/21 arising from the circulation of [different variants, including] Alpha variant the policies proved to accrue significant harm in Wales." Can you just explain how the different approach in England accrued significant harm in Wales? Well, if money had been made available to extend the firebreak, I mean, that's what I've been led to believe,
6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20		TAC witness statement, you describe the period leading up to and after the firebreak and the subsequent lockdowns in England and Wales as a key moment where there was a significant difference between Wales and England. You then go on to say: "England did not follow SAGE's advice to intervene early and also did not support Wales to do so financially. Given the subsequent number of infections, hospitalisations and deaths in the autumn/winter of 2020/21 arising from the circulation of [different variants, including] Alpha variant the policies proved to accrue significant harm in Wales." Can you just explain how the different approach in England accrued significant harm in Wales? Well, if money had been made available to extend the firebreak, I mean, that's what I've been led to believe, then perhaps we could have had a three-week firebreak,
6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21		TAC witness statement, you describe the period leading up to and after the firebreak and the subsequent lockdowns in England and Wales as a key moment where there was a significant difference between Wales and England. You then go on to say: "England did not follow SAGE's advice to intervene early and also did not support Wales to do so financially. Given the subsequent number of infections, hospitalisations and deaths in the autumn/winter of 2020/21 arising from the circulation of [different variants, including] Alpha variant the policies proved to accrue significant harm in Wales." Can you just explain how the different approach in England accrued significant harm in Wales? Well, if money had been made available to extend the firebreak, I mean, that's what I've been led to believe, then perhaps we could have had a three-week firebreak, and certainly from the advice that we were given it was
6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22		TAC witness statement, you describe the period leading up to and after the firebreak and the subsequent lockdowns in England and Wales as a key moment where there was a significant difference between Wales and England. You then go on to say: "England did not follow SAGE's advice to intervene early and also did not support Wales to do so financially. Given the subsequent number of infections, hospitalisations and deaths in the autumn/winter of 2020/21 arising from the circulation of [different variants, including] Alpha variant the policies proved to accrue significant harm in Wales." Can you just explain how the different approach in England accrued significant harm in Wales? Well, if money had been made available to extend the firebreak, I mean, that's what I've been led to believe, then perhaps we could have had a three-week firebreak, and certainly from the advice that we were given it was better to be in lockstep across the UK with clearer
6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24		TAC witness statement, you describe the period leading up to and after the firebreak and the subsequent lockdowns in England and Wales as a key moment where there was a significant difference between Wales and England. You then go on to say: "England did not follow SAGE's advice to intervene early and also did not support Wales to do so financially. Given the subsequent number of infections, hospitalisations and deaths in the autumn/winter of 2020/21 arising from the circulation of [different variants, including] Alpha variant the policies proved to accrue significant harm in Wales." Can you just explain how the different approach in England accrued significant harm in Wales? Well, if money had been made available to extend the firebreak, I mean, that's what I've been led to believe, then perhaps we could have had a three-week firebreak, and certainly from the advice that we were given it was better to be in lockstep across the UK with clearer public health messaging, that probably would have been
6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23		TAC witness statement, you describe the period leading up to and after the firebreak and the subsequent lockdowns in England and Wales as a key moment where there was a significant difference between Wales and England. You then go on to say: "England did not follow SAGE's advice to intervene early and also did not support Wales to do so financially. Given the subsequent number of infections, hospitalisations and deaths in the autumn/winter of 2020/21 arising from the circulation of [different variants, including] Alpha variant the policies proved to accrue significant harm in Wales." Can you just explain how the different approach in England accrued significant harm in Wales? Well, if money had been made available to extend the firebreak, I mean, that's what I've been led to believe, then perhaps we could have had a three-week firebreak, and certainly from the advice that we were given it was better to be in lockstep across the UK with clearer
6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24		TAC witness statement, you describe the period leading up to and after the firebreak and the subsequent lockdowns in England and Wales as a key moment where there was a significant difference between Wales and England. You then go on to say: "England did not follow SAGE's advice to intervene early and also did not support Wales to do so financially. Given the subsequent number of infections, hospitalisations and deaths in the autumn/winter of 2020/21 arising from the circulation of [different variants, including] Alpha variant the policies proved to accrue significant harm in Wales." Can you just explain how the different approach in England accrued significant harm in Wales? Well, if money had been made available to extend the firebreak, I mean, that's what I've been led to believe, then perhaps we could have had a three-week firebreak, and certainly from the advice that we were given it was better to be in lockstep across the UK with clearer public health messaging, that probably would have been better if everybody had followed the SAGE advice at that

(35) Pages 137 - 140

1		point, but I've not seen the economic argument from the	1
2		Treasury, say, on not having a firebreak across the UK	2
3		at that point.	3
4	Q.	You say in your witness statement that the advice or	4
5		your advice was not reflected in the ministerial advice	5
6		that was prepared regarding regulations that would come	6
7		into force after the firebreak period ended on	7
8		9 November.	8
9		If we can just have a look at that ministerial	9
10		advice, please thank you.	10
11		If we have a look at page 4, paragraph 17, the	11
12		advice refers to keeping the virus at a manageable	12
13		level, which it describes at or below Rt 1.2.	13
14		Do you consider or did you consider an Rt value of	14
15	_	or at below 1.2 keeping the virus at a manageable level?	15
16	Α.	No, and I think Professor Gravenor gave a good	16
17		explanation of what R of 1.2 meant, it still means	17
18		you're in exponential growth. I think our advice was to	18
19		keep it at or below 1, which would have been difficult	19
20	~	as well.	20
21	Q.		21
22		a sustainable level following the firebreak lockdown?	22
23	Α.	Because there were too many relaxations and there were	23
24 25		more opportunities for mixing over the general	24 25
25		population. 141	20
1	Q.	If we can have a look, please, at some TAG policy	1
2		modelling advice that was published on 1 December 2020.	2
3		It's INQ000321023. If we can have a look at the bottom	3
4		of page 1, the advice there states:	4
5		"The most efficient way to reduce harm from covid-19	5
6		and pressure on the NHS is to [Document read]	6
7		restrictions as soon as practically possible (high	7
8		confidence)."	8
9		Now, we know Wales entered level 4 restrictions on	9
10		19 December. Now, having regard to mounting concerns	10
11		throughout November and December 2020, do you consider	11
12		that there was avoidable delay in the Welsh Government's	12
13		decision-making over moving to alert level 4,	13
14		effectively a lockdown?	14
15	Α.	Again, some of these questions are for ministers and	15
16		policy colleagues, but the advice at the time, based on	16
17		the modelling, was: go earlier. As it was throughout	17
18		the pandemic. But again, very difficult decisions.	18
19	Q.		19
20		of 2021 into May 2022, and you've dealt with the advice	20
21		provided by TAG and TAC during that period in your	21
22		witness statement, and obviously we will have regard to	22
23		that so just a few questions, really, about the Omicron	23
24		variant.	24
-			24
25		We know that was identified as a variant of concern 143	24

1	Q.	TAG published a statement on 7 December on NPIs in the
2		pre-Christmas period.
3		We've got that at INQ00035042.
4		If we can just turn to the bottom of page 2, please,
5		it's the penultimate bullet point on that page:
6		"Policy modelling suggests that introducing Tier 3
7		restrictions prior [Document read] patients, and
8		deaths."
9		Now, no further restrictions were imposed following
10		this advice. Why do you think the advice of TAG was not
11		acted upon at this time? So this is 7 sorry,
12		2 December.
13	Α.	I can't quite remember when the tiers were brought in,
14		but certainly that advice came from SAGE advice around
15		the analysis of the impact of tiers, which I from
16		memory, I think 40 out of 43 areas in Tier 3 showed
17		a reduction in transmission and prevalence in those
18		areas. So that was the advice.
19		But as to why Cabinet decided not to or policy
20		colleagues didn't put that as their policy
21		recommendations, I don't know. I can't quite remember
22		the phasing of post lockdown restrictions, but
23		I remember there being discussions around alert levels
24		and what would be the sufficient what would be the
25		right tier to go into.
		142
1		on 27 November 2021. Eluned Morgan, in her written
2		evidence to the Inquiry, has described the decision to
3		reintroduce some restrictions in response to Omicron as
4		an example of a decision that may have been taken
5		differently had more information been available.
6		She has said in her statement that:
7		"At the time there were information gaps in relation
8		to the efficacy of the vaccinations deployed through the
9		vaccination programme [Document read] available
10		earlier."
11		Do you agree with that view? Were there gaps in
12		relation to the efficacy of the vaccination programme at
13		that time?
14	Α.	Yeah, I agree. I think whenever a new variant emerged,
15		trying to characterise it in terms of impact on
16		vaccination status or the case case to
17		hospitalisation ratio, the number of people that became
18		infected that would then go on to be hospitalised, there
19		was some degree of uncertainty. I believe, from memory,
20		there was a high scenario of a 2.5 case hospitalisation
21		ratio and a low scenario of 1%, that these were just in

- the bounds of, you know, reasonable scenarios. So there
- 23 was some uncertainty. And then new evidence came
- 24 available, probably from UKHSA, at the time, to say that
- the lower estimate was more likely. So whilst we would

(36) Pages 141 - 144

1		have a significant number of cases, which we did, which	1
2		would obviously impact Long Covid too, the stress on the	2
3		NHS would be lower. So then there was a change in	3
4		advice when the lower estimates became the more likely	4
5		estimates.	5
6	MR	POOLE: Dr Orford, thank you. They're all the questions	6
7		I've got for you, but there are some questions from	7
8		core participants.	8
9	LA	DY HALLETT: Ms Heaven.	9
10		Questions from MS HEAVEN	10
11	MS	HEAVEN: Thank you, my Lady.	11
12		Just to say that, no criticism of Mr Poole, but he's	12
13		asked my question, so I've agreed with him to ask the	13
14		same way but in a slightly different way, so you're not	14
15		surprised looking at the spreadsheet.	15
16		Good afternoon, Dr Orford, I represent the Covid-19	16
17		Bereaved Families for Justice Cymru.	17
18		Can I just go back to the firebreak, then, please.	18
19		We obviously understand that that specific request came	19
20		from you to Michael Gravenor and his team on 11 October	20
21		to model a firebreak.	21
22		Now, if I before I ask you the specific question,	22
23		if I can just fill you in on some of the evidence	23
24		my Lady's heard.	24
25		So Michael Gravenor told the Inquiry that if there'd	25
		145	
1		a moment ago and you just indicated that you knew that	1
2		four weeks was better than three weeks. So can I just	2
3		check with you, then, was it your understanding, and	3
4		indeed did you know, as a result of Michael Gravenor's	4
5		modelling, that four weeks would push the virus deep	5
6		into December, seven to nine weeks? Was that your	6
7		understanding?	7
8	Α.	That was my understanding, and I'm pretty certain that	8
9		was shared with policy colleagues around that time, and	9
10		then there were separate requests that came for further	10
11		modelling.	11
12	Q.	So that was going to be my next point, just to be very	12
13		clear on what the Welsh Government knew. You have been	13
14		critical in your witness statement about Welsh ministers	14
15		departing from TAG/TAC advice in the easing of the	15
16		firebreak, and we've just seen the email that you sent	16
17		to ministers on the 15th where you said the take home is	17
18		act sooner for longer, three weeks rather than two. TAG	18
19		then recommends two to three weeks.	19
20		So, just so that my Lady's absolutely clear on your	20
21		evidence, were Cabinet ministers, and in particular the	21
22		First Minister for Wales, Mark Drakeford, and	22
23		Vaughan Gething, told in no uncertain terms that	23
24		an autumn firebreak for four weeks would reduce	24
25		community transmission deep into December, seven to	25
		147	

1		been a longer firebreak, this would have resulted in
2		very low prevalence of the virus into December. He
3		said, in effect, it would have pushed it deep into
4		December. He said a four-week firebreak would give
5		a seven to nine-week suppression time period, which
6		of course would have meant that Wales would have faced
7		a period of high winter transmission, plus the emergence
8		of the Alpha variant, from a starting point of much
9		lower community prevalence than it in fact had to face
10		in December 2020. And of course that was bringing it
11		much closer to when the vaccine arrived in December.
12		I asked Michael Gravenor if the Welsh Government
13		had knew of his modelling results, and this is what
14		he said. So he said the report for the five to
15		seven weeks and then the three to five weeks was in the
16		report that went in for the two to three-week firebreak,
17		but it did not include his results for the four-week
18		firebreak.
19		But when I asked him about the Welsh Government
20		would have known about the effects of a four-week
21		firebreak, so that's the seven to nine-week suppression
22		time, he essentially said they had all the evidence, it
23		was easy to extrapolate to a four-week firebreak, it was
24		a matter of common sense.
25		Of course CTI has asked you a bit about this 146
		140
1		ning works and closer of source to the time when the
1		nine weeks, and closer, of course, to the time when the
2		vaccine would arrive? Were they told that in no
2 3	•	vaccine would arrive? Were they told that in no uncertain terms?
2 3 4	А.	vaccine would arrive? Were they told that in no uncertain terms? I'd have to go back and check on the modelling papers
2 3 4 5	А.	vaccine would arrive? Were they told that in no uncertain terms? I'd have to go back and check on the modelling papers and the internal TAC summaries that were shared around
2 3 4 5 6	Α.	vaccine would arrive? Were they told that in no uncertain terms? I'd have to go back and check on the modelling papers and the internal TAC summaries that were shared around that time. However, separate conversations that
2 3 4 5 6 7	Α.	vaccine would arrive? Were they told that in no uncertain terms? I'd have to go back and check on the modelling papers and the internal TAC summaries that were shared around that time. However, separate conversations that considered not just the science, the affordability
2 3 4 5 6 7 8	Α.	vaccine would arrive? Were they told that in no uncertain terms? I'd have to go back and check on the modelling papers and the internal TAC summaries that were shared around that time. However, separate conversations that considered not just the science, the affordability for example, would have been had within government. So
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	A.	vaccine would arrive? Were they told that in no uncertain terms? I'd have to go back and check on the modelling papers and the internal TAC summaries that were shared around that time. However, separate conversations that considered not just the science, the affordability for example, would have been had within government. So perhaps those questions are best addressed to policy
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	A.	vaccine would arrive? Were they told that in no uncertain terms? I'd have to go back and check on the modelling papers and the internal TAC summaries that were shared around that time. However, separate conversations that considered not just the science, the affordability for example, would have been had within government. So perhaps those questions are best addressed to policy colleagues who are responsible for developing those
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11		vaccine would arrive? Were they told that in no uncertain terms? I'd have to go back and check on the modelling papers and the internal TAC summaries that were shared around that time. However, separate conversations that considered not just the science, the affordability for example, would have been had within government. So perhaps those questions are best addressed to policy colleagues who are responsible for developing those policies and advice to ministers.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	A. Q.	vaccine would arrive? Were they told that in no uncertain terms? I'd have to go back and check on the modelling papers and the internal TAC summaries that were shared around that time. However, separate conversations that considered not just the science, the affordability for example, would have been had within government. So perhaps those questions are best addressed to policy colleagues who are responsible for developing those
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12		vaccine would arrive? Were they told that in no uncertain terms? I'd have to go back and check on the modelling papers and the internal TAC summaries that were shared around that time. However, separate conversations that considered not just the science, the affordability for example, would have been had within government. So perhaps those questions are best addressed to policy colleagues who are responsible for developing those policies and advice to ministers. Just to push you a little bit though because we've seen
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13		vaccine would arrive? Were they told that in no uncertain terms? I'd have to go back and check on the modelling papers and the internal TAC summaries that were shared around that time. However, separate conversations that considered not just the science, the affordability for example, would have been had within government. So perhaps those questions are best addressed to policy colleagues who are responsible for developing those policies and advice to ministers. Just to push you a little bit though because we've seen your email to ministers though where it says two to
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14		vaccine would arrive? Were they told that in no uncertain terms? I'd have to go back and check on the modelling papers and the internal TAC summaries that were shared around that time. However, separate conversations that considered not just the science, the affordability for example, would have been had within government. So perhaps those questions are best addressed to policy colleagues who are responsible for developing those policies and advice to ministers. Just to push you a little bit though because we've seen your email to ministers though where it says two to three weeks. Did you specifically say to ministers,
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15		vaccine would arrive? Were they told that in no uncertain terms? I'd have to go back and check on the modelling papers and the internal TAC summaries that were shared around that time. However, separate conversations that considered not just the science, the affordability for example, would have been had within government. So perhaps those questions are best addressed to policy colleagues who are responsible for developing those policies and advice to ministers. Just to push you a little bit though because we've seen your email to ministers though where it says two to three weeks. Did you specifically say to ministers, "But four weeks would push it deep into December"; do
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	Q.	vaccine would arrive? Were they told that in no uncertain terms? I'd have to go back and check on the modelling papers and the internal TAC summaries that were shared around that time. However, separate conversations that considered not just the science, the affordability for example, would have been had within government. So perhaps those questions are best addressed to policy colleagues who are responsible for developing those policies and advice to ministers. Just to push you a little bit though because we've seen your email to ministers though where it says two to three weeks. Did you specifically say to ministers, "But four weeks would push it deep into December"; do you recall?
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	Q.	vaccine would arrive? Were they told that in no uncertain terms? I'd have to go back and check on the modelling papers and the internal TAC summaries that were shared around that time. However, separate conversations that considered not just the science, the affordability for example, would have been had within government. So perhaps those questions are best addressed to policy colleagues who are responsible for developing those policies and advice to ministers. Just to push you a little bit though because we've seen your email to ministers though where it says two to three weeks. Did you specifically say to ministers, "But four weeks would push it deep into December"; do you recall? I'm pretty certain we had advice going through at that
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	Q.	vaccine would arrive? Were they told that in no uncertain terms? I'd have to go back and check on the modelling papers and the internal TAC summaries that were shared around that time. However, separate conversations that considered not just the science, the affordability for example, would have been had within government. So perhaps those questions are best addressed to policy colleagues who are responsible for developing those policies and advice to ministers. Just to push you a little bit though because we've seen your email to ministers though where it says two to three weeks. Did you specifically say to ministers, "But four weeks would push it deep into December"; do you recall? I'm pretty certain we had advice going through at that time so I've not got it in front of me with
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19	Q.	vaccine would arrive? Were they told that in no uncertain terms? I'd have to go back and check on the modelling papers and the internal TAC summaries that were shared around that time. However, separate conversations that considered not just the science, the affordability for example, would have been had within government. So perhaps those questions are best addressed to policy colleagues who are responsible for developing those policies and advice to ministers. Just to push you a little bit though because we've seen your email to ministers though where it says two to three weeks. Did you specifically say to ministers, "But four weeks would push it deep into December"; do you recall? I'm pretty certain we had advice going through at that time so I've not got it in front of me with different policy modelling outputs. So I'd have to go
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	Q. A.	vaccine would arrive? Were they told that in no uncertain terms? I'd have to go back and check on the modelling papers and the internal TAC summaries that were shared around that time. However, separate conversations that considered not just the science, the affordability for example, would have been had within government. So perhaps those questions are best addressed to policy colleagues who are responsible for developing those policies and advice to ministers. Just to push you a little bit though because we've seen your email to ministers though where it says two to three weeks. Did you specifically say to ministers, "But four weeks would push it deep into December"; do you recall? I'm pretty certain we had advice going through at that time so I've not got it in front of me with different policy modelling outputs. So I'd have to go back and check what the papers were at that time, but
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	Q. A.	vaccine would arrive? Were they told that in no uncertain terms? I'd have to go back and check on the modelling papers and the internal TAC summaries that were shared around that time. However, separate conversations that considered not just the science, the affordability for example, would have been had within government. So perhaps those questions are best addressed to policy colleagues who are responsible for developing those policies and advice to ministers. Just to push you a little bit though because we've seen your email to ministers though where it says two to three weeks. Did you specifically say to ministers, "But four weeks would push it deep into December"; do you recall? I'm pretty certain we had advice going through at that time so I've not got it in front of me with different policy modelling outputs. So I'd have to go back and check what the papers were at that time, but there was more than one policy model made at that point.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	Q. A.	vaccine would arrive? Were they told that in no uncertain terms? I'd have to go back and check on the modelling papers and the internal TAC summaries that were shared around that time. However, separate conversations that considered not just the science, the affordability for example, would have been had within government. So perhaps those questions are best addressed to policy colleagues who are responsible for developing those policies and advice to ministers. Just to push you a little bit though because we've seen your email to ministers though where it says two to three weeks. Did you specifically say to ministers, "But four weeks would push it deep into December"; do you recall? I'm pretty certain we had advice going through at that time so I've not got it in front of me with different policy modelling outputs. So I'd have to go back and check what the papers were at that time, but there was more than one policy model made at that point. HEAVEN: Okay, thank you, my Lady, that's my question.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	Q. A.	vaccine would arrive? Were they told that in no uncertain terms? I'd have to go back and check on the modelling papers and the internal TAC summaries that were shared around that time. However, separate conversations that considered not just the science, the affordability for example, would have been had within government. So perhaps those questions are best addressed to policy colleagues who are responsible for developing those policies and advice to ministers. Just to push you a little bit though because we've seen your email to ministers though where it says two to three weeks. Did you specifically say to ministers, "But four weeks would push it deep into December"; do you recall? I'm pretty certain we had advice going through at that time so I've not got it in front of me with different policy modelling outputs. So I'd have to go back and check what the papers were at that time, but there was more than one policy model made at that point. HEAVEN: Okay, thank you, my Lady, that's my question. DY HALLETT: Thank you, Ms Heaven.

(37) Pages 145 - 148

1	MS FOUBISTER: Thank you, my Lady. No, I haven't, just the
2	one from me.
3	Questions from MS FOUBISTER
4	MS FOUBISTER: Good afternoon, Dr Orford, I represent John's
5	Campaign and Care Rights UK.
6	My question is about evidence and decision-making.
7	So I would like to refer you to your individual witness
8	statement, which is the one dated 19 December 2023,
9	that's INQ000390618.
10	Hopefully we can turn to paragraph 190.
11	190 is at the bottom of the page and it goes on to
12	the next page a bit unfortunately, so hopefully we can
13	see all of it.
14	While we're getting there I'll tell you what I'm
15	going to be directing your attention to, and that's that
16	at paragraph 190 you refer to a paper called
17	the Executive Committee in April 2020.
18	If we can just zoom in to paragraph 190. Thank you
19	very much.
20	So you refer to the paper which is focused on "How
21	can we use evidence better, to inform effective
22	policies", and then if we can go down the page a bit,
23	it's over onto the second bit of the page, to (IV),
24	where you note that one of the recommendations of that
25	paper was that the Welsh Government needs to embed 149
	140
1	policies
1	policies. So there's work like that going on throughout Welsh
2	. So there's work like that going on throughout Welsh
2 3	So there's work like that going on throughout Welsh Government about how we improve our analytical capacity
2 3 4	So there's work like that going on throughout Welsh Government about how we improve our analytical capacity and capability as an organisation. So that work is
2 3 4 5	So there's work like that going on throughout Welsh Government about how we improve our analytical capacity and capability as an organisation. So that work is ongoing.
2 3 4 5 6	So there's work like that going on throughout Welsh Government about how we improve our analytical capacity and capability as an organisation. So that work is ongoing. MS FOUBISTER: Thank you very much.
2 3 4 5 6 7	So there's work like that going on throughout Welsh Government about how we improve our analytical capacity and capability as an organisation. So that work is ongoing. MS FOUBISTER: Thank you very much. Thank you, my Lady.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8	So there's work like that going on throughout Welsh Government about how we improve our analytical capacity and capability as an organisation. So that work is ongoing. MS FOUBISTER: Thank you very much. Thank you, my Lady. THE WITNESS: Thank you.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	So there's work like that going on throughout Welsh Government about how we improve our analytical capacity and capability as an organisation. So that work is ongoing. MS FOUBISTER: Thank you very much. Thank you, my Lady. THE WITNESS: Thank you. LADY HALLETT: Thank you very much.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	So there's work like that going on throughout Welsh Government about how we improve our analytical capacity and capability as an organisation. So that work is ongoing. MS FOUBISTER: Thank you very much. Thank you, my Lady. THE WITNESS: Thank you. LADY HALLETT: Thank you very much. Thank you very much, Dr Orford, that completes the
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11	So there's work like that going on throughout Welsh Government about how we improve our analytical capacity and capability as an organisation. So that work is ongoing. MS FOUBISTER: Thank you very much. Thank you, my Lady. THE WITNESS: Thank you. LADY HALLETT: Thank you very much. Thank you very much, Dr Orford, that completes the questions we have. I'm not sure whether we're going to
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12	So there's work like that going on throughout Welsh Government about how we improve our analytical capacity and capability as an organisation. So that work is ongoing. MS FOUBISTER: Thank you very much. Thank you, my Lady. THE WITNESS: Thank you. LADY HALLETT: Thank you very much. Thank you very much, Dr Orford, that completes the questions we have. I'm not sure whether we're going to have to ask you to come back. I'm sorry, it's the
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	So there's work like that going on throughout Welsh Government about how we improve our analytical capacity and capability as an organisation. So that work is ongoing. MS FOUBISTER: Thank you very much. Thank you, my Lady. THE WITNESS: Thank you. LADY HALLETT: Thank you very much. Thank you very much, Dr Orford, that completes the questions we have. I'm not sure whether we're going to have to ask you to come back. I'm sorry, it's the nature of the module
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	So there's work like that going on throughout Welsh Government about how we improve our analytical capacity and capability as an organisation. So that work is ongoing. MS FOUBISTER: Thank you very much. Thank you, my Lady. THE WITNESS: Thank you. LADY HALLETT: Thank you very much. Thank you very much, Dr Orford, that completes the questions we have. I'm not sure whether we're going to have to ask you to come back. I'm sorry, it's the nature of the module THE WITNESS: No problem.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	So there's work like that going on throughout Welsh Government about how we improve our analytical capacity and capability as an organisation. So that work is ongoing. MS FOUBISTER: Thank you very much. Thank you, my Lady. THE WITNESS: Thank you. LADY HALLETT: Thank you very much. Thank you very much, Dr Orford, that completes the questions we have. I'm not sure whether we're going to have to ask you to come back. I'm sorry, it's the nature of the module THE WITNESS: No problem. LADY HALLETT: system that we've introduced, because we
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	So there's work like that going on throughout Welsh Government about how we improve our analytical capacity and capability as an organisation. So that work is ongoing. MS FOUBISTER: Thank you very much. Thank you, my Lady. THE WITNESS: Thank you. LADY HALLETT: Thank you very much. Thank you very much, Dr Orford, that completes the questions we have. I'm not sure whether we're going to have to ask you to come back. I'm sorry, it's the nature of the module THE WITNESS: No problem. LADY HALLETT: system that we've introduced, because we have so many issues to investigate. But thank you for
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	So there's work like that going on throughout Welsh Government about how we improve our analytical capacity and capability as an organisation. So that work is ongoing. MS FOUBISTER: Thank you very much. Thank you, my Lady. THE WITNESS: Thank you. LADY HALLETT: Thank you very much. Thank you very much, Dr Orford, that completes the questions we have. I'm not sure whether we're going to have to ask you to come back. I'm sorry, it's the nature of the module THE WITNESS: No problem. LADY HALLETT: system that we've introduced, because we have so many issues to investigate. But thank you for your help so far anyway.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	So there's work like that going on throughout Welsh Government about how we improve our analytical capacity and capability as an organisation. So that work is ongoing. MS FOUBISTER: Thank you very much. Thank you, my Lady. THE WITNESS: Thank you. LADY HALLETT: Thank you very much. Thank you very much, Dr Orford, that completes the questions we have. I'm not sure whether we're going to have to ask you to come back. I'm sorry, it's the nature of the module THE WITNESS: No problem. LADY HALLETT: system that we've introduced, because we have so many issues to investigate. But thank you for your help so far anyway. THE WITNESS: Thank you, your Ladyship.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19	So there's work like that going on throughout Welsh Government about how we improve our analytical capacity and capability as an organisation. So that work is ongoing. MS FOUBISTER: Thank you very much. Thank you, my Lady. THE WITNESS: Thank you. LADY HALLETT: Thank you very much. Thank you very much, Dr Orford, that completes the questions we have. I'm not sure whether we're going to have to ask you to come back. I'm sorry, it's the nature of the module THE WITNESS: No problem. LADY HALLETT: system that we've introduced, because we have so many issues to investigate. But thank you for your help so far anyway.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	So there's work like that going on throughout Welsh Government about how we improve our analytical capacity and capability as an organisation. So that work is ongoing. MS FOUBISTER: Thank you very much. Thank you, my Lady. THE WITNESS: Thank you. LADY HALLETT: Thank you very much. Thank you very much, Dr Orford, that completes the questions we have. I'm not sure whether we're going to have to ask you to come back. I'm sorry, it's the nature of the module THE WITNESS: No problem. LADY HALLETT: system that we've introduced, because we have so many issues to investigate. But thank you for your help so far anyway. THE WITNESS: Thank you, your Ladyship. (The witness withdrew) LADY HALLETT: Mr Poole.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	So there's work like that going on throughout Welsh Government about how we improve our analytical capacity and capability as an organisation. So that work is ongoing. MS FOUBISTER: Thank you very much. Thank you, my Lady. THE WITNESS: Thank you. LADY HALLETT: Thank you very much. Thank you very much, Dr Orford, that completes the questions we have. I'm not sure whether we're going to have to ask you to come back. I'm sorry, it's the nature of the module THE WITNESS: No problem. LADY HALLETT: system that we've introduced, because we have so many issues to investigate. But thank you for your help so far anyway. THE WITNESS: Thank you, your Ladyship. (The witness withdrew) LADY HALLETT: Mr Poole. MR POOLE: My Lady, I'm in your hands whether we, before the
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	So there's work like that going on throughout Welsh Government about how we improve our analytical capacity and capability as an organisation. So that work is ongoing. MS FOUBISTER: Thank you very much. Thank you, my Lady. THE WITNESS: Thank you. LADY HALLETT: Thank you very much. Thank you very much, Dr Orford, that completes the questions we have. I'm not sure whether we're going to have to ask you to come back. I'm sorry, it's the nature of the module THE WITNESS: No problem. LADY HALLETT: system that we've introduced, because we have so many issues to investigate. But thank you for your help so far anyway. THE WITNESS: Thank you, your Ladyship. (The witness withdrew) LADY HALLETT: Mr Poole.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	So there's work like that going on throughout Welsh Government about how we improve our analytical capacity and capability as an organisation. So that work is ongoing. MS FOUBISTER: Thank you very much. Thank you, my Lady. THE WITNESS: Thank you. LADY HALLETT: Thank you very much. LADY HALLETT: Thank you very much. Thank you very much, Dr Orford, that completes the questions we have. I'm not sure whether we're going to have to ask you to come back. I'm sorry, it's the nature of the module THE WITNESS: No problem. LADY HALLETT: system that we've introduced, because we have so many issues to investigate. But thank you for your help so far anyway. THE WITNESS: Thank you, your Ladyship. (The witness withdrew) LADY HALLETT: Mr Poole. MR POOLE: My Lady, I'm in your hands whether we, before the next witness, we take our 15-minute break now or we hear 15 minutes of evidence.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	So there's work like that going on throughout Welsh Government about how we improve our analytical capacity and capability as an organisation. So that work is ongoing. MS FOUBISTER: Thank you very much. Thank you, my Lady. THE WITNESS: Thank you. LADY HALLETT: Thank you very much. Thank you very much, Dr Orford, that completes the questions we have. I'm not sure whether we're going to have to ask you to come back. I'm sorry, it's the nature of the module THE WITNESS: No problem. LADY HALLETT: system that we've introduced, because we have so many issues to investigate. But thank you for your help so far anyway. THE WITNESS: Thank you, your Ladyship. (The witness withdrew) LADY HALLETT: Mr Poole. MR POOLE: My Lady, I'm in your hands whether we, before the next witness, we take our 15-minute break now or we hear

151

Inquiry	4 March 2024		
1	a better culture of evidence use within policy		
2	development.		
3	So my question to you, Dr Orford, is for your views		
4	on what specific changes have been or should be made to		
5	ensure that the views and evidence from stakeholders and		
6	experts are taken into account by core decision-makers?		
7	A. Thank you.		
8	So this work has come from the so this was		
9	April 2022 from the Strategic Evidence Board, so		
10	there's a recognition by the executive group of Welsh		
11	Government the need for more evidence to be embedded		
12	within policymaking. And I think that observation		
13	you know, the chief science adviser,		
14	Sir Patrick Vallance and Angela McLean currently, are		
15	doing work to ensure there's greater scientific literacy		
16	within the civil service, where there's a relatively		
17	small percentage of civil servants that have a degree in		
18	science, broadly they have degrees in humanities. Some		
19	of the work that we've done in the Health and Social		
20	Services Group is to develop a division called SEA,		
21	Science Evidence Advice. Within SEA there are important		
22	functions like SPI functions, which we call science		
23	policy interfaces, so people who are able to support		
24	policy colleagues, ask evidence-informed questions to		
25	support them in developing and evaluating their 150		
1 2 3	made, if we take it now. LADY HALLETT: Very well, back at 3 o'clock. (2.45 pm)		
4	(A short break)		
5	(3.00 pm)		
6	LADY HALLETT: Is anybody else feeling the chill? Could we		
7	sort out the temperature, please.		
8 9	MR POOLE: Could I please call Dame Shan Morgan. DAME SHAN MORGAN (affirmed)		
10	Questions from LEAD COUNSEL TO THE INQUIRY for MODULE 2B		
11	MR POOLE: Could you please start by giving us your full		
12	name.		
13	A. My name is Shan Elizabeth Morgan.		
14	Q. As you give your evidence this afternoon, if I could ask		
15	you to keep your voice up so that we can hear you but		
16	also so that your evidence can be recorded. If I ask		
17	you anything you don't understand, please do ask me to		
18	rephrase it.		
19	Dame Shan, you have provided a witness statement to		
20	this module, we have it there on the display, you've		
21	signed that on 13 December last year. I was going to		
22	say, are the contents true to the best of your knowledge		
23	and belief, but before I do that, I think you need to		
24	make a couple of corrections, if I just walk you through		
25	those.		

152

1		If we can, sorry, have page 18 of the witness
2		statement up, just see if those have been made already.
3		No they haven't.
4		Now I understand that the meetings you refer to
5		these paragraphs, so paragraphs 60, 61 and 62 as being
6		hosted by Mark Sedwill, which you refer to as Covid-O
7		meetings, were in fact Cabinet Secretary meetings, not
8		Covid-O meetings, and you did not attend any Covid-O
9		meetings; is that right?
10	Α.	That's right.
11	Q.	We will make those corrections to those paragraphs 60,
12		61 and 62. Other than those corrections, are the
13		contents of that statement true to the best of your
14		knowledge and belief?
15	Α.	Yes.
16	Q.	I'm grateful.
17		You were asked to provide a witness statement to
18		this module in your capacity as the former
19		permanent secretary of the Welsh Government. In
20		particular, you were asked to outline any role you
21		played in key decisions that were made by the Welsh
22		Government during the pandemic. Before I ask you
23		questions about that, can I just start with a few
24		questions about your career.
25		You joined the civil service in 1977. You were then 153
		100
1		January 2020.
2		We can see at the top the First Minister, below him
3		a number of Welsh ministers and deputy ministers, and
4		then we see your former role as permanent secretary
5		sitting below those ministers and deputy ministers.
6		Now, we'll come on to the specifics of your role in
7		a moment, but essentially am I right that the permanent
8 9		secretary is the head of the civil service within the Welsh Government?
9 10	Α.	That's correct.
10	Q.	You have the director generals, each of those director
12	ч.	generals that we can see there, the four of them at that
13		stage, each of those are senior civil servants reporting
14		to you; is that correct?
15	Α.	It is.
16	Q.	Now, Andrew Goodall, in his witness statement to the
17		Inquiry, who we'll be also hearing from tomorrow
18		morning, he has said that:
19		"Despite the range of responsibilities we [namely
20		the Welsh Government] are a compact administration. All
21		ministers and senior leaders are under one roof and are
22		frequently in the same room together. This enables the
23		organisation to take advantage of being able to work in
24		a highly integrated way, and make decisions at pace."
25		Do you agree with that description that he gives of
		155

nquir	У	4 March 2024
1		seconded to the European Commission in Brussels between
2		1984 and 1987, before returning to the UK where you were
3		appointed private secretary to the permanent secretary
4		of the employment department within the UK Government in
5		1990.
6		You were appointed head of the employment and
7		training strategy unit at the Government Office for
8		London in 1992.
9		In 1997, you were seconded to the British Embassy in
10		Paris as labour and social affairs attacheé, and served
11		as ambassador to Argentina and Paraguay between 2008 and
12		2012.
13		And then in 2017 you were appointed as the Welsh
14		Government permanent secretary, and also appointed
15		Dame Commander of the Order of St Michael and St George;
16		and I think I'm right in saying that you retired from
17		the civil service in October 2021.
18		Is all of that accurate?
19	Α.	It's all accurate.
20	Q.	Start with some questions, if I may, then, about the
21		structures of the Welsh Government.
22		If we can please have on screen INQ000066086. This
23		shows the organisational structure of the Welsh
24		Government as at November 2019, so namely the
25		organisational structure going into the pandemic in 154
1		the Welsh Government?
2	A.	Yes, I do.
3	Q.	Professor Wincott, whom we heard from last week, he gave
4		evidence that initially one might get the impression
5		that the decision-making processes in the Welsh
6		Government are overly complex, but he went on to say
7		that having worked through the full body of material
8		that he had been provided with to provide his report, he
9		said a rather more coherent pattern of response from the
10		Welsh Government has come into focus. Do you have any
11		comments on Professor Wincott's evidence in that regard?
12	Α.	Yes, I think that's I can understand why he made that
13		comment. I think it's fair to say two things: first,
14		that the structures evolved over time and I think became
15		less complex; and, second, that in any case because the
16		Welsh Government is a very small organisation people
17		knew each other very well and they were often on the
18		different the same person might be on different
19		structures within the Welsh Government, and that meant
20		that people were very well integrated.
21	Q.	So would you say that being a compact administration was
22		an advantage when it came to decision-making during the
23		pandemic?
24	Α.	I think it was.

- 24 A. I think it was.
- 25 **Q.** Turning then to your former role as permanent secretary 156

UK Covid-19 Inquiry

1		and the role of the civil service in Wales generally,
2		all civil servants in Wales are bound by the Civil
3		Service Code and, as such, they're expected to carry out
4		their roles with dedication and commitment to the core
5		values of the civil service, namely integrity, honesty,
6		objectivity and impartiality.
7		Now, you say in your witness statement that, for all
8		practical purposes, as permanent secretary you were
9		accountable to the First Minister. Just tell me, what
10		does that mean in practice?
11	Α.	It meant that in practice I was clear that it was the
12		First Minister who set my priorities for action, and in
13		fact who made a very significant contribution to my
14		annual civil service appraisal. My line manager
15		formally was the Cabinet Secretary, but it was very
16		clear in my contract and in the ways of working that
17		I was very directly accountable to the First Minister
18		for everything I did in that role.
19	Q.	You describe in your witness statement the role of
20		permanent secretary as having three main components.
21		Perhaps if I just identify those: first, principal
22		accounting officer. So by that you mean managing and
23		accounting the proper expenditure of public money; is
24		that right?
25	Α.	That's right.
		157
1	Q.	Would it be right to say that the Welsh Cabinet is the
2		central decision-making body of the Welsh Government?
3	Α.	It would be absolutely right.
4	Q.	And that remained the case, as far as you're concerned,
5		throughout the pandemic?
6	Α.	That's right.
7	Q.	Now, as permanent secretary you attended meetings of the
8		Welsh Cabinet, but you say in your statement you
9		intervened rarely and, when you did, this was in your
10		capacity as principal accounting officer. By that do
11		you mean your interventions would usually concern
12		sort of staff, budgetary issues?
13	Α.	Exactly so.
14	Q.	Although the Cabinet led on collective decisions
15		relating to the Welsh Government's pandemic response.

relating to the Welsh Government's pandemic response,obviously individual ministers were required to make

- 17 decisions in their own portfolios; that's right, isn't
- 18 it?
- 19 A. That's right.
- 20 **Q**. I just want to explore with you now some points about
- what informed decision-making during the pandemic. I'llstart, if I may, with the ministerial advice process.
- 23 Can you just explain -- we've got an example up on
- 24 screen very helpfully, this is from 22 March -- but can
- 25 you just explain what a ministerial advice document is? 159

1	Q.	Second, as we have discussed, leading the Welsh civil
2		service; and then third, you were principal policy
3		adviser to the First Minister.
4		Just as regards that third aspect of the role, would
5		it be right to say you had general responsibility for
6		overseeing the quality of advice that was presented to
7		the First Minister and also Welsh ministers, but you
8		were not directly involved in the provision of advice
9		itself?
10	Α.	That is correct.
11	Q.	You go on to say in your witness statement that:
12		"In practical terms, my responsibility as Permanent
13		Secretary was to ensure that the right people were in
14		the key positions supporting Ministers and that they had
15		the right skills, experience and support to discharge
16		those roles effectively."
17		Did you find that at all challenging during the
18		pandemic?
19	Α.	It was challenging in that, again, being a small
20		organisation, there was a relatively small central core,
21		if you like, of people who had the high level policy
22		skills that ministers needed in order to prepare actions
23		for the pandemic to prepare legislation, so we were
24		heavily reliant on a relatively small core of people at
25		the centre.
		158

1	Α.	It is a classic civil service submission, policy
2		submission document. So it will be drafted by the
3		relevant civil servants and they will identify the key
4		issues, they will set out a range of options, the impact
5		of the different options, and they will give advice to
6		the relevant minister about the range of options.
7	Q.	So if we just look at this by way of example, not really
8		the substance of it, we can see the top right where it's
9		come from. So it's come, in this case, from the public
10		health division. We can see who has cleared it, and we
11		can see the date it's been generated. And then perhaps
12		if we can just come out thank you to the table,
13		there we can see who needs to make a decision. So for
14		this particular ministerial advice, a decision was
15		needed.
16		Perhaps if we can, sorry, scroll out sorry, the
17		words in bold we can see a decision there was needed
18		by the whole Cabinet in this example, and then the table
19		summarises the advice what's been recommended and the
20		timing.
21		Obviously the advice is then set out in the body of
22		the document, and if we could go please to page 6, the
23		annex that we see there, this is called clearance
24		tracking. So am I right this identifies if the
25		ministerial advice raises, as we see there financial

25 ministerial advice raises, as we see there, financial 160

(40) Pages 157 - 160

- 1 legal or governance issues; and then there's a statement
- 2 assuring the quality of advice, and then a copy list of
- 3 who the advice is going to. Is that -- that's all
- 4 roughly accurate?
- 5 A. Totally accurate.
- 6 Q. When would a ministerial advice be used?
- 7 A. It would be used on any issue of significance requiring
- 8 a decision by ministers.9 Q. And who in particular would have input? Presumably it
- 10 depends on the subject matter of the advice, does it?
- 11 A. It does indeed. It would be senior civil service
- 12 officials who would make sure that they liaised with
- 13 colleagues in other relevant parts of the organisation
- to make sure that there was a joined-up response acrossthe whole of the government.
- 16 Q. And how were decisions made under the ministerial adviceprocess recorded?
- 18 A. They were recorded through a decision report, which was19 then normally included on the Welsh Government website.
- 20 **Q.** So these would be externally facing decision reports?
- 21 A. That's right.
- 22 **Q.** Now, the ministerial advice that we've still got, the
- example we're looking at, at page 1, I think it says at
 the bottom -- yes, decision report:
- 25
- "This decision does not require a decision report." 161
- 1 needed to take an urgent decision, so sort of outside
- 2 Cabinet? Presumably that happened during the pandemic?
- A. There were processes for doing that and for making sure
 that any such decisions were made on the basis of
- 5 evidence, and that they were properly recorded.
- 6 **Q.** When you say "properly recorded", how would a decision
- 7 being made by an individual minister, say, outside
- 8 Cabinet or outside this ministerial advice process? How9 would they be recorded generally?
- 10 A. It would be recorded in pretty much the same way as11 ministerial advice.
- 12 Q. The Inquiry understands that in April -- I think they
 13 started on 6 April -- was the introduction of daily
- 14 ministerial calls. Did you participate in those calls?
- 15 A. I was present, I think, at all of them, all that I could
 be present at. They were open to senior officials to
 attend.
- 18 Q. Again the Inquiry has received evidence to the effect
 19 that decisions were not usually taken during these calls
 20 unless obviously the urgency of the situation required
- 21 it. Does that accord with your recollection?
- 22 A. That is correct. There were times when I think the need
- 23 for a decision was flagged up in those calls, it was
- an opportunity to do that, but the decision would then
 be taken and recorded outside of those ministerial calls

163

- Is that just again because of the subject matter of
- 2 this particular ministerial advice?
- 3 A. Yes.

1

- 4 Q. Because it concerns legislation; is that right?
- 5 A. Yes.
- 6 **Q.** Now, presumably outside this process and definitely
- 7 during the pandemic, urgent decisions needed to be made
- 8 that wouldn't allow time for this process to be
- 9 followed. Did you have experience of that during the10 pandemic?
- 11 A. Inevitably. The -- there were three core elements to
- 12 decision-making in the Welsh Government. You've
- 13 described the first one, which was ministerial advice on
- 14 individual policy areas; the second process was Cabinet,
- 15 where Cabinet papers on generally cross-cutting big
- 16 issues were prepared, with input from a wide range of
- 17 civil servants; and the third was the 21-day review
- 18 process during the pandemic. And I should add that for
- 19 each of these processes there was also a template
- setting out the requirement to evaluate the equalityimpact assessment.
- Q. We'll be coming to equality impact assessmentsspecifically a bit later on, but just sticking with this
- 24 process, so ministerial advice, Cabinet and then 21-day
- 25 review process, what about where an individual minister 162
- 1 which usually lasted about half an hour a day.
- 2 Q. Change of topic slightly, and ask you some questions now
- 3 about the Welsh Government executive committee known as
- 4 ExCo. Can you help us, when was ExCo established?
- 5 A. It had been -- it had been operating in a similar format
 6 when I first arrived in early 2017. I then, if you
- 7 like, developed it to do what I felt it needed to do,
- 8 and it became the core corporate decision-making9 meeting.
- 10 Q. I understand -- and I'm right in saying, am I -- that
- 11 you chaired ExCo throughout your time as
- 12 permanent secretary?
- 13 **A.** I did.
- 14 Q. Just briefly describe the role and function of ExCo,15 please.
- 16 A. ExCo was there to give me assurance that all decisions
- 17 about corporate issues were taken with all relevant
- 18 members of the senior Welsh Government team attending19 and contributing.
- 20 **Q.** And in terms of membership, am I right then that ExCo comprised director generals and senior policy officials?
- 22 **A.** Yes, largely on the corporate side, because one of the
- things about the staffing of the Welsh Government is
- 24 of course it's not like a Whitehall department, it is
- 25 a whole of government organisation, and at the time that 164

UK Covid-19 Inquiry

2

9

20

21

 I was permanent secretary there was no chief operating officer and those functions came under my group, so therefore some of those people needed to be represented at ExCo for those kinds of decisions. Q. The Inquiry is aware from Andrew Goodall's witness statement that as well as ExCo there is something known as the Welsh Government Board. Was that something that was in existence during your tenure as permanent secretary? A. Very much so, that was a well established body, it met about every six weeks, and it was a body that oversaw governance and general organisational strategy for the Welsh Government. It focused very heavily on governance, risk assessment and preparations of the annual report for the Welsh Government. It also looked after oversight of delivery of the First Minister's priorities for government, and it would carry out on that basis horizon scans and sort of policy discussions to look at progress. Q. I want to next ask you about some changes to the structures that we've been talking about, and also changes in personnel that happened during the pandemic. In your witness statement, paragraph 38 of your witness statement, you explain that a committee named ExCovid was established in February 2020, which you 165 			
 therefore some of those people needed to be represented at ExCo for those kinds of decisions. Q. The Inquiry is aware from Andrew Goodall's witness statement that as well as ExCo there is something known as the Welsh Government Board. Was that something that was in existence during your tenure as permanent secretary? A. Very much so, that was a well established body, it met about every six weeks, and it was a body that oversaw governance and general organisational strategy for the Welsh Government. It focused very heavily on governance, risk assessment and preparations of the annual report for the Welsh Government. It also looked after oversight of delivery of the First Minister's priorities for government, and it would carry out on that basis horizon scans and sort of policy discussions to look at progress. Q. I want to next ask you about some changes to the structures that we've been talking about, and also changes in personnel that happened during the pandemic. In your witness statement, paragraph 38 of your witness statement, you explain that a committee named ExCovid was established in February 2020, which you 165 1 "For example, ExCovid was set up with the intention of it being the senior decision-making and resource allocation body under Ministers, and I think that its terms of reference still reflect that. But we have found in practice that the pace and breadth of decisions 	1		I was permanent secretary there was no chief operating
 4 at ExCo for those kinds of decisions. 5 Q. The Inquiry is aware from Andrew Goodall's witness 6 statement that as well as ExCo there is something known 7 as the Welsh Government Board. Was that something that 8 was in existence during your tenure as 9 permanent secretary? 10 A. Very much so, that was a well established body, it met 11 about every six weeks, and it was a body that oversaw 12 governance and general organisational strategy for the 13 Welsh Government. It focused very heavily on 14 governance, risk assessment and preparations of the 15 annual report for the Welsh Government. It also looked 16 after oversight of delivery of the First Minister's 17 priorities for government, and it would carry out on 18 that basis horizon scans and sort of policy discussions 19 to look at progress. 20 Q. I want to next ask you about some changes to the 21 structures that we've been talking about, and also 22 changes in personnel that happened during the pandemic. 23 In your witness statement, paragraph 38 of your 24 witness statement, you explain that a committee named 25 ExCovid was established in February 2020, which you 165 	2		officer and those functions came under my group, so
 Q. The Inquiry is aware from Andrew Goodall's witness statement that as well as ExCo there is something known as the Welsh Government Board. Was that something that was in existence during your tenure as permanent secretary? A. Very much so, that was a well established body, it met about every six weeks, and it was a body that oversaw governance and general organisational strategy for the Welsh Government. It focused very heavily on governance, risk assessment and preparations of the annual report for the Welsh Government. It also looked after oversight of delivery of the First Minister's priorities for government, and it would carry out on that basis horizon scans and sort of policy discussions to look at progress. Q. I want to next ask you about some changes to the structures that we've been talking about, and also changes in personnel that happened during the pandemic. In your witness statement, paragraph 38 of your witness statement, you explain that a committee named ExCovid was established in February 2020, which you 165 	3		therefore some of those people needed to be represented
 statement that as well as ExCo there is something known as the Welsh Government Board. Was that something that was in existence during your tenure as permanent secretary? A. Very much so, that was a well established body, it met about every six weeks, and it was a body that oversaw governance and general organisational strategy for the Welsh Government. It focused very heavily on governance, risk assessment and preparations of the annual report for the Welsh Government. It also looked after oversight of delivery of the First Minister's priorities for government, and it would carry out on that basis horizon scans and sort of policy discussions to look at progress. Q. I want to next ask you about some changes to the structures that we've been talking about, and also changes in personnel that happened during the pandemic. In your witness statement, paragraph 38 of your witness statement, you explain that a committee named ExCovid was established in February 2020, which you 165 	4		at ExCo for those kinds of decisions.
 as the Welsh Government Board. Was that something that was in existence during your tenure as permanent secretary? A. Very much so, that was a well established body, it met about every six weeks, and it was a body that oversaw governance and general organisational strategy for the Welsh Government. It focused very heavily on governance, risk assessment and preparations of the annual report for the Welsh Government. It also looked after oversight of delivery of the First Minister's priorities for government, and it would carry out on that basis horizon scans and sort of policy discussions to look at progress. Q. I want to next ask you about some changes to the structures that we've been talking about, and also changes in personnel that happened during the pandemic. In your witness statement, paragraph 38 of your witness statement, you explain that a committee named ExCovid was established in February 2020, which you 165 	5	Q.	The Inquiry is aware from Andrew Goodall's witness
 was in existence during your tenure as permanent secretary? A. Very much so, that was a well established body, it met about every six weeks, and it was a body that oversaw governance and general organisational strategy for the Welsh Government. It focused very heavily on governance, risk assessment and preparations of the annual report for the Welsh Government. It also looked after oversight of delivery of the First Minister's priorities for government, and it would carry out on that basis horizon scans and sort of policy discussions to look at progress. Q. I want to next ask you about some changes to the structures that we've been talking about, and also changes in personnel that happened during the pandemic. In your witness statement, paragraph 38 of your witness statement, you explain that a committee named ExCovid was established in February 2020, which you 165 	6		statement that as well as ExCo there is something known
 9 permanent secretary? 10 A. Very much so, that was a well established body, it met about every six weeks, and it was a body that oversaw governance and general organisational strategy for the 13 Welsh Government. It focused very heavily on governance, risk assessment and preparations of the annual report for the Welsh Government. It also looked after oversight of delivery of the First Minister's priorities for government, and it would carry out on that basis horizon scans and sort of policy discussions to look at progress. 20 Q. I want to next ask you about some changes to the structures that we've been talking about, and also changes in personnel that happened during the pandemic. 23 In your witness statement, paragraph 38 of your witness statement, you explain that a committee named ExCovid was established in February 2020, which you 165 1 "For example, ExCovid was set up with the intention of it being the senior decision-making and resource allocation body under Ministers, and I think that its terms of reference still reflect that. But we have found in practice that the pace and breadth of decisions 	7		as the Welsh Government Board. Was that something that
 A. Very much so, that was a well established body, it met about every six weeks, and it was a body that oversaw governance and general organisational strategy for the Welsh Government. It focused very heavily on governance, risk assessment and preparations of the annual report for the Welsh Government. It also looked after oversight of delivery of the First Minister's priorities for government, and it would carry out on that basis horizon scans and sort of policy discussions to look at progress. Q. I want to next ask you about some changes to the structures that we've been talking about, and also changes in personnel that happened during the pandemic. In your witness statement, paragraph 38 of your witness statement, you explain that a committee named ExCovid was established in February 2020, which you 165 1 "For example, ExCovid was set up with the intention of it being the senior decision-making and resource allocation body under Ministers, and I think that its terms of reference still reflect that. But we have found in practice that the pace and breadth of decisions 	8		was in existence during your tenure as
 about every six weeks, and it was a body that oversaw governance and general organisational strategy for the Welsh Government. It focused very heavily on governance, risk assessment and preparations of the annual report for the Welsh Government. It also looked after oversight of delivery of the First Minister's priorities for government, and it would carry out on that basis horizon scans and sort of policy discussions to look at progress. Q. I want to next ask you about some changes to the structures that we've been talking about, and also changes in personnel that happened during the pandemic. In your witness statement, paragraph 38 of your witness statement, you explain that a committee named ExCovid was established in February 2020, which you 165 1 "For example, ExCovid was set up with the intention of it being the senior decision-making and resource allocation body under Ministers, and I think that its terms of reference still reflect that. But we have found in practice that the pace and breadth of decisions 	9		permanent secretary?
 governance and general organisational strategy for the Welsh Government. It focused very heavily on governance, risk assessment and preparations of the annual report for the Welsh Government. It also looked after oversight of delivery of the First Minister's priorities for government, and it would carry out on that basis horizon scans and sort of policy discussions to look at progress. Q. I want to next ask you about some changes to the structures that we've been talking about, and also changes in personnel that happened during the pandemic. In your witness statement, paragraph 38 of your witness statement, you explain that a committee named ExCovid was established in February 2020, which you 165 1 "For example, ExCovid was set up with the intention of it being the senior decision-making and resource allocation body under Ministers, and I think that its terms of reference still reflect that. But we have found in practice that the pace and breadth of decisions 	10	Α.	Very much so, that was a well established body, it met
 Welsh Government. It focused very heavily on governance, risk assessment and preparations of the annual report for the Welsh Government. It also looked after oversight of delivery of the First Minister's priorities for government, and it would carry out on that basis horizon scans and sort of policy discussions to look at progress. I want to next ask you about some changes to the structures that we've been talking about, and also changes in personnel that happened during the pandemic. In your witness statement, paragraph 38 of your witness statement, you explain that a committee named ExCovid was established in February 2020, which you 165 "For example, ExCovid was set up with the intention of it being the senior decision-making and resource allocation body under Ministers, and I think that its terms of reference still reflect that. But we have found in practice that the pace and breadth of decisions 	11		about every six weeks, and it was a body that oversaw
 governance, risk assessment and preparations of the annual report for the Welsh Government. It also looked after oversight of delivery of the First Minister's priorities for government, and it would carry out on that basis horizon scans and sort of policy discussions to look at progress. Q. I want to next ask you about some changes to the structures that we've been talking about, and also changes in personnel that happened during the pandemic. In your witness statement, paragraph 38 of your witness statement, you explain that a committee named ExCovid was established in February 2020, which you 165 1 "For example, ExCovid was set up with the intention of it being the senior decision-making and resource allocation body under Ministers, and I think that its terms of reference still reflect that. But we have found in practice that the pace and breadth of decisions 	12		governance and general organisational strategy for the
 annual report for the Welsh Government. It also looked after oversight of delivery of the First Minister's priorities for government, and it would carry out on that basis horizon scans and sort of policy discussions to look at progress. Q. I want to next ask you about some changes to the structures that we've been talking about, and also changes in personnel that happened during the pandemic. In your witness statement, paragraph 38 of your witness statement, you explain that a committee named ExCovid was established in February 2020, which you 1 "For example, ExCovid was set up with the intention of it being the senior decision-making and resource allocation body under Ministers, and I think that its terms of reference still reflect that. But we have found in practice that the pace and breadth of decisions 	13		Welsh Government. It focused very heavily on
 after oversight of delivery of the First Minister's priorities for government, and it would carry out on that basis horizon scans and sort of policy discussions to look at progress. Q. I want to next ask you about some changes to the structures that we've been talking about, and also changes in personnel that happened during the pandemic. In your witness statement, paragraph 38 of your witness statement, you explain that a committee named ExCovid was established in February 2020, which you 1 "For example, ExCovid was set up with the intention of it being the senior decision-making and resource allocation body under Ministers, and I think that its terms of reference still reflect that. But we have found in practice that the pace and breadth of decisions 	14		governance, risk assessment and preparations of the
 priorities for government, and it would carry out on that basis horizon scans and sort of policy discussions to look at progress. Q. I want to next ask you about some changes to the structures that we've been talking about, and also changes in personnel that happened during the pandemic. In your witness statement, paragraph 38 of your witness statement, you explain that a committee named ExCovid was established in February 2020, which you 1 "For example, ExCovid was set up with the intention of it being the senior decision-making and resource allocation body under Ministers, and I think that its terms of reference still reflect that. But we have found in practice that the pace and breadth of decisions 	15		annual report for the Welsh Government. It also looked
 that basis horizon scans and sort of policy discussions to look at progress. Q. I want to next ask you about some changes to the structures that we've been talking about, and also changes in personnel that happened during the pandemic. In your witness statement, paragraph 38 of your witness statement, you explain that a committee named ExCovid was established in February 2020, which you 1 "For example, ExCovid was set up with the intention of it being the senior decision-making and resource allocation body under Ministers, and I think that its terms of reference still reflect that. But we have found in practice that the pace and breadth of decisions 	16		after oversight of delivery of the First Minister's
 to look at progress. Q. I want to next ask you about some changes to the structures that we've been talking about, and also changes in personnel that happened during the pandemic. In your witness statement, paragraph 38 of your witness statement, you explain that a committee named ExCovid was established in February 2020, which you 165 "For example, ExCovid was set up with the intention of it being the senior decision-making and resource allocation body under Ministers, and I think that its terms of reference still reflect that. But we have found in practice that the pace and breadth of decisions 	17		priorities for government, and it would carry out on
 Q. I want to next ask you about some changes to the structures that we've been talking about, and also changes in personnel that happened during the pandemic. In your witness statement, paragraph 38 of your witness statement, you explain that a committee named ExCovid was established in February 2020, which you 165 "For example, ExCovid was set up with the intention of it being the senior decision-making and resource allocation body under Ministers, and I think that its terms of reference still reflect that. But we have found in practice that the pace and breadth of decisions 	18		that basis horizon scans and sort of policy discussions
 structures that we've been talking about, and also changes in personnel that happened during the pandemic. In your witness statement, paragraph 38 of your witness statement, you explain that a committee named ExCovid was established in February 2020, which you 165 "For example, ExCovid was set up with the intention of it being the senior decision-making and resource allocation body under Ministers, and I think that its terms of reference still reflect that. But we have found in practice that the pace and breadth of decisions 	19		to look at progress.
 changes in personnel that happened during the pandemic. In your witness statement, paragraph 38 of your witness statement, you explain that a committee named ExCovid was established in February 2020, which you 165 "For example, ExCovid was set up with the intention of it being the senior decision-making and resource allocation body under Ministers, and I think that its terms of reference still reflect that. But we have found in practice that the pace and breadth of decisions 	20	Q.	I want to next ask you about some changes to the
 In your witness statement, paragraph 38 of your witness statement, you explain that a committee named ExCovid was established in February 2020, which you 165 "For example, ExCovid was set up with the intention of it being the senior decision-making and resource allocation body under Ministers, and I think that its terms of reference still reflect that. But we have found in practice that the pace and breadth of decisions 	21		structures that we've been talking about, and also
 witness statement, you explain that a committee named ExCovid was established in February 2020, which you 165 "For example, ExCovid was set up with the intention of it being the senior decision-making and resource allocation body under Ministers, and I think that its terms of reference still reflect that. But we have found in practice that the pace and breadth of decisions 	22		changes in personnel that happened during the pandemic.
 ExCovid was established in February 2020, which you 165 "For example, ExCovid was set up with the intention of it being the senior decision-making and resource allocation body under Ministers, and I think that its terms of reference still reflect that. But we have found in practice that the pace and breadth of decisions 	23		In your witness statement, paragraph 38 of your
 165 "For example, ExCovid was set up with the intention of it being the senior decision-making and resource allocation body under Ministers, and I think that its terms of reference still reflect that. But we have found in practice that the pace and breadth of decisions 	24		witness statement, you explain that a committee named
 "For example, ExCovid was set up with the intention of it being the senior decision-making and resource allocation body under Ministers, and I think that its terms of reference still reflect that. But we have found in practice that the pace and breadth of decisions 	25		ExCovid was established in February 2020, which you
 of it being the senior decision-making and resource allocation body under Ministers, and I think that its terms of reference still reflect that. But we have found in practice that the pace and breadth of decisions 			165
 of it being the senior decision-making and resource allocation body under Ministers, and I think that its terms of reference still reflect that. But we have found in practice that the pace and breadth of decisions 			
 allocation body under Ministers, and I think that its terms of reference still reflect that. But we have found in practice that the pace and breadth of decisions 	1		"For example, ExCovid was set up with the intention
 4 terms of reference still reflect that. But we have 5 found in practice that the pace and breadth of decisions 	2		of it being the senior decision-making and resource
5 found in practice that the pace and breadth of decisions	3		allocation body under Ministers, and I think that its
	4		terms of reference still reflect that. But we have
6 needed made it impossible for ExCovid to fulfil that	5		found in practice that the pace and breadth of decisions
•	6		needed made it impossible for ExCovid to fulfil that

- 7 role and instead it acts in a strategic co-ordination 8 and information-sharing role, which works very well; but 9 is not how we envisaged it at the start." 10 So, first question: I mean, do you agree with that 11 comment?
- 12 A. Yes, I do.

25

13	Q.	Did the actual role played by ExCovid change from its
14		intended role and, if so, why did it change?
15	Α.	I think it evolved very quickly indeed to reflect what
16		the organisation needed. It needed to make sure that
17		everybody was joined up, that information was shared
18		across the organisation, that everybody had access to
19		the same understanding of what was happening. But,
20		going back to what I said earlier on, it was very clear
21		that decisions other than about resources, all policy
22		decisions were for ministers.
23	Q.	Generally, whilst we're looking at one of these lessons
24		learned documents, do you believe that the lessons

learned exercises that were undertaken by ExCovid

167

- 1 chaired until your departure from the civil service in
 - October 2021; is that right?
- 3 A. That's right.
- 4 Q. Just briefly tell us, what was the purpose of ExCovid?
- **A.** The purpose of ExCovid was to bring together the key 5
- 6 senior policy officials and operational officials
- 7 involved in responding to the pandemic. It followed
- 8 a format that had been successful in preparations for
 - a no-deal Brexit, and therefore I adopted that. So it
- 10 was a similar but expanded membership to ExCo, which was
- 11 the sort of corporate decision-making function. ExCovid
- 12 was not there to take decisions other than in relation 13
- to prioritisation of areas of work and re-prioritisation
- 14 of resources within the organisation.
- 15 Q. In October 2020, I think you decided that ExCovid would
- 16 undertake a lessons learned exercise. We'll return to
- 17 this in a bit more detail later in your evidence, but
- just turning to one document at this stage. 18 19
 - If I can have INQ000300004 -- thank you very much --
 - this is the response of the permanent secretaries group
 - to that lessons learned exercise; so that's a group that
- 22 sits under you. On this page under "Observations: What do you think worked less well?"
- 23
- 24 So we're looking bottom right, thank you. And then, 25 "For example", yes:
 - 166

1		involved adequate self-reflection on the areas that did
2		require improvement?
3	Α.	I think so. I think we got better at it as time went
4		on, and they I found them incredibly valuable. It
5		was an important mirror for us to look at, and of course
6		it gave rise to follow-up action as well.
7	Q.	As of December 2021, I understand that ExCovid's role
8		and remit were transferred to ExCo. Now, I appreciate
9		you had left post by this time. Are you able to comment
10		as to why it transferred back to ExCo?
11	Α.	I can't comment from any particular knowledge.
12		I imagine Andrew Goodall, my successor, decided that
13		there was at that point some duplication and the need
14		for ExCovid, which I think we had all felt was a very
15		valid body, had gone away.
16	Q.	I mean, given that the membership of ExCovid was, as
17		I understand it, the normal membership of ExCo plus
18		I think five additional members, why was it felt that
19		ExCo, which was a body already in existence, couldn't
20		simply absorb the work that was undertaken by ExCovid?
21		Was there a need for there to be two bodies?
22	Α.	I believe there was a need for two bodies. In the
23		beginning ExCovid met, I think, twice a week at the most
24		difficult times and we did something in ExCovid that we
25		didn't do in ExCo, which was to have what we called 168

1	deep dives on subjects, which meant that policy	1		Can you explain to me what did you understand those
2	officials across the whole of the Welsh Government were	2		concerns to be and when were they first raised with you?
3	being exposed to, for example, the risks involved in	3		This is obviously an email of 20 March 2020.
4	a very wide range of policy areas.	4	Α.	The concern I picked up was that we weren't joining up
	You referred there to deep dives, and I think it's also	5		well enough across the whole of the Welsh Government,
6 7	known as sort of challenge sessions, and in your witness	6		that was something that I was trying to rectify with the
7	statement you specifically recall a deep dive into the	7		establishment of ExCovid, so we intensified that
8	harms to children and young people. Can you recall what	8	~	process.
9 10 A .	other deep dives were undertaken?	9 10	Q.	You say in this email Andrew Slade who was at the time, I think, director general for Economy, Skills and
10 A. 11	There were a very wide range. We looked at the vaccinations programme, we looked at international	10		Natural Resources could move some of his senior staff
12	comparators, we looked at children and young people,	12		to a wider role within Welsh Government. And then,
12	I think a couple of times, we looked at care homes, the	12		three paragraphs down, in respect of Tim Render, I think
14	winter planning of the NHS; a very wide variety over	13		it's suggested that he says there:
14	time.	14		
16 Q .		15		" head up a new team responsible for policy response co-ordination and strategic planning."
10 u . 17	than changes to structures.	10		And then goes on in the fourth paragraph, you say:
18	If we can have a look, please, at INQ000299055.	17		"The new team would obviously sit alongside Reg's
19	Bottom email, please, on this chain, it's an email from	10		role on ECC(W), COBR and LRFs/SCGs, Amelia's work of
20	you on 20 March to the four director generals, copies in	20		shielding and Jo's role as head of the Preparedness
21	a number of other officials within the Welsh Government.	20		Group. But I'm clear we need some serious forward
22	Yes, at the top of the page, you say:	22		planning alongside the other excellent teams we have in
23	"I'm picking up signals that SpAds and Ministers are	23		place."
24	getting increasingly concerned about a lack of overall	24		Now, at this stage ExCovid had been established,
25	coordination on our policy response to Coronavirus."	25		I think Reg Kilpatrick was a member of ExCovid in his
	169			170
1	conceity on the disactor with second shills for sivil	1		resilience team or any other team in evictors?
1 2	capacity as the director with responsibility for civil contingencies and emergency planning. I think I'm right	1 2		resilience team or any other team in existence? I suppose my question is: did there need to be another
2 3	in saying Reg Kilpatrick also led the resilience team	2		team added to already a multiplicity of teams?
3 4	which was operating out of the Emergency Coordination	4	۸	ExCo was not a team, ExCo was a committee. The Covid
4 5	Centre Wales, as is acknowledged in this paragraph we're	4 5	A.	project team was what evolved over time to provide some
6	looking at. Is the new team that's being proposed in	6		of the underpinning work. So Tim sat within that for
7	this email, is that the Covid project team, can you	7		a while, before he moved back to his previous role in
8	recall?	8		what was called ESNR, working on rural affairs.
9 A .		9	Q.	If we could I think it's in the same chain but
10	team. I knew I'd worked with Tim when I was in	10	.	further yes, further up page 6. Thank you very much.
11	Brussels, I knew him well, I knew he had some really	10		This is an email from Des Clifford, it's right at the
12	good experience when he worked in DEFRA on crisis and	12		bottom of the page, second paragraph, third line, where
13	emergency planning for dealing with floods. I wanted to	13		he is saying:
14	bring that expertise into the centre.	10		"One possible drawback to creating the mooted
15	Going back to what I said early on, I was conscious	15		central policy approach (and I agree that Tim is good at
16	that we were heavily reliant on quite a small core of	16		this sort of thing) is that it risks baking in further
17	staff and we moved them around, as Andrew Slade agreed	17		confusion about accountability [Document read]
18	to do there. We had to be very flexible, very fast	18		to the central team as opposed to existing directorate
19	acting to make sure that we were moving people with the	19		structures."
20	right skills to the right place.	20		Did you appreciate the concerns that were being
21 Q .		20		expressed here by Des Clifford about confusions about
22	would head up, was that new team given a name?	22		accountability lines?
	I don't remember the name, I'm afraid.	23	Α.	I did, but I felt I knew the skills that Tim could
	-	24		bring, and he for me was the right person at the right
24 Q .				
24 Q . 25	could that have been absorbed into ExCovid or the	25		time to add those skills.

(43) Pages 169 - 172

1 Q .	. In June 2020 you were involved in the establishment of	1		the same time to Simon Brindle.
2	the recovery secretariat. We don't need the email,	2	Q.	If we can have on screen, please I think it's another
3	thank you. That was implemented in, as I said, in	3		organogram, it's INQ000066097, but this time we've move
4	June 2020 on your advice to the First Minister. Can you	4		forward to January 2021. We can see that
5	just briefly explain why the recovery secretariat was	5		Reg Kilpatrick, along with being director for local
6	established and what its role was?	6		government, is now director general Covid-19, and we see
7 A .	The recovery secretariat was established to take	7		his name at the bottom of that group.
8	a forward look. Much of the infrastructure that we've	8		Now, in your witness statement you confirm that in
9	talked about so far was about the immediate response to	9		September 2020, following discussions between yourself
10	the pandemic, but it became clear that we needed to do	10		and the four director generals, and also obviously the
11	more forward planning, forward thinking on how we would	11		agreement of the First Minister, Reg Kilpatrick was
12	work to towards a recovery, and that's what the	12		appointed to this new director general role.
13	recovery secretariat was there for.	13		If we look at this organisational chart, as at
14 Q .	. And Simon Brindle was appointed to the role of director	14		January 2021 Reg Kilpatrick, as a new director general,
15	of recovery. In Reg Kilpatrick's witness statement to	15		appears obviously still to sit under within
16	the Inquiry, he outlines at around this time so this	16		Tracey Burke's group as director general for education
17	is June 2020 responsibility for the 21-day review	17		and public services.
18	process transferred to Simon Brindle. Does that accord	18		Was the intention that Reg Kilpatrick would be
19	with your recollection?	19		a director general, would lead his own group, or sit
20 A .	It does.	20		within one, or was this a distinction without any
21 Q .	. Was it right that, up until that transfer, it was	21		meaning?
22	Reg Kilpatrick that had been responsible for the 21-day	22	Α.	The intention was that he should lead his own group, and
23	review process; is that right?	23		he did.
24 A .	That's right, it came under him until he was promoted to	24	Q.	Dame Shan, I'd like to next ask you some questions,
25	director general, and then it moved across pretty much	25		then, about informal methods of communication during th
1	pandemic, in particular the policies that were in place	1		of Welsh ministers and officials, including yourself,
2	during your time as permanent secretary, dealing with the use of informal communications, which obviously	2		did have WhatsApp on personal mobiles and also, in the
3	The use of informal communications, which opviously	<u>^</u>		case of Welsh ministers, Welsh ministers had WhatsApp
	-	3		
4	include text and WhatsApp.	4		enabled on their Senedd mobile phones. You were awar
5	include text and WhatsApp. Just like to look at some of those policies with	4 5		enabled on their Senedd mobile phones. You were aware of that?
5 6	include text and WhatsApp. Just like to look at some of those policies with you. First is a document from January 2020, it's	4 5 6		enabled on their Senedd mobile phones. You were award of that? I wasn't aware of that actually.
5 6 7	include text and WhatsApp. Just like to look at some of those policies with you. First is a document from January 2020, it's INQ000396686, it's called a SIRO notice, Senior	4 5 6 7		enabled on their Senedd mobile phones. You were award of that? I wasn't aware of that actually. So at the time you weren't aware of the point I made
5 6 7 8	include text and WhatsApp. Just like to look at some of those policies with you. First is a document from January 2020, it's INQ000396686, it's called a SIRO notice, Senior Information Risk Owner notice, and it's entitled	4 5 6 7 8	Q.	enabled on their Senedd mobile phones. You were award of that? I wasn't aware of that actually. So at the time you weren't aware of the point I made about the use of WhatsApp on the Senedd phones?
5 6 7 8 9	include text and WhatsApp. Just like to look at some of those policies with you. First is a document from January 2020, it's INQ000396686, it's called a SIRO notice, Senior Information Risk Owner notice, and it's entitled "Social media".	4 5 6 7 8 9		enabled on their Senedd mobile phones. You were award of that? I wasn't aware of that actually. So at the time you weren't aware of the point I made about the use of WhatsApp on the Senedd phones? Not on the Senedd phones, because I have no no
5 6 7 8 9 10	include text and WhatsApp. Just like to look at some of those policies with you. First is a document from January 2020, it's INQ000396686, it's called a SIRO notice, Senior Information Risk Owner notice, and it's entitled "Social media". As we can see from the box at the top of this page,	4 5 7 8 9 10	Q.	enabled on their Senedd mobile phones. You were award of that? I wasn't aware of that actually. So at the time you weren't aware of the point I made about the use of WhatsApp on the Senedd phones? Not on the Senedd phones, because I have no no contact with direct contact with the Senedd
5 6 7 8 9 10 11	include text and WhatsApp. Just like to look at some of those policies with you. First is a document from January 2020, it's INQ000396686, it's called a SIRO notice, Senior Information Risk Owner notice, and it's entitled "Social media". As we can see from the box at the top of this page, the purpose of the notice is to indicate	4 5 7 8 9 10 11	Q.	enabled on their Senedd mobile phones. You were aware of that? I wasn't aware of that actually. So at the time you weren't aware of the point I made about the use of WhatsApp on the Senedd phones? Not on the Senedd phones, because I have no no contact with direct contact with the Senedd structures. But obviously I was very clear, in line
5 6 7 8 9 10 11	include text and WhatsApp. Just like to look at some of those policies with you. First is a document from January 2020, it's INQ000396686, it's called a SIRO notice, Senior Information Risk Owner notice, and it's entitled "Social media". As we can see from the box at the top of this page, the purpose of the notice is to indicate organisation-wide changes to procedures that must be	4 5 7 8 9 10 11 12	Q.	enabled on their Senedd mobile phones. You were award of that? I wasn't aware of that actually. So at the time you weren't aware of the point I made about the use of WhatsApp on the Senedd phones? Not on the Senedd phones, because I have no no contact with direct contact with the Senedd structures. But obviously I was very clear, in line with this memo, that the Welsh Government phones could
5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	include text and WhatsApp. Just like to look at some of those policies with you. First is a document from January 2020, it's INQ000396686, it's called a SIRO notice, Senior Information Risk Owner notice, and it's entitled "Social media". As we can see from the box at the top of this page, the purpose of the notice is to indicate organisation-wide changes to procedures that must be adopted by all divisions of the Welsh Government.	4 5 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	Q. A.	enabled on their Senedd mobile phones. You were award of that? I wasn't aware of that actually. So at the time you weren't aware of the point I made about the use of WhatsApp on the Senedd phones? Not on the Senedd phones, because I have no no contact with direct contact with the Senedd structures. But obviously I was very clear, in line with this memo, that the Welsh Government phones could not support WhatsApp.
5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	include text and WhatsApp. Just like to look at some of those policies with you. First is a document from January 2020, it's INQ000396686, it's called a SIRO notice, Senior Information Risk Owner notice, and it's entitled "Social media". As we can see from the box at the top of this page, the purpose of the notice is to indicate organisation-wide changes to procedures that must be adopted by all divisions of the Welsh Government. And if we could please go to page 2 of this	4 5 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	Q.	enabled on their Senedd mobile phones. You were award of that? I wasn't aware of that actually. So at the time you weren't aware of the point I made about the use of WhatsApp on the Senedd phones? Not on the Senedd phones, because I have no no contact with direct contact with the Senedd structures. But obviously I was very clear, in line with this memo, that the Welsh Government phones could not support WhatsApp. But you were aware obviously you were using WhatsApp
5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	include text and WhatsApp. Just like to look at some of those policies with you. First is a document from January 2020, it's INQ000396686, it's called a SIRO notice, Senior Information Risk Owner notice, and it's entitled "Social media". As we can see from the box at the top of this page, the purpose of the notice is to indicate organisation-wide changes to procedures that must be adopted by all divisions of the Welsh Government. And if we could please go to page 2 of this document, under the heading "WhatsApp" it says:	4 5 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	Q. A.	 enabled on their Senedd mobile phones. You were award of that? I wasn't aware of that actually. So at the time you weren't aware of the point I made about the use of WhatsApp on the Senedd phones? Not on the Senedd phones, because I have no no contact with direct contact with the Senedd structures. But obviously I was very clear, in line with this memo, that the Welsh Government phones could not support WhatsApp. But you were aware obviously you were using WhatsApp on your own personal mobile; were you aware that Welsh
5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	include text and WhatsApp. Just like to look at some of those policies with you. First is a document from January 2020, it's INQ000396686, it's called a SIRO notice, Senior Information Risk Owner notice, and it's entitled "Social media". As we can see from the box at the top of this page, the purpose of the notice is to indicate organisation-wide changes to procedures that must be adopted by all divisions of the Welsh Government. And if we could please go to page 2 of this document, under the heading "WhatsApp" it says: "A summary of our position on WhatsApp is that its	4 5 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	Q. A.	 enabled on their Senedd mobile phones. You were award of that? I wasn't aware of that actually. So at the time you weren't aware of the point I made about the use of WhatsApp on the Senedd phones? Not on the Senedd phones, because I have no no contact with direct contact with the Senedd structures. But obviously I was very clear, in line with this memo, that the Welsh Government phones could not support WhatsApp. But you were aware obviously you were using WhatsApp on your own personal mobile; were you aware that Welsh ministers and Welsh officials were using WhatsApp on
5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	include text and WhatsApp. Just like to look at some of those policies with you. First is a document from January 2020, it's INQ000396686, it's called a SIRO notice, Senior Information Risk Owner notice, and it's entitled "Social media". As we can see from the box at the top of this page, the purpose of the notice is to indicate organisation-wide changes to procedures that must be adopted by all divisions of the Welsh Government. And if we could please go to page 2 of this document, under the heading "WhatsApp" it says: "A summary of our position on WhatsApp is that its use does not allow us to comply with our legal	4 5 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	Q. A. Q.	 enabled on their Senedd mobile phones. You were award of that? I wasn't aware of that actually. So at the time you weren't aware of the point I made about the use of WhatsApp on the Senedd phones? Not on the Senedd phones, because I have no no contact with direct contact with the Senedd structures. But obviously I was very clear, in line with this memo, that the Welsh Government phones could not support WhatsApp. But you were aware obviously you were using WhatsApp on your own personal mobile; were you aware that Welsh ministers and Welsh officials were using WhatsApp on their personal mobiles?
5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	include text and WhatsApp. Just like to look at some of those policies with you. First is a document from January 2020, it's INQ000396686, it's called a SIRO notice, Senior Information Risk Owner notice, and it's entitled "Social media". As we can see from the box at the top of this page, the purpose of the notice is to indicate organisation-wide changes to procedures that must be adopted by all divisions of the Welsh Government. And if we could please go to page 2 of this document, under the heading "WhatsApp" it says: "A summary of our position on WhatsApp is that its use does not allow us to comply with our legal responsibilities as a data controller. The	4 5 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	Q. A.	 enabled on their Senedd mobile phones. You were aware of that? I wasn't aware of that actually. So at the time you weren't aware of the point I made about the use of WhatsApp on the Senedd phones? Not on the Senedd phones, because I have no no contact with direct contact with the Senedd structures. But obviously I was very clear, in line with this memo, that the Welsh Government phones could not support WhatsApp. But you were aware obviously you were using WhatsApp on your own personal mobile; were you aware that Welsh ministers and Welsh officials were using WhatsApp on their personal mobiles? I wasn't directly aware, but I would have assumed that
5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19	 include text and WhatsApp. Just like to look at some of those policies with you. First is a document from January 2020, it's INQ000396686, it's called a SIRO notice, Senior Information Risk Owner notice, and it's entitled "Social media". As we can see from the box at the top of this page, the purpose of the notice is to indicate organisation-wide changes to procedures that must be adopted by all divisions of the Welsh Government. And if we could please go to page 2 of this document, under the heading "WhatsApp" it says: "A summary of our position on WhatsApp is that its use does not allow us to comply with our legal responsibilities as a data controller. The [Document read] may not be used for Welsh Government 	4 5 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19	Q. A. Q.	 enabled on their Senedd mobile phones. You were awar of that? I wasn't aware of that actually. So at the time you weren't aware of the point I made about the use of WhatsApp on the Senedd phones? Not on the Senedd phones, because I have no no contact with direct contact with the Senedd structures. But obviously I was very clear, in line with this memo, that the Welsh Government phones could not support WhatsApp. But you were aware obviously you were using WhatsApp on your own personal mobile; were you aware that Welsh ministers and Welsh officials were using WhatsApp on their personal mobiles? I wasn't directly aware, but I would have assumed that they would do.
5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	 include text and WhatsApp. Just like to look at some of those policies with you. First is a document from January 2020, it's INQ000396686, it's called a SIRO notice, Senior Information Risk Owner notice, and it's entitled "Social media". As we can see from the box at the top of this page, the purpose of the notice is to indicate organisation-wide changes to procedures that must be adopted by all divisions of the Welsh Government. And if we could please go to page 2 of this document, under the heading "WhatsApp" it says: "A summary of our position on WhatsApp is that its use does not allow us to comply with our legal responsibilities as a data controller. The [Document read] may not be used for Welsh Government business." 	4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	Q. A. Q.	 enabled on their Senedd mobile phones. You were awar of that? I wasn't aware of that actually. So at the time you weren't aware of the point I made about the use of WhatsApp on the Senedd phones? Not on the Senedd phones, because I have no no contact with direct contact with the Senedd structures. But obviously I was very clear, in line with this memo, that the Welsh Government phones coul not support WhatsApp. But you were aware obviously you were using WhatsApp on their personal mobile; were you aware that Welsh ministers and Welsh officials were using WhatsApp on their personal mobiles? I wasn't directly aware, but I would have assumed that they would do. Now, there's no definition of "Welsh Government
5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	 include text and WhatsApp. Just like to look at some of those policies with you. First is a document from January 2020, it's INQ000396686, it's called a SIRO notice, Senior Information Risk Owner notice, and it's entitled "Social media". As we can see from the box at the top of this page, the purpose of the notice is to indicate organisation-wide changes to procedures that must be adopted by all divisions of the Welsh Government. And if we could please go to page 2 of this document, under the heading "WhatsApp" it says: "A summary of our position on WhatsApp is that its use does not allow us to comply with our legal responsibilities as a data controller. The [Document read] may not be used for Welsh Government business." 	4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	Q. A. Q.	 enabled on their Senedd mobile phones. You were awar of that? I wasn't aware of that actually. So at the time you weren't aware of the point I made about the use of WhatsApp on the Senedd phones? Not on the Senedd phones, because I have no no contact with direct contact with the Senedd structures. But obviously I was very clear, in line with this memo, that the Welsh Government phones coul not support WhatsApp. But you were aware obviously you were using WhatsApp on your own personal mobile; were you aware that Welsh ministers and Welsh officials were using WhatsApp on their personal mobile? I wasn't directly aware, but I would have assumed that they would do. Now, there's no definition of "Welsh Government business", but would you accept that discussing and
5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	 include text and WhatsApp. Just like to look at some of those policies with you. First is a document from January 2020, it's INQ000396686, it's called a SIRO notice, Senior Information Risk Owner notice, and it's entitled "Social media". As we can see from the box at the top of this page, the purpose of the notice is to indicate organisation-wide changes to procedures that must be adopted by all divisions of the Welsh Government. And if we could please go to page 2 of this document, under the heading "WhatsApp" it says: "A summary of our position on WhatsApp is that its use does not allow us to comply with our legal responsibilities as a data controller. The [Document read] may not be used for Welsh Government business." Now, it is right, isn't it, that the Welsh Government did not allow the use of WhatsApp on Welsh 	4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	Q. A. Q.	 enabled on their Senedd mobile phones. You were award of that? I wasn't aware of that actually. So at the time you weren't aware of the point I made about the use of WhatsApp on the Senedd phones? Not on the Senedd phones, because I have no no contact with direct contact with the Senedd structures. But obviously I was very clear, in line with this memo, that the Welsh Government phones could not support WhatsApp. But you were aware obviously you were using WhatsApp on their personal mobile; were you aware that Welsh ministers and Welsh officials were using WhatsApp on their personal mobiles? I wasn't directly aware, but I would have assumed that they would do. Now, there's no definition of "Welsh Government policy on the personal mobiles"
5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	 include text and WhatsApp. Just like to look at some of those policies with you. First is a document from January 2020, it's INQ000396686, it's called a SIRO notice, Senior Information Risk Owner notice, and it's entitled "Social media". As we can see from the box at the top of this page, the purpose of the notice is to indicate organisation-wide changes to procedures that must be adopted by all divisions of the Welsh Government. And if we could please go to page 2 of this document, under the heading "WhatsApp" it says: "A summary of our position on WhatsApp is that its use does not allow us to comply with our legal responsibilities as a data controller. The [Document read] may not be used for Welsh Government business." Now, it is right, isn't it, that the Welsh Government did not allow the use of WhatsApp on Welsh Government devices, so Welsh Government mobile phones? 	4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	Q. A. Q. Q.	 enabled on their Senedd mobile phones. You were award of that? I wasn't aware of that actually. So at the time you weren't aware of the point I made about the use of WhatsApp on the Senedd phones? Not on the Senedd phones, because I have no no contact with direct contact with the Senedd structures. But obviously I was very clear, in line with this memo, that the Welsh Government phones could not support WhatsApp. But you were aware obviously you were using WhatsApp on your own personal mobile; were you aware that Welsh ministers and Welsh officials were using WhatsApp on their personal mobiles? I wasn't directly aware, but I would have assumed that they would do. Now, there's no definition of "Welsh Government business", but would you accept that discussing and commenting upon Welsh Government policy on the person WhatsApp account would fall foul of this notice?
5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	 include text and WhatsApp. Just like to look at some of those policies with you. First is a document from January 2020, it's INQ000396686, it's called a SIRO notice, Senior Information Risk Owner notice, and it's entitled "Social media". As we can see from the box at the top of this page, the purpose of the notice is to indicate organisation-wide changes to procedures that must be adopted by all divisions of the Welsh Government. And if we could please go to page 2 of this document, under the heading "WhatsApp" it says: "A summary of our position on WhatsApp is that its use does not allow us to comply with our legal responsibilities as a data controller. The [Document read] may not be used for Welsh Government business." Now, it is right, isn't it, that the Welsh Government did not allow the use of WhatsApp on Welsh Government devices, so Welsh Government mobile phones? That's right. 	4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	Q. A. Q.	 enabled on their Senedd mobile phones. You were aware of that? I wasn't aware of that actually. So at the time you weren't aware of the point I made about the use of WhatsApp on the Senedd phones? Not on the Senedd phones, because I have no no contact with direct contact with the Senedd structures. But obviously I was very clear, in line with this memo, that the Welsh Government phones could not support WhatsApp. But you were aware obviously you were using WhatsApp on your own personal mobile; were you aware that Welsh ministers and Welsh officials were using WhatsApp on their personal mobiles? I wasn't directly aware, but I would have assumed that they would do. Now, there's no definition of "Welsh Government business", but would you accept that discussing and commenting upon Welsh Government policy on the personal

(44) Pages 173 - 176

UK Covid-19 Inqu

1		taken in relation to Welsh Government business by	1
2		WhatsApp on private mobiles.	2
3	Q.	We'll come on to the content of some of the messages in	3
4		a moment, a bit later in your evidence. But it's right,	4
5		isn't it, that throughout the pandemic, whilst you were	5
6		permanent secretary, you were in a WhatsApp group with	6
7		Andrew Goodall, Andrew Slade, Tracey Burke? I think	7
8		that group is frequently referred to as "the quintet",	8
9		so that's a reference to the regular meetings	9
10		established across the director generals.	10
11		So in that group, to take one example, which we'll	11
12		come back to in a moment, you sent a message asking:	12
13		"Any questions for my phone call with Chris Wormald	13
14		at 1400 hours."	14
15		Would you agree that a question of that nature,	15
16		although it is not making a decision, but a question of	16
17		that nature is conducting Welsh Government business?	17
18	Α.	I would say that it was just a way of getting quick	18
19		information, much more quickly than by any other route	19
20		available. It would obviously have come ultimately in	20
21		an email, so through the proper channels, and after the	21
22		meeting with Chris Wormald I would have sent round	22
23		a short note, not via WhatsApp but via email, that could	23
24		be recorded. So for me that was just a quick heads-up	24
25		that we needed some urgent action, rather than any kind	25
		177	
1		and preserve record content."	1
2		Is that as we've just discussed, that's putting	2
3		in black and white what we've just discussed, namely the	3
4		importance of retention of	4
5	Α.	Exactly.	5
6	Q.	records, if they're created on, as it says, ephemeral	6
7		means such as text messages or	7
8		So this policy was informing those working within	8
9		the Welsh Government about this need for proper	9
10		management and preservation. This obviously was	10
11		a policy that was in place throughout the pandemic.	11
12		That's right, isn't it?	12
13		We haven't seen anything this was in place,	13
14		although it's dated "last reviewed February 2019", it	14
15		was in place whilst you were permanent secretary?	15
16	Α.	That's right.	16
17	Q.	Now, the next document, please, INQ000396694.	17
18		Now, this is an email sent on 29 October 2020. It's	18
19		copied to you. If we can just have a look at the second	19
20		paragraph, please:	20
21		"In the last few weeks [Document read] civil	21
22		servant."	22
23		Then it goes on talk about:	23
24		"Our corporate platform is [Document read]	24
25		chat feature."	25

nquiry	y	4 March 2024
1		of decision or business being conducted.
2	LAI	DY HALLETT: For those who don't know him,
3		Sir Chris Wormald, permanent secretary at the Department
4		of Health and Social Care in the UK Government.
5		Thank you.
6	MR	POOLE: Thank you, my Lady.
7		So for you the key would be, even if there has been
8		a conversation in WhatsApp, it is recording after the
9		event the if it is Welsh Government business, that
10		has to be recorded either by an email or some other form
11		that is retained?
12	Α.	That is very clear in the guidance.
13	Q.	We can have a look at a second document, INQ000396685.
14		This is, as it says there, Welsh Government information
15		management and governance policy published August 2018
16		and then last reviewed February 2019. Can we have
17		a look at page 2, please. It describes the policy, so
18		its policy defines the way Welsh Government information
19		and records should be managed. You're described as the
20		policy owner. We don't need to go to it, but you signed
21		this policy off on page 7.
22		If we could have a look, please, at page 17,
23		paragraph 6.6, it says here:
24		"Text or 'instant messages' are electronic mail and
25		messaging systems used for the [Document read] 178
1		Prior to receiving this email, were you aware that
2		Welsh Government officials were not following policies,
3		were not recording discussions back to iShare as they
4		should have been, and, perhaps more worryingly, were
5		being pressured into using personal WhatsApp accounts
6		for Welsh Government business?

7 Α. I was not aware that anybody was under any pressure at all to use WhatsApp, personal WhatsApp accounts for 8 9 Welsh Government business. Had I heard that, then 10 I would have stamped on that immediately, obviously. 11 I had discussed this issue with Peter Kennedy because 12 I was the policy owner myself, so I was aware of his 13 concerns. 14 I should say in this whole area of informal

15 communications there were, if you like, sort of four 16 safeguards, I think: the messages coming out from 17 directors general themselves, very clear messages about 18 what was acceptable, what needed to be recorded. There 19 were similar messages going to the senior leadership 20 group, the group of Welsh Government directors that met 21 on a regular basis, and we used that for sort of 22 cascading core messages. That was one of them. 23 We were very conscious that an Inquiry would be 24 coming along in due course, and that we needed to make 25 sure that all records were preserved. 180

179

(45) Pages 177 - 180

1		Third point, the circulars, the reminders that	1		surprised me.
2		you've highlighted here.	2	Q.	Can we please look at INQ000396684.
3		And then the sort of final element was something we	3		This is the last policy document I want to take you
4		called the internal control questionnaire, which was	4		to. It's called "Guidance on private office records".
5		completed annually as part of the governance process for	5		It's dated 17 June 2009. Paragraph 4 on this first
6		assuring the annual report, and each director was	6		page, just talking about really scope of this guidance:
7		required to complete a questionnaire which set out the	7		"This guidance applies to all information which is
8		extent to which they had observed all of these practices	8		created in any [Document read] or government
9		properly. That was signed off at director general	9		policy."
10		level, and there was subsequently a Welsh	10		Perhaps if we can go to the next paragraph,
11		Government-wide discussion to make sure that we really	11		paragraph 5:
12		had challenged the responses.	12		"The records of Special Advisers require separate
13		So I think that there were four levels, if you like,	13		consideration [Document read] might need to be
14		to give me assurance that the messages were going	14		introduced."
15		through that, whilst certain things were acceptable on	15		Now, you referred a moment ago to Welsh ministers'
16		WhatsApp, any kind of policy discussions or decisions	16		WhatsApp group, which was a chat that was extant during
17		were not acceptable; nothing like that could take place	17		the pandemic. Having looked at the various policies and
18		on private or any other WhatsApp.	18		guidance we've just been through, was your reaction to
19	Q.	With those four levels in place, did it surprise you	19		the fact that on 25 November 2021 Jane Runeckles who
20		then when you received on 29 October 2020 this email	20		is the head of the Welsh Government's team of special
21		notifying you that there were people within the	21		advisers and the special adviser to the
22		organisation, civil servants feeling pressured to use	22		First Minister turned on disappearing messages in
23		personal WhatsApps to conduct effectively Welsh	23		that chat?
24		Government business?	24	Α.	My reaction is surprise, given that there was very clear
25	Α.	I don't recall specifically, but I'm sure it would have	25		guidance to all private offices. I should point out
		181			182
1		that I had at that point left the Welsh Government, so	1		[Document read] record of Welsh Government's
2	_	I wouldn't have been directly aware of it.	2		business."
3	Q.	If messages concerning Welsh Government business are not	3		Now, that document from April 2021, that's some
4		otherwise being retained, as we've agreed they should	4		seven months before the disappearing messages function
5		be, would you agree that it is contrary to the policies	5		is enabled in the ministers' WhatsApp chat, and that's
6		on record retention that we've just been going through	6		specifically drawing the attention of ministers' offices
7		to have turned on disappearing messages in a chat	7		to the preservation of information for a future Inquiry.
8		involving Welsh Government ministers on	8		Do you agree that it's plain that even if decisions
9		25 November 2021?	9		which you've made this distinction earlier were
10	Α.	I have to say personally I'm not familiar enough with	10		not being formally taken by informal communication
11		the technology to know what that means in practice, but	11		methods, anything of business value, as it says in this
12		I think the messages were very clear from the circulars	12		email, should be formally summarised, stored in iShare?
				A.	
12 13 14		I think the messages were very clear from the circulars and from all of the all of the instructions that came out to private offices that we needed to maintain proper	12 13 14	A. Q.	email, should be formally summarised, stored in iShare? Yes. Whilst you were permanent secretary, are you aware that
12 13		I think the messages were very clear from the circulars and from all of the all of the instructions that came out to private offices that we needed to maintain proper records, both for the Welsh Government but also for	12 13 14 15		email, should be formally summarised, stored in iShare? Yes. Whilst you were permanent secretary, are you aware that that is something that was being undertaken in respect
12 13 14		I think the messages were very clear from the circulars and from all of the all of the instructions that came out to private offices that we needed to maintain proper records, both for the Welsh Government but also for a future Inquiry.	12 13 14		email, should be formally summarised, stored in iShare? Yes. Whilst you were permanent secretary, are you aware that that is something that was being undertaken in respect of text and WhatsApp messages?
12 13 14 15 16 17	Q.	I think the messages were very clear from the circulars and from all of the all of the instructions that came out to private offices that we needed to maintain proper records, both for the Welsh Government but also for a future Inquiry. Final document on this topic, INQ000396461. It's	12 13 14 15 16 17		email, should be formally summarised, stored in iShare? Yes. Whilst you were permanent secretary, are you aware that that is something that was being undertaken in respect of text and WhatsApp messages? It was certainly a message that was given very, very
12 13 14 15 16 17 18	Q.	I think the messages were very clear from the circulars and from all of the all of the instructions that came out to private offices that we needed to maintain proper records, both for the Welsh Government but also for a future Inquiry. Final document on this topic, INQ000396461. It's an email sent to all private secretaries to Welsh	12 13 14 15 16 17 18	Q.	email, should be formally summarised, stored in iShare? Yes. Whilst you were permanent secretary, are you aware that that is something that was being undertaken in respect of text and WhatsApp messages? It was certainly a message that was given very, very regularly because, as I said, we were immensely
12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19	Q.	I think the messages were very clear from the circulars and from all of the all of the instructions that came out to private offices that we needed to maintain proper records, both for the Welsh Government but also for a future Inquiry. Final document on this topic, INQ000396461. It's an email sent to all private secretaries to Welsh Government ministers. It's dated 19 April 2021. Just	12 13 14 15 16 17	Q.	email, should be formally summarised, stored in iShare? Yes. Whilst you were permanent secretary, are you aware that that is something that was being undertaken in respect of text and WhatsApp messages? It was certainly a message that was given very, very
12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	Q.	I think the messages were very clear from the circulars and from all of the all of the instructions that came out to private offices that we needed to maintain proper records, both for the Welsh Government but also for a future Inquiry. Final document on this topic, INQ000396461. It's an email sent to all private secretaries to Welsh Government ministers. It's dated 19 April 2021. Just reading from the first paragraph:	12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	Q.	email, should be formally summarised, stored in iShare? Yes. Whilst you were permanent secretary, are you aware that that is something that was being undertaken in respect of text and WhatsApp messages? It was certainly a message that was given very, very regularly because, as I said, we were immensely conscious that we needed to preserve a proper public record for the future.
12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	Q.	I think the messages were very clear from the circulars and from all of the all of the instructions that came out to private offices that we needed to maintain proper records, both for the Welsh Government but also for a future Inquiry. Final document on this topic, INQ000396461. It's an email sent to all private secretaries to Welsh Government ministers. It's dated 19 April 2021. Just reading from the first paragraph: "As I mentioned at our Heads of Branch meeting last	12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	Q.	email, should be formally summarised, stored in iShare? Yes. Whilst you were permanent secretary, are you aware that that is something that was being undertaken in respect of text and WhatsApp messages? It was certainly a message that was given very, very regularly because, as I said, we were immensely conscious that we needed to preserve a proper public record for the future. Change topics next, and I'd like to ask about your
12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	Q.	I think the messages were very clear from the circulars and from all of the all of the instructions that came out to private offices that we needed to maintain proper records, both for the Welsh Government but also for a future Inquiry. Final document on this topic, INQ000396461. It's an email sent to all private secretaries to Welsh Government ministers. It's dated 19 April 2021. Just reading from the first paragraph: "As I mentioned at our Heads of Branch meeting last week, it is important that [Document read] in	12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	Q. A.	email, should be formally summarised, stored in iShare? Yes. Whilst you were permanent secretary, are you aware that that is something that was being undertaken in respect of text and WhatsApp messages? It was certainly a message that was given very, very regularly because, as I said, we were immensely conscious that we needed to preserve a proper public record for the future. Change topics next, and I'd like to ask about your involvement in the initial phase of the pandemic, so the
12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	Q.	I think the messages were very clear from the circulars and from all of the all of the instructions that came out to private offices that we needed to maintain proper records, both for the Welsh Government but also for a future Inquiry. Final document on this topic, INQ000396461. It's an email sent to all private secretaries to Welsh Government ministers. It's dated 19 April 2021. Just reading from the first paragraph: "As I mentioned at our Heads of Branch meeting last week, it is important that [Document read] in iShare"	12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	Q. A.	email, should be formally summarised, stored in iShare? Yes. Whilst you were permanent secretary, are you aware that that is something that was being undertaken in respect of text and WhatsApp messages? It was certainly a message that was given very, very regularly because, as I said, we were immensely conscious that we needed to preserve a proper public record for the future. Change topics next, and I'd like to ask about your involvement in the initial phase of the pandemic, so the period January to March 2020. You say in your witness
12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	Q.	I think the messages were very clear from the circulars and from all of the all of the instructions that came out to private offices that we needed to maintain proper records, both for the Welsh Government but also for a future Inquiry. Final document on this topic, INQ000396461. It's an email sent to all private secretaries to Welsh Government ministers. It's dated 19 April 2021. Just reading from the first paragraph: "As I mentioned at our Heads of Branch meeting last week, it is important that [Document read] in	12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	Q. A.	email, should be formally summarised, stored in iShare? Yes. Whilst you were permanent secretary, are you aware that that is something that was being undertaken in respect of text and WhatsApp messages? It was certainly a message that was given very, very regularly because, as I said, we were immensely conscious that we needed to preserve a proper public record for the future. Change topics next, and I'd like to ask about your involvement in the initial phase of the pandemic, so the

1		conscitut but that you were on the circulation list of	1		during that whole period of January and later February
		capacity, but that you were on the circulation list of	2		during that whole period of January and later February, people were drawing on and strengthening their existing
2		an official internal Welsh Government update on the new			
3		virus on 30 January 2020.	3		networks to understand what the evidence was telling us,
4		Now, we know the first meeting of ExCovid took place	4		what the data was telling us.
5		on 18 February 2020. Would this have been the first	5		My first meeting of ExCovid, as you said, was
6		meeting that you attended in an official capacity	6		18 February. It followed on from an important email
7		regarding Covid, to your recollection?	7		that Reg Kilpatrick sent a little earlier that month
8		To the best of my recollection, yes.	8		drawing everybody's attention to the fact this was
9	Q.	Now, by this time, so mid-February, you were presumably	9		something we needed to prepare for in a more
10		aware that this new virus posed a serious threat to	10		co-ordinated way across the whole of the Welsh
11		public health in Wales. Were you aware of that?	11		Government. He had already stood up the ECC(W) from
12	Α.	I was aware.	12		5 February, although it had to expand later.
13	Q.	What work had been done by you, or perhaps your office,	13		So there was quite a lot of action going on.
14		prior to this meeting of ExCovid on 18 February, to	14		February, particularly in mid-February, I remember us
15		begin to co-ordinate the response of the Welsh civil	15		shifting up a gear and then really continuing with
16		service to respond to Covid?	16		engagement intensifying as we moved towards the period
17	Α.	I think the first thing to say is that the health	17		of the lockdown.
18		professionals led the initial part of the response to	18	Q.	You say in your witness statement that another standard
19		Covid, as you would expect, given their expertise.	19		process adopted by ExCovid was the implementation of
20		January I recall as a period of great uncertainty, with	20		a risk register, which was a document that recorded the
21		growing awareness of the threat. That was a time when	21		extremely broad range of operational risks that the
22		the health team were focused on linking up with	22		Welsh Government faced as a result of the pandemic.
23		colleagues in the UK Government. I was very conscious	23		When was the first risk register produced by ExCovid,
24		that the CMOs, as you may have heard earlier, had	24		can you recall?
25		a really excellent communication network, so I think	25	Α.	
		185			186
1	Q.	And who was responsible for producing that?	1		of DAs."
2	Α.	I believe it was Liz Lalley.	2		Then Tracey Burke replies at 8.11:
3	Q.	To change topic again and now move on to the	3		"Quite a download through Shan but best we know it.
4		co-ordination and relationship with the UK Government,	4		I [Document read] from themHow best to raise?
5		you say in your statement that:	5		Tracey."
6		" I and the Permanent Secretaries for Scotland	6		You then reply at 8.13:
7		and Northern Ireland also attended regular informal	7		"I have a 3 DAs call this morning I hope and we'll
8		four-way meetings with the Permanent Secretary for the	8		discuss it. I'm [Document read] development
9		Department for Health and Social Care, Chris Wormald,	9		we're seeing."
10		who established these meetings in order to exchange	10		Tracey then replies:
11		views on Covid-19 developments and to share information.	10		"Good. Vital we have sight of work of these
12		The first of these meetings took place on 6 March 2020	12		groups vital."
13		and they continued regularly throughout the specified	12		Then you reply:
14		period."	13		"Of course! Signs not good so far"
14		Now, as we've already seen throughout the pandemic	14		Then Andrew Slade replies at 10.04:
16			16		
		there was a WhatsApp group with Andrew Goodall,			"Yes. And I fear [Welsh Government] describing UK
17		Andrew Slade, yourself and Tracey Burke.	17		[Government's] Budget [Document read] kept quiet
18		Can we, please, have that WhatsApp group,	18		on that topic."
19		INQ000303227. I think we're beginning at the bottom of	19		So just focusing, if I may, on the comments made
20		page 4, so this is on yeah.	20		about COBR, what did you understand to be
21		So top of that page, 17 March, you say, amongst	21		Jane Runeckles' concerns about the new ministerial
22		other things so the second entry at the top of that	22		structures and, as she says in her WhatsApp, the lack of
23		page, 19.26:	23		DAs?
24 25		"Thanks for an excellent CovExco. Saw Jane R afterwards [Document read] structures and lack	24 25	Α.	I think her concern was the same one that the First Minister had expressed for some time, which was

(47) Pages 185 - 188

1		the lack of predictability about structures. COBR
2		meetings happened between about January and May, and
3		they came back again sort of autumn and winter, but they
4		died away in between, during which time there was the
5		ministerial implementation groups, although those too
6		died away. So I think Jane's concerns I think reflected
7		what I know were the First Minister's concerns about
8		predictability of communication and engagement
9		structures with the UK Government.
10	Q.	You referred in your answer to ministerial
11		implementation groups. Now, the Inquiry has heard
12		evidence from Welsh ministers and officials to the
13		effect that although ministerial implementation group
14		meetings took place regularly throughout April and
15		May 2020, they were usually initiated by the
16		UK Government, often at short notice, and they say with
17		the agenda being set by the UK Government. Does that
18		accord with your recollection and your experience at the
19		time?
20	Α.	It does.
20	Q.	Did you have take any action to secure the attendance
22	ω.	of Welsh ministers and officials at those ministerial
22		implementation group meetings?
23 24	Α.	There was a joint letter. Once the ministerial
24 25	А.	implementation groups started dying away, a joint letter
25		189
1		"The process feels [so it's second paragraph down]
1 2		"The process feels [so it's second paragraph down] more and more like announcing a concept and working back
2		more and more like announcing a concept and working back
2 3		more and more like announcing a concept and working back ASAP in detail and practicalities this reflects.
2 3 4		more and more like announcing a concept and working back ASAP in detail and practicalities this reflects. "The speed of events has meant that some of the
2 3 4 5		more and more like announcing a concept and working back ASAP in detail and practicalities this reflects. "The speed of events has meant that some of the spirit [Document read] announcements.
2 3 4 5 6		more and more like announcing a concept and working back ASAP in detail and practicalities this reflects. "The speed of events has meant that some of the spirit [Document read] announcements. "As we discussed earlier it feels like creeping
2 3 4 5 6 7		more and more like announcing a concept and working back ASAP in detail and practicalities this reflects. "The speed of events has meant that some of the spirit [Document read] announcements. "As we discussed earlier it feels like creeping divergence [Document read] raise but happening
2 3 4 5 6 7 8		more and more like announcing a concept and working back ASAP in detail and practicalities this reflects. "The speed of events has meant that some of the spirit [Document read] announcements. "As we discussed earlier it feels like creeping divergence [Document read] raise but happening all round.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9		more and more like announcing a concept and working back ASAP in detail and practicalities this reflects. "The speed of events has meant that some of the spirit [Document read] announcements. "As we discussed earlier it feels like creeping divergence [Document read] raise but happening all round. "Are we ensuring we are [Document read] are
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9		more and more like announcing a concept and working back ASAP in detail and practicalities this reflects. "The speed of events has meant that some of the spirit [Document read] announcements. "As we discussed earlier it feels like creeping divergence [Document read] raise but happening all round. "Are we ensuring we are [Document read] are doing."
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11		more and more like announcing a concept and working back ASAP in detail and practicalities this reflects. "The speed of events has meant that some of the spirit [Document read] announcements. "As we discussed earlier it feels like creeping divergence [Document read] raise but happening all round. "Are we ensuring we are [Document read] are doing." Then Tracey Burke says at 13.12:
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12		more and more like announcing a concept and working back ASAP in detail and practicalities this reflects. "The speed of events has meant that some of the spirit [Document read] announcements. "As we discussed earlier it feels like creeping divergence [Document read] raise but happening all round. "Are we ensuring we are [Document read] are doing." Then Tracey Burke says at 13.12: "Yes agree to both Andrews' points [Document
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13		more and more like announcing a concept and working back ASAP in detail and practicalities this reflects. "The speed of events has meant that some of the spirit [Document read] announcements. "As we discussed earlier it feels like creeping divergence [Document read] raise but happening all round. "Are we ensuring we are [Document read] are doing." Then Tracey Burke says at 13.12: "Yes agree to both Andrews' points [Document read] homes et cetera. Tracey."
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14		more and more like announcing a concept and working back ASAP in detail and practicalities this reflects. "The speed of events has meant that some of the spirit [Document read] announcements. "As we discussed earlier it feels like creeping divergence [Document read] raise but happening all round. "Are we ensuring we are [Document read] are doing." Then Tracey Burke says at 13.12: "Yes agree to both Andrews' points [Document read] homes et cetera. Tracey." To which you replied at 14.05:
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15		<pre>more and more like announcing a concept and working back ASAP in detail and practicalities this reflects. "The speed of events has meant that some of the spirit [Document read] announcements. "As we discussed earlier it feels like creeping divergence [Document read] raise but happening all round. "Are we ensuring we are [Document read] are doing." Then Tracey Burke says at 13.12: "Yes agree to both Andrews' points [Document read] homes et cetera. Tracey." To which you replied at 14.05: "All excellent points but call now postponed.</pre>
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16		 more and more like announcing a concept and working back ASAP in detail and practicalities this reflects. "The speed of events has meant that some of the spirit [Document read] announcements. "As we discussed earlier it feels like creeping divergence [Document read] raise but happening all round. "Are we ensuring we are [Document read] are doing." Then Tracey Burke says at 13.12: "Yes agree to both Andrews' points [Document read] homes et cetera. Tracey." To which you replied at 14.05: "All excellent points but call now postponed. I can cover them [Document read] the Tim team.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17		 more and more like announcing a concept and working back ASAP in detail and practicalities this reflects. "The speed of events has meant that some of the spirit [Document read] announcements. "As we discussed earlier it feels like creeping divergence [Document read] raise but happening all round. "Are we ensuring we are [Document read] are doing." Then Tracey Burke says at 13.12: "Yes agree to both Andrews' points [Document read] homes et cetera. Tracey." To which you replied at 14.05: "All excellent points but call now postponed. I can cover them [Document read] the Tim team. What do you think?"
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18		 more and more like announcing a concept and working back ASAP in detail and practicalities this reflects. "The speed of events has meant that some of the spirit [Document read] announcements. "As we discussed earlier it feels like creeping divergence [Document read] raise but happening all round. "Are we ensuring we are [Document read] are doing." Then Tracey Burke says at 13.12: "Yes agree to both Andrews' points [Document read] are read] homes et cetera. Tracey." To which you replied at 14.05: "All excellent points but call now postponed. I can cover them [Document read] the Tim team. What do you think?" Now, the "Tim team", that's the reference to the
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19	A.	more and more like announcing a concept and working back ASAP in detail and practicalities this reflects. "The speed of events has meant that some of the spirit [Document read] announcements. "As we discussed earlier it feels like creeping divergence [Document read] raise but happening all round. "Are we ensuring we are [Document read] are doing." Then Tracey Burke says at 13.12: "Yes agree to both Andrews' points [Document read] homes et cetera. Tracey." To which you replied at 14.05: "All excellent points but call now postponed. I can cover them [Document read] the Tim team. What do you think?" Now, the "Tim team", that's the reference to the team you envisaged being headed up by Tim Render that we
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	A. Q.	 more and more like announcing a concept and working back ASAP in detail and practicalities this reflects. "The speed of events has meant that some of the spirit [Document read] announcements. "As we discussed earlier it feels like creeping divergence [Document read] raise but happening all round. "Are we ensuring we are [Document read] are doing." Then Tracey Burke says at 13.12: "Yes agree to both Andrews' points [Document read] are read] homes et cetera. Tracey." To which you replied at 14.05: "All excellent points but call now postponed. I can cover them [Document read] the Tim team. What do you think?" Now, the "Tim team", that's the reference to the team you envisaged being headed up by Tim Render that we referred to earlier? That's right.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21		 more and more like announcing a concept and working back ASAP in detail and practicalities this reflects. "The speed of events has meant that some of the spirit [Document read] announcements. "As we discussed earlier it feels like creeping divergence [Document read] raise but happening all round. "Are we ensuring we are [Document read] are doing." Then Tracey Burke says at 13.12: "Yes agree to both Andrews' points [Document read] are read] homes et cetera. Tracey." To which you replied at 14.05: "All excellent points but call now postponed. I can cover them [Document read] the Tim team. What do you think?" Now, the "Tim team", that's the reference to the team you envisaged being headed up by Tim Render that we referred to earlier? That's right. In terms of these messages, though, at this time so
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23		 more and more like announcing a concept and working back ASAP in detail and practicalities this reflects. "The speed of events has meant that some of the spirit [Document read] announcements. "As we discussed earlier it feels like creeping divergence [Document read] raise but happening all round. "Are we ensuring we are [Document read] are doing." Then Tracey Burke says at 13.12: "Yes agree to both Andrews' points [Document read] are read] homes et cetera. Tracey." To which you replied at 14.05: "All excellent points but call now postponed. I can cover them [Document read] the Tim team. What do you think?" Now, the "Tim team", that's the reference to the team you envisaged being headed up by Tim Render that we referred to earlier? That's right. In terms of these messages, though, at this time so this is 20 March did you feel there was a lack of
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24		 more and more like announcing a concept and working back ASAP in detail and practicalities this reflects. "The speed of events has meant that some of the spirit [Document read] announcements. "As we discussed earlier it feels like creeping divergence [Document read] raise but happening all round. "Are we ensuring we are [Document read] are doing." Then Tracey Burke says at 13.12: "Yes agree to both Andrews' points [Document read] are doing." To which you replied at 14.05: "All excellent points but call now postponed. I can cover them [Document read] the Tim team. What do you think?" Now, the "Tim team", that's the reference to the team you envisaged being headed up by Tim Render that we referred to earlier? That's right. In terms of these messages, though, at this time so this is 20 March did you feel there was a lack of co-ordination between you and your senior officials
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23		 more and more like announcing a concept and working back ASAP in detail and practicalities this reflects. "The speed of events has meant that some of the spirit [Document read] announcements. "As we discussed earlier it feels like creeping divergence [Document read] raise but happening all round. "Are we ensuring we are [Document read] are doing." Then Tracey Burke says at 13.12: "Yes agree to both Andrews' points [Document read] are read] homes et cetera. Tracey." To which you replied at 14.05: "All excellent points but call now postponed. I can cover them [Document read] the Tim team. What do you think?" Now, the "Tim team", that's the reference to the team you envisaged being headed up by Tim Render that we referred to earlier? That's right. In terms of these messages, though, at this time so this is 20 March did you feel there was a lack of

1		went from me and from my counterparts in the Scottish
2		Government and Northern Ireland to complain about the
3		lack of engagement with the devolved administrations and
4		the failure to establish a structure which would enable
5		us to have the kinds of discussions that we needed to.
6	Q.	In your view, would there have been a benefit to using
7		the existing Joint Ministerial Committee rather than
8		these newly created ministerial implementation groups?
9	Α.	No. The JMC is a very kind of formal structure. It
10		didn't meet once during the pandemic, which I think is
11		very telling. I believe it has since been revised and
12		strengthened, but it was a very formal and formulaic
13		sort of meeting. I attended a number in my time.
14	Q.	Returning to some WhatsApp messages, then, we're looking
15		at INQ000303227. I'm grateful, yes.
16		We're so just to orientate ourselves,
17		20 March 2020 you sent a message to the group, saying:
18		"Any [questions] for my phone call with Chris
19		Wormald at 1400?"
20		Andrew Slade replies:
21		"From my perspective, his take on lockdown and
22		timing. Lots of intel [Document read] useful to
23		have/gauge his view."
24		Then at page 6 Andrew Goodall says, so this is at
25		13.04 is the message:
		190
1		the UK Government?
1 2	A.	
	A.	I think to be fair things were very fast-moving but, yes, I did. I think there was there was quite
2 3 4	Α.	I think to be fair things were very fast-moving but, yes, I did. I think there was there was quite a variation in the degree of engagement between
2 3 4 5	A.	I think to be fair things were very fast-moving but, yes, I did. I think there was there was quite a variation in the degree of engagement between different parts of Whitehall and the devolved
2 3 4	Α.	I think to be fair things were very fast-moving but, yes, I did. I think there was there was quite a variation in the degree of engagement between different parts of Whitehall and the devolved administrations. Those departments like DEFRA and
2 3 4 5	A.	I think to be fair things were very fast-moving but, yes, I did. I think there was there was quite a variation in the degree of engagement between different parts of Whitehall and the devolved
2 3 4 5 6 7 8	Α.	I think to be fair things were very fast-moving but, yes, I did. I think there was there was quite a variation in the degree of engagement between different parts of Whitehall and the devolved administrations. Those departments like DEFRA and actually the Department of Health had a much better understanding of how best to work with devolved
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	Α.	I think to be fair things were very fast-moving but, yes, I did. I think there was there was quite a variation in the degree of engagement between different parts of Whitehall and the devolved administrations. Those departments like DEFRA and actually the Department of Health had a much better understanding of how best to work with devolved administrations. But that was very mixed across the
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9		I think to be fair things were very fast-moving but, yes, I did. I think there was there was quite a variation in the degree of engagement between different parts of Whitehall and the devolved administrations. Those departments like DEFRA and actually the Department of Health had a much better understanding of how best to work with devolved administrations. But that was very mixed across the whole of the UK Government.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11	A. Q.	I think to be fair things were very fast-moving but, yes, I did. I think there was there was quite a variation in the degree of engagement between different parts of Whitehall and the devolved administrations. Those departments like DEFRA and actually the Department of Health had a much better understanding of how best to work with devolved administrations. But that was very mixed across the whole of the UK Government. What did you understand by Andrew Goodall's reference in
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12		I think to be fair things were very fast-moving but, yes, I did. I think there was there was quite a variation in the degree of engagement between different parts of Whitehall and the devolved administrations. Those departments like DEFRA and actually the Department of Health had a much better understanding of how best to work with devolved administrations. But that was very mixed across the whole of the UK Government. What did you understand by Andrew Goodall's reference in these WhatsApp messages we've just seen to "creeping
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13		I think to be fair things were very fast-moving but, yes, I did. I think there was there was quite a variation in the degree of engagement between different parts of Whitehall and the devolved administrations. Those departments like DEFRA and actually the Department of Health had a much better understanding of how best to work with devolved administrations. But that was very mixed across the whole of the UK Government. What did you understand by Andrew Goodall's reference in these WhatsApp messages we've just seen to "creeping divergence and the spirit of sharing has been
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	Q.	I think to be fair things were very fast-moving but, yes, I did. I think there was there was quite a variation in the degree of engagement between different parts of Whitehall and the devolved administrations. Those departments like DEFRA and actually the Department of Health had a much better understanding of how best to work with devolved administrations. But that was very mixed across the whole of the UK Government. What did you understand by Andrew Goodall's reference in these WhatsApp messages we've just seen to "creeping divergence and the spirit of sharing has been disappearing"?
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15		I think to be fair things were very fast-moving but, yes, I did. I think there was there was quite a variation in the degree of engagement between different parts of Whitehall and the devolved administrations. Those departments like DEFRA and actually the Department of Health had a much better understanding of how best to work with devolved administrations. But that was very mixed across the whole of the UK Government. What did you understand by Andrew Goodall's reference in these WhatsApp messages we've just seen to "creeping divergence and the spirit of sharing has been disappearing"? I think he I took it that he was concerned that, from
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	Q.	I think to be fair things were very fast-moving but, yes, I did. I think there was there was quite a variation in the degree of engagement between different parts of Whitehall and the devolved administrations. Those departments like DEFRA and actually the Department of Health had a much better understanding of how best to work with devolved administrations. But that was very mixed across the whole of the UK Government. What did you understand by Andrew Goodall's reference in these WhatsApp messages we've just seen to "creeping divergence and the spirit of sharing has been disappearing"? I think he I took it that he was concerned that, from the centre, there were anxieties about differences
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	Q.	I think to be fair things were very fast-moving but, yes, I did. I think there was there was quite a variation in the degree of engagement between different parts of Whitehall and the devolved administrations. Those departments like DEFRA and actually the Department of Health had a much better understanding of how best to work with devolved administrations. But that was very mixed across the whole of the UK Government. What did you understand by Andrew Goodall's reference in these WhatsApp messages we've just seen to "creeping divergence and the spirit of sharing has been disappearing"? I think he I took it that he was concerned that, from the centre, there were anxieties about differences between the devolved administrations and the UK
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	Q. A.	I think to be fair things were very fast-moving but, yes, I did. I think there was there was quite a variation in the degree of engagement between different parts of Whitehall and the devolved administrations. Those departments like DEFRA and actually the Department of Health had a much better understanding of how best to work with devolved administrations. But that was very mixed across the whole of the UK Government. What did you understand by Andrew Goodall's reference in these WhatsApp messages we've just seen to "creeping divergence and the spirit of sharing has been disappearing"? I think he I took it that he was concerned that, from the centre, there were anxieties about differences between the devolved administrations and the UK Government.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19	Q.	I think to be fair things were very fast-moving but, yes, I did. I think there was there was quite a variation in the degree of engagement between different parts of Whitehall and the devolved administrations. Those departments like DEFRA and actually the Department of Health had a much better understanding of how best to work with devolved administrations. But that was very mixed across the whole of the UK Government. What did you understand by Andrew Goodall's reference in these WhatsApp messages we've just seen to "creeping divergence and the spirit of sharing has been disappearing"? I think he I took it that he was concerned that, from the centre, there were anxieties about differences between the devolved administrations and the UK Government. Now, we know certainly the Inquiry's heard evidence
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	Q. A.	I think to be fair things were very fast-moving but, yes, I did. I think there was there was quite a variation in the degree of engagement between different parts of Whitehall and the devolved administrations. Those departments like DEFRA and actually the Department of Health had a much better understanding of how best to work with devolved administrations. But that was very mixed across the whole of the UK Government. What did you understand by Andrew Goodall's reference in these WhatsApp messages we've just seen to "creeping divergence and the spirit of sharing has been disappearing"? I think he I took it that he was concerned that, from the centre, there were anxieties about differences between the devolved administrations and the UK Government. Now, we know certainly the Inquiry's heard evidence to the effect that early June 2020, that's when MIGs
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	Q. A.	I think to be fair things were very fast-moving but, yes, I did. I think there was there was quite a variation in the degree of engagement between different parts of Whitehall and the devolved administrations. Those departments like DEFRA and actually the Department of Health had a much better understanding of how best to work with devolved administrations. But that was very mixed across the whole of the UK Government. What did you understand by Andrew Goodall's reference in these WhatsApp messages we've just seen to "creeping divergence and the spirit of sharing has been disappearing"? I think he I took it that he was concerned that, from the centre, there were anxieties about differences between the devolved administrations and the UK Government. Now, we know certainly the Inquiry's heard evidence to the effect that early June 2020, that's when MIGs were replaced by Covid-S, which was the Prime Minister's
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	Q. A.	I think to be fair things were very fast-moving but, yes, I did. I think there was there was quite a variation in the degree of engagement between different parts of Whitehall and the devolved administrations. Those departments like DEFRA and actually the Department of Health had a much better understanding of how best to work with devolved administrations. But that was very mixed across the whole of the UK Government. What did you understand by Andrew Goodall's reference in these WhatsApp messages we've just seen to "creeping divergence and the spirit of sharing has been disappearing"? I think he I took it that he was concerned that, from the centre, there were anxieties about differences between the devolved administrations and the UK Government. Now, we know certainly the Inquiry's heard evidence to the effect that early June 2020, that's when MIGs were replaced by Covid-S, which was the Prime Minister's strategy group, and Covid-O, which was the operations
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	Q. A.	I think to be fair things were very fast-moving but, yes, I did. I think there was there was quite a variation in the degree of engagement between different parts of Whitehall and the devolved administrations. Those departments like DEFRA and actually the Department of Health had a much better understanding of how best to work with devolved administrations. But that was very mixed across the whole of the UK Government. What did you understand by Andrew Goodall's reference in these WhatsApp messages we've just seen to "creeping divergence and the spirit of sharing has been disappearing"? I think he I took it that he was concerned that, from the centre, there were anxieties about differences between the devolved administrations and the UK Government. Now, we know certainly the Inquiry's heard evidence to the effect that early June 2020, that's when MIGs were replaced by Covid-S, which was the operations committee now chaired by Mr Gove. The Inquiry
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24	Q. A.	I think to be fair things were very fast-moving but, yes, I did. I think there was there was quite a variation in the degree of engagement between different parts of Whitehall and the devolved administrations. Those departments like DEFRA and actually the Department of Health had a much better understanding of how best to work with devolved administrations. But that was very mixed across the whole of the UK Government. What did you understand by Andrew Goodall's reference in these WhatsApp messages we've just seen to "creeping divergence and the spirit of sharing has been disappearing"? I think he I took it that he was concerned that, from the centre, there were anxieties about differences between the devolved administrations and the UK Government. Now, we know certainly the Inquiry's heard evidence to the effect that early June 2020, that's when MIGs were replaced by Covid-S, which was the Prime Minister's strategy group, and Covid-O, which was the operations committee now chaired by Mr Gove. The Inquiry understands that the devolved administrations and
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	Q. A.	I think to be fair things were very fast-moving but, yes, I did. I think there was there was quite a variation in the degree of engagement between different parts of Whitehall and the devolved administrations. Those departments like DEFRA and actually the Department of Health had a much better understanding of how best to work with devolved administrations. But that was very mixed across the whole of the UK Government. What did you understand by Andrew Goodall's reference in these WhatsApp messages we've just seen to "creeping divergence and the spirit of sharing has been disappearing"? I think he I took it that he was concerned that, from the centre, there were anxieties about differences between the devolved administrations and the UK Government. Now, we know certainly the Inquiry's heard evidence to the effect that early June 2020, that's when MIGs were replaced by Covid-S, which was the operations committee now chaired by Mr Gove. The Inquiry

1	Covid-S meetings, and were only invited to attend	1		that all three of the decision-making processes that the
2	Covid-O meetings on a standing basis from October 2020.	2		Welsh Government used involved a detailed template which
3	Is that right? Does that accord with your recollection?	3		took the drafters through the process of an equalities
4 A .	That's right.	4		impact assessment. We called it an integrated impact
5 Q .	I'd like to change topic now and ask some questions, as	5		assessment, because it covered a very wide range.
5	I said I would earlier, about equality impact	6		So ministerial advice, as I've said already, plus
7	assessments.	7		Cabinet papers, plus the 21-day cycle, each had their
3	Now, as with any new policy, when making decisions	8		own template for assessing the equalities impact of any
9	in respect of NPIs during the pandemic you would accept	9		policy or restriction or lifting of restrictions that
0	that there was a general duty, obviously, on the Welsh	10		was being considered.
1	Government to consider vulnerable groups and those with	11		So I think that whilst there were times when there
2	protected characteristics; yes?	12		were no formal no formal impact assessments
3 A .	Yes.	13		published, there were there was always a great deal
4 Q .	The Inquiry understands that no equality impact	14		of thought given to the impact of different restrictions
5	assessments were carried out for the initial 21-day	15		on different communities within the Welsh Government.
6	review of the coronavirus regulations, nor in fact the	16		And not just because there was a template setting it
7	next three reviews, so there were no equality impact	17		out, but also because I think all of us were very clear
8	assessments carried out in respect of the restrictions	18		that it mattered a great deal to Welsh Government
9	for nearly three months after the initial lockdown;	19		ministers, in particular the First Minister, that we
0	that's right, isn't it?	20		should address all aspects of inequality in everything
1 A .	My understanding is that there was a great deal of work	21		that we did.
2	going on, that there weren't that the team were under	22	Q.	Now, obviously I can understand that the initial
3	such pressure and ministers under such pressure that it	23		regulations were drafted under exceptional circumstances
4	wasn't always possible to prepare a formal equality	24		over a very short space of time, but in respect of the
5	impact assessment, but nonetheless I should emphasise 193	25		next three 21-day reviews so obviously, doing the 194
1	maths, that's nearly two months do you accept that	1		in your witness statement to the correspondence you've
2	full impact assessments could and should have been	2		mentioned with the Reverend Coombs, so there were
3	undertaken for those subsequent 21-day reviews?	3		letters back and forth in July 2020, early 2021,
4 A .	I do. There was I received during that period	4		culminating in the response from you on 10 March 2021.
5	a number of letters from the Reverend Coombs, from the	5		Would you say that the process for publishing EIAs
6	head of the EHRC in Wales, and we had a number of very,	6		improved after March 2021, after you had had that
7	very worthwhile and positive discussions together.	7		exchange with the Reverend Coombs?
3	I had to explain that in the early days it was very	8	Α.	I believe it did, although I'm conscious that I had to
	difficult to publish equality impact assessments because	0		reply to one of her letters that we'd actually published
9	difficult to publish equality impact assessments because	9		reply to one of her letters that we a actually published
9 0	the resource available within the Welsh Government for	9 10		the impact assessments in the wrong part of the Welsh
0	the resource available within the Welsh Government for	10	Q.	the impact assessments in the wrong part of the Welsh
0 1	the resource available within the Welsh Government for translating those impact assessments into Welsh was very	10 11	Q.	the impact assessments in the wrong part of the Welsh Government website.
0 1 2	the resource available within the Welsh Government for translating those impact assessments into Welsh was very thin, and obviously it was a period when we had to	10 11 12	Q.	the impact assessments in the wrong part of the Welsh Government website. Now, in Wales there's a duty under the Rights of
0 1 2 3	the resource available within the Welsh Government for translating those impact assessments into Welsh was very thin, and obviously it was a period when we had to prioritise translation of the legislation. And I should say that, as you might expect, it was not legal for us as a government to publish anything in	10 11 12 13	Q.	the impact assessments in the wrong part of the Welsh Government website. Now, in Wales there's a duty under the Rights of Children and Young Persons (Wales) Measure 2011, also
0 1 2 3 4	the resource available within the Welsh Government for translating those impact assessments into Welsh was very thin, and obviously it was a period when we had to prioritise translation of the legislation. And I should say that, as you might expect, it was	10 11 12 13 14	Q.	the impact assessments in the wrong part of the Welsh Government website. Now, in Wales there's a duty under the Rights of Children and Young Persons (Wales) Measure 2011, also the Children's Rights Scheme 2021, a duty on the Welsh
0 1 2 3 4 5	the resource available within the Welsh Government for translating those impact assessments into Welsh was very thin, and obviously it was a period when we had to prioritise translation of the legislation. And I should say that, as you might expect, it was not legal for us as a government to publish anything in	10 11 12 13 14 15	Q.	the impact assessments in the wrong part of the Welsh Government website. Now, in Wales there's a duty under the Rights of Children and Young Persons (Wales) Measure 2011, also the Children's Rights Scheme 2021, a duty on the Welsh Government to have regard to the United Nations
0 1 2 3 4 5 6	the resource available within the Welsh Government for translating those impact assessments into Welsh was very thin, and obviously it was a period when we had to prioritise translation of the legislation. And I should say that, as you might expect, it was not legal for us as a government to publish anything in English only, we had to publish the English and the	10 11 12 13 14 15 16	Q.	the impact assessments in the wrong part of the Welsh Government website. Now, in Wales there's a duty under the Rights of Children and Young Persons (Wales) Measure 2011, also the Children's Rights Scheme 2021, a duty on the Welsh Government to have regard to the United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child in exercising its
0 1 2 3 4 5 6 7	the resource available within the Welsh Government for translating those impact assessments into Welsh was very thin, and obviously it was a period when we had to prioritise translation of the legislation. And I should say that, as you might expect, it was not legal for us as a government to publish anything in English only, we had to publish the English and the Welsh versions together. So that was an issue.	10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	Q.	the impact assessments in the wrong part of the Welsh Government website. Now, in Wales there's a duty under the Rights of Children and Young Persons (Wales) Measure 2011, also the Children's Rights Scheme 2021, a duty on the Welsh Government to have regard to the United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child in exercising its functions which in turn requires considerations of the best interests of the child, and the Children's Rights
0 1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 0	the resource available within the Welsh Government for translating those impact assessments into Welsh was very thin, and obviously it was a period when we had to prioritise translation of the legislation. And I should say that, as you might expect, it was not legal for us as a government to publish anything in English only, we had to publish the English and the Welsh versions together. So that was an issue. I do think that Dr Coombs I got the impression	10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	Q.	the impact assessments in the wrong part of the Welsh Government website. Now, in Wales there's a duty under the Rights of Children and Young Persons (Wales) Measure 2011, also the Children's Rights Scheme 2021, a duty on the Welsh Government to have regard to the United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child in exercising its functions which in turn requires considerations of the best interests of the child, and the Children's Rights
0 1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 0 1	the resource available within the Welsh Government for translating those impact assessments into Welsh was very thin, and obviously it was a period when we had to prioritise translation of the legislation. And I should say that, as you might expect, it was not legal for us as a government to publish anything in English only, we had to publish the English and the Welsh versions together. So that was an issue. I do think that Dr Coombs I got the impression that she was reassured by the information that we gave	10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	Q.	the impact assessments in the wrong part of the Welsh Government website. Now, in Wales there's a duty under the Rights of Children and Young Persons (Wales) Measure 2011, also the Children's Rights Scheme 2021, a duty on the Welsh Government to have regard to the United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child in exercising its functions which in turn requires considerations of the best interests of the child, and the Children's Rights Scheme also requires the Welsh Government to undertake
0 1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 0	the resource available within the Welsh Government for translating those impact assessments into Welsh was very thin, and obviously it was a period when we had to prioritise translation of the legislation. And I should say that, as you might expect, it was not legal for us as a government to publish anything in English only, we had to publish the English and the Welsh versions together. So that was an issue. I do think that Dr Coombs I got the impression that she was reassured by the information that we gave her about the work that was actually going on, and that	10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	Q.	the impact assessments in the wrong part of the Welsh Government website. Now, in Wales there's a duty under the Rights of Children and Young Persons (Wales) Measure 2011, also the Children's Rights Scheme 2021, a duty on the Welsh Government to have regard to the United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child in exercising its functions which in turn requires considerations of the best interests of the child, and the Children's Rights Scheme also requires the Welsh Government to undertake a children's rights impact assessment as part of
0 1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 0 1	the resource available within the Welsh Government for translating those impact assessments into Welsh was very thin, and obviously it was a period when we had to prioritise translation of the legislation. And I should say that, as you might expect, it was not legal for us as a government to publish anything in English only, we had to publish the English and the Welsh versions together. So that was an issue. I do think that Dr Coombs I got the impression that she was reassured by the information that we gave her about the work that was actually going on, and that was extremely important, and the commitment that	10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	Q.	the impact assessments in the wrong part of the Welsh Government website. Now, in Wales there's a duty under the Rights of Children and Young Persons (Wales) Measure 2011, also the Children's Rights Scheme 2021, a duty on the Welsh Government to have regard to the United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child in exercising its functions which in turn requires considerations of the best interests of the child, and the Children's Rights Scheme also requires the Welsh Government to undertake a children's rights impact assessment as part of an integrated assessment.
0 1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 0 1 2	the resource available within the Welsh Government for translating those impact assessments into Welsh was very thin, and obviously it was a period when we had to prioritise translation of the legislation. And I should say that, as you might expect, it was not legal for us as a government to publish anything in English only, we had to publish the English and the Welsh versions together. So that was an issue. I do think that Dr Coombs I got the impression that she was reassured by the information that we gave her about the work that was actually going on, and that was extremely important, and the commitment that ministers were making in their decision-making process	10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	Q. A.	the impact assessments in the wrong part of the Welsh Government website. Now, in Wales there's a duty under the Rights of Children and Young Persons (Wales) Measure 2011, also the Children's Rights Scheme 2021, a duty on the Welsh Government to have regard to the United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child in exercising its functions which in turn requires considerations of the best interests of the child, and the Children's Rights Scheme also requires the Welsh Government to undertake a children's rights impact assessment as part of an integrated assessment. Now, can you help us, were children's rights impact

(49) Pages 193 - 196

UK Covid-19 Inquiry

1	because I checked this shujeuchy in Echryony 2020	4	The same with Tracey Burke, who was the DC respectible
1	because I checked this, obviously in February 2020	1	The same with Tracey Burke, who was the DG responsible
2	there was a children's rights impact assessment on alert	2	for education; for obvious reasons she needed those.
3 ⊿	levels and restrictions in Wales. November the same	3	What we did, as a result of invitations from the head of
4	year, there was one on adoption and fostering	4	the WLGA, Chris Llewelyn, was set up meetings with him
5	regulations. The following year there was a children's	5	and with the 22 well, the chief execs of the 22 Welsh
6	rights impact assessment on moving to remote working.	6	local authorities in order to exchange views and ideas
7	They were carried out regularly as separate significant	7	and concerns.
8	impact assessments on their own, as well as the impact	8	I would say honestly that I could have done more.
9	on children and young people being considered in the	9	I think it would probably have been a very good idea had
10	integrated impact assessments that we've been talking	10	I invited the chief exec of the WLGA to become a member
11	about earlier.	11	of ExCovid, or at least come from time to time when
12 Q .		12	there was an area of particular interest. I think
13	about your engagement during the pandemic with the Welsh	13	I could have done more to establish that level of
14	Local Government Association.	14	regular contact, and in retrospect I think I should have
15	On 21 March 2020 Chris Llewelyn, who is the chief	15	established myself a pattern of regular one-to-ones with
16	executive of the WLGA, emailed you and the directors	16	both the CEO of WLGA and of SOLACE, the Society of Loca
17	general requesting early engagement with the Welsh	17	Authority Chief Executives.
8	Government. Were structures and processes put in place	18	MR POOLE: Dame Shan, they're all the questions I've got for
9	to ensure early and effective engagement with local	19	you, but I understand there are some questions from
20	government?	20	core participants.
21 A .	, , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , ,	21	LADY HALLETT: Yes, Ms Heaven.
22	who needed, for policy and operational reasons, to work	22	Questions from MS HEAVEN
23	closely with local government. So, for example,	23	MS HEAVEN: Thank you, my Lady.
24	Reg Kilpatrick had excellent relations with his	24	Good afternoon, Dame Shan, I represent the Covid-19
25	colleagues in local government in a variety of areas. 197	25	Bereaved Families for Justice. 198
1	The first topic, please, is again the issue of	1	Then he says noting "I" seems to mean "I have not"
1 2	The first topic, please, is again the issue of WhatsApp and deletion of message chats by members of the	1 2	Then he says noting "I" seems to mean "I have not", okay.
2	WhatsApp and deletion of message chats by members of the	2	okay.
2 3	WhatsApp and deletion of message chats by members of the Welsh Government.	2 3	okay. So, as I said, there are others, I'm just giving you
2 3 4	WhatsApp and deletion of message chats by members of the Welsh Government. Just so that you fully understand the context of my	2 3 4	okay. So, as I said, there are others, I'm just giving you one example. So you're obviously surprised about the
2 3 4 5	WhatsApp and deletion of message chats by members of the Welsh Government. Just so that you fully understand the context of my question, obviously we've had disclosure of extensive	2 3 4 5	okay. So, as I said, there are others, I'm just giving you one example. So you're obviously surprised about the Jane Runeckles turning on deleting messages, but do you
2 3 4 5 6	WhatsApp and deletion of message chats by members of the Welsh Government. Just so that you fully understand the context of my question, obviously we've had disclosure of extensive WhatsApps and we can see that WhatsApp's been used for	2 3 4 5 6	okay. So, as I said, there are others, I'm just giving you one example. So you're obviously surprised about the Jane Runeckles turning on deleting messages, but do you agree that if other SPADs, special advisers, are
2 3 4 5 6 7	WhatsApp and deletion of message chats by members of the Welsh Government. Just so that you fully understand the context of my question, obviously we've had disclosure of extensive WhatsApps and we can see that WhatsApp's been used for a range of issues by special advisers and Welsh	2 3 4 5 6 7	okay. So, as I said, there are others, I'm just giving you one example. So you're obviously surprised about the Jane Runeckles turning on deleting messages, but do you agree that if other SPADs, special advisers, are deleting messages and encouraging others to do the same,
2 3 4 5 6 7 8	WhatsApp and deletion of message chats by members of the Welsh Government. Just so that you fully understand the context of my question, obviously we've had disclosure of extensive WhatsApps and we can see that WhatsApp's been used for a range of issues by special advisers and Welsh ministers touching on Welsh Government business work	2 3 4 5 6 7 8	okay. So, as I said, there are others, I'm just giving you one example. So you're obviously surprised about the Jane Runeckles turning on deleting messages, but do you agree that if other SPADs, special advisers, are deleting messages and encouraging others to do the same, there was obviously an issue on retention of WhatsApps
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	WhatsApp and deletion of message chats by members of the Welsh Government. Just so that you fully understand the context of my question, obviously we've had disclosure of extensive WhatsApps and we can see that WhatsApp's been used for a range of issues by special advisers and Welsh ministers touching on Welsh Government business work related activity from, for example, pre-announcing	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	okay. So, as I said, there are others, I'm just giving you one example. So you're obviously surprised about the Jane Runeckles turning on deleting messages, but do you agree that if other SPADs, special advisers, are deleting messages and encouraging others to do the same, there was obviously an issue on retention of WhatsApps that went much wider than Jane Runeckles? Is that
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	WhatsApp and deletion of message chats by members of the Welsh Government. Just so that you fully understand the context of my question, obviously we've had disclosure of extensive WhatsApps and we can see that WhatsApp's been used for a range of issues by special advisers and Welsh ministers touching on Welsh Government business work related activity from, for example, pre-announcing policy to officials, asking for clarification on	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	okay. So, as I said, there are others, I'm just giving you one example. So you're obviously surprised about the Jane Runeckles turning on deleting messages, but do you agree that if other SPADs, special advisers, are deleting messages and encouraging others to do the same, there was obviously an issue on retention of WhatsApps that went much wider than Jane Runeckles? Is that a fair comment, do you think?
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	WhatsApp and deletion of message chats by members of the Welsh Government. Just so that you fully understand the context of my question, obviously we've had disclosure of extensive WhatsApps and we can see that WhatsApp's been used for a range of issues by special advisers and Welsh ministers touching on Welsh Government business work related activity from, for example, pre-announcing policy to officials, asking for clarification on government policy, policy discussions, seeking	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11	 okay. So, as I said, there are others, I'm just giving you one example. So you're obviously surprised about the Jane Runeckles turning on deleting messages, but do you agree that if other SPADs, special advisers, are deleting messages and encouraging others to do the same, there was obviously an issue on retention of WhatsApps that went much wider than Jane Runeckles? Is that a fair comment, do you think? A. I think all I can say that there was a very clear
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11	WhatsApp and deletion of message chats by members of the Welsh Government. Just so that you fully understand the context of my question, obviously we've had disclosure of extensive WhatsApps and we can see that WhatsApp's been used for a range of issues by special advisers and Welsh ministers touching on Welsh Government business work related activity from, for example, pre-announcing policy to officials, asking for clarification on government policy, policy discussions, seeking assistance on what officials and ministers should do in	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12	 okay. So, as I said, there are others, I'm just giving you one example. So you're obviously surprised about the Jane Runeckles turning on deleting messages, but do you agree that if other SPADs, special advisers, are deleting messages and encouraging others to do the same, there was obviously an issue on retention of WhatsApps that went much wider than Jane Runeckles? Is that a fair comment, do you think? A. I think all I can say that there was a very clear message that had gone to private office about what the
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	WhatsApp and deletion of message chats by members of the Welsh Government. Just so that you fully understand the context of my question, obviously we've had disclosure of extensive WhatsApps and we can see that WhatsApp's been used for a range of issues by special advisers and Welsh ministers touching on Welsh Government business work related activity from, for example, pre-announcing policy to officials, asking for clarification on government policy, policy discussions, seeking assistance on what officials and ministers should do in certain circumstances.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	 okay. So, as I said, there are others, I'm just giving you one example. So you're obviously surprised about the Jane Runeckles turning on deleting messages, but do you agree that if other SPADs, special advisers, are deleting messages and encouraging others to do the same, there was obviously an issue on retention of WhatsApps that went much wider than Jane Runeckles? Is that a fair comment, do you think? A. I think all I can say that there was a very clear message that had gone to private office about what the proper procedures were. I am not aware personally of
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 9 10 11 12 13	WhatsApp and deletion of message chats by members of the Welsh Government. Just so that you fully understand the context of my question, obviously we've had disclosure of extensive WhatsApps and we can see that WhatsApp's been used for a range of issues by special advisers and Welsh ministers touching on Welsh Government business work related activity from, for example, pre-announcing policy to officials, asking for clarification on government policy, policy discussions, seeking assistance on what officials and ministers should do in certain circumstances. This is just a short list, but you get the idea.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 13	 okay. So, as I said, there are others, I'm just giving you one example. So you're obviously surprised about the Jane Runeckles turning on deleting messages, but do you agree that if other SPADs, special advisers, are deleting messages and encouraging others to do the same, there was obviously an issue on retention of WhatsApps that went much wider than Jane Runeckles? Is that a fair comment, do you think? A. I think all I can say that there was a very clear message that had gone to private office about what the proper procedures were. I am not aware personally of the of the messages that you're referring to. I did
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 2 3 4 5	WhatsApp and deletion of message chats by members of the Welsh Government. Just so that you fully understand the context of my question, obviously we've had disclosure of extensive WhatsApps and we can see that WhatsApp's been used for a range of issues by special advisers and Welsh ministers touching on Welsh Government business work related activity from, for example, pre-announcing policy to officials, asking for clarification on government policy, policy discussions, seeking assistance on what officials and ministers should do in certain circumstances. This is just a short list, but you get the idea. So you have been asked about the disappearing	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	 okay. So, as I said, there are others, I'm just giving you one example. So you're obviously surprised about the Jane Runeckles turning on deleting messages, but do you agree that if other SPADs, special advisers, are deleting messages and encouraging others to do the same, there was obviously an issue on retention of WhatsApps that went much wider than Jane Runeckles? Is that a fair comment, do you think? A. I think all I can say that there was a very clear message that had gone to private office about what the proper procedures were. I am not aware personally of the of the messages that you're referring to. I did read some of the WhatsApp chain that came through, but
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	WhatsApp and deletion of message chats by members of the Welsh Government. Just so that you fully understand the context of my question, obviously we've had disclosure of extensive WhatsApps and we can see that WhatsApp's been used for a range of issues by special advisers and Welsh ministers touching on Welsh Government business work related activity from, for example, pre-announcing policy to officials, asking for clarification on government policy, policy discussions, seeking assistance on what officials and ministers should do in certain circumstances. This is just a short list, but you get the idea. So you have been asked about the disappearing messages being turned on by Jane Runeckles. I just want	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	 okay. So, as I said, there are others, I'm just giving you one example. So you're obviously surprised about the Jane Runeckles turning on deleting messages, but do you agree that if other SPADs, special advisers, are deleting messages and encouraging others to do the same, there was obviously an issue on retention of WhatsApps that went much wider than Jane Runeckles? Is that a fair comment, do you think? A. I think all I can say that there was a very clear message that had gone to private office about what the proper procedures were. I am not aware personally of the of the messages that you're referring to. I did read some of the WhatsApp chain that came through, but it was very long.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 0 11 2 3 4 15 16 17	WhatsApp and deletion of message chats by members of the Welsh Government. Just so that you fully understand the context of my question, obviously we've had disclosure of extensive WhatsApps and we can see that WhatsApp's been used for a range of issues by special advisers and Welsh ministers touching on Welsh Government business work related activity from, for example, pre-announcing policy to officials, asking for clarification on government policy, policy discussions, seeking assistance on what officials and ministers should do in certain circumstances. This is just a short list, but you get the idea. So you have been asked about the disappearing messages being turned on by Jane Runeckles. I just want to give you another example. There are quite a few, but	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	 okay. So, as I said, there are others, I'm just giving you one example. So you're obviously surprised about the Jane Runeckles turning on deleting messages, but do you agree that if other SPADs, special advisers, are deleting messages and encouraging others to do the same, there was obviously an issue on retention of WhatsApps that went much wider than Jane Runeckles? Is that a fair comment, do you think? A. I think all I can say that there was a very clear message that had gone to private office about what the proper procedures were. I am not aware personally of the of the messages that you're referring to. I did read some of the WhatsApp chain that came through, but it was very long. Something that struck me that I was certainly
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 0 1 1 2 3 4 15 16 17 18	WhatsApp and deletion of message chats by members of the Welsh Government. Just so that you fully understand the context of my question, obviously we've had disclosure of extensive WhatsApps and we can see that WhatsApp's been used for a range of issues by special advisers and Welsh ministers touching on Welsh Government business work related activity from, for example, pre-announcing policy to officials, asking for clarification on government policy, policy discussions, seeking assistance on what officials and ministers should do in certain circumstances. This is just a short list, but you get the idea. So you have been asked about the disappearing messages being turned on by Jane Runeckles. I just want to give you another example. There are quite a few, but I'll just give you another one. To be clear, you're not	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	 okay. So, as I said, there are others, I'm just giving you one example. So you're obviously surprised about the Jane Runeckles turning on deleting messages, but do you agree that if other SPADs, special advisers, are deleting messages and encouraging others to do the same, there was obviously an issue on retention of WhatsApps that went much wider than Jane Runeckles? Is that a fair comment, do you think? A. I think all I can say that there was a very clear message that had gone to private office about what the proper procedures were. I am not aware personally of the of the messages that you're referring to. I did read some of the WhatsApp chain that came through, but it was very long. Something that struck me that I was certainly reassured by was that where ministers were asking for
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 2 3 4 5 16 17 18 19	 WhatsApp and deletion of message chats by members of the Welsh Government. Just so that you fully understand the context of my question, obviously we've had disclosure of extensive WhatsApps and we can see that WhatsApp's been used for a range of issues by special advisers and Welsh ministers touching on Welsh Government business work related activity from, for example, pre-announcing policy to officials, asking for clarification on government policy, policy discussions, seeking assistance on what officials and ministers should do in certain circumstances. This is just a short list, but you get the idea. So you have been asked about the disappearing messages being turned on by Jane Runeckles. I just want to give you another example. There are quite a few, but I'll just give you another one. To be clear, you're not in this WhatsApp chat, okay. 	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19	 okay. So, as I said, there are others, I'm just giving you one example. So you're obviously surprised about the Jane Runeckles turning on deleting messages, but do you agree that if other SPADs, special advisers, are deleting messages and encouraging others to do the same, there was obviously an issue on retention of WhatsApps that went much wider than Jane Runeckles? Is that a fair comment, do you think? A. I think all I can say that there was a very clear message that had gone to private office about what the proper procedures were. I am not aware personally of the of the messages that you're referring to. I did read some of the WhatsApp chain that came through, but it was very long. Something that struck me that I was certainly reassured by was that where ministers were asking for clarification of particular policy areas or decisions,
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 0 11 2 3 4 4 5 16 17 18 9 20	WhatsApp and deletion of message chats by members of the Welsh Government. Just so that you fully understand the context of my question, obviously we've had disclosure of extensive WhatsApps and we can see that WhatsApp's been used for a range of issues by special advisers and Welsh ministers touching on Welsh Government business work related activity from, for example, pre-announcing policy to officials, asking for clarification on government policy, policy discussions, seeking assistance on what officials and ministers should do in certain circumstances. This is just a short list, but you get the idea. So you have been asked about the disappearing messages being turned on by Jane Runeckles. I just want to give you another example. There are quite a few, but I'll just give you another one. To be clear, you're not in this WhatsApp chat, okay. This is a WhatsApp chat called "Drake SPADs" and	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	 okay. So, as I said, there are others, I'm just giving you one example. So you're obviously surprised about the Jane Runeckles turning on deleting messages, but do you agree that if other SPADs, special advisers, are deleting messages and encouraging others to do the same, there was obviously an issue on retention of WhatsApps that went much wider than Jane Runeckles? Is that a fair comment, do you think? A. I think all I can say that there was a very clear message that had gone to private office about what the proper procedures were. I am not aware personally of the of the messages that you're referring to. I did read some of the WhatsApp chain that came through, but it was very long. Something that struck me that I was certainly reassured by was that where ministers were asking for clarification of particular policy areas or decisions, then the SPADs and I think it was, from recollection,
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 0 0 11 2 3 4 4 5 6 6 7 8 9 9 0 11 2 2 1 20 21	 WhatsApp and deletion of message chats by members of the Welsh Government. Just so that you fully understand the context of my question, obviously we've had disclosure of extensive WhatsApps and we can see that WhatsApp's been used for a range of issues by special advisers and Welsh ministers touching on Welsh Government business work related activity from, for example, pre-announcing policy to officials, asking for clarification on government policy, policy discussions, seeking assistance on what officials and ministers should do in certain circumstances. This is just a short list, but you get the idea. So you have been asked about the disappearing messages being turned on by Jane Runeckles. I just want to give you another one. To be clear, you're not in this WhatsApp chat, okay. This is a WhatsApp chat called "Drake SPADs" and it's 24 September 2020, and we don't need to name the 	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	 okay. So, as I said, there are others, I'm just giving you one example. So you're obviously surprised about the Jane Runeckles turning on deleting messages, but do you agree that if other SPADs, special advisers, are deleting messages and encouraging others to do the same, there was obviously an issue on retention of WhatsApps that went much wider than Jane Runeckles? Is that a fair comment, do you think? A. I think all I can say that there was a very clear message that had gone to private office about what the proper procedures were. I am not aware personally of the of the messages that you're referring to. I did read some of the WhatsApp chain that came through, but it was very long. Something that struck me that I was certainly reassured by was that where ministers were asking for clarification of particular policy areas or decisions, then the SPADs and I think it was, from recollection, usually Jane Runeckles said that they would send
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 0 1 1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 0 0 1 1 2 2 1 22	 WhatsApp and deletion of message chats by members of the Welsh Government. Just so that you fully understand the context of my question, obviously we've had disclosure of extensive WhatsApps and we can see that WhatsApp's been used for a range of issues by special advisers and Welsh ministers touching on Welsh Government business work related activity from, for example, pre-announcing policy to officials, asking for clarification on government policy, policy discussions, seeking assistance on what officials and ministers should do in certain circumstances. This is just a short list, but you get the idea. So you have been asked about the disappearing messages being turned on by Jane Runeckles. I just want to give you another example. There are quite a few, but 'll just give you another one. To be clear, you're not in this WhatsApp chat, okay. This is a WhatsApp chat called "Drake SPADs" and it's 24 September 2020, and we don't need to name the SpAd, but there's a special adviser who says as follows: 	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	 okay. So, as I said, there are others, I'm just giving you one example. So you're obviously surprised about the Jane Runeckles turning on deleting messages, but do you agree that if other SPADs, special advisers, are deleting messages and encouraging others to do the same, there was obviously an issue on retention of WhatsApps that went much wider than Jane Runeckles? Is that a fair comment, do you think? A. I think all I can say that there was a very clear message that had gone to private office about what the proper procedures were. I am not aware personally of the of the messages that you're referring to. I did read some of the WhatsApp chain that came through, but it was very long. Something that struck me that I was certainly reassured by was that where ministers were asking for clarification of particular policy areas or decisions, then the SPADs and I think it was, from recollection, usually Jane Runeckles said that they would send an email to set that out.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 2 3 4 5 16 17 18 9 20 21 22 23	 WhatsApp and deletion of message chats by members of the Welsh Government. Just so that you fully understand the context of my question, obviously we've had disclosure of extensive WhatsApps and we can see that WhatsApp's been used for a range of issues by special advisers and Welsh ministers touching on Welsh Government business work related activity from, for example, pre-announcing policy to officials, asking for clarification on government policy, policy discussions, seeking assistance on what officials and ministers should do in certain circumstances. This is just a short list, but you get the idea. So you have been asked about the disappearing messages being turned on by Jane Runeckles. I just want to give you another example. There are quite a few, but I'll just give you another one. To be clear, you're not in this WhatsApp chat, okay. This is a WhatsApp chat called "Drake SPADs" and it's 24 September 2020, and we don't need to name the SpAd, but there's a special adviser who says as follows: 	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	 okay. So, as I said, there are others, I'm just giving you one example. So you're obviously surprised about the Jane Runeckles turning on deleting messages, but do you agree that if other SPADs, special advisers, are deleting messages and encouraging others to do the same, there was obviously an issue on retention of WhatsApps that went much wider than Jane Runeckles? Is that a fair comment, do you think? A. I think all I can say that there was a very clear message that had gone to private office about what the proper procedures were. I am not aware personally of the of the messages that you're referring to. I did read some of the WhatsApp chain that came through, but it was very long. Something that struck me that I was certainly reassured by was that where ministers were asking for clarification of particular policy areas or decisions, then the SPADs and I think it was, from recollection, usually Jane Runeckles said that they would send an email to set that out.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 0 1 1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 0 0 1 1 2 2 1 22	 WhatsApp and deletion of message chats by members of the Welsh Government. Just so that you fully understand the context of my question, obviously we've had disclosure of extensive WhatsApps and we can see that WhatsApp's been used for a range of issues by special advisers and Welsh ministers touching on Welsh Government business work related activity from, for example, pre-announcing policy to officials, asking for clarification on government policy, policy discussions, seeking assistance on what officials and ministers should do in certain circumstances. This is just a short list, but you get the idea. So you have been asked about the disappearing messages being turned on by Jane Runeckles. I just want to give you another example. There are quite a few, but 'll just give you another one. To be clear, you're not in this WhatsApp chat, okay. This is a WhatsApp chat called "Drake SPADs" and it's 24 September 2020, and we don't need to name the SpAd, but there's a special adviser who says as follows: 	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	 okay. So, as I said, there are others, I'm just giving you one example. So you're obviously surprised about the Jane Runeckles turning on deleting messages, but do you agree that if other SPADs, special advisers, are deleting messages and encouraging others to do the same, there was obviously an issue on retention of WhatsApps that went much wider than Jane Runeckles? Is that a fair comment, do you think? A. I think all I can say that there was a very clear message that had gone to private office about what the proper procedures were. I am not aware personally of the of the messages that you're referring to. I did read some of the WhatsApp chain that came through, but it was very long. Something that struck me that I was certainly reassured by was that where ministers were asking for clarification of particular policy areas or decisions, then the SPADs and I think it was, from recollection, usually Jane Runeckles said that they would send an email to set that out.

1		that had been sent to private office that that was not	1		cov
2		appropriate, that was not right.	2		tran
3	Q.	No, so if special advisers are deleting messages and	3		of c
4		encouraging others to do the same, you'd agree that was	4		ann
5		clearly wrong, shouldn't have happened?	5		mar
6	Α.	That was not in line with our policy.	6		dive
7	Q.	Did you ever turn on disappearing messages or delete	7		Eng
8		WhatsApps?	8		
9	Α.	I didn't turn on disappearing messages and, as I said	9		you
10		earlier, to be honest I wouldn't know how to, but I know	10		So i
11		I deleted a few early messages. I have no recollection	11		plea
12		of why, beyond I suppose just an attempt at	12		
13		housekeeping. But I am very glad that the entire	13		rem
14		conversation has been made available to the Inquiry,	14		to it
15		because others and I think notably Andrew Goodall kept	15		with
16		all his WhatsApp messages, very properly.	16		
17	Q.	Okay, thank you.	17		all s
18		I'm going to move on from WhatsApps now to the	18		
19		separate topic of face coverings. And just so that we	19		say
20		can situate it, this is 9 June 2020 and, as we know, on	20		
21		that date Vaughan Gething gave a press statement	21		read
22		announcing the latest position that the Welsh Government	22		
23		was taking on face coverings. And, I mean, he said	23		
24		a lot in that press conference, but the gist of it was	24		and
25		that the Welsh Government was recommending face 201	25		
1		or	1		a go
2		Not in detail, I'm afraid.	2		hav
2 3		Not in detail, I'm afraid. Okay. Well, let me see if I can assist you. So the	2 3		hav do y
2 3 4		Not in detail, I'm afraid. Okay. Well, let me see if I can assist you. So the first thing is you're talking about something having	2 3 4	Α.	hav do y I thi
2 3 4 5		Not in detail, I'm afraid. Okay. Well, let me see if I can assist you. So the first thing is you're talking about something having gone wrong. What had gone wrong? What was the concern	2 3 4 5	A.	hav do y I thi I als
2 3 4 5 6		Not in detail, I'm afraid. Okay. Well, let me see if I can assist you. So the first thing is you're talking about something having gone wrong. What had gone wrong? What was the concern around this announcement that had to be made on 9 June	2 3 4 5 6	A.	hav do y I thi I als peo
2 3 4 5 6 7		Not in detail, I'm afraid. Okay. Well, let me see if I can assist you. So the first thing is you're talking about something having gone wrong. What had gone wrong? What was the concern around this announcement that had to be made on 9 June which, as we know, was clearly diverging from UK	2 3 4 5 6 7		hav do y I thi I als peo and
2 3 4 5 6 7 8	Q.	Not in detail, I'm afraid. Okay. Well, let me see if I can assist you. So the first thing is you're talking about something having gone wrong. What had gone wrong? What was the concern around this announcement that had to be made on 9 June which, as we know, was clearly diverging from UK Government policy?	2 3 4 5 6 7 8	A. Q.	hav do y I thi I als peo and But
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	Q. A.	Not in detail, I'm afraid. Okay. Well, let me see if I can assist you. So the first thing is you're talking about something having gone wrong. What had gone wrong? What was the concern around this announcement that had to be made on 9 June which, as we know, was clearly diverging from UK Government policy? I don't know what had gone wrong.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9		hav do y I thi I als peo and But con
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	Q.	Not in detail, I'm afraid. Okay. Well, let me see if I can assist you. So the first thing is you're talking about something having gone wrong. What had gone wrong? What was the concern around this announcement that had to be made on 9 June which, as we know, was clearly diverging from UK Government policy? I don't know what had gone wrong. Okay, fine.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	Q.	hav do y I thi I als peo and But con was
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11	Q. A.	Not in detail, I'm afraid. Okay. Well, let me see if I can assist you. So the first thing is you're talking about something having gone wrong. What had gone wrong? What was the concern around this announcement that had to be made on 9 June which, as we know, was clearly diverging from UK Government policy? I don't know what had gone wrong. Okay, fine. Moving on, then, you were talking here about face	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11	Q. A.	hav do y I thi I als peo and But con was I wa
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11	Q. A.	Not in detail, I'm afraid. Okay. Well, let me see if I can assist you. So the first thing is you're talking about something having gone wrong. What had gone wrong? What was the concern around this announcement that had to be made on 9 June which, as we know, was clearly diverging from UK Government policy? I don't know what had gone wrong. Okay, fine. Moving on, then, you were talking here about face mask militancy. So that's your phrase, and just to see	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12	Q. A. Q.	hav do y I thi I als peo and But con was I was
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	Q. A.	Not in detail, I'm afraid. Okay. Well, let me see if I can assist you. So the first thing is you're talking about something having gone wrong. What had gone wrong? What was the concern around this announcement that had to be made on 9 June which, as we know, was clearly diverging from UK Government policy? I don't know what had gone wrong. Okay, fine. Moving on, then, you were talking here about face mask militancy. So that's your phrase, and just to see if you can assist us with what you meant by that, see if	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	Q. A.	hav do y I thi I als peo and But con was I wa Oka Bec
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	Q. A.	Not in detail, I'm afraid. Okay. Well, let me see if I can assist you. So the first thing is you're talking about something having gone wrong. What had gone wrong? What was the concern around this announcement that had to be made on 9 June which, as we know, was clearly diverging from UK Government policy? I don't know what had gone wrong. Okay, fine. Moving on, then, you were talking here about face mask militancy. So that's your phrase, and just to see if you can assist us with what you meant by that, see if I can assist you, do you mean that there may be a risk	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 13	Q. A. Q.	hav do y I thi I als peo and But con was I was I wa But con arou
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	Q. A.	Not in detail, I'm afraid. Okay. Well, let me see if I can assist you. So the first thing is you're talking about something having gone wrong. What had gone wrong? What was the concern around this announcement that had to be made on 9 June which, as we know, was clearly diverging from UK Government policy? I don't know what had gone wrong. Okay, fine. Moving on, then, you were talking here about face mask militancy. So that's your phrase, and just to see if you can assist us with what you meant by that, see if I can assist you, do you mean that there may be a risk that certain people would have a go at other people for	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	Q. A. Q. A.	hav do y I thi I als peo and But con was I was I wa Oka Bec arou con
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	Q. A. Q.	Not in detail, I'm afraid. Okay. Well, let me see if I can assist you. So the first thing is you're talking about something having gone wrong. What had gone wrong? What was the concern around this announcement that had to be made on 9 June which, as we know, was clearly diverging from UK Government policy? I don't know what had gone wrong. Okay, fine. Moving on, then, you were talking here about face mask militancy. So that's your phrase, and just to see if you can assist us with what you meant by that, see if I can assist you, do you mean that there may be a risk that certain people would have a go at other people for not wearing a mask?	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	Q. A. Q.	hav do y I thi I als peo and But con was I was I wa Oka Bec arou con Doe
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	Q. A. Q.	Not in detail, I'm afraid. Okay. Well, let me see if I can assist you. So the first thing is you're talking about something having gone wrong. What had gone wrong? What was the concern around this announcement that had to be made on 9 June which, as we know, was clearly diverging from UK Government policy? I don't know what had gone wrong. Okay, fine. Moving on, then, you were talking here about face mask militancy. So that's your phrase, and just to see if you can assist us with what you meant by that, see if I can assist you, do you mean that there may be a risk that certain people would have a go at other people for not wearing a mask? Yes.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	Q. A. Q. A.	hav do y I thi I als peo and But con was I wa Oka Bec arou con Doe hes
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	Q. A. Q.	Not in detail, I'm afraid. Okay. Well, let me see if I can assist you. So the first thing is you're talking about something having gone wrong. What had gone wrong? What was the concern around this announcement that had to be made on 9 June which, as we know, was clearly diverging from UK Government policy? I don't know what had gone wrong. Okay, fine. Moving on, then, you were talking here about face mask militancy. So that's your phrase, and just to see if you can assist us with what you meant by that, see if I can assist you, do you mean that there may be a risk that certain people would have a go at other people for not wearing a mask? Yes. Okay.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	Q. A. Q. A.	hav do y I thi I als peo and But con Was I was I was I was Oka Bec arou con Doe hes We
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19	Q. A. Q.	Not in detail, I'm afraid. Okay. Well, let me see if I can assist you. So the first thing is you're talking about something having gone wrong. What had gone wrong? What was the concern around this announcement that had to be made on 9 June which, as we know, was clearly diverging from UK Government policy? I don't know what had gone wrong. Okay, fine. Moving on, then, you were talking here about face mask militancy. So that's your phrase, and just to see if you can assist us with what you meant by that, see if I can assist you, do you mean that there may be a risk that certain people would have a go at other people for not wearing a mask? Yes. Okay. So just to understand, then, why this was a concern	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19	Q. A. Q. A.	hav do y I thi I also peo and But con Was I was I was Coka Con Doe hes We peo
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	Q. A. Q.	Not in detail, I'm afraid. Okay. Well, let me see if I can assist you. So the first thing is you're talking about something having gone wrong. What had gone wrong? What was the concern around this announcement that had to be made on 9 June which, as we know, was clearly diverging from UK Government policy? I don't know what had gone wrong. Okay, fine. Moving on, then, you were talking here about face mask militancy. So that's your phrase, and just to see if you can assist us with what you meant by that, see if I can assist you, do you mean that there may be a risk that certain people would have a go at other people for not wearing a mask? Yes. Okay. So just to understand, then, why this was a concern for you: in the context of this policy announcement, was	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	Q. A. Q. Q.	hav do y I thi I als peo and But con was I was I was Oka Beo aron Con Doe hes We peo a he
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	Q. A. Q.	Not in detail, I'm afraid. Okay. Well, let me see if I can assist you. So the first thing is you're talking about something having gone wrong. What had gone wrong? What was the concern around this announcement that had to be made on 9 June which, as we know, was clearly diverging from UK Government policy? I don't know what had gone wrong. Okay, fine. Moving on, then, you were talking here about face mask militancy. So that's your phrase, and just to see if you can assist us with what you meant by that, see if I can assist you, do you mean that there may be a risk that certain people would have a go at other people for not wearing a mask? Yes. Okay. So just to understand, then, why this was a concern for you: in the context of this policy announcement, was it being anticipated that the Welsh Government divergent	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	Q. A. Q. A.	hav do y I thi I als peo and But con Was I was I was I was I was Oka Bec aron con Doe hes We peo a he I dic
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	Q. A. Q.	Not in detail, I'm afraid. Okay. Well, let me see if I can assist you. So the first thing is you're talking about something having gone wrong. What had gone wrong? What was the concern around this announcement that had to be made on 9 June which, as we know, was clearly diverging from UK Government policy? I don't know what had gone wrong. Okay, fine. Moving on, then, you were talking here about face mask militancy. So that's your phrase, and just to see if you can assist us with what you meant by that, see if I can assist you, do you mean that there may be a risk that certain people would have a go at other people for not wearing a mask? Yes. Okay. So just to understand, then, why this was a concern for you: in the context of this policy announcement, was it being anticipated that the Welsh Government divergent approach on face coverings particularly on public	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	Q. A. Q. Q.	hav do y I thi I als peo and But con Was I was I was I was I was Oka Bec arou con Doe hes We peo a he I dic earl
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	Q. A. Q.	Not in detail, I'm afraid. Okay. Well, let me see if I can assist you. So the first thing is you're talking about something having gone wrong. What had gone wrong? What was the concern around this announcement that had to be made on 9 June which, as we know, was clearly diverging from UK Government policy? I don't know what had gone wrong. Okay, fine. Moving on, then, you were talking here about face mask militancy. So that's your phrase, and just to see if you can assist us with what you meant by that, see if I can assist you, do you mean that there may be a risk that certain people would have a go at other people for not wearing a mask? Yes. Okay. So just to understand, then, why this was a concern for you: in the context of this policy announcement, was it being anticipated that the Welsh Government divergent approach on face coverings particularly on public transport could result in people having a go at other	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	Q. A. Q. Q.	hav do y I thi I also peo and But con Was I wa Oka Bec arou con Doe hes We peo a he I dic earl you
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	Q. A. Q.	Not in detail, I'm afraid. Okay. Well, let me see if I can assist you. So the first thing is you're talking about something having gone wrong. What had gone wrong? What was the concern around this announcement that had to be made on 9 June which, as we know, was clearly diverging from UK Government policy? I don't know what had gone wrong. Okay, fine. Moving on, then, you were talking here about face mask militancy. So that's your phrase, and just to see if you can assist us with what you meant by that, see if I can assist you, do you mean that there may be a risk that certain people would have a go at other people for not wearing a mask? Yes. Okay. So just to understand, then, why this was a concern for you: in the context of this policy announcement, was it being anticipated that the Welsh Government divergent approach on face coverings particularly on public	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	Q. A. Q. Q.	hav do y I thi I als peo and But con Was I was I was I was I was Oka Bec arou con Doe hes We peo a he I dic earl

uiry		4 March 2024
1		coverings on social transport sorry, on public
2		transport where social distancing was not possible, and
3		of course we know by this time the UK Government had
4		announced that on public transport face coverings were
5		mandatory. So at this point on 9 June, we have this
6 -		divergent approach on public transport, Wales versus
7		England.
8		So I want to ask you about a WhatsApp exchange where
9		you appear to be discussing this policy announcement.
0		So if we can get up, please, INQ000388424, and it's 004,
1		please. The entry is right at the bottom.
2		Now, I appreciate that this it's tricky to
3		remember hundreds of WhatsApps, so let me just take you
4		to it. It's at the very bottom here, and it starts off
5		with on 9 June at 10.32, you say:
6		"Hope all goes well at the press conference it
7		all sounded a bit muddled at 9 am."
8		Then we have somebody whose name has been redacted
9		saying:
20		"A number of heads banged together [Document
!1		read] from the TFW side."
2		Then you respond again:
3		"Good huge scope for multiple misinterpretation
24		and face mask militancy."
25		Okay. So first of all do you remember this exchange 202
1		a go, when they got into Wales, because somebody didn't
2		have a mask on? Was that what you were concerned about,
3		do you think?
4	۹.	I think that would always have been a possibility, but
5		I also think that there was very clear advice given to
6		people about what was what the rules were in Wales
7		and what the rules were in England.
в (Q .	But why, just on this face mask militancy, why are you
9		concerned that there may be face mask militancy? Why
0		was
1	۹.	I was concerned about people being angry.
2 (ว .	Okay, Why?

kay. Why?

13	Α.	Because there was such a lot of emotion at the time
14		around the pandemic, not surprisingly, and I was
15		concerned about any anger amongst amongst people.
40	~	

pes this maybe suggest that there was a degree of

- sitancy, certainly within certain quarters of the
- elsh Government, about mandating and requiring Welsh
- ople to wear face coverings in public, that there was nesitancy?
- idn't detect any hesitancy. I think you've heard
- rlier today from Sir Frank, who will have explained to
- u the advice he gave to the Welsh Government at
- ferent times. So I would not say there was any
- sitancy. I think the Welsh Government and ministers 204

UK Covid-19 Inquiry

1	at all times were very clear about the decisions they	
2	had taken. So, no, not hesitancy.	
3	Q. What expert evidence did you have to suggest that this	
4	concept of face mask militancy was something that had to	
5	be considered or given any credence at all? Did you	
6	have any expert advice?	
7	A. I had no expert advice, I wouldn't describe that comment	
8	there as as a comment of significance beyond general	
9	concern about people's reactions to each other when they	
10	were under the horrendous pressure of the pandemic.	
11	MS HEAVEN: Thank you very much.	
12	Thank you, my Lady, those are my questions.	
13	LADY HALLETT: Thank you, Ms Heaven.	
14	I understand that we've had some extra questions	
15	come in. Mr Gardner, do you have a question?	
16	We're running out of stenographer time, so just to	
17	make sure everybody understands, I will cut people short	
18	when we get to the stage where we're running out of	
19	time, over running out of time.	
20	So, Mr Gardner, was there a question you wanted to	
21	put?	
22	(Pause)	
23	Actually have I got the right?	
24	Yes, very well, ask your question, Mr Gardner.	
25	Questions from MR GARDNER 205	
	203	
1	human rights, those were very those were significant	
1 2	human rights, those were very those were significant documents which inevitably had to draw on a range of	
2	documents which inevitably had to draw on a range of	
2 3	documents which inevitably had to draw on a range of information.	
2 3 4	 documents which inevitably had to draw on a range of information. Q. So in effect am I would I be correct to say, as Sally Holland said in her evidence, that certainly in the early stages of the pandemic, children's rights 	
2 3 4 5	documents which inevitably had to draw on a range of information.Q. So in effect am I would I be correct to say, as Sally Holland said in her evidence, that certainly in	
2 3 4 5 6 7 8	 documents which inevitably had to draw on a range of information. Q. So in effect am I would I be correct to say, as Sally Holland said in her evidence, that certainly in the early stages of the pandemic, children's rights 	
2 3 4 5 6 7	 documents which inevitably had to draw on a range of information. Q. So in effect am I would I be correct to say, as Sally Holland said in her evidence, that certainly in the early stages of the pandemic, children's rights impact assessments were not being habitually undertaken 	
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	 documents which inevitably had to draw on a range of information. Q. So in effect am I would I be correct to say, as Sally Holland said in her evidence, that certainly in the early stages of the pandemic, children's rights impact assessments were not being habitually undertaken at the time of the decision to which they relate? A. I think it depend what you mean, because I am confident that none of our ministers would have taken any 	
2 3 5 6 7 8 9	 documents which inevitably had to draw on a range of information. Q. So in effect am I would I be correct to say, as Sally Holland said in her evidence, that certainly in the early stages of the pandemic, children's rights impact assessments were not being habitually undertaken at the time of the decision to which they relate? A. I think it depend what you mean, because I am confident that none of our ministers would have taken any decisions that had an impact on children and young 	
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	 documents which inevitably had to draw on a range of information. Q. So in effect am I would I be correct to say, as Sally Holland said in her evidence, that certainly in the early stages of the pandemic, children's rights impact assessments were not being habitually undertaken at the time of the decision to which they relate? A. I think it depend what you mean, because I am confident that none of our ministers would have taken any 	
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	 documents which inevitably had to draw on a range of information. Q. So in effect am I would I be correct to say, as Sally Holland said in her evidence, that certainly in the early stages of the pandemic, children's rights impact assessments were not being habitually undertaken at the time of the decision to which they relate? A. I think it depend what you mean, because I am confident that none of our ministers would have taken any decisions that had an impact on children and young 	
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	 documents which inevitably had to draw on a range of information. Q. So in effect am I would I be correct to say, as Sally Holland said in her evidence, that certainly in the early stages of the pandemic, children's rights impact assessments were not being habitually undertaken at the time of the decision to which they relate? A. I think it depend what you mean, because I am confident that none of our ministers would have taken any decisions that had an impact on children and young people without having considered those factors. Q. I'll come back to that, I think, in the general point, but 	
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	 documents which inevitably had to draw on a range of information. Q. So in effect am I would I be correct to say, as Sally Holland said in her evidence, that certainly in the early stages of the pandemic, children's rights impact assessments were not being habitually undertaken at the time of the decision to which they relate? A. I think it depend what you mean, because I am confident that none of our ministers would have taken any decisions that had an impact on children and young people without having considered those factors. Q. I'll come back to that, I think, in the general point, but LADY HALLETT: I'm not sure you will, Mr Gardner, I'm afraid 	
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	 documents which inevitably had to draw on a range of information. Q. So in effect am I would I be correct to say, as Sally Holland said in her evidence, that certainly in the early stages of the pandemic, children's rights impact assessments were not being habitually undertaken at the time of the decision to which they relate? A. I think it depend what you mean, because I am confident that none of our ministers would have taken any decisions that had an impact on children and young people without having considered those factors. Q. I'll come back to that, I think, in the general point, but LADY HALLETT: I'm not sure you will, Mr Gardner, I'm afraid we're going to have to cut you short there. I'm sorry. 	
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	 documents which inevitably had to draw on a range of information. Q. So in effect am I would I be correct to say, as Sally Holland said in her evidence, that certainly in the early stages of the pandemic, children's rights impact assessments were not being habitually undertaken at the time of the decision to which they relate? A. I think it depend what you mean, because I am confident that none of our ministers would have taken any decisions that had an impact on children and young people without having considered those factors. Q. I'll come back to that, I think, in the general point, but LADY HALLETT: I'm not sure you will, Mr Gardner, I'm afraid we're going to have to cut you short there. I'm sorry. MR GARDNER: There, my Lady, or just one? 	
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	 documents which inevitably had to draw on a range of information. Q. So in effect am I would I be correct to say, as Sally Holland said in her evidence, that certainly in the early stages of the pandemic, children's rights impact assessments were not being habitually undertaken at the time of the decision to which they relate? A. I think it depend what you mean, because I am confident that none of our ministers would have taken any decisions that had an impact on children and young people without having considered those factors. Q. I'll come back to that, I think, in the general point, but LADY HALLETT: I'm not sure you will, Mr Gardner, I'm afraid we're going to have to cut you short there. I'm sorry. MR GARDNER: There, my Lady, or just one? LADY HALLETT: There. 	
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19	 documents which inevitably had to draw on a range of information. Q. So in effect am I would I be correct to say, as Sally Holland said in her evidence, that certainly in the early stages of the pandemic, children's rights impact assessments were not being habitually undertaken at the time of the decision to which they relate? A. I think it depend what you mean, because I am confident that none of our ministers would have taken any decisions that had an impact on children and young people without having considered those factors. Q. I'll come back to that, I think, in the general point, but LADY HALLETT: I'm not sure you will, Mr Gardner, I'm afraid we're going to have to cut you short there. I'm sorry. MR GARDNER: There, my Lady, or just one? LADY HALLETT: I'm grateful. 	
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	 documents which inevitably had to draw on a range of information. Q. So in effect am I would I be correct to say, as Sally Holland said in her evidence, that certainly in the early stages of the pandemic, children's rights impact assessments were not being habitually undertaken at the time of the decision to which they relate? A. I think it depend what you mean, because I am confident that none of our ministers would have taken any decisions that had an impact on children and young people without having considered those factors. Q. I'll come back to that, I think, in the general point, but LADY HALLETT: I'm not sure you will, Mr Gardner, I'm afraid we're going to have to cut you short there. I'm sorry. MR GARDNER: There, my Lady, or just one? LADY HALLETT: I'm grateful. LADY HALLETT: I'm sorry, Ms Foubister, I thought you were 	
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	 documents which inevitably had to draw on a range of information. Q. So in effect am I would I be correct to say, as Sally Holland said in her evidence, that certainly in the early stages of the pandemic, children's rights impact assessments were not being habitually undertaken at the time of the decision to which they relate? A. I think it depend what you mean, because I am confident that none of our ministers would have taken any decisions that had an impact on children and young people without having considered those factors. Q. I'll come back to that, I think, in the general point, but LADY HALLETT: I'm not sure you will, Mr Gardner, I'm afraid we're going to have to cut you short there. I'm sorry. MR GARDNER: There, my Lady, or just one? LADY HALLETT: I'm sorry, Ms Foubister, I thought you were looking at me quizzically, I'd completely forgotten I'd 	
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	 documents which inevitably had to draw on a range of information. Q. So in effect am I would I be correct to say, as Sally Holland said in her evidence, that certainly in the early stages of the pandemic, children's rights impact assessments were not being habitually undertaken at the time of the decision to which they relate? A. I think it depend what you mean, because I am confident that none of our ministers would have taken any decisions that had an impact on children and young people without having considered those factors. Q. I'll come back to that, I think, in the general point, but LADY HALLETT: I'm not sure you will, Mr Gardner, I'm afraid we're going to have to cut you short there. I'm sorry. MR GARDNER: There, my Lady, or just one? LADY HALLETT: I'm sorry, Ms Foubister, I thought you were looking at me quizzically, I'd completely forgotten I'd given permission for you to ask one. You wanted to ask 	
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	 documents which inevitably had to draw on a range of information. Q. So in effect am I would I be correct to say, as Sally Holland said in her evidence, that certainly in the early stages of the pandemic, children's rights impact assessments were not being habitually undertaken at the time of the decision to which they relate? A. I think it depend what you mean, because I am confident that none of our ministers would have taken any decisions that had an impact on children and young people without having considered those factors. Q. I'll come back to that, I think, in the general point, but LADY HALLETT: I'm not sure you will, Mr Gardner, I'm afraid we're going to have to cut you short there. I'm sorry. MR GARDNER: There, my Lady, or just one? LADY HALLETT: I'm sorry, Ms Foubister, I thought you were looking at me quizzically, I'd completely forgotten I'd given permission for you to ask one. You wanted to ask permission to ask a second one, is that right? 	
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24	 documents which inevitably had to draw on a range of information. Q. So in effect am I would I be correct to say, as Sally Holland said in her evidence, that certainly in the early stages of the pandemic, children's rights impact assessments were not being habitually undertaken at the time of the decision to which they relate? A. I think it depend what you mean, because I am confident that none of our ministers would have taken any decisions that had an impact on children and young people without having considered those factors. Q. I'll come back to that, I think, in the general point, but LADY HALLETT: I'm not sure you will, Mr Gardner, I'm afraid we're going to have to cut you short there. I'm sorry. MR GARDNER: There, my Lady, or just one? LADY HALLETT: I'm sorry, Ms Foubister, I thought you were looking at me quizzically, I'd completely forgotten I'd given permission for you to ask one. You wanted to ask permission to ask a second one, is that right? MS FOUBISTER: I think we have two pre-approved ones, and it 	
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	 documents which inevitably had to draw on a range of information. Q. So in effect am I would I be correct to say, as Sally Holland said in her evidence, that certainly in the early stages of the pandemic, children's rights impact assessments were not being habitually undertaken at the time of the decision to which they relate? A. I think it depend what you mean, because I am confident that none of our ministers would have taken any decisions that had an impact on children and young people without having considered those factors. Q. I'll come back to that, I think, in the general point, but LADY HALLETT: I'm not sure you will, Mr Gardner, I'm afraid we're going to have to cut you short there. I'm sorry. MR GARDNER: There, my Lady, or just one? LADY HALLETT: I'm sorry, Ms Foubister, I thought you were looking at me quizzically, I'd completely forgotten I'd given permission for you to ask one. You wanted to ask permission to ask a second one, is that right? 	

4	мп	CADDIED: Dama Manage Livetwant to nick up from where
1	IVIR	GARDNER: Dame Morgan, I just want to pick up from where
2		we were in your answers to Counsel to the Inquiry
3		relating to children's rights impact assessments.
4		Would you agree with me that for CRIAs to be
5		effective, there should be contemporaneous documents?
6	Α.	Sorry, for what to be effective?
7	Q.	For them to be effective documents, they should be
8		completed contemporaneously?
9	Α.	Ideally, I would agree with that, but there are
10		of course circumstances where it's not absolutely
11		possible to do that, if there are competing priorities.
12	Q.	And how would they go about considering the impact of
13		policies and decisions if they're not completed
14		contemporaneously?
15	Α.	They would draw on contemporaneous evidence. I think
16		that is the point, and that takes us back to the need to
17		record all evidence and how decisions were taken.
18	Q.	But how would they be in the mind of the decision-maker
19		if they're not being completed alongside the decision?
20	Α.	The I think in most cases they were. It depends
21		whether you're talking about the integrated impact
22		assessment that was carried out at the time of the
23		ministerial advice paper or at the time of the
24		discussion on the 21-day review. If you're talking
25		about the separate impact assessment on children and
1		ask permission
2		DY HALLETT: Thank you.
2 3		DY HALLETT: Thank you. FOUBISTER: to ask the other ones.
2 3 4		DY HALLETT: Thank you. FOUBISTER: to ask the other ones. Thank you, my Lady.
2 3 4 5	MS	DY HALLETT: Thank you. FOUBISTER: to ask the other ones. Thank you, my Lady. Questions from MS FOUBISTER
2 3 4 5 6	MS	DY HALLETT: Thank you. FOUBISTER: to ask the other ones. Thank you, my Lady. Questions from MS FOUBISTER FOUBISTER: Good afternoon, Dame Shan, I represent
2 3 4 5 6 7	MS	DY HALLETT: Thank you. FOUBISTER: to ask the other ones. Thank you, my Lady. Questions from MS FOUBISTER FOUBISTER: Good afternoon, Dame Shan, I represent John's Campaign and Care Rights UK.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8	MS	DY HALLETT: Thank you. FOUBISTER: to ask the other ones. Thank you, my Lady. Questions from MS FOUBISTER FOUBISTER: Good afternoon, Dame Shan, I represent John's Campaign and Care Rights UK. I'm going to refer to your witness statement, which
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	MS	DY HALLETT: Thank you. FOUBISTER: to ask the other ones. Thank you, my Lady. Questions from MS FOUBISTER FOUBISTER: Good afternoon, Dame Shan, I represent John's Campaign and Care Rights UK. I'm going to refer to your witness statement, which is INQ000371233, on page 10 at paragraph 33, and you say
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	MS	DY HALLETT: Thank you. FOUBISTER: to ask the other ones. Thank you, my Lady. Questions from MS FOUBISTER FOUBISTER: Good afternoon, Dame Shan, I represent John's Campaign and Care Rights UK. I'm going to refer to your witness statement, which is INQ000371233, on page 10 at paragraph 33, and you say at the beginning of this paragraph that you believe that
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11	MS	DY HALLETT: Thank you. FOUBISTER: to ask the other ones. Thank you, my Lady. Questions from MS FOUBISTER FOUBISTER: Good afternoon, Dame Shan, I represent John's Campaign and Care Rights UK. I'm going to refer to your witness statement, which is INQ000371233, on page 10 at paragraph 33, and you say at the beginning of this paragraph that you believe that the Welsh Government had a strong focus on vulnerable Description
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12	MS	POP HALLETT: Thank you. FOUBISTER: to ask the other ones. Thank you, my Lady. Questions from MS FOUBISTER FOUBISTER: Good afternoon, Dame Shan, I represent John's Campaign and Care Rights UK. I'm going to refer to your witness statement, which is INQ000371233, on page 10 at paragraph 33, and you say at the beginning of this paragraph that you believe that the Welsh Government had a strong focus on vulnerable and at-risk groups, and you cite initiatives such as the
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	MS	DY HALLETT: Thank you. FOUBISTER: to ask the other ones. Thank you, my Lady. Questions from MS FOUBISTER FOUBISTER: Good afternoon, Dame Shan, I represent John's Campaign and Care Rights UK. I'm going to refer to your witness statement, which is INQ000371233, on page 10 at paragraph 33, and you say at the beginning of this paragraph that you believe that the Welsh Government had a strong focus on vulnerable and at-risk groups, and you cite initiatives such as the BAME advisory group. Do you believe that the government
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	MS	DY HALLETT: Thank you. FOUBISTER: to ask the other ones. Thank you, my Lady. Questions from MS FOUBISTER FOUBISTER: Good afternoon, Dame Shan, I represent John's Campaign and Care Rights UK. I'm going to refer to your witness statement, which is INQ000371233, on page 10 at paragraph 33, and you say at the beginning of this paragraph that you believe that the Welsh Government had a strong focus on vulnerable and at-risk groups, and you cite initiatives such as the BAME advisory group. Do you believe that the government had the care sector in mind? Diagram
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	MS MS	DY HALLETT: Thank you. FOUBISTER: to ask the other ones. Thank you, my Lady. Questions from MS FOUBISTER FOUBISTER: Good afternoon, Dame Shan, I represent John's Campaign and Care Rights UK. I'm going to refer to your witness statement, which is INQ000371233, on page 10 at paragraph 33, and you say at the beginning of this paragraph that you believe that the Welsh Government had a strong focus on vulnerable and at-risk groups, and you cite initiatives such as the BAME advisory group. Do you believe that the government had the care sector in mind? I do believe that.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	MS	DY HALLETT: Thank you. FOUBISTER: to ask the other ones. Thank you, my Lady. Questions from MS FOUBISTER FOUBISTER: Good afternoon, Dame Shan, I represent John's Campaign and Care Rights UK. I'm going to refer to your witness statement, which is INQ000371233, on page 10 at paragraph 33, and you say at the beginning of this paragraph that you believe that the Welsh Government had a strong focus on vulnerable and at-risk groups, and you cite initiatives such as the BAME advisory group. Do you believe that the government had the care sector in mind? I do believe that. Are there any examples of comparable initiatives in
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	MS MS A. Q.	DY HALLETT: Thank you. FOUBISTER: to ask the other ones. Thank you, my Lady. Questions from MS FOUBISTER FOUBISTER: Good afternoon, Dame Shan, I represent John's Campaign and Care Rights UK. I'm going to refer to your witness statement, which is INQ000371233, on page 10 at paragraph 33, and you say at the beginning of this paragraph that you believe that the Welsh Government had a strong focus on vulnerable and at-risk groups, and you cite initiatives such as the BAME advisory group. Do you believe that the government had the care sector in mind? I do believe that. Are there any examples of comparable initiatives in relation to carers or people who require care?
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	MS MS	DY HALLETT: Thank you. FOUBISTER: to ask the other ones. Thank you, my Lady. Questions from MS FOUBISTER FOUBISTER: Good afternoon, Dame Shan, I represent John's Campaign and Care Rights UK. I'm going to refer to your witness statement, which is INQ000371233, on page 10 at paragraph 33, and you say at the beginning of this paragraph that you believe that the Welsh Government had a strong focus on vulnerable and at-risk groups, and you cite initiatives such as the BAME advisory group. Do you believe that the government had the care sector in mind? I do believe that. Are there any examples of comparable initiatives in relation to carers or people who require care? I'm afraid not having had notice of the question, I
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	MS MS A. Q.	DY HALLETT: Thank you. FOUBISTER: to ask the other ones. Thank you, my Lady. Questions from MS FOUBISTER FOUBISTER: Good afternoon, Dame Shan, I represent John's Campaign and Care Rights UK. I'm going to refer to your witness statement, which is INQ000371233, on page 10 at paragraph 33, and you say at the beginning of this paragraph that you believe that the Welsh Government had a strong focus on vulnerable and at-risk groups, and you cite initiatives such as the BAME advisory group. Do you believe that the government had the care sector in mind? I do believe that. Are there any examples of comparable initiatives in relation to carers or people who require care? I'm afraid not having had notice of the question, I I can't give an example that springs to mind, but but
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	MS MS A. Q.	DY HALLETT: Thank you. FOUBISTER: to ask the other ones. Thank you, my Lady. Questions from MS FOUBISTER FOUBISTER: Good afternoon, Dame Shan, I represent John's Campaign and Care Rights UK. I'm going to refer to your witness statement, which is INQ000371233, on page 10 at paragraph 33, and you say at the beginning of this paragraph that you believe that the Welsh Government had a strong focus on vulnerable and at-risk groups, and you cite initiatives such as the BAME advisory group. Do you believe that the government had the care sector in mind? I do believe that. Are there any examples of comparable initiatives in relation to carers or people who require care? I'm afraid not having had notice of the question, I I can't give an example that springs to mind, but but I know that Welsh Government ministers were looking at
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	MS MS A. Q.	DY HALLETT: Thank you. FOUBISTER: to ask the other ones. Thank you, my Lady. Questions from MS FOUBISTER FOUBISTER: Good afternoon, Dame Shan, I represent John's Campaign and Care Rights UK. I'm going to refer to your witness statement, which is INQ000371233, on page 10 at paragraph 33, and you say at the beginning of this paragraph that you believe that the Welsh Government had a strong focus on vulnerable and at-risk groups, and you cite initiatives such as the BAME advisory group. Do you believe that the government had the care sector in mind? I do believe that. Are there any examples of comparable initiatives in relation to carers or people who require care? I'm afraid not having had notice of the question, I I can't give an example that springs to mind, but but I know that Welsh Government ministers were looking at all vulnerable groups and looking at whatever they could
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	MS MS A. Q.	DY HALLETT: Thank you. FOUBISTER: to ask the other ones. Thank you, my Lady. Questions from MS FOUBISTER FOUBISTER: Good afternoon, Dame Shan, I represent John's Campaign and Care Rights UK. I'm going to refer to your witness statement, which is INQ000371233, on page 10 at paragraph 33, and you say at the beginning of this paragraph that you believe that the Welsh Government had a strong focus on vulnerable and at-risk groups, and you cite initiatives such as the BAME advisory group. Do you believe that the government had the care sector in mind? I do believe that. Are there any examples of comparable initiatives in relation to carers or people who require care? I'm afraid not having had notice of the question, I I can't give an example that springs to mind, but but I know that Welsh Government ministers were looking at all vulnerable groups and looking at whatever they could do to manage the pandemic across the whole country.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	MS MS A. Q.	DY HALLETT: Thank you. FOUBISTER: to ask the other ones. Thank you, my Lady. Questions from MS FOUBISTER FOUBISTER: Good afternoon, Dame Shan, I represent John's Campaign and Care Rights UK. I'm going to refer to your witness statement, which is INQ000371233, on page 10 at paragraph 33, and you say at the beginning of this paragraph that you believe that the Welsh Government had a strong focus on vulnerable and at-risk groups, and you cite initiatives such as the BAME advisory group. Do you believe that the government had the care sector in mind? I do believe that. Are there any examples of comparable initiatives in relation to carers or people who require care? I'm afraid not having had notice of the question, I I can't give an example that springs to mind, but but I know that Welsh Government ministers were looking at all vulnerable groups and looking at whatever they could do to manage the pandemic across the whole country. I can't at the moment think of a specific example. I'm
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	MS MS A. Q.	DY HALLETT: Thank you. FOUBISTER: to ask the other ones. Thank you, my Lady. Questions from MS FOUBISTER FOUBISTER: Good afternoon, Dame Shan, I represent John's Campaign and Care Rights UK. I'm going to refer to your witness statement, which is INQ000371233, on page 10 at paragraph 33, and you say at the beginning of this paragraph that you believe that the Welsh Government had a strong focus on vulnerable and at-risk groups, and you cite initiatives such as the BAME advisory group. Do you believe that the government had the care sector in mind? I do believe that. Are there any examples of comparable initiatives in relation to carers or people who require care? I'm afraid not having had notice of the question, I I can't give an example that springs to mind, but but I know that Welsh Government ministers were looking at all vulnerable groups and looking at whatever they could do to manage the pandemic across the whole country.

25 parts of the Inquiry.

208

UK Covid-19 Inquiry

1	Q. You explained deep dives to us earlier this afternoon,
2	and you mentioned specifically a deep dive on
3	care homes. Do you recall what that covered and would
4	it have covered, for example, consideration of the
5	indirect harms of the Covid response on people in
6	care homes?
7	A. I think I referred to a deep dive on social care, and
8	I don't recollect the detail of that discussion. But
9	the whole point of the deep dives was to look very
10	broadly at the immediate and the longer term impacts of
11	any restrictions, any policy developments. So I am
12	quite sure that we would have covered that.
13	Q. And so just to be clear, because I think earlier you
14	referred to care homes and just then you said
15	social care, would it have covered things like unpaid
16	care, domiciliary care, rather than just being limited
17	to care homes?
18	A. I don't recall I'm afraid in sufficient detail to be
19	able to say confidently.
20	MS FOUBISTER: My Lady, that leads me to the one we don't
21	have permission for yet, if there's time for me to
22	request it.
23	LADY HALLETT: It's about whether well, you can ask the
24	first one, which is the health professionals led the
25	initial part of the Covid response.
1	Thank you very much for your help, Dame Shan. I'm
2	tempted to ask you what it's like going from the
3	diplomatic service to running the civil service in
4	Wales, but I think maybe for another time.
5	Thank you very much for all you have done.
6	(The witness withdrew)
7	LADY HALLETT: Right, that completes today's evidence.
8	MR POOLE: My Lady, it does.
9	LADY HALLETT: We shall return at 10 o'clock tomorrow.
10	(4.24 pm)
11	(The hearing adjourned until 10 am
12	on Tuesday, 5 March 2024)
13	
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
04	
21	
22	
22 23	
22	

1	MS FOUBISTER: Yes.			
2	So, Dame Shan, earlier you explained that health			
3	professionals led the initial part of the Covid			
4	response. Does it follow that you considered their			
5	involvement became less pronounced as the pandemic			
6	progressed and, if so, do you think that was right or do			
7	you think they should have remained at the forefront of			
8	the response?			
9	A. Not at all, I think the rest of us joined in. It's that			
10	way around, that we went from we went from a response			
11	by the Welsh Government that was led by the excellent			
12	health professionals to a Welsh Government-wide			
13	response. At the beginning it was the health minister			
14	who led in discussions and negotiations with the			
15	UK Government, for example, but as time moved on and it			
16	was clear that there what the potential impact of the			
17	pandemic might be across Wales, then the whole of the			
18	Welsh Government took part in those discussions.			
19	So rather than the health professionals being put on			
20	one side, we were heavily dependent on them throughout			
21	the whole process, and, as I said, I think			
22	Andrew Goodall led that process really outstandingly.			
23	MS FOUBISTER: Thank you.			
24	Thank you, my Lady.			
25	LADY HALLETT: Thank you very much indeed. 210			

1	INDEX	
2	F	AGE
3	SIR FRANK ATHERTON (sworn)	1
4	Questions from LEAD COUNSEL TO THE INQUIRY	1
5	for MODULE 2B	
6	Questions from MS HEAVEN	62
7	Questions from MS FOUBISTER	73
8		
9	DR ROBERT ORFORD (affirmed)	75
10	Questions from LEAD COUNSEL TO THE INQUIRY	75
11	for MODULE 2B	
12	Questions from MS HEAVEN	145
13	Questions from MS FOUBISTER	149
14		
15	DAME SHAN MORGAN (affirmed)	152
16	Questions from LEAD COUNSEL TO THE INQUIRY	.152
17	for MODULE 2B	
18	Questions from MS HEAVEN	198
19	Questions from MR GARDNER	205
20	Questions from MS FOUBISTER	208
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		

212

LADY HALLETT: [40] 1/6 6/8 6/11 43/22 43/25 44/2 54/15 54/19 62/19 73/2 75/3 75/6 75/10 109/1 109/4 109/8 113/6 113/9 113/11 120/9 120/14 145/9	1.45 [1] 109/4 1.45 pm [1] 109/7 10 [4] 28/21 36/5 196/4 208/9 10 am [1] 211/11 10 August [1] 64/13 10 August 2020 [1] 52/13 10 December 2021	15 July 2020 [1] 51/6 15 minutes [1] 151/23 15 minutes' [1] 44/20 15 October [2] 136/19 137/11 15,000 [1] 126/14 15-minute [1] 151/22 15th [2] 112/17	1984 [3] 50/4 50/5 154/2 1987 [1] 154/2 1990 [1] 154/5 1992 [1] 154/8 1997 [1] 154/9 2	102/24 103/2 103/5 105/18 106/1 106/18 108/24 109/10 113/18 117/4 120/23 121/16 123/3 123/9 130/16 130/18 143/2 143/11 146/10 149/17 155/1 165/25 166/15 170/3 173/1 173/4 173/17
148/23 151/9 151/15	[1] 56/18	147/17	2 December [1]	174/9 175/6 179/18
151/20 151/24 152/2	10 o'clock [1] 211/9	16 [2] 41/17 127/19	142/12	181/20 184/23 185/3
152/6 178/2 198/21	10,000 [1] 126/16	16 April [1] 127/7	2 March [3] 34/24	185/5 187/12 189/15
205/13 207/15 207/18	10.00 am [1] 1/2	16 August [2] 60/24	35/10 130/18	190/17 192/20 193/2
207/20 208/2 209/23	10.04 [1] 188/15	61/5	2 October [1] 132/13	196/3 197/1 197/15
210/25 211/7 211/9	10.32 [1] 202/15	16 March [3] 58/17	2-3 [1] 112/1	199/21 201/20
MR GARDNER: [3]	100,000 [1] 59/18	59/14 111/12	2.2 [1] 131/19	2020/21 [1] 140/14
206/1 207/17 207/19	100,000 people [1]	160 [2] 73/17 73/20	2.45 pm [1] 152/3	2021 [25] 4/5 43/3
MR POOLE: [23] 1/3	59/15	16th [1] 61/16	2.5 [1] 144/20	43/9 43/23 44/5 44/7
1/9 6/13 43/23 44/4	101 [1] 57/21	17 [6] 33/3 110/8	20 [3] 45/23 47/23	56/15 56/18 57/23
54/14 54/20 62/16	105,000 staff [1]	110/13 123/20 141/11	130/4	94/9 143/20 144/1
75/5 75/14 75/17	126/12	178/22	20 April [1] 127/24	154/17 166/2 168/7
108/24 109/9 113/17	109 [1] 30/14	17 April [1] 124/5	20 February [8]	174/4 174/14 182/19
120/18 145/6 151/21	11 [2] 53/23 114/5	17 April 2020 [1]	27/12 30/24 30/25	183/9 183/19 184/3
151/25 152/8 152/11	11 February [5]	123/9	31/18 32/17 106/10	196/3 196/4 196/6
178/6 198/18 211/8	13/10 13/15 13/20	17 June 2009 [1]	107/7 107/21	196/14
MS FOUBISTER:	81/10 81/18	182/5	20 February 2020 [1]	2022 [3] 7/13 143/20
[11] 73/5 75/1 149/1	11 February 2020 [1]	17 March [3] 110/12	30/11	150/9
149/4 151/6 207/24	13/8	110/13 187/21	20 March [3] 110/16	2023 [2] 1/20 149/8
208/3 208/6 209/20	11 March [2] 37/2	18 [2] 153/1 185/5	169/20 191/23	2024 [2] 1/1 211/12
210/1 210/23	114/5	18 December 2023	20 March 2020 [2]	21 [1] 140/14
MS HEAVEN: [6]	11 May [3] 44/25	[1] 1/20	170/3 190/17	21 days [1] 42/13
62/21 73/1 145/11	50/19 63/7	18 February [4]	20,000 [2] 40/2 115/8	21 December 2021
148/22 198/23 205/11	11 October [2]	33/17 33/23 185/14	200 [2] 98/3 110/1	[1] 57/23
THE WITNESS: [7] 1/8 75/9 75/12 109/3 151/8 151/14 151/18 •	135/19 145/20 11 September 2020 [2] 53/20 54/8 11.13 am [1] 54/16 11.30 [1] 54/15 11.30 am [1] 54/18	186/6 18 October [2] 137/19 139/4 18 September [2] 131/2 131/4 18 September 2020	2002 [1] 2/20 2008 [2] 2/23 154/11 2009 [1] 182/5 2010 [1] 5/1 2011 [1] 196/13 2012 [4] 2/21 2/23	21 March [1] 119/7 21 March 2020 [1] 197/15 21 November [1] 116/5 21 September [1]
'21 [1] 43/22 'instant [1] 178/24 0 004 [1] 202/10	12 March [3] 37/12	[1] 130/16	2/25 154/12	131/16
	108/14 110/7	189 [1] 116/9	2016 [2] 2/13 2/25	21 September 2020
	12 weeks [1] 59/17	19 [40] 4/13 14/19	2017 [3] 76/15	[1] 55/15
	12.45 pm [1] 109/5	23/18 23/21 24/24	154/13 164/6	21,000 [1] 113/1
	13 [2] 113/25 116/9	27/7 28/6 33/7 51/2	2018 [1] 178/15	21-day [13] 42/9
1	13 December [1]	62/22 67/24 68/6	2019 [7] 3/20 12/18	42/14 73/22 100/23
1 April [2] 119/8	152/21	68/13 69/14 69/16	17/6 19/5 154/24	162/17 162/24 173/17
124/8	13 March 2020 [1]	70/15 71/15 78/13	178/16 179/14	173/22 193/15 194/7
1 August [2] 60/23	121/16	78/13 79/8 90/15	2020 [100] 5/18 5/22	194/25 195/3 206/24
61/13	13 May [1] 121/1	90/18 100/7 105/15	7/13 7/15 11/10 12/14	22 [4] 35/3 111/19
1 August 2002 [1]	13.04 [1] 190/25	105/17 107/14 110/17	12/20 13/7 13/8 14/12	198/5 198/5
2/20	13.12 [1] 191/11	116/9 125/13 127/22	15/14 15/16 15/19	22 January [3] 20/3
1 August 2008 [1]	131 [1] 100/5	128/14 128/16 130/17	18/17 19/1 22/8 23/4	20/22 80/21
2/23	14 July 2020 [1]	139/9 143/5 145/16	23/16 25/14 26/21	22 January 2020 [3]
1 August 2016 [1]	130/18	174/6 184/25 187/11	27/6 28/5 29/9 29/18	13/7 22/8 80/17
2/25	14 March [1] 37/7	198/24	30/11 43/6 43/24	22 July 2020 [1] 94/8
1 December 2020 [1]	14 October [1]	19 April 2021 [1]	47/12 47/23 48/9	22 June [1] 60/17
143/2	137/14	183/19	50/14 50/19 51/6	22 March [3] 117/8
1 June [1] 112/23	14 September [1]	19 December [2]	52/13 53/20 54/8	118/3 159/24
1 March [1] 109/13	53/22	76/3 143/10	54/20 55/15 58/17	22 March 2020 [1]
1 May 2012 [2] 2/21	14.05 [1] 191/14	19 December 2023	59/1 60/16 63/2 67/23	117/4
2/23 1.2 [3] 141/13 141/15 141/17	1400 [1] 190/19 1400 hours [1] 177/14 15 [1] 38/9	[1] 149/8 19.26 [1] 187/23 190 [4] 149/10 149/11 149/16 149/18		22nd [1] 118/8 23 [2] 21/16 126/15 23 March [7] 40/11 41/4 41/16 41/17 42/5

(54) LADY HALLETT: - 23 March

2	106/15	745 [1] 112/22	57/16 58/16 59/12	71/25 74/11 81/8 82/4
		75 [2] 107/10 128/4	59/12 59/14 63/1 63/3	1 1
23 March [2] 112/10 118/7	124/8	75-80 [1] 30/22	63/21 65/23 66/10	119/7 167/18
23 November [1]	33 [1] 208/9	77 [1] 56/21	67/5 67/6 67/8 68/18	accessible [3] 99/14
76/5	34,000 [1] 113/2	79 [1] 56/21	69/2 69/9 69/13 70/13	1 1
23,000 [1] 126/17	35 [1] 113/4	8	72/22 73/8 73/20	accord [4] 163/21
23rd [1] 118/10	36,000 [1] 126/12		73/22 74/5 74/8 74/11	173/18 189/18 193/3
24 [1] 21/23	38 [1] 165/23	8 April 2020 [1] 67/23	74/13 74/16 78/18	According [1] 113/5
24 April [1] 127/25	38 days [1] 140/1	8 January [1] 27/12	84/20 88/25 90/4 92/2	accordingly [2]
24 January [6] 19/23	4	8 weeks [1] 103/19	92/24 94/21 95/25 96/21 97/21 102/23	32/14 32/18
20/21 23/18 24/19	4 June 2020 [1]	8.11 [1] 188/2	103/19 103/22 106/2	account [7] 18/20 18/21 53/5 70/16
103/8 104/10	60/16	8.13 [1] 188/6	108/24 110/1 113/21	71/11 150/6 176/23
24 January 2020 [3]	4 March 2024 [1] 1/1		116/5 117/3 117/12	accountability [2]
12/14 12/20 23/16	4.24 pm [1] 211/10	80,000 [1] 126/17	117/18 118/3 118/14	172/17 172/22
24 March [1] 59/14	40 [2] 30/19 142/16	9	118/23 121/13 126/21	accountable [2]
24 September 2020 [1] 199/21	41 [1] 82/6	-	127/1 128/21 130/13	157/9 157/17
25 [1] 128/5	43 [1] 142/16	9 am [1] 202/17	130/14 143/19 143/23	
25 February [7]	5	9 April [1] 68/12	146/19 146/20 146/25	
24/25 32/25 34/5		9 April 2020 [1]	147/14 148/25 149/6	accounts [2] 180/5
103/15 103/22 104/4	5 February [2] 28/18 186/12	123/3 9 June [3] 202/5	151/3 153/23 153/24	180/8
104/12	5 February 2020 [1]	9 June [3] 202/5 202/15 203/6	154/20 159/20 160/6	accrue [1] 140/16
25 November 2021	29/9	9 June 2020 [2]	162/25 164/1 164/3	accrued [1] 140/18
[2] 182/19 183/9	5 March 2024 [1]	50/19 201/20	164/17 164/23 165/11 165/20 165/21 167/21	accumulation [1] 126/5
25 September [1]	211/12	9 March [1] 114/1	169/16 169/24 172/17	accurate [7] 119/15
132/6	5 May 2020 [1] 99/2	9 November [1]	172/21 172/21 173/9	120/12 120/16 154/18
26 [1] 22/1	5.1 [1] 33/9	141/8	173/9 174/25 176/8	154/19 161/4 161/5
27 February [3]	5.3 [1] 33/12	9 October [2] 133/2	179/9 179/23 180/17	acknowledge [1]
104/18 104/20 105/9	50 [6] 31/15 32/6	135/7	182/6 184/21 184/24	50/12
27 February 2020 [1] 90/6	99/13 106/15 106/21	9,000 [1] 126/13	188/20 188/21 189/1	acknowledged [1]
27 March [2] 118/14	128/6	96 [1] 52/10	189/2 189/7 190/2	171/5
121/7	50-70 [1] 124/19	Α	192/16 193/6 195/20	across [19] 12/2
27 November 2021	500 [2] 38/2 38/5	ability [1] 6/21	197/11 197/13 199/15	1 1
[2] 56/15 144/1	56 [1] 61/2	able [32] 6/3 8/12	200/4 200/12 202/8	134/25 135/10 140/23
28 April 2020 [1]	57 [1] 61/21	8/15 14/22 36/15 38/7	203/4 203/11 204/2	141/2 161/14 167/18
50/14	6	41/14 60/21 63/23	204/6 204/11 204/15 204/18 205/1 205/9	169/2 170/5 173/25
28 February [1]	6 April [1] 163/13	70/19 81/14 81/20	206/12 206/21 206/25	177/10 186/10 192/9 208/22 210/17
35/16	6 July [2] 60/19	82/19 84/21 89/8	200/12/200/21/200/23	act [7] 11/13 40/22
29 [2] 128/6 179/18	60/22	89/10 91/17 97/10	Above [1] 117/14	50/4 50/5 50/7 83/13
29 June [3] 54/22	6,000 Covid [1] 119/8		absence [1] 11/21	147/18
55/6 60/20	6.6 [1] 178/23	99/16 101/20 107/3	absolute [5] 56/10	acted [2] 126/22
29 October 2020 [1]	60 [2] 153/5 153/11	108/8 118/3 134/14	71/3 122/9 130/25	142/11
181/20 2 B [6] 1/5 75/16	61 [3] 47/20 153/5	136/7 150/23 155/23	136/14	acting [1] 171/19
152/10 212/5 212/11	153/12	168/9 209/19	absolutely [14] 13/18	
212/17	62 [3] 48/19 153/5 153/12	about [186] 4/12 6/14 6/21 7/1 8/2 9/8 9/14	41/10/00/12 10/25	36/3 105/10 109/9
	68 [1] 130/17	11/25 12/1 12/16 13/1	71/9 72/18 85/21	109/23 123/21 131/11
3	69 days [1] 113/4	13/5 16/10 16/11	95/25 120/15 152/4	137/9 157/12 168/6
3 April [1] 69/19		17/10 18/24 19/3 19/6	137/12 147/20 159/3 206/10	177/25 186/13 189/21
3 June 2020 [1]	7	22/9 22/19 23/3 24/10	absorb [1] 168/20	actions [9] 21/19 22/5 22/7 29/13 42/4
54/20	7 April 2020 [1]	24/23 25/12 25/19	absorbed [1] 171/25	82/7 98/8 121/18
3 March [2] 36/1	120/23	25/20 26/7 27/3 27/10	abstruse [1] 99/25	158/22
36/11 3 March 2020 [1]	7 December [1]	28/6 28/7 30/8 31/21	academic [2] 97/6	active [2] 85/13 97/8
3 March 2020 [1] 109/10	142/1	32/7 32/22 34/13	98/1	actively [2] 96/12
3 o'clock [1] 152/2	7 June [2] 47/19	34/15 37/5 37/8 38/11	accept [8] 64/19	97/4
3.00 pm [1] 152/5	64/11	39/17 40/24 42/9 43/5	64/24 69/24 72/18	activities [1] 115/19
3.9 [1] 36/5	7 June 2020 [1] 48/9	43/6 43/10 45/10	95/21 176/21 193/9	activity [4] 44/12
30 [4] 32/6 37/15	7 May [1] 50/16 7 May 2020 [1] 73/21	45/17 45/17 45/21	195/1	108/17 134/2 199/9
106/20 185/3	7/6/20 [1] 47/23	45/22 46/23 47/5 48/22 49/3 50/1 51/13	acceptable [3]	acts [1] 167/7
30 April [1] 127/12	70 [2] 1/22 124/19	51/18 53/8 54/12		actual [2] 36/21
30-50 [2] 31/15	72 [1] 3/17	56/21 56/24 57/6	accepted [1] 64/8	167/13
			access [10] 4/16	actually [21] 25/24
				(55) 23 March actually

(55) 23 March... - actually

Α	42/15 43/3 45/19	78/9 79/25 80/7 80/19	agenda [4] 33/5 33/8	167/21 168/14 175/13
	46/23 47/13 47/14	86/25 150/13 158/3	104/14 189/17	180/8 180/25 181/8
actually [20] 32/6 45/23 46/1 49/12	49/19 50/12 50/18	182/21 199/22	agendas [1] 25/2	182/7 182/25 183/13
59/21 59/24 97/9 99/2	51/19 52/22 53/6 54/1	advisers [11] 8/16	ago [5] 9/11 63/1	183/13 183/18 183/25
99/5 101/22 110/14	54/1 54/8 55/16 55/18	83/3 86/17 87/25	119/3 147/1 182/15	191/8 191/15 194/1
111/5 115/22 119/22	55/24 56/11 58/1	88/22 92/25 182/12	agree [40] 12/5 14/23	194/17 194/20 195/23
129/11 176/6 192/7	63/10 63/11 65/6	182/21 199/7 200/6	15/2 23/6 23/13 23/15	198/18 200/11 201/16
195/20 196/9 205/23	65/17 65/20 65/24	201/3	28/4 30/25 31/1 32/15	202/16 202/17 202/25
actuals [1] 139/23	65/25 66/9 66/13	advisers' [1] 84/5	34/8 38/16 38/20 40/4	205/1 205/5 206/17
acute [1] 121/25	66/17 66/24 66/24	advises [2] 10/20	42/1 44/17 51/24 54/8	208/21 210/9 211/5
ad [4] 15/13 15/18	66/25 69/25 70/4 70/5	114/12	55/1 70/3 108/17	All right [1] 65/22
101/8 101/10	70/11 70/13 70/16	advising [7] 46/10	111/25 116/24 122/13	
ad hoc [4] 15/13	70/16 70/17 71/9	50/10 56/9 58/19	123/25 134/19 135/23	
15/18 101/8 101/10	71/13 72/6 72/14 78/4	77/10 95/13 131/11		allow [6] 39/17 54/25
adapted [2] 32/14	84/6 84/14 90/14	advisory [22] 4/16	167/10 172/15 177/15	
32/18	90/24 92/9 93/9 93/17	14/16 16/25 17/1 52/3		175/22
add [7] 43/9 43/18	93/20 93/21 93/25	54/4 59/9 66/18 79/9	200/6 201/4 206/4	allowing [5] 113/22
60/12 86/12 104/23	94/8 94/11 95/1 97/4	80/12 84/11 85/16	206/9	116/6 116/10 116/20
162/18 172/25	97/6 98/22 99/1 99/4	89/22 89/25 90/3	agreed [12] 7/9 11/16	
added [5] 42/23 43/2	99/5 101/5 101/5	90/10 90/13 95/23	11/21 12/8 19/22 42/1	alluded [3] 7/20
43/22 86/14 172/3	101/9 101/22 101/25	96/7 98/2 136/7	42/1 80/2 121/6	119/3 128/24
addition [1] 78/19	102/1 102/4 102/5	208/13	145/13 171/17 183/4	almost [1] 59/15
additional [3] 5/21	102/6 102/11 102/17	advocate [1] 97/12	agreement [7]	alone [1] 72/7
17/18 168/18	104/15 105/22 110/11	advocating [2] 65/11	117/24 119/9 119/13	along [3] 52/3 174/5
address [1] 194/20	111/2 111/5 113/21	65/13	119/16 119/19 119/19	180/24
addressed [4] 33/8	114/3 114/21 114/25	affairs [2] 154/10	174/11	alongside [8] 4/21
98/14 122/11 148/9	115/3 115/4 115/4	172/8	agrees [1] 29/11	9/4 9/7 89/23 97/19
adequate [1] 168/1	115/24 116/2 116/3	affected [2] 39/4	ahead [12] 37/8	170/18 170/22 206/19
adequately [1] 66/20	123/5 125/23 127/11	70/25	39/18 40/3 40/6	Alpha [2] 140/15
adjourned [1] 211/11			113/23 114/17 115/11	146/8
adjournment [1]	128/21 129/21 131/4	152/9 212/9 212/15	115/14 115/17 116/6	already [21] 9/14
109/6	131/20 132/3 132/8	afford [2] 58/3 58/11	116/11 135/19	9/18 19/2 24/3 27/19
administration [4]	132/14 133/3 135/6	affordability [2]	aimed [3] 29/14	30/22 36/10 51/25
82/24 88/7 155/20	135/7 135/16 137/15	138/19 148/7	121/18 129/23	78/18 86/13 107/11
156/21	138/7 139/3 139/3	afforded [1] 3/9	akin [1] 17/23	107/23 122/22 125/17
administrations [8]	139/5 140/10 140/22	afraid [6] 75/7 171/23		153/2 168/19 172/3
20/9 20/25 119/14	140/25 141/4 141/5	203/2 207/15 208/18	Albert [2] 68/2 72/23	186/11 187/15 194/6 197/21
190/3 192/6 192/9	141/5 141/10 141/12 141/18 142/10 142/10	209/18	Albert Heaney [2] 68/2 72/23	also [52] 1/16 1/18
192/17 192/24	141/18 142/10 142/10 142/18		alert [4] 100/12	2/5 2/24 9/21 22/2
administrative [10]	143/2 143/4 143/16	140/6 141/7 165/16	142/23 143/13 197/2	22/6 23/10 27/25 28/7
5/13 5/21 6/7 6/15	143/20 145/4 147/15	177/21 178/8 193/19	alerting [1] 29/21	38/21 39/5 44/16
7/19 8/6 8/12 8/18	148/11 148/17 150/21	196/6 196/6	align [3] 50/2 53/19	50/25 60/3 63/21
8/25 87/17	158/6 158/8 159/22	afternoon [6] 145/16	69/10	75/23 76/4 76/6 79/12
admission [3] 67/24	159/25 160/5 160/14	149/4 152/14 198/24	aligned [5] 49/16	81/20 82/20 83/19
123/4 123/6	160/19 160/21 160/25		59/8 59/24 64/11	84/8 84/11 91/2 95/15
admissions [1] 68/5	161/2 161/3 161/6	afterwards [1]	65/14	95/19 97/22 113/3
admit [1] 68/12	161/10 161/16 161/22	187/25	alignment [2] 48/21	116/19 121/14 127/16
adopted [8] 55/3 60/7	162/2 162/13 162/24	again [31] 1/6 29/8	49/14	128/24 140/11 152/16
101/13 129/5 131/21	163/8 163/11 173/4	35/4 53/11 55/13	all [78] 11/1 19/22	154/14 155/17 158/7
166/9 175/13 186/19	194/6 204/5 204/23	56/17 61/9 63/2 75/7	22/5 27/3 36/7 38/25	162/19 165/15 165/21
adopting [1] 48/23	205/6 205/7 206/23	75/8 96/11 96/12	40/10 41/4 49/24	169/5 171/3 174/10
adoption [1] 197/4	advisable [1] 46/10	97/15 100/10 104/14	53/18 53/22 56/1 58/4	176/2 183/15 187/7
advance [1] 115/9	advise [9] 3/10 18/9	106/22 107/15 123/7	59/8 62/16 64/6 65/2	194/17 196/13 196/19
advanced [1] 112/14	38/1 38/4 88/2 115/13	124/3 128/9 129/24	65/22 69/2 69/4 77/1	204/5
advantage [4] 38/22	123/1 123/7 130/11	130/2 143/15 143/18	79/16 81/14 88/21	alternative [2] 71/6
57/8 155/23 156/22	advised [15] 24/19	158/19 162/1 163/18	95/8 98/1 109/16	72/19
advice [183] 4/11 4/19 4/23 10/2 14/13	25/11 40/5 44/25	187/3 189/3 199/1	110/5 115/18 115/21	although [18] 3/7
4/19 4/23 10/2 14/13 16/22 18/9 18/10	50/15 54/3 58/22 59/4	202/22	117/14 124/23 127/8	49/2 49/5 52/22 72/1
18/12 18/18 18/20	59/16 63/8 64/7 103/9	against [6] 38/4 40/5	131/15 145/6 146/22	78/1 83/9 102/18
18/21 21/24 24/21	110/9 110/19 131/2	63/22 67/15 100/16	149/13 154/18 154/19	105/14 106/1 137/5
24/23 37/10 39/16	adviser [18] 4/21	115/13	155/20 157/2 157/7	159/14 177/16 179/14
39/21 40/16 42/1	4/25 5/6 10/25 52/13	age [1] 53/23	158/17 161/3 163/15	186/12 189/5 189/13
	76/14 77/4 77/8 78/7	Agency [1] 76/23	163/15 164/16 164/17	196/8
L				(E6) actually although

(56) actually... - although

Α	Ann John [3] 66/1	appeared [2] 26/25	152/22 153/12 155/13	42/8 56/17 58/15 60/6
	66/12 66/17	82/13	155/20 155/21 155/21	60/24 69/9 69/13 75/8
always [8] 15/23 17/22 87/15 87/17	Ann John's [1] 96/20	appearing [1] 28/13	156/6 157/2 168/9	75/24 75/25 80/23
93/23 193/24 194/13	annex [1] 160/23	appears [5] 47/19	169/23 178/24 183/3	87/19 87/20 88/25
204/4	announced [7] 40/11	47/24 56/19 119/8	184/14 191/9 191/9	98/20 102/23 103/6
am [24] 1/2 29/12	54/21 58/18 60/17	174/15	191/9 198/19 199/17	113/20 121/12 128/16
30/17 54/16 54/18	60/20 139/9 202/4	applies [1] 182/7	200/3 200/6 201/3	130/13 130/14 136/18
63/15 88/6 89/13	announcement [6] 54/22 119/6 121/23	appointed [7] 4/5 154/3 154/6 154/13	204/8 205/12 206/9 206/11 208/16	143/19 145/13 145/22 150/24 151/12 152/14
93/15 96/9 97/25	202/9 203/6 203/20	154/14 173/14 174/12		152/16 152/17 153/22
117/14 134/11 155/7	announcements [1]	appraisal [1] 157/14	94/19 98/4 132/1	164/2 165/20 169/16
160/24 164/10 164/20	191/5	appreciate [4] 135/3	180/14 198/12	174/24 184/21 193/5
200/13 201/13 202/17 207/4 207/9 209/11	announcing [4]	168/8 172/20 202/12	areas [13] 2/17 10/21	197/12 202/8 205/24
211/11	121/17 191/2 199/9	appreciated [2] 65/9	96/5 133/23 135/21	207/22 207/22 207/23
am I [1] 207/4	201/22	105/17	142/16 142/18 162/14	208/1 208/3 209/23
ambassador [1]	annual [5] 17/5 17/20		166/13 168/1 169/4	211/2
154/11	157/14 165/15 181/6	36/6 38/19 47/8 47/8	197/25 200/19	asked [20] 47/3 55/7
ambition [2] 36/14	annually [1] 181/5	48/23 56/3 64/20	aren't [1] 3/7	55/11 60/3 63/1 63/3
92/11	anodyne [1] 34/20	65/21 66/4 66/11 89/20 101/13 125/3	aren't [1] 3/7	65/23 67/5 67/6 85/6
Amelia's [1] 170/19	another [13] 13/5 30/10 61/21 113/6	89/20 101/13 125/3	Argentina [1] 154/11 argue [1] 10/7	118/8 118/14 130/10 145/13 146/12 146/19
ameliorate [1] 74/24	113/8 113/13 133/2	202/6 203/22	argued [1] 50/24	146/25 153/17 153/20
amendments [1]	172/2 174/2 186/18	approaches [1] 82/9	argument [3] 49/6	199/15
42/16	199/17 199/18 211/4	approaching [1]	138/21 141/1	asking [7] 48/2 59/11
among [1] 130/18	answer [10] 21/7	94/22	arguments [1] 51/11	59/13 80/19 177/12
amongst [3] 187/21 204/15 204/15	44/8 47/6 56/6 92/14	appropriate [6] 41/25		199/10 200/18
amount [2] 6/3 41/5	110/25 114/10 114/16		93/10 140/14	asks [1] 114/3
analyse [1] 136/24	123/15 189/10	108/25 201/2	arose [1] 12/3	aspect [3] 17/14
analysis [3] 14/13	answered [1] 118/20	approved [1] 207/24	around [51] 6/2 8/8	55/11 158/4
128/2 142/15	answers [1] 206/2	approximately [1]	11/10 30/1 31/8 43/16	
analytical [2] 130/23	anticipated [2] 139/11 203/21	113/1 April [28] 6/2 7/15	44/13 44/13 45/20 45/21 50/3 54/9 63/21	67/2 194/20 aspiration [2] 31/7
151/3	anxieties [1] 192/16	43/6 50/14 67/22	67/14 73/21 74/2	36/16
Andrew [20] 3/22 4/1	anxious [1] 70/10	67/23 68/12 69/19	74/17 80/11 80/13	ass [1] 40/5
24/7 25/5 30/3 155/16	any [61] 2/8 10/22	91/19 119/8 120/23	85/2 90/5 95/23 96/6	assembled [1]
165/5 168/12 170/9 171/17 177/7 177/7	11/14 12/18 15/15	123/3 123/9 123/20	98/9 122/17 126/9	118/11
187/16 187/17 188/15	15/18 22/7 24/16	124/5 124/8 127/7	127/5 128/9 128/12	assessing [1] 194/8
190/20 190/24 192/11	25/21 26/10 26/19	127/12 127/24 127/25		assessment [19]
201/15 210/22	31/6 33/6 42/16 46/23	149/17 150/9 163/12	133/21 134/2 134/21	42/16 47/2 89/8 89/11
Andrew Goodall [11]	51/24 52/6 66/8 72/7	163/13 183/19 184/3	136/9 138/7 138/8	100/11 100/13 100/14
3/22 24/7 25/5 30/3	72/8 73/11 74/19	186/25 189/14	138/11 138/13 138/23	108/18 162/21 165/14
155/16 168/12 177/7	85/15 86/22 103/1 113/14 130/5 130/19	April 2020 [4] 7/15 43/6 91/19 149/17	139/19 142/14 142/23 147/9 148/5 171/17	193/25 194/4 194/5 196/20 196/21 197/2
187/16 190/24 201/15	132/21 137/3 138/25	April 2021 [1] 184/3	173/16 203/6 204/14	197/6 206/22 206/25
210/22	153/8 153/20 156/10	April 2022 [1] 150/9	210/10	assessments [14]
Andrew Goodall's [2] 165/5 192/11	156/15 161/7 163/4	are [88] 1/23 2/1 2/11		162/22 193/7 193/15
Andrew Slade [6]	168/11 172/1 174/20	3/9 7/5 8/24 22/5	16/20 16/20 18/1 18/6	193/18 194/12 195/2
170/9 171/17 177/7	177/13 177/19 177/25		86/22	195/9 195/11 196/10
187/17 188/15 190/20	180/7 181/16 181/18	36/22 38/18 48/11	arrangements [4]	196/23 197/8 197/10
Andrews' [1] 191/12	182/8 183/25 189/21	48/21 51/8 58/2 62/17		206/3 207/7
Aneurin [1] 124/14	190/18 193/8 194/8	68/4 76/9 76/11 76/13		assigned [1] 88/1
Aneurin Bevan [1]	204/15 204/21 204/24 205/5 205/6 207/10	87/6 87/25 90/9 90/20	arrive [9] 24/20 25/12	assist [4] 121/19 203/3 203/13 203/14
124/14	208/16 209/11 209/11	91/21 98/20 102/8	103/10 104/11 105/23	
Angela [1] 150/14	anybody [4] 66/9	105/20 106/7 106/24	148/2	199/12
Angela McLean [1]	70/22 152/6 180/7	115/23 115/24 120/15		assisted [1] 87/11
150/14	anything [6] 88/12	120/15 126/11 126/12	146/11 164/6	assisting [1] 1/13
anger [1] 204/15 Anglocentric [2]	116/18 152/17 179/13	126/13 126/14 126/15		associated [3] 94/1
109/13 109/23	184/11 195/15	126/16 126/16 128/25		136/10 136/12
angry [1] 204/11	anyway [1] 151/17	131/10 131/25 132/21		Association [3] 2/22
Ann [6] 51/14 66/1	apparent [3] 16/19	133/9 134/16 136/14	Asia [1] 19/18	69/17 197/14
66/12 66/17 95/7	23/24 32/4	137/1 143/15 145/7 148/9 148/10 150/6	Asian [2] 19/14 44/15 ask [53] 1/14 9/8	assume [3] 15/14 101/8 108/21
96/20	appear [3] 34/4 36/20 202/9	150/14 150/21 150/23		assumed [1] 176/18
		100/20		
				(57) always - assumed

(57) always - assumed

Α	198/17	BAME [1] 208/13	46/10 48/8 48/10 50/2	behind [1] 112/13
Assuming [1] 11/19	autumn [6] 82/11	banged [1] 202/20	53/16 53/19 54/24	being [86] 11/4 21/3
assumption [2] 41/4	113/18 138/12 140/13	banning [1] 38/17	55/18 56/9 56/25	21/4 21/19 22/7 22/23
46/22	147/24 189/3	bars [3] 39/25 115/11	58/25 59/2 59/15	23/5 29/17 33/25
assumptions [1]	autumn/winter [2]	115/18	65/23 67/3 67/5 67/6	34/14 34/23 35/16
105/2	113/18 140/13	base [1] 32/12	70/14 71/10 72/4 76/1	36/11 40/23 41/23
assurance [3] 22/20	available [14] 22/16	based [10] 14/13	81/17 81/19 81/20	43/6 45/15 46/13
164/16 181/14	84/2 91/16 108/10	19/17 22/11 42/15	81/20 83/9 83/15	46/20 47/15 50/12
assuring [2] 161/2	122/8 126/10 127/18	50/12 76/25 103/18	83/20 84/2 84/17	52/5 52/12 55/3 60/7
181/6	140/19 144/5 144/9	114/22 119/9 143/16	84/17 84/18 85/1	61/6 62/9 62/14 64/5
asymptomatic [25]	144/24 177/20 195/10		89/16 91/6 93/12	64/13 64/14 67/14
31/15 31/18 31/20	201/14	basically [1] 122/5	94/23 102/2 102/13 102/14 102/16 108/11	68/14 70/1 70/24 71/17 71/21 78/3 83/9
31/21 31/22 32/1 32/4	avoid [2] 70/11 110/10	basis [12] 18/4 29/24 32/15 34/5 46/22 49/7		
32/7 32/10 32/16 68/7	avoidable [1] 143/12	128/23 129/3 163/4	112/18 113/3 113/18	93/13 95/17 102/20
71/1 106/2 106/6	avoided [1] 42/6	165/18 180/21 193/2	115/13 117/24 119/9	104/9 104/15 105/6
106/7 106/15 106/19	aware [34] 7/5 13/19	be [224]	119/16 120/11 123/17	106/6 107/23 107/23
107/5 125/12 126/1	20/12 30/2 85/7 86/24		127/23 128/10 129/2	111/4 118/23 119/2
127/3 127/5 127/20	96/7 103/4 105/15	became [20] 11/6	129/3 129/5 132/4	121/10 135/4 136/7
128/10 129/4	106/19 115/24 116/1	18/18 31/11 32/4	135/3 136/13 136/23	138/21 142/23 153/5
asymptomatic-mild	127/23 128/7 132/3	32/13 49/15 52/1 52/1	137/25 138/2 139/13	155/23 156/21 158/19
[1] 106/15 at [384]	132/21 138/20 165/5	76/23 78/12 84/2	139/15 140/19 140/20	163/7 167/2 169/3
at [384] at-risk [2] 43/8	176/4 176/6 176/7	94/18 100/12 144/17	140/24 141/19 144/4	171/6 171/21 172/20
208/12	176/14 176/15 176/18	145/4 156/14 164/8	144/5 146/1 147/13	174/5 178/1 180/5
Atherton [17] 1/3 1/4	180/1 180/7 180/12	173/10 184/25 210/5	148/8 148/24 150/4	183/4 184/10 184/15
1/11 1/11 69/1 79/19	183/2 184/14 184/25	because [46] 6/15	153/2 156/8 160/11	189/17 191/19 194/10
79/20 103/8 103/16	185/10 185/11 185/12	16/20 22/16 22/19	160/19 164/5 164/5	197/9 199/16 203/21
104/1 104/18 106/10	200/13	38/23 42/10 43/12	165/21 166/8 170/24	204/11 206/19 207/7
106/19 107/7 111/19	awareness [5] 16/10	46/5 49/12 50/4 53/16 56/8 58/10 65/7 67/6	171/25 173/22 178/7 180/4 182/18 183/2	209/16 210/19
136/20 212/3	27/9 86/15 89/24 185/21	75/10 83/7 92/23 93/3		being: [1] 42/18 being: first [1] 42/18
attached [1] 20/1	away [6] 15/10 54/4	103/2 107/6 112/14	185/13 186/25 190/6	belief [4] 1/25 76/10
attacheé [1] 154/10	168/15 189/4 189/6	117/25 118/13 130/3	190/11 192/13 195/2	152/23 153/14
attempt [1] 201/12	189/25	137/8 141/23 148/12	197/10 198/9 199/6	believe [22] 27/23
attempts [1] 84/23	awful [1] 57/6	151/15 156/15 162/1	199/15 201/1 201/14	39/5 42/3 42/7 47/1
attend [12] 7/22 13/8 13/9 34/18 81/21	axis [1] 52/3	162/4 164/22 176/9	202/18 204/4	50/4 65/17 66/20
114/11 131/17 132/2	B	180/11 184/18 194/5	before [25] 9/20 11/8	74/21 81/1 87/10
153/8 163/17 192/25		194/16 194/17 195/9	13/2 26/23 37/10	111/11 140/20 144/19
193/1	back [49] 1/6 6/23	197/1 201/15 204/1	44/20 67/20 68/15	167/24 168/22 187/2
attendance [2] 81/10	11/20 12/24 17/21	204/13 207/9 209/13	69/13 72/21 76/20	190/11 196/8 208/10
189/21	20/21 27/15 27/18	become [5] 16/19	84/4 84/6 106/3	208/13 208/15
attended [9] 8/20	28/8 41/7 41/13 41/13 47/6 49/4 49/24 62/4	19/15 132/18 138/16		
12/11 33/17 34/24	63/1 64/25 65/16	198/10	130/14 145/22 151/21 152/23 153/22 154/2	below [9] 131/3 132/9 132/16 139/7
131/17 159/7 185/6	67/22 71/3 74/14	becomes [3] 31/10 84/6 127/17	172/7 184/4	141/13 141/15 141/19
187/7 190/13	78/18 109/20 112/3	becoming [1] 71/2	beg [1] 44/1	155/2 155/5
attending [5] 1/13	126/8 128/15 131/3	bed [1] 103/19	begin [1] 185/15	beneficial [2] 16/15
35/21 39/25 81/13	133/15 135/8 138/5	beds [3] 122/7	beginning [11] 5/25	18/3
164/18	139/17 140/1 145/18	126/16 126/17	67/22 83/4 83/15	benefit [9] 16/17
attention [3] 149/15 184/6 186/8	148/4 148/20 151/12	been [159] 2/12 5/2	94/13 101/11 101/17	38/20 40/7 47/7 47/9
August [16] 2/20	152/2 167/20 168/10	7/14 8/5 10/8 12/6	168/23 187/19 208/10	
2/23 2/25 6/15 11/10	171/15 172/7 177/12	13/9 13/11 13/13	210/13	190/6
18/17 52/13 54/25	180/3 189/3 191/2	13/21 13/22 14/24	begins [1] 124/11	benefits [2] 39/6
60/23 60/24 61/5	196/3 206/16 207/13	15/7 15/21 15/22	behalf [4] 76/4	136/10
61/13 64/13 65/8	background [9] 2/15	16/15 16/17 28/10	118/15 131/17 132/2	Bennee [5] 89/2
130/8 178/15	9/17 9/20 9/22 9/25 76/17 95/12 96/8	29/24 30/8 32/16	behaviour [2] 39/17 66/14	102/10 131/17 132/2 134/12
August 2018 [1]	96/10	32/21 33/15 35/14 35/18 35/22 35/24	behavioural [12]	Bereaved [3] 62/23
178/15	backgrounds [1]	36/10 36/13 38/22	46/23 51/12 65/23	145/17 198/25
August 2020 [1]	10/13	39/2 39/13 39/14	66/2 66/9 66/13 66/19	bespoke [1] 93/25
11/10	badly [1] 117/16	39/15 40/1 40/5 40/8	66/24 67/2 94/6 94/24	
authorities [3] 134/1	baking [1] 172/16	40/24 41/1 42/4 42/5	94/24	55/1 55/5 65/21 76/9
135/1 198/6 authority [2] 93/5	balanced [1] 136/17		behaviours [4] 45/14	77/16 80/13 80/14
	balancing [1] 136/9	45/18 45/19 46/5 46/9	46/22 46/25 95/15	84/15 85/6 85/9 85/19
L			l	(58) Assuming - best

(58) Assuming - best

В	143/3 149/11 161/24	bullet [17] 23/9 29/1	Campaign [3] 73/6	168/11 200/24 208/19
best [15] 85/21	166/24 169/19 172/12		149/5 208/7	208/23
89/7 92/14 105/21	174/7 187/19 202/11	31/14 37/17 37/25	can [177] 1/3 1/15	cancel [2] 37/22
122/10 129/22 135/2	202/14	52/14 53/2 106/13	1/16 2/4 3/16 3/21	38/13
148/9 152/22 153/13	bounce [4] 41/7	107/9 108/1 127/14	3/23 6/17 7/2 10/12	cancelled [2] 40/1
185/8 188/3 188/4	41/13 41/13 112/3		10/14 14/9 17/7 17/9	115/25
192/8 196/18	bounce back [1]	bundle [5] 2/7 3/17	18/6 20/19 21/9 28/20	
better [24] 18/7 44/9	41/13 bounce-back [1]	28/22 30/15 33/2 burdensome [1] 16/6	30/15 31/7 32/19 33/5 37/11 37/14 37/24	39/6 39/8 114/3 Cancer [1] 76/20
44/18 50/2 53/19 56/7	112/3	Burke [5] 177/7	38/8 44/21 47/18	candidly [1] 28/5
57/19 60/11 84/12	bound [2] 3/8 157/2	187/17 188/2 191/11	47/22 48/5 48/21 52/8	
88/19 108/19 109/14	boundaries [1] 24/3	198/1	57/20 58/3 58/5 58/7	91/11 94/19 102/16
112/17 112/18 139/15 139/22 140/23 140/25	bounds [1] 144/22	Burke's [1] 174/16	59/13 60/5 60/24	129/1 130/4 151/4
147/2 149/21 150/1	box [2] 125/16	buses [1] 45/2	61/20 62/25 66/22	capable [1] 102/20
151/24 168/3 192/7	175/10	business [17] 5/10	67/7 68/7 68/21 68/25	
between [38] 2/20	Branch [1] 183/21	33/6 98/13 175/20	69/5 73/16 73/18	22/10 26/10 26/20
2/22 2/25 12/17 12/19	breadth [1] 167/5	176/21 177/1 177/17	73/18 75/14 75/23	27/2 27/4 79/13 81/22
19/4 25/4 27/5 27/12	break [6] 44/20 47/10		75/23 76/3 76/5 76/8	91/11 91/15 92/17
37/5 41/17 44/23	54/17 137/19 151/22 152/4	180/9 181/24 183/3 183/25 184/2 184/11	78/20 82/15 84/23 85/23 86/4 87/19	94/19 102/16 103/19 103/23 105/8 108/15
62/15 80/6 80/9 86/22	breakdown [1] 96/8	199/8	87/20 90/4 90/8 90/10	108/20 110/19 118/4
87/2 88/5 88/15 88/21	breaker [4] 55/14	busy [1] 43/12	90/21 91/3 91/24 95/2	118/23 127/17 129/1
92/12 101/15 101/25	55/14 55/19 131/14	but [230]	95/19 97/25 98/5	129/2 129/6 130/3
102/5 122/19 124/9	breakers [1] 100/17		98/16 98/24 100/22	151/3 153/18 159/10
130/17 139/20 140/8 154/1 154/11 174/9	Brexit [2] 27/22	С	100/24 105/18 106/9	171/1 185/1 185/6
189/2 189/4 191/24	166/9	Cabinet [34] 18/21	110/18 113/14 113/20	capitals [1] 57/23
192/4 192/17 197/21	brief [2] 48/15 99/13	24/25 25/2 25/10	114/7 114/8 116/7	capture [2] 96/19
Bevan [1] 124/14	briefing [11] 52/14	25/10 32/24 33/12	117/3 118/18 118/21	110/5
beyond [5] 24/3 61/7	95/3 98/18 99/21	33/21 33/22 34/6 34/11 34/16 34/18	118/24 119/3 119/4	captured [1] 120/16
200/25 201/12 205/8	110/17 114/6 114/7 114/8 114/10 114/12	34/19 34/19 35/12	119/22 121/21 121/23 122/21 124/7 124/10	Cardiff [3] 3777 40/3
bi [1] 87/6	114/17	52/24 104/6 104/13	124/11 124/15 125/1	cardinal [1] 128/13
bi-monthly [1] 87/6	briefings [1] 79/13	104/14 142/19 147/21	126/6 126/8 126/21	care [67] 45/12 46/7
big [4] 23/4 91/14	briefly [6] 55/13 89/5	153/7 157/15 159/1	127/11 128/15 128/15	
105/23 162/15	98/20 164/14 166/4	159/8 159/14 160/18	131/3 131/18 131/23	67/25 68/8 68/12
bigger [3] 82/21 83/7 130/4	173/5	162/14 162/15 162/24	132/14 133/3 133/15	68/16 69/12 69/15
biology [1] 76/18	Brindle [3] 173/14	163/2 163/8 194/7	135/17 136/18 136/25	69/24 70/3 70/13
Biosecurity [1] 14/11	173/18 174/1	Cabinet Secretary [2]		70/19 71/7 71/15
bit [14] 9/6 61/18	bring [14] 8/16 80/21	153/7 157/15	142/4 143/1 143/3	71/17 71/20 71/25
66/23 99/12 133/12	90/1 114/8 129/11 131/3 131/9 132/9	calculations [1] 115/5	145/18 145/23 147/2	72/5 72/9 72/12 72/15 72/18 73/7 101/21
146/25 148/12 149/12	132/16 134/15 139/7	call [13] 1/3 23/17	149/10 149/12 149/18 149/21 149/22 152/15	
149/22 149/23 162/23	166/5 171/14 172/24	28/19 28/24 37/21	152/16 153/1 153/23	122/6 122/14 122/17
166/17 177/4 202/17	bringing [2] 100/14	75/14 98/10 150/22	154/22 155/2 155/12	123/4 123/4 124/2
black [2] 44/15 179/3	146/10	152/8 177/13 188/7	156/12 159/23 159/24	
bleak [1] 111/16 board [4] 14/17	British [3] 70/18	190/18 191/15	160/8 160/10 160/11	127/8 127/16 127/20
109/17 150/9 165/7	71/12 154/9	call-off [1] 98/10	160/12 160/13 160/16	
boards [1] 30/2	British Embassy [1]	called [16] 67/9	160/17 164/4 166/19	129/4 129/12 129/13
bodies [4] 90/20	154/9	67/24 98/21 112/3 128/1 137/9 149/16	169/8 169/16 169/18	129/14 129/15 129/19
114/19 168/21 168/22	broad [3] 2/17 23/15	128/1 137/9 149/16 150/20 160/23 168/25	170/1 171/7 173/4 174/2 174/4 175/10	137/8 149/5 169/13
body [9] 13/5 156/7	186/21 broadened [1] 94/20	172/8 175/7 181/4	174/2 174/4 175/10 178/13 178/16 179/19	178/4 187/9 208/7 208/14 208/17 209/3
159/2 160/21 165/10	broader [1] 66/18	182/4 194/4 199/20	182/2 182/10 186/24	209/6 209/7 209/14
165/11 167/3 168/15	broadly [4] 99/17	calls [5] 163/14	187/18 191/16 194/22	
168/19	135/15 150/18 209/10		196/22 197/12 199/6	209/17
bold [1] 160/17 boost [2] 17/19 74/13	broke [1] 26/24	163/25	200/11 201/20 202/10	care home [9] 71/25
border [1] 92/5	brought [5] 2/4 84/13	came [24] 9/19 11/1	203/3 203/13 203/14	72/5 122/6 123/4
both [7] 5/12 35/19	121/8 128/3 142/13	47/6 50/10 62/3 67/10	207/25 209/23	127/20 128/2 129/4
39/6 76/7 183/15	Brussels [2] 154/1	89/25 92/2 94/5 110/1	can't [22] 12/21	129/13 129/19
191/12 198/16	171/11	127/4 129/17 134/22 138/7 142/14 144/23	15/17 25/16 34/3 51/9	
bottom [17] 20/6	bubble [1] 60/18 Budget [1] 188/17	145/19 147/10 156/22	55/8 66/8 68/25 74/19 75/7 81/23 85/1	67/19 67/23 68/12 69/15 69/24 70/3
37/18 56/25 57/22	Budget [1] 188/17 budgetary [1] 159/12	165/2 173/24 183/13	109/18 132/23 132/25	
114/10 127/15 142/4	built [1] 14/25	189/3 200/15	133/25 142/13 142/21	1
				(59) bost - caro homos

(59) best... - care homes

Care homes [16] 147/8 3 44/8/1 781/15 chief (22) 17/2 2/16 chronology (2) 66/15 60/15 12014 1201/16 1201/16 122/16 22/17 22/17 22/17 22/17 22/17 22/17 22/17 22/16 22/16 22/16 22/16 22/16 22/16 22/16 22/16 22/16 22/16 22/16 22/16	С	certain [7] 115/1	chemicals [1] 92/5	36/25	closer [2] 146/11
Card Nomes [13] 199/13 203/15 204/17 2/24 (5) 60/15 Closure [1] 11/20 122/14 122/17 1263 10/4 15/8 18/21 22/14 30/4 35/7 68/16 30/21 (1) 10/11 4/3 26/16 30/20 (1) 10/11 4/3 26/16 30/20 (1) 10/11 4/3 26/16 30/20 (1) 10/11 4/3 26/16 30/20 (1) 10/11 4/3 26/16 30/20 (1) 10/11 4/3 26/16 30/20 (1) 10/11 4/3 26/16 30/20 (1) 10/11 4/3 26/16 30/20 (1) 10/11 4/3 26/16 30/20 (1) 10/11 4/3 26/16 30/20 (1) 10/11 4/3 26/17 4/20 (1) 10/11 4/3 26/16 30/20 (1)					
1/21/9 1/21/9					
120/16 120/17<					
12011 12011 2007 2415 132/03 5415 56/12 597 000 7925 80/6 80/18 51/14 Cluster [1] 124/19 2096 209/14 209/17 833 95/1 105/22 86/16 86/25 87/25 circuit-breaker [2] CMO [4] 37 3/24 2096 209/14 209/17 136/8 140/22 142/14 165/1 197/15 198/5 circuit-breakers [1] 772 97/18 97/18 97/18 772 97/18 97/18 97/18 772 97/18 97/18 CMO [4] 30/23 CMO [4] 30/23 26/17 80/5 71/18 772 97/18 97					
L29/16 109/12 209/7 54/15 56/72 59/7 80/1 79/25 80/5 80/16 13/1/4 cluster [1] 12/4/9 Care Inspectorate [1] 139/6 209/14 209/7 55/6 109/22 2104/10 159/15 55/6 17/25 55/6 13/71/4 2000 14 2000 14 2000 14 2000 14 2000 14 2000 14 2000 14 2000 14 2000 14 2000 14 2000 14 2000 14 2000 14 2000 14 2000 14 2000 14 2000 14 2000 14 2000 16 2/12 2/11 10/7 10/19 2/11 10/11 2/11 10/11					
20/00 (20/07 42) 33/3 95/1 105/22 86/16 86/25 87/25 circuit-breaker [2] C// (4) 4// (2) 6// (4) 08/16 00/17 136/8 140/22 142/14 166/1 197/15 198/5 circuit-breaker [1] 12// (4) 15// (4) 1// (4					
Care inspectorate [1] 107/6 109/1 134/23 88/22 104/10 150/13 55/14 131/14 7/2 9/11 107/1 0/19 Care sector [1] 208/14 200/14 204/12 20/21 165/1 67/115 198/5 100/17 7/2 9/11 107/1 0/19 Care [1] 3/2 50/5 carers [3] 10/10 carers [1] 100/13 cares [1] 198/5 133/12 200/25 129/16 20/26 20/26 21/2 Carers [1] 208/17 123/21 124/16 125/1 chiaf exce [1] 198/15 133/12 200/25 129/18 12/9 20/16 21/2 14/14 10/14 185/1 100/17 10/16 10 1/17 10/18 199/15 193/18 190/26 chain [7] 100/13 carers [1] 198/5 139/15 193/18 19/12 190/13 10/114 10/14 185/1 10/12 10/21 10/114 10/12 10/21 10/21 19/12 190/21 10/115 10/114 10/14 185/1 10/12 10/21 10/21 10/21 13/11 20/21 19/12 190/21 10/21 10/114 10/14 185/1 10/12 10/21 10/21 10/21 10/12 10/21 10/21 10/21 10/12 10/21 10/21 10/12 10/21 10/21 10/12 10/21 10/21 10/12 10/21 10/21 10/12 10/21 10/21 10/12 10/21 10/21 10/12 10/21 10/21 10/12 10/21 10/21 10/12 10/21 10/21 10/12 10/21 10/21 10/12 10/21 10/21 10/12 10/21 10/21 10/12 10/21 10/21 10/12 10/21 10/21 10/12 10/21	209/6 209/14 209/17				
Boline Care sector [1] 136/8 14/022 14/21/4 16/5/1 197/15 198/5 circuit-breakers [1] 17/1 10/17 10/19 208/14 200/17 20/417 10/75 200/17 20/417 20/75 198/10 circuitaria [3] 18/11 10/17 10/19 10/24 11/19 208/14 200/17 20/417 20/75 circuitaria [3] 18/11 201/17 20/417 20/75 201/12 20/21 201/12 20/21 201/12 20/21 201/12 20/21 201/12 20/21 201/12 20/21 201/12 20/21 201/12 20/21 201/12 20/21 201/12 20/21 201/12 20/21 201/12 20/21 201/12 20/21 201/12 20/21 201/16 20/19 201/12 20/21 201/12 20/21 201/16 20/19 201/12 20/21 201/16 20/19 201/12 20/21 201/16 20/19 201/12 20/21 201/16 20/19 201/12 20/21 201/16 20/19 201/12 20/21 201/16 20/19 201/12 20/21 201/16 20/19 201/12 20/21 201/16 20/19 201/12 20/21 201/16 20/19 201/16 20/19 201/12 20/21 201/16 20/19 201/12 20/21 201/16 20/19 201/12 20/21 201/16 20/19 201/12 20/17 20/11 201/12 20/21 201/12 20/17 20/11 201/12 20/17 20/11 201/12 20/17 20/11 201/12 20/17 20/11 20	Care Inspectorate [1]				
Care sector [1] 184/17 192/19 192/25 198/10 198/17 100/17 101/1 102/1 112/1 Care [1] 3/25 0/5 cares [1] 108/17 20/14 20/14 20/16 21/2 21/9 10/2 02/17 01/16 01/17 10/7 21/9 10/2 02/17 01/16 01/17 10/7 21/9 10/2 02/17 01/16 01/17 10/7 21/9 10/2 02/17 01/16 01/17 10/7 21/9 10/2 02/17 01/16 01/17 10/7 21/9 10/2 02/17 01/16 01/17 10/7 21/9 10/2 02/17 01/16 01/17 10/7 21/9 10/2 02/17 01/16 01/17 10/7 21/9 10/2 02/17 01/16 10/17 01/76 01/7 21/9 10/2 02/17 01/16 10/7 21/9 10/2 02/17 01/16 10/7 21/9 10/2 02/17 01/16 10/7 21/9 10/2 02/17 01/16 10/7 21/9 10/2 02/17 01/16 10/7 <t< td=""><td>68/16</td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td>1 1</td></t<>	68/16				1 1
208/14 164/11 152/19 15223 156/10 156/11 100/14	care sector [1]				1 1
Carber [1] 03/2 05/14 ceters [3] 10/10 chief execs [1] 198/5 183/12 20/15 20/19 27/18 29/14 40/15 20/14 40/15 20/14 40/15 20/14 40/15 20/14 40/15 20/14 40/15 20/14 40/15 20/14 40/15 20/14 40/15 20/14 40/15 40/14 40/15 40/14 40/15 40/14 40/15 40/14 40/15 50/14 40/15 50/16 40/15 50/16 40/15 50/16 40/15 50/17 40/15 50/17 40/15 50/17 40/16 40/17 10/17 <th10 17<="" th=""> <th10 1<="" td=""><td>208/14</td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td></th10></th10>	208/14				
career [3] 3/2 50/19 2/11 2/11	cared [1] 68/8				
153/24 2/1/22 191/13 Citer inter inter interplector [1] Citro Littor [1] 3/16 4/16 491/14 491/24 careful [2] 106/22 123/21 124/16 (125/1 child [2] 196/16 circumstances [6] 9/91 90/27 90/33 90/23 carreid [6] 130/20 chair [6] 57/7 92/13 101/16 196/14 19/14 149/13 206/10 101/12 101/16 101/17 101/18 199/17 100/22 chaired [8] 11/13 3/425 79/8 89/2 97/3 109/14 89/3 206/10 101/22 102/11 02/12 104/16 122/19 carreid [6] 190/22 chaired [8] 11/13 200/25 207/11 15/13 157/1 157/2 CMO unit [1] 7/2 carseating [1] 190/22 19/14 89/25 206/2 20/16 Children's [8] 196/14 83/14 83/26 83/23 CMO unit [1] 7/2 carseating [1] 19/02 challenge [4] 53/15 chill [1] 152/6 155/13 157/1 157/2 CMO unit [1] 7/2 carseating [1] 19/02 challenge [6] 13/1 19/6 15/13 157/1 157/2 CMO unit [1] 7/2 CMO unit [1] 7/2 carseating [1] 10/12 14/14 20/2 15/14 157/1 157/2 15/14 157/1 157/2 CMO unit [1] 7/2 12/14 148/2					
careful [2] 106/12 106/12 106/12 106/12 106/14 186/16 106/14 10					
106/22 123/21 124/16 123/1 123/21 124/16 123/1 123/21 124/16 123/1 121/21 124/21 123/25 121/21 124/21 124/21 123/25 121/21 124/21 124/21 123/25 121/21 124/21 123/25 1					
carers [1] 208/17 169/19 11/2/9 200/17 199/15 109/18 102/0 199/13 206/10 199/13 206/10 carring [1] 169/18 11/2/9 200/18 169/12 19/13 107/16 199/13 206/10 101/16 101/17 101/18 carry [2] 153/13 11/3 169/13 11/29 children [6] 169/1 199/13 206/10 101/16 101/17 101/18 carry [2] 153/13 11/3 169/13 11/29 children [6] 169/1 101/16 101/17 101/18 101/12 102/11 102/6 carry [2] 153/13 157/1 153/13 157/1 157/1 164/11 166/1 192/2 101/16 101/17 101/18 103/11 carry [2] 104/24 199/13 206/10 153/25 154/17 115/8 103/11 CMO s [2] 8/22 9/13 carry [2] 104/24 1104/22 153/25 154/17 115/8 103/11 CMO s [2] 8/22 9/13 carry [2] 104/24 161/11 162/1 102/2 153/25 154/17 115/8 103/11 CMO s [2] 8/22 9/13 carry [2] 104/24 181/12 153/25 154/17 115/7 153/14 11/12 103/11 12/13 19/6 103/11 carry [3] 11/24 161/11 162/2 153/14 15/1 153/14 15/1 11/14 11/14 11/14 11/14 11/14 11/14 11/14 11/14 11/14					
chaired [6] 130/20 chaired [8] 130/75 <					
193/75 193/75 193/72 103/72					1 1
1977 206/22 chared [8] 11/13 205/2 207/3 chared [8] 11/13 207/2 205/2 207/3 chared [8] 11/13 207/2 205/2 207/3 chared [8] 11/13 207/2 205/2 207/3 chared [8] 11/13 207/6 155/2 16/7/1 10/18 10/3/11 CMO s [2] 28/19 20/10 20/19 chared [1] 11/13 207/6 11/12/2 11/14/11 12/17 11/14/11 12/17 11/14 12/17 11/14/11 12/17 11/14/16/14 12/17 </td <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td>					
carry [2] 157/3 34/25 / 9/8 89/2 9/73 children's [8] 196/14 83/13 83/20 83/20 83/20 CMO's [2] CMO's [2] 28/14 10/11		chaired [8] 11/13			
165/17 164/11 160/1 192/3 190/16 190/20 196/22 94/4 150/16 150/17 CMOs [2] 26/19 carrying [1] 108/9 7/3 37/3 153/27 127/2 197/5 206/3 155/32 154/17 157/6 100/311 cascading [1] 180/22 201/6 155/32 157/6 157/14 100/18 11/3 11/4 11/7 7/725 26/1 29/42 201/6 153/25 24/3 26/24 155/12 157/6 157/14 100/18 11/3 11/4 11/5/27 100/18 11/3 11/4 11/5/27 3/1/2 201/6 129/12 29/13 20/25 24/3 26/24 161/11 162/17 166/12 100/18 11/3 11/4 11/5/27 11/18 11/15 3/1/1 102/1 104/24 128/17 158/1 158/17 158/1 158/17 158/1 158/17 158/1 158/17 158/1 158/17 158/1 158/17 158/1 158/17 158/1 158/17 158/1 158/24 159/4 160/1 160/3 176/1 133/19 122/6 121/17 57/15 158/27 158/24 168/24 168/24 168/24 168/25 121/17 16/13 168/24 168/25 121/17 168/26 121/17 168/26 168/26 168/26 168/26 168/26 168/26 168/26 168/26 168/26 168/16 168/17 <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td>					
carrying [1] 108/9 chairman [2] 11/2					
cascaling [1] 180/22 37/3 20/17 180					
case [22] 22/14 25/3 Challenged [1] 13/2 13/2 13/2 13/7		37/3	207/6	155/13 157/1 157/2	CMOs [20] 8/22 9/13
Case [21] China [6] 13/1 19/1 12/13 12/13 12/13 12/13 12/13 12/13 12/13 12/13 12/13 12/13 12/13 12/13 12/13 12/13 12/13 12/13 12/13 12/13 12/13 12/14 12/13 12/14					
32/2 33/20 34/9 36/15 Challenged [1] 19/8 23/25 24/3 20/24 161/11 102/21 163/21 20/10 20/13 20/15 32/2 33/20 24/3 20/24 161/11 102/21 12/16 23/17 51/11 21/16 23/17 51/11 21/16 23/17 51/11 124/19 128/12 144/16 68/23 39/10 92/22 49/10 52/18 52/24 161/11 107/21 181/22 21/12 12/12 16 23/17 51/11 159/4 160/9 176/3 challenging [2] 63/17 64/11 22/3 charrification [2] 185/24 24/16 28/13 31/4 31/6 charse [17] 40/15 94/18 96/16 classic [1] 60/9 CMOs is [1] 61/2 33/14 34/13 16/14 112/12 12/25 129/19 chosen [1] 61/15 58/16 66/12 86/6 88/21 89/2 92/4 33/14 34/13 167/14 148/25 12/12 145/3 164/2 Chris [33] 5/2 10/6 58/16 66/12 18/10 187/4 19/124 34/15 14/1 12/23 13/11 13/14 112/23 13/11 13/14 112/23 13/11 13/14 112/23 13/11 13/14 112/23 13/11 13/14 112/23 13/11 13/14 112/23 13/11 13/14 112/24 12/16 23/23 13/11 Co-chaire[1] 101/15 co-chaire[1] 101/15 16/11 18/15 16/11 18/15 16/11 18/15 16/11 18/15 16/11 18/15 16/11 18/15 16/11 111/14 16/11 18/16 16/11 111/1		129/18 129/25 169/6			12/13 19/6 19/17
94/1 101/21 104/24 181/12 choice [12] 40/22 171/119/21 181/22 21/1 21/6 23/17 51/11 124/19 128/12 144/16 challenges [5] 7/7 2/23 92/10 92/22 185/15 211/3 64/6 87/2 114/16 144/16 144/20 156/15 133/19 63/17 64/11 12/3 185/15 211/3 64/6 87/2 114/16 cases [20] 24/15 133/19 63/17 64/11 12/3 195/10 200/19 CMOs as [1] 21/1 53/17 03/3/15 33/16 158/17 158/19 challenging [2] 158/17 158/19 clarity [1] 136/1 CMOs [1] 101/5 53/13 70/19 94/2 158/17 158/19 choices [4] 7/15 71/5 classic [1] 60/1 86/6 88/21 89/2 92/4 51/18 70/19 94/2 121/21 145/1 206/20 167/13 167/14 184/21 12/24 19/21 21/2 23/3 105/9 108/14 120/2 co-chair [1] 101/19 21/21 145/1 206/20 167/13 167/14 184/21 12/24 19/21 21/2 23/3 105/9 108/14 120/2 co-chair [1] 101/19 catch-up [1] 16/2 14/14 18/10 12/24 19/21 21/2 23/3 136/17 147/13 147/20 co-chair [4] 101/19 21/24 14/16 1/10 116/24 124/9 125/8 136/17 147/13 147/20 co-chair [4] 101/19 catch-up [1] 57/12 16/17 16/717 75/17 88/22		challenged [1]	19/8 23/25 24/3 26/24	161/11 162/17 166/1	20/10 20/13 20/15
124/19 128/12 128/12 128/12 128/12 128/12 128/13 186/15 186/15 186/12 186/14 186/12		181/12	choice [12] 40/22	171/1 179/21 181/22	21/1 21/6 23/17 51/11
144/16 144/20 156/14 133/19 63/17 64/18 122/3 199/10 20/19 185/24 11 11 12/12 133/19 63/17 64/11 122/3 199/10 20/19 CMOs as [1] 21/11 24/16 28/13 31/4 31/6 158/17 158/19 158/17 158/19 12/12 12/12 136/14 CMOs as [1] 21/11 CMOs as [1] 21/11 20/18 20/18 21/11 136/14 CMOs as [1] 21/11 CMOs as [1] 21/11 136/14 148/12 12/12 136/14 148/12 12/12 148/14 148/12 12/14 148/14 148/12 148/14 148/14 148/14 148/14 148/14 148/14 11/14		challenges [5] 7/7	45/8 48/25 49/1 49/3	185/15 211/3	64/6 87/2 114/18
159/4 160/9 176/3 133/19 63/17 64/11 122/3 119/10 200/19 CMOs [1] 21/1 cases [20] 24/15 23/16 28/17 158/19 122/6 chailenging [2] 122/6 choices [4] 71/5 71/5 clarity [1] 136/1 codes [1] 96/9 codes [1] 96/9 codes [1] 96/9 codes [1] 101/5 codes [1] 101/5 codes [1] 49/9 51/19 86/6 88/21 89/2 92/4 86/6 88/21 89/2 92/4 86/6 88/21 89/2 92/4 86/6 88/21 89/2 92/4 86/6 88/21 89/2 92/4 86/6 88/21 89/2 92/4 86/6 86/12 167/1 101/19 118/9 codes [1] 61/2 codes [1] 61/2 167/1 101/19 118/9 167/1 101/19 118/9 167/1 101/19 118/9 167/1 101/19 118/9 167/1 101/19 118/9 167/1 101/19 118/9 167/1 101/19 118/9 167/1 101/19 118/9 167/1 101/19 118/9 167/1 101/19 118/9 167/1 101/19 118/9 167/1 101/19 118/9 167/1 101/19 118/9 167/1 101/19 118/9 167/1 101/19 118/9 167/1 101/19 118/9 167/1 101/19 118/9 167/1 101/19 118/9 167/1 101/15 101/19 101/19 10/18 167/1 101/15 101/15 101/19 10/18 166/12 101/17 101/15 108/14 167/1 101/15 101/15 108/14 167/1 101/15 101/15 108/14 167/1 101/15 101/15 108/14 167/1 101/15 101/15 101/15 101/15 101/15 101/15 100/13 107/17 107/16 101/15 101/15 100/13 107/17 107/16 101/15 101/15 100/13 107/17 100/16 101/17 100/16 101/17 100/16 101/17 100/16 101/17 100/16 101/17 100/16 101/17 100/16 100/17 100/16 100			49/10 52/18 52/23	clarification [2]	185/24
cases [20] 24/15 chailenging [2] 122/5 class [1] 96/9 class [1] 96/9 class [1] 96/9 class [1] 96/9 solid 6/13 Solid 86/8 82/21 82/21 86/7 </td <td></td> <td>133/19</td> <td>63/17 64/11 122/3</td> <td>199/10 200/19</td> <td>CMOs as [1] 21/1</td>		133/19	63/17 64/11 122/3	199/10 200/19	CMOs as [1] 21/1
24/16 28/13 31/1 31/1 130/1 1					CMOs' [1] 101/5
31/10 33/15 33/18 33/24 34/1 35/14 35/18 70/19 94/2 change [17/] 40/15 36/18 70/19 94/2 change [17/] 40/15 20/18 88/25 117/3 choose [1] 63/19 chosen [1] 91/25 clars [37] 40/9 51/19 95/25 10/1/9 118/9 51/19 51/21 55/25 95/25 10/1/9 118/9 95/25 10/19 118/9 51/19 51/21 55/25 16ar [37] 40/9 51/19 94/2 16ar [37] 40/9 51/19 95/25 16ar [37] 419/12 16ar [37] 410/12 16ar [37] 410/12 <t< td=""><td></td><td>158/17 158/19</td><td>choices [4] 71/5 71/5</td><td></td><td></td></t<>		158/17 158/19	choices [4] 71/5 71/5		
33/24 34/1 35/14 35/18 70/19 94/2 98/13 11/14 112/23 121/12 123/25 129/19 chosen [1] 91/25 134/15 145/3 164/2 121/21 123/25 129/19 chosen [1] 91/25 134/15 145/3 164/2 Chosen [1] 91/25 134/15 145/3 164/2 Chosen [1] 91/25 Cather [1] 16/2 Cather [1] 16/2 Cather [2] 85/10 Cather [2] 85/10 Cather [2] 85/10 Cather [2] 85/10 Cather [2] 85/10 Cather [2] 85/10 Cather [3] 19/20 S3/15 137/5 Cc [1] 68/25 Cc [1] 68/25 Cc [1] 68/25 Cc [1] 68/25 Cc [1] 68/25 Cc [1] 68/25 Cc [1] 125/9 Central [3] 19/20 S3/15 137/5 Cc [1] 125/9 Central [3] 159/20 S3/15 137/5 Cc [1] 125/9 Central [3] 159/20 T59/17 127/15 177/18 S3/10 Char Gentral [2] 3/19 174/13 Char Gentral [2] 3/19 174/13 Char Gentral [2] 3/19 174/13 Char Gentral [2] 3/19 174/13 Char Gentral [3] 179/25 T3/15 137/5 Cc [1] 125/9 Central [3] 159/20 T59/2 177/15 177/21 Central [3] 159/20 T59/2 177/15 177/21 Char Gentral [3] 159/20 T59/2 177/15 177/21 Char Gentral [3] 159/20 T59/2 177/15 177/21 Central [3] 159/20 T59/2 177/15 177/21 Central [3] 159/20 T59/2 177/15 177/21 Char Central [2] 3/19 174/13 Char Central [3] 199/2 Char Central [4] 158/20 T59/20 T59/20 T59/20 T50		change [17] 40/15	94/18 96/16	classic [1] 160/1	86/6 88/21 89/2 92/4
35/18 70/19 94/2 121/12 123/25 129/19 chosen [1] 91/25 51/19 51/21 53/25 161/1 71/016 185/15 98/13 11/14 112/23 134/15 145/3 164/2 Chris [3] 5/2 10/6 58/16 34 66/1 66/12 186/10 187/4 191/24 121/12 1 45/2 00/20 catch [1] 16/2 catch [1] 16/2 catch [1] 16/2 catch [1] 16/2 co-chair [1] 101/19 catch [1] 16/2 catch [1] 16/2 changed [5] 4/4 29/19 41/8 50/23 54/2 136/17 147/13 147/20 co-chaire [1] 89/2 65/16 changed [5] 4/4 29/19 41/8 50/23 54/2 136/17 147/13 147/20 co-dniate [1] 65/16 changer [2] 125/2 112/5 116/4 116/10 177/11 157/16 167/20 co-ordinate [1] 62/16 changes [7] 60/15 112/5 116/4 116/10 176/24 178/12 180/17 co-ordinating [1] causea [1] 73/9 causea [1] 177/2 180/16 169/17 175/12 178/3 187/9 190/18 200/12 20/15 co-ordinating [1] cc [1] 68/25 channels [1] 177/2 178/3 187/9 190/18 204/5 205/1 209/13 118/9 co-ordinating [8] cc [1] 68/25 chancite [1] 120/2 characteristics [2] 197/15 198/4 210/16 co-ordination [8] 27/13 86/3 86/6 88/21 cc [1] 68/25 characteristics [2] <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td>clear [37] 49/9 51/19</td> <td>95/25 101/19 118/9</td>				clear [37] 49/9 51/19	95/25 101/19 118/9
98/13 111/14 112/21 134/15 145/15 148/15 122/15 122/15 123/15 123/15 123/15 123/15 123/15 123/15 123/15 123/15 123/15 111/16 111/16 111/16 111/16 111/16 111/15 1111/15 1111/15 1111/15 1111/		121/12 123/25 129/19	chosen [1] 91/25	51/19 51/21 55/25	167/7 170/16 185/15
121/21 145/1 206/20 186/13 16/1/4 184/21 12/24 19/21 21/2 23/3 105/9 108/14 120/2 co-chair [1] 101/19 catch [1] 16/2 187/3 193/5 197/12 23/16 28/24 28/25 136/17 147/13 147/20 co-chair [1] 89/2 catch-up [1] 16/2 changed [5] 4/4 29/19 41/8 50/23 54/2 136/17 147/13 147/20 co-chair [1] 89/2 Catherine [2] 85/10 changer [2] 125/21 86/23 96/22 111/21 136/17 147/13 147/20 co-ordinate [1] 85/16 125/25 116/4 116/10 167/2 1173/10 176/11 185/15 Catherine Moore [1] 125/2 116/14 165/20 165/22 126/20 177/13 177/22 178/3 187/9 190/18 120/4 120/25 co-ordinate [1] Caused [1] 73/9 169/16 169/17 175/12 178/3 187/9 190/18 204/5 205/1 209/13 118/9 co-ordinate [1] Cc [1] 68/25 channels [1] 177/21 178/3 187/9 190/18 201/1 200/25 co-ordination [8] 27/13 86/3 86/6 88/21 Cic [1] 69/1 characterise [1] 127/21 178/3 187/9 190/18 201/5 203/7 co-ordinate [1] 167/4 187/4 Col [1] 125/9 characterise [2] 197/15 198/4 201/5 203/7 co-ordinate [3/2 2/24 27/13 86/3 86/6 88/21 0/10 characterise [134/15 145/3 164/2	Chris [33] 5/2 10/6	58/1 63/4 66/1 66/12	186/10 187/4 191/24
catch [1] 16/2 catch-up [1] 16/2 changed [5] 4/4 29/19 29/19 28/24 28/25 122/15 122/15 122/15 123/11 co-chaired [1] 89/2 Catherine [2] 85/10 54/10 77/5 77/7 88/22 55/10 157/11 157/11 16 167/20 co-ordinated [1] 85/10 Catherine Moore [1] 125/25 112/5 116/24 126/20 177/13 177/12 185/15 co-ordinated [1] 118/5 Catherine Moore [1] 157/12 125/25 160/15 116/24 126/20 177/13 177/22 co-ordinated [1] 185/15 116/24 178/11 185/15 co-ordinated [1] 185/15 co-ordinated [1] 185/15 co-ordinated [1] 186/25 co-ordinated [1] 187/15 188/17 189/16 186/25 co-ordinated [1] 186/25 co-ordinated [1] 187/14		167/13 167/14 184/21	12/24 19/21 21/2 23/3	105/9 108/14 120/2	co-chair [1] 101/19
catch-up [1] 16/2 changed [5] 4/4 29/19/478 50/23 54/2 136/17 147/15 147/20 co-tunded [1] 92/4 Catherine [2] 85/10 54/10 77/5 77/7 88/22 55/10 63/7 63/10 157/11 157/16 167/20 co-ordinate [1] Catherine Moore [1] 85/16 125/25 112/21 125/25 112/21 170/21 173/10 176/11 185/15 Cause [1] 57/12 changes [7] 60/15 116/24 124/9 125/8 182/24 183/12 194/17 co-ordinate [1] Cause [1] 73/9 changing [2] 55/13 126/20 177/13 177/22 199/18 200/11 200/25 co-ordinate [1] co-ordinate [1] Caused [1] 73/9 changing [2] 55/13 197/15 198/4 210/16 co-ordinating [1] 18/9 Caused [1] 16/25 79/8 144/15 Characteristics [2] 197/15 198/4 210/16 clearup [1] 160/10 167/7 170/16 187/4 Cell [8] 16/25 79/8 144/15 Characteristics [2] 197/15 198/4 clearup [6] 64/19 co-production [1] 95/25 Coll [1] 125/9 characteristics [2] 19/24 123/16 28/25 201/5 203/7 coalesce [1] 138/9<		187/3 193/5 197/12	23/16 28/24 28/25	122/15 123/23 133/11	co-chaired [1] 89/2
Catherine [2] 85/10 54/10 71/178 </td <td></td> <td>changed [5] 4/4</td> <td>29/19 41/8 50/23 54/2</td> <td></td> <td></td>		changed [5] 4/4	29/19 41/8 50/23 54/2		
85/16 Changer [2] 125/21 86/23 96/22 17/21 17/0/21 17/3/10 17/3/10 17/3/10 17/3/10 17/3/10 17/3/10 17/3/10 17/3/10 17/3/10 17/3/10 17/3/10 17/3/10 17/3/10 17/3/10 17/3/10 17/3/10 17/3/10 17/3/10 17/3/10		54/10 77/5 77/7 88/22		157/11 157/16 167/20	co-ordinate [1]
Catherine Moore [1] 125/25 112/5 116/4 116/10 176/24 178/12 180/17 (20-ordinated [1] 85/10 changes [7] 60/15 150/4 165/20 165/22 182/24 183/12 194/17 186/10 cause [1] 57/12 169/16 169/17 175/12 169/16 169/17 175/12 178/3 187/9 190/18 200/15 205/1 209/13 186/10 caused [1] 73/9 changing [2] 55/13 169/16 169/17 175/12 178/3 187/9 190/18 200/15 205/1 209/13 118/9 cc [1] 68/25 channels [1] 177/21 160/16 169/17 175/12 178/3 187/9 190/18 204/5 205/1 209/13 118/9 cc [1] 68/25 channels [1] 177/21 126/4 Chris Jones [2] 54/2 clearance [1] 160/10 167/7 170/16 187/4 cc [1] 68/25 characteristics [2] 197/15 198/4 210/16 co-production [1] 95/25 ccl [1] 125/9 characteristics [2] 19/17 189/4 201/5 203/7 coalesce [1] 138/9 g0/12 89/1 89/6 89/23 90/3 90/17 characteristics [2] 19/21 23/16 182/23 183/7 Chris Whitty's [1] 172/21 33/16 33/23 34/24 33/16 33/23 34/24 centre [6] 14/11 61/4 182/16 182/23 183/7 Chris Wormald [2] clincians [1] 59/25 188/20 189/1 colese [1] 16/1 code [4] 3/		changer [2] 125/21	86/23 96/22 111/21	170/21 173/10 176/11	185/15
85/10 changes [1] 50/15 110/24 124/19 125/8 162/24 183/12 194/17 168/10 cause [1] 57/12 150/4 165/20 165/22 126/20 177/13 177/22 199/18 200/11 200/25 co-ordinating [1] caused [1] 73/9 169/16 169/17 175/12 178/3 187/9 190/18 204/5 205/1 209/13 118/9 caveat [3] 19/20 53/15 137/5 126/4 Chris Jones [2] 54/2 204/5 205/1 209/13 27/13 86/3 86/6 88/21 cc [1] 68/25 channels [1] 177/21 Characterise [2] 197/15 198/4 cleared [1] 160/10 167/7 170/16 187/4 CDC [1] 125/9 characteristics [2] 197/15 198/4 cleared [1] 140/23 191/24 co-ordination [8] 80/12 89/1 89/6 89/23 144/15 Chris Whitty [8] 10/6 82/22 133/14 135/9 201/5 203/7 coalesce [1] 138/9 90/3 90/17 centers [1] 125/9 characteristics [2] 19/21 23/16 28/25 201/5 203/7 coalesce [1] 138/9 159/2 172/15 172/18 chars [1] 179/25 182/16 182/23 183/7 124/9 125/8 126/20 111/2 clinicians [1] 59/25 coalesce [1] 16/1 3/12 40/18 170/19 158/25 171/5 171/14 199/23 chats [1] 199/2 Chris Wormald [2] closed [2] 123/9 3/12 30/2		125/25	112/5 116/4 116/10	176/24 178/12 180/17	co-ordinated [1]
cause [1] 57/12 caused [1] 73/9 caveat [3] 19/20 150/4 165/20 165/22 169/16 169/17 175/12 changing [2] 55/13 126/4 126/20 17/13 177/22 178/3 187/9 190/18 204/5 205/1 209/13 204/5 205/1 209/13 210/16 co-ordinating [1] 118/9 cause [1] 73/9 caveat [3] 19/20 150/4 169/17 175/12 changing [2] 55/13 126/4 178/3 187/9 190/18 204/5 205/1 209/13 204/5 205/1 209/13 co-ordinating [1] 118/9 cc [1] 68/25 cc'd [1] 68/25 chancls [1] 177/21 chaotic [1] 120/2 characterise [1] 144/15 Chris Llewelyn [2] 197/15 198/4 cleared [1] 160/23 cleared [1] 140/23 27/13 86/3 86/6 88/21 167/7 170/16 187/4 CDC [1] 125/9 cell [8] 16/25 79/8 80/12 89/1 89/6 89/23 144/15 Chris Whitty [8] 10/6 characteristics [2] 43/9 193/12 197/15 198/4 clearel [1] 140/23 19/21 23/16 28/25 co-production [1] 95/25 goal point characteristics [2] 43/9 193/12 197/15 198/4 clearel [1] 140/23 co-production [1] 95/25 centers [1] 125/9 central [4] 158/20 159/2 172/15 172/18 char [8] 179/25 Chris Whitty's [1] 12/24 172/21 33/16 33/23 34/24 chart [8] 179/25 182/16 182/23 183/7 Chris Williams [3] 124/9 125/8 126/20 1111/2 37/12 40/18 170/19 fs/25 171/5 171/14 199/23 199/23 Chris Wormald [2] 124/9 125/8 126/20 close [1] 16/1 code [4] 3/9 84/11 code [4] 3/9 84/11 199/23 Chris's [1] 126/25		changes [7] 60/15	116/24 124/9 125/8		
caused [1] 73/9 chore 169/17/173/12 178/3 187/9 190/18 204/3 205/1 209/13 116/9 caused [3] 19/20 53/15 137/5 changing [2] 55/13 197/15 198/4 210/16 co-ordination [8] cc [1] 68/25 channels [1] 177/21 55/10 cleared [1] 160/10 167/7 170/16 187/4 cc [1] 68/25 chancic [1] 120/2 characterise [1] 197/15 198/4 cleared [1] 160/10 167/7 170/16 187/4 CDC [1] 125/9 characterise [1] 197/15 198/4 clearer [1] 140/23 clearer [1] 140/23 191/24 6a/12 89/1 89/6 89/23 144/15 Chris Whitty [8] 10/6 82/22 133/14 135/9 201/5 203/7 co-production [1] 90/3 90/17 centers [1] 125/9 characteristics [2] 19/21 23/16 28/25 201/5 203/7 coalesce [1] 138/9 Centers [1] 125/9 central [4] 158/20 chart [2] 3/19 174/13 Chris Whitty's [1] 172/21 33/16 33/23 34/24 158/25 171/5 171/14 chats [1] 179/25 12/24 clinicians [1] 59/25 close [1] 16/1 code [4] 3/9 84/11 199/23 chats [1] 199/2 177/13 177/22 closed [2] 123/9 95/22 157/3 coherent [1] 156/9 coherent [2] 14/22 83/10<		150/4 165/20 165/22		199/18 200/11 200/25	
caveat [3] 19/20 53/15 137/15 126/4 197/15 196/4 210/16 Co-ordination [6] 53/15 137/5 126/4 Chris Jones [2] 54/2 clearance [1] 160/10 167/7 170/16 187/4 cc [1] 68/25 channels [1] 177/21 55/10 cleared [1] 160/10 167/7 170/16 187/4 CDC [1] 125/9 characterise [1] 197/15 198/4 cleared [1] 160/10 167/7 170/16 187/4 CDC [1] 125/9 characterise [1] 197/15 198/4 cleared [1] 140/23 191/24 co-production [1] 95/25 Contris Whitty [8] 10/6 82/22 133/14 135/9 201/5 coalesce [1] 138/9 0/3 90/17 Centers [1] 125/9 chart [2] 3/19 174/13 Chris Whitty's [1] 172/21 33/16 33/23 34/24 chart [2] 3/19 179/25 182/16 182/16 182/23 183/7 Chris Williams [3] 111/2 37/12 40/18 170/19 19		169/16 169/17 175/12			118/9
53/15 137/5 120/4 Chris Jones [2] 54/2 Clearance [1] 160/23 27/13 86/3 86/6 88/21 cc [1] 68/25 channels [1] 177/21 chantels [1] 120/4 chantels [1] 160/23 27/13 86/3 86/6 88/21 cc [1] 68/25 chantels [1] 120/2 chantels [1] 120/2 cleared [1] 160/10 167/7 170/16 187/4 197/15 184/1 187/4 197/15 198/4 197/15 198/4 197/15 184/1 197/15 198/16 19/21 20/15 201/5 203/7 201/5 203/7 201/5 203/7 201/5 203/7 201/5 203/7 201/5 203/7 201/5 203/7 <td< td=""><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td>co-ordination [8]</td></td<>					co-ordination [8]
cc [1] 68/25 channels [1] 17/721 55/10 cleared [1] 160/10 167/7 170/16 187/4 cc [1] 69/1 chaotic [1] 120/2 chaotic [1] 120/2 characterise [1] 197/15 198/4 cleared [1] 160/10 191/24 CDC [1] 125/9 characteristics [2] 144/15 197/15 198/4 clearer [1] 140/23 clearer [1] 140/23 co-production [1] 80/12 89/1 89/6 89/23 90/3 90/17 characteristics [2] 19/21 23/16 28/25 201/5 203/7 coalesce [1] 138/9 Centers [1] 125/9 chart [2] 3/19 174/13 chait [8] 179/25 19/21 23/16 28/25 201/5 203/7 coalesce [1] 138/9 Centers [6] 14/11 61/4 182/16 182/23 183/7 Chris Whitty's [1] 172/21 33/16 33/23 34/24 158/25 171/5 171/14 184/5 199/19 199/20 124/9 125/8 126/20 Chris Williams [3] 111/2 37/12 40/18 170/19 188/20 189/1 chasi [1] 19/2 Chris's [1] 126/25 closed [2] 123/9 95/22 157/3 chasi [1] 19/2 chasis [1] 19/2 Chris's [1] 126/25 closel [5] 79/20 coherent [1] 156/9 chasi [1] 48/21 check [4] 119/21 147/3 148/4 148/20 19/4 56/23 142/2 79/25 94/16 130/23 coherent [1] 70/3 <t< td=""><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td></t<>					
cc'd [1] 69/1 Chaotic [1] 120/2 Chris Liewelyn [2] Clearer [1] 140/23 191/24 CDC [1] 125/9 characterise [1] 197/15 198/4 Clearly [6] 64/19 82/22 133/14 135/9 201/5 203/7 S0/12 89/1 89/6 89/23 oharacteristics [2] 192/1 23/16 28/25 201/5 203/7 Coll 11 138/9 Centers [1] 125/9 central [4] 158/20 192/2 29/19 41/8 63/7 112/5 Clifford [2] 172/11 33/16 33/23 34/24 characteristics [2] 31/9 174/13 Chris Whitty's [1] 172/21 33/16 33/23 34/24 characteristics [2] 199/25 12/24 Clinicial [2] 60/4 34/25 35/16 36/2 159/2 172/15 172/18 chats [8] 179/25 12/24 Chris Williams [3] 111/2 37/12 40/18 170/19 158/25 171/5 171/14 158/25 171/5 171/14 Chris [1] 199/2 Chris Wormald [2] Close [1] 16/1 code [4] 3/9 84/11 199/23 chats [1] 199/2 Chris's [1] 126/25 Chris's [1] 126/25 123/20 coherent [1] 156/9 cohort [1] 70/3 check [4] 119/21 147/3 148/4 148/20 19/4 56/23 142/2 79/25 94/16 130/23 coherent [3] 22/23					
CDC [1] 125/9 cell [8] 16/25 79/8 80/12 89/1 89/6 89/23 90/3 90/17 characteristics [2] 144/15 characteristics [2] 43/9 193/12 chart [2] 3/19 174/13 chat [8] 179/25 159/2 172/15 172/18 centre [6] 14/11 61/4 158/25 171/5 171/14 192/16 centric [2] 14/22 83/10 19/715 198/4 Chris Whitty [8] 10/6 Chris Whitty [8] 10/6 29/19 41/8 63/7 112/5 Chris Whitty's [1] 12/24 clearly [6] 64/19 82/22 133/14 135/9 201/5 203/7 29/19 41/8 63/7 112/5 Clifford [2] 172/11 172/21 co-production [1] 95/25 Centers [1] 125/9 central [4] 158/20 159/2 172/15 172/18 centre [6] 14/11 61/4 199/23 char [8] 179/25 182/16 182/23 183/7 184/5 199/19 199/20 199/23 Chris Whitty's [1] 124/9 125/8 126/20 Chris Wormald [2] chasi [1] 199/2 Chris Williams [3] 124/9 125/8 126/20 Chris Wormald [2] chasi [1] 199/2 111/2 37/12 40/18 170/19 37/12 40/18 170/19 188/20 189/1 Code [4] 3/9 84/11 177/13 177/22 closed [2] 123/9 123/20 188/20 189/1 code [4] 3/9 84/11 Code [4] 3/9 84/11 177/13 177/22 closed [2] 123/9 95/22 157/3 coherent [1] 156/9 Chris Warmald [4] 119/21 147/3 148/4 148/20 19/4 56/23 142/2 79/25 94/16 130/23 coherent [1] 70/3					
cell [8] 16/25 79/8 144/15 chris Wnitty [8] 10/6 82/22 133/14 135/9 95/25 80/12 89/1 89/6 89/23 characteristics [2] 43/9 193/12 19/21 23/16 28/25 201/5 203/7 coalesce [1] 138/9 0/3 90/17 chara [2] 3/19 174/13 chart [2] 3/19 174/13 chart [2] 3/19 174/13 chris Wnitty's [1] 172/21 33/16 33/23 34/24 central [4] 158/20 159/2 172/15 172/18 chats [8] 179/25 182/16 182/23 183/7 Chris Wnitty's [1] 172/21 33/16 33/23 34/24 159/2 172/15 172/18 centre [6] 14/11 61/4 182/16 182/23 183/7 Chris Williams [3] 111/2 37/12 40/18 170/19 158/25 171/5 171/14 184/5 199/19 199/20 124/9 125/8 126/20 clinicians [1] 59/25 closed [2] 123/9 188/20 189/1 199/23 chats [1] 199/2 chris's [1] 126/25 closed [2] 123/9 95/22 157/3 coherent [1] 156/9 coheck [4] 119/21 check [4] 119/21 147/3 148/4 148/20 19/4 56/23 142/2 79/25 94/16 130/23 coherent [1] 70/3 coherent [1] 70/3 19/4 56/23 142/2 19/4 56/23 142/2 79/25 94/16 130/23 coherent [3] 22/23					
80/12 89/1 89/6 89/23 90/3 90/17 characteristics [2] 43/9 193/12 19/21 23/16 28/25 201/5 203/7 coalesce [1] 138/9 Centers [1] 125/9 central [4] 158/20 159/2 172/15 172/18 chara [2] 3/19 174/13 Chris Whitty's [1] 12/24 172/21 33/16 33/23 34/24 Centre [6] 14/11 61/4 158/25 171/5 171/14 184/5 199/19 199/20 182/16 182/23 183/7 Chris Williams [3] 124/9 125/8 126/20 111/2 37/12 40/18 170/19 Centre [6] 14/11 61/4 192/16 184/5 199/19 199/20 Chris Wormald [2] 177/13 177/22 Clinicians [1] 59/25 38/20 189/1 Centric [2] 14/22 83/10 chasi [1] 199/2 Chris's [1] 126/25 closed [2] 123/9 95/22 157/3 Cobeck [4] 119/21 Christmas [4] 12/18 19/4 56/23 142/2 123/20 coherent [1] 70/3 Centre [6] 14/11 98/16 147/3 148/4 148/20 19/4 56/23 142/2 79/25 94/16 130/23 coherent [3] 22/23					1 1
90/3 90/17 43/9 193/12 29/19 41/8 63/7 112/5 Clifford [2] 172/11 COBR [12] 20/24 Genters [1] 125/9 chart [2] 3/19 174/13 Chris Whitty's [1] 172/21 33/16 33/23 34/24 central [4] 158/20 159/2 172/15 172/18 chat [8] 179/25 12/24 clinical [2] 60/4 34/25 35/16 36/2 159/2 172/15 172/18 182/16 182/23 183/7 Chris Williams [3] 111/2 37/12 40/18 170/19 158/25 171/5 171/14 184/5 199/19 199/20 199/23 Chris Wormald [2] 111/2 39/84/11 192/16 chats [1] 199/2 Chris's [1] 126/25 closed [2] 123/9 95/22 157/3 coherent [1] 156/9 centric [2] 14/22 642/1 119/21 Christmas [4] 12/18 123/20 coherent [1] 156/9 coherent [1] 70/3 6FO [11] 198/16 147/3 148/4 148/20 19/4 56/23 142/2 79/25 94/16 130/23 Colinidale [3] 22/23					
Centers [1] 125/9 central [4] 158/20 159/2 172/15 172/18 centre [6] 14/11 61/4 192/16 centric [2] 14/22 83/10 cnart [2] 3/19 1/4/13 chat [8] 179/25 182/16 182/23 183/7 184/5 199/19 199/20 199/23 cnris Wnitty's [1] 12/24 17/2/21 33/16 33/23 34/24 34/25 35/16 36/2 37/12 40/18 170/19 124/9 125/8 126/20 Chris Wormald [2] 177/13 177/22 centric [2] 14/22 83/10 14/12 198/16 chas [1] 199/2 chasi [1] 48/21 check [4] 119/21 chris Williams [3] 177/13 177/22 clinicians [1] 59/25 choist [1] 126/25 33/16 33/23 34/24 34/25 35/16 36/2 37/12 40/18 170/19 188/20 189/1 Centric [2] 14/22 83/10 chas [1] 199/2 chasi [1] 48/21 check [4] 119/21 177/13 177/22 chasi [1] 126/25 close [1] 16/1 closed [2] 123/9 code [4] 3/9 84/11 95/22 157/3 Centric [2] 14/22 83/10 147/3 148/4 148/20 19/4 56/23 142/2 79/25 94/16 130/23 coherent [1] 70/3 Colindale [3] 22/23					
central [4] 158/20 chat [6] 179/25 12/24 clinical [2] 60/4 54/25 55/16 56/2 159/2 172/15 172/18 182/16 182/23 183/7 Chris Williams [3] 111/2 37/12 40/18 170/19 centre [6] 14/11 61/4 184/5 199/19 199/20 124/9 125/8 126/20 clinicians [1] 59/25 188/20 189/1 158/25 171/5 171/14 199/23 Chris Wormald [2] closed [2] 123/9 95/22 157/3 centric [2] 14/22 chazi [1] 48/21 Chris's [1] 126/25 closed [2] 123/9 95/22 157/3 centric [2] 14/22 chazi [1] 48/21 Chris's [1] 126/25 123/20 coherent [1] 156/9 cs3/10 check [4] 119/21 Christmas [4] 12/18 closely [5] 79/20 cohort [1] 70/3 CEO [11] 198/16 147/3 148/4 148/20 19/4 56/23 142/2 79/25 94/16 130/23 Colindale [3]					1 1
159/2 172/15 172/18 162/16 182/23 183/7 Chris Williams [3] 111/2 37/12 40/18 170/19 centre [6] 14/11 61/4 184/5 199/19 199/20 124/9 125/8 126/20 clinicians [1] 59/25 188/20 189/1 158/25 171/5 171/14 199/23 chats [1] 199/2 177/13 177/22 closed [2] 123/9 188/20 189/1 centric [2] 14/22 6 chazi [1] 48/21 Chris's [1] 126/25 closed [2] 123/9 95/22 157/3 83/10 check [4] 119/21 147/3 148/4 148/20 Christmas [4] 12/18 12/18 closely [5] 79/20 cohort [1] 70/3 CEO [1] 198/16 147/3 148/4 148/20 19/4 56/23 142/2 79/25 94/16 130/23 Colinidale [3] 22/23					1 1
centre [6] 14/11 61/4 184/5 199/19 199/20 124/9 125/8 126/20 clinicians [1] 59/25 188/20 189/1 158/25 171/5 171/14 199/23 chats [1] 199/2 Chris Wormald [2] close [1] 16/1 code [4] 3/9 84/11 192/16 chats [1] 199/2 177/13 177/22 closed [2] 123/20 coherent [1] 156/9 centric [2] 14/22 check [4] 119/21 Christmas [4] 12/18 123/20 coherent [1] 156/9 83/10 CFO [1] 198/16 147/3 148/4 148/20 19/4 56/23 142/2 79/25 94/16 130/23 cohort [1] 70/3					1 1
158/25 171/5 171/5 171/14 199/25 Chris Wormaid [2] Close [1] 10/1 Code [4] 5/9 6/4/11 192/16 chats [1] 199/2 177/13 177/22 close [1] 10/1 95/22 157/3 centric [2] 14/22 check [4] 119/21 147/3 148/4 148/20 Christmas [4] 12/18 closely [5] 79/20 cohort [1] 70/3 CEO [1] 198/16 147/3 148/4 148/20 19/4 56/23 142/2 79/25 94/16 130/23 Colored [3] 22/23					
192/16 chats [1] 199/2 17//13 17//22 closed [2] 123/9 95/22 15//3 centric [2] 14/22 chazi [1] 48/21 Chris's [1] 126/25 123/20 coherent [1] 156/9 83/10 check [4] 119/21 147/3 148/4 148/20 Christmas [4] 12/18 closed [2] 79/20 coherent [1] 70/3 0 147/3 148/4 148/20 19/4 56/23 142/2 79/25 94/16 130/23 cohort [1] 70/3					
centric [2] 14/22 chazi [1] 48/21 chris's [1] 126/25 123/20 coherent [1] 156/9 83/10 check [4] 119/21 christmas [4] 12/18 closely [5] 79/20 cohort [1] 70/3 CFO [1] 198/16 147/3 148/4 148/20 19/4 56/23 142/2 79/25 94/16 130/23 Colindale [3] 22/23					
83/10 Cneck [4] 119/21 Christmas [4] 12/18 Closely [5] 79/20 Conort [1] 70/3 CEO [1] 198/16 147/3 148/4 148/20 19/4 56/23 142/2 79/25 94/16 130/23 Colindale [3] 22/23					
CEO [1] 198/16 147/3 148/4 148/20 19/4 56/23 142/2 79/25 94/16 130/23 Colindale [3] 22/23					
спескей [1] 197/1 chronologically [1] 197/23 22/24 23/1					
		спескед [1] 19//1	cnronologically [1]	197/23	22/24/23/1

(60) care homes... - Colindale

С	61/16 157/4 195/21	63/15	172/21	35/22 36/9 36/12
collate [1] 79/22	commitments [1]	computer [1] 60/11	conjunction [1]	36/13
collating [1] 79/4	97/20	concept [4] 67/10	58/18	contemporaneous
colleague [2] 26/13	committee [9] 8/3	67/11 191/2 205/4	connected [1] 17/12	[3] 48/7 206/5
82/1	24/8 24/10 149/17 164/3 165/24 172/4	concern [20] 45/17 45/24 46/2 56/16 67/8	connections [2] 88/5	206/15
colleagues [26] 9/3	190/7 192/23	67/14 73/8 73/15	Connor [2] 124/9	contemporaneously [2] 206/8 206/14
9/7 15/14 22/12 49/14	committees [1]	73/16 74/7 117/11	124/16	content [3] 11/23
49/22 50/21 93/22	95/23			177/3 179/1
96/10 101/3 109/20 115/3 126/21 129/16	common [3] 61/11	159/11 170/4 188/24	conscious [5] 171/15	
129/18 129/23 130/23	70/18 146/24	203/5 203/19 205/9	180/23 184/19 185/23	
132/24 142/20 143/16	comms [1] 115/2	concerned [20]	196/8	153/13
147/9 148/10 150/24	communicated [1]	10/17 37/8 45/10		context [13] 6/5 7/25
161/13 185/23 197/25	12/25 communication [9]	45/14 45/23 48/22 52/23 69/18 73/22	126/7 consequence [3]	29/13 37/11 38/24 69/13 70/23 70/24
collective [1] 159/14	38/22 86/18 88/21	97/21 99/3 103/22	26/11 88/12 103/24	91/13 91/18 111/10
combined [1] 105/4	94/6 123/23 174/25	117/23 159/4 169/24	consequences [4]	199/4 203/20
come [31] 3/10 4/17 6/23 10/12 14/5 22/15	184/10 185/25 189/8	192/15 204/2 204/9	25/19 27/21 71/8	contingencies [2]
64/25 66/10 67/11	communications [6]	204/11 204/15	116/5	83/13 171/2
69/16 75/11 78/18	39/15 51/25 54/12	concerning [1] 183/3		continually [1] 47/6
82/25 85/2 124/13	55/7 175/3 180/15	concerns [28] 3/12	31/17 31/18 36/9 45/1	continuation [1]
124/13 138/22 141/6	communities [2] 194/15 195/24	6/14 6/20 6/23 7/1 7/9 26/10 26/19 26/22	51/10 55/4 80/23 94/23 104/1 112/10	100/4 continue [7] 24/13
150/8 151/12 155/6	community [15] 35/9	37/5 43/5 43/10 63/21		
156/10 160/9 160/9	35/19 46/4 46/4 46/15	68/17 118/2 118/22	141/14 143/11 193/11	114/11 116/21
160/12 177/3 177/12 177/20 198/11 205/15	46/17 69/20 70/1	118/23 128/21 133/20		continued [5] 6/13
207/13	72/13 72/17 111/14	143/10 162/4 170/2	56/14	15/19 51/2 60/23
comes [3] 67/7 77/19	121/1 121/25 146/9	172/20 180/13 188/21	consideration [8]	187/13
137/5	147/25	189/6 189/7 198/7	17/15 34/10 39/14	continuing [2] 133/9
coming [23] 1/6 6/4	compact [2] 155/20 156/21	concise [1] 18/22 concluded [1] 32/11	39/16 93/12 93/14 182/13 209/4	186/15 contract [2] 98/10
7/11 16/11 30/8 51/22	company [2] 117/24	concluding [1] 46/24	considerations [2]	157/16
72/11 72/12 72/16	119/11	conclusion [1] 16/24	138/2 196/17	contrary [1] 183/5
75/20 82/18 86/7 89/9 91/13 101/25 102/1	comparable [1]	conclusions [1]	considered [14]	contribute [1] 125/18
102/11 105/23 106/23	208/16	137/1		contributed [1] 42/14
162/22 180/16 180/24	comparators [1]	condensed [1] 99/16	106/4 110/20 111/4	contributing [3] 97/4
203/24	169/12	conditions [3] 73/14	138/13 148/7 194/10 197/9 205/5 207/12	98/7 164/19
Commander [1]	compared [1] 115/20 comparing [1] 130/2	conduct [2] 108/15	210/4	contribution [2] 100/23 157/13
154/15	competing [2]	181/23	considering [2] 74/3	contributors [1] 98/2
comment [17] 4/14 14/23 28/8 85/15 97/7	120/18 206/11	conducted [1] 178/1	206/12	control [11] 6/6
104/7 105/19 108/19	complain [1] 190/2	conducting [1]	consisted [1] 5/11	25/13 31/12 34/12
109/21 156/13 167/11	complete [2] 75/4	177/17	constrained [1]	72/5 72/15 111/4
168/9 168/11 200/10	181/7	conduit [1] 18/11	129/1	111/6 125/10 132/10
200/24 205/7 205/8	completed [6] 2/18 76/19 181/5 206/8	conference [3] 54/23 201/24 202/16	construct [2] 19/20 59/7	181/4 controller [1] 175/18
commentary [1]	206/13 206/19	confess [1] 58/13	consulted [3] 40/14	controversial [1]
107/22	completely [7] 14/25	confidence [1] 143/8	40/24 41/1	120/11
commented [1] 109/12	46/12 46/15 53/3	confident [4] 108/5	contact [15] 31/8	convened [2] 13/7
commenting [2]	64/14 69/25 207/21	126/7 176/25 207/9	35/17 70/14 80/15	23/17
99/20 176/22	completes [2] 151/10		108/2 108/5 108/10	Convention [1]
comments [8] 14/23	211/7 complex [3] 59/19	209/19	108/15 108/20 108/23 110/10 112/7 176/10	
64/1 69/7 109/17	complex [3] 59/19 156/6 156/15	confirm [2] 76/8 174/8	176/10 112/7 176/10	conversation [9] 90/1 97/14 104/6
109/19 109/20 156/11	complicated [2]	confirmed [5] 33/18	contacted [5] 37/4	124/11 126/20 128/9
188/19	10/18 134/24	33/24 45/5 53/21	58/22 58/25 59/3 59/5	
Commission [2] 92/4 154/1	comply [1] 175/17	121/21	contacts [1] 22/4	conversations [13]
commissioned [1]	components [1]	conflict [1] 101/24	contain [7] 31/7	80/12 82/1 85/20
66/9	157/20	conflicted [1] 101/22	34/20 36/7 36/15	85/23 86/1 86/8 97/13
commissioning [4]	composition [2] 96/6 96/21	confusing [6] 49/15 53/10 64/10 64/21	99/21 110/8 196/24	101/19 104/15 104/17 132/25 138/20 148/6
66/16 90/22 101/2	comprised [1]	65/7 66/4	contained [4] 19/8 62/7 99/6 104/3	Coombs [4] 195/5
101/13	164/21	confusion [1] 172/17		195/18 196/2 196/7
commitment [3]	compulsory [2] 45/6	confusions [1]	30/25 31/1 31/3 33/14	
L				(61) collate - Cooper

(61) collate - Cooper

С	111/18 113/24 117/7	covid [84] 4/13 12/13	criticieme [1] 05/21	47/23 52/13 76/3 76/5
	117/15 120/5 122/18	14/15 14/19 17/25	cross [4] 27/17 28/11	114/5 149/8 179/14
Cooper [1] 119/23	123/18 125/15 126/23	23/18 23/21 24/24	92/5 162/15	182/5 183/19
coordination [2]	127/13 128/10 131/19	26/24 27/7 27/10 28/6		dates [2] 50/14 85/1
169/25 171/4	137/17 138/18 140/21	33/7 34/6 34/15 35/11		Davies [1] 37/3
copied [2] 68/18	152/6 152/8 152/11	42/20 42/23 51/2	cross-cutting [1]	day [27] 3/12 3/12
179/19	152/14 160/22 163/15	58/20 62/22 67/24	162/15	23/16 24/18 36/1 42/9
copies [2] 2/6 169/20	170/11 171/24 171/25	68/6 68/13 69/14	Crossman [1] 87/4	42/14 45/4 54/22
copy [11] 2/7 3/18	172/9 172/23 175/14	69/16 69/24 70/15	crucial [1] 77/10	68/15 73/22 80/21
21/13 28/21 30/15	176/12 177/23 178/22	71/1 71/15 73/14 74/4		81/1 100/23 118/7
33/2 35/3 37/14 52/10	181/17 195/2 198/8	74/8 78/13 78/13 79/8		119/8 126/10 162/17
56/21 161/2	198/13 203/23 208/21	89/1 89/5 89/23 90/15	CSA [5] 84/19 88/4	162/24 164/1 173/17
core [13] 62/18 69/16	couldn't [7] 49/5 49/8		88/8 88/9 88/17	173/22 193/15 194/7
90/17 145/8 150/6 157/4 158/20 158/24	57/10 58/11 116/12	103/1 104/12 105/15	CSAH [1] 77/21	194/25 195/3 206/24
162/11 164/8 171/16	129/12 168/19	105/17 107/14 110/17		days [14] 19/10 20/2
180/22 198/20	Council [1] 76/21	112/23 117/21 119/8	CTI [7] 63/1 63/2 64/8	20/6 35/13 41/17
core participants [3]	councils [1] 134/8	125/13 125/17 127/22	64/12 64/17 65/23	42/13 96/4 113/4
62/18 145/8 198/20	COUNSEL [7] 1/5	128/5 128/14 128/20	146/25	113/4 121/7 128/3
coronavirus [15]	75/16 152/10 206/2	130/17 132/23 137/19		132/6 140/1 195/8
12/16 19/4 23/8 23/12	212/4 212/10 212/16	143/5 145/2 145/16	135/7 196/4	deal [12] 4/13 37/1
24/11 31/11 33/11	counterpart [1] 9/16	153/6 153/8 153/8	culture [1] 150/1	41/14 44/21 91/11
36/3 42/11 45/3 72/8	counterparts [4]	171/7 171/24 172/4	Cumbria [1] 2/20	91/16 120/7 133/20
109/9 114/4 169/25	12/19 87/5 190/1	174/6 184/25 185/7	current [7] 29/3	166/9 193/21 194/13
193/16	191/25	185/16 185/19 187/11	84/10 103/18 122/2	194/18
corporate [6] 76/4	countries [3] 19/14	192/21 192/22 193/1	128/18 132/9 133/5	dealing [4] 7/20
164/8 164/17 164/22	62/15 129/10	193/2 198/24 209/5	currently [6] 2/11	89/19 171/13 175/2
166/11 179/24	country [1] 208/22	209/25 210/3	21/21 22/22 76/13	dealt [3] 43/10 67/3
correct [43] 4/3 4/8	couple [7] 31/13	covid-19 [37] 4/13	102/18 150/14	143/20
5/4 5/8 7/17 11/11	112/13 127/10 128/3	14/19 23/18 23/21	curve [1] 41/10	deaths [6] 113/2
14/18 24/22 33/16	140/3 152/24 169/13	24/24 27/7 28/6 33/7	custom [1] 3/13	113/2 113/13 130/17 140/13 142/8
43/4 53/1 72/23 76/16	course [38] 2/3 4/16 4/22 10/13 12/12 14/2	68/13 69/14 69/16	cut [2] 205/17 207/16	
77/1 77/2 77/13 77/18	18/19 24/14 25/9	70/15 71/15 78/13	cutting [1] 162/15 cycle [1] 194/7	debate [1] 97/11 debating [1] 116/19
78/6 78/15 79/1 79/7	25/25 26/25 30/1 31/2	78/13 79/8 90/15	Cymru [2] 62/23	December [19] 1/20
79/11 79/17 80/4	36/17 36/18 36/21	90/18 100/7 105/15	145/17	56/18 57/23 76/3
81/16 87/8 89/4 90/7	38/24 44/12 47/4	105/17 107/14 110/17		142/1 142/12 143/2
93/18 100/19 108/21	61/10 72/11 75/10	125/13 127/22 128/14		143/10 143/11 146/2
108/22 112/24 114/25	77/7 78/18 78/19	130/17 143/5 145/16	daily [2] 11/8 163/13	146/4 146/10 146/11
	87/22 100/5 133/17	174/6 184/25 187/11	damage [1] 93/11	147/6 147/25 148/15
132/19 155/10 155/14	146/6 146/10 146/25	198/24	damaging [1] 66/5	149/8 152/21 168/7
158/10 163/22 207/4	148/1 164/24 168/5	Covid-O [5] 153/6	Dame [12] 152/8	December 2020 [1]
corrections [3]	180/24 188/14 202/3	153/8 153/8 192/22	152/9 152/19 154/15	143/11
152/24 153/11 153/12	206/10	193/2	174/24 198/18 198/24	December 2021 [1]
correctly [4] 58/4 58/5 58/5 61/17	CoV [2] 107/6 125/18		206/1 208/6 210/2	168/7
corresponded [1]	cover [1] 191/16	193/1	211/1 212/15	decide [1] 92/13
79/21	covered [6] 67/2	CPOs [1] 9/3	Dame Commander	decided [5] 20/8
correspondence [1]	194/5 209/3 209/4	cramped [1] 95/16	[1] 154/15	20/24 142/19 166/15
196/1	209/12 209/15	create [2] 48/15	Dame Shan [7]	168/12
cost [1] 93/25	coverings [48] 44/22	126/21	152/19 174/24 198/18	decision [51] 12/4
costs [1] 94/1		created [5] 60/2 70/2	198/24 208/6 210/2	14/14 20/12 38/10
could [79] 1/9 1/14	45/20 45/22 46/4	179/6 182/8 190/8	211/1 Domo Shon Morron	38/13 40/10 40/16
6/8 19/12 19/13 19/14	46/14 46/17 46/20	creating [1] 172/14	Dame Shan Morgan	40/18 40/25 42/2
19/24 30/10 32/3 32/8	47/2 47/5 47/14 47/16		[1] 152/8	49/19 50/2 54/1 58/11
32/24 36/5 42/5 46/3	48/23 49/7 49/17 50/1		DAs [4] 20/8 188/1	70/22 77/14 104/2
46/6 46/17 46/19	50/11 50/17 50/20	creeping [2] 191/6	188/7 188/23 dashboards [1] 79/6	138/3 143/13 144/2
46/24 48/18 56/17	50/22 50/25 51/18 52/15 52/17 53/10	192/12 CPIAc [1] 206/4	dashboards [1] 79/6 data [9] 14/21 15/6	144/4 149/6 150/6 156/5 156/22 150/2
57/9 60/17 60/18 66/6	52/15 52/17 53/19 53/23 54/5 62/10	CRIAs [1] 206/4	79/5 85/13 89/9	156/5 156/22 159/2 159/21 160/13 160/14
66/7 68/19 70/13 71/4		crises [1] 77/23	130/15 130/16 175/18	
72/15 72/20 74/9	63/9 63/16 64/15	crisis [2] 77/19 171/12	186/4	161/20 161/24 161/25
74/13 74/13 74/15	64/21 65/1 65/25 67/1		date [6] 106/11	161/25 162/12 163/1
75/17 75/22 98/10	201/19 201/23 202/1	113/18 147/14	112/18 124/4 124/5	163/6 163/23 163/24
101/8 101/14 104/19	202/4 203/22 204/19	criticism [2] 83/11	160/11 201/21	164/8 166/11 167/2
104/21 107/5 107/8	CovExco [1] 187/24	145/12	dated [11] 1/20 47/19	
	[1] .o			
				(62) Cooper - decision

(62) Cooper... - decision

D	delivery [2] 77/12	detect [2] 108/8	140/10 140/11 141/14	71/8 78/5 133/11
decision [4] 195/22	165/16	204/21	145/1 146/17 147/4	directions [1] 72/12
206/18 206/19 207/8	demand [7] 103/18	detectability [1]	148/14 153/8 157/18	directly [10] 18/19
decision-maker [1]	110/24 122/8 126/19	30/20	158/17 159/9 162/9	20/15 21/2 88/19
206/18	129/15 129/16 129/16		163/14 164/13 167/13	108/22 116/16 157/17
decision-makers [2]	demanded [1] 69/18	deteriorating [1]	167/14 168/1 168/24	158/8 176/18 183/2
104/2 150/6	demands [1] 5/18	133/13	170/1 172/2 172/20	director [30] 2/19
decision-making [16]	dementia [2] 73/13	determined [2] 24/11	172/23 174/23 175/22	3/21 3/22 4/1 4/6 24/7
12/4 14/14 77/14	74/3	24/12	176/2 181/19 188/20	26/6 27/6 69/6 90/24
138/3 143/13 149/6	demonstrated [1]	develop [4] 22/18	189/21 191/23 192/3	101/21 136/5 155/11
156/5 156/22 159/2	130/17	22/25 59/25 150/20	192/11 194/21 196/8	155/11 164/21 169/20
159/21 162/12 164/8	dentists [1] 126/13	developed [7] 19/21	198/3 200/14 201/7	170/10 171/1 173/14
166/11 167/2 194/1	denude [1] 46/7	31/2 36/19 70/5 106/3		173/25 174/5 174/6
195/22	departing [1] 147/15	121/4 164/7	didn't [31] 11/21 14/7	174/10 174/12 174/14
decisions [37] 23/4	department [7] 88/3	developing [7] 21/24	15/15 25/10 26/2	174/16 174/19 177/10
32/12 32/13 32/18	88/9 154/4 164/24	22/13 22/21 78/20	34/17 43/25 44/11	181/6 181/9
32/21 61/11 77/15	178/3 187/9 192/7	79/2 148/10 150/25	51/17 57/6 57/10	director general [7]
79/16 80/11 114/20	departments [2] 88/1		87/15 94/17 96/11	90/24 170/10 173/25
121/19 122/11 128/25	192/6	22/9 78/16 86/8 150/2	98/10 98/12 101/22	174/6 174/14 174/16 181/9
143/18 153/21 155/24	departure [1] 166/1	188/8	101/23 102/25 104/5 107/1 126/22 138/17	
159/14 159/17 161/16	depend [1] 207/9	developments [2] 187/11 209/11		directorate [2] 59/10
162/7 163/4 163/19	dependent [1] 210/20		138/17 142/20 168/25 176/25 190/10 201/9	172/18 directors [7] 2/22
164/16 165/4 166/12	depends [4] 85/25	devices [1] 175/23 devolved [22] 20/8	204/1 204/21	directors [7] 2/22 28/25 29/20 29/23
167/5 167/21 167/22	113/16 161/10 206/20		died [2] 189/4 189/6	180/17 180/20 197/16
176/25 181/16 184/8	deployed [2] 7/10	82/13 82/22 82/22	difference [5] 44/22	disabled [1] 130/18
193/8 200/19 205/1	144/8	83/1 83/3 88/7 109/14		disadvantaged [2]
206/13 206/17 207/11	deprived [2] 44/16	109/20 110/4 110/6	140/8	73/9 73/24
decrease [1] 110/23	95/12	119/14 121/11 190/3	differences [4] 82/8	disagree [1] 112/2
dedication [1] 157/4	depth [1] 34/21	192/5 192/8 192/17	110/6 130/6 192/16	disagreeing [1]
deep [12] 146/3	deputy [10] 2/24 5/1	192/24	different [43] 18/2	112/4
147/5 147/25 148/15	54/2 55/10 68/16 69/6		42/4 45/19 46/12	disappearing [7]
169/1 169/5 169/7	96/23 122/19 155/3	DHSC [2] 21/24 22/2	46/15 48/23 49/13	182/22 183/7 184/4
169/9 209/1 209/2	155/5	diagram [2] 61/3	49/17 49/22 50/21	192/14 199/15 201/7
209/7 209/9	Deputy CMO [3] 54/2		59/23 62/15 64/5 71/8	I I
deep dives [4] 169/1	96/23 122/19	dialled [1] 37/12		discharge [4] 121/24
169/5 209/1 209/9	derive [2] 92/8 92/9	Diamond [2] 31/16	92/22 92/22 94/2	122/13 127/8 158/15
deeply [2] 55/20 72/4	Des [2] 172/11	106/16	94/18 96/17 100/15	discharged [1] 124/1
defines [1] 178/18	172/21	Diamond Princess	102/8 106/7 107/6	discharges [1] 122/5
defining [1] 106/8	Des Clifford [2]	[2] 31/16 106/16	130/25 134/25 135/3	discharging [1]
definitely [2] 96/13	172/11 172/21	diary [2] 48/12 64/11	137/22 140/14 140/17	
162/6	describe [10] 5/15	did [115] 5/20 5/20	145/14 148/19 156/18	
definition [2] 128/12	11/6 42/13 78/2 82/19		156/18 160/5 192/5	66/22 199/5
176/20	101/14 140/5 157/19	12/18 13/20 13/23		discomfort [1] 96/24
DEFRA [2] 171/12 192/6	164/14 205/7	14/7 15/5 16/19 21/4	204/24	discounted [1] 39/3
	described [10] 7/19	22/18 24/9 26/9 26/19	differently [3] 28/12	discourse [1] 97/11
degree [14] 3/10 3/11 3/14 28/2 36/9 39/1	54/12 88/3 89/7 94/20		32/21 144/5	discrete [1] 90/2
62/2 76/18 92/12	125/21 134/18 144/2	43/9 43/18 45/5 45/15		discriminated [1]
100/2 144/19 150/17	162/13 178/19	46/22 47/1 47/2 49/24		67/15
192/4 204/16	describes [4] 83/14	50/3 51/10 51/17 52/5		
degrees [1] 150/18	85/11 141/13 178/17	53/13 53/25 54/8	94/22 96/16 98/12	63/22 66/15
delay [6] 30/20 31/11	describing [2] 81/2	54/25 55/4 55/22	104/7 108/11 123/15	discuss [4] 24/6 34/6
36/7 43/21 110/8	188/16	56/12 63/24 66/12	130/3 136/13 136/16	135/20 188/8
143/12	description [3] 77/25			discussed [11] 23/19
delays [1] 122/6	90/12 155/25	73/11 73/15 79/18	184/24 195/9	24/24 35/11 37/13
delete [1] 201/7	desired [1] 134/14	79/24 80/7 80/23 81/4		104/13 127/23 158/1
deleted [2] 199/23	despite [2] 24/23	81/25 82/1 82/3 86/12	80/8	179/2 179/3 180/11
201/11	155/19	91/15 92/16 93/9	digital [1] 129/16	191/6
deleting [3] 200/5	detail [7] 18/23	93/19 93/21 103/4	diplomatic [1] 211/3	discussing [4] 9/2
200/7 201/3	104/23 166/17 191/3		direct [6] 11/23 42/19	
deletion [2] 199/2	203/2 209/8 209/18	112/2 112/18 113/8	95/13 95/15 138/23	discussion [13] 24/9
200/24	detailed [3] 55/9	117/17 118/2 121/3 123/1 123/7 123/25	176/10 directing [1] 140/15	34/15 34/21 40/15
deliver [1] 79/12	101/23 194/2 details [1] 130/5	125/24 138/24 139/16	directing [1] 149/15 direction [4] 35/25	51/18 61/14 111/12 112/12 135/22 135/25
		120124 100124 108/10		112/12 100/22 100/20
			(6)	3) decision - discussion

(63) decision... - discussion

D	83/23 85/4 87/11	does [25] 8/18 24/25	108/19 109/9 111/19	drawing [3] 184/6
	89/15 94/9 94/23 95/5	26/18 34/13 60/12	117/3 117/11 117/13	186/2 186/8
discussion [3] 181/11 206/24 209/8	95/21 95/22 96/2 97/7	75/4 75/5 104/9	117/17 117/19 121/12	drew [1] 9/9
discussions [23]	101/25 102/4 104/1	113/11 157/10 161/10		drinking [1] 85/19
9/11 11/20 11/24 19/5	105/16 108/17 109/23	161/11 161/25 163/21		
25/4 29/20 29/24 30/6	111/2 112/10 113/6	173/18 173/20 175/17	136/20 145/6 145/16	dual [1] 86/25
34/14 55/9 81/14 99/8	116/24 116/25 117/2	175/25 189/17 189/20		due [7] 12/12 30/20
124/3 142/23 165/18	122/13 132/9 134/19	193/3 196/24 204/16	195/18 212/9	77/7 78/19 114/4
174/9 180/3 181/16	135/23 138/1 139/12	210/4 211/8	Dr Andrew Goodall	124/14 180/24
190/5 195/7 199/11	139/17 139/18 140/11	doesn't [4] 25/7 26/1	[1] 4/1	duplication [1]
210/14 210/18	141/14 141/21 142/10	39/18 43/14	Dr Atherton [9] 79/19	
disease [10] 9/18	143/11 144/11 148/15 152/17 152/23 155/25	doing [7] 49/17 62/10 96/1 150/15 163/3	103/8 103/16 104/1 104/18 106/10 106/19	duration [2] 105/2 139/18
10/5 26/11 26/21	156/2 156/10 159/10	191/10 194/25	107/7 136/20	during [42] 2/3 4/9
70/20 72/7 72/9 77/20	163/24 164/7 164/7	domiciliary [1]	Dr Chris Jones [2]	5/24 9/9 11/5 11/7
103/24 125/9	166/23 167/10 167/12	209/16	5/2 96/22	15/3 67/24 77/5 77/25
displaced [1] 38/18	167/24 168/25 171/18		Dr Chris Williams [2]	78/22 79/3 79/19 89/2
displacement [1]	173/10 176/19 184/8	3/15 10/15 11/16	23/3 50/23	91/8 94/25 95/5 95/9
115/19	191/17 195/1 195/4	11/23 14/6 20/14	Dr Connor [1] 124/16	
display [5] 104/19	195/18 199/12 199/24	20/16 24/15 24/22	Dr Connor's [1]	143/21 153/22 156/22
107/8 117/7 136/21 152/20	199/25 200/5 200/7	25/2 29/21 33/20	124/22	158/17 159/21 162/7
displayed [6] 76/4	200/10 201/4 202/25	33/21 34/20 35/24	Dr Coombs [1]	162/9 162/18 163/2
76/6 118/16 119/23	203/14 204/3 205/15	36/13 42/7 43/20 51/6		163/19 165/8 165/22
124/7 135/17	206/11 208/13 208/15	52/7 54/9 57/5 58/13	Dr Frank Atherton [1]	174/25 175/2 182/16
disproportionate [2]	208/22 208/24 209/3	67/12 75/24 80/21	1/11	186/1 189/4 190/10
43/7 43/11	210/6 210/6	87/10 95/22 103/6	Dr Goodall [4] 4/5	193/9 195/4 197/13
distance [1] 15/5	doctoral [1] 76/19	103/16 114/7 116/1	5/19 6/16 7/9	duty [3] 193/10
distancing [4] 50/18	doctors [1] 126/13	116/15 119/18 130/5	Dr Jones [5] 54/2	196/12 196/14
54/6 58/21 202/2	document [88] 2/8	131/16 132/7 139/5	54/2 54/10 122/20	dying [2] 40/20
distinction [2]	7/6 17/13 21/21 29/4 35/9 36/11 36/18 38/2	142/21 152/17 171/23 173/2 178/2 178/20		189/25
174/20 184/9	51/8 52/17 67/19	181/25 199/21 203/9	Dr Jones' [1] 54/8 Dr Orford [22] 14/9	E
distinguished [1] 3/2	68/19 69/11 90/18	209/8 209/18 209/20	19/23 20/6 20/11	each [10] 91/23 97/2
dive [3] 169/7 209/2	98/21 100/7 100/18	done [13] 12/22 15/2	20/20 21/4 30/13	98/20 155/11 155/13
209/7	100/22 101/1 107/9	22/23 96/8 96/18	30/18 52/15 75/20	156/17 162/19 181/6
diverge [2] 64/7 65/6	107/25 109/13 110/17	112/1 131/2 134/11	76/13 79/18 91/6	194/7 205/9
divergence [2] 191/7	110/22 111/1 111/25	150/19 185/13 198/8	102/23 109/9 117/3	earlier [32] 6/1 13/9
192/13 divergent [5] 64/20	112/5 114/14 114/19	198/13 211/5	121/12 129/19 145/6	13/22 24/5 32/25
66/4 66/11 202/6	115/1 120/3 120/24	doubling [2] 111/12	145/16 150/3 151/10	44/10 44/19 45/23
203/21	122/24 123/23 124/20	138/15	Dr Quentin Sandifer	89/16 90/5 91/10
diverging [1] 203/7	125/4 125/7 125/8	doubt [1] 69/15	[1] 108/13	112/16 112/22 133/12
diversity [2] 95/19	125/18 127/17 127/21	doubtless [1] 36/22	Dr Robert Orford [2]	138/13 139/13 139/14
96/11	128/19 131/9 131/21	down [19] 17/10	5/7 75/14	143/17 144/10 167/20
diverted [2] 8/6 46/20	131/25 132/11 132/16		Dr Sandifer [5] 27/5	184/9 185/24 186/7 191/6 191/20 193/6
dives [5] 169/1 169/5	133/1 133/9 133/14	40/10 40/25 56/22	108/19 117/11 117/13	197/11 201/10 204/22
169/9 209/1 209/9	137/2 137/24 142/7 143/6 144/9 159/25	62/5 69/8 73/20 86/7 102/13 111/17 119/2	117/19 Dr Sandifer's [2]	209/1 209/13 210/2
divided [1] 51/20	143/6 144/9 159/25	127/15 131/3 149/22	108/17 117/17	earliest [1] 99/15
division [3] 102/18	172/17 175/6 175/15	170/13 191/1	Dr Thomas Connor	early [39] 7/24 8/1
150/20 160/10	175/19 178/13 178/25		[1] 124/9	8/2 14/24 18/25 19/10
divisions [1] 175/13	179/17 179/21 179/24		Dr Williams [1] 23/12	19/11 22/17 23/11
do [123] 2/6 3/13	182/3 182/8 182/13	Dr [67] 1/11 4/1 4/5	draft [1] 118/12	29/8 29/18 31/5 31/5
8/14 11/18 12/22 13/8	183/17 183/22 184/1	5/2 5/7 5/19 6/16 7/9	drafted [6] 71/12	31/25 32/17 43/6
13/13 13/16 13/17 14/23 15/21 23/6 23/7	184/3 186/20 187/25	14/9 19/23 20/6 20/11		45/24 46/17 55/17
23/20 24/20 27/14	188/4 188/8 188/17	20/20 21/4 23/3 23/12	160/2 194/23	55/18 55/20 56/3 59/6
27/15 28/9 29/6 29/10	190/22 191/5 191/7	27/5 30/13 30/18	drafters [1] 194/3	80/11 83/12 112/11
29/23 31/16 39/12	191/9 191/12 191/16	50/23 52/15 54/2 54/2		131/12 132/7 134/6
40/4 40/8 40/15 40/24	202/20	54/8 54/10 75/14	Drake SPADs [1]	140/11 164/6 171/15
41/1 41/25 43/16	documents [16] 2/3	75/15 75/20 76/13	199/20	192/20 195/8 196/3
49/21 50/1 55/7 55/21	36/18 82/3 82/4 98/16	79/18 79/19 87/19	Drakeford [3] 24/17	197/17 197/19 201/11 207/6
57/2 58/24 60/6 66/23	98/17 98/18 99/23	91/6 96/22 102/23	103/7 147/22	easily [1] 98/11
67/20 70/3 75/25	101/7 101/11 109/24 135/13 167/24 206/5	103/8 103/16 104/1 104/18 106/10 106/19	draw [3] 10/14	easing [1] 147/15
81/17 83/6 83/10	206/7 207/2	107/7 108/13 108/17	drawback [1] 172/14	Easter [2] 128/1
				(CA) discussion - Faster

(64) discussion... - Easter

E	email [73] 19/23 20/1	end [6] 6/6 13/4 23/2	epidemiology [3]	every [6] 16/4 42/13
Easter [1] 128/2	20/7 20/11 20/20	25/14 92/18 117/16	9/23 10/5 29/3	65/11 65/11 136/9
	20/21 20/22 21/4	ended [3] 119/12	equal [1] 65/12	165/11
easy [8] 70/21 70/21	28/18 28/24 29/11	129/8 141/7	equalities [2] 194/3	everybody [6] 71/6
71/5 72/17 72/19	30/11 30/11 30/13	energy [2] 49/25	194/8	126/23 140/25 167/17
110/5 138/22 146/23				
Eat [1] 130/8	68/17 68/23 80/22	53/18	equality [7] 162/20	167/18 205/17
ECC [2] 170/19	81/2 103/16 103/17	engagement [7]	162/22 193/6 193/14	everybody's [1]
186/11	103/22 104/3 104/18	186/16 189/8 190/3	193/17 193/24 195/9	186/8
	104/20 104/22 106/13	192/4 197/13 197/17	equivalent [1] 22/7	everyone [4] 45/6
economic [16] 58/10	109/13 109/25 111/18		ESNR [1] 172/8	63/16 126/19 128/19
92/25 93/6 93/9 93/9	111/20 111/20 114/1	England [45] 9/16		
93/11 93/11 93/15			especially [3] 37/23	everything [5] 25/8
93/17 93/17 93/19	114/3 117/8 117/11	10/19 14/22 15/1 22/2		101/18 139/10 157/18
133/22 136/12 138/2	118/16 118/22 118/25	22/6 22/13 22/24 23/5	essential [1] 110/9	194/20
	119/1 119/23 119/25	29/21 47/15 50/19	essentially [4] 16/24	everything's [1]
138/21 141/1	122/19 123/19 123/20	53/14 59/21 59/21	100/14 146/22 155/7	39/19
economically [1]	124/8 124/15 124/16	60/17 60/22 61/8	establish [4] 91/8	everywhere [1]
44/16				
economist [1] 74/22	135/18 135/21 135/24		127/1 190/4 198/13	115/22
economy [2] 138/19	136/18 136/21 137/5	82/21 82/23 82/24	established [21]	evidence [99] 1/15
	137/18 147/16 148/13	83/5 83/7 83/10 85/12	14/11 86/3 89/13	1/18 2/3 5/6 6/25 9/13
170/10	169/19 169/19 170/3	85/24 91/11 92/3	89/15 89/16 89/18	10/16 14/4 14/13
education [2] 174/16	170/9 171/7 172/11	109/22 112/23 119/13		14/20 23/2 24/18 28/3
198/2	173/2 177/21 177/23			
educational [1]		127/7 127/24 129/20	108/6 137/14 164/4	31/17 32/9 32/11 37/2
138/10	178/10 179/18 180/1	130/2 130/4 140/7	165/10 165/25 170/24	37/22 43/5 47/4 47/7
	181/20 183/18 184/12	140/9 140/10 140/18	173/6 173/7 177/10	47/24 48/3 49/20 50/6
effect [12] 11/14 55/5	186/6 200/22	202/7 204/7	187/10 198/15	51/1 51/3 51/14 53/17
58/8 116/16 134/14	email's [1] 136/4	England-centric [2]	establishing [3]	64/17 64/18 64/25
136/24 146/3 163/18	amailed [5] 80/17	14/22 83/10	17/15 78/20 88/5	65/1 65/2 66/3 66/8
189/13 192/20 195/23				
207/4	125/7 125/8 125/24	English [4] 10/24	establishment [2]	75/21 75/23 76/25
effective [8] 55/20	197/16	195/16 195/16 203/24	170/7 173/1	77/16 78/19 79/15
	emailing [1] 117/9	enjoy [1] 3/15	estimate [2] 105/5	84/22 90/18 92/9
131/11 132/11 149/21	emails [4] 6/6 7/21	enlarge [1] 30/15	144/25	92/17 93/12 93/19
197/19 206/5 206/6	81/1 120/15	enough [7] 48/2 76/1	estimates [2] 145/4	94/25 95/7 96/23 97/2
206/7		92/19 110/11 112/11	145/5	97/7 97/12 100/15
effectively [12] 10/24	Embassy [1] 154/9			
20/12 21/5 53/12	embed [1] 149/25	170/5 183/10	et [3] 10/10 27/22	102/17 103/7 105/13
58/12 70/6 126/25	embedded [1]	ensure [11] 13/23	191/13	107/5 107/20 114/13
	150/11	38/6 45/11 77/15	et cetera [3] 10/10	116/4 116/8 116/15
134/7 136/22 143/14	emerge [1] 8/2	79/14 88/14 122/5	27/22 191/13	125/21 125/22 126/6
158/16 181/23	emerged [1] 144/14	150/5 150/15 158/13	ethnic [4] 44/15	134/15 134/17 144/2
effectiveness [1]				
47/5	emergence [1] 146/7	197/19	95/11 95/19 96/11	144/23 145/23 146/22
effects [2] 41/10	emergency [14]	ensuring [1] 191/9	Europe [1] 40/21	147/21 149/6 149/21
146/20	17/23 26/8 26/12 38/6	entailed [2] 115/7	European [2] 92/4	150/1 150/5 150/9
	38/14 38/17 39/13	115/11 -	154/1	150/11 150/21 150/24
efficacy [2] 144/8	41/22 91/9 102/15	entered [2] 112/9	European	151/23 152/14 152/10
144/12	121/3 171/2 171/4	143/9		156/4 156/11 163/5
efficient [1] 143/5			Commission [2]	
eg [2] 105/2 108/3	171/13	entire [1] 201/13	92/4 154/1	163/18 166/17 177/4
EHRC [1] 195/6	emerging [1] 92/10	entirely [1] 78/12	evaluate [1] 162/20	186/3 189/12 192/19
EIAs [1] 196/5	emotion [1] 204/13	entitled [2] 17/6	evaluating [1] 150/25	205/3 206/15 206/17
	emphasis [1] 83/4	175/8	Evans [2] 51/4 51/23	207/5 211/7
eight [1] 76/22	emphasise [1]	entry [9] 47/18 48/1	even [5] 39/23 41/14	evidence-based [1]
eight years [1] 76/22	102/25	56/18 56/20 57/22	81/12 178/7 184/8	76/25
either [4] 24/16 61/15				
70/14 178/10	employment [2]	58/7 60/25 187/22	evening [1] 40/11	evidence-informed
elderly [1] 70/25	154/4 154/6	202/11	event [4] 102/20	[1] 150/24
	enable [3] 6/3 72/7	environments [2]	108/2 122/8 178/9	evident [1] 121/3
electronic [1] 178/24	190/4	54/6 126/2	events [16] 17/12	evidential [1] 129/3
element [2] 43/19	enabled [2] 176/4	envisaged [3] 21/5	37/23 39/23 40/1	evolution [3] 5/24
181/3	184/5	167/9 191/19	91/12 114/4 114/12	91/20 100/4
elements [1] 162/11				
eliminate [1] 122/6	enables [1] 155/22	envisaging [1] 68/11		evolved [7] 18/13
Elizabeth [1] 152/13	enclosed [4] 45/1	ephemeral [1] 179/6	115/16 115/20 115/23	
else [3] 25/8 117/14	50/15 50/17 63/9	epidemic [5] 103/20	116/11 116/20 191/4	156/14 167/15 172/5
	encounter [1] 10/22	132/11 134/3 139/8	eventually [2] 52/3	evolves [1] 114/14
152/6	encountered [1]	139/17	68/1	evolving [2] 16/9
Eluned [1] 144/1	92/20	epidemics [1] 10/9	ever [6] 17/15 67/11	64/23
Eluned Morgan [1]		epidemiological [2]	92/16 95/6 126/8	exacerbated [1]
144/1	encouraging [2]			
	200/7 201/4	115/17 136/23	201/7	42/24
L		l	I	

(65) Easter... - exacerbated

E	exercising [1] 196/16	Extensively [1] 51/16	15/23 16/15 18/5	feels [2] 191/1 191/6
exact [2] 55/8 85/1	existed [1] 9/14	extent [2] 51/10	34/20 55/24 80/11	fellowship [1] 76/19
exactly [5] 49/15	existence [3] 165/8	181/8	82/20 87/19 92/9	felt [11] 6/5 15/3
78/9 113/9 159/13	168/19 172/1	external [1] 93/1	94/16 109/25 120/15	41/22 41/24 49/11
179/5	existing [4] 42/24	externally [2] 100/18	fairness [1] 27/19	54/10 134/23 164/7
example [38] 8/21	172/18 186/2 190/7	161/20	fall [2] 74/9 176/23	168/14 168/18 172/23
40/2 48/8 51/13 53/13	expand [1] 186/12	extra [1] 205/14	falling [1] 70/10	few [11] 27/12 41/17
62/10 66/6 79/4 86/11	expanded [1] 166/10	extraordinary [2]	familiar [3] 36/7	62/23 78/21 84/20
88/17 92/24 93/25	expansion [1] 108/16	16/15 84/12	88/18 183/10	108/8 143/23 153/23
95/6 95/16 98/22 99/7	expansive [1] 99/19	extrapolate [1]	Families [3] 62/23	179/21 199/17 201/11
99/20 100/8 144/4	expect [4] 67/1	146/23	145/17 198/25	few weeks [2] 27/12
148/8 159/23 160/7	129/13 185/19 195/14	extremely [5] 8/17	famous [1] 41/7	179/21
160/18 161/23 166/25	expected [2] 121/20	43/12 49/11 186/21	fans [2] 40/3 115/9	fewer [2] 113/2 113/2
167/1 169/3 177/11	157/3	195/21	far [13] 10/17 52/23	field [2] 3/2 91/24
196/25 197/23 199/9	Expedite [1] 121/24	eye [1] 24/14	60/11 75/11 91/10	fifth [10] 31/14 42/22
199/17 200/4 203/24	expediting [1] 122/13		103/3 105/7 108/19	43/2 43/10 43/19
208/19 208/23 209/4	expenditure [1]	84/5	110/11 151/17 159/4	43/22 53/2 106/13
210/15	157/23	F	173/9 188/14	127/14 132/15
examples [4] 82/10	experience [7] 9/25		fast [5] 36/23 41/3	figure [1] 130/21
96/4 99/15 208/16	19/17 84/12 158/15	face [65] 7/7 44/21	129/17 171/18 192/2	figures [4] 105/2
exceeding [1] 110/19	162/9 171/12 189/18	45/1 45/6 45/12 45/13	fast-moving [1]	113/11 113/12 138/22
excellent [11] 15/4	experiences [1]	45/15 45/20 45/21	192/2	fill [1] 145/23
15/5 47/21 85/17	95/14	45/22 46/4 46/10		filled [1] 4/6
136/6 170/22 185/25	experiment [1]	46/14 46/17 46/19	fear [2] 41/12 188/16	filling [2] 70/10 92/16
187/24 191/15 197/24	134/19	46/20 46/20 47/2 47/5		final [3] 109/16 181/3
210/11	expert [7] 10/2 65/24	47/13 47/16 48/23	February [68] 5/18	183/17
exception [1] 27/8	78/24 85/18 205/3	49/7 49/17 50/1 50/10		finalised [1] 121/6
exceptional [1]	205/6 205/7	50/15 50/17 50/20	13/10 13/15 13/20	finally [3] 61/20
194/23	expertise [3] 77/22	50/22 50/24 51/18	15/14 15/19 16/7 17/3	71/14 72/21
exceptionally [1]	171/14 185/19	52/15 52/17 53/4	22/15 22/17 24/25	financial [3] 58/2
41/2	experts [9] 90/14	53/12 53/19 53/23 54/5 62/10 62/11	27/1 27/12 28/5 28/16	
exchange [6] 122/19	91/23 91/25 92/6 92/7	62/25 63/6 63/8 63/9		financially [1] 140/12
187/10 196/7 198/6	93/1 93/3 93/4 150/6	63/16 64/15 64/20	30/11 30/24 30/25	find [6] 74/23 81/4
202/8 202/25	explain [11] 8/19	65/1 65/25 66/25 67/5	31/18 32/17 32/25	92/16 110/2 137/3 158/17
excluding [1] 126/18	58/7 78/11 98/20	67/9 146/9 201/19	00/11 00/20 01/0	
ExCo [16] 164/4	140/17 159/23 159/25 165/24 170/1 173/5	201/23 201/25 202/4	35/15 35/16 78/12 81/10 81/18 83/12	finding [1] 112/25
164/4 164/11 164/14	195/8	202/24 203/11 203/22	01/1001/1003/12 00/6103/15103/15	findings [1] 84/18 fine [3] 39/19 68/24
164/16 164/20 165/4	explained [3] 204/22	202/24 203/11 203/22 204/8 204/9 204/19	103/21 103/22 104/4	203/10
165/6 166/10 168/8	200/1 210/2	205/4	104/12 104/18 104/20	
168/10 168/17 168/19	explaining [1] 10//10	face masks [6] 45/12	105/9 105/15 105/18	firebreak [39] 55/22
168/25 172/4 172/4	explanation [1]	45/22 46/14 46/20	106/1 106/10 106/18	82/10 130/13 131/14
ExCovid [24] 165/25	141/17	50/15 53/12	107/7 107/21 165/25	133/14 135/10 135/21
166/4 166/5 166/11	explore [3] 14/9	faced [3] 9/24 146/6	178/16 179/14 185/5	136/24 137/4 137/13
166/15 167/1 167/6	44/24 159/20	186/22	185/9 185/14 186/1	137/16 137/21 138/3
167/13 167/25 168/14	explored [2] 93/13	facility [1] 125/14	186/6 186/12 186/14	138/5 138/11 138/25
168/16 168/20 168/23	94/1	facing [3] 100/18	186/14 197/1	139/4 139/7 139/9
168/24 170/7 170/24	exponential [2]	103/13 161/20	February 2019 [2]	139/12 139/18 139/24
170/25 171/25 185/4	110/23 141/18	fact [15] 10/19 35/15	178/16 179/14	139/25 140/6 140/20
185/14 186/5 186/19	exposed [2] 104/5	43/19 49/15 60/10	February 2020 [9]	140/21 141/2 141/7
186/23 198/11	169/3	64/21 65/6 90/9 146/9	5/18 15/14 15/19	141/22 145/18 145/21
ExCovid's [1] 168/7	express [4] 6/14 6/24		29/18 78/12 105/18	146/1 146/4 146/16
exec [1] 198/10	37/4 73/16	186/8 193/16 195/25	106/18 165/25 197/1	146/18 146/21 146/23
execs [1] 198/5	expressed [6] 73/8	factor [1] 39/14	February 2022 [1]	147/16 147/24
executive [12] 5/11	73/15 96/24 117/1	factored [1] 138/2	7/13	firebreaks [1] 138/8
5/12 8/3 24/8 24/10	172/21 188/25	factors [1] 207/12	February/March [1]	first [115] 12/12
50/16 88/17 104/6 149/17 150/10 164/3	expresses [2] 117/11		83/12	12/16 13/3 13/6 18/17
149/17 150/10 164/3	128/21	36/12 134/19	fed [1] 12/3	19/3 19/12 24/17
executives [3] 30/2	extant [2] 102/18	failure [1] 190/4	feel [9] 5/25 9/6	24/21 25/6 25/12
30/4 198/17	182/16	fair [12] 4/14 4/14 8/8	12/21 12/24 14/24	26/24 27/11 28/3 29/1
exercise [2] 166/16	extend [1] 140/19	9/23 10/3 27/3 80/3	15/7 93/8 109/23	32/9 33/7 33/17 34/6
166/21	extended [2] 60/19	120/4 120/14 156/13	191/23	34/15 34/25 35/11
exercises [1] 167/25	60/21	192/2 200/10	feeling [2] 152/6	35/11 35/15 37/4
	extensive [1] 199/5	fairly [13] 11/25	181/22	38/25 40/12 42/18
L	l	l	1	

(66) exact - first

F	Fliss Bennee [5]	formulaic [1] 190/12	69/1	141/16 156/3 168/6
	89/2 102/10 131/17	forth [1] 196/3	free [1] 78/3	195/19 201/21 204/23
first [87] 45/10 45/17 47/13 48/4	132/2 134/12		freely [1] 98/3	GCSA [1] 35/8
48/13 50/13 50/25	flooding [2] 25/9	forum [5] 61/15	frequent [1] 11/6	gear [1] 186/15
52/12 52/15 52/19	28/7	83/14 83/15 89/7 90/2	frequently [5] 15/23	general [30] 2/19
52/24 53/3 53/6 53/20	floodings [2] 8/9	forward [8] 12/7	79/22 102/9 155/22	3/23 4/1 4/6 9/19
55/15 56/4 58/4 69/22	27/21	56/14 62/21 170/21	177/8	23/11 24/7 69/6 72/14
71/23 79/13 80/24	floods [1] 171/13	173/8 173/11 173/11	Friday [1] 11/9	74/13 90/24 101/21
81/6 81/9 91/2 91/19	flowing [1] 107/15	174/4	front [4] 21/13 47/22	116/11 116/22 141/24
94/7 94/9 94/11 94/25	flu [4] 29/6 38/25	fostering [1] 197/4	55/11 148/18	158/5 165/12 170/10
95/5 98/21 98/23	39/3 105/1	Foubister [9] 73/3	frontline [1] 38/6	173/25 174/6 174/12
100/3 100/3 103/1	FM [1] 52/18	73/4 148/24 149/3 207/20 208/5 212/7	fronts [2] 43/13 44/12	174/14 174/16 174/19 180/17 181/9 193/10
103/4 103/6 104/9	focus [6] 82/23 94/24 96/17 135/25 156/10	212/13 212/20	frustrating [1] 81/7	197/17 205/8 207/13
105/13 105/24 109/16	208/11	foul [1] 176/23	frustration [2] 62/2	general of [4] 3/23
110/8 110/18 111/23	focused [5] 47/9	found [4] 66/22 81/7	62/13	4/1 69/6 101/21
114/2 114/15 121/5	78/12 149/20 165/13	167/5 168/4	fulfil [1] 167/6	generally [8] 45/16
121/10 125/2 133/7	185/22	foundation [1] 94/4	full [5] 1/9 75/17	66/25 86/10 126/11
134/17 136/19 137/7	focusing [2] 6/25	four [36] 3/21 12/2	152/11 156/7 195/2	157/1 162/15 163/9
147/22 155/2 156/13 157/9 157/12 157/17	188/19	21/6 36/6 38/12 42/17	fuller [1] 96/14	167/23
157/21 158/3 158/7	folks [1] 59/25	42/18 44/23 49/4	fully [2] 86/24 199/4	generals [7] 3/21
162/13 164/6 165/16	follow [4] 22/4	56/24 59/7 61/11	function [4] 4/10	155/11 155/12 164/21
167/10 170/2 173/4	140/10 168/6 210/4	64/23 78/24 84/10	164/14 166/11 184/4	169/20 174/10 177/10
174/11 175/6 182/5	follow-up [1] 168/6	110/2 121/2 121/3	functions [6] 90/12	generated [1] 160/11
182/22 183/20 184/25	followed [10] 2/16	121/7 132/6 139/22	90/20 150/22 150/22	genomic [1] 107/19
185/4 185/5 185/17	17/4 28/19 68/9	146/4 146/17 146/20	165/2 196/17	genomics [1] 96/5
186/5 186/23 187/12	120/10 135/15 140/25		fund [2] 76/20 98/11	geographical [1]
188/25 189/7 194/19	162/9 166/7 186/6	147/24 148/15 155/12		132/1 Coorgo [1] 154/15
199/1 202/25 203/4	following [15] 39/1 39/16 45/4 53/21	169/20 174/10 180/15 181/13 181/19 187/8	110/15 110/22 111/3	George [1] 154/15 Geriatrics [2] 70/18
209/24	58/21 94/16 106/10	four days [2] 121/7	111/3 111/6 112/14	71/12
First Minister [39]	123/19 130/19 137/3	132/6	113/17 132/10 132/22	
24/17 24/21 25/6 28/3	141/22 142/9 174/9	four lines [2] 38/12	139/3 142/9 147/10	get [16] 14/1 31/9
32/9 33/17 40/12	180/2 197/5	56/24	172/10 172/10 172/16	
47/13 48/13 50/13 50/25 52/15 52/19	follows [1] 199/22	four months [2]	207/25	96/15 103/17 113/6
52/24 53/3 53/6 53/20	food [1] 95/17	121/2 121/3	future [7] 40/9 74/1	113/8 113/13 130/1
91/2 103/1 103/4	foot [1] 62/5	four nation [1] 78/24		156/4 199/14 202/10
103/6 104/9 105/13	force [1] 141/7	four nations [5] 12/2		205/18
114/2 134/17 136/19	forecasts [1] 79/6	21/6 36/6 44/23 64/23	G	Gething [11] 10/16
137/7 147/22 155/2	forefront [1] 210/7	four weeks [5]		33/12 34/1 69/19
157/9 157/12 157/17	foreseeable [1]	139/22 147/2 147/5	gains [1] 139/21	
158/3 158/7 173/4	39/25 foreseeably [2] 115/7	147/24 148/15	game [3] 125/21 125/25 126/4	127/12 136/20 147/23 201/21
174/11 182/22 188/25	115/10	four-way [1] 187/8	gaps [2] 144/7	getting [4] 135/6
194/19	forgotten [1] 207/21	four-week [1] 146/17	144/11	149/14 169/24 177/18
First Minister's [3]	form [5] 60/18 60/21	fourth [6] 42/20	Gardner [6] 205/15	Giri [1] 136/4
37/4 165/16 189/7	82/15 126/6 178/10	104/21 108/1 124/17	205/20 205/24 205/25	Giri Shankar [1]
Firstly [1] 82/17	formal [14] 8/19 10/7	131/5 170/17	207/15 212/19	136/4
fit [2] 80/14 111/10 five [6] 17/10 33/4	12/8 13/3 18/22 40/15	framework [1]	Gareth [1] 37/3	gist [1] 201/24
76/22 146/14 146/15	59/12 86/22 101/2	121/18	Gareth Davies [1]	give [17] 2/4 45/9
168/18	190/9 190/12 193/24	France [1] 35/19	37/3	50/8 66/9 66/23 67/20
five weeks [1]	194/12 194/12	Frank [41] 1/3 1/4 1/7	gather [1] 39/8	75/7 82/10 119/4
146/15	formalised [1]	1/11 1/11 1/13 1/17	gathering [2] 38/14	146/4 152/14 160/5
five years [1] 76/22	101/12	2/2 2/11 3/17 6/9 7/8	39/18	164/16 181/14 199/17
fizzle [2] 19/13 19/18	formally [6] 13/25	9/8 18/24 28/21 33/2 33/22 35/3 37/15 42/8	gatherings [16] 37/1	199/18 208/19
fizzling [1] 23/25	44/10 44/18 157/15 184/10 184/12	44/2 44/4 44/20 45/19		given [31] 9/23 16/22 17/15 25/8 25/11
flag [1] 6/20	format [2] 164/5	48/4 52/10 53/11	40/6 113/22 114/6	38/23 43/15 43/15
flagged [2] 71/10	166/8	54/20 56/14 58/15	115/13 116/6 116/10	50/12 52/14 55/18
163/23	formation [2] 80/11	62/16 62/22 64/16	116/14 116/21	58/1 60/9 60/10 70/1
flattening [1] 41/10	96/3	65/4 69/1 73/6 75/4	gauge [1] 190/23	91/24 111/1 116/4
flexible [1] 171/18	formed [1] 91/20	75/6 102/10 204/22	gave [15] 1/18 14/4	118/10 139/10 140/12
Fliss [5] 89/2 102/10 131/17 132/2 134/12	former [4] 15/1	212/3	37/11 54/22 66/2 66/5	140/22 168/16 171/22
101/11 102/2 104/12	153/18 155/4 156/25	Frank Atherton [1]	66/16 98/3 115/4	182/24 184/17 185/19
L	1	<u> </u>	1	(67) first siven

(67) first... - given

	000/0	404/00 404/05 405/5		
G	208/6	164/23 164/25 165/7	grounded [1] 77/16	48/8 49/2 53/11 55/18
given [4] 194/14	Goodall [16] 3/22 4/1	165/13 165/15 165/17	group [75] 3/23 17/1	57/2 59/15 60/12
204/5 205/5 207/22	4/5 5/19 6/16 7/9 24/7	169/2 169/21 170/5	17/24 58/21 58/24	61/13 61/13 61/15
gives [3] 116/17	25/5 30/3 155/16	170/12 174/6 175/13	58/24 59/20 60/2 61/4	62/3 65/9 65/10 66/10
122/2 155/25	168/12 177/7 187/16	175/19 175/22 175/23	65/11 65/13 66/18	68/13 69/16 70/14
	190/24 201/15 210/22	175/23 176/12 176/20	66/19 69/17 79/9 81/3	70/15 71/10 71/24
giving [12] 1/9 1/14 24/21 53/6 54/11	Goodall's [2] 165/5	176/22 177/1 177/17	81/8 85/17 86/3 86/5	71/25 72/4 79/2 80/12
75/17 75/20 114/21	192/11	178/4 178/9 178/14	86/6 86/12 89/22	80/14 80/23 81/4 86/9
	got [29] 2/5 27/3 35/1	178/18 179/9 180/2	89/25 90/10 90/13	86/18 91/6 92/21
114/22 114/25 152/11	62/17 66/23 66/25	180/6 180/9 180/20	90/13 90/23 92/13	92/22 92/25 93/2
200/3	85/15 88/15 96/4	181/11 181/24 182/8	92/25 93/2 93/16	94/15 95/13 100/11
glad [1] 201/13	98/22 100/8 100/24	183/1 183/3 183/8	93/24 94/4 94/5 94/13	101/17 107/3 108/8
global [2] 19/15	106/25 112/5 119/5	183/15 183/19 185/2	96/7 96/11 98/2 104/6	109/12 111/14 111/20
121/2	125/11 138/9 139/15	185/23 186/11 186/22		112/17 113/12 116/16
go [53] 1/22 15/5	142/3 145/7 148/18	187/4 188/16 189/9	123/10 123/14 123/15	117/24 119/10 121/9
18/19 20/9 20/25	159/23 161/22 168/3	189/16 189/17 190/2	123/20 136/7 137/14	122/15 123/12 124/13
25/10 33/5 36/20	195/18 195/25 198/18	191/25 192/1 192/10	137/15 137/20 150/10	127/23 129/2 133/23
37/24 38/8 39/18 56/3	204/1 205/23	192/18 192/25 193/11	150/20 165/2 166/20	134/24 135/12 135/13
56/4 57/14 63/1 69/5	Gov [1] 38/1	194/2 194/15 194/18	166/21 170/21 174/7	136/10 136/23 138/2
69/8 86/3 98/24 109/1	Gove [1] 192/23	195/10 195/15 196/11	174/16 174/19 174/22	140/19 140/21 140/25
110/11 111/9 112/18	governance [8] 80/5	196/15 196/19 196/23		144/5 146/9 146/13
113/23 116/6 116/11	83/17 110/6 161/1	196/24 197/14 197/18		146/22 148/8 148/17
122/21 124/10 124/15	165/12 165/14 178/15	197/20 197/23 197/25		156/8 158/5 158/14
125/1 126/8 129/13	181/5	199/3 199/8 199/11	189/23 190/17 192/22	158/21 164/5 164/5
132/8 133/15 138/5		201/22 201/25 202/3	199/23 208/13	166/8 167/18 168/9
139/5 140/9 142/25	government [212] 3/8 3/11 3/20 4/11 8/4	203/8 203/21 204/18		168/14 168/15 170/24
143/17 144/18 145/18			groups [32] 43/8	
148/4 148/19 149/22	8/7 9/15 10/20 10/25	204/23 204/25 208/11	44/15 44/16 60/18	171/11 171/18 173/22
158/11 160/22 175/14	13/11 14/6 14/12	208/13 208/20 210/11	61/14 73/10 73/12	176/3 180/9 180/11
178/20 182/10 203/15	14/14 14/20 16/21	210/12 210/15 210/18		181/8 181/12 183/1
203/23 204/1 206/12	23/23 24/9 24/10	Government's [6]	74/18 74/23 85/21	185/13 185/24 186/11
GO-Science [1] 86/3	27/10 27/14 27/17	38/13 143/12 159/15	92/12 92/21 92/22	186/12 188/25 192/7
goes [6] 29/11 34/21	28/11 29/18 32/10	182/20 184/1 188/17	94/14 94/15 95/8	194/7 195/6 195/8
149/11 170/17 179/23		Government-wide [2]		195/12 195/16 196/6
202/16	41/1 41/24 42/15	181/11 210/12	131/1 188/12 189/5	196/6 196/8 197/24
going [54] 2/2 3/20	44/25 50/20 53/13	governments [5]	189/11 189/25 190/8	198/9 199/5 200/12
5/6 6/23 12/7 20/16	55/21 58/17 58/18	82/22 83/2 88/7	193/11 208/12 208/21	201/1 202/3 203/5
21/15 24/1 24/2 25/25	63/7 63/13 64/7 64/13	109/21 121/11	growing [2] 134/4	203/6 203/9 205/2
26/1 26/2 27/20 28/8	67/8 68/10 69/17	GPs [3] 60/3 60/10	185/21	205/4 205/7 205/14
37/8 40/6 43/18 44/12	71/24 77/11 77/15	60/12	growth [4] 110/23	207/2 207/11 208/11
44/17 48/13 63/12	78/2 78/4 79/16 80/18	• • •	139/8 140/2 141/18	208/14 208/18
67/19 67/22 71/16	81/5 81/12 82/8 83/22	gradual [2] 5/24	guarantee [1] 75/7	hadn't [4] 31/4 54/10
82/20 86/15 107/25	84/11 84/14 86/4	91/20	guess [2] 105/20	65/9 128/10
114/17 115/14 115/16	87/25 88/1 88/10	gradually [2] 31/24	113/16	half [4] 72/22 127/22
117/25 132/25 135/5	88/10 89/21 90/15	32/20	guesswork [1]	138/12 164/1
135/8 147/12 148/17	92/3 93/1 93/20 94/9	graphic [1] 41/7	107/17	half term [1] 138/12
149/15 151/2 151/11	94/11 95/25 96/25	grateful [18] 17/7	guidance [16] 67/23	halfway [1] 73/20
152/21 154/25 161/3	97/3 98/19 99/10	19/25 35/2 36/4 38/3		Halligan [3] 80/1 80/9
167/20 171/15 180/19	100/20 102/2 102/2	47/20 61/21 62/16	77/22 84/10 84/16	80/13
181/14 183/6 186/13	104/2 105/14 105/17	76/12 78/10 97/25	90/14 123/3 178/12	halved [1] 113/4
193/22 195/20 201/18	107/13 110/4 111/22	113/25 116/8 119/24	182/4 182/6 182/7	Hancock [2] 125/20
207/16 208/8 211/2	113/21 116/12 117/21	125/11 153/16 190/15	182/18 182/25	125/25
gone [10] 84/3 84/3	117/22 119/7 119/10	207/19	Н	hand [4] 10/3 17/11
110/15 111/3 112/17	119/12 119/17 120/19			88/20 125/16
168/15 200/12 203/5	120/24 121/11 123/22	98/9 141/16 145/20	habitually [1] 207/7	handbrake [1] 41/22
203/5 203/9	130/10 134/22 134/23		had [159] 4/16 7/12	handful [1] 107/20
good [25] 49/5 50/6	146/12 146/19 147/13		8/21 9/12 10/7 10/8	handled [1] 28/11
53/17 62/22 73/6 76/1	148/8 149/25 150/11	147/4		hands [1] 151/21
88/15 96/4 109/18	151/3 153/19 153/22	great [6] 120/7	26/3 26/22 28/25	happen [5] 24/1 24/4
111/7 116/15 117/19	154/4 154/7 154/14	133/20 185/20 193/21		86/15 89/11 176/25
129/22 141/16 145/16	154/21 154/24 155/9	194/13 194/18	31/4 33/15 34/7 34/8	happened [6] 14/7
149/4 171/12 172/15	155/20 156/1 156/6	greater [5] 83/16	35/18 35/22 35/24	69/19 163/2 165/22
188/11 188/14 197/21	156/10 156/16 156/19		36/9 36/13 37/12 39/2	189/2 201/5
198/9 198/24 202/23	159/2 161/15 161/19	150/15	39/5 40/1 40/22 42/4	happening [18] 19/6
	162/12 164/3 164/18	grew [2] 31/24 32/20	42/17 44/2 45/18 46/9	21/5 24/14 25/8 40/21
L				(68) given happening

(68) given... - happening

н	he [56] 5/7 10/17	126/14 127/24 130/24	205/2	honest [1] 201/10
	10/19 12/25 23/3 24/7	135/19 136/5 136/6	Hi [1] 69/4	honestly [2] 130/5
happening [13]	27/6 27/9 27/11 27/11	137/8 138/24 139/12	high [18] 3/10 3/11	198/8
41/19 62/14 72/3 85/24 85/24 86/10	28/5 28/6 30/3 30/18	140/24 150/19 160/10		honesty [1] 157/5
87/2 89/12 89/20	37/8 50/23 50/23 51/1	178/4 185/11 185/17	103/24 106/20 113/7	honoured [1] 117/25
111/11 129/20 167/19	96/24 97/1 97/16	185/22 187/9 192/7	113/8 113/13 118/12	honours [1] 76/18
191/7	108/21 111/20 116/5	209/24 210/2 210/12	130/21 135/24 143/7	hope [8] 21/13 26/5
happens [3] 96/3	116/13 118/20 124/16		144/20 146/7 158/21	30/14 31/7 84/5 109/1
113/6 115/21	124/24 146/2 146/4	healthcare [5] 21/24	higher [2] 5/12	188/7 202/16
hard [13] 2/5 2/7 3/18	146/14 146/14 146/22	74/11 77/12 77/16	110/20	hopeful [1] 8/5
21/13 28/21 30/14	155/18 155/25 156/3	126/14	highlighted [2] 56/25	
33/2 35/3 37/14 52/10	156/6 156/8 156/8 156/12 170/14 171/11	Heaney [2] 68/2 72/23	181/2 bighting [1]	149/10 149/12
56/4 56/21 139/6	171/12 172/7 172/13	hear [7] 1/15 5/6 52/5	highlighting [1] 112/6	horizon [1] 165/18 horrendous [1]
hardest [1] 37/21	172/24 173/16 173/24		highlights [1] 135/21	205/10
harm [17] 42/19	174/22 174/23 186/11		highly [2] 120/11	hospital [14] 45/12
42/19 42/23 43/2	192/15 192/15 200/1	heard [25] 9/13 10/16		47/16 70/14 71/1 71/2
43/10 43/22 73/9 74/1	201/23 204/23	12/16 13/6 19/3 23/2	him [10] 5/7 24/19	71/7 105/1 105/3
93/6 133/22 133/22 136/9 136/12 138/9	he's [3] 27/7 136/5	26/7 43/5 50/23 51/3	103/9 145/13 146/19	105/5 113/2 121/13
140/16 140/18 143/5	145/12	51/13 51/14 63/7	155/2 171/11 173/24	122/7 122/8 122/14
harms [20] 42/17	head [10] 14/19	78/17 92/18 96/22	178/2 198/4	hospitalisation [2]
42/18 42/20 42/21	21/18 154/6 155/8	97/15 115/8 145/24	hindsight [9] 16/17	144/17 144/20
73/12 73/23 74/5 74/8	170/15 170/20 171/22	156/3 180/9 185/24	38/20 40/7 64/17	hospitalisations [1]
74/8 92/25 93/10	182/20 195/6 198/3	189/11 192/19 204/21	112/15 112/19 115/15	
93/15 93/24 136/10	headed [2] 66/2	hearing [3] 14/10		hospitalised [1]
136/13 136/15 136/17	191/19	155/17 211/11	his [35] 11/13 24/17	144/18
138/23 169/8 209/5	heading [2] 21/18	Heaven [12] 62/19	27/12 28/3 32/9 37/5	hospitals [14] 28/14
has [51] 5/2 9/13	175/15 heads [3] 177/24	62/20 73/2 145/9 145/10 148/23 198/21	50/25 63/10 97/1 97/5 101/16 103/7 105/13	46/2 46/13 46/19 68/13 69/23 69/24
20/20 20/24 21/21	183/21 202/20	198/22 205/13 212/6	108/12 116/8 116/21	70/9 70/23 72/17
24/17 28/4 28/5 30/19	heads-up [1] 177/24	212/12 212/18	125/20 134/17 134/18	
32/9 37/2 42/23 50/25	health [136] 2/20	heavily [5] 7/6	145/20 146/13 146/17	126/11
54/3 78/17 83/9 84/13	2/22 2/24 3/2 3/23	158/24 165/13 171/16		hosted [1] 153/6
84/15 84/17 88/17	4/12 4/19 4/22 4/24	210/20	170/25 172/7 174/7	hour [1] 164/1
88/21 96/23 96/24 102/13 102/13 102/15	5/6 5/17 7/5 7/10 8/11	heed [1] 104/2	174/19 174/22 180/12	hours [4] 96/3 125/7
105/14 116/4 116/16	9/18 9/20 10/8 12/23	held [8] 5/2 5/7 20/2	190/21 190/23 197/24	
118/19 120/11 124/13	15/1 15/12 15/13	55/10 76/14 80/21	201/16	household [2] 60/19
124/20 134/18 144/2	15/24 16/5 16/8 17/6	94/7 141/21	hit [1] 34/7	60/21
144/6 146/25 150/8	17/14 17/19 22/2 22/6		hm [1] 5/14	housekeeping [1]
155/18 156/10 160/10	22/13 22/20 23/5	18/10 45/2 48/6 48/21	hoc [4] 15/13 15/18	201/13
163/18 178/7 178/10	24/13 25/5 25/15 26/8			how [45] 9/7 16/11
189/11 190/11 191/4	26/12 27/7 27/16	77/22 82/15 84/23	hold [3] 52/2 76/17	25/20 25/21 25/23
192/13 195/25 201/14	27/23 28/9 29/1 29/15 29/20 29/23 30/2	86/4 91/24 92/14 130/9 135/25 151/17	105/2 holiday [1] 138/14	42/2 42/16 57/10 59/17 60/2 70/6 70/13
202/18	33/10 36/16 42/10	164/4 196/22 211/1	holidays [1] 138/9	71/18 71/21 74/13
hat [1] 26/9	46/7 47/12 48/14 49/6		Holland [1] 207/5	74/13 74/15 77/6
hats [1] 10/24	49/7 50/4 55/25 56/8	13/11 13/21 81/19	home [21] 45/7 59/17	79/18 91/14 91/25
have [324]	70/6 70/12 71/11 72/4		63/16 68/8 69/12 71/7	96/14 97/22 97/25
have/gauge [1]	75/10 76/14 76/22	helpfully [3] 9/19	71/25 72/5 72/9	103/23 105/23 106/8
190/23 haven't [8] 66/22	76/23 76/25 77/4 77/8		110/10 122/3 122/6	107/17 113/11 126/21
72/25 112/4 120/10		HEPU [3] 26/7 26/9	123/4 127/8 127/20	127/1 133/9 140/17
148/24 149/1 153/3	85/10 85/11 85/12	26/15	128/2 128/23 129/4	149/20 151/3 161/16
179/13	87/1 88/17 88/22	her [9] 14/20 95/18	129/13 129/19 147/17	163/6 163/8 167/9
having [24] 7/21	89/21 90/23 90/25	144/1 144/6 188/22	homes [30] 67/19	173/11 192/8 201/10
12/16 16/1 18/6 29/19	91/1 91/9 92/3 92/5	188/24 195/20 196/9	67/23 68/12 69/15	206/12 206/17 206/18
29/24 43/7 50/5 86/25	93/2 93/5 93/9 93/17	207/5	69/24 70/3 70/13	however [5] 97/13
87/14 88/14 97/19	94/3 96/18 99/9	here [18] 33/7 33/25	70/19 71/15 71/17	119/11 129/8 148/6
111/1 134/14 139/21	101/21 103/13 103/23 108/13 108/14 109/15		71/20 72/12 72/15 72/18 121/14 122/14	175/25
141/2 143/10 156/7	115/12 115/24 116/3	48/18/61/6/65/7/90/24	122/17 124/2 126/3	HSSG [3] 4/1 26/8 122/20
157/20 182/17 203/4	117/9 117/22 117/23	122/12 172/21 178/23		
203/23 207/12 208/18	118/11 119/17 120/25	181/2 202/14 203/11	129/14 129/15 169/13	
having three [1]	121/6 121/16 121/18	hesitancy [5] 204/17	191/13 209/3 209/6	human [1] 207/1
139/21	123/3 123/10 124/10	204/20 204/21 204/25		humanities [1]
				hannoning - humanitios

(69) happening... - humanities

H humanities [1]	I definitely [1] 96/13 I deleted [1] 201/11	60/24 98/19 99/3 113/20 125/6 127/10 128/5 145/19 147/2	184/18 193/6 200/3 201/9 210/21	I won't [3] 64/25 69/2 75/7
150/18	I described [1] 94/20 I did [12] 5/20 5/20	138/5 145/18 147/2 152/24 153/23 157/21	I sat [1] 9/7 I say [3] 32/19 34/17	I would [32] 4/24 10/4 10/7 12/5 15/2
hundreds [1] 202/13	5/25 9/6 50/3 51/17	159/20 199/16 206/1	104/20	15/25 18/15 18/19
hydrant [1] 85/20	81/25 157/18 164/13	I keep [1] 48/12	I shall [2] 6/10 54/15	23/15 31/1 34/23
hyperlocal [1] 133/21 hypothetically [2]	172/23 192/3 200/14	I kind [1] 6/5	I should [6] 162/18	36/17 38/20 38/21
111/7 129/7	I didn't [6] 25/10	I knew [4] 171/10	180/14 182/25 193/25	51/16 51/24 58/15
	34/17 51/17 104/5	171/11 171/11 172/23		67/1 84/5 87/18
<u> </u>	201/9 204/21	I know [5] 32/20	I start [1] 97/25	122/24 129/8 130/14
I absolutely [1] 72/18	I do [20] 3/13 8/14 12/22 13/13 27/15	96/10 189/7 201/10 208/20	I still [1] 29/23	149/7 176/18 177/18 177/22 180/10 193/6
I actually [1] 97/9	29/10 39/12 40/15		I stress [1] 46/1 I suggested [1] 73/24	
l adopted [1] 166/9	41/1 50/1 67/20 95/22	65/16	I support [1] 63/19	I wouldn't [4] 102/15
l agree [3] 44/17 111/25 144/14	116/25 117/2 152/23	I made [1] 176/7	I suppose [5] 10/6	183/2 201/10 205/7
l also [1] 204/5	156/2 167/12 195/4	I may [9] 3/5 9/10	26/22 109/16 172/2	I wrote [1] 48/10
l am [7] 30/17 97/25	195/18 208/15	37/1 81/24 130/15	201/12	l'd [17] 35/5 37/16
134/11 200/13 201/13	I don't [33] 11/23	132/4 154/20 159/22	I suspect [2] 53/15	80/12 92/3 98/14
207/9 209/11	14/6 20/14 20/16	188/19	107/19	118/16 121/12 122/9
l and [2] 102/10	24/15 24/22 25/2 29/21 33/21 35/24	I mean [28] 20/14 39/21 50/22 51/10	I take [1] 138/1 I tend [1] 81/24	143/19 148/4 148/19 171/10 174/24 184/21
187/6	36/13 42/7 43/20 52/7	62/2 62/6 81/9 81/25	I then [1] 164/6	193/5 207/21 207/21
I appreciate [3] 135/3 168/8 202/12	54/9 57/5 58/13 67/12	85/16 87/15 88/14	I think [214]	I'll [7] 51/7 132/8
l ask [6] 60/6 69/13	80/21 87/10 95/22	93/21 94/12 95/1	I to [1] 108/19	149/14 159/21 199/18
136/18 145/22 152/16	103/6 116/1 119/18	95/21 99/24 102/9	I took [1] 192/15	207/13 207/25
153/22	131/16 132/7 139/5	105/16 109/24 115/7	I understand [25] 2/5	
I asked [3] 118/8	142/21 171/23 181/25	129/8 129/10 132/23	2/23 5/11 11/5 11/12	3/7 6/13 6/20 6/23
146/12 146/19	203/9 209/8 209/18	140/20 141/21 167/10 168/16 201/23		
I assume [2] 101/8	I drafted [1] 115/2 I express [1] 73/16	l meant [1] 22/24	40/19 43/2 77/4 79/14 84/7 91/19 98/17 99/1	17/7 18/5 19/25 21/15 24/22 25/18 26/12
108/21	l expressed [1] 73/15		102/13 123/11 153/4	26/14 29/1 30/5 31/1
I attended [1] 190/13	I feel [5] 12/21 12/24		164/10 168/7 168/17	32/20 34/17 35/2 36/4
l be [4] 4/18 7/20 78/1 207/4	14/24 15/7 93/8	32/25 183/21	198/19 205/14	38/3 43/24 46/16
I believe [15] 27/23	I felt [7] 6/5 15/3	I missed [1] 59/2	l used [1] 29/22	47/20 48/2 48/13 49/1
39/5 42/3 47/1 50/4	49/11 54/10 134/23	I myself am [1] 96/9	I want [11] 9/8 18/24	50/7 60/3 61/21 62/16
65/17 66/20 74/21	164/7 172/23	I need [2] 48/15	36/24 42/8 63/1 69/9	63/12 65/4 67/19
81/1 111/11 144/19	I first [1] 164/6	48/16	102/23 130/13 165/20 182/3 202/8	73/15 75/7 76/12 78/10 81/9 84/19 85/7
100/22 101/2 100/11	I found [2] 81/7 168/4 I gave [2] 66/16	50/8	I wanted [2] 22/20	86/24 90/6 90/22
196/8	115/4	I passed [1] 56/11	171/13	92/21 92/21 95/22
I can [22] 1/3 32/19 44/21 58/5 59/13 69/5	l go [1] 133/15	I picked [1] 170/4	I was [52] 6/4 8/5	96/7 97/8 97/12
73/18 75/14 78/20	I got [3] 66/25 195/18		10/7 25/4 33/21 39/20	111/25 112/4 112/4
98/16 119/3 126/8	205/23	I presented [1] 8/3	40/14 45/22 46/16	112/6 113/25 115/1
127/11 128/15 145/23	I guess [1] 113/16	I probably [1] 53/15	49/9 49/9 49/11 49/13	
156/12 166/19 169/16	I had [11] 22/19 26/22 49/2 62/3 65/10	I provided [1] 4/21	53/8 54/9 55/7 55/11 56/3 57/12 57/13	123/11 123/14 124/4 125/11 126/15 134/21
194/22 197/12 200/11	109/12 180/11 183/1	l really [2] 15/17	57/16 57/17 59/13	147/8 148/17 149/14
203/14	195/8 196/8 205/7	33/20	65/16 73/22 80/14	151/11 151/12 151/21
I can cover [1] 191/16	I have [9] 58/1 58/13	I recall [3] 24/12	81/23 89/24 96/12	153/16 154/16 164/10
l can't [17] 12/21	69/7 135/24 176/9	61/17 185/20	116/1 118/6 118/10	169/23 170/21 171/2
25/16 55/8 74/19 75/7	183/10 188/7 200/1	I received [1] 195/4	124/4 124/6 138/20	171/23 176/24 181/25
81/23 85/1 109/18	201/11	I recognise [1] 53/8	152/21 157/11 157/17	183/10 188/8 190/15
132/23 132/25 133/25	l haven't [2] 72/25 112/4	I recollect [1] 109/19 I referred [1] 209/7	163/15 165/1 170/6 171/10 171/15 176/11	196/8 200/3 201/18 203/2 207/15 207/15
	1 4 4 4 4 4 4 4 4 4 4 4 4 4 4 4 4 4 4 4	l remember [3] 9/2	180/7 180/12 180/12	207/16 207/19 207/20
200/24 200/13 200/23	I honestly [1] 130/5	142/23 186/14	185/12 185/23 200/17	208/8 208/18 208/23
I checked [1] 197/1 I come [1] 64/25	I hope [4] 21/13	I represent [5] 62/22	200/23 204/14	209/18 211/1
I continue [1] 114/11	30/14 84/5 109/1	73/6 145/16 198/24	I wasn't [11] 20/14	I'm afraid [5] 75/7
I could [7] 30/10 32/8	I imagine [1] 168/12	208/6	25/10 34/18 51/23	171/23 203/2 208/18
56/17 152/14 163/15	l informed [1] 73/21	l right [7] 29/12 88/7	104/5 104/14 104/16	209/18
198/8 198/13	I invited [1] 198/10 I joined [1] 51/16	89/13 93/15 155/7 160/24 164/20	108/22 124/3 176/6 176/18	l've [16] 17/22 27/19 51/25 62/17 64/18
I couldn't [2] 49/5	l just [20] 17/5 23/13	I said [10] 22/23 24/5		67/11 84/17 119/5
49/8	33/25 44/21 47/18	167/20 171/15 173/3	205/17	140/20 141/1 145/7
				(70) humanities _ l've

(70) humanities... - I've

I I've [5] 145/13 148/18 199/23 ICU [1] 111/15 idea [5] 67/13 135/2 198/9 199/23 ICU [1] 111/15 idea [5] ideally [2] 96/12 206/9 ideas [1] ideas [1] 198/6 identified [8] 42/17 56/16 59/16 59/20 60/1 98/16 98/16 143/25 identifies [1] identify [6] 60/5 98/16 98/19 100/22 157/21 157/21 100/22 157/21 1/3 112/2 14/7 136/3 if [174] if [174] 1/3 1/4 2/7 3/5 3/16 3/17 3/2 identify [6] 60/5 98/16 99/20 3/2 3/5 3/1 5/1<	29/15 39/17 42/17 43/7 43/11 56/12 56/13 77/23 97/23 105/3 113/14 115/5 115/6 127/19 130/25 134/12 138/10 139/8 139/11 142/15 144/15 145/2 160/4 162/21 162/22 193/6 193/14 193/17 193/25 194/4 194/4 194/8 194/12 194/14 195/2 195/9 195/11 196/10 196/20 196/22 197/2 197/6 197/8 197/8 197/10 206/3 206/12 206/21 206/25 207/7 207/11 210/16 impacts [6] 74/24 74/24 94/1 95/15 105/7 209/10 impartiality [1] 157/6 imperative [1] 71/3 Imperial [1] 76/19 implementation [9] 137/14 137/20 186/19 189/5 189/11 189/13 189/23 189/25 190/8 implemented [9] 4/13 55/20 55/22 56/7 130/10 131/12 132/22 139/13 173/3 implications [4] 4/12	improve [1] 151/3 improved [1] 196/6 improvement [2] 98/5 168/2 inappropriate [2] 46/5 95/20 incidence [2] 54/3 133/23 incident [3] 17/24 67/25 120/10 incidents [1] 10/9 include [2] 146/17 175/4 include [2] 146/17 175/4 include [7] 17/18 70/12 80/19 80/24 95/16 124/4 161/19 including [11] 8/22 25/9 62/9 95/9 112/9 117/21 117/22 117/22 118/11 140/15 176/1 incoherent [1] 116/22 inconsistent [2] 60/7 69/25 incorporate [1] 15/6 increase [2] 41/20 127/16 increasing [1] 139/11 increasingly [2] 23/24 169/24 incredibly [1] 168/4 incur [1] 136/12 indeed [8] 51/12 55/10 64/21 68/11 147/4 161/11 167/15 210/25 independence [4] 3/10 3/14 92/13 96/25 independent [3] 18/11 78/3 101/16 index [2] 100/25 211/13	73/25 74/5 136/12 209/5 individual [8] 25/20 76/2 115/20 149/7 159/16 162/14 162/25 163/7 individuals [6] 9/15 21/25 22/4 42/19 71/17 128/12 indoor [1] 54/5 inequalities [3] 42/24 94/3 130/24 inequality [3] 43/20 44/13 194/20 inevitably [2] 162/11 207/2 infected [8] 21/25 22/3 32/3 71/2 106/24 107/1 107/18 144/18 infection [16] 25/13 31/6 31/22 32/1 32/7 34/12 35/17 35/19 41/5 41/20 55/23 72/5 72/11 72/15 112/15 139/11 infections [3] 74/14 125/13 140/12 infectious [9] 9/18 10/5 26/11 26/21 70/20 72/7 72/8 103/24 107/18 influences [2] 83/20 83/24 influencing [1] 97/5 inform [2] 14/13 149/21 informal [10] 11/25 16/2 25/4 48/16 86/14 174/25 175/3 180/14 184/10 187/7 information [40] 6/3 9/9 12/1 12/2 13/2 15/10 16/2 16/13 59/22 62/3 62/14 73/10 73/25 79/5 79/23 84/2 93/23 96/15 96/19 99/7 99/17 100/1 100/11 106/23 107/15 111/21 139/24 144/5 144/7 167/8 167/17 175/8 177/19 178/14 178/18 182/7 184/7 187/11	193/19 194/22 209/25 210/3 initially [6] 15/2 22/11 22/16 32/1 59/20 156/4 initiated [1] 189/15 initiative [1] 130/11 initiatives [6] 118/4 118/24 120/5 135/4 208/12 208/16 input [2] 161/9 162/16 INQ000048838 [1] 100/24 INQ000056221 [1] 35/2 INQ000056221 [1] 37/16 INQ000066086 [1] 154/22 INQ000066086 [1] 154/22 INQ000066189 [1] 17/7 INQ000066189 [1] 17/7 INQ000066397 [1] 133/3 INQ000066397 [1] 133/3 INQ000066397 [1] 133/3 INQ000068504 [1] 90/8 INQ000087032 [1] 104/19 INQ00022863 [1] 52/8 INQ00022863 [1] 52/8 INQ00022863 [1] 124/7 INQ000271446 [1] 113/24 INQ000271446 [1] 113/24 INQ000271447 [1] 113/24 INQ000271447 [1] 113/24 INQ000251498 [1] 19/25 INQ000271447 [1] 113/24 INQ000271447 [1] 113/24 INQ000271447 [1] 113/24
128/15 129/5 130/15 131/4 131/12 131/19 131/23 132/9 132/14 133/2 133/5 137/17 138/8 140/19 140/25	189/23 189/25 190/8 implemented [9] 4/13 55/20 55/22 56/7 130/10 131/12 132/22 139/13 173/3 implications [4] 4/12 58/3 58/10 107/12 importance [2] 88/6 179/4 important [24] 10/13	independence [4] 3/10 3/14 92/13 96/25 independent [3] 18/11 78/3 101/16 index [2] 100/25	99/17 100/1 100/11 106/23 107/15 111/21 139/24 144/5 144/7 167/8 167/17 175/8 177/19 178/14 178/18 182/7 184/7 187/11 195/19 207/3 information-sharing [3] 16/2 16/13 167/8 informed [8] 25/5 25/6 25/6 33/12 67/13 73/21 150/24 159/21 informing [1] 179/8	19/25 INQ000271446 [1] 113/24 INQ000271447 [1] 114/9 INQ000299055 [1] 169/18 INQ000300004 [1] 166/19 INQ000303227 [2]

(71) I've... - INQ000309871

1	144/2 145/25 152/10	140/10	involving [2] 120/10	107/9 108/21 110/5
INQ000309905 [1]		intervened [1] 159/9	183/8	110/16 111/19 112/24
119/22		intervening [1] 134/2		114/5 114/9 116/8
INQ000310085 [2]		intervention [5]	Ipsos MORI [1] 96/18	
106/12 107/8	189/11 192/23 193/14 195/25 201/14 206/2	37/21 56/1 132/7 135/14 136/10	Ireland [4] 50/16 87/5 187/7 190/2	124/17 125/9 127/14 130/4 132/5 137/18
INQ000315913 [1]	208/25 212/4 212/10	interventions [14]	is [322]	142/5 143/3 149/23
137/17	212/16	56/2 82/11 131/7	iShare [3] 180/3	151/12 151/24 154/19
INQ000321023 [1]	Inquiry's [1] 192/19	131/20 131/25 133/18		156/13 160/8 160/9
143/3	Insights [1] 94/6		isn't [10] 39/24 42/22	160/11 164/24 169/5
INQ000327541 [2]	insisting [1] 46/16	134/5 134/13 134/18	72/24 106/5 124/24	169/19 170/14 172/9
47/20 61/1 INQ000327548 [1]	inspector [1] 68/16	134/22 159/11	159/17 175/21 177/5	172/11 174/2 174/3
56/20	Inspectorate [1]	into [60] 3/20 8/11	179/12 193/20	175/6 175/7 175/8
INQ000336353 [1]	68/16	8/12 11/9 12/4 12/4	isolate [1] 128/18	177/4 179/14 179/18
122/18	instead [1] 167/7	15/19 16/7 17/18	isolating [2] 22/3	182/4 182/5 183/17
INQ000336393 [1]	instruction [1] 59/10	22/15 22/17 27/1	70/20	183/19 184/8 191/1
68/20	instructions [1]	28/15 33/15 34/1	isolation [2] 23/11 137/22	199/21 202/10 202/12 202/14 206/10 209/23
INQ000336421 [1]	183/13 insufficient [1] 32/11	34/21 37/12 40/9 42/24 46/20 53/5 56/5		202/14/208/10/209/23
123/18	integrated [6] 155/24		13/1 15/7 19/15 24/8	Italy [8] 26/24 26/25
INQ00035042 [1]	156/20 194/4 196/21	71/17 72/11 74/14	24/13 27/16 27/16	28/14 35/13 40/21
142/3	197/10 206/21	91/13 91/18 100/13	27/17 27/24 28/9	41/18 41/19 70/9
INQ000350513 [1] 111/19	Integration [1] 69/7	103/15 108/24 111/10		item [1] 33/8
INQ000371233 [1]	integrity [1] 157/5		39/25 44/23 47/1 49/3	items [1] 33/5
208/9	intel [1] 190/22	122/14 123/6 130/8	49/15 50/3 53/7 61/10	
INQ000383581 [1]	intelligence [10] 12/1		65/14 66/21 67/7	iterating [1] 89/20
21/11	14/21 79/3 79/8 86/10		71/10 124/12 161/7	its [12] 29/15 94/7
INQ000383585 [1]	86/14 89/1 89/6 89/9 89/23	146/3 147/6 147/25 148/15 150/6 154/25	180/11 195/17 199/1 200/8	94/11 109/12 120/25 138/15 167/3 167/13
28/20	intend [1] 127/16	156/10 169/7 171/14	issued [4] 45/4 53/20	173/6 175/16 178/18
INQ000383626 [1]	intended [2] 139/16	171/25 180/5 195/11	70/16 123/3	196/16
30/12	167/14	204/1		itself [3] 43/14 95/10
INQ000383998 [1] 118/16	intensified [1] 170/7	introduce [1] 126/2	12/23 26/23 27/2	158/9
INQ000385719 [1]	intensifying [1]	introduced [9] 42/24	27/20 27/22 45/20	IV [1] 149/23
135/17	186/16	47/15 60/16 68/10	62/5 151/16 159/12	J
INQ000388424 [1]	intention [4] 167/1 171/21 174/18 174/22	125/17 127/7 127/9	160/4 161/1 162/16 164/17 199/7	Jane [10] 52/11
202/10	inter [1] 17/12	introducing [2]	it [471]	52/11 64/12 182/19
INQ000390618 [1]	inter-connected [1]	112/21 142/6	it's [140] 3/1 6/17	187/24 188/21 199/16
	17/12	introduction [3]	6/17 17/5 17/7 17/8	200/5 200/9 200/21
INQ000391115 [1] 1/21	interactions [4]	67/21 111/5 163/13	17/10 18/7 19/24 20/7	Jane Runeckles [7]
INQ000396461 [1]	58/23 86/20 87/2	investigate [3] 73/11	21/11 21/13 21/15	52/11 64/12 182/19
183/17	132/23	74/5 151/16	22/16 25/3 25/25 26/1	199/16 200/5 200/9
INQ000396684 [1]	interest [3] 61/14	investigator [1]	27/3 28/21 30/11	200/21 Jano Runocklos' [1]
182/2	133/21 198/12 interested [2] 30/17	76/20 investment [1] 17/18	30/12 30/13 30/14 30/17 31/13 32/25	Jane Runeckles' [1] 188/21
INQ000396685 [1]	82/7	invitation [2] 14/5	33/2 33/3 33/7 33/25	Jane's [1] 189/6
178/13	interestingly [1]	81/12	35/2 35/3 35/5 35/10	January [47] 6/1 6/6
INQ000396686 [1] 175/7	27/25	invitations [2] 14/1	35/12 37/14 37/16	7/15 8/2 12/14 12/20
INQ000396694 [1]	interests [2] 44/14	198/3	37/25 38/11 39/21	13/4 13/7 15/16 18/25
179/17	196/18	invite [1] 30/4	42/22 44/10 47/1	19/11 19/23 20/3
INQ000668086 [1]	interfaces [1] 150/23		47/20 47/20 47/21	20/21 20/22 22/8
3/16	intergovernmental	35/7 37/9 81/17 192/25 193/1 198/10	47/23 48/10 48/16 48/25 49/2 51/19	22/14 23/4 23/16 23/18 23/20 24/19
INQUIRY [55] 1/5	[1] 20/13 intergovernmentally	involve [1] 25/5	48/25 49/2 51/19 52/10 52/13 56/20	25/14 26/21 26/23
1/14 1/18 9/13 10/16	[4] 21/6	involve [1] 23/3 involved [16] 9/15	56/21 56/21 56/24	27/5 27/12 28/5 80/17
14/20 18/8 23/2 24/18	internal [7] 99/6	10/8 72/4 89/25 101/3		80/21 102/24 103/2
26/7 27/7 37/2 43/5	99/19 100/20 116/9	103/12 108/22 122/11	61/1 61/2 61/3 61/9	103/5 103/8 104/10
45/9 48/6 50/22 53/25 75/16 75/21 78/17	148/5 181/4 185/2	124/3 124/6 158/8	61/20 67/11 67/18	105/15 105/17 106/1
86/2 87/24 92/17 95/7	international [4] 47/4	166/7 168/1 169/3	68/20 70/17 72/8	155/1 174/4 174/14
96/22 96/24 97/2	79/4 85/18 169/11	173/1 194/2	72/22 78/22 85/19	175/6 184/23 185/3
97/15 103/8 105/14	interpret [1] 34/23	involvement [5] 83/1	91/4 91/4 92/1 96/1	185/20 186/1 189/2
116/5 120/23 137/13	intersect [1] 79/18 intervene [2] 113/16	96/5 122/9 184/22 210/5	97/9 98/23 104/6 104/19 106/6 106/12	January 2020 [9] 15/16 23/4 25/14
		210/0	104/13 100/0 100/12	
			(=0)	

(72) INQ000309905 - January 2020

January 2020 [6] 201/2 02/2 20/2 20/2 20/2 20/2 50/2 for an analysis of a straight a straight of a	J	173/17 182/5 192/20	К	116/2 120/15 120/22	23/4 23/20 26/21
262:1 103:2 103:5 17:5 17:6 17:9 12:9	January 2020 [6]		keen [1] 60/9		26/22 27/1 35/15 41/3
156/1 175/6 185/3 June 2020 [1] 14712 152/2 24/13 448/12 130/5 130/9 13/16 100/6 130/6 134/6 January Zet [1] 17/3 28/2 13/2 14/16 132/2 13/2 14/16 136/5 130/7 12/2 13/6 100/6 130/6 13/6 January/February 3/20 5/5 7/18 10/19 7/22 87/2 14/16 136/5 130/7 12/2 137/2 13/6 18/6 13/6 12/0 2 JBC [4] 14/16 14/21 3/20 5/5 7/18 10/19 23/2 5/7 12/8 13/20 14/2 13/21 5/7 12/21 15/21 3/7 14/21 JD [1] 14/19 3/22 5/7 11/28/4 22/9 13/16 5/7 3/7 16/17 10/74					
January, 2021 [1] 1744 1744 1744 1744 1744 1744 1744 1744 1744 1745 1744 1744 1744 1744 1744 1744 1744 1744 1745 1744 1744 1744 1744 1745 1744 1744 1745					
1744 1744 <td< td=""><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td></td<>					
january/serty [1] january/serty [2] january/serty [2] <thjanuary [2]<="" serty="" th=""> january/serty [2] <</thjanuary>					
January/February 3/2	January/early [1] 8/2		keeping [5] 25/5 30/2		
2020 [1] 106/1 11/3					
JBC (4) 14/24 (54) 20/13 (20/14) 12/13 (20/14) 12/14 (20/14) <td></td> <td></td> <td>Kennedy [1] 180/11</td> <td></td> <td></td>			Kennedy [1] 180/11		
14/2 41 30/- 36/25 37/11 42/8 42/9 201/15 <td>JBC [4] 14/16 14/21</td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td>	JBC [4] 14/16 14/21				
Jub [1] Jub [1] <t< td=""><td>14/24 15/4</td><td></td><td>16/16 80/14 188/17</td><td></td><td></td></t<>	14/24 15/4		16/16 80/14 188/17		
Jo Trott [1] 14/19 485 48/14 48/18 50/2 W9 [11] 7/2 Nowing [1] 12/14 186/1 186/12 208/24 Jo's Trott [1] 170/20 55/13 58/7 60/15 39/12 99/24 128/18 Nowing [1] 12/14 Iatter [1] 201/22 John [5] 51/14 66/1 60/24 61/2 06/27 153/21 138/14 160/3 166/12 66/17 7/130/23 Iatter [1] 201/22 Iatter [1] 201/2					
Jos T(1) TO/14 51/7 54/12 Solva 51/7 54/12 Solva 51/7 54/12 Solva 51/7 54/12 Item T(1) Item T(1) Solva 51/7 54/12 Item T(1) Item T(1) <thitem t(1)<="" th=""> Item</thitem>					
Job s [1] Job s [2] 55/13 58/7 60/15 55/14 57/17 55/14 57/17 55/14 57/17 55/14 57/17 55/14 57/17 55/14 57/17 55/14 57/17 55/14 57/17 55/14 57/17 55/15 57/14 55/14 57/17 55/14 57/17 55/14 57/17 55/14 57/17 55/14 57/17 55/14 57/17 55/14 57/17 55/14 57/17 55/14 57/17 55/14 57/17 55/14 57/17 55/14 57/17 55/14 57/17 55/14 57/17 55/14 57/14 55/14 57/17					
Jub [1] 13/2					
John [9] 5/14 b03/1 62/23 63/2 63/4 63/6 153/21 166/5 178/7 153/21 166/5 178/7 153/21 166/5 178/7 153/21 166/5 178/7 153/21 166/5 178/7 153/21 166/5 178/7 153/21 166/5 178/7 153/21 168/1 <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td>					
bb/12 50/1 793/7 63/12 64/8 64/8 65/8 bb/5 76/7 b/5 76/7					
John Si [4] Job Si					
1449/4 208/7 68/2 68/21 68/24 120/18 146/20 164/3 165/6 75/16 80/2 80/13 3/2 208/7 52/26 83/10 87/19 73/8 170/25 171/3 169/6 85/10 101/17 123/24 3/2 21785 3/10 87/19 87/20 89/5 90/21 97/14 75/22 78/20 137/18 170/25 171/3 169/6 85/10 101/17 123/24 3/2 4/23 84/24 85/5 98/19 89/24 99/3 98/12 89/14 99/23 89/16 197/24 14/14 167/87 14/14 167/87 153/25 161/14 167/7 100/24 101/7 101/14 173/75 15/15 41/7 48/14 80/7 8/18 8/19 8/25 74/25 16/14 8/67 88/10 9/14 15/27 117/25 18/17 19/27 12/81 116 19/9 18/22 18/11 9/03 15/8/1 16/7 12/27 13/17 19/17 12/27 13/17 15/12 13/17 19/17 19/2 14/17 13/17 19/17 19/2 14/17 13/17 19/17 19/2 14/17 13/17 19/17 19/2 14/17 13/17 19/17 19/17 13/17 19/17 19/17 13/17 19/17 19/17 13/17 19/17 19/17 13/17 19/17 19/17 13/17 19/17 19/17 13/17 19/17 19/17 13/17 19/17 19/17 13/17 19/17 19/17 13/17 19/17 19/17 13/17 19/17 19/17 13/17 19/17 19/17 13/17 19/17 19/17 13/17 19/17 19/17 13/17 19/17 19/17 13/17 19/17 19/17 13/17 19/17 19/17 13/17 19/17 19/17 13/17 19/17 19/17 13/					26/6 26/12 26/15 27/6
John S Campaign [2] 71/14 75/22 78/20 Kilpatrick [10] 169/6 85/10 101/17 123/24 40/11 82/15 83/10 87/19 82/15 83/10 87/19 173/8 2007.24 152/10 174/19 174/2 40/11 91/24 92/23 98/16 91/24 91/24 173/15 12/24 517/13 152/10 174/19 174/2 150/15 51/17 51/17 91/24 92/23 98/16 91/24 91/15 177/14 173/15 12/24 517/13 155/21 165/41 166/6 155/21 166/6 155/21 166/14 12/23 141/14 12/23 141/14 12/23 141/14 12/23 141/14 166/14 12/23 141/14 166/14 12/23 141/14 12/23 141/14 12/23 141/14 12/23 141/14 12/23					
Johnson [2] 34/25 82/15 83/10 8/119 173/22 174/5 174/11 1 132/10 174/19 174/21 132/10 174/19 174/21 40/11 90/12 91/24 92/23 98/16 91/24 92/23 98/16 172/45 174/11 174/14 174/18 186/7 12/24 22/20 12/276 153/25 161/14 167/17 106/8 11/10 113/20 90/24 101/7 101/14 173/15 16/17 48/14 86/8 12/24 22/210 212/16 15/21 11 16/21 16/21 11 16/21		71/14 75/22 78/20			85/10 101/17 123/24
40/11 5/720 5/720 59/724 92/23 98/16 97/24 92/23 98/16 98/19 98/24 18/24 <t< td=""><td></td><td>82/15 83/10 87/19</td><td></td><td> </td><td>152/10 174/19 174/22</td></t<>		82/15 83/10 87/19		 	152/10 174/19 174/22
join [5] 51/17 51/17 [2] 79/24 99/3 84/23 84/24 85/5 84/23 84/24 85/5 99/19 98/29 99/3 90/19 98/29 99/3 90/19 98/29 99/3 100/24 101/7 101/11 106/8 111/10 113/20 115/16 116/7 119/3 115/16 116/7 119/3 111/10 113/20 111/10 11/10 113/20 111/10 111/10 113/20 111/10 11/10 113/20 111/10 11/10 113/20 111/10 11/10 11/10 113/20 111/10 111/10 113/20 111/10 1				<u>L</u>	212/4 212/10 212/16
84/23 84/24 85/5 98/19 98/24 99/3 Kilpatrick's [1] L4/2 136/1 155/21 153/25 161/14 160/24 101/24					
joined [5] 51/16 100/24 101/7 10174 173/15 labour [1] 120/21 leadership [3] 27/17 153/25 161/14 1671/7 106/8 111/10 113/20 116/8 11/10 113/20 116/8 11/10 113/20 116/8 11/10 113/20 116/8 11/10 113/20 116/8 11/10 113/20 116/8 11/10 113/20 116/8 11/10 113/20 116/8 11/10 113/20 116/8 11/10 113/20 11/16 12/17 11/17					
153/25 161/14 167/17 106/8 111/10 113/20 210/9 kind [14] 6/5 8/10 9/4 8/18 8/19 8/25 74/25 l62/8 17/9 2/25 74/25 l63/18 180/19 150/15 11/16 14/11 189/24 189/25 190/7 119/21 125/6 125/6 129/11 29/11 30/14 132/8 119/21 125/6 125/6 129/11 29/11 130/14 132/8 15/15 41/7 48/14 86/8 99/11 29/11 15/26 95/11 99/19 6/25 99/11 99/11 52/02 141/16 42/4 86/11 136/1 19/99 96/25 141/16 42/4 86/11 136/1 19/24 187/25 189/24 189/25 190/7 Jonathan Van-Tam [1] 12/23 135/23 138/5 139/5 139/10 140/17 141/9 liaks [2] 165/4 190/5 liaks [2] 6/7 7/23 liaks [2] 6/7 7/23 19/22 122/20 122/20 122/20 147/16 147/20 148/7 145/12 145/18 145/23 Kirsty [1] 54/20 liaks [1] 87/2 liaks [1] 87/2 19/22 122/20 122/20 147/16 17/20 148/7 148/12 149/1 149/18 liaks [1] 17/12 liaks [1] 87/2 liaks [1] 87/2 liaks [1] 87/2 19/22 122/20 122/22 145/12 145/18 145/23 Kirsty [1] 54/20 liak/11 14/7 liak/11 148/22 liak/11 148/22 liak/16 16/6/21 167/2 19/22 159/23 159/25 147/16 147/2 148/12 149/1 149/16 liak/12 149/14 liak/12 147/14 liak/12 145/14 liak/12 147					
210/9 113/51/51/51/51/51/51/51/51/51/51 15/15/51/71/54/17 16/15/51/71/51/51/51/51/51/51/51/51/51/51/51/51/51					
joining [1] 170/4 joint [5] 11/16 14/11 126/8 127/10 128/4 joint [5] 11/16 14/11 129/21 120/1 120/1 Jonathan Van-Tam [1] 12/23 Jonathan Van-Tam [1] 12/23 Jones [9] 5/2 54/2 54/2 54/2 54/2 54/2 55/2 6/22 122/20 122/2 Jones [9] 5/2 54/2 147/1 417/2 147/12 147/1 147/2 147/12 147/1 417/2 147/12 147/1 417/2 147/1 417/2 147/2 147/1 417/2 147/1 417/2 147/1 417/2 147/1 417/2 147/2					
joint [5] 11/16 14/11 129/11 21/23 Jonathan Van-Tam [1] 12/23 Jones [9] 5/2 54/2 Jones [1] 54/8 journey [1] 25/23 Jones [1] 96/3 July 2021 [3] 43/3 43/22 44/5 45/24 51/6 Journey [1] 97/19 July 2020 [1] 196/3 July 2021 [3] 43/3 43/22 44/5 45/24 51/6 Journey [1] 96/3 July 2021 [3] 43/3 43/24 44/5 420/21 July 2020 [1] 196/3 July 2021 [3] 43/3 43/24 44/5 420/717 203/19 204/8 205/16 203/19 204/				95/11 95/19 90/25	
189/24 189/25 190/7 135/23 138/5 139/5 135/23 138/5 139/5 135/23 138/5 139/5 191/23 </td <td></td> <td></td> <td>177/25 181/16 190/9</td> <td></td> <td></td>			177/25 181/16 190/9		
Jonathan [1] 12/23 139/10 140/17 141/2 139/10 140/17 141/2	189/24 189/25 190/7		200/23		
Jonatran Van [1] 142/4 143/23 144/1 Kingdom [1] 63/5 Lady [26] 6/10 6/3/23 leaks [1] 85/8 jones [9] 5/2 54/2 145/12 166/13 156/14 147/12 145/12 166/13 157/14 157/14 157/14 157/14 157/14 157/14 147/12 145/12	Jonathan [1] 12/23		kinds [2] 165/4 190/5		
[1] 1/2/23 145/12 145/18 145/23 Kirsty [1] 54/20 54/14 62/21 66/3 earn [1] 40/9 Jones [9] 5/2 54/2 147/1 147/2 147/12 Kirsty Williams [1] 69/15 73/1 73/5 75/2 learned [6] 12/7 98/. Jones [1] 54/2 148/12 149/1 149/18 Kirsty Williams [1] 69/15 73/1 73/5 75/2 learned [6] 12/7 98/. Jones [1] 54/2 148/12 149/1 149/18 Kirsty Williams [1] 69/15 73/1 73/5 75/2 learned [6] 12/7 98/. Jones [1] 54/2 148/12 149/1 149/18 Kirsty Williams [1] 69/15 73/1 73/5 75/2 learned [6] 12/7 98/. Judgement [1] 60/13 157/9 157/21 158/4 152/24 153/2 153/23 102/10 146/13 147/1 178/6 198/23 205/12 learned [6] 12/7 98/. Judith [1] 4/7 166/18 173/5 175/5 160/12 162/1 177/18 177/14 177/24 179/2 171/11 171/11 172/23 ladyship [1] 151/18 leave [3] 45/7 63/16 July [11] 43/3 43/9 177/18 177/19 182/6 179/3 179/19 182/6 13/16 14/6 15/2 20/. Ladyship [1] 151/18 ladyship [1] 151/18 leave [3] 45/7 63/16 July 2021 [1] 96/3 199/14 199/16 192/12 32/3 22/03 66/13 alley [1] 128/17 14/20 16/52 33/5 landed [1] 128/17 14/20 16/52 33/5 July 2021 [3] 43/3 200/14 209/16 20					
Jones [9] 5/2 54/2 54/2					
54/2 54/2 54/10 55/10 147/16 147/20 148/7 54/20 75/5 75/9 75/14 166/16 166/21 167/2 96/22 122/20 122/22 148/12 149/1 149/18 148/12 149/1 149/18 kits [1] 117/12 108/24 145/11 148/22 166/16 166/21 167/2 journey [1] 25/23 152/24 153/2 153/23 152/24 153/2 153/23 102/10 146/13 147/1 108/24 145/11 148/22 145/17 151/21 166/16 166/21 167/2 judgement [1] 60/13 159/20 159/23 159/25 102/10 146/13 147/1 177/18 157/1 151/21 178/6 138/23 205/12 149/1 451/1 148/22 147/13 06/24 209/20 20/17 208/4 209/20 20/17 208/4 209/20 20/17 208/4 209/20 198/11 188/1 19/10 198/11 188/1 19/10 198/11 188/1 19/10 198/11 188/1 19/10 198/11 188/1 19/10 198/11 188/1 19/10 198/11 188/1 19/10 198/11 188/1 19/10 198/11 188/1 19/10 198/11 188/1 19/10 198/11 188/1 19/10 198/11 188/1 19/10 198/11 188/1 19/10 198/11 188/1 19/10 198/11 188/1 19/10 198/11 188/1 19/10 198/11 188/1 19/10 198/11 188/1 19/10 198/11 188/1 19/10 18/11 18/11 18/11 18/11		1/7/1 1/7/2 1/7/12			
9/5/2 1/22/2 1/22/2 1/48/12 1/49/1 1/49/1 1/49/1 1/49/1 1/49/1 1/49/1 1/49/1 1/49/1 1/41/2 <th1 2<="" th=""> 1/41/2</th1>					166/16 166/21 167/24
Johnes [1] 134/3 152/24 153/2 152/24 153/2 152/2 153/2 152/2 153/2 <th111< th=""> 153/2</th111<>				108/24 145/11 148/22	167/25
Journey [1] 23/23 157/9 157/21 158/4 102/10 140/13 171/11 178/6 198/23 205/12 least [6] 9/16 31/19 judgements [1] 60/13 159/20 159/23 159/51 160/7 160/12 162/1 147/13 156/17 171/10 207/17 208/4 209/20 44/13 60/24 119/10 judgiments [1] 60/14 160/17 160/12 162/1 160/17 160/12 162/1 177/11 171/11 172/11 207/17 208/4 209/20 198/11 judgiments [1] 4/7 166/18 173/5 175/5 160/7 160/12 162/1 17/11 177/14 172/2 13/16 14/6 15/2 20/4 Lady's [2] 145/24 188/17 63/16 july [11] 43/3 43/9 177/18 177/24 179/2 17/18 177/24 179/2 13/16 14/6 15/2 20/4 Lady's [2] 145/24 182/18 183/6 183/19 30/3 40/16 40/18 Lady's [2] 145/2 Lady's [2] 145/2 1/10/20 16/19 71/7 19/12 10/12 30/3 40/16 40/18 Lady's [2] 145/2 Lady's [2] 145/2 1/10/20 16/19 71/7 1/12/20 Lady's [2] 12/20 Lady's [2] 16/25 23/5 30/3 40/16 40/18 Lady's [2] 145/2 Lady's [2] 12/20 Lady's [2] 145/2 1/12/20 Lady's [2] 12/20 Lady's [2] 145/2 Lady's [2] 12/20				149/1 151/7 151/21	
judgements [1] 60/4 159/20 159/23 159/25 160/7 160/12 162/1 171/11 171/11 172/23 201/17 206/4 209/20 44/13 60/24 119/10 Judith [1] 4/7 160/12 162/1 160/7 160/12 162/1 171/11 171/11 172/23 201/17 206/4 209/20 198/11 Judith Paget [1] 4/7 166/18 173/5 175/5 173/1 171/11 171/11 172/23 201/17 206/4 209/20 198/11 July [11] 43/3 43/9 177/18 177/24 179/2 171/11 171/11 172/23 145/24 147/20 130/18 196/3 179/3 179/19 182/6 188/19 190/16 192/12 13/16 14/6 15/2 20/4 14/12 04/18 20/3 40/16 40/18 July 2020 [1] 196/3 199/14 199/16 199/18 199/14 199/16 199/18 36/20 36/22 39/11 140/20 159/14 171/3 140/20 159/14 171/3 July 2021 [3] 43/3 200/3 201/12 203/19 204/8 205/16 20/10 20/13 203/12 21/10 57/11 57/16 10/10 42/10 51/16 138/16 188/18 209/24 210/3 145/17 199/12 123/1/4 140/20 159/14 171/3 185/18 209/24 210/3 21/14 21/14 140/20 159/14 171/3 185/18 209/24 210/3 10/11 128/11 140/20 159/14 171/3 185/18 209/24 210/3 21/14 20/20 10/11 10/20 159/14 171/3 185/18 209/24 210/3 10/14 14/22 10/20 159/14 171/3 185/18 209/24 210/3 21/14 20/20 159/14 171/3 185/1					
Judith [1] 47 1607 1607 2 16271 know [105] 2/8 7/25 198711 Judith Paget [1] 47 162/23 164/14 166/4 162/23 164/14 166/4 know [105] 2/8 7/25 Lady's [2] 145/24 198711 July [11] 43/3 43/9 1771/8 1771/24 179/2 13/16 14/6 15/2 20/4 Lady's [2] 145/24 113/20 43/22 44/5 45/24 51/6 182/18 183/6 183/19 179/3 179/19 182/6 13/16 14/6 15/2 20/4 Lady's [2] 145/24 147/20 July 201 [1] 96/3 199/14 199/16 199/18 188/19 190/16 192/12 36/20 36/22 39/11 Lady's [2] 126/4 41/20 46/19 71/7 July 202 [1] 196/3 199/14 199/16 199/18 199/14 199/16 199/18 36/20 36/22 39/11 Lancashire [1] 2/20 Lady's [2] 72/13 145/17 71/2 134/11 July 202 [1] 196/3 199/14 199/16 199/18 199/23 200/3 201/12 27/10 57/11 57/16 108/16 138/16 Leeds [1] 2/16 June [27] 14/12 145/17 198/25 Justice [3] 62/23 8/13 85/4 85/17 50/23 51/14 6/3 69/8 left [5] 62/4 66/7 43/14 47/12 47/19 Justice Cymru [1] 62/23 8/13 85/4 85/17 50/23 51/14 6/3 69/8 left [5] 62/4 66/7 41/10 74/14 82/21 145/17 198/25 Justice Cymru [1] 62/23 8/13 85/4 85/17 50/		159/20 159/23 159/25		207/17 200/4 209/20	44/13 60/24 119/10
Judith Paget [1] 4/7 105/23 164/14 160/4 8/21 9/3 10/14 12/22 Lady s [2] 14/7/20 113/20 July [11] 43/3 43/9 166/18 173/5 175/5 177/18 177/24 179/2 13/16 14/6 15/2 20/4 14/7/20 14/7/20 113/20 43/22 44/5 45/24 51/6 179/3 179/19 182/6 182/18 183/6 183/19 21/4 23/13 26/2 27/5 14/14 19/2 16/25 23/5 30/18 196/3 188/19 190/16 192/12 188/19 190/16 192/12 36/20 36/22 39/11 1ancashire [1] 2/20 14/12 046/19 71/7 July 2021 [3] 43/3 199/14 199/16 199/18 199/23 200/3 201/12 36/20 36/22 39/11 1anguage [1] 26/4 140/20 159/14 171/3 185/18 209/24 210/3 Juncture [2] 103/12 103/12 20/13 203/12 20/119 202/13 203/12 57/10 57/11 57/16 57/10 57/11 57/16 108/16 138/16 140/20 159/14 171/3 185/18 209/24 210/3 Junctures [1] 94/2 20/119 202/13 203/12 20/119 202/13 203/12 57/10 57/11 57/16 6/23 67/12 69/14 6/23 67/12 69/14 164/22 1argely [2] 72/13 164/22 125/16 168/9 183/1 Junctures [1] 94/2 Justice [3] 62/23 145/17 198/25 3/31 85/4 85/17 50/23 51/14 66/3 69/8 1eft [5] 62/4 66/7 125/16 168/9 183/1 <td< td=""><td></td><td></td><td></td><td>210/24 211/0</td><td>198/11</td></td<>				210/24 211/0	198/11
juggle [1] 97/19 166/18 17/3/5 17/5/5 13/16 14/6 15/2 20/4 147/20 113/20 julg [11] 43/3 43/9 177/18 177/24 179/2 13/16 14/6 15/2 20/4 Ladyship [1] 151/18 Ladyship [1] 128/11					leave [3] 45/7 63/16
July [11] 43/3 43/9 177/18 177/24 179/2 21/4 23/13 26/2 27/5 Ladysnip [1] 157/18 16d [20] 16/25 23/5 43/22 44/5 45/24 51/6 179/3 179/19 182/6 21/4 23/13 26/2 27/5 Lalley [1] 187/2 30/3 40/16 40/18 60/19 60/22 94/8 182/18 183/6 183/19 32/3 32/20 36/13 30/3 40/16 40/18 41/20 46/19 71/7 130/18 196/3 194/16 196/25 199/4 36/20 36/22 39/11 40/10 42/10 51/16 1arget [1] 26/4 140/20 159/14 171/3 July 2020 [1] 196/3 199/14 199/16 199/18 55/14 57/6 57/10 57/10 57/11 57/16 108/16 138/16 185/18 209/24 210/3 juncture [2] 103/12 20/14 209/16 20/14 209/16 60/10 62/7 64/4 65/16 66/23 67/12 69/14 164/22 120/11 210/14 210/2 108/21 20/19 204/8 205/16 60/10 62/7 64/4 65/16 66/23 67/12 69/14 164/22 125/16 168/9 183/1 junctures [1] 94/2 Justice [3] 62/23 74/10 74/14 82/21 35/17 42/23 43/5 125/16 168/9 183/1 43/14 47/12 47/19 Justice Cymru [1] 69/20 70/17 74/8 74/10 74/14 82/21 35/17 42/23 43/5 125/16 168/9 183/1 60/16 60/17 60/20 Justification [1] 99/4 101/17 102/10 76/3 92/18 97/15 125/16 168/9 183/1 125/16 161					
43/22 44/5 45/24 51/6 17/9/3 17/9/19 182/6 28/15 28/16 31/2 31/4 31/4 30/3 40/16 40/18 60/19 60/22 94/8 182/18 183/6 183/19 28/15 28/16 31/2 31/4 31/2 31/4 41/20 46/19 71/7 July 201 [1] 43/22 194/16 196/25 199/4 36/20 36/22 39/11 36/20 36/22 39/11 140/10 42/10 51/16 140/20 159/14 171/3 July 202 [1] 196/3 199/14 199/16 199/18 199/12 200/3 201/12 57/10 57/11 57/16 71/23 71/24 97/17 185/18 209/24 210/3 July 2021 [3] 43/3 200/3 201/12 57/10 57/11 57/16 108/16 138/16 183/18 209/24 210/2 Juncture [2] 103/12 200/1 207/17 209/13 206/12 207/17 209/13 66/23 67/12 69/14 66/23 67/12 69/14 66/23 67/12 69/14 164/22 1eeds [1] 23/2 33/8 1eft [5] 62/4 66/7 June [27] 14/12 Justice [3] 62/23 145/17 198/25 83/13 85/4 85/17 50/23 51/14 66/3 69/8 76/3 92/18 97/15 125/16 168/9 183/1 41/20 46/19 71/7 12/23 9/4 101/17 102/10 9/4 101/17 102/10 103/6 105/20 107/1 164/22 1eft [5] 62/4 66/7 125/16 168/9 183/1 195/23 145/17 198/25 145/17 198/25 145/17 198/25 145/17 197/25 109/6 96/10 109/19 133/15 152/21 <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td>					
60/19 60/22 94/8 130/18 196/3 182/18 183/6 183/19 188/19 190/16 192/12 199/14 199/16 199/18 199/14 199/16 199/18 199/23 200/3 201/12 201/19 202/13 203/12 199/23 200/3 201/12 201/19 202/13 203/12 199/23 200/3 201/12 201/19 202/13 203/12 201/19 202/13 203/12 201/1 20/14 210/2 201/1 20/14 20/16 166/23 67/12 69/14 66/23 67/12 69/14 66/24 92/10 94/3 76/3 92/18 97/15 166/3 178/16 179/14 175/17 195/15 16gislation [5] 134/2 158/23 162/4 195/13 195/23					
130/18 196/3 194/16 196/25 199/4 194/16 196/25 199/4 190/14 199/16 199/18 140/20 159/14 171/3 July 2020 [1] 196/3 199/14 199/16 199/18 199/23 200/3 201/12 100/10 42/10 57/16 185/14 57/6 57/10 July 2021 [3] 43/3 199/23 200/3 201/12 201/19 202/13 203/12 201/19 202/13 203/12 100/10 42/10 57/16 108/21 junctures [1] 94/2 209/14 209/16 209/14 209/16 60/10 62/7 64/4 65/16 66/23 67/12 69/14 164/22 140/20 159/14 171/3 185/18 209/24 210/3 junctures [1] 94/2 209/14 209/16 209/14 209/16 69/20 70/17 74/8 164/22 164/22 125/16 168/9 183/1 43/14 47/12 47/19 145/17 198/25 86/24 92/10 94/3 35/17 97/11 97/25 35/17 42/23 43/5 125/16 168/9 183/1 47/23 48/9 50/19 54/22 55/2 55/6 Justice Cymru [1] 94/10 95/6 96/10 76/3 92/18 97/15 125/16 168/9 183/1 60/16 60/17 60/20 98/13 99/4 101/17 102/10 136/10 57/20 107/1 175/17 195/15 156/3 178/16 179/14 158/23 162/4 195/13 112/23 173/1 173/4 justify [2] 65/25 107/23 108/9 112/9 103/6 105/20 107/1 138/9 112/9 158/23 162/4 195/13	60/19 60/22 94/8				
July 21 [1] 43/22 199/14 199/16 199/18 40/10 42/10 51/16 Iarge [7] 50/11 71/18 185/18 209/24 210/3 July 2020 [1] 196/3 199/23 200/3 201/12 5/14 57/6 57/10 71/23 71/24 97/17 185/18 209/24 210/3 July 2021 [3] 43/3 199/23 200/3 201/12 201/19 202/13 203/12 5/14 57/6 57/10 71/10 57/11 57/16 185/18 209/24 210/3 junctures [2] 103/12 203/19 204/8 205/16 60/10 62/7 64/4 65/16 66/23 67/12 69/14 69/20 70/17 74/8 164/22 Leeds [1] 2/16 Leeds University [1] junctures [1] 94/2 Justice [3] 62/23 145/17 198/25 83/13 85/4 85/17 85/14 57/6 57/10 108/16 138/16 Leeds [1] 2/16 Leeds [1] 2/16 43/14 47/12 47/19 Justice [3] 62/23 145/17 198/25 83/13 85/4 85/17 85/24 92/10 94/3 35/17 42/23 43/5 125/16 168/9 183/1 Leeds [1] 125/16 Leeds [1] 125/16 <t< td=""><td>130/18 196/3</td><td></td><td>36/20 36/22 39/11</td><td></td><td></td></t<>	130/18 196/3		36/20 36/22 39/11		
July 2020 [1] 199/23 200/3 201/12 199/23 200/3 201/12 55/14 57/6 57/10 71/23 71/24 97/17 210/11 210/14 210/2 July 2021 [3] 43/3 43/9 44/5 201/19 202/13 203/12 57/10 57/11 57/16 60/10 62/7 64/4 65/16 60/10 62/7 64/4 65/16 60/10 62/7 64/4 65/16 60/20 70/17 74/8 164/22					
July 2021 [3] 43/3 43/9 44/5 201/19 202/13 203/12 juncture [2] 103/12 108/21 203/19 204/8 205/16 junctures [1] 94/2 junctures [1] 94/2 junctures [1] 94/2 junctures [1] 94/2 junctures [2] 104/12 junctures [1] 94/2 junctures [2] 14/12 43/14 47/12 47/19 Justice [3] 62/23 43/14 47/12 47/19 Justice Cymru [1] 60/16 60/17 60/20 60/16 60/17 60/20 64/11 85/2 86/2 justification [1] 98/13 justify [2] 65/25 justify [2] 65/25					
43/9 44/5 juncture [2] 103/12 108/21 junctures [1] 94/2 junctures [1] 94/2 June [27] 14/12 43/14 47/12 47/19 47/23 48/9 50/19 54/20 54/22 55/2 55/6 60/16 60/17 60/20 64/11 85/2 86/2 112/23 173/1 173/4 112/23 173/1 173/4 65/16 60/10 62/7 64/4 65/16 66/23 67/12 69/14 66/23 67/12 69/14 69/20 70/17 74/8 74/10 74/14 82/21 83/13 85/4 85/17 86/24 92/10 94/3 94/10 95/6 96/10 96/17 97/11 97/25 99/4 101/17 102/10 103/6 105/20 107/1 103/6 105/20 107/1 107/23 108/9 112/9					
Juncture [2] 103/12 206/1 207/17 209/13 66/23 67/12 69/14 164/22 2/16 junctures [1] 94/2 209/14 209/16 69/20 70/17 74/8 164/22 18st [21] 23/2 33/8 2/16 junctures [1] 94/2 Justice [3] 62/23 69/20 70/17 74/8 164/22 18st [21] 23/2 33/8 2/16 43/14 47/12 47/19 Justice Cymru [1] 69/20 70/17 74/8 35/17 42/23 43/5 125/16 168/9 183/1 47/23 48/9 50/19 Justice Cymru [1] 86/24 92/10 94/3 94/10 95/6 96/10 76/3 92/18 97/15 169/19 133/15 152/21 60/16 60/17 60/20 justification [1] 99/4 101/17 102/10 163/6 105/20 107/1 103/6 105/20 107/1 156/3 178/16 179/14 158/23 162/4 195/13 112/23 173/1 173/4 justify [2] 65/25 103/6 105/20 107/1 138/9 112/9 164/1 195/23					
108/21 209/14 209/16 69/20 70/17 74/8 Iast [21] 23/2 33/8 Ieft [5] 62/4 66/7 junctures [1] 94/2 Justice [3] 62/23 33/13 85/4 85/17 35/17 42/23 43/5 125/16 168/9 183/1 43/14 47/12 47/19 Justice Cymru [1] 86/24 92/10 94/3 94/10 95/6 96/10 50/23 51/14 66/3 69/8 Ieft [5] 62/4 66/7 47/23 48/9 50/19 Justice Cymru [1] 94/10 95/6 96/10 96/17 97/11 97/25 109/19 133/15 152/21 Iegal [4] 53/16 161/1 54/20 54/22 55/2 55/6 justification [1] 99/4 101/17 102/10 163/6 105/20 107/1 179/21 182/3 183/21 Iegislation [5] 134/2 112/23 173/1 173/4 justify [2] 65/25 107/23 108/9 112/9 107/23 108/9 112/9 107/23 108/9 112/9					
Junctures [1] 94/2 June [27] 14/12 43/14 47/12 47/19 145/17 198/25 43/14 47/12 47/19 145/17 198/25 Justice Cymru [1] 82/23 94/10 95/6 96/10 96/17 97/11 97/25 96/17 97/11 97/25 96/17 97/11 97/25 98/13 98/13 112/23 173/1 173/4 95/25					
June [27] 14/12 43/14 47/12 47/19 145/17 198/25 43/14 47/12 47/19 145/17 198/25 47/23 48/9 50/19 Justice Cymru [1] 60/16 60/17 60/20 60/16 60/17 60/20 64/11 85/2 86/2 112/23 173/1 173/4 83/13 85/4 85/17 83/13 85/4 85/17 103/6 105/20 107/1 103/6 105/20 107/1 112/23 173/1 173/4 145/17 198/25 83/13 85/4 85/17 103/6 105/20 107/1 103/6 105/20 107/1 107/23 108/9 112/9 164/1					
43/14 47/12 47/19 Justice Cymru [1] 86/24 92/10 94/3 76/3 92/18 97/15 legal [4] 53/16 161/1 47/23 48/9 50/19 62/23 94/10 95/6 96/10 96/17 97/11 97/25 109/19 133/15 152/21 legal [4] 53/16 161/1 54/20 54/22 55/2 55/6 60/16 60/17 60/20 98/13 96/17 97/11 97/25 156/3 178/16 179/14 legislation [5] 134/2 64/11 85/2 86/2 103/6 105/20 107/1 103/6 105/20 107/1 164/1 158/23 162/4 195/13 112/23 173/1 173/4 justify [2] 65/25 65/25 108/9 112/9 12/9 164/1					left-hand [1] 125/16
47/23 48/9 30/19 62/23 54/20 54/22 55/2 55/6 60/16 60/17 60/20 60/16 60/17 60/20 98/13 64/11 85/2 86/2 103/6 105/20 107/1 112/23 173/1 173/4 105/25					legal [4] 53/16 161/1
60/16 60/17 60/20 Justification [1] 99/4 101/17 102/10 150/3 176/16 179/14 legislation [5] 134/2 64/11 85/2 98/13 103/6 105/20 107/1 179/21 182/3 183/21 158/23 162/4 195/13 112/23 173/1 173/4 justify [2] 65/25 107/23 108/9 112/9 164/1 195/23					
64/11 85/2 86/2 98/13 103/6 105/20 107/1 179/21 102/3 103/21 158/23 162/4 195/13 112/23 173/1 173/4 justify [2] 65/25 103/6 105/20 107/1 1asted [1] 164/1 195/23					legislation [5] 134/24
112/23 173/1 173/4 Justify [2] 65/25 107/23 108/9 112/9 Lasted [1] 104/1 195/23					158/23 162/4 195/13
66/11 late [18] 8/2 1//3 length [3] 56/7		66/11		late [18] 8/2 17/3	length [3] 56/7

(73) January 2020... - length

I	likely [10] 19/18 24/2	112/13 154/8 203/25	144/21 146/2	27/23 28/8 32/22 59/6
L	30/19 31/19 39/3	long [13] 3/1 27/16	lower [7] 133/23	72/9 122/15 178/19
length [2] 113/12	56/23 57/3 108/4	27/23 28/9 39/11	137/3 139/16 144/25	management [8]
131/9	144/25 145/4	72/21 85/4 94/10	145/3 145/4 146/9	16/5 23/11 25/9 36/16
Leslie [1] 75/19	limit [2] 108/15 110/9	99/14 125/13 145/2	LRFs [1] 170/19	77/19 89/21 178/15
less [5] 41/14 119/14	limited [6] 19/13	199/24 200/16	LRFs/SCGs [1]	179/10
156/15 166/23 210/5	19/18 86/18 91/23	Long Covid [1] 145/2		manager [1] 157/14
lessen [2] 138/10	171/9 209/16	longer [4] 124/6	lucky [2] 57/18 57/19	managing [6] 10/9
139/7 Iesson [1] 40/8	limits [1] 10/14	146/1 147/18 209/10	lunch [1] 109/2	17/24 23/8 23/9 41/21
lessons [6] 12/7 98/3	line [9] 32/6 52/2	look [66] 4/17 7/2	<u> </u>	157/22
166/16 166/21 167/23	124/17 124/18 124/18	10/11 12/11 20/17	M	mandate [1] 64/15
167/24	157/14 172/12 176/11	21/9 21/15 22/18	machinery [1] 89/19	mandated [2] 53/4
let [8] 62/21 67/20	201/6	30/10 32/24 36/5	made [39] 13/15 14/1	53/12
68/2 72/7 119/2	lines [7] 4/4 17/10	37/10 47/1 47/18	40/10 42/12 49/10	mandating [6] 47/15
119/21 202/13 203/3	38/12 56/21 56/24	48/18 49/24 56/17	51/25 56/2 61/16 64/1	49/6 49/6 49/8 50/10
Let's [2] 65/22 67/18	116/9 172/22	57/20 60/24 65/16	64/10 64/16 82/15	204/18
letter [8] 6/16 6/17	lines 13 [1] 116/9	66/20 68/19 90/8	83/9 90/1 93/8 101/8	mandation [1] 65/12
6/18 6/24 7/3 7/10	linked [1] 108/3	90/10 90/21 91/3	115/15 119/6 121/17	mandatory [7] 47/25
189/24 189/25	linking [1] 185/22	93/21 96/12 104/21	132/3 134/23 140/19	48/3 50/24 52/4 54/4
letters [4] 98/6 195/5	list [8] 60/1 60/10	106/9 110/16 110/18	148/21 150/4 152/1	127/7 202/5
196/3 196/9	60/13 62/5 91/5 161/2		153/2 153/21 156/12 157/13 161/16 162/7	manner [1] 92/9
level [36] 5/16 9/15	185/1 199/14	113/24 119/20 125/15	163/4 163/7 167/6	many [8] 72/12 74/10
10/4 19/5 22/5 22/17	listen [1] 97/10	127/13 131/5 131/19	176/7 184/9 188/19	87/15 93/23 107/18
28/2 36/19 41/6 41/21	literacy [1] 150/15	131/23 132/15 133/2	201/14 203/6	129/25 141/23 151/16
56/23 58/1 58/8 58/12	literature [1] 47/4	133/5 136/17 136/18 137/17 137/21 141/9	mail [1] 178/24	March [63] 1/1 6/2 15/19 16/8 19/1 22/18
59/21 59/21 60/12	little [7] 6/8 6/24 61/18 95/13 120/4	141/11 143/1 143/3	main [3] 4/10 17/20	34/24 35/10 36/1
62/4 91/17 92/1	148/12 186/7	160/7 165/19 168/5	157/20	36/11 37/2 37/7 37/12
100/12 104/6 104/13	live [1] 17/12	169/18 173/8 174/13	maintain [1] 183/14	40/11 41/4 41/16
104/25 118/1 118/12	lived [2] 56/13	175/5 178/13 178/17	major [6] 27/20 39/24	
130/1 135/24 141/13	129/14	178/22 179/19 182/2	77/20 114/4 114/23	59/5 59/14 59/14
141/15 141/22 143/9	lives [1] 71/21	209/9	116/16	83/12 102/24 108/14
143/13 158/21 181/10	living [1] 95/16	looked [17] 17/17	make [27] 9/21 11/22	108/24 109/10 109/13
198/13	Liz [1] 187/2	24/2 39/5 48/4 64/6	36/17 44/14 49/18	110/7 110/8 110/12
level 4 [4] 58/8 58/12	Liz Lalley [1] 187/2	92/7 96/13 101/8	52/24 55/4 56/1 60/3	110/13 110/16 111/12
143/9 143/13	Llewelyn [2] 197/15	125/12 135/5 139/10	61/11 70/22 71/25	111/19 112/10 113/20
levels [7] 131/22	108/1	165/15 169/10 169/11	114/19 121/19 122/9	114/1 114/5 117/4
132/17 136/15 142/23 181/13 181/19 197/3	local [24] 14/14	169/12 169/13 182/17	152/24 153/11 155/24	
liaised [1] 161/12	69/17 79/4 82/11	looking [32] 12/24	159/16 160/13 161/12	
liaising [2] 20/15	108/3 131/8 133/18	17/21 27/15 27/18	161/14 167/16 171/19	121/16 122/19 124/8
21/1	133/21 133/25 134/5	29/1 34/10 40/20	180/24 181/11 205/17	130/18 159/24 169/20
liaison [4] 12/18	134/7 134/10 134/13	41/18 41/19 57/5 64/4		170/3 184/23 187/12
20/13 21/5 86/16	134/18 134/21 134/25	65/2 69/15 74/22 77/6		187/21 190/17 191/23
life [1] 70/2		96/16 110/4 110/14	150/6	196/4 196/6 197/15
lifting [2] 62/8 194/9	197/19 197/23 197/25	117/20 125/16 134/12		211/12
light [2] 44/7 47/14	198/6 198/16	135/5 135/23 145/15	makeup [1] 92/23	March 2020 [4] 19/1
like [42] 35/5 37/16	lock [2] 40/10 40/25	161/23 166/24 167/23	14/14 39/20 53/8	102/24 108/24 184/23
41/22 47/22 58/14	lockdown [21] 40/14	171/6 190/14 207/21 208/20 208/21	77/14 109/21 138/3	March/April [1] 6/2
58/15 75/25 83/6 84/6	42/5 55/22 57/15 95/5 111/8 112/9 112/10		143/13 149/6 156/5	Margaret [4] 68/17 68/23 69/22 71/9
85/19 87/13 88/13	112/17 112/19 113/3	looks [3] 33/4 34/4 47/22	156/22 159/2 159/21	
96/5 98/14 101/11	113/12 131/15 135/10		162/12 163/3 164/8	Margaret Rooney [3] 68/17 68/23 69/22
110/7 118/16 118/20	135/10 141/22 142/22	117/16	166/11 167/2 176/24	marginal [1] 139/21
121/12 125/4 130/14	143/14 186/17 190/21		177/16 193/8 194/1	Mark [2] 147/22
136/17 137/1 143/19	193/19	35/24 36/10 36/13	195/22 195/22	153/6
149/7 150/22 151/2	lockdowns [4] 35/13		mammoth [1] 59/24	Mark Drakeford [1]
158/21 164/7 164/24	134/7 135/4 140/7	44/12 44/17 57/6	manage [13] 6/3 6/21	147/22
174/24 175/5 180/15	lockstep [1] 140/23	63/24 74/12 78/17	9/5 24/13 25/20 38/14	
181/13 181/17 184/21	logic [1] 138/11	82/21 107/4 134/2	70/6 70/19 72/15	153/6
191/2 191/6 192/6	logically [2] 116/22	137/21 186/13 201/24		mask [16] 46/11
193/5 209/15 211/2	129/8	204/13	208/22	46/24 52/5 63/23 66/6
liked [1] 83/16 likelihood [4] 30/22	logistical [1] 129/16	lots [3] 91/10 136/8	manageable [2]	66/14 67/5 67/9
32/17 107/11 107/22	logistics [1] 129/10	190/22	141/12 141/15	202/24 203/12 203/16
	London [4] 112/13	low [3] 131/22	managed [8] 27/16	203/25 204/2 204/8
L			I	(74) length mask

(74) length... - mask

	104/7 105/24 118/9	123/9 123/19 127/24	methodology [1]	194/19 210/13
M	119/4 119/21 123/15	127/25 132/4 135/20	112/8	Minister's [6] 37/4
mask [2] 204/9 205/4	148/18 149/2 152/17	135/22 164/9 177/22	methods [3] 36/15	52/12 79/13 165/16
masks [12] 45/12	157/9 164/16 170/1	183/21 185/4 185/6	174/25 184/11	189/7 192/21
45/22 46/14 46/20	172/24 177/24 181/14	185/14 186/5 190/13	Michael [5] 145/20	ministerial [32] 84/4
50/15 51/8 53/4 53/12	182/1 190/1 200/17	meetings [48] 8/20	145/25 146/12 147/4	101/5 127/11 127/13
65/12 65/13 67/14	202/13 203/3 206/4 207/21 209/20 209/21	8/22 8/24 9/12 11/6 11/10 11/12 11/16	154/15 Michael Gravenor [3]	128/15 128/21 141/5 141/9 159/22 159/25
95/18	mean [39] 13/17	11/21 11/24 12/8	145/20 145/25	160/14 160/25 161/6
mass [15] 37/1 37/13	20/14 23/7 26/1 39/21	12/11 13/23 15/13	146/12	161/16 161/22 162/2
37/22 38/11 38/13 38/17 39/2 39/5 39/18	50/22 51/10 53/5 62/2	15/15 15/18 15/22	Michael Gravenor's	162/13 162/24 163/8
113/22 114/6 115/13	62/6 81/9 81/25 83/23	16/3 16/7 16/14 16/16		163/11 163/14 163/25
116/6 116/10 116/21	85/16 87/15 88/14	18/22 78/23 78/23	mid [6] 55/19 59/1	188/21 189/5 189/10
match [7] 37/5 37/8	93/21 94/12 95/1	78/24 86/9 86/22 87/6		189/13 189/22 189/24
40/3 115/8 115/10	95/21 99/24 102/9 105/16 109/24 115/7	87/9 87/12 87/13 87/16 153/4 153/7	186/14 mid-February [2]	190/7 190/8 194/6 206/23
115/12 115/25	129/8 129/10 132/23	153/7 153/8 153/9	185/9 186/14	ministers [68] 4/11
material [4] 92/23	140/20 141/21 157/10		mid-March [2] 59/1	4/22 11/20 11/24 12/4
93/3 116/16 156/7	157/22 159/11 167/10		59/5	16/23 18/10 18/16
materials [1] 120/20 maths [1] 195/1	168/16 200/1 201/23	189/14 189/23 193/1	mid-September [1]	18/19 18/23 40/18
matter [11] 13/13	203/14 207/9	193/2 198/4	55/19	42/1 49/10 49/12
45/8 63/17 95/24	meaning [2] 91/12	member [13] 3/8 14/16 25/10 66/17	middle [6] 28/16	49/18 50/13 52/2
95/24 96/3 96/6 98/9	174/21 meaningful [1] 88/5	78/2 79/9 81/3 85/16	28/16 61/2 61/22 119/1 133/6	54/11 56/11 58/2 61/13 65/20 70/22
146/24 161/10 162/1	means [4] 67/12	88/10 136/5 136/6	might [24] 8/5 16/11	73/21 88/2 93/22 95/3
mattered [1] 194/18	141/17 179/7 183/11	170/25 198/10	25/19 25/20 25/21	99/10 102/3 102/9
matters [3] 10/3 77/11 103/13	meant [11] 9/25	members [8] 91/5	30/7 32/21 39/8 40/1	105/21 143/15 147/14
maximise [2] 47/9	22/24 30/25 81/13	97/16 97/18 123/14	46/18 63/22 74/25	147/17 147/21 148/11
122/7	141/17 146/6 156/19	124/10 164/18 168/18		148/13 148/14 155/3
may [60] 2/21 2/23	157/11 169/1 191/4 203/13	199/2 momborshin [5]	108/25 122/10 124/23 156/4 156/18 182/13	155/3 155/5 155/5 155/21 158/7 158/14
2/25 3/5 5/22 7/13	Measure [1] 196/13	membership [5] 123/12 164/20 166/10	195/14 203/25 210/17	158/22 159/16 161/8
9/10 14/3 14/4 14/5	measures [17] 4/13	168/16 168/17	MIGs [1] 192/20	167/3 167/22 169/23
14/24 15/7 16/17 33/20 36/14 37/1	25/13 29/14 34/12	memo [1] 176/12	mild [3] 31/15 106/15	176/1 176/3 176/3
38/21 39/12 44/25	56/19 58/19 58/21	memory [5] 81/23	107/3	176/16 183/8 183/19
50/16 50/19 63/2 63/7	72/6 100/23 111/4	89/14 120/12 142/16	militancy [8] 52/5	189/12 189/22 193/23
68/6 73/8 73/21 74/17	111/6 112/21 122/5	144/19	67/5 67/9 202/24	194/19 195/22 199/8
81/24 83/19 84/2 84/2	132/9 132/16 133/24 139/4	mention [3] 33/7 87/7 93/6	203/12 204/8 204/9 205/4	199/12 200/18 204/25 207/10 208/20
84/3 84/18 85/1 85/2	measuring [1] 134/3	mentioned [9] 9/11	mind [3] 206/18	ministers' [3] 182/15
95/14 97/22 97/22	media [4] 55/11	32/25 35/14 45/24	208/14 208/19	184/5 184/6
99/2 99/15 109/1	55/11 85/8 175/9	90/3 91/10 183/21	minded [2] 38/1 38/4	minorities [1] 95/11
131/8 132/4 135/3	medical [14] 1/12	196/2 209/2	mine [1] 26/14	minority [1] 44/15
143/20 144/4 154/20	2/12 2/17 2/24 3/6	message [8] 39/19	minimise [1] 25/15	minute [1] 151/22
159/22 175/19 183/25		137/2 177/12 184/17 190/17 190/25 199/2	minimising [1] 29/15 minimum [1] 56/10	minuted [1] 34/14 minutes [31] 8/19
185/24 186/25 188/19	76/21 79/19 104/10	200/12	minister [57] 24/17	8/24 9/4 11/14 12/8
189/2 189/15 203/14	medicine [2] 2/16 3/3			20/1 20/5 21/9 21/15
204/9 May 2020 [5] 5/22	meet [12] 11/3 11/8	179/7 180/16 180/17	28/3 32/9 33/10 33/17	21/20 23/10 33/1 33/4
7/13 63/2 73/8 189/15	13/25 15/23 16/5	180/19 180/22 181/14		34/10 34/19 35/1
May 2022 [1] 143/20	29/22 29/23 30/4	182/22 183/3 183/7	47/13 48/13 48/14	35/12 36/1 37/14 38/8
May/June [1] 85/2	45/16 48/13 60/18 190/10	183/12 184/4 184/16 190/14 191/22 192/12	50/13 50/25 51/4 52/15 52/19 52/24	39/22 87/9 87/11 87/13 87/18 99/22
maybe [2] 204/16	meeting [51] 7/21	190/14 191/22 192/12	52/15 52/19 52/24 53/3 53/6 53/20 91/1	99/22 131/18 133/12
211/4	7/22 11/4 12/12 13/3	200/14 200/24 201/3	91/2 103/1 103/4	135/6 151/23
McLean [1] 150/14	13/16 20/2 20/5 21/10	201/7 201/9 201/11	103/6 104/9 105/13	minutes' [1] 44/20
me [51] 2/9 6/2 6/3 11/1 13/12 14/8 18/15	24/12 32/24 33/16	201/16	110/8 114/2 118/19	mirror [1] 168/5
25/4 25/7 26/18 28/17	33/21 33/22 33/23	messages' [1]	121/6 121/16 134/17	misinterpretation [1]
30/4 43/15 49/3 49/18	34/6 34/6 34/24 34/25		136/14 136/19 137/7	202/23
57/13 58/14 62/6	35/1 35/21 36/2 37/12 69/17 69/18 80/20	messaging [4] 49/23 64/9 140/24 178/25	137/7 147/22 155/2 157/9 157/12 157/17	misnomer [1] 99/12
62/21 63/25 64/19	80/25 81/6 81/10	met [7] 84/4 87/3	158/3 158/7 160/6	missed [4] 30/19 44/3 59/2 124/23
64/24 67/20 68/2	81/11 94/7 97/2 100/3		162/25 163/7 173/4	missing [3] 27/11
75/25 91/24 101/14	106/11 111/11 115/11	168/23 180/20	174/11 182/22 188/25	60/9 137/25
L	l		1	

(75) mask... - missing

mistake [2] 38/2 38/4 / 19/5 4/25 34/1 113/5 113/6 17/2 17/13 48/15 <th>Μ</th> <th>24/2 31/9 31/10 32/13</th> <th>Mr Gething [7] 10/16</th> <th>157/16 158/12 165/2</th> <th>16/21 17/13 18/1</th>	Μ	24/2 31/9 31/10 32/13	Mr Gething [7] 10/16	157/16 158/12 165/2	16/21 17/13 18/1
93/8 93/16 93/16 93/16 93/16 93/16 93/16 93/16 93/16 93/16 93/16 93/16 93/16 93/16 93/16 93/16 93/17 93/16 93/17				168/12 172/2 177/13	48/15 48/16 50/5 51/6
Instance [1] 34/5 Bel/2 / 3/10 / 3/2 Mr Hancock [2] 18/5 19/01 / 19/3 19/4 20/31 9/17 9/4 20/31 9/17 9/4 20/31 mitraget [2] 36/8 78/7 78/8 9/17 8/8 20/8 3/4 19/17 8/2 20/17 20/84 19/17 8/2 20/87 <td< th=""><th></th><th>57/14 62/11 65/11</th><th>119/6 127/12 136/20</th><th>178/6 182/24 185/8</th><th>80/21 89/15 92/8</th></td<>		57/14 62/11 65/11	119/6 127/12 136/20	178/6 182/24 185/8	80/21 89/15 92/8
Instruct [1] Dir/ling		66/23 73/10 73/25	Mr Hancock [2]	186/5 190/1 190/13	94/17 94/20 96/20
mitigate [2] abs/l 4 911 917.3 mit optimis (12) abs/l 4 911 917.3 mit optimis (12) abs/l 4 911 917.3				190/18 190/21 193/21	101/20 103/17 106/8
77/23 20/3 <t< th=""><th></th><th>86/14 91/11 91/23</th><th>Mr Johnson [2]</th><th>198/23 199/4 205/12</th><th>106/22 112/6 117/15</th></t<>		86/14 91/11 91/23	Mr Johnson [2]	198/23 199/4 205/12	106/22 112/6 117/15
mitigation [6] 29/12 29/17 20/17		92/25 93/2 95/12 99/6	34/25 40/11	205/12 207/17 208/4	126/1 129/11 131/21
29/13 29/17 307 313 1011/2		99/16 99/19 100/11	Mr Poole [5] 54/19	209/20 210/24 211/8	132/6 132/7 133/14
mixed [1] 1929 105/21 111/1 126/21 197/20 <		101/12 101/23 103/13	109/8 145/12 148/25	my Lady [25] 6/10	134/15 135/9 135/13
mixing (i) 11/2/1 11/2/1 11/2		105/21 111/14 112/6	151/20	54/14 62/21 66/3	137/2 150/11 152/23
Imm [1] 12/11 <		112/7 119/14 126/21	Ms [21] 62/19 62/20	69/15 73/1 73/5 75/2	163/22 168/13 168/21
Imm. ini [1] 51/4 15/16 (3) 15/16 (3) 16/16 (3)		127/1 129/9 131/2	73/2 73/3 73/4 145/9	75/5 75/9 75/14	168/22 170/21 172/2
mobile [3] 175/23 134/24 134					
1764 1767 1777 1777 1767 1767 1777					182/13 199/21 206/16
mobiles [3] 176/17 17					
176/17 177/2 1402 1 190/11 150/9 1602 1 21/13 2 12/13 12/12 13/13 12/13/13 12/13/13 12/13 12/13 12/13 12/13 12/13 12/13 12/13					
model [3] 113/5 166/17/17/19/11 //17/19 Mis Founster [2] my Lagy's [2] 143/2 173/25 28/8 3/31 145/21 148/21 19/12 19/88 19/8/3 Mis Founster [2] my Lagy's [2] 143/2 7 73/2 59/01 9/2/14 13/17 73/6 79/16 19/21 29/88 19/8/3 Mis Heaven [6] 6/2/19 my Lagy's [2] 143/2 7/8/2 59/8 5/2/18 111/9 13/12 131/8 33/17 73/6 79/16 20/87 16 12/21 5 moring [5] 11/9 my Lagy's [2] 15/3 5/2 5/8 5/2/18 111/9 13/12 131/8 139/23 142/2 136/23 139/19 MORI [1] 96/18 moring [5] 11/9 my Lagy's [2] 15/3 5/2 5/8 5/2 5/8 16/8 15/3 7/12 18/7 16/7/17 16/27 163/1 139/23 142/2 13/2 13/2 100/16 13/6 moring [5] 11/9 19/3 7/19 4/1/10 my Lagy's [2] 15/3 7/17 16/27 15/7/17 14/3 147/16 18/7 13/7/14 18/7/18 my Lagy's [2] 16/7/17 17/7/17 17/19 17/7/17 14/7/19/21 17/7/17 14/7/19/21 17/7/17 14/7/19/21 17/7/17 14/7/19/21 17/7/17 14/7/19/21 17/7/17 14/7/19/21 17/7/17 14/7/19/21 17/7/17 14/7/19/21 17/7/17 14/7/19/21 17/7/17 14/7/19/21 17/7/17 14/7/19/7/17 17/7					
145/21 148/21 100/4 100/9 19/2 173/5 140/24 173/5 140/24 173/5 140/24 173/5 140/24 modellers [1] 115/5 112/21 136/23 139/19 112/21 136/23 139/19 119/12 13/8 109/14 109/21 13/2/14/2/17 12/21 136/23 139/19 12/21 136/23 139/19 136/14 21/16 136/14 21/16 111/9 13/12 13/8 13/2/14/17 13/2/2 142/15 18/12 120/5/13 18/12 120/5/13 18/12 120/5/13 18/12 120/5/13 18/12 120/5/13 18/12 120/5/13 16/14 16/7/16 17/10 13/2/14/14/14/3/14/14/14/14/14/14/14/14/14/14/14/14/14/					
modelliers [1] 115/2 191/2					
modeling [16] 40/27 9/32 14/3/17 19/32 14/3/17 19/32 14/3/17 19/32 14/3/17 19/32 14/3/17 19/32 14/3/17 19/32 14/3/17 19/32 16/32 1					
13/17 79/6 97/16 152/8 152/9 152/15 150/12 190/15 150/12 190/15 150/12 190/15 150/12 190/15 112/21 136/23 136/79 06/1 7 152/7 163/1 150/12 190/15 150/12 150/13 11/15 150/12 150/13 11/15 150/12 150/13 11/15 150/12 150/13 11/15 150/12 150/13 11/15 150/12 150/13 11/15 150/12 150/13 11/15 150/12 150/13 11/15 150/12 150/13 11/15 150/12 150/13 11/15 150/12 150/13 11/15 150/12 150/13 11/15 150/12 150/13 11/15 150/12 150/13 11/15 150/12 150/13 11/15 150/12 150/13 11/15 150/12 150/13 11/15 150/12 150/13 11/15 150/12 150/13 11					
112/221 136/23 139/23 142/6 139/23 142/6 139/23 142/6 139/23 142/6 139/23 142/6 139/23 142/6 139/23 142/6 143/17 146/13 147/16 153/23 167/1<					
13/23 142/6 143/2 MOR [1] 96/18 18/16 18/18 18/22 64/14 65/8 164/1 65/8 143/17 146/13 147/5 morning [5] 11/9 9/18 37/19 41/10 mysitiying [1] 64/21 167/16 167/16 173/10 143/17 1148/1 148/14 18/18 18/7 morning [5] 11/9 9/18 12/9 13/14 18/14 18/14 18/7 module [21] 1/5 1/18 mortality [2] 130/20 90/5 97/8 12/9 (9 133/4) 18/7 18/7 13/14 18/14 18/7 117/7 18/7 11/7 <th></th> <th></th> <th></th> <th></th> <th></th>					
143/17 146/13 147/15 morning [5] 11/9 19/3 19/3 11/9 19/3 11/9 11/16 16/16 11/12 16/16					
147/11 148/4 148/19 62/22 73/6 155/18 41/11 43/21 46/6 47/8 17/125 180/18 130/24 models [1] 03/18 mortality [2] 130/20 183/4 71/8 name [9] 1/10 75/17 183/4 14/19 186/6 11/9 120 10/16 13/6 mortality [2] 130/20 90/5 97/8 129/9 133/4 name [9] 1/10 75/17 193/12 180/24 11/9 120 10/16 13/6 mortality [2] 130/20 90/5 97/8 129/9 133/4 name [9] 1/10 75/17 190/5 197/22 198/2 13/14 81 51/13 152/10 most [15] 19/17 23/4 146/11 149/19 15/16 177/12 120/21 12/21 named [1] 165/2 112/25 13/18 15/17 17/2 mounting [1] 143/10 mounting [1] 143/10 120/25 21/11 211/5 154/12 4 155/19 157/5 negative [5] 41/10 negative [7] 9/22 negative [7] 9/22 negative [7] 9/22 negative [7] 9/22 negative [7] 9/27 negative [7] 9/27<					
models [1] 103/18 lob/1 cost/11 (2)/13/14 cost/				N	
module [21] 1/15 1/16 1/17 1/18 1/18 1/18 1/17 1/18 1/18 1/18 1/18 1/18 1/18 1/18 1/18 1/18 1/18 1/18 1/18 1/18 1/18 1/18 1/18 1/18 1/18 1/18					
1/19 1/20 10/16 12/12 1					
14/3 26/8 /5111 /51/6 55/20 59/16 60/5 60/8 151/9 151/10 163/10 202/18 111/25 137/21 149/25 134/18 151/13 152/10 136/20 87/1 89/24 151/9 151/10 166/19 172/10 namely [8] 10/23 150/23 152/20 153/18 212/5 143/5 168/23 206/20 192/7 200/9 205/11 namely [8] 10/23 12/23 46/21 125/25 Module 1 [4] 1/18 143/5 168/23 206/20 192/7 200/9 205/11 151/2 51/9 157/5 namely [8] 10/23 Module 1 [2] 76/18 move [13 51/13 150/82 58/12 65/22 67/18 multiple [1] 202/17 narrative [1] 89/8 nation [3] 15/25 63/ 9/4 10 315 108/24 130/8 170/11 187/3 36/24 54/4 56/23 multiple [1] 202/13 nation [1] 15/26 nation [1] 15/26 nation [1] 11/2 nation [1] 13/1 nation [2] 11/1 nation [2] 11/1 12/12 16/22 nation [2] 11/1 nation [2] 11/1 nation [2] 11/1 nation [2] 11/1 13/12 13/16 13/23 nation [2] 11/1 13/16 13/33 nation [2] 11/1 13/16 13/33 13/16 13/32 13/17 13/16 13/33 13/16 13/11 13/16 13/33 13/17 13/16 13/33 13/17 13/17 13/17 13/17 13/17					
762 108/12 125/21 86/20 87/1 89/24 134/18 15/10 166/13 173/8 173/25 177/19 named [1] 165/24 166/13 negative [5] 41/10 12/20 153/18 212/5 143/5 186/23 206/20 205/11 121/21 1	14/3 26/8 75/11 75/16				
134/10 153/10	76/2 108/12 125/21				
132/20 153/15 143/5 168/23 206/20 192/7 200/9 205/11 152/23 46/21 125/25 68/4 71/8 74/24 123/5 Module 1 [4] 1/18 1/19 10/16 14/3 mounting [1] 143/10 210/25 211/1 211/5 154/24 155/19 157/5 negatively [1] 97/23 module 2 [3] 13/6 36/24 54/4 56/23 58/12 65/22 67/18 multiplicity [1] 12/21 natrative [1] 89/8 natrative [1] 89/8 molecular [2] 76/18 90/4 103/15 108/24 multiplicity [1] 172/3 natronal [13] 14/14 natronal [13] 14/14 negotiating [2] 108/8 movet [9] 52/3 59/9 90/2 9/7 12/15 15/23 movet [9] 52/3 59/9 100/7 171/17 172/7 129/2 17 20/8 2/21/3 24/17 171/14 117/18 130/1 negotiating [2] 101/8 108/25 119/3 140/7 143/1 155/25 36/22 41/2 210/14 movet [9] 52/3 59/9 100/7 171/17 172/7 129/2 17 2/15 15/23 moting [1] 14/14 negotiating [2] 101/8 100/7 171/17 172/7 173/25 174/3 186/16 24/5 24/6 24/18 48/14 national [13] 14/14 network [7] 84/19 100/15 110/2 101/15 38/16 43/23 44/44 nations [21] 12/2 network [7] 84/19 157/23 monitor [1] 133/9 moving [12] 15/10 45/14 45/13 48/19 network [3] 92/6 88/14 88/8 88/14 88/16 <	134/18 151/13 152/10			namely [8] 10/23	
212/21/1 212/21/1 212/211 212/211 212/211 212/211 212/21 154/24 155/19 157/2 negatively [1] 97/23 Module 1[3] 13/6 26/8 125/21 molecular [2] 76/18 nutting [1] 143/10 nutting [1] 120/25 21/1 21/1 21/1 21/25 21/1 11 154/24 155/19 155/19 157/2 negatively [1] 97/23 26/8 125/21 36/24 56/22 67/18 multiplicity [1] 172/3 narrative [1] 89/8 negatively [1] 97/23 Molecular [2] 76/18 90/4 103/15 108/24 multiplicity [1] 77/12 167/14 15/15 18/16 8/12 8/14 8/16 8/12 8/14 8/16	152/20 153/18 212/5				
Module 1 [4] 1/19 1/18 move [15] 8/11 3/11 muddled [1] 202/17 marrative [1] 8/8 megotiating [2] 119/10 14/8/24 26/8 125/21 36/24 54/4 56/12 mutiplicity [1] 1202/23 matrative [1] 8/8 megotiating [2] 119/10 148/24 108/8 100/11 103/15 108/24 130/8 170/11 187/3 mutiplicity [1] 172/3 nation [3] 15/25 63/7 108/8 100/11 103/15 108/24 175/12 18/20 12/15 119/10 148/24 megotiations [1] 119/10 148/24 megotiations [1] 119/10 148/24 megotiations [1] 119/10 148/24 megotiations [1] 110/11 148/24 megotiations [1] 120/14 mettor [1] 13/8 13/8 13/8 13/8 13/8 13/8 13/8 13/8 13/8 13/8 13/8 13/8 13/8 13/8 14/8 12/14 12/14 12/14 12/14 12/14 12/14 12/14 12/14 12/14 12/14 12/14	212/11 212/17				
1/19 10/16 14/3 module 2 [3] 13/6 26/8 125/21 36/24 54/4 56/23 58/12 65/22 67/18 multiple [1] 202/33 multiplicity [1] 172/3 narrative [1] 89/8 mation [3] 15/25 63/5 78/24 negotiating [2] 119/10 148/24 108/8 90/4 103/15 108/24 must [4] 12/21 64/25 national [13] 14/14 negotiations [1] 21/18/25 108/8 90/4 103/15 108/24 must [4] 12/21 64/22 national [13] 14/14 negotiations [1] 21/18/26 108/8 90/4 103/15 108/24 must [4] 12/21 64/22 national [13] 14/14 negotiations [1] 21/18/26 108/8 90/4 103/15 108/24 must [4] 12/21 64/22 national [13] 14/14 netter [1] 91/6 108/25 119/3 140/7 110/7 17/17 17/27 18/20 18/21 21/3 21/3 national [13] 14/14 netter [1] 84/24 110/7 17/17 17/12 12/2 119/10 148/24 netter [1] 8/24 netter [1] 8/24 12/17 12 182/15 208/25 110/7 17/17 18/20 18/21 21/3 21/3 117/14 117/18 130/1 network [7] 84/19 157/23 monitor [1] 133/9 monitor [1] 134/3 network [3] 92/6 88/14 88/16 185/25 networks [3] 92/6 186/7 month [2] 80/16 18/16 18/15/2 73/17 74/2 75/2 75/5 Nature [13] 73/25 networks [3] 92/6 186/7					
modecule 2 [3] 13/5 58/12 65/22 67/18 multiplicity [1] 172/3 nation [3] 15/25 63/5 119/10 148/24 negotiations [1] 108/8 molecular [2] 76/18 90/4 103/15 108/24 must [4] 12/21 64/22 78/24 negotiations [1] network [7] skife 1/1 network [7] skife 1/1 network [7] skife 1/1 skife	1/19 10/16 14/3				
2016 12:0:21 90/4 103/15 108/24 must [4] 12/21 64/22 78/24 negotiations [1] 108/8 175/12 186/25 mational [13] 14/14 210/14 210/14 108/8 170/11 187/3 201/18 must [4] 12/21 64/22 78/24 negotiations [1] 90/4 103/15 108/24 175/12 186/25 mational [13] 14/14 210/14 neither [1] 91/6 90/4 103/15 108/24 175/12 186/25 mational [13] 14/14 210/14 neither [1] 91/6 90/4 103/15 108/24 170/11 187/3 171/15 15/23 60/12 79/4 101/3 NERVTAG [11] 84/21 90/4 103/15 108/24 110/7 171/17 172/7 18/26 18/22 13/8 133/19 135/13 85/12 85/18 94/14 108/25 119/3 140/7 100/7 171/13 15/10 13/8 133/19 135/13 85/12 85/18 94/14 13/6 21/6 25/18 28/1 108/25 119/21 16/7 35/25 36/22 41/2 88/16 42/21 14/3/3 50/5 54/9 54/14 55/10 99/2 90/7 101164/23 127/4 127/25 128/3 157/23 11/11 143/3 50/5 54/9 54/14 55/10 99/2 90/7 1111 64/23 186/3 197/21 171/16 19/21 97/6 73/17 74/2 75/2 75/5 Natural [1] 170/11 network [7] 88/3/21 195/1 109/8 118/15 118/19 78/8 79/22 82/1 86/20 8					
1108/cutal [2] 70.10 130/8 170/11 187/3 175/12 186/25 national [13] 14/14 210/14 9/11 18/5 63/1 67/20 108/25 119/3 140/7 171/17 172/7 18/20 18/21 21/3 21/7 117/14 117/18 130/1 84/22 84/24 85/5 85/7 108/8 100/17 171/17 172/7 18/20 18/21 21/3 21/7 117/14 117/18 130/1 84/12 86/16 91/5 84/1 84/24 85/5 85/7 108/25 119/3 140/7 173/25 174/3 186/16 24/5 24/5 24/6 34/19 131/8 133/19 135/13 85/12 86/18 94/14 177/12 182/15 208/23 moving [12] 15/10 38/16 43/23 44/4 nations [21] 12/2 85/14 86/18 94/14 157/23 moving [12] 15/10 46/2 47/8 48/14 15/6 21/6 25/18 28/1 network [7] 84/19 157/23 monitor [1] 133/9 moving [12] 10/16 24/17 57/17 61/9 62/21 66/3 82/14 82/22 83/3 networks [3] 92/6 157/23 monitor [1] 13/4/3 Mr [26] 10/16 24/17 67/18 69/15 73/1 73/5 84/10 114/16 196/15 networks [3] 92/6 186/7 monthl [1] 87/6 monthls [9] 6/1 7/11 109/8 118/15 118/19 73/17 74/2 75/2 75/5 Natural [1] 170/11 networks [3] 92/6 113/14 14/4 101/15 10/20 12/20 10/24 117/19 103/3 103/14 112/14 112/24/15 05/20 205/24 111/11 11/			must [4] 12/21 64/22		
108/8 201/18 moved [9] 52/3 59/9 9/2 9/7 12/15 15/23 27/13 40/14 42/5 neither [1] 91/6 108/25 119/3 140/7 110/7 171/17 172/7 18/20 18/21 21/3 21/7 117/14 117/18 130/1 84/22 84/24 85/5 85/7 108/25 119/3 140/7 173/25 174/3 186/16 210/15 18/20 18/21 21/3 21/7 131/8 133/19 135/13 85/12 85/18 94/14 177/12 182/15 208/23 moving [12] 15/10 88/16 43/23 44/4 nations [21] 12/2 12/2 85/18 94/14 10/7 35/25 36/22 41/2 9/2 9/7 12/15 15/20 38/16 43/23 44/4 nations [21] 12/2 12/2 12/2 15/6 27/18 28/1 network [7] 84/19 157/23 monitor [1] 13/4/3 16/7 35/25 36/22 41/2 24/15 29/12 65/4 59/7 61/11 64/23 88/16 185/25 network [7] 84/19 157/23 monitor [1] 13/4/3 monitor [1] 13/4/3 morit [2] 01/6 24/17 67/18 69/15 73/1 73/5 84/10 114/16 196/15 network [3] 92/6 186/7 monthly [1] 87/6 monthly [1] 87/6 73/17 74/2 75/2 75/5 Natural [1] 170/11 neutral [1] 18/5 119/6 125/20 125/25 109/8 118/15 118/19 73/17 74/2 75/2 75/5 Natural [1] 70/12 neutral [1] 18/5 neutral [1] 18/5 11/2 46/1 59/10 59/10 never [6] 11/1 1					
moment [14] 4/17 moved [9] 52/3 59/9 9/2 9/7 12/15 15/23 60/12 79/4 101/3 NERVTAG [11] 84/21 108/25 119/3 140/7 110/7 171/17 172/7 18/20 18/21 21/3 21/7 117/14 117/18 130/1 84/22 84/24 85/5 85/7 173/25 174/3 186/16 24/5 24/5 24/6 34/19 131/8 133/19 135/13 84/22 84/24 85/5 85/7 177/12 182/15 208/23 moving [12] 15/10 16/7 35/25 36/22 41/2 48/14 45/24 46/2 47/8 48/14 15/6 21/6 25/18 28/1 177/12 182/15 208/23 moving [12] 15/10 16/7 35/25 36/22 41/2 48/15 49/13 49/19 36/6 37/5 44/23 48/24 88/4 88/8 88/14 88/16 157/23 monitor [1] 133/9 monitor [1] 134/3 15/6 14 62/11 143/13 50/5 54/9 54/14 55/10 48/10 114/16 196/15 88/14 88/16 88/14 88/4 88/8 88/14 88/16 186/7 month [2] 80/16 13/12 34/1 34/25 73/17 74/2 75/2 75/5 84/10 114/16 196/15 network [3] 92/6 19/11 44/13 42/4 121/2 19/6 125/02 125/25 92/2 95/2 96/10 100/3 81/2 82/19 83/21 network [3] 11/2 46/1 59/10 59/10 19/12 186/20 145/12 101/19 103/13 104/7 73/8 79/22 82/1 86/20 81/2 82/19 83/21 network [3] 12/18 14/25 19/14 112/14 19/8 118/15 118/1					
9/11/16/3 531 607/20 110/7 171/17 172/7 18/20 18/21 21/3 21/7 117/14 117/18 130/1 84/22 84/24 85/5 85/7 108/25 119/3 140/7 173/25 174/3 186/16 24/5 24/5 24/5 24/6 34/19 131/8 133/19 135/13 85/12 85/18 94/14 177/12 182/15 208/23 monidg [2] 1/1 53/22 monig [12] 15/10 45/24 46/2 47/8 48/14 15/6 21/6 25/18 28/1 network [7] 84/19 16/7 35/25 36/22 41/2 48/15 49/13 49/19 56/14 62/11 143/13 50/5 54/9 54/14 55/10 49/23 50/10 51/12 88/16 185/25 171/19 192/2 197/6 57/17 61/9 62/21 65/4 65/17 65/20 66/3 82/14 82/22 83/3 network [3] 92/6 186/7 month [2] 80/16 13/12 34/1 34/25 73/17 74/2 75/2 75/5 Natural [1] 170/11 neutral [1] 18/5 196/17 119/6 125/20 125/25 92/2 95/2 96/10 10/3 81/2 82/19 83/21 neutral [1] 18/5 195/1 119/6 125/20 205/24 101/19 103/13 104/7 93/3 109/14 112/14 newer [6] 11/1 11/1 171/2 185/10 192/23 104/15 105/22 108/24 151/13 177/15 177/15 19/4 42/24 144/14 195/1 119/6 125/20 205/24 101/19 103/13 104/7 93/3 109/14 112/14 newer [8] 12/18 14/25 195/1 119/12 136/20 105/20 205/24 101/19 103/13 104/7<					
108/25 119/3 140/7 173/25 174/3 186/16 24/5 24/5 24/6 34/19 131/8 133/19 135/13 85/12 85/18 94/14 177/12 182/15 208/23 moving [12] 15/10 38/16 43/23 44/4 nations [21] 12/2 127/4 127/25 128/3 Monday [2] 1/1 53/22 moving [12] 15/10 45/24 46/2 47/8 48/14 15/6 21/6 25/18 28/1 network [7] 84/19 16/7 35/25 36/22 41/2 48/15 94/13 49/19 56/14 62/11 143/13 50/5 54/9 54/14 55/10 49/23 50/10 51/12 88/4 88/8 88/14 88/16 171/19 192/2 197/6 57/17 61/9 62/21 65/4 59/7 61/11 64/23 88/16 185/25 networks [3] 92/6 monitor [1] 133/9 171/19 192/2 197/6 57/17 761/9 62/21 65/4 59/7 61/11 64/23 88/16 185/25 months [9] 6/1 7/11 119/6 125/20 125/25 97/2 97/14 78/6 78/7 Natural [1] 170/11 networks [3] 92/6 127/12 136/20 145/12 101/19 103/7 75/9 75/14 78/6 78/7 Nature [13] 73/25 network [3] 12/18 14/25 127/12 136/20 145/12 101/19 103/31 104/7 93/3 109/14 112/14 new [18] 12/18 14/25 11/2 46/1 59/10 59/10 195/1 19/6 125/20 125/25 92/2 95/2 96/10 100/3 83/24 85/25 92/23 16/6 127/12 136/20 145/12 101/19 103/13 104/7 93/3 109/14 112/14					
14/1/155//17/14 210/15 38/16 43/23 44/4 nations [21] 12/2 127/4 127/25 128/3 Monday [2] 1/1 53/22 moving [12] 15/10 16/7 35/25 36/22 41/2 48/15 49/13 49/19 36/6 37/5 44/23 48/24 88/16 48/23 48/4 monitor [1] 133/9 16/7 35/25 36/22 41/2 48/15 49/13 49/19 36/6 37/5 44/23 48/24 88/16 48/23 48/4 monitor [1] 133/9 171/19 192/2 197/6 50/5 54/9 54/14 55/10 49/23 50/10 51/12 88/16 185/25 monitoring [1] 134/3 171/19 192/2 197/6 57/17 61/9 62/21 65/4 59/7 61/11 64/23 82/14 82/22 83/3 network [3] 92/6 months [9] 6/1 7/11 40/11 54/19 103/7 75/9 75/14 78/6 78/7 nature [13] 73/25 networks [3] 92/6 11/1 13 42/4 121/2 119/6 125/20 125/25 73/17 74/2 75/2 75/5 Natural [1] 170/11 never [6] 11/1 11/1 41/13 42/4 121/2 127/12 136/20 145/12 101/19 103/13 104/7 93/3 109/14 112/14 never [6] 11/1 11/1 41/13 42/4 121/2 127/12 136/20 145/12 104/15 105/22 108/24 151/13 177/15 177/17 19/4 42/24 144/14 195/1 196/5 152/5/20 205/24 125/14 122/14 11/21 148/21 147/12 144/23 170/15 170/18 195/1 195/1 10/2 171/2 103/7 17/1					
11/1/12 182/15 208/23 Monday [2] 1/1 53/22 money [2] 140/19 157/23 moving [12] 15/10 16/7 35/25 36/22 41/2 56/14 62/11 143/13 55/15 61/2 62/16 24/23 48/14 15/6 21/6 25/18 28/1 36/6 37/5 44/23 48/24 48/15 49/13 49/19 36/6 37/5 44/23 48/24 48/15 49/13 49/19 36/6 37/5 44/23 48/24 48/23 50/10 51/12 59/7 61/11 64/23 82/14 82/22 83/3 month [2] 80/16 186/7 months [9] 6/1 7/11 41/13 42/4 121/2 119/6 125/20 125/25 127/12 136/20 145/12 109/8 118/15 118/19 195/1 45/24 46/2 47/8 48/14 48/15 49/13 49/19 50/5 54/9 54/14 55/10 67/17 61/9 62/21 65/4 65/17 65/20 66/3 73/17 74/2 75/2 75/5 Natural [1] 170/11 noutral [1] 18/5 network [3] 92/6 186/3 197/21 networks [3] 92/6 186/3 197/21 11/2 46/1 59/10 59/10 nevertheless [1] 64/6 new [18] 12/18 14/25 19/4 42/24 144/14 14/23 170/15 170/18 171/6 171/9 171/21 171/2 174/14 185/2 185/10 188/21 193/8 New Year [2] 12/18 19/4			38/16 43/23 44/4	nations [21] 12/2	
Monday [2] 1/1 53/22 16/7 35/25 36/22 41/2 48/15 49/13 49/19 36/6 37/5 44/23 48/24 88/4 88/8 8/14 88/16 money [2] 140/19 157/23 16/7 35/25 36/22 41/2 48/15 49/13 49/19 36/6 37/5 44/23 48/24 88/4 88/8 8/14 88/16 monitor [1] 133/9 171/19 192/2 197/6 57/17 61/9 62/21 65/4 59/7 61/11 64/23 88/14 82/22 83/3 88/16 185/25 monitor [2] 80/16 65/17 65/20 66/3 82/14 82/22 83/3 84/10 114/16 196/15 networks [3] 92/6 3/12 34/1 34/25 40/11 54/19 103/7 67/18 69/15 73/1 73/5 84/10 114/16 196/15 networks [3] 92/6 3/12 34/1 34/25 40/11 54/19 103/7 75/9 75/14 78/6 78/7 81/2 82/19 83/21 networks [3] 92/6 19/6 125/20 125/25 92/2 95/2 96/10 100/3 83/24 85/25 92/23 81/2 82/19 83/21 new [18] 12/18 14/25 19/1 13/5/1 119/6 125/20 125/25 92/2 95/2 96/10 100/3 83/24 85/25 92/23 81/4 4/23 170/15 170/17 19/5/1 19/6 125/20 205/24 10/1/9 103/13 104/7 93/3 109/14 112/14 new [18] 12/18 14/25 19/6 12/25 207/15 205/20 205/24 12/2/4 147/8 147/12 135/8 145/11 145/13 193/19 195/1 144/23 170/15 170/18 19/6 11/2					
money [2] 140/19 56/14 62/11 143/13 50/5 54/9 54/14 55/10 49/23 50/10 51/12 88/16 185/25 monitor [1] 133/9 171/19 192/2 197/6 57/17 61/9 62/21 65/4 59/7 61/11 64/23 82/14 82/22 83/3 186/3 197/21 monthr [2] 80/16 33/12 34/1 34/25 73/17 74/2 75/2 75/5 84/10 114/16 196/15 networks [3] 92/6 months [9] 6/1 7/11 40/11 54/19 103/7 73/17 74/2 75/2 75/5 Natural [1] 170/11 never [6] 11/1 11/1 41/13 42/4 121/2 109/8 118/15 118/19 78/8 79/22 82/1 86/20 81/2 82/19 83/21 never [6] 11/1 11/1 19/6 125/20 125/25 92/2 95/2 96/10 100/3 83/24 85/25 92/23 64/6 19/1 149/6 125/20 125/25 101/15 105/22 108/24 151/13 177/15 177/17 19/4 42/24 144/14 19/5/1 18/5 151/20 192/23 104/15 105/22 108/24 151/13 177/15 177/17 19/4 42/24 144/14 205/15 205/20 205/24 112/24 117/19 119/18 nearly [3] 35/10 144/23 170/15 170/18 19/6 85/10 Mr Gardner [4] 149/1 149/6 150/3 193/19 195/1 171/2 174/12 174/14 18/18 18/22 19/15 Mr Gardner [4] 205/15 205/20 205/24 151/7 151/21 152/13 55/4 91/8 New Year [2]					88/4 88/8 88/14 88/16
monitor [1] 133/9 monitoring [1] 133/9 monitoring [1] 11/1/19 192/2 19/16 5/1/1 65/17 65/20 65/20 65/3 82/14 82/22 83/3 84/10 114/16 196/15 186/3 197/21 networks [3] 92/6 186/3 186/3 197/21 networks [3] 92/6 186/3 186/3 197/21 networks [3] 92/6 18/7 18/7 14 14/16 196/17 11/2 11/2 11/2 11/2 11/2 11/2 19/4 11/2 <th></th> <th></th> <th></th> <th></th> <th></th>					
monitoring [1] 133/3 203/11 65/17 65/20 66/3 82/14 82/22 83/3 186/3 197/21 monitoring [1] 134/3 Mr [26] 10/16 24/17 67/18 69/15 73/1 73/5 84/10 114/16 196/15 neutral [1] 186/3 197/21 186/7 Monthly [1] 87/6 67/18 69/15 73/1 73/5 84/10 114/16 196/15 neutral [1] 18/3 monthy [1] 87/6 40/11 54/19 103/7 75/9 75/14 78/6 78/7 nature [13] 73/25 never [6] 11/1 11/1 41/13 42/4 121/2 109/8 118/15 118/19 78/8 79/22 82/1 86/20 81/2 82/19 83/21 never theless [1] 64/6 195/1 109/8 118/15 118/19 78/8 79/22 106/20 83/24 85/25 92/23 64/6 new [18] 12/18 14/25 195/1 109/8 118/15 112/0 192/23 104/15 105/22 108/24 151/13 177/15 177/17 19/4 42/24 144/14 205/15 205/20 205/24 112/24 117/19 119/18 nearly [3] 35/10 144/23 170/15 170/18 more [76] 6/8 7/12 7/19 8/5 10/1 10/2 145/24 147/8 147/12 necessarily [2] 16/3 18/18 18/22 19/15 205/15 205/20 205/24 205/15 205/20 205/24 151/7 151/21 152/13 55/4 91/8 19/4		171/19 192/2 197/6	57/17 61/9 62/21 65/4		networks [3] 92/6
month [2] 80/16 Mr [26] 10/16/24/17 67/18/09/15/3/17/3/5 64/10/11/4/16/15/15 neutral [1] 17/15 186/7 33/12/34/134/25 73/17/4/275/275/5 Natural [1] 170/11 never [6] 11/1/11/1 40/11/54/19/103/7 75/97/5/14/78/678/7 81/282/19/83/21 never [6] 11/1/11/1 41/13/42/4 121/2 109/8 118/15/18/19 92/295/296/10/100/3 81/282/19/83/21 nevertheless [1] 41/13/42/4 121/2 127/12/136/20/145/12 101/19/103/13/104/7 93/3/109/14 112/14 new [18] 12/18/14/25 195/1 19/6/125/20/125/25 92/29/29/29/29/29/20/10/100/3 83/24/85/25/92/23 93/3/109/14 112/14 new [18] 12/18/14/25 195/1 119/6/125/20/125/25 102/12 101/19/103/13/104/7 93/3/3/109/14 112/14 144/23 164/6 new [18] 12/18/14/25 19/4/224 144/14 144/23 170/15 170/18 171/2 174/20/14/2 193/19 195/1 144/23 170/15 171/2 171/2 174/20/14/2 145/24 147/12 144/23 170/15 171/2 171/2 171/					
186/7 33/12 34/1 34/25 73/17 74/2 75/2 75/5 Natural [1] 17/0/11 never [6] 1/1/1 1/1 monthly [1] 87/6 40/11 54/19 103/7 75/9 75/14 78/6 78/7 nature [13] 73/25 11/2 46/1 59/10 59/10 months [9] 6/1 7/11 109/8 118/15 118/19 92/2 95/2 96/10 100/3 81/2 82/19 83/21 nature [13] 73/25 81/2 82/19 83/21 nevertheless [1] 64/6 127/12 136/20 145/12 101/19 103/13 104/7 93/3 109/14 112/14 93/3 109/14 112/14 148/25 151/20 192/23 104/15 105/22 108/24 151/13 177/15 177/17 new [18] 12/18 14/25 195/1 148/25 151/20 192/23 104/15 105/22 108/24 151/13 177/15 177/17 new [18] 12/18 14/25 195/1 148/25 151/20 192/23 104/15 105/22 108/24 151/13 177/15 177/17 new [18] 12/18 14/25 205/15 205/20 205/24 112/24 117/19 119/18 193/19 195/1 necessarily [2] 16/3 11/6 11/22 17/23 Nr Gardner [4] 149/1 149/6 150/3 83/11 171/2 174/14 185/2 185/10 188/21 18/18 18/22 19/15 05/15 205/20 205/24 151/7 151/21 152/13 157/12 157/13 157/14 necel [45] 1/22 16/12 19/4 <th></th> <th></th> <th></th> <th></th> <th></th>					
monthly [1] 87/6 months [9] 6/1 7/11 41/13 42/4 121/2 121/3 184/4 193/19 195/1 40/11 54/19 103/7 109/8 118/15 118/19 119/6 125/20 125/25 127/12 136/20 145/12 127/12 136/20 145/12 127/12 136/20 145/12 127/12 136/20 145/12 127/12 136/20 145/12 127/12 136/20 145/12 127/12 136/20 145/12 101/19 103/13 104/7 195/1 nature [13] 7/3/25 81/2 82/19 83/21 83/24 85/25 92/23 93/3 109/14 112/14 151/13 177/15 177/17 103/3 109/14 112/14 151/13 177/15 177/17 10/4 42/24 144/14 112/24 117/19 119/18 205/15 205/20 205/24 112/24 117/19 119/18 205/15 205/20 205/24 112/24 117/19 119/18 205/15 205/20 205/24 112/24 117/19 119/18 104/15 105/22 108/24 112/24 117/19 119/18 193/19 195/1 11/2 46/1 59/10 59/10 81/2 82/19 83/21 19/4 42/24 144/14 144/23 170/15 170/18 171/6 171/9 171/21 171/6 171/9 171/21 171/2 174/14 185/2 185/10 188/21 193/8 Moore [76] 6/8 7/12 7/19 8/5 10/1 10/2 11/6 11/22 17/23 18/18 18/22 19/15 Mr Gardner [4] 205/15 205/20 205/24 205/15 205/20 205/24 205/15 205/20 205/24 205/15 205/20 205/24 207/15 145/24 147/8 147/12 149/1 149/6 150/3 157/12 157/13 157/14 necessary [3] 16/4 55/4 91/8 need [45] 1/22 16/12 New Year [2] 12/18 19/4					
months [9] 6/1 7/11 109/8 116/13 118/19 78/8 79/22 82/1 86/20 61/2 62/19 63/21 63/2 12 41/13 42/4 121/2 119/6 125/20 125/25 92/2 95/2 96/10 100/3 83/24 85/25 92/23 64/6 121/3 184/4 193/19 119/6 125/20 145/12 101/19 103/13 104/7 93/3 109/14 112/14 64/6 195/1 148/25 151/20 192/23 104/15 105/22 108/24 151/13 177/15 177/17 19/4 42/24 144/14 195/1 148/25 151/20 192/23 104/15 105/22 108/24 151/13 177/15 177/17 19/4 42/24 144/14 205/15 205/20 205/24 112/24 117/19 119/18 nearly [3] 35/10 19/4 42/24 144/14 193/19 195/1 145/24 147/8 147/12 necessarily [2] 16/3 171/6 171/9 171/21 7/19 8/5 10/1 10/2 147/20 148/22 148/22 83/11 171/2 2 174/12 174/14 18/18 18/22 19/15 16/5 205/20 205/24 151/7 151/21 152/13 151/7 151/21 152/13 16/4 18/18 18/22 19/15 05/15 205/20 205/24 151/7 151/21 152/13 157/12 157/13 157/14 need [45] 1/22 16/12 19/4					11/2 46/1 59/10 59/10
41/13 42/4 121/2 119/6 125/20 125/25 92/2 95/2 96/10 100/5 05/24 05/25 92/25 92/2 92/25 121/3 184/4 193/19 127/12 136/20 145/12 101/19 103/13 104/7 93/3 109/14 112/14 new [18] 12/18 14/25 195/1 148/25 151/20 192/23 104/15 105/22 108/24 151/13 177/15 177/17 19/4 42/24 144/14 148/25 151/20 192/23 104/15 105/22 108/24 151/13 177/15 177/17 new [18] 12/18 14/25 205/15 205/20 205/24 112/24 117/19 119/18 193/19 195/1 144/23 170/15 170/18 205/25 207/15 212/19 135/8 145/11 145/13 193/19 195/1 171/6 171/9 171/21 17/16 17/9 171/21 145/24 147/8 147/12 necessarily [2] 16/3 171/2 174/12 174/14 7/19 8/5 10/1 10/2 149/1 149/6 150/3 83/11 18/2/2 185/10 188/21 18/18 18/22 19/15 05/15 205/20 205/24 151/7 151/21 152/13 55/4 91/8 New Year [2] 12/18 19/4 207/15 157/12 157/13 157/14 need [45] 1/22 16/12 19/4					
121/3 184/4 193/19 127/12 136/20 145/12 101/19 103/13 104/7 93/3 109/14 112/14 new [18] 12/18 14/25 195/1 148/25 151/20 192/23 104/15 105/22 108/24 151/13 177/15 177/17 19/4 42/24 144/14 Moore [1] 85/10 125/15 205/20 205/24 112/24 117/19 119/18 151/13 177/15 177/17 19/4 42/24 144/14 205/15 205/20 205/24 112/24 117/19 119/18 193/19 195/1 144/23 170/15 170/18 more [76] 6/8 7/12 7/19 8/5 10/1 10/2 145/24 147/8 147/12 145/24 147/8 147/12 171/6 171/9 171/21 7/19 8/5 10/1 10/2 11/6 11/22 17/23 149/1 149/6 150/3 83/11 18/18 18/22 19/15 151/7 151/21 152/13 83/11 185/2 185/10 188/21 18/18 18/22 19/15 205/15 205/20 205/24 151/7 151/21 152/13 157/12 157/13 157/14 122 16/12 193/8 New Year [2] 12/18 157/12 157/13 157/14 19/4 19/4 19/4					
195/1 148/25 151/20 192/23 104/15 105/22 108/24 151/15 177/15 177/17 19/4 42/24 144/14 Moore [1] 85/10 205/15 205/20 205/24 112/24 117/19 119/18 nearly [3] 35/10 144/23 170/15 170/18 mooted [1] 172/14 205/25 207/15 212/19 135/8 145/11 145/13 193/19 195/1 171/6 171/9 171/21 Mr Drakeford [2] 145/24 147/8 147/12 145/24 147/8 147/12 171/2 171/2 174/14 7/19 8/5 10/1 10/2 146/15 205/20 205/24 149/1 149/6 150/3 83/11 185/2 185/10 188/21 148/18 18/22 19/15 205/15 205/20 205/24 151/7 151/21 152/13 157/12 157/13 157/14 necessary [3] 16/4 189/8 New Year [2] 12/18 19/4 19/4 19/4 19/4 19/4					
Moore [1] 85/10 205/15 205/20 205/24 112/24 117/19 119/18 nearly [3] 35/10 144/23 170/15 170/18 170/18 10/15 170/15 170/18 10/15 170/15 170/18 10/15 170/18 10/15 170/18 10/15 170					
mooted [1] 172/14 more [76] 6/8 7/12 7/19 8/5 11/6 11/22 11/2 17/10 11/6 11/22 11/2 17/10 11/2 17					
more [76] 6/8 7/12 Mr Drakeford [2] 143/24 147/8 147/12 necessarily [2] 10/3 17/1/22 174/14 185/2 185/10 188/21 185/2 185/10 188/21 193/8 193/8 New Year [2] 12/18 193/8 193/8 New Year [2] 12/18 193/8 193/8 193/8 193/8 193/8 193/8 193/8 193/8 193/8 193/8 193/8 193/8 193/8 193/8 193/8 193/8 193/8 193/8 193/8					
7/19 8/5 10/1 10/2 24/17 103/7 147/20 148/22 148/22 03/11 03/11 185/2 185/10 188/21 11/6 11/22 17/23 11/6 11/22 17/23 149/1 149/6 150/3 149/1 149/6 150/3 16/4 18/18 18/22 19/15 205/15 205/20 205/24 151/7 151/21 152/13 55/4 91/8 1882 16/4 19/4 157/12 157/13 157/14 19/4 19/4					
11/6 1/22 1/23 205/15 205/20 205/20 205/24 151/7 151/21 152/13 55/4 91/8 New Year [2] 12/18 18/18 18/22 19/15 207/15 157/12 157/13 157/14 need [45] 1/22 16/12 19/4	7/19 8/5 10/1 10/2				
18/18 18/22 19/15 207/15 157/12 157/13 157/14 need [45] 1/22 16/12 19/4					
	18/18 18/22 19/15				
		201710	101/12 101/10 101/14		

(76) mistake - New Year

Ν	non-scientists [1]	142/10 142/19 145/14	38/16 40/10 42/22	54/7
newly [1] 190/8	97/12	146/17 148/7 148/18	43/2 43/5 44/7 44/7	observed [4] 81/25
Newport [1] 66/7	none [1] 207/10	151/11 153/7 153/8	44/20 45/4 45/17 50/9	81/25 139/24 181/8
next [29] 6/21 9/8	nonetheless [1]	158/8 160/7 161/25	50/21 51/6 52/13	observer [5] 81/13
14/10 18/24 21/23	193/25	163/19 164/24 166/12		81/21 81/24 84/21
30/21 48/19 58/15	nor [2] 91/6 193/16	167/9 172/4 175/17	58/16 58/17 60/15	85/5
67/18 86/15 89/11	normal [2] 36/15	175/19 175/22 176/9	63/12 63/24 64/4	observers [4] 84/25
102/23 107/13 118/7	168/17	176/13 177/16 177/23		85/2 97/9 97/10
121/14 122/25 130/13	normality [2] 116/17	180/2 180/3 180/7	71/4 72/10 72/17	observing [1] 99/17
140/2 140/2 147/12	116/18	181/17 183/3 183/10	78/11 78/16 87/24	obvious [3] 55/23
149/12 151/22 165/20	normally [2] 51/17	184/10 188/14 192/25		64/19 198/2
174/24 179/17 182/10	161/19	194/16 195/15 199/18		obviously [46] 24/6
184/21 193/17 194/25	northern [5] 35/13	200/1 200/13 201/1	111/1 117/4 117/11	25/3 29/15 45/2 50/9
NHS [19] 26/10 26/20	50/16 87/5 187/7	201/2 201/6 202/2	118/24 120/22 125/20	52/20 57/13 63/24
27/4 91/15 103/14	190/2	203/2 203/16 204/14	127/7 137/13 137/22	70/1 77/3 77/6 80/14
103/19 105/3 105/7	Northern Ireland [4]	204/24 205/2 206/10	142/9 143/9 143/10	86/17 88/6 91/6
105/10 110/2 110/3	50/16 87/5 187/7 190/2	206/13 206/19 207/7	143/19 145/22 151/22	102/15 105/24 106/16
110/19 126/12 126/16		207/15 208/18 210/9	151/24 152/1 153/4	122/15 129/1 133/12
132/18 136/11 143/6	nosocomial [1]	notably [1] 201/15	155/6 155/16 157/7	138/17 143/22 145/2
145/3 169/14	124/12	note [15] 12/10 52/9	159/7 159/20 161/22 162/6 164/2 168/8	145/19 159/16 160/21
Nicola [1] 50/14	not [195] 5/22 8/10 9/16 9/22 10/4 10/19	52/11 53/2 56/22 57/13 61/9 64/10	162/6 164/2 168/8	163/20 170/3 170/18 174/10 174/15 175/3
Nicola Sturgeon [1]	9/16 9/22 10/4 10/19 11/15 11/18 13/7	64/12 65/8 70/4 70/5	174/8 175/21 175/25	176/11 176/14 177/20
50/14	13/12 13/19 14/7 16/1	139/6 149/24 177/23	176/20 179/17 179/18	179/10 180/10 193/10
night [1] 110/1	16/3 16/14 18/16 23/1		182/15 184/3 185/4	194/22 194/25 195/12
nine [8] 33/18 33/24	24/1 24/24 26/12	56/18 56/20 57/20	185/9 187/3 187/15	197/1 199/5 200/4
56/21 91/22 146/5	26/14 27/9 28/6 31/1	60/25	189/11 191/15 191/18	200/8
146/21 147/6 148/1	32/2 32/3 32/3 32/20	notebooks [3] 47/19	192/19 192/23 193/5	occasionally [1] 50/8
nine weeks [2] 147/6	33/16 34/2 34/7 34/14		193/8 194/22 195/25	occurred [1] 40/1
148/1	34/17 35/18 37/22	noted [1] 38/11	196/12 196/22 199/24	October [21] 55/17
nine-week [2] 146/5	38/10 38/18 39/3	notes [9] 7/23 8/20	201/18 202/12	91/21 94/9 132/13
146/21	39/24 40/1 40/14	8/24 11/15 34/20	NPIs [3] 131/8 142/1	133/2 134/6 135/7
ninth [1] 37/25 no [68] 8/24 11/2	40/15 41/5 44/10	37/20 48/7 48/17 95/3		135/19 136/19 137/11
11/2 13/19 15/20 16/3	44/13 45/5 45/15	nothing [1] 181/17	nuances [1] 110/5	137/14 137/19 139/4
17/17 20/4 21/7 21/8	45/21 46/9 48/11	notice [7] 175/7	number [30] 7/6 7/21	139/9 145/20 154/17
24/15 33/15 33/22	49/16 49/20 50/7	175/8 175/11 176/23	8/20 45/20 50/21	166/2 166/15 179/18
34/1 34/10 34/17	50/18 50/19 53/4	176/24 189/16 208/18	64/16 87/16 92/7	181/20 193/2
40/22 42/7 44/4 46/12	53/25 54/6 54/25 58/3		92/11 96/24 97/18	October 2020 [2]
51/21 52/7 57/5 59/4	58/22 59/23 62/14	noting [1] 200/1	105/8 108/4 112/22	166/15 193/2
64/5 64/25 65/14	63/5 63/8 63/15 63/22			
67/16 69/15 71/16	64/18 65/10 65/13	133/11	121/20 122/7 128/22	94/9 166/2
71/16 72/19 80/5	65/14 67/8 67/11 68/4		140/12 144/17 145/1	odd [1] 62/6
86/24 88/24 91/23	70/21 70/21 70/25	Nova Scotia [1] 2/25	155/3 169/21 175/25	off [12] 60/10 62/1
107/2 114/13 122/9	71/571/2171/23	novel [2] 12/16 19/3	190/13 195/5 195/6 202/20	66/7 68/1 68/11 68/15 71/19 98/10 138/19
123/2 123/8 124/6	71/24 72/17 72/19 79/24 81/10 81/14	November [13] 3/20 4/5 27/6 56/15 76/5		
124/6 130/12 139/2	81/21 81/24 81/25	4/5 27/6 56/15 76/5 116/5 141/8 143/11	numbers [10] 39/9 71/18 71/23 83/7	178/21 181/9 202/14 office [15] 5/17 7/12
141/16 142/9 145/12	82/24 83/10 84/17	144/1 154/24 182/19	104/25 105/4 105/5	8/12 11/13 12/24 14/6
147/23 148/2 149/1	87/17 88/8 92/21	183/9 197/3	108/10 138/16 138/16	
151/14 153/3 165/1	92/21 93/9 95/17	November 2019 [2]	nurses [1] 126/13	101/16 154/7 182/4
166/9 176/9 176/9	95/22 96/3 96/7 97/8	3/20 154/24	nursing [1] 125/14	185/13 200/12 201/1
176/20 176/25 190/9	97/13 99/2 102/18	November 2020 [1]		officer [17] 1/12 2/12
193/14 193/17 194/12	103/2 105/15 105/18	27/6	0	2/24 3/6 5/12 5/12
194/12 201/3 201/11	106/25 107/16 108/3	November 2021 [1]	o'clock [3] 151/24	14/6 26/17 26/18 35/8
205/2 205/7	110/5 111/25 112/4	4/5	152/2 211/9	78/8 79/19 104/10
non [7] 42/20 73/14	112/24 114/18 114/23	now [123] 2/11 4/9	objectives [1] 121/9	117/5 157/22 159/10
74/4 74/8 97/12 110/9 131/7	115/1 115/12 116/14	6/23 7/7 8/8 9/17 11/3		165/2
non-Covid [4] 42/20	123/5 123/14 124/4	11/12 12/11 13/5	observation [1]	officers [1] 10/12
73/14 74/4 74/8	126/4 126/7 127/9	15/10 18/8 19/2 20/4	150/12	offices [3] 182/25
non-essential [1]	129/11 132/5 132/9	20/17 22/5 23/20	Observations [1]	183/14 184/6
110/9	133/23 134/13 134/16		166/22	official [6] 99/7
non-pharmaceutical	134/21 136/7 138/2	27/25 28/3 29/12	observatory [1]	101/18 183/25 184/25
[1] 131/7	140/10 140/11 141/1	30/24 33/16 35/9	85/12	185/2 185/6
	141/2 141/5 141/21	35/10 35/22 37/20	observe [2] 49/22	officials [29] 4/12
L	1			(77) newly - officials

(77) newly - officials

0	55/6	181/18 182/8 185/13	136/12 137/21 138/25	outstandingly [1]
officials [28] 11/20	operating [3] 164/5	186/25 194/9 194/9	139/5 153/12 156/17	210/22
67/8 88/2 95/3 96/25	165/1 171/4	198/11 200/19 201/7	161/13 166/12 167/21	outstrip [2] 103/19
97/3 97/4 99/9 105/21	operational [8] 32/12		169/9 169/21 170/22	105/8
122/20 123/22 123/24	32/13 32/17 32/21	207/17 208/17 210/6	172/1 177/19 178/10	over [22] 18/13 37/24
161/12 163/16 164/21	129/25 166/6 186/21	order [13] 7/22 50/6	181/18 187/22 200/6	53/22 57/8 61/20
166/6 166/6 169/2	197/22	60/5 81/5 82/14 95/17	203/15 203/23 205/9	70/10 91/4 98/3 98/24
169/21 176/1 176/16	operationalisation [1]		208/3	100/10 101/12 101/13
180/2 189/12 189/22	108/23	154/15 158/22 187/10 198/6	others [9] 4/22 10/2 119/24 136/20 199/24	109/2 114/15 141/24 143/13 149/23 156/14
191/24 197/21 199/10	operationalise [1] 129/17	ordinate [1] 185/15	200/3 200/7 201/4	169/14 172/5 194/24
199/12	operations [1]	ordinated [1] 186/10	200/3/200/7/201/4	205/19
often [7] 26/4 30/4	192/22	ordinating [1] 118/9	otherwise [1] 183/4	overall [3] 7/9 113/14
34/21 109/24 110/1	opinion [3] 44/23	ordination [8] 27/13	ought [2] 70/19 81/17	
156/17 189/16	51/20 83/2	86/3 86/6 88/21 167/7	our [31] 6/21 7/5	overarching [2] 23/6
Oh [3] 43/24 103/6 122/16	opinions [1] 51/21	170/16 187/4 191/24	16/11 17/6 17/14	23/7
okay [16] 67/4 67/17	opportunities [1]	Orford [31] 5/7 14/2	22/18 22/25 31/20	overlap [2] 123/12
69/13 71/14 115/23	141/24	14/9 17/1 19/23 20/6	31/24 32/19 40/15	123/17
133/16 138/6 148/22	opportunity [2]	20/11 20/20 21/4		
199/19 200/2 201/17	163/24 208/24	30/13 30/18 52/15	60/2 74/21 89/20	overly [2] 16/6 156/6
202/25 203/3 203/10	opposed [4] 32/8	75/14 75/15 75/19	94/18 98/3 101/21	oversaw [1] 165/11
203/18 204/12	49/8 93/13 172/18	75/20 76/13 79/18	141/18 151/3 151/22	overseeing [1] 158/6
Omicron [7] 56/15	opposite [1] 65/12	87/19 91/6 102/23	169/25 175/16 175/17	oversight [1] 165/16
56/19 57/3 57/6 57/6	optics [1] 115/16	109/9 117/3 121/12	179/24 183/21 201/6	overwhelmed [2]
143/23 144/3	optimistic [1] 23/25	129/19 145/6 145/16	207/10	105/11 132/19
Omnishambles [1]	optimum [1] 92/1	149/4 150/3 151/10 212/9	ourselves [2] 102/11	own [11] 7/12 22/18
61/23	option [4] 54/24 55/1 55/5 138/25		190/16 out [53] 2/9 19/13	22/25 88/3 114/19 159/17 174/19 174/22
on [442]	options [4] 61/4	organisation [13] 14/25 123/16 151/4	19/18 23/25 26/24	176/15 194/8 197/8
once [8] 28/13 28/13	160/4 160/5 160/6	155/23 156/16 158/20		owner [3] 175/8
42/10 80/15 125/17	or [122] 8/2 8/24 9/22	161/13 164/25 166/14		178/20 180/12
126/23 189/24 190/10	10/20 11/15 12/4 12/8			
one [47] 19/16 19/20	12/25 13/12 14/7	181/22	69/2 69/5 70/4 73/18	P
23/6 49/14 50/3 51/8 55/2 61/4 61/5 73/22	15/21 17/16 17/17	organisation-wide [1]	80/20 80/24 81/5	pace [3] 36/23
90/2 93/8 93/10 99/15	18/1 18/11 18/17	175/12	117/12 117/16 118/9	155/24 167/5
112/22 113/11 113/14	19/14 19/18 23/7	organisational [5]	120/25 130/8 130/9	pack [1] 99/21
115/1 121/10 140/4	31/22 40/15 42/24	3/19 154/23 154/25	130/20 142/16 152/7	package [3] 58/18
148/21 149/2 149/8	44/11 48/13 50/10	165/12 174/13	157/3 160/4 160/12	131/7 131/20
149/24 155/21 156/4	51/12 54/6 58/10 59/3		160/16 160/21 162/20	
162/13 164/22 166/18	61/5 61/15 68/7 70/15		165/17 171/4 180/16	121/9
167/23 172/14 174/20	70/22 72/8 73/13	organogram [1]	181/7 182/25 183/14	paediatrics [1] 2/18 page [91] 1/22 3/17
177/11 180/22 188/24	73/18 74/4 77/20 78/4	174/3	193/15 193/18 194/17 196/25 197/7 200/22	7/3 17/8 17/9 21/15
196/9 197/4 198/15	82/10 83/20 83/23 83/25 84/4 85/5 93/5	orient [1] 85/9 orientate [1] 190/16	205/16 205/18 205/19	33/6 33/6 35/5 35/6
199/18 200/4 207/17	94/23 96/11 97/7	oriented [1] 78/7	206/22	36/5 37/17 37/18
207/22 207/23 207/25	97/23 99/13 99/22	origin [1] 134/21	outbreak [6] 29/3	37/24 37/24 38/8
209/20 209/24 210/20	99/22 100/18 102/7	other [81] 3/14 6/23	57/3 79/10 124/14	47/20 48/19 48/19
one week [1] 112/22	102/12 103/2 104/6	8/6 8/8 8/16 8/22 9/2	124/24 128/2	48/19 56/21 56/25
ones [3] 198/15	104/14 105/18 106/6	9/3 9/12 10/18 11/15	outbreaks [4] 10/10	57/21 57/22 61/2 61/3
207/24 208/3	106/25 107/2 107/2	15/6 15/6 19/14 19/16		61/20 61/21 68/20
ongoing [3] 89/8 89/11 151/5	107/18 111/23 114/11	25/18 27/20 27/22	outcome [1] 17/20	68/24 90/11 91/5
online [1] 95/17	115/25 118/6 118/7	28/1 33/6 36/17 42/21	outcomes [1] 19/12	98/23 98/25 100/25
only [10] 10/7 22/17	119/10 119/14 123/1	43/16 44/16 48/24	outdoor [1] 37/23	110/18 111/23 113/25
32/19 63/5 82/7 88/10	123/1 123/7 123/7	49/14 49/23 50/9	outdoors [1] 60/18	
128/5 128/6 193/1	125/7 126/7 127/3	51/12 62/9 62/12	outlier [2] 9/6 64/14	114/15 116/9 118/18
195/16	131/14 134/13 134/16		outline [1] 153/20	119/1 119/20 119/20
ONS [1] 130/16	134/23 135/10 136/15		outlined [2] 29/3	119/25 122/21 122/23 123/20 124/11 124/15
onslaught [1] 82/19	138/9 141/4 141/13	72/8 72/10 73/12 74/2	123/23	125/2 125/15 127/13
onstream [1] 22/16	141/14 141/15 141/19 142/19 144/16 150/4	74/4 78/21 78/24 83/20 83/22 83/23	outlines [1] 173/16	127/19 128/16 131/5
onto [1] 149/23	151/22 161/1 163/8	84/3 89/18 96/10	outputs [2] 94/15 148/19	131/19 131/24 132/15
open [5] 54/21 54/24	171/25 172/1 174/19	97/18 109/19 117/25	outside [6] 86/17	133/5 133/6 141/11
116/21 137/20 163/16	17//20 178/1 178/10	124/10 126/18 129/4	162/6 163/1 163/7	142/4 142/5 143/4
opening [3] 55/2 55/6	178/24 179/7 181/16	129/10 131/14 132/18		149/11 149/12 149/22
		-		
				(78) officials - nage

(78) officials... - page

Р	80/15 83/12 83/22	21/23	161/13 192/5 208/25	14/9 48/5 49/13 51/11
page [20] 149/23	84/1 84/13 85/15	paragraph 26 [1]	party [1] 51/24	59/13 73/18 82/25
153/1 160/22 161/23	88/23 89/2 89/17	22/1	pass [1] 18/15	90/4 92/18 93/1 95/18
166/22 169/22 172/10	89/19 91/7 93/11 94/2		passage [2] 48/5	98/20 98/24 100/22
172/12 175/10 175/14	95/9 96/13 97/17	90/21	116/7	101/14 107/8 111/13
178/17 178/21 178/22	100/6 102/21 122/17	paragraph 3.9 [1]	passed [2] 20/20	114/7 115/18 119/3
182/6 187/20 187/21	135/15 138/13 138/15		56/11	135/1 138/22 140/21
187/23 190/24 208/9	140/1 143/18 153/22	paragraph 33 [1]	path [1] 57/11	148/9 157/21 160/11
212/2	154/25 156/23 158/18 158/23 159/5 159/15		patient [2] 61/14 96/4	160/16 180/4 182/10 185/13
page 1 [5] 110/18	159/21 162/7 162/10	paragraph 38 [1] 165/23	patients [17] 31/8 60/4 60/5 60/11 68/6	period [32] 7/15 7/24
111/23 125/2 143/4	162/18 163/2 165/22	paragraph 4 [3]	68/7 69/24 70/13	8/21 9/1 12/19 18/25
161/23	166/7 173/10 175/1	119/21 119/25 182/5	70/14 70/25 106/6	19/9 36/24 41/16
page 10 [2] 36/5	177/5 179/11 182/17	paragraph 41 [1]	121/13 121/24 122/14	80/15 94/16 95/4
208/9	184/22 186/22 187/15		124/1 127/8 142/7	101/6 101/23 103/3
page 101 [1] 57/21	190/10 193/9 197/13	paragraph 5 [2]	Patrick [6] 41/9	131/15 134/1 135/12
page 11 [1] 114/5 page 13 [1] 113/25	204/14 205/10 207/6	37/17 182/11	80/19 86/18 86/20	140/2 140/5 141/7
page 13 [1] 113/23	208/22 210/5 210/17	Paragraph 5.1 [1]	86/23 150/14	142/2 143/21 146/5
page 18 [1] 153/1	pandemics [2] 40/9	33/9	pattern [2] 156/9	146/7 184/23 185/20
page 189 [1] 116/9	77/20	paragraph 6 [1] 91/4	198/15	186/1 186/16 187/14
page 2 [14] 7/3 21/15	paper [7] 94/21	paragraph 6.6 [1]	paucisymptomatic	195/4 195/12
90/11 119/20 119/25	112/25 126/25 149/16		[1] 107/2	permanent [22] 4/5
123/20 125/15 127/13		paragraphs [4] 153/5	205/22	153/19 154/3 154/14 155/4 155/7 156/25
131/5 132/15 133/5	papers [16] 86/7 94/3 99/8 99/24 103/1	153/5 153/11 170/13 paragraphs 60 [2]	paused [2] 60/22	155/4 155/7 156/25
142/4 175/14 178/17	103/4 104/23 112/16	153/5 153/11	61/18	159/7 164/12 165/1
page 2.2 [1] 131/19	126/4 127/4 130/22	Paraguay [1] 154/11	pausing [1] 30/24	165/9 166/20 175/2
page 3 [4] 17/8	130/24 148/4 148/20	parallel [1] 30/1	peak [1] 103/20	177/6 178/3 179/15
114/10 122/21 124/15	162/15 194/7	paramount [1] 88/6	penultimate [4] 7/2	184/14 187/6 187/8
page 4 [4] 114/15 127/19 141/11 187/20	paragraph [54] 6/18	pardon [1] 44/1	17/8 33/6 142/5	permanent
page 5 [3] 35/5 37/17	7/3 17/8 20/7 21/16	Paris [1] 154/10	people [76] 9/4 15/5	secretaries [2]
128/16	21/23 21/23 22/1 22/1	part [21] 17/23 47/1	32/2 38/2 38/5 39/8	166/20 187/6
page 56 [1] 61/2	33/9 33/12 35/5 35/6	50/11 60/21 63/13	39/25 40/20 44/15	permanent secretary
page 57 [1] 61/21	36/5 37/17 38/9 69/8	77/14 77/24 78/7 78/8		[16] 153/19 154/3
page 6 [6] 33/6 37/24	73/17 73/20 82/6	78/16 89/21 95/24	60/10 60/13 63/22	154/14 155/4 156/25
124/11 160/22 172/10	90/11 90/21 91/4 104/21 110/18 110/21	97/13 97/17 181/5 185/18 196/10 196/20	67/14 67/15 68/12 70/20 70/25 71/3	157/8 157/20 159/7 164/12 165/1 165/9
190/24	111/24 114/15 119/21		71/20 72/7 72/16	175/2 177/6 178/3
page 61 [1] 47/20	119/25 124/17 125/2		72/16 73/9 74/16	179/15 184/14
page 62 [1] 48/19	127/14 127/19 128/16		85/19 85/21 87/17	permission [4]
page 7 [1] 178/21	136/25 141/11 149/10		88/15 98/5 100/1	207/22 207/23 208/1
page 70 [1] 1/22	149/16 149/18 165/23		104/25 105/4 106/6	209/21
page 72 [1] 3/17	170/17 171/5 172/12	145/8 198/20	106/24 107/1 107/5	permitted [2] 84/24
page 79 [1] 56/21 page 8 [1] 38/8	178/23 179/20 182/5	participate [4] 81/14	107/18 107/20 107/23	85/5
pages [2] 91/3 99/14	182/10 182/11 183/20		108/9 110/1 115/7	person [6] 60/14
pages 3 [1] 91/3	183/24 191/1 208/9	participated [1] 95/9	115/11 127/5 128/13	65/11 88/18 156/18
Paget [1] 4/7	208/10	participation [1] 97/8		172/24 203/24
pan [1] 105/1	paragraph 15 [1] 38/9	particular [22] 2/17 9/24 33/21 34/18	150/23 156/16 156/20 158/13 158/21 158/24	
pan-flu [1] 105/1	paragraph 16 [1]	66/14 73/10 74/3	165/3 169/8 169/12	176/2 176/15 176/17
pandemic [105] 3/21	127/19	74/12 74/23 92/8	171/19 181/21 186/2	176/22 180/5 180/8
3/25 4/9 5/8 5/10 5/15	paragraph 160 [2]	99/22 124/24 147/21	197/9 203/15 203/15	181/23
5/25 5/25 6/22 8/1	73/17 73/20	153/20 160/14 161/9	203/23 203/24 204/6	personally [5] 10/15
9/10 9/25 11/3 11/5	paragraph 17 [1]	162/2 168/11 175/1	204/11 204/15 204/19	
11/8 15/4 15/9 16/9 16/19 17/16 18/16	141/11	194/19 198/12 200/19	205/17 207/12 208/17	
23/8 26/1 26/3 26/25	paragraph 19 [1]	particularly [10]	209/5	personnel [1] 165/22
29/6 31/5 31/25 31/25	128/16	10/20 25/7 37/16	people's [2] 74/11	Persons [1] 196/13
38/7 38/25 41/21 43/7	paragraph 190 [3]	40/21 43/16 58/20	205/9	perspective [8] 80/3
43/17 45/25 46/18	149/10 149/16 149/18		per [1] 127/3	84/10 105/22 110/5
70/9 74/7 77/3 77/6	paragraph 2 [3] 35/5	203/22	per se [1] 127/3	115/12 115/17 138/24
77/9 77/24 77/25	35/6 110/21	partly [1] 118/13	percentage [1] 150/17	190/21
78/22 79/3 79/19	paragraph 23 [1] 21/16	partnership [1] 96/1 parts [8] 8/7 74/10	perhaps [35] 3/15	pessimism [1] 57/17 pessimistic [3] 57/2
79/21 80/1 80/6 80/10	paragraph 24 [1]	83/22 89/10 89/18	8/19 10/1 10/8 12/7	57/17 57/17
				(79) pago - possimistic

(79) page... - pessimistic

Р	93/9 93/19	181/1 182/25 183/1	portfolios [1] 159/17	199/9 207/24
Peter [1] 180/11	played [3] 42/2	202/5 206/16 207/13	Porton [2] 22/13	pre-announcing [1]
Peter Kennedy [1]	153/21 167/13	209/9	22/23	199/9
180/11	plays [2] 77/21 117/25	point 4 [1] 121/23 point 5 [1] 137/23	Porton Down [2] 22/13 22/23	pre-approved [1] 207/24
pharmaceutical [2]	please [93] 1/3 1/9	point 6 [1] 131/23	posed [3] 23/21	pre-Christmas [1]
119/11 131/7 phase [5] 6/21 11/7	3/16 7/2 17/8 19/24	point 7 [1] 122/1	92/15 185/10	142/2
31/11 59/7 184/22	20/7 21/9 28/20 30/10		position [14] 26/19	pre-symptoms [1]
phases [1] 18/14	30/21 32/24 33/5 35/6 36/6 37/14 37/18 38/9	points [9] 23/9 31/13 82/17 84/1 99/24	49/12 49/13 51/3 51/5 53/9 83/4 109/22	107/2 precarious [1]
phasing [5] 138/5	47/18 48/19 52/8 53/2	135/25 159/20 191/12		110/14
138/11 138/14 138/17 142/22	56/17 56/20 57/21	191/15	129/7 175/16 201/22	precautionary [8]
PhD [1] 76/18	60/24 62/24 67/18	policies [16] 101/4	positions [1] 158/14	20/1 20/22 21/10
PHE [1] 22/2	68/19 75/14 75/18 75/25 76/8 87/21 90/8	122/10 129/17 130/7 134/25 136/8 140/15	positive [8] 33/18 33/24 106/24 122/24	32/15 32/22 80/20 80/25 81/6
phone [2] 177/13 190/18	90/21 91/3 104/19	148/11 149/22 151/1	128/5 128/6 128/19	preceding [1] 135/13
phones [5] 175/23	104/21 106/9 106/14	175/1 175/5 180/2	195/7	precise [1] 184/24
176/4 176/8 176/9	109/4 110/16 110/21	182/17 183/5 206/13	positives [1] 30/19	predictability [2]
176/12	111/18 113/24 116/7 117/7 119/20 119/22	policy [88] 4/11 60/16 62/15 67/13	positivity [1] 133/8 possibility [2] 106/4	189/1 189/8 preferable [1] 56/10
phrase [2] 52/5	122/18 122/21 123/18		204/4	preferred [2] 54/24
203/12 pick [2] 126/24 206/1	124/7 124/7 124/15	71/19 72/21 76/25	possible [13] 8/10	87/18
picked [2] 111/15	125/15 127/19 128/16	77/12 78/4 78/7 82/9	25/19 41/9 50/18 54/6	preliminary [2] 128/4
170/4	131/5 131/19 131/23 132/15 133/2 133/15	93/22 94/18 95/20 96/2 96/16 97/9 97/14	87/17 110/10 123/14 143/7 172/14 193/24	128/7 preparation [1]
picking [2] 110/25	135/17 136/18 137/17	98/7 98/9 101/3	202/2 206/11	121/20
169/23 picture [5] 16/9	141/10 142/4 143/1	122/11 123/22 123/24		preparations [2]
100/16 111/2 111/16	145/18 152/7 152/8	123/25 124/3 125/23	112/1	165/14 166/8
133/13	152/11 152/17 154/22 160/22 164/15 169/18	127/9 128/25 129/5 129/19 130/6 132/24	possibly [2] 111/14 112/12	prepare [7] 26/3 26/5 79/12 158/22 158/23
pictures [2] 28/14	169/19 174/2 175/14	134/2 134/15 135/3	post [10] 2/12 3/24	186/9 193/24
41/18 piece [1] 102/7	178/17 178/22 179/17	142/6 142/19 142/20	4/6 5/2 5/8 76/14	prepared [2] 141/6
pieces [4] 62/1 93/25	179/20 182/2 187/18	143/1 143/16 147/9	76/19 139/24 142/22	162/16
94/4 126/5	197/12 199/1 202/10 202/11	148/9 148/19 148/21 150/1 150/23 150/24	168/9	Preparedness [3] 26/9 26/12 170/20
pin [1] 28/17	Pleasure [1] 1/8	158/2 158/21 160/1	post-firebreak [1] 139/24	preparing [1] 22/3
place [27] 12/13 20/24 25/14 25/17	plenty [1] 127/4	162/14 164/21 165/18		prescient [1] 17/21
34/13 50/6 62/9 71/4	plus [4] 146/7 168/17	166/6 167/21 169/1	115/25 191/15	present [6] 6/25
72/6 80/6 84/16 86/13	194/6 194/7 pm [5] 109/5 109/7	169/4 169/25 170/15	potential [10] 19/12 23/19 23/21 39/7 39/7	79/22 80/7 99/2 163/15 163/16
97/22 98/10 134/25	152/3 152/5 211/10	178/17 178/18 178/20		presented [6] 8/3
170/23 171/20 175/1 179/11 179/13 179/15	naint [04] 1/0/ 0/5	178/21 179/8 179/11	137/16 210/16	40/23 85/14 115/22
181/17 181/19 185/4	8/15 9/21 12/5 18/2	180/12 181/16 182/3	potentially [6] 21/25	138/21 158/6
187/12 189/14 197/18	18/5 23/17 24/1 25/16 26/2 27/2 29/2 30/17	182/9 193/8 194/9 197/22 199/10 199/11	22/3 46/6 46/18 71/1 71/18	presently [1] 114/13 presents [1] 122/15
placed [2] 105/21	30/21 31/5 31/14	199/11 200/19 201/6	power [2] 60/12	preservation [2]
108/19 plain [1] 184/8	35/24 36/17 37/17	202/9 203/8 203/20	117/25	179/10 184/7
plainly [1] 34/7	37/25 39/20 41/3	209/11	PPE [13] 45/10 45/18	
plan [17] 23/6 23/7	45/17 46/21 51/25 52/1 52/14 53/2 53/8	policymakers [1] 95/13	45/18 45/21 46/1 46/2 46/9 46/12 46/19	184/19 preserved [1] 180/25
23/12 31/2 31/12 36/3	54/14 57/5 57/10	policymaking [1]		preserved [1] 180/25 preserving [1] 39/12
36/6 39/3 94/16 109/9 109/23 118/7 118/12	57/12 57/16 59/5 62/6	150/12	practical [2] 157/8	president [1] 2/21
118/20 120/22 121/5	62/8 64/25 70/8 87/1	political [9] 48/20	158/12	press [8] 54/23 63/2
121/10	94/17 96/20 103/12 104/15 105/9 105/25	48/25 49/3 49/10 52/23 58/11 64/11	practicalities [2] 126/8 191/3	63/12 63/25 64/1 201/21 201/24 202/16
planning [17] 21/18	106/14 106/25 107/9	83/20 83/23	practically [1] 143/7	press release [1]
29/5 29/7 29/12 29/17 30/7 38/25 105/4	108/1 108/23 112/4	politicians [1] 55/9	practice [12] 2/19 3/9	63/2
132/17 132/21 133/10	112/6 118/2 121/23	politics [2] 117/15	3/13 9/19 15/23 74/13	pressure [9] 5/16
169/14 170/16 170/22	122/1 124/6 127/15 131/5 131/23 132/15	117/18 Poole [5] 54/19 109/8	84/12 95/23 157/10 157/11 167/5 183/11	38/14 97/21 136/11 143/6 180/7 193/23
171/2 171/13 173/11	136/2 137/23 138/3	145/12 148/25 151/20		143/6 180/7 193/23
plans [1] 22/3 platform [1] 179/24	139/1 141/1 141/3	population [5] 83/8	77/17 181/8	pressured [2] 180/5
play [4] 77/10 79/2	142/5 146/8 147/12	95/5 115/21 130/25	pragmatic [1] 38/18	181/22
	148/21 168/13 176/7	141/25	pre [4] 107/2 142/2	pressures [2] 39/13
				(90) Potor prossuros

(80) Peter - pressures

Ρ	18/7 18/17 28/1 28/15	141/16	protocol [1] 122/2	138/24 140/24 157/23
pressures [1]	28/16 30/15 41/17	Professor	proved [2] 32/2	160/9 174/17 184/19
43/15	43/12 48/2 49/24	Gravenor's [1] 98/1	140/15	185/11 202/1 202/4
presumably [7] 16/7	53/15 64/9 82/17 83/5 85/9 88/19 89/7 92/1	[3] 80/1 80/9 80/13	provide [19] 2/6 4/10 14/13 18/20 35/8	202/6 203/22 204/19
28/25 132/2 161/9	94/13 101/10 105/20	[3] 80/180/980/18 Professor Orford [2]	53/25 65/18 65/20	public's [1] 63/19 publication [4] 36/2
162/6 163/2 185/9	107/20 109/25 110/13	14/2 17/1	66/12 72/2 76/1 78/4	36/21 99/11 109/12
presymptomatic [3]	110/14 115/2 126/9	Professor Sir [5]	89/7 90/14 116/3	publicly [3] 63/10
125/12 127/3 127/5	128/11 129/22 139/24	10/6 12/22 19/21 41/8		93/13 99/14
pretty [6] 110/14	140/1 140/24 144/24	79/20	172/5	publish [4] 100/21
111/16 147/8 148/17 163/10 173/25	151/25 198/9	Professor Vallance	provide	195/9 195/15 195/16
prevalence [4]	problem [7] 11/1	[1] 14/4	evidence-based [1]	published [12] 36/11
139/16 142/17 146/2	54/11 57/24 92/19	Professor Whitty [8]	14/13	109/10 118/21 120/22
146/9	116/14 118/13 151/14			120/24 121/2 121/5
prevention [1]	problematic [1] 52/1	42/18 86/19 86/24	1/19 4/21 5/22 5/22	142/1 143/2 178/15
125/10	problems [2] 10/22 96/2	116/19 Professor Whitty's	18/8 33/11 46/6 69/7 71/13 72/14 90/25	194/13 196/9 publishing [1] 196/5
previous [4] 10/9	procedures [2]	[1] 9/17	93/20 93/23 94/8	pubs [3] 39/9 39/25
57/8 110/25 172/7	175/12 200/13	Professor Wincott [1]		115/11
previously [3] 20/2	proceeding [1] 34/5	156/3	143/21 152/19 156/8	pull [2] 62/21 73/18
110/20 111/13	process [28] 18/18	Professor Wincott's	providers [2] 72/2	pulled [4] 37/18
primacy [1] 101/17 prime [3] 38/12 72/1	22/11 42/10 42/14	[1] 156/11	121/19	41/23 41/23 128/16
192/21	59/6 59/11 59/19	Professor Young [1]	provides [2] 28/24	purely [3] 27/23 28/9
Prime Minister [1]	101/11 159/22 161/17	87/4	90/24	85/12
38/12		programme [3] 144/9		purpose [11] 86/5
Prime Minister's [1]	162/18 162/24 162/25 163/8 170/8 173/18	144/12 169/11	18/23 30/13 42/15	88/14 89/5 99/4 100/9 100/25 122/4 137/15
192/21	173/23 181/5 186/19	programmes [1] 92/4 progress [2] 137/6	93/16	166/4 166/5 175/11
Princess [2] 31/16	191/1 194/3 195/22	165/19	provision [3] 4/19	purposes [3] 6/25
106/16	196/5 210/21 210/22	progressed [2] 82/25		99/3 157/8
principal [6] 4/24 114/2 121/8 157/21	processes [8] 12/4	210/6	prudent [2] 40/5	pursued [1] 135/4
158/2 159/10	22/19 22/25 156/5	progressing [1]	115/13	push [3] 147/5
Principality [1] 37/7	162/19 163/3 194/1	138/15	public [120] 2/19	148/12 148/15
principle [1] 32/23	197/18	prohibit [1] 38/10	2/22 3/2 4/12 4/19	pushed [3] 139/17
prior [20] 5/10 11/3	procurement [1] 98/11	project [4] 14/19 171/7 171/24 172/5	4/24 7/5 7/10 9/17 9/20 10/8 15/1 15/11	140/1 146/3 put [18] 5/15 6/5
13/15 13/20 17/16	produce [2] 89/10	projections [1]	15/13 15/24 16/5 16/8	
20/11 21/3 56/23 68/4	94/10	138/23	17/14 17/19 22/2 22/6	
77/24 81/18 91/7 92/2	produced [3] 139/3	promote [3] 45/13	22/12 22/20 23/5	70/12 71/17 71/21
96/13 109/12 123/5 127/8 142/7 180/1	139/4 186/23	46/24 67/9	25/15 27/7 29/1 29/15	98/12 133/23 135/24
185/14	producing [1] 187/1	promoted [1] 173/24	29/20 29/23 36/15	142/20 197/18 205/21
priorities [4] 82/18	product [1] 97/24	promotion [1] 46/21	38/17 38/22 38/23	210/19
157/12 165/17 206/11	production [1] 95/25	prompt [1] 81/4	39/15 39/17 39/19	putting [4] 17/18
prioritisation [2]	professional [6] 2/15 8/15 8/16 76/17 97/5	promulgated [2] 84/18 104/16	44/25 45/1 47/16 49/6 49/7 49/16 49/23 50/4	49/11 65/5 179/2
166/13 166/13	97/19	pronounced [1]	50/16 53/3 53/10	Q
prioritise [2] 38/7	professionals [6]	210/5	53/24 54/12 55/4	quality [3] 97/23
195/13 priority [4] 28/6	126/14 185/18 209/24	proper [6] 157/23	55/25 56/8 63/8 63/9	158/6 161/2
45/11 82/14 105/16	210/3 210/12 210/19	177/21 179/9 183/14		quantitate [1] 104/24
private [12] 5/17	professor [32] 8/23	184/19 200/13	65/8 65/14 65/15	quarterly [1] 11/4
80/17 114/2 154/3	9/16 9/17 10/1 10/6	properly [5] 62/14	65/18 66/5 67/15 70/5	
177/2 181/18 182/4	10/23 11/13 12/22	163/5 163/6 181/9	70/12 71/11 72/4	Quentin [2] 108/13 117/8
182/25 183/14 183/18	14/2 14/4 17/1 19/21 41/8 42/18 51/14	201/16 proposed [1] 171/6	76/23 84/6 85/3 85/10 85/11 85/12 90/17	Quentin Sandifer [1]
200/12 201/1	76/24 79/20 80/1 80/9		90/19 91/8 92/3 93/2	117/8
private office [4]	80/13 86/19 86/24	protected [5] 43/8	93/5 95/4 96/4 96/18	query [1] 47/24
5/17 182/4 200/12	87/4 87/4 95/7 97/15	44/14 71/20 133/23	99/16 108/13 108/14	question [36] 20/19
201/1 private offices [2]	98/1 98/9 116/19	193/12	110/9 115/12 115/23	21/3 38/16 59/2 65/4
182/25 183/14	141/16 156/3 156/11	protection [9] 5/17	115/24 116/3 116/12	69/22 74/2 75/24 85/6
privilege [1] 118/10	Professor Ann John	12/23 42/11 46/6	116/22 117/9 117/15	109/18 110/25 111/7
privy [3] 84/17	[2] 51/14 95/7 Professor Crossman	76/23 79/9 89/22 103/13 136/5	117/18 117/22 117/23 118/11 119/16 121/17	114/11 114/16 117/19 121/14 129/22 130/14
104/14 104/16	[1] 87/4	protections [2] 25/16		133/15 135/8 139/19
probably [36] 16/6	Professor Gravenor	101/4	127/24 135/18 136/5	145/13 145/22 148/22
	[3] 97/15 98/9			
			l	(1) prossures - question

(81) pressures... - question

Q	ramifications [1]	188/8 188/17 190/22	163/18 181/20 195/4	56/12
· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	10/21	191/5 191/7 191/9	receiving [3] 6/4	reduction [1] 142/17
question [12] 148/25 149/6 150/3	ran [2] 46/1 60/6	191/13 191/16 200/15	20/11 180/1	ref [1] 98/6
167/10 172/2 177/15	range [15] 2/17 4/16	202/21	recent [1] 17/12	refer [11] 22/6 70/4
177/16 199/5 205/15	10/12 43/13 100/11	read-out [2] 80/20	recognise [8] 20/14	112/5 112/20 149/7
205/20 205/24 208/18	155/19 160/4 160/6	80/24	20/17 44/10 44/11	149/16 149/20 153/4
	162/16 169/4 169/10	readiness [1] 21/18	44/18 48/11 53/8 97/6	153/6 195/25 208/8
questioning [1] 101/2	186/21 194/5 199/7	reading [5] 34/19	recognised [5] 23/21	reference [12] 31/16
questionnaire [2]	207/2	62/1 109/18 120/1	28/10 39/22 88/8 88/9	48/20 64/16 73/17
181/4 181/7	rapid [1] 124/20	183/20	recognising [3]	83/9 90/9 106/16
questions [62] 1/5	rapidly [6] 55/24 57/9	reads [5] 48/20 56/22	13/21 49/9 52/20	134/5 167/4 177/9
3/5 9/8 18/24 42/9	64/23 69/14 71/15	58/14 104/22 123/21	recognition [2] 88/13	191/18 192/11
58/15 62/17 62/17	131/25	real [3] 23/19 74/7	150/10	referenced [1] 64/13
62/20 73/4 75/4 75/16	rarely [1] 159/9	129/18	recollect [3] 109/18	references [5] 2/4
84/20 85/9 88/25 90/4	rate [3] 41/19 106/20	realisation [1] 41/20	109/19 209/8	2/7 61/5 110/2 119/2
92/15 102/23 105/24	131/3	realised [1] 199/23	recollection [9]	referred [9] 5/5 22/5
113/20 118/14 118/20	rates [2] 55/23	realising [1] 44/7	12/15 163/21 173/19	169/5 177/8 182/15
121/13 122/10 130/13	139/11	realistically [1]	185/7 185/8 189/18	189/10 191/20 209/7
143/15 143/19 143/23	rather [19] 3/18	134/15	193/3 200/20 201/11	209/14
145/6 145/7 145/10	27/16 28/5 34/22	reality [1] 40/19	recommend [3] 45/5	referring [10] 2/2 2/8
148/9 149/3 150/24	39/18 88/20 109/22	really [49] 9/5 10/13	63/6 199/24	26/13 36/11 47/25
151/11 152/10 153/23	119/17 120/2 127/2	12/21 15/17 16/10	recommendation [1]	48/22 61/25 74/9
153/24 154/20 164/2	129/20 132/13 147/18	17/21 19/21 20/14	51/21	134/10 200/14
174/24 177/13 190/18	156/9 169/16 177/25	20/16 22/11 25/17	recommendations	refers [4] 29/13
193/5 197/12 198/18	190/7 209/16 210/19	27/1 28/14 32/19	[2] 142/21 149/24	106/14 118/22 141/12
198/19 198/22 205/12	ratio [2] 144/17	33/20 41/16 43/14	recommended [8]	reflect [5] 84/12
205/14 205/25 208/5	144/21 RODULAL 51/10 66/0	48/12 49/2 49/18	50/17 50/20 55/15	109/14 109/22 167/4
212/4 212/6 212/7	RCBI [4] 51/12 66/2	52/17 56/4 59/7 67/11	110/22 111/5 131/16	167/15
212/10 212/12 212/13	94/17 95/10	67/12 72/13 83/14 87/13 91/17 94/3	139/6 160/19	reflected [2] 141/5 189/6
212/16 212/18 212/19	re [7] 7/10 54/21 54/24 55/2 55/6		recommending [7]	
212/20	137/22 166/13	100/4 102/9 106/22	49/8 56/3 63/15 111/3 133/14 135/9 201/25	reflection [1] 168/1
quick [2] 177/18	re-deployed [1] 7/10	117/14 117/19 136/6	recommends [1]	reflections [1]
177/24	re-open [2] 54/21	143/23 160/7 171/11	147/19	105/20
quickly [3] 23/22	54/24	181/11 182/6 185/25	record [15] 11/16	reflects [1] 191/3
167/15 177/19	re-opening [2] 55/2	186/15 200/24 210/22		Reg [11] 137/18
quiet [2] 81/24	55/6	reason [4] 61/18 67/6		170/25 171/3 173/15
188/17	re-prioritisation [1]	92/2 137/6	16/16 29/22 179/1	173/22 174/5 174/11
quietly [1] 87/19	166/13	reasonable [5] 29/4	183/6 184/1 184/20	174/14 174/18 186/7
quintet [1] 177/8	reach [1] 14/7	29/7 29/7 104/24	206/17	197/24
quite [32] 17/21	reached [1] 16/24	144/22	recorded [16] 1/16	Reg Kilpatrick [10]
22/12 26/7 32/20	reaching [1] 108/15	reasonably [2]	22/12 75/24 132/5	137/18 170/25 171/3
35/24 41/3 41/15	reaction [2] 182/18	116/23 129/13	152/16 161/17 161/18	
49/12 51/19 55/25	182/24	reasons [4] 45/9	163/5 163/6 163/9	174/14 174/18 186/7
56/7 56/14 59/19	reactions [1] 205/9	94/12 197/22 198/2	163/10 163/25 177/24	I I I I I I I I I I I I I I I I I I I
59/19 59/24 69/10 72/10 74/12 78/17	read [70] 7/7 17/13	reassured [3] 195/19	178/10 180/18 186/20	Reg Kilpatrick's [1]
91/13 109/24 116/22	21/20 21/21 29/4 35/9		recording [3] 52/14	173/15
128/10 129/15 142/13	38/2 51/7 51/9 52/17	Rebecca [2] 51/4	178/8 180/3	Reg's [1] 170/18
142/21 171/16 186/13	58/4 58/5 58/5 62/5	51/23	records [9] 9/5 12/8	regard [8] 10/22 48/6
188/3 192/3 199/17	68/2 69/2 69/11 72/25		30/5 178/19 179/6	78/4 94/23 143/10
209/12	73/18 80/20 80/24	51/4	180/25 182/4 182/12	143/22 156/11 196/15
quizzically [1] 207/21	81/5 90/18 110/22	recall [18] 24/12	183/15	regarding [14] 26/10
quote [1] 63/12	111/25 114/14 114/19		recovery [6] 173/2	26/20 64/11 85/8
· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	120/3 122/24 123/23	40/15 52/7 61/9 61/10		107/12 115/5 117/10
R	124/20 125/4 125/18	61/17 148/16 169/7	173/13 173/15	118/22 123/25 132/24
R rate [1] 131/3	127/17 127/21 128/19	169/8 171/8 181/25	rectify [1] 170/6	137/16 138/3 141/6
raise [3] 5/20 188/4	131/9 131/21 132/1	185/20 186/24 209/3	red [1] 118/25	185/7
191/7	132/8 132/11 132/16	209/18	redacted [2] 28/18	regards [10] 2/15 4/9
raised [4] 5/19 7/9	133/7 133/10 137/2	recede [1] 74/15	202/18	7/12 17/22 51/23
43/6 170/2	137/25 142/7 143/6	receive [3] 70/13	reduce [8] 41/5 41/6	76/17 77/19 113/22
raises [2] 98/9	144/9 172/17 175/19	81/5 89/9	45/3 58/23 133/22	126/1 158/4
160/25	178/25 179/21 179/24 182/8 182/13 183/22	28/18 55/18 65/24	133/22 143/5 147/24	region [1] 126/10
raising [1] 68/17	184/1 187/25 188/4	95/7 102/5 102/6	reduced [1] 112/22 reducing [2] 29/14	regional [1] 19/13 register [2] 186/20
	107/1107/20100/4	JUL 102/J 102/U		100/20
				(82) question - register

(82) question... - register

R register [1] 186/23 regular [11] 8/22 9/12 29/24 90/25 98/18 129/3 177/9 180/21 187/7 198/14 198/15 regularly [5] 87/3 184/18 187/13 189/14 198/15 regularly [5] 87/3 184/18 187/13 189/14 197/7 regulations [5] 42/12 141/6 193/16 194/23 197/5 reimburse [1] 98/5 reinforcing [1] 51/2 reintroduce [1] 144/3 related [2] 56/19 207/8 relate [2] 56/19 207/8 related [6] 77/12 77/15 103/1 121/14 122/6 199/9 relating [3] 73/12 159/15 206/3 relating [3] 73/12 159/15 206/3 relation [14] 10/21 12/13 60/4 60/7 74/17 114/3 117/12 120/25 124/13 144/7 144/12 166/12 177/1 208/17 relations [1] 197/24 relations [1] 197/24 relationships [3] 10/18 101/14 187/4 relative [1] 130/25 relative [1] 130/25	202/13 202/25 remind [1] 75/22 reminders [1] 181/1 remit [1] 168/8 remote [1] 197/6 Render [5] 170/13 171/9 171/21 171/24 191/19 repeat [2] 20/19 32/19 repeatedly [1] 47/3 rephrase [1] 152/18 rephrase [1] 152/18 rephrase [1] 152/18 rephrase [1] 192/21 replied [1] 191/14 replies [5] 122/22 188/2 188/10 188/15 190/20 reply [5] 114/4 118/24 188/6 188/13 196/9 report [16] 17/5 17/6 17/20 26/18 100/8 100/14 101/20 125/20 146/14 146/16 156/8 161/18 161/24 161/25 165/15 181/6 reported [1] 3/25 reporting [4] 4/4 20/21 90/22 155/13 reports [2] 100/9 161/20 represent [6] 62/22 73/6 145/16 149/4 198/24 208/6 representative [3] 13/16 13/22 13/24 representatives [2] 20/4 84/24 representatives [3] 3 13/16 13/22 13/24 representatives [resolving [1] 54/11 resource [5] 7/1 7/14 46/3 167/2 195/10 resources [6] 8/11 18/7 46/8 166/14 167/21 170/11 respect [7] 80/1 136/1 170/13 184/15 193/9 193/18 194/24 respected [1] 38/12 respective [3] 20/9 21/1 90/12 respective [3] 20/9 21/1 90/12 respectively [1] 87/5 respond [8] 16/12 26/11 26/20 92/10 102/17 103/24 185/16 202/22 responders [1] 38/15 responding [1] 166/7 response [39] 7/11 14/15 17/23 24/5 25/21 33/14 38/7 56/19 64/23 78/13 78/16 80/2 83/21 83/22 83/24 83/25 90/15 95/9 102/15 107/14 111/20 144/3 156/9 159/15 161/14	results [4] 128/4 128/8 146/13 146/17 retained [2] 178/11 183/4 retention [3] 179/4 183/6 200/8 retired [1] 154/16 retrospect [1] 198/14 return [3] 54/15 166/16 211/9 returning [2] 154/2 190/14 Reverend [3] 195/5 196/2 196/7 Reverend Coombs [3] 195/5 196/2 196/7 reversed [1] 72/22 review [11] 42/9 42/14 84/15 84/17 100/23 162/17 162/25 173/17 173/23 193/16 206/24 reviewed [3] 42/12 178/16 179/14 reviews [5] 73/22	43/8 45/21 45/25 46/1 58/19 60/6 60/9 60/14 66/14 66/14 70/2 71/21 89/8 89/21 94/6
relevant [4] 160/3 160/6 161/13 164/17 reliant [5] 7/6 23/1 118/23 158/24 171/16 relied [1] 120/5 relieving [1] 136/11	repurposed [1] 102/14 request [2] 145/19 209/22 requested [1] 47/13 requesting [1] 197/17 requests [4] 13/15 13/17 101/8 147/10 require [5] 98/5 161/25 168/2 182/12 208/17 required [12] 10/1 42/12 53/23 57/4 68/4 68/14 123/5 128/22	56/19 64/23 78/13 78/16 80/2 83/21 83/22 83/24 83/25 90/15 95/9 102/15 107/14 111/20 144/3 156/9 159/15 161/14 166/20 169/25 170/16 173/9 185/15 185/18 196/4 200/23 209/5 209/25 210/4 210/8 210/10 210/13 responses [3] 25/24 95/20 181/12 responsibilities [6] 77/5 77/9 78/21 103/3	100/23 162/17 162/25 173/17 173/23 193/16 206/24 reviewed [3] 42/12 178/16 179/14 reviews [5] 73/22 74/1 193/17 194/25 195/3 revised [1] 190/11 revisit [1] 84/9 rhythm [1] 11/9 right [131] 2/13 2/14 3/1 3/7 3/12 3/13 4/2 4/10 4/18 5/3 5/13	risk [33] 24/20 24/23 25/11 25/15 32/12 43/8 45/21 45/25 46/1 58/19 60/6 60/9 60/14 66/14 66/14 70/2

(83) register... - risky

R	S	Sandifer [7] 27/5	190/17 200/25 202/19	
risky [1] 46/24	safeguards [1]	108/13 108/19 117/8	says [26] 14/20	3/16 19/24 30/16 51/7
Robert [5] 5/7 75/14	180/16	117/11 117/13 117/19		52/8 76/6 80/22 98/22
75/15 75/19 212/9	safely [3] 68/8 72/9	Sandifer's [2] 108/17	31/14 32/6 58/6 90/24	100/8 103/17 121/21
robust [4] 22/21	72/16	117/17	95/23 106/14 108/21	122/18 125/11 131/4
22/22 49/20 79/15	safer [1] 72/19	SARS [3] 19/17 107/6		154/22 159/24 174/2
Roche [5] 119/2	safest [1] 71/4	125/18	161/23 170/14 175/15	
119/11 119/12 119/17	safety [3] 88/17	SARS-CoV-1 [1] 107/6	178/14 178/23 179/6	se [1] 127/3
120/10	117/15 117/18	SARS-Cov-2 [1]	184/11 188/22 190/24 191/11 199/22 200/1	150/21
role [45] 3/5 4/9	SAGE [68] 13/5 13/6	125/18	scale [7] 25/21 25/24	second [36] 6/18
65/18 65/20 66/16	13/8 13/9 13/16 13/19	sat [4] 4/19 9/7 93/4	118/4 118/12 121/10	19/13 42/19 45/12
77/7 77/10 77/14	13/22 13/25 16/20	172/6	129/11 131/8	46/21 52/13 55/1 55/5
77/19 77/21 77/25	20/2 20/22 21/10 23/9	satisfy [2] 71/19	scanned [1] 47/3	56/5 63/18 68/20 81/1
78/2 78/6 78/7 78/8	30/14 30/18 39/5	71/22	scans [1] 165/18	82/14 88/20 90/11
78/8 78/9 79/2 79/18	39/16 39/21 55/15	Saturday [2] 37/6	scarce [1] 46/3	98/24 100/7 111/23
79/22 85/11 86/25	63/11 78/23 78/23	40/4	scenario [6] 23/25	112/3 113/16 118/18
93/10 93/19 153/20	80/20 80/25 81/6	saw [7] 19/7 25/11	29/4 29/7 132/17	124/17 124/17 124/18
155/4 155/6 156/25 157/1 157/18 157/19	81/10 81/11 81/17 82/3 82/4 82/7 82/18	36/2 91/19 130/8	144/20 144/21	127/14 136/24 149/23
158/4 164/14 167/7	83/9 83/14 83/17	133/12 187/24	scenarios [2] 133/10	156/15 158/1 162/14
167/8 167/13 167/14	84/10 84/16 84/17	say [112] 3/1 4/10 6/1		172/12 178/13 179/19
168/7 170/12 170/19	86/9 86/17 86/21 93/8	6/14 6/19 7/4 7/8 7/12	SCGs [1] 170/19	187/22 191/1 207/23
170/20 172/7 173/6	94/13 95/1 99/8 99/20	8/14 9/12 9/23 12/17	scheduled [3] 37/6	second-hand [1]
173/14 174/12	99/22 100/3 103/4	13/3 15/12 15/25	40/4 135/20	88/20
roles [6] 9/20 77/5	104/23 106/11 106/23			seconded [2] 154/1
103/2 157/4 158/16	107/15 111/11 115/4	19/11 19/16 23/18	130/9 196/14 196/19	154/9
169/16	124/13 128/3 131/16	27/3 32/19 34/3 34/9	school [2] 138/9	secretariat [7] 11/14
roof [1] 155/21	131/20 132/3 132/4	34/17 40/12 40/17	138/13	85/6 87/14 173/2
room [1] 155/22	133/11 135/6 135/14	45/10 45/12 45/14	schools [5] 54/21	173/5 173/7 173/13
Rooney [3] 68/17	135/16 138/8 140/25	48/16 51/16 52/21 61/12 63/24 69/11	54/24 55/2 55/6 116/20	secretaries [3] 166/20 183/18 187/6
68/23 69/22	142/14	73/15 73/19 77/10	science [27] 4/21	secretary [25] 4/6
rotated [1] 11/5	SAGE's [1] 140/10	77/21 79/24 82/6	14/6 39/22 39/22 64/4	80/18 114/2 153/7
roughly [1] 161/4	said [56] 2/11 10/17	82/12 83/19 84/8	64/5 65/24 66/13	153/19 154/3 154/3
round [2] 177/22	22/23 23/3 23/12 24/5	84/22 88/4 91/22 93/7	66/19 66/24 67/2 80/3	154/14 155/4 155/8
191/8	24/17 27/19 28/4 28/5	98/6 99/12 99/19	83/21 83/25 86/2 86/3	156/25 157/8 157/15
route [2] 18/14	32/9 33/25 50/23	100/15 102/5 102/25	86/4 86/6 94/24	157/20 158/13 159/7
177/19 routed [1] 101/18	50/25 51/7 55/1 59/3 63/18 68/3 73/20	103/21 104/20 106/1	102/17 114/18 126/5	164/12 165/1 165/9
routes [1] 6/5	83/10 95/10 95/12	106/3 107/5 109/11	148/7 150/13 150/18	175/2 177/6 178/3
routine [3] 74/11	97/1 103/7 103/16	111/23 113/14 113/17	150/21 150/22	179/15 184/14 187/8
126/2 128/23	103/17 105/14 116/10	120/4 120/9 126/6	scientific [30] 5/5	sector [4] 8/11 71/25
routinely [1] 34/18	119/25 121/23 135/13	129/8 136/14 136/25	16/22 76/13 77/4 77/8	72/5 208/14
Rt [2] 141/13 141/14	135/14 144/6 146/3	137/23 140/9 141/2	77/11 77/16 78/13	secure [1] 189/21
rugby [7] 37/3 37/5	146/4 146/14 146/14	141/4 144/24 145/12		Sedwill [1] 153/6
37/10 40/3 114/16	146/22 147/17 155/18	148/14 152/22 156/6	80/18 83/24 84/1	see [69] 1/20 3/21
115/9 115/10	156/9 167/20 171/15	156/13 156/21 157/7	84/11 84/14 86/16	3/23 6/17 17/7 20/6
rules [2] 204/6 204/7	173/3 184/18 186/5	158/5 158/11 159/1 159/8 163/6 163/7	86/25 87/25 88/22 90/13 94/24 95/23	27/2 27/9 28/13 28/14 47/22 49/5 49/8 51/9
run [5] 41/3 60/11	193/6 194/6 200/3	169/22 170/9 170/17	90/13 94/24 95/23	52/16 56/24 57/9 61/2
78/21 99/13 114/11	200/21 201/9 201/23		125/22 129/21 150/15	61/3 61/21 66/8 67/7
run-up [1] 41/3	207/5 209/14 210/21	184/23 185/17 186/18		68/21 68/25 69/5
Runeckles [8] 52/11	Sally [1] 207/5	187/5 187/21 189/16	79/15	72/20 76/3 76/6 83/11
52/12 64/12 182/19	Sally Holland [1]	195/14 196/5 198/8	scientist [3] 76/21	84/6 90/11 91/20 95/2
199/16 200/5 200/9	207/5	200/11 202/15 203/24		98/14 98/23 105/6
200/21 Bupacklas' [1]	same [26] 23/16 27/9	204/24 207/4 208/9	scientists [4] 46/23	109/24 114/7 116/7
Runeckles' [1] 188/21	29/19 30/8 53/13 106/11 107/9 107/25	209/19	51/13 92/19 97/12	118/18 118/25 121/21
running [7] 28/15	109/21 115/18 125/6	saying [29] 4/18 6/13	scope [2] 182/6	121/23 124/11 131/3
45/25 46/19 205/16	125/25 128/11 135/14	7/20 9/22 20/17 20/23		131/18 132/14 133/3
205/18 205/19 211/3	145/14 155/22 156/18	25/3 25/25 39/11	Scotia [1] 2/25	134/13 136/25 149/13
runs [1] 91/4	163/10 167/19 172/9	46/16 49/4 60/3 78/1	Scotland [4] 37/6	153/2 155/2 155/4
rural [1] 172/8	174/1 188/24 197/3	81/9 90/6 93/15 97/25		155/12 160/8 160/10
	198/1 200/7 201/4	106/23 111/9 123/11	Scottish [5] 38/1	160/11 160/13 160/17
	sampling [1] 21/22	124/22 137/20 154/16 164/10 171/3 172/13	38/13 40/2 115/9 190/1	160/23 160/25 174/4 174/6 175/10 199/6
		104/10 1/1/3 1/2/13	130/1	174/0 175/10 199/0
				(94) rieku

(84) risky... - see

S	89/13 174/9	Shankar [1] 136/4	112/21 142/16	150/14 178/3 204/22
	sequential [1] 125/3	shape [1] 48/14	shows [1] 154/23	212/3
see [3] 203/3 203/12 203/13	series [1] 15/13	share [8] 27/14 27/15		Sir Chris [1] 63/10
seeding [1] 112/15	serious [3] 92/4	80/8 86/10 99/16	62/1 62/1 84/20	Sir Chris Whitty [4]
seeing [3] 26/23	170/21 185/10	103/11 137/2 187/11	137/21 164/22 202/21	86/23 111/21 116/4
109/19 188/9	seriously [2] 43/20	shared [11] 11/15	210/20	116/10
seek [2] 46/23	95/2	19/16 19/22 20/5	sight [2] 137/24	Sir Chris Whitty's [1]
126/23	seriousness [1] 51/2	62/15 93/13 93/22	188/11	116/24
seeking [2] 83/2	servant [4] 83/20	121/11 147/9 148/5	signal [2] 38/23	Sir Chris Wormald
199/11	83/23 84/4 179/22	167/17	116/18	[1] 178/3
seem [2] 38/18 43/14	servants [8] 3/14	sharing [10] 12/1	signalled [1] 116/11	Sir Frank [31] 1/7 1/17 2/2 2/11 3/17 6/9
seemed [1] 62/6	90/17 150/17 155/13 157/2 160/3 162/17	12/1 13/2 16/2 16/13 86/14 126/25 137/7	signals [1] 169/23 signed [8] 1/23 68/1	7/8 9/8 18/24 28/21
seems [4] 13/3 34/9	181/22	167/8 192/13	68/11 68/15 76/7	33/2 33/22 35/3 37/15
57/13 200/1	served [2] 2/21	she [13] 10/20 51/7	152/21 178/20 181/9	42/8 44/20 45/19 48/4
seen [11] 8/10 17/22	154/10	66/4 66/5 69/23 85/17	signed off [3] 68/11	52/10 53/11 54/20
35/12 37/2 83/16	service [17] 3/9	95/8 95/10 95/12	68/15 181/9	56/14 58/15 62/22
141/1 147/16 148/12	103/23 150/16 153/25	144/6 188/22 195/19	significance [2]	64/16 65/4 73/6 75/4
	154/17 155/8 157/1	198/2	161/7 205/8	75/6 102/10 204/22
self [1] 168/1 self-reflection [1]	157/3 157/5 157/14	she's [2] 69/2 85/17	significant [24] 6/20	Sir Frank Atherton
168/1	158/2 160/1 161/11	shedding [1] 106/3	8/9 24/19 24/23 25/11	[2] 1/3 1/11
send [5] 39/18	166/1 185/16 211/3	shielded [2] 60/2	27/21 60/14 70/2 79/2	Sir Patrick [1] 86/20
	211/3	61/4	93/10 93/19 103/9	Sir Patrick Vallance
200/21	services [16] 3/23	shielding [12] 58/16	104/11 105/3 105/7	[5] 41/9 80/19 86/18
Senedd [4] 176/4	33/10 38/18 39/13	59/6 59/8 60/16 60/17		86/23 150/14
176/8 176/9 176/10	47/12 69/6 74/15 74/25 90/23 90/25	60/20 60/22 60/23 61/7 61/12 69/25	140/16 140/18 145/1 157/13 197/7 207/1	Sir Whitty [1] 86/21
senior [21] 5/11	91/1 121/7 130/24	170/20	significantly [2]	SIRO [1] 175/7 sit [3] 170/18 174/15
15/24 15/24 16/5	139/12 150/20 174/17	shifting [1] 186/15	79/15 103/18	174/19
52/12 80/17 99/9	sessions [1] 169/6	ship [3] 31/15 106/15		sits [3] 26/14 90/23
105/21 117/4 155/13	set [18] 14/25 16/25	106/17	Signs [1] 188/14	166/22
	17/3 18/14 25/2 29/13		similar [6] 50/18 51/5	1 1
164/18 164/21 166/6	74/20 92/11 94/20	shores [1] 34/7	60/1 164/5 166/10	155/5
167/2 170/11 175/7 180/19 191/24	138/20 157/12 160/4	short [16] 42/9 46/18	180/19	situate [1] 201/20
sense [7] 62/13 78/3	160/21 167/1 181/7	54/17 56/13 62/23	Simon [3] 173/14	situation [10] 30/3
84/5 90/1 115/16	189/17 198/4 200/22	102/22 109/6 131/15	173/18 174/1	35/8 57/15 70/7
122/9 146/24	set-up [1] 16/25	135/10 152/4 177/23	Simon Brindle [3]	114/14 119/4 120/2
sensible [1] 125/4	sets [1] 36/6		173/14 173/18 174/1	133/5 137/8 163/20
sensitive [2] 99/7	setting [8] 67/25 68/5		simple [2] 21/7 56/6	situational [7] 16/10
107/17	71/7 104/14 120/25 123/6 162/20 194/16	shortage [1] 46/9 shorter [1] 111/13	simplifying [1] 99/25 simply [6] 21/3 38/16	86/15 89/24 100/7 100/9 100/11 100/13
sensitivities [1] 85/8	settings [4] 46/15	shortly [2] 69/16	50/2 81/21 111/4	six [7] 37/5 60/18
sent [20] 19/23 21/3	47/16 123/10 123/20	135/19	168/20	114/16 121/9 128/1
70/4 104/18 104/20	settled [1] 11/9	should [52] 13/9	since [7] 2/13 5/1	128/2 165/11
106/10 111/18 111/21	seven [6] 146/5	15/21 28/10 32/16	35/11 35/15 76/15	Six Nations [2] 37/5
114/1 123/19 135/18	1/6/15 1/6/21 1/7/6	34/11 39/13 39/14	88/22 190/11	114/16
136/19 147/16 177/12 177/22 179/18 183/18	117/25 181/1	39/15 40/9 40/24 41/1	single [2] 65/15	six weeks [1] 165/11
186/7 190/17 201/1	seven months [1]	45/7 55/21 58/25 59/2		sixth [2] 30/17 81/11
sentinel [4] 83/6	184/4	61/7 63/17 65/6 65/13		size [2] 83/8 130/4
107/16 111/15 127/1	seven weeks [1]	67/13 83/15 88/6	1/11 1/13 1/17 2/2	skewed [1] 85/13
separate [10] 13/13	146/15	93/12 100/1 110/9	2/11 3/17 6/9 7/8 9/8	skills [7] 10/11
18/20 82/24 138/20	Seventh [1] 107/9		10/6 12/22 18/24	158/15 158/22 170/10
147/10 148/6 182/12	several [3] 84/23	111/7 114/11 115/25 136/2 139/12 150/4	19/21 28/21 33/2 33/22 35/3 37/15 41/8	171/20 172/23 172/25
197/7 201/19 206/25	97/3 130/22 severely [1] 58/20	162/18 174/22 176/25		skip [1] 22/1 skipping [1] 183/24
separation [1] 3/11	severity [2] 57/3	178/19 180/4 180/14	44/20 45/19 48/4	Slade [6] 170/9
September [16]	57/11	182/25 183/4 184/12	52/10 53/11 54/20	
18/17 53/20 53/22	shall [4] 6/10 6/12	193/25 194/20 195/2	56/14 58/15 62/16	188/15 190/20
54/8 55/15 55/16	54/15 211/9	195/14 198/14 199/12		slightly [9] 42/8
55/19 89/13 130/16 131/2 131/4 131/16	Shan [12] 152/8	206/5 206/7 210/7	65/4 73/6 75/4 75/6	49/13 49/17 59/23
132/6 134/6 174/9	152/9 152/13 152/19	shouldn't [1] 201/5	79/20 80/19 86/18	81/7 88/25 126/9
199/21	174/24 188/3 198/18	show [3] 67/19	86/20 86/21 86/23	145/14 164/2
September 2020 [2]	198/24 208/6 210/2	127/10 134/16	86/23 102/10 111/21	slow [1] 139/8
	211/1 212/15	showed [3] 41/9	116/4 116/10 116/24	slowed [1] 140/2

(85) see... - slowed

S	188/25 190/14 191/4	199/20 200/6 200/20	133/13 135/9 155/13	76/7 76/9 140/4
slowly [1] 96/3	193/5 197/12 198/19	speak [1] 37/9	166/18 170/24 205/18	
small [13] 7/6 15/25	200/15 205/14	speaks [1] 43/19	stages [6] 14/24 15/8	
39/8 47/7 123/16	somebody [3] 128/9	special [8] 52/12	31/25 83/12 94/13	statistics [2] 130/19
138/16 150/17 156/16	202/18 204/1	182/12 182/20 182/21		130/22
158/19 158/20 158/24	somehow [1] 12/25	199/7 199/22 200/6	stakeholders [1]	status [3] 84/21 85/5
171/9 171/16	someone [2] 7/22	201/3	150/5	144/16
so [368]	135/18	specific [13] 12/11	stamped [1] 180/10	stay [3] 59/8 59/16 105/3
social [31] 3/23	something [24] 14/22 26/3 43/13 48/8	15/11 16/22 25/16 44/13 47/13 74/19	stance [3] 49/21 49/22 64/8	staying [1] 71/2
33/10 46/7 47/12	48/10 49/17 50/7	88/1 91/18 145/19	stand [1] 136/14	steady [1] 89/19
50/18 54/6 58/21	67/10 93/6 97/6 98/14		standard [1] 186/18	stenographer [1]
58/23 61/15 69/6	105/18 128/24 138/12		standards [1] 45/16	205/16
90/23 90/25 91/1	165/6 165/7 168/24	22/6 119/1 148/14	standing [3] 18/1	step [6] 17/24 18/6
93/25 95/19 101/21 110/10 121/7 121/17	170/6 181/3 184/15	162/23 169/7 181/25	18/3 193/2	31/3 36/25 52/21
121/19 126/17 137/8	186/9 200/17 203/4	184/6 209/2	stark [2] 132/13	84/20
150/19 154/10 175/9	205/4	specifics [1] 155/6	135/7	steps [10] 13/20
178/4 187/9 202/1	sometimes [7] 8/23	specified [1] 187/13	start [23] 1/9 3/5 3/25	
202/2 209/7 209/15	11/8 36/19 57/18 62/3		9/10 15/11 25/22	59/4 73/11 74/4 74/17
social care [5]	93/24 99/13	spent [3] 49/25 53/18		74/19 107/13
101/21 121/17 126/17	soon [4] 13/25 17/4	113/3 SPLIEL 04/14 04/14	77/9 80/6 80/9 83/17	stick [2] 68/24
209/7 209/15	112/1 143/7	SPI [5] 94/14 94/14 95/1 99/22 150/22	96/12 97/25 104/24 129/7 130/8 152/11	100/24
Social media [1]	sooner [7] 7/14 55/22 56/6 111/8	SPI-B [2] 94/14 95/1	153/23 154/20 159/22	sticking [3] 57/20 107/25 162/23
175/9	111/9 129/5 147/18	SPI-B [2] 94/14 93/1 SPI-M [2] 94/14	167/9	still [15] 25/14 29/23
socially [2] 73/9	sorry [27] 20/19	99/22	started [9] 13/25	33/14 36/14 36/16
73/24	22/23 26/17 43/24	spider [1] 61/22	14/1 15/19 22/15	36/24 39/1 102/18
societal [1] 42/21	44/1 49/1 59/2 63/8	spike [1] 61/3	28/13 28/14 74/15	128/11 128/13 134/3
society [6] 42/25 60/8 70/18 71/13	69/23 73/15 79/15	spirit [2] 191/5	163/13 189/25	141/17 161/22 167/4
74/10 198/16	87/22 96/22 107/9	192/13	starting [8] 8/1 24/4	174/15
socio [1] 44/16	124/4 125/8 126/16	spoke [1] 116/5	25/18 27/1 30/8 35/6	stock [2] 45/10 45/18
socioeconomic [4]	132/24 142/11 151/12		57/9 146/8	stood [3] 102/13
42/21 74/20 92/24	153/1 160/16 160/16	12/25 28/7 87/20	starts [3] 37/25	102/20 186/11
93/24	202/1 206/6 207/16	sporadic [1] 31/6	135/24 202/14	stop [3] 34/11 115/16
soft [1] 13/2	207/20	sporting [2] 116/11 116/20	state [6] 29/11 63/14 89/19 107/10 125/2	115/18 stored [1] 184/12
softly [1] 6/11	sort [22] 2/9 12/7 16/13 17/4 37/10	sports [1] 114/11	134/1	strains [1] 57/8
SOLACE [1] 198/16	57/15 61/3 88/12	spread [6] 19/14 24/2		strand [1] 30/1
solely [2] 81/25	92/16 134/6 152/7	29/14 45/3 57/9 69/11		strands [1] 100/15
93/14	159/12 163/1 165/18	spreading [4] 34/12	116/19	strange [2] 80/23
some [85] 2/2 3/5 3/14 5/23 6/14 7/11	166/11 169/6 172/16	35/23 69/14 71/15	statement [74] 1/17	81/4
9/8 10/9 12/10 12/17	180/15 180/21 181/3	spreadsheet [1]	1/19 1/23 1/24 5/15	strategic [5] 27/6
13/2 15/1 18/24 19/4	189/3 190/13	145/15	7/8 8/14 9/21 11/7	27/13 150/9 167/7
19/5 22/19 39/1 42/9	sort of [14] 17/4	springs [1] 208/19	12/17 15/12 19/3 19/7	170/16
50/14 58/15 61/14	37/10 88/12 92/16	St [2] 154/15 154/15	20/15 23/18 40/13	strategy [13] 36/10
62/5 62/6 62/17 68/6	134/6 159/12 163/1	St George [1] 154/15		36/12 111/22 118/15
69/7 78/6 88/25 90/4	165/18 166/11 169/6 180/15 180/21 189/3	St Michael [1] 154/15 Stadium [1] 37/7	55/5 63/13 63/25 64/1 72/23 72/25 73/18	120/25 121/2 121/4 135/20 136/2 136/3
92/6 92/12 92/17	190/13	staff [13] 3/8 7/11	76/3 76/4 76/8 78/11	154/7 165/12 192/22
98/16 98/18 102/23	sought [1] 47/14	27/9 45/12 98/12		strengthen [2] 17/14
105/2 111/17 112/3	sound [1] 129/3	126/12 127/2 128/6	87/7 88/4 91/22 93/7	17/18
113/20 115/3 121/12	sounded [1] 202/17	128/23 129/4 159/12	102/25 106/4 108/12	strengthened [1]
123/12 123/17 130/13 134/7 135/24 136/20	sounds [1] 125/4	170/11 171/17	109/10 112/20 121/17	
137/1 138/7 138/11	source [1] 35/17	staffing [2] 87/14	140/5 141/4 142/1	strengthening [1]
139/20 143/1 143/15	sources [5] 4/23 9/9	164/23	143/22 144/6 147/14	186/2
143/19 144/3 144/19	9/10 15/10 15/11	stage [34] 2/8 19/7		stress [3] 28/15 46/1
144/23 145/7 145/23	South [1] 77/1	19/16 23/3 23/11	153/13 153/17 155/16	
150/18 154/20 159/20	South Wales [1] 77/1	23/20 23/24 25/14 26/6 26/21 29/8 29/18	157/7 157/19 158/11 159/8 161/1 165/6	stringent [1] 58/20
164/2 165/3 165/20	space [1] 194/24 spaces [5] 45/2	33/15 34/17 36/14	165/23 165/24 169/7	strong [1] 208/11 struck [3] 16/19
168/13 169/16 170/11	50/15 50/17 53/24	41/25 44/19 46/17	173/15 174/8 184/24	117/24 200/17
170/21 171/11 172/5	63/9	52/6 54/7 58/25 69/14		structure [5] 17/16
174/24 175/5 177/3	SpAd [1] 199/22	69/20 86/13 111/6	201/21 208/8	154/23 154/25 190/4
177/25 178/10 184/3	SpAds [4] 169/23	120/6 120/8 132/21	statements [4] 76/2	190/9
				(96) alowly atrusture

(86) slowly - structure

S	summarised [1]	Suspending [1]	TAG [58] 17/4 17/16	171/10 171/21 171/22
structures [14] 9/14	184/12	122/2	17/17 17/22 18/1 18/4 18/8 18/11 18/11	171/24 172/1 172/1 172/3 172/4 172/5
86/12 154/21 156/14	summarises [1] 160/19	sustainable [1] 141/22	18/14 18/18 18/23	172/18 182/20 185/22
156/19 165/21 169/17	summarising [1]	sustainably [1] 137/3		191/16 191/18 191/19
172/19 176/11 187/25 188/22 189/1 189/9	99/25	sustained [3] 35/9	66/17 66/18 66/19	193/22
197/18	summary [14] 54/2	35/19 69/20	66/24 66/25 76/5	teams [2] 170/22
stuck [1] 58/2	98/21 99/1 99/5 99/6	Swansea [1] 97/16	78/17 78/20 90/12	172/3
studied [1] 2/15	100/10 109/20 119/4	swift [1] 92/9	91/5 91/6 91/8 91/19	technical [21] 14/16
study [6] 112/21	119/15 131/4 132/8 133/3 136/22 175/16	swiftly [3] 82/20 109/25 138/17	93/8 93/17 93/20 94/6 95/10 96/25 97/2	16/25 17/1 17/23 24/1 26/15 66/18 77/11
125/10 125/12 125/16	summer [1] 94/21	Swiss [1] 119/11	97/18 98/16 100/23	79/23 80/12 85/16
125/24 127/23	Sunday [1] 110/1	sworn [2] 1/4 212/3	101/9 101/15 101/15	89/25 90/3 90/10
Sturgeon [1] 50/14 subgroup [11] 66/2	supermarkets [2]	symptomatic [6]	102/1 102/6 102/11	90/13 90/14 96/7 98/2
66/19 67/3 74/20	53/5 64/15	68/7 70/15 71/17	102/13 102/18 123/1	99/25 114/6 136/7
79/10 91/23 93/6	supplement [1]	128/5 128/7 128/12	123/7 123/12 139/3	technically [1] 15/5
93/16 94/7 94/10	101/4 supply [1] 120/19	symptoms [8] 32/3 68/13 106/3 106/25	139/6 140/4 142/1 142/10 143/1 143/21	technology [1] 183/11
95/10	supplying [1] 119/12	107/2 107/2 107/3	147/15 147/18	telephone [1] 30/5
subgroups [4] 78/23	support [31] 5/13	128/13	TAG/TAC [1] 147/15	telescope [1] 110/4
91/20 91/22 94/20 subject [4] 53/16	5/21 5/23 5/24 6/2 6/7	synthesise [2] 79/22	take [37] 7/22 9/4 9/5	tell [7] 2/9 74/19 89/5
137/19 161/10 162/1	6/15 7/1 7/11 7/13	89/10	12/5 13/20 13/23 17/5	
subjects [1] 169/1	7/19 7/23 8/6 8/6 8/12		24/8 35/5 36/20 36/25	
submission [2] 160/1	8/18 8/25 9/4 48/3 53/17 63/19 87/15	29/21 46/7 60/11 70/5 107/16 126/22 127/2	43/9 43/20 44/20 58/22 59/4 63/25 66/7	telling [3] 186/3 186/4 190/11
160/2	87/17 101/5 105/1	151/15	73/11 88/16 109/16	temperature [1]
submitted [1] 127/11	105/5 140/11 150/23	systems [4] 4/17	121/3 125/6 138/1	152/7
subsequent [3] 140/6 140/12 195/3	150/25 158/15 176/13		147/17 151/22 152/1	template [4] 162/19
subsequently [1]	supported [1] 5/1	 т	155/23 163/1 166/12	194/2 194/8 194/16
181/10	supporting [2]	L A-b [7] 04/40 00/04	173/7 177/11 181/17	temporary [1] 5/23
substance [1] 160/8	114/18 158/14	tab [7] 21/13 28/21 30/14 33/3 35/3 37/15	182/3 189/21 190/21	tempted [1] 211/2
substantive [1]	suppose [5] 10/6 26/22 109/16 172/2	52/10	202/13 taken [24] 11/15	ten [2] 35/13 91/23 ten days [1] 35/13
111/23	201/12	tab 10 [1] 28/21	20/24 21/19 22/7	tend [6] 18/15 28/4
successful [2] 35/18 166/8	suppressing [1]	tab 109 [1] 30/14	34/11 42/4 53/5 71/11	
successor [1] 168/12	11/11	tab 17 [1] 33/3	74/17 84/16 87/9	126/4
such [25] 3/8 5/18	suppression [3]	tab 22 [1] 35/3	87/12 105/10 107/13	tended [4] 11/3 18/14
13/24 17/13 17/16		tab 30 [1] 37/15 tab 7 [1] 21/13	144/4 150/6 163/19	18/21 82/7
17/25 45/2 46/24		tab 96 [1] 52/10	163/25 164/17 177/1 184/10 205/2 206/17	tends [1] 126/5 tenure [1] 165/8
53/24 69/12 73/12	25/18 30/5 31/1 32/20		207/10	term [4] 125/13 138/9
74/23 77/20 77/23 84/15 104/3 124/20	44/14 49/18 71/25	160/18	takes [2] 104/12	138/12 209/10
126/3 157/3 163/4	92/21 95/22 97/8	TAC [68] 17/3 17/16	206/16	terms [22] 7/18 9/6
179/7 193/23 193/23	111/25 112/4 123/14	17/17 17/22 18/2 18/4 18/8 18/11 18/12		
204/13 208/12	124/4 134/21 151/11 161/12 161/14 163/3	18/14 18/18 18/23	18/20 49/13 49/21 51/4 53/9 84/20	77/7 77/14 80/8 82/3 86/16 90/9 90/22
suffering [3] 73/13	167/16 171/19 180/25		201/23	96/10 125/22 138/15
73/13 74/3	181/11 181/25 205/17	47/3 51/17 51/19	talk [4] 32/22 63/21	144/15 147/23 148/3
sufficient [12] 31/17 45/11 45/18 47/24	207/15 208/24 209/12		117/3 179/23	158/12 164/20 167/4
82/3 94/23 104/2	surge [1] 122/8	55/25 66/16 66/16	talked [1] 173/9	191/22
107/4 108/10 139/18	surprise [6] 24/25	74/21 76/5 78/17 78/20 87/7 90/17	talking [12] 23/3	terse [1] 34/22
142/24 209/18	25/7 34/13 104/9 181/19 182/24	90/22 91/6 91/8 97/18	31/21 69/2 74/16	test [9] 51/10 51/11 68/14 120/24 121/5
sufficiently [1] 23/22	surprised [3] 145/15	98/17 98/21 99/1	197/10 203/4 203/11	126/19 126/23 128/22
suggest [5] 47/25	182/1 200/4	100/10 101/9 101/15	206/21 206/24	133/8
57/13 112/16 204/16 205/3	surprisingly [1]	101/15 102/1 102/6	talks [1] 28/6	testing [55] 21/19
suggested [5] 24/7	204/14	102/12 102/13 110/16	Tam [1] 12/23	21/25 22/10 22/10
66/3 73/10 73/24	surveillance [6] 83/6	110/18 110/22 114/22 123/1 123/7 123/12		22/10 22/15 22/18
170/14	107/16 111/15 121/1 126/22 127/2	123/1123/123/12	72/18 72/19 team [31] 5/17 7/5	22/21 22/22 22/25 23/1 23/7 23/10 30/19
suggests [2] 125/3	survey [2] 96/8 96/11	131/17 132/3 132/7	14/19 15/4 55/8 90/17	30/20 71/16 93/2
142/6	surveys [1] 96/17	132/14 133/3 133/13	97/16 145/20 164/18	106/24 112/7 117/3
summaries [3] 34/22 99/4 148/5	suspect [2] 53/15	135/6 135/8 140/5	170/15 170/18 171/3	117/5 117/10 117/12
	107/19	143/21 147/15 148/5	171/6 171/7 171/9	118/4 118/7 118/9
				(97) atmustures testing

(87) structures - testing

Т	75/2 75/3 75/6 75/9	138/9 150/25 155/12	therefore [6] 3/25	41/2 46/12 47/10
	75/11 75/12 75/20	163/15 168/4 171/17	15/14 36/10 93/11	62/12 62/13 63/24
testing [29] 118/12	87/23 109/3 110/17	180/22 191/16 206/7	165/3 166/9	83/6 96/1 130/1
118/12 118/14 118/20	118/17 119/24 122/22	210/20	therein [1] 130/7	134/16 134/23 156/13
118/22 120/5 120/19				164/23 181/15 187/22
120/22 121/4 121/14		themHow [1] 188/4		
124/1 124/6 124/20	141/10 145/6 145/11	theme [1] 125/6	16/14 23/9 33/4 34/7	192/2 209/15
124/22 125/3 125/22	148/22 148/23 149/1	themselves [5] 39/23		
126/2 127/3 127/6	150/7 151/7 151/8	114/23 116/15 129/12		
127/7 127/16 128/25	151/18 160/12 166/24	180/17	68/7 71/4 74/1 90/9	16/11 25/20 25/23
129/3 129/9 129/12	173/3 178/5 178/6	then [127] 2/18 8/19	91/12 95/15 96/15	36/21 41/15 43/17
129/13 129/19 129/23	198/23 201/17 205/12		99/4 99/13 100/9	49/4 49/25 57/14
137/22	205/13 210/23 210/24		100/16 101/7 101/11	74/12 93/15 173/11
tests [12] 22/13 68/4	thanks [2] 50/8	30/21 31/3 31/10	102/8 115/19 115/23	thinks [1] 27/11
108/8 117/21 119/8	187/24	31/10 33/12 37/3	122/4 122/10 124/3	third [11] 20/7 37/17
119/12 120/11 121/10	that [1305]	37/24 38/8 40/12	136/14 143/15 144/21	42/20 45/14 100/22
	that's [94] 2/14 3/13	48/10 55/16 58/22	153/5 161/20 162/19	158/2 158/4 162/17
123/5 126/10 126/19	4/3 5/4 5/7 11/11	59/14 60/19 60/22	163/19 167/23 181/8	172/12 181/1 183/24
128/22	12/15 14/18 20/17	63/18 65/22 71/14	187/10 187/12 188/11	
text [5] 118/24 175/4	24/22 26/8 26/13	81/11 81/12 82/10	190/8 191/22 192/12	this [328]
178/24 179/7 184/16	33/16 34/2 39/11	82/11 89/15 89/18	they [98] 2/1 2/4	Thomas [1] 124/9
TFW [1] 202/21	39/20 40/8 42/2 42/25	90/16 91/3 91/20	10/12 11/25 16/8	those [122] 4/4 8/24
than [51] 10/1 13/9	43/1 53/1 53/8 54/14	93/16 94/17 94/18	16/13 21/1 34/19	11/5 11/12 11/16
18/22 27/16 38/2 38/5	56/11 58/6 58/13 60/2	99/14 100/12 100/13	34/20 34/22 36/19	11/19 11/21 11/24
44/1 45/23 45/23	68/24 69/8 70/21	100/22 101/4 103/15	42/12 45/7 46/8 51/1	11/24 12/5 12/8 14/23
48/23 50/9 55/22	72/23 76/16 77/2	106/16 108/21 110/8	51/8 55/22 58/11 59/2	15/15 15/18 15/22
57/19 60/11 61/19				
62/11 82/21 88/20	77/13 77/18 78/15	110/15 110/21 112/18		16/14 16/16 17/22
91/23 93/1 108/19	79/1 79/7 79/11 79/17	113/6 113/13 114/15	63/16 66/20 68/13	21/9 21/15 27/11
109/22 110/20 111/3	80/4 81/16 87/8 89/4	115/17 119/13 121/6	69/18 71/4 71/5 71/11	27/14 30/6 34/14
111/13 111/14 112/14	90/7 93/18 100/19	121/10 122/1 125/1	71/13 71/23 71/25	37/14 41/16 42/18
112/18 119/17 121/7	106/5 109/18 111/7	126/6 126/6 127/19	72/15 76/11 77/6	43/8 43/10 44/11
127/2 129/9 129/20	111/8 112/24 114/25	128/21 132/9 132/13	79/14 85/18 86/14	51/11 58/19 59/17
138/25 139/5 139/13	117/6 117/19 126/18	137/23 138/10 139/9	87/10 90/20 92/14	59/18 60/17 60/20
139/22 146/9 147/2	129/22 130/9 135/6	140/2 140/9 140/21	92/14 92/24 102/5	63/22 64/1 72/6 73/12
147/18 148/21 153/12	136/21 139/19 140/20	144/18 144/23 145/3	102/6 102/7 102/7	73/13 74/3 74/6 74/16
166/12 167/21 169/17	146/21 148/22 149/9	145/18 146/15 147/3	102/10 107/3 115/10	74/18 76/7 76/9 82/1
177/19 177/25 190/7	149/15 153/10 155/10	147/10 147/19 149/22	115/22 120/16 131/10	85/2 85/9 85/21 87/1
200/9 209/16 210/19	156/12 157/25 159/6	153/25 154/13 154/20	132/12 134/13 135/2	87/6 87/9 87/12 88/1
	159/17 159/19 161/3	155/4 156/25 158/2	135/12 146/22 148/2	91/25 93/4 94/15
thank [68] 1/6 1/13 2/10 3/4 6/10 21/14	161/21 166/3 166/21	160/11 160/18 160/21	150/18 153/3 156/17	95/12 95/13 95/21
	171/6 173/12 173/24	161/1 161/2 161/19	158/14 160/3 160/4	98/19 99/24 104/15
28/23 37/18 44/3 57/1	175/24 177/9 179/2	162/24 163/24 164/6	160/5 161/12 161/18	104/16 105/20 110/5
64/3 68/22 73/1 73/2	179/12 179/16 184/3	164/20 166/24 170/12	163/5 163/9 163/12	113/11 113/12 113/15
73/575/175/275/3	184/5 191/18 191/21	170/17 173/25 174/25		115/6 120/9 122/10
75/6 75/9 75/11 75/12	192/20 193/4 193/20	178/16 179/23 180/9	176/19 180/3 181/8	122/11 126/12 126/13
75/20 87/23 109/3	195/1 203/12	181/3 181/20 183/24	183/4 187/13 189/3	128/6 128/7 130/19
110/17 118/17 119/24	their [36] 3/12 17/19	186/15 188/2 188/6	189/3 189/15 189/16	131/18 134/12 134/18
122/22 123/18 124/18	20/9 20/25 47/2 49/19	188/10 188/13 188/15		138/21 142/17 148/9
128/17 133/3 136/21	59/22 59/22 60/4	190/14 190/24 191/11		148/10 152/25 153/2
141/10 145/6 145/11	60/11 60/13 67/3	200/1 200/20 202/18	206/7 206/12 206/15	153/11 153/11 153/12
148/22 148/23 149/1	71/21 72/1 88/2 95/15			155/5 155/11 155/13
149/18 150/7 151/6	97/19 97/24 98/3 98/6			157/21 158/16 163/14
151/7 151/8 151/9				
151/10 151/16 151/18	98/7 114/19 116/2	theories [2] 66/10	they're [11] 46/12	163/23 163/25 165/2
160/12 166/19 166/24	116/2 142/20 150/25	66/13	62/16 88/8 88/9 88/19	
172/10 173/3 178/5	157/4 159/17 176/4	there [291]	145/6 157/3 179/6	172/25 175/5 178/2
178/6 198/23 201/17	176/17 185/19 186/2	there'd [1] 145/25	198/18 206/13 206/19	
205/11 205/12 205/13	194/7 195/22 197/8	there's [21] 30/5	they've [2] 106/25	189/22 192/6 193/11
208/2 208/4 210/23	210/4	34/10 48/20 61/21	121/9	195/3 195/11 196/25
210/24 210/25 211/1	them [32] 9/4 9/5	82/17 82/24 91/10	thick [1] 129/17	198/2 205/12 207/1
210/24 210/20 211/1	12/6 29/22 31/7 34/22	94/12 110/2 116/15	thin [1] 195/12	207/1 207/12 210/18
thank you [50] 1/6	37/11 39/7 39/8 48/15	124/16 130/3 150/10	thing [9] 40/8 46/15	though [9] 33/4 34/4
2/10 3/4 6/10 21/14	48/16 51/11 59/16	150/15 150/16 151/2	71/23 72/10 83/6	46/9 82/13 107/10
28/23 57/1 64/3 68/22	60/1 63/20 74/25	161/1 176/20 196/12	135/14 172/16 185/17	122/13 148/12 148/13
73/1 73/2 73/5 75/1	92/14 92/15 97/22	199/22 209/21	203/4	191/22
	98/20 100/5 126/24	thereafter [1] 17/4	things [19] 8/1 36/22	thought [11] 32/1
				(88) testing thought

(88) testing... - thought

-	170/12 171/0 171/01	70/01 100/15 101/9	traffia [4] 0/6	turn [C] 61/20 142/4
Τ	170/13 171/9 171/21 171/24 191/19	79/21 100/15 121/8 130/1 155/22 166/5	traffic [1] 9/6 train [2] 66/6 203/25	turn [6] 61/20 142/4 149/10 196/17 201/7
thought [10] 34/13	time [142] 3/22 8/9	195/7 195/17 202/20	training [3] 2/18 10/8	201/9
43/24 45/13 51/1 66/5	8/10 12/17 13/2 15/3	told [7] 9/19 27/7	154/7	turned [4] 118/9
91/7 101/19 111/13	16/4 18/13 19/4 21/19	35/16 104/10 145/25	trains [2] 39/9 45/2	182/22 183/7 199/16
194/14 207/20	22/8 24/14 25/17 26/4	147/23 148/2	trans [1] 41/19	turning [4] 138/19
thoughts [2] 48/14	28/17 30/9 36/20			156/25 166/18 200/5
48/15	36/20 36/22 40/22	tolerate [1] 136/15	transcript [1] 116/8	
thousand [1] 126/10	41/2 44/21 48/4 49/25	Tom [1] 125/3	transfer [2] 123/6 173/21	twice [1] 168/23 two [28] 10/24 20/2
thread [1] 124/8	51/4 51/18 53/11	tomorrow [3] 112/1 155/17 211/9	transferred [3] 168/8	20/6 26/22 26/22
threat [6] 23/19	53/13 53/18 54/9	too [10] 27/16 27/23	168/10 173/18	35/18 46/12 56/10
23/21 64/23 105/17	54/25 55/23 56/9 59/5			76/1 81/1 82/17 90/20
185/10 185/21	62/12 63/4 63/18 64/5		transfers/admissions	91/19 94/12 99/5
threats [1] 92/5	64/20 65/5 65/9 65/17	189/5	[1] 68/5	125/7 125/9 139/6
three [28] 8/23 19/11	71/14 81/8 82/2 82/25		transition [1] 69/20	139/20 146/16 147/18
45/9 49/23 50/9 51/12	89/24 91/21 94/9	38/10 48/7 50/21	translate [2] 10/2	147/19 148/13 156/13
56/9 94/13 98/18	97/21 98/3 98/6 98/13	64/12 66/4 70/16 74/5		168/21 168/22 195/1
139/6 139/21 139/21	99/18 100/10 101/12	81/8 84/22 85/4 94/10		207/24
139/22 139/25 140/21	101/13 104/5 104/8	95/1 104/2 185/4	translating [1]	two days [1] 20/6
146/15 146/16 147/2	107/16 107/19 108/7	187/12 189/14 192/15		two hours [2] 125/7
	108/9 108/18 111/13	194/3 210/18	translation [1]	125/9
157/20 162/11 170/13	111/16 112/12 113/3	top [13] 47/23 48/19	195/13	two months [1]
193/17 193/19 194/1	114/22 115/18 115/21	106/13 114/5 122/22	transmissibility [1]	195/1
194/25	116/1 116/17 118/2	125/1 125/16 155/2	57/7	two weeks [2] 56/10
three months [1]	118/6 120/16 120/17	160/8 169/22 175/10	transmission [27]	139/20
193/19	126/9 129/10 129/24	187/21 187/22	31/18 31/21 31/22	twofold [1] 38/24
three weeks [7] 56/9	131/9 132/24 133/1	topic [16] 42/8 44/21		
139/21 139/22 147/2	133/7 133/18 133/24	55/13 62/25 67/18	32/16 35/10 39/24	34/14 86/7 96/19
	135/5 136/2 138/4	88/25 117/3 121/12	41/11 47/11 56/13	types [2] 99/5 101/7
three-week [2] 139/6	138/15 139/1 142/11	164/2 183/17 187/3	106/2 106/7 106/20	
146/16	143/16 144/7 144/13	188/18 193/5 197/12	108/3 113/22 114/24	U
through [38] 6/1 6/4	144/24 146/5 146/22	199/1 201/19	115/21 124/12 124/23	UK [120] 8/22 9/10
7/13 14/2 14/5 14/21	147/9 148/1 148/6	topics [2] 62/24	125/19 126/1 142/17	9/13 9/15 10/19 10/20
18/15 20/9 20/16	148/18 148/20 156/14		146/7 147/25	10/21 10/25 11/3 11/8
20/25 36/24 56/4 59/22 69/15 78/21	162/8 164/11 164/25	total [2] 113/2 113/3	transmit [3] 107/3	12/13 14/12 15/10
84/3 84/3 84/19 86/21	168/3 168/9 169/15	Totally [1] 161/5	107/5 128/10	16/20 19/5 20/16 21/2
96/18 101/18 104/16	170/10 171/9 172/5	totals [1] 105/6	transpired [1] 57/15	21/18 21/21 21/24
110/4 111/15 127/4	172/25 173/16 174/1	touched [1] 19/2	transport [7] 47/17	22/5 22/11 22/17 23/6
135/12 144/8 148/17	174/3 175/2 176/7	touching [1] 199/8	50/16 202/1 202/2	23/12 23/17 23/19
152/24 156/7 161/18	185/9 185/21 188/25	towards [9] 6/6 13/4	202/4 202/6 203/23	24/16 28/2 28/19
177/21 181/15 182/18	189/4 189/19 190/13	15/8 28/15 37/17 46/3	travel [1] 108/3	30/19 31/5 33/15
183/6 188/3 194/3	191/22 194/24 198/11	57/14 173/12 186/16	travelled [1] 115/9	33/19 33/24 34/2
200/15	198/11 199/24 202/3	Trace [1] 120/24	travelling [1] 115/8	35/14 35/22 36/18
throughout [20] 5/8	204/13 205/16 205/19		Treasury [2] 93/14	36/19 38/10 40/14
31/24 74/7 77/3 79/21	205/19 206/22 206/23		141/2	40/19 41/20 41/21
80/15 95/4 122/17	207/8 207/25 209/21	119/23 174/16 177/7	tricky [2] 69/10	41/24 44/25 45/15
135/15 143/11 143/17	210/15 211/4	187/17 188/2 188/5	202/12	52/21 53/13 58/18
151/2 159/5 164/11	time-limited [1]	188/10 191/11 191/13		59/21 62/4 63/7 70/11
177/5 179/11 187/13	171/9	198/1	trigger [1] 108/2	73/7 80/18 81/5 81/12
187/15 189/14 210/20	timeliness [1] 97/23	Tracey Burke [5]	Trott [1] 14/19	83/5 83/14 83/15
tier [3] 142/6 142/16	timely [4] 82/4 84/9	177/7 187/17 188/2	true [5] 1/24 22/16	83/16 83/21 83/22
142/25	121/20 122/5	191/11 198/1	76/9 152/22 153/13	83/24 84/11 86/4
Tier 3 [2] 142/6	times [10] 8/23 64/16		trump [1] 117/15	86/16 87/25 88/21
142/16	93/23 130/4 163/22	174/16	trumping [1] 117/18	91/17 93/14 94/16 104/25 105/6 107/18
tiers [2] 142/13	168/24 169/13 194/11	, , , , , ,	trust [2] 66/5 120/4	107/21 107/24 109/9
142/15	204/24 205/1	117/9 119/23	truth [1] 76/8	109/22 110/3 110/7
till [2] 41/3 41/15	timing [3] 113/17 160/20 190/22	Tracey's [1] 120/15	try [7] 2/6 6/10 6/12 15/5 35/4 111/10	111/22 112/2 112/9
Tim [11] 170/13	timings [2] 130/6	tracing [8] 31/8 35/17 108/2 108/5	122/6	112/15 112/17 117/21
171/9 171/10 171/21	138/8		trying [9] 36/24 44/14	117/25 118/4 118/7
171/24 172/6 172/15	today [4] 1/13 20/24	112/7	49/18 59/8 74/23	118/23 119/12 120/5
172/23 191/16 191/18	75/20 204/22	track [2] 86/7 111/17		120/19 121/11 125/23
191/19	today's [1] 211/7	tracking [1] 160/24	170/6	129/9 130/10 134/22
Tim Render [5]	together [10] 70/12	tract [1] 21/21	Tuesday [1] 211/12	140/23 141/2 149/5
			· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	
				(89) thoughtIK

(89) thought... - UK

U	understandable [1]	8/23 9/20 14/25 16/2	16/18 40/8 51/1	94/12 95/2 96/4 96/15
UK [16] 154/2	79/23	16/25 17/3 17/24 18/6		96/20 104/7 105/6
154/4 178/4 185/23	understandably [1]	18/14 22/4 25/21	using [4] 176/14	106/8 108/8 129/22
187/4 188/16 189/9	133/19	25/24 28/24 31/13	176/16 180/5 190/6	133/4 136/13 136/16
189/16 189/17 192/1	understanding [19] 10/5 18/25 31/20	37/18 41/3 41/3 41/15		137/24 138/16 138/16
192/10 192/17 202/3	31/24 32/20 44/4 95/4	41/16 42/5 56/24 66/2 66/10 67/7 69/16	189/15 200/21	143/18 146/2 147/12 149/19 151/6 151/9
203/7 208/7 210/15	95/14 95/17 96/14	70/10 73/18 74/21	·	151/10 152/2 156/16
UK CMOs [1] 11/8	102/24 117/20 119/18	75/22 80/21 87/20	V	156/17 156/20 157/13
UK Government [16]	147/3 147/7 147/8	89/23 98/22 102/20	vaccination [3] 144/9	157/15 157/17 159/24
9/15 10/25 14/12	167/19 192/8 193/21	103/17 107/25 110/25		165/10 165/13 166/19
53/13 81/5 81/12	understands [10]	111/15 114/8 117/16	vaccinations [2]	167/8 167/15 167/20
83/22 111/22 117/21 121/11 134/22 154/4	18/8 53/25 86/2 87/24	118/4 118/12 119/12	144/8 169/11	168/14 169/4 169/10
189/9 189/16 192/10	120/23 137/13 163/12	124/13 124/13 124/15		169/14 171/18 171/18
210/15	192/24 193/14 205/17	125/1 126/24 128/16	148/2	172/10 176/11 178/12
UK level [1] 62/4	understood [6] 32/13	136/14 138/3 140/6	vaccines [1] 95/18	180/17 180/23 182/24
UK-level [1] 22/17	44/2 49/19 57/7 102/2	152/15 153/2 159/23	valid [2] 96/20	183/12 184/17 184/17
UK-wide [5] 9/10	102/4	161/14 163/23 167/1	168/15	185/23 190/9 190/11
10/21 15/10 118/4	undertake [3] 108/16	167/17 168/6 169/23	Vallance [6] 14/4 41/9 80/19 86/18	190/12 192/2 192/9
120/5	166/16 196/19	170/4 170/4 170/15 171/22 172/10 173/21	86/23 150/14	194/5 194/17 194/24 195/6 195/7 195/8
UKHSA [2] 85/14	undertaken [10] 29/17 132/21 136/23	177/24 185/22 186/11	valuable [1] 168/4	195/11 197/21 198/9
144/24	167/25 168/20 169/9	186/15 191/19 198/4	value [2] 141/14	199/24 200/11 200/16
ultimate [1] 4/18	184/15 195/3 196/23	202/10 206/1	184/11	200/25 201/13 201/16
ultimately [1] 177/20	207/7	update [7] 30/14	values [1] 157/5	202/14 204/5 205/1
unable [1] 95/17	undue [1] 43/21	33/11 100/3 100/5	Valuing [1] 17/6	205/11 205/24 207/1
unaware [2] 84/19 118/6	unduly [2] 57/2 57/16	106/9 107/7 185/2	Van [1] 12/23	209/9 210/25 211/1
uncertain [2] 147/23	unfiltered [1] 84/6	updates [1] 91/1	variant [6] 56/16	211/5
148/3	unfortunately [4]	updating [1] 30/18	140/15 143/24 143/25	
uncertainty [5] 106/2	82/13 87/10 87/14	upon [5] 9/9 32/11	144/14 146/8	177/23 177/23
120/7 144/19 144/23	149/12	120/5 142/11 176/22	variants [1] 140/15	view [31] 4/24 8/15
185/20		urged [1] 111/8	variation [2] 92/12 192/4	18/3 19/15 24/1 27/15 42/6 50/22 52/1 54/10
unclear [1] 127/21	unions [2] 54/25 55/10	urgency [2] 27/9 163/20	variety [2] 169/14	57/2 58/7 70/18 82/16
uncouple [1] 90/1		urgent [3] 162/7	197/25	85/14 95/19 97/5
under [20] 1/21	26/9 26/12 154/7	163/1 177/25	various [7] 4/23 6/4	103/11 104/7 107/12
21/18 33/6 50/6 74/21	United [2] 63/5	us [39] 1/9 9/19	9/20 51/20 79/5	108/18 110/11 114/22
155/21 161/16 165/2 166/22 166/22 167/3	196/15	12/25 13/1 18/10	122/20 182/17	125/24 129/2 129/21
173/24 174/15 175/15	United Kingdom [1]	19/22 36/25 48/21	Vaughan [3] 69/19	137/9 138/1 144/11
180/7 193/22 193/23	63/5	57/1 58/7 62/4 66/23	147/23 201/21	190/6 190/23
194/23 196/12 205/10	United Nations [1]	71/10 71/13 75/17	Vaughan Gething [3]	views [8] 27/14 33/25
undermined [1]	196/15	82/15 82/20 84/23	69/19 147/23 201/21	85/15 116/24 150/3
64/22	universities [2] 93/5 98/11	86/5 89/5 99/18 112/14 135/25 152/11	vectors [2] 39/24	150/5 187/11 198/6 viral [3] 41/11 47/10
underneath [1] 3/22	University [2] 2/16	164/4 166/4 168/5	ventilation [1] 105/1	106/3
underpin [1] 95/14	76/25	175/17 186/3 186/4	venues [1] 110/11	virology [4] 9/22
underpinning [2]	unjustified [1] 57/18	186/14 190/5 194/17	verbal [1] 119/19	85/18 85/19 93/2
125/22 172/6	unless [4] 105/10	195/15 196/22 203/13	verbally [2] 50/24	virtue [1] 10/23
understand [51] 2/5 2/23 5/11 5/21 11/5	110/3 132/16 163/20	206/16 209/1 210/9	123/22	virus [31] 19/8 19/12
11/12 11/14 13/6	unlike [1] 93/8	use [21] 18/7 29/6	version [5] 99/15	19/17 24/20 24/24
14/12 17/3 35/21 37/9	unlikely [1] 32/2	45/13 46/4 47/16	99/16 99/19 109/16	25/12 29/14 30/20
40/19 43/2 49/5 65/4	unpaid [1] 209/15	47/25 48/3 49/7 50/4	109/19	30/22 34/7 34/11
66/1 75/24 77/4 79/14	unprecedented [1]	50/15 63/6 79/5	versions [1] 195/17 versus [2] 30/20	35/22 41/12 56/2 57/8
80/5 82/18 84/7 86/6	5/16 unpublished [1] 99/7	119/13 149/21 150/1 175/3 175/17 175/22	202/6	62/7 69/11 79/5 103/10 104/11 107/11
87/3 91/12 91/19 94/7	untenable [2] 31/10	176/8 180/8 181/22	very [114] 6/11 15/25	107/21 107/23 108/9
98/17 99/1 102/13	41/22	used [16] 26/4 29/22	15/25 19/8 27/3 36/7	141/12 141/15 141/21
	until [17] 5/22 13/8	41/8 45/15 46/13	36/23 37/18 43/20	146/2 147/5 185/3
145/19 152/17 153/4	24/25 43/9 50/19	46/14 50/5 52/5 65/13		185/10
156/12 164/10 168/7 168/17 170/1 175/25	60/23 61/5 81/10	161/6 161/7 175/19	50/6 51/21 52/1 53/17	visceral [1] 41/12
186/3 188/20 192/11	89/23 104/12 107/4	178/25 180/21 194/2	56/25 57/9 57/22 62/4	
194/22 198/19 199/4	108/2 127/9 166/1	199/6	65/1 65/1 70/10 72/4	vital [3] 46/7 188/11
203/19 205/14		useful [10] 12/6 12/9	74/7 79/20 82/22 85/13 85/14 87/15	188/12
	up [78] 1/15 2/4 6/8	12/10 13/14 15/22	00/10/00/14/07/10	voice [7] 1/15 6/8
				(90) LIK - voice

V	204/6 210/17 211/4	167/23 171/5 187/19	140/19 141/20 152/2	196/23 196/24 197/13
	Wales' [3] 43/18	188/9 190/14 190/16	156/17 156/20 165/6	197/17 198/5 199/3
voice [5] 65/15 65/19 75/22 87/20	85/11 108/14	205/16 205/18 207/16	165/10 166/23 167/8	199/7 199/8 201/22
152/15	walk [1] 152/24	we've [36] 19/2 35/1	168/6 170/5 171/11	201/25 203/21 204/18
volume [1] 9/5	want [27] 9/8 17/5	35/12 48/4 51/3 63/6	197/8 198/5 202/16	204/18 204/23 204/25
voluntarily [1] 97/17	18/24 23/13 28/21	96/4 98/4 98/22 100/8	203/3 205/24 209/23	208/11 208/20 210/11
vulnerable [13] 43/8	33/2 36/24 42/8 44/8	100/23 101/7 115/8	Welsh [199] 3/8 3/11	210/12 210/18
58/24 59/16 60/5 60/8	44/21 44/24 63/1 69/9	125/11 135/5 139/10	3/19 4/11 4/11 8/4 8/7	Welsh-specific [1]
70/2 71/20 74/16	85/21 98/19 99/3 102/23 125/6 127/10	142/3 147/16 148/12 150/19 151/15 159/23	11/20 13/11 13/14 13/16 13/22 13/24	15/11 went [13] 7/21 15/3
121/24 122/14 193/11	130/13 139/5 159/20	161/22 165/21 173/8	14/6 14/20 15/11	61/13 61/18 98/18
208/11 208/21	165/20 182/3 199/16	174/3 179/2 179/3	16/21 16/22 16/22	99/8 146/16 156/6
W	202/8 206/1	182/18 183/4 183/6	18/10 20/4 23/22 24/8	168/3 190/1 200/9
Wales [164] 1/12	wanted [7] 22/20	187/15 192/12 197/10	24/10 24/25 27/10	210/10 210/10
2/12 3/6 6/22 7/10 8/9	33/25 35/3 92/14	199/5 205/14	27/14 29/17 32/10	were [351]
10/17 13/17 15/12	171/13 205/20 207/22		32/24 34/4 34/15	weren't [9] 33/22
15/13 15/24 16/5 16/8	wanting [1] 67/9	65/2	35/12 37/3 37/9 41/1	44/11 59/4 92/18
17/19 22/8 22/18	warned [1] 109/1	weakened [2] 49/23	41/23 42/15 42/25	135/2 138/22 170/4
22/20 22/21 22/24	warning [2] 104/3	64/9	50/12 50/20 51/4	176/7 193/22
23/22 24/15 24/20	132/14	wear [9] 46/10 53/23	52/24 55/21 58/17	WG [1] 123/24
24/24 25/8 25/13	warnings [1] 104/3	54/5 63/8 63/9 63/20	63/13 64/7 64/13	what [150] 2/6 11/24
25/15 25/17 25/25	was [779] was: [1] 143/17	63/23 66/6 204/19 wearing [10] 10/24	64/22 65/7 67/8 68/10 69/17 77/11 77/15	13/20 13/23 16/11 19/6 20/17 21/4 22/7
27/7 27/20 29/21 30/9	FAT 440/47	26/6 26/9 45/1 45/6	78/2 79/16 82/8 82/10	23/12 24/14 25/3
31/9 35/15 37/6 40/12	wasn't [28] 12/2	46/24 53/12 63/15	84/24 88/10 90/15	25/13 25/19 27/11
42/11 42/22 43/20 46/2 47/8 47/8 48/22	20/14 25/10 34/18	203/16 203/25	91/13 91/18 92/2	28/4 30/7 31/11 32/19
49/25 50/9 52/20 53/9	39/23 48/11 48/12	web [1] 126/21	93/20 94/8 94/11	32/21 34/3 34/9 34/11
53/22 54/21 55/25	51/23 53/17 65/19	website [4] 63/13	95/25 97/3 98/19	34/12 34/23 39/17
56/8 60/1 60/20 60/23	69/23 72/21 77/24	161/19 196/11 196/24	100/20 102/2 102/2	40/20 41/18 46/16
61/7 61/19 62/4 63/4	103/12 104/5 104/14	week [27] 8/23 23/2	104/1 105/14 105/16	46/22 47/2 47/25
64/9 65/6 66/4 66/7	104/16 107/4 108/22	35/11 43/5 50/23	107/13 113/21 117/22	48/15 48/16 48/21
67/25 68/17 69/21	117/24 118/6 121/5	51/15 66/3 72/22 76/3	119/7 119/9 119/17	51/10 57/9 57/10 58/6
70/6 70/11 70/12	124/3 133/13 135/8	92/18 97/16 112/16	120/23 123/22 134/23	58/14 59/11 61/6
71/11 72/4 76/14 77/1	176/6 176/18 193/24	112/22 126/23 139/6 139/25 140/21 146/4	135/20 138/11 143/12 146/12 146/19 147/13	
77/4 78/22 79/25	watching [1] 70/9 wave [10] 56/4 56/5	146/5 146/16 146/17	140/12 140/19 147/13	
82/21 84/21 85/3 85/4	91/14 91/15 94/25	146/20 146/21 146/23		74/17 82/15 82/18
85/11 85/25 86/11	112/3 113/7 113/8	156/3 168/23 183/22	154/13 154/21 154/23	
88/11 89/10 92/19 93/2 93/4 94/25 95/2	113/13 113/16	weekend [1] 114/17	155/3 155/9 155/20	86/10 86/12 86/15
96/18 98/8 100/7	waves [1] 74/14	weekly [4] 11/9 79/13		88/12 89/11 91/13
100/16 103/10 103/23	way [23] 16/11 29/19	99/10 124/22	156/16 156/19 158/1	91/15 95/4 95/22 97/7
104/12 105/6 105/7	39/11 41/21 42/23	weeks [28] 27/12	158/7 159/1 159/2	98/19 99/4 99/17
105/10 108/6 108/13	54/11 60/2 60/15 85/9		159/8 159/15 161/19	100/9 100/25 107/12
108/20 109/15 110/7	111/17 125/25 138/14		162/12 164/3 164/18	111/8 111/10 113/6
112/9 112/10 115/24	143/5 145/14 145/14	127/10 139/20 139/21	164/23 165/7 165/13	115/22 115/22 116/17
117/9 117/12 117/15	155/24 160/7 163/10 177/18 178/18 186/10	139/22 139/22 139/22 140/3 146/15 146/15	170/5 170/12 175/13	117/17 119/2 124/4 125/17 127/21 129/20
117/16 117/23 117/23	187/8 210/10	140/3 140/13 140/13	175/19 175/21 175/22	134/1 134/10 135/5
118/3 118/5 118/9	501 74/00 407/0		175/23 176/1 176/3	136/1 136/17 139/16
118/11 119/17 120/22	157/16	147/24 148/1 148/14	176/3 176/12 176/15	140/20 141/17 142/24
123/3 123/10 124/10 124/14 126/11 126/12		148/15 165/11 179/21	176/16 176/20 176/22	142/24 146/13 147/13
127/9 129/21 130/2	we'd [3] 118/10	weight [1] 97/11	177/1 177/17 178/9	148/20 149/14 150/4
130/20 133/6 134/4	138/12 196/9	welcome [1] 137/24	178/14 178/18 179/9	157/9 159/21 159/25
134/7 134/12 135/11	we'll [14] 4/17 12/11	well [54] 2/7 5/5 8/14	180/2 180/6 180/9	162/25 164/7 166/4
135/15 135/19 136/2	35/4 68/24 77/6 78/18			166/22 167/15 167/19
136/6 137/16 139/8	82/25 155/6 155/17	14/4 14/24 16/17	182/15 182/20 183/1	167/20 168/25 169/8
140/1 140/7 140/8	162/22 166/16 177/3	25/18 28/2 30/5 32/13	183/3 183/8 183/15	170/1 171/15 172/5
140/11 140/16 140/18	177/11 188/7 we're [26] 5/6 15/25	33/20 38/21 58/13 59/6 62/1 66/22 67/13	183/18 184/1 185/2 185/15 186/10 186/22	172/8 173/6 173/12 176/24 176/24 179/3
143/9 146/6 147/22	25/14 36/7 48/18	71/13 81/24 94/4	188/16 189/12 189/22	180/18 180/18 183/11
157/1 157/2 171/5	67/22 99/2 106/8	101/7 102/15 110/2	191/25 192/25 193/10	185/13 186/3 186/4
185/11 195/6 195/24	108/24 122/21 123/16		194/2 194/15 194/18	188/20 189/7 191/17
196/12 196/13 197/3 202/6 203/25 204/1	136/15 136/16 149/14		195/10 195/11 195/17	192/11 198/3 199/12
	151/11 161/23 166/24			
				(91) voice what

(91) voice... - what

	147/17 140/12 140/24	Whitehall [0] 164/04		want [4] 64/15 64/25
W		Whitehall [2] 164/24	will [33] 2/3 2/6 2/9	won't [4] 64/15 64/25
what [12] 203/9	150/16 154/2 160/8	192/5	14/9 20/15 21/1 63/25	
203/13 204/2 204/6		Whitty [23] 8/23 9/16	64/18 64/24 69/5	wonder [1] 50/1
204/6 204/7 205/3	200/18 202/2 202/8	10/1 10/6 10/23 11/13		word [5] 57/23 61/22
206/6 207/9 209/3	205/18 206/1 206/10	19/21 21/2 23/16	103/18 105/3 105/6	101/10 136/8 136/8
210/16 211/2	wherever [1] 63/16	28/25 29/19 41/8	105/23 105/23 120/3	words [10] 5/16
what's [10] 10/13	whether [30] 13/12	42/18 63/7 86/19	132/10 132/12 135/25	27/13 61/3 68/10
61/25 67/9 85/24	18/1 23/13 37/21	86/21 86/23 86/24	143/22 153/11 160/2	116/22 129/5 131/14
85/24 86/7 89/5 89/11	47/24 50/1 57/16 61/6	111/21 112/5 116/4	160/3 160/4 160/5	132/18 134/19 160/17
	63/19 68/6 72/8 81/23	116/10 116/19	199/24 204/22 205/17	work [49] 15/1 43/16
151/24 160/19	85/23 93/4 106/24	Whitty's [3] 9/17	207/15 208/24	44/17 59/25 74/12
whatever [2] 39/10	106/25 107/1 113/14	12/24 116/24	Williams [7] 23/3	78/12 79/12 79/24
208/21	118/3 119/5 126/7	who [62] 3/22 9/3	23/12 50/23 54/20	80/13 86/10 86/11
WhatsApp [36] 51/6	128/9 134/13 134/16	10/7 10/8 14/9 15/4	124/9 125/8 126/20	88/18 91/10 91/18
51/23 175/4 175/15	134/22 136/11 151/11	26/18 27/5 45/16	willing [1] 136/15	92/2 92/6 92/7 96/16
175/16 175/22 176/2	151/21 206/21 209/23		Wincott [1] 156/3	97/19 97/24 98/1
176/3 176/8 176/13	which [124] 1/20 2/8	63/22 66/1 66/2 70/13		103/13 110/10 112/24
176/14 176/16 176/23	2/16 3/14 4/17 8/16	70/15 70/15 70/25	winter [8] 41/13	121/9 129/25 134/11
177/2 177/6 177/23				1 1
178/8 180/5 180/8	9/9 12/3 12/3 13/5	71/1 80/13 90/14	94/22 113/18 140/13	136/23 137/6 138/17
180/8 181/16 181/18			143/19 146/7 169/14	150/8 150/15 150/19
182/16 184/5 184/16	18/23 26/7 32/12	95/8 96/22 96/23 98/3		151/2 151/4 155/23
187/16 187/18 188/22	32/19 34/21 34/21	107/1 118/8 123/15	wise [2] 29/12 57/19	166/13 168/20 170/19
190/14 192/12 199/2	34/22 36/7 36/9 36/19			171/24 172/6 173/12
199/19 199/20 200/15	37/13 38/25 39/25	129/14 129/23 136/3	151/19 211/6	185/13 188/11 192/8
201/16 202/8	40/16 41/9 43/10	136/4 148/10 150/23	within [52] 16/21	193/21 195/20 197/22
WhatsApp's [1]	43/13 44/22 45/5 46/5	155/17 157/12 157/13	23/22 26/14 26/17	199/8
199/6	47/10 50/3 50/7 52/8	158/21 160/10 160/13	51/20 70/20 82/23	worked [12] 2/16
	53/21 54/23 56/15	161/3 161/9 161/12	87/24 88/2 88/8 88/15	
WhatsApps [7] 67/7	62/3 62/25 64/13 65/6	170/9 178/2 182/19	89/20 90/23 91/11	79/20 92/3 129/15
181/23 199/6 200/8	67/2 68/23 69/19	187/1 187/10 197/15	92/25 93/4 93/4 98/8	139/25 156/7 166/23
201/8 201/18 202/13	70/12 70/16 72/6	197/22 198/1 199/22	99/9 99/21 102/17	171/10 171/12
when [71] 3/10 4/5	72/10 74/9 74/9 74/20			workers [4] 21/24
5/22 8/1 10/11 16/19	74/21 76/5 76/23	who's [1] 14/19	126/11 126/16 127/2	38/6 126/17 126/18
17/24 18/6 18/14	78/17 81/11 81/13	whole [17] 67/1	127/16 134/7 134/7	workforce [1] 108/16
25/17 26/24 28/9 31/6		115/20 117/20 135/11		working [15] 16/1
32/22 34/7 41/2 41/13	100/14 100/25 101/22			41/4 44/11 47/9 76/20
45/6 45/25 46/18	103/16 116/15 117/8	169/2 170/5 180/14	155/8 156/19 166/14	96/9 97/17 130/22
49/24 50/10 56/2				134/16 136/16 157/16
56/15 59/14 61/12	122/2 122/18 123/10 128/23 129/24 131/9	186/1 186/10 192/10	169/21 170/12 172/6	
62/12 63/4 66/6 66/23		208/22 209/9 210/17	174/15 174/20 179/8	172/8 179/8 191/2
68/21 71/14 73/15	133/25 135/18 138/14			
77/19 82/8 84/1 84/23			194/15 195/10 195/24	
85/20 91/14 103/8	145/1 145/1 146/5	156/3	204/17	world [2] 17/12
105/4 105/23 107/21	149/8 149/20 150/22	whose [2] 120/12	without [7] 67/14	117/20
113/16 142/13 145/4	153/6 161/18 162/13	202/18	68/13 78/4 100/1	worldwide [1] 33/14
146/11 146/19 148/1	164/1 165/25 166/10	why [32] 43/9 55/4	108/16 174/20 207/12	
156/22 159/9 161/6	167/8 168/14 168/19	61/18 62/10 62/11	witness [51] 1/17	177/22 178/3 187/9
163/6 163/22 164/4	168/25 169/1 171/4	81/3 85/4 89/15 91/7	1/19 1/23 9/21 19/7	190/19
164/6 170/2 171/10	175/3 177/11 181/4	91/24 94/10 109/23	40/13 42/13 45/8	worried [5] 27/3
171/12 181/20 184/24	181/7 181/8 182/7	112/2 114/16 121/3	73/17 75/13 76/1 76/2	46/16 74/11 116/12
185/21 186/23 192/20	182/16 184/9 186/20	130/20 133/13 135/8	78/11 79/24 82/6	117/14
	188/25 189/4 190/4	141/21 142/10 142/19	83/19 84/8 87/7 88/4	worryingly [1] 180/4
	190/10 191/14 192/21	156/12 167/14 168/10	91/22 93/7 102/25	worse [1] 104/24
198/11 204/1 205/9	192/22 194/2 196/17	168/18 173/5 201/12		worsening [1] 111/2
205/18	203/7 207/2 207/8	203/19 204/8 204/8	140/4 140/5 141/4	worst [3] 26/5 29/4
whenever [1] 144/14	208/8 209/24	204/9 204/12	143/22 147/14 149/7	29/7
where [42] 26/24	while [3] 6/24 149/14		151/19 151/22 152/19	
33/23 33/25 41/6	172/7	wide [14] 9/10 10/21	153/1 153/17 155/16	worthwhile [1] 195/7
43/17 44/22 50/17	whilst [15] 1/14	15/10 36/18 118/4	157/7 157/19 158/11	would [249]
54/6 65/16 68/13 70/8	18/18 02/10 03/1	120/5 162/16 169/4	165/5 165/23 165/24	would [249] wouldn't [7] 40/2
71/4 73/15 83/7 83/13	115/19 116/20 127/21			46/5 102/15 162/8
93/3 94/1 100/10	135/3 144/25 167/23	189/10 189/14 175/12	184/23 186/18 196/1	183/2 201/10 205/7
110/10 111/12 115/21	177/5 170/15 181/15		208/8 211/6	
126/22 126/24 129/12		wider [4] 5/17 90/19		write [2] 28/24 98/6
134/21 138/16 140/7	184/14 194/11	170/12 200/9	WLGA [4] 197/16	writes [1] 124/16
	white [1] 179/3	widespread [1] 19/15	190/4 190/10 198/10	writing [4] 6/20 59/11
				(92) what writing

(92) what... - writing

W	you [812]	76/2 76/10 76/17 77/5
writing [2] 59/12	you know [45] 7/25	77/5 77/7 77/8 77/14
122/10	9/3 12/22 15/2 28/15	77/19 78/2 78/11
written [13] 28/3 32/9	28/16 31/2 31/4 36/20 39/11 57/11 62/7	78/12 78/19 78/21 79/14 79/18 79/24
48/9 51/1 51/3 94/21	65/16 70/17 74/8	81/9 82/6 83/19 84/8
96/23 97/1 103/7	74/10 82/21 83/13	84/15 84/22 86/16
105/13 119/19 134/17	85/17 92/10 94/3 95/6	
144/1	96/17 97/11 97/25	91/22 93/7 102/24
wrong [6] 32/8	101/17 102/10 105/20	
196/10 201/5 203/5	107/23 108/9 116/2	104/22 106/4 107/7
203/5 203/9 wrote [6] 6/15 48/10	120/15 122/16 123/16	107/12 108/18 109/10
59/15 68/17 71/9	126/4 129/24 130/2	109/17 110/11 110/25
130/22	133/25 134/14 135/1	112/20 114/4 118/24
	135/12 136/6 139/16	129/2 129/21 137/5
Y	144/22 150/13	137/8 138/1 140/4
yeah [51] 1/11 3/13	you'd [3] 103/6	140/4 140/4 141/4
4/3 4/8 4/14 4/15 5/4	138/10 201/4	141/5 143/21 147/3
6/7 7/17 11/11 14/2	you'll [1] 110/2	147/6 147/14 147/20
19/10 20/18 21/14	you're [32] 1/14 6/11	148/13 148/25 149/7
21/17 23/15 40/9 42/2	14/22 17/24 23/10 25/3 26/13 39/21	149/15 150/3 151/17 151/18 151/21 152/11
44/6 47/11 48/17 53/1	47/25 52/23 59/9	152/14 152/15 152/16
54/13 55/12 57/25	E0/11 60/0E 71/0	152/22 153/13 153/18
58/9 59/19 81/7 86/20	74/16 81/14 87/19	153/24 155/4 155/6
91/18 93/18 99/24	110/2 116/10 126/7	156/25 157/7 157/19
101/10 102/12 105/20 106/6 107/22 112/24	134/10 137/6 141/18	158/11 159/8 159/9
114/25 117/6 120/13	145/14 159/4 178/19	159/11 163/21 164/11
124/25 128/1 128/9	199/18 200/4 200/14	165/8 165/23 165/23
122/20 124/11 126/4	203/4 206/21 206/24	166/1 166/17 169/6
137/10 139/14 144/14	you've [22] 1/19 2/5	173/4 173/19 174/8
187/20	5/5 //10 //20 20/4	175/2 176/15 177/4
year [6] 12/18 18/17	28/7 35/14 83/10 88/3	
19/4 152/21 197/4	88/15 90/3 113/12	184/25 185/7 185/13
197/5	119/3 128/24 143/20	186/18 187/5 189/10
years [3] 49/4 76/22	152/20 162/12 181/2	189/18 189/18 190/6 191/24 191/25 193/3
76/22	184/9 196/1 204/21	191/24 191/25 193/3
yes [76] 2/14 4/21 5/9	young [8] 73/9 73/23 87/4 169/8 169/12	205/24 206/2 208/8
5/20 5/20 6/10 14/18	196/13 197/9 207/11	203/24 200/2 208/8
16/10 16/12 19/10	your [206] 1/9 1/15	your Ladyship [1]
23/15 27/4 29/10	1/15 1/01 0/2 0/7 0/15	
29/16 30/9 38/3 39/12	2/10 2/17 1/0 1/10	yourself [12] 27/8
43/1 47/20 48/3 53/10 53/17 54/15 58/6 60/9		52/14 68/1 68/16
61/24 64/2 75/19	6/24 7/8 7/12 9/16	71/19 71/22 80/7 80/9
81/16 81/19 82/5	9/21 9/22 9/25 10/14	86/23 174/9 176/1
83/18 89/14 90/7 91/4	11/7 12/5 12/17 12/19	187/17
100/19 102/22 103/25	15/10 10/2 10/10	7
104/22 105/12 106/12	18/25 19/2 19/7 19/15	<u> </u>
106/14 113/5 113/10	23/10/20/0/20/9/20/19	20011[3] 17/3 00/4
113/19 117/2 119/20	27/8 28/8 28/22 30/14	149/18
119/24 120/21 129/8	33/25 40/12 42/6	
134/9 136/21 148/24	42/13 44/1 44/8 45/8	
153/15 156/2 156/12	45/17 45/18 46/21	
161/24 162/3 162/5	47/18 48/5 49/22	
164/22 166/25 167/12	E0/44 E4/00 EC/47	
169/22 172/10 184/13	53/11 54/23 56/17 56/20 57/16 57/20	
185/8 188/16 190/15	58/7 59/2 63/12 63/21	
191/12 192/3 193/12	64/8 64/10 64/17	
193/13 198/21 203/17	64/20 65/5 65/18	
205/24 210/1	65/25 66/13 73/17	
yet [4] 24/15 34/7	75/6 75/8 75/11 75/17	
50/19 209/21	75/20 75/22 75/23	
	10/20 10/22 10/20	