		UK			
1		Thursday, 25 January 2024			
2	(10	.00 am)			
3	LADY HALLETT: Mr Tariq.				
4	MR TARIQ: Good morning, my Lady. May I please call Rachel				
5		Elizabeth Lloyd.			
6		MS RACHEL ELIZABETH LLOYD (affirmed)			
7		Questions from COUNSEL TO THE INQUIRY			
8	MR	TARIQ: Could I check that you're commonly known as			
9		Liz Lloyd?			
10	A.	I am indeed.			
11	Q.	There's a few preliminary matters I wanted to discuss			
12		with you before we get to the substance of your			
13		evidence. Can you keep your voice up and can you speak			
14		slowly because there is a stenographer that is taking			
15		the evidence. If any of my questions are unclear,			
16		please say so and I can repeat or rephrase.			
17		You've provided two statements to the Inquiry, and			
18		both these statements are dated 15 November 2023. The			
19		first statement is on screen. This is at INQ000274006,			
20		and this is a statement that explains your role in the			
21		Scottish Government's response to the pandemic.			
22		I understand that there was a correction that you			
23		wanted to make at, is it to paragraph 13?			
24	Α.	Paragraph 13, yes, there's a fairly obvious, I hope,			
25		typographical error. I have used the date "late			
		•			
1	A.	Yes.			
2	Q.	And then after a short break, you were back in post as			
3		a special adviser from August 2021 to around			
4		28 March 2023; is that correct?			
5	A.	That's correct.			
6	Q.	And you served as the chief of staff to the then			
7		First Minister of Scotland, Nicola Sturgeon, from			
8		January 2015 to 23 March 2021; is that correct?			
9	A.	Yeah, that's correct.			
10	Q.	Then you returned to the Scottish Government, as we've			
11		said, in August 2021, and this time your role was as			
12		strategic political and policy adviser to the			
13		First Minister within the special adviser team; is that			
14		correct?			
15	A.	Yes, that's correct.			
16	Q.	And you remained in that role until the resignation of			
17		Nicola Sturgeon as First Minister of Scotland at the end			
18		of March 2023, at which point you also chose to leave			
19		government; is that correct?			
20	Α.	That is indeed.			

1		2020/early 2021", when that should be "late 2019/early
2		2020".
3	Q.	. , ,
4		talking about 2019 into 2020. So subject to that
5		amendment, can you confirm that this is your statement?
6	A.	It is.
7	Q.	And are you are the contents of this statement true
8		to the best of your knowledge and belief?
9	A.	They are.
10	Q.	There's also a second statement that you gave to
11		the Inquiry, which is also dated 15 November 2023. This
12		is INQ000274004, and this is a statement about the use
13		and retention of informal communications such as
14		WhatsApp messages. Can you confirm that this is your
15		statement?
16	A.	It is.
17	Q.	Are the contents of this statement true to the best of
18		your knowledge and belief?
19	A.	They are.
20	Q.	Thank you.
21		I wanted to move on now to discussing your
22		professional background before we get to your role
23		during the pandemic. You were employed as a special
24		adviser to the Scottish Government from January 2012 to
25		I believe, 23 March 2021; is that correct?
		2
4		There is a special advisagel and of conducts in
1 2		There is a special advisers' code of conduct; is that correct?
3	^	There is, yes.
	Α.	, ,
4	Q.	'
5		adding a political dimension to the advice and
6		assistance available to ministers, and the code notes
7		that one of the reasons for the role is to reinforce the
8		political impartiality of the permanent civil service so
9		that the political advice can come from the special
10 11		advisers as opposed to the permanent civil servants; is
		that correct?
12 13	Α.	That is correct.
	Q.	Professor Paul Cairney gave evidence in week 1 to the
14		Inquiry, and in his report he says that special advisers
15		are appointed by the First Minister personally and
16		ultimately the responsibility for the management of the
17		special advisers rests with the First Minister. Is that
18		your understanding?
19	Α.	That is correct. I would say the day-to-day management
20		of the special adviser team is delegated to the chief of
21	_	staff.
22	u.	Yes, but ultimately the

23 A. Ultimately, it's the First Minister.

25

Q. -- responsibility rests with the First Minister.

In your first statement, you say, and I'll simply

Q. And you now work in the private sector, I understand?

Q. I now want to turn to ask you about the role of special

advisers more generally before we get to your

22

23

24

25

A. Yes, I do.

quote at this stage:

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

"Special Advisers are not decision takers but support the decision-making process by supporting ministerial thinking and assist in the application, understanding of and communication of ministerial decisions."

Therefore, am I correct to understand that the role of a special adviser is not to take the decisions themselves.

- 10 A. That is correct, yes.
- Q. And there has to be clear boundaries between the
 decision-makers, such as the Scottish ministers, and
 special advisers as it's only the ministers who are
 elected and therefore accountable to the public; is that
 correct?
- 16 A. That's correct.
- 17 Q. And as special advisers you're neither elected nor18 accountable to the public?
- 19 A. That is broadly correct, yes. I always felt accountable20 to the public.
- 21 Q. But in terms --
- 22 A. But not formally.
- Q. Not formally. And your role is generally not meant tobe public-facing, unlike the politicians, is it?
- 25 A. That's correct.

5

- 1 well, would receive advice from scientists, they would 2 be looking at, you know, broader information on 3 legislative proposals, policy proposals, and sometimes 4 ministers need a place or a person where they can 5 essentially think out loud without that being taken as 6 their definitive view. So my role and the role of other 7 special advisers frequently is to engage with them to 8 help them stress test ideas, to talk out what might the 9 consequences of a particular route of action be, help 10 them come to, you know, are there other questions they 11 should ask, do they have all the information they need, 12 and to help them explore, if you like, the advice and 13 information before them.
- 14 Q. So in the context of a particular decision that the 15 First Minister or another minister needs to make, there 16 may be competing considerations, there may be competing 17 almost briefings coming from different interests, 18 whether it be economic, whether it be scientific or 19 medical, and part of the role of the special adviser is 20 to be able to almost stress test the different perhaps 21 conflicting advice so that the minister can make the 22 decision?
- 23 A. Yes, yes.
- Q. In your statement, and I won't take you to thisparticular part, but I think you say that it would be

- Q. And some special advisers can build up close
 relationships with their ministers, having worked with
 them over many years; is that correct?
- 4 A. That is.
- 5 **Q.** Is it fair to say that your relationship with
- Nicola Sturgeon was particularly close, having worked as her chief of staff since 2015?
- 8 A. Yes, yes, and certainly by the time of the pandemic.
- 9 Q. And is it fair to say that you were one of her closest 10 confidentes?
- 11 A. Yes, I would say so.
- 12 Q. Can we turn to your first statement, which is on the
 13 screen now, it's paragraph 29, and page 8, and here you
 14 say:

15 "My advice during this period was on the general 16 tenor of the actions being taken, managing public 17 response and the communication of the actions being 18 taken. I played a role on the [First Minister's] behalf 19 in asking clinicians and officials for more and better 20 advice and raising questions on further action and acted 21 as a sounding board/thought partner for the 22 First Minister and others."

Are you able to tell me what you mean by "thought partner"?

25 **A.** Ministers, the First Minister, but other ministers as

- 1 normal for you to attend decision-making meetings with
- 2 the First Minister where she was in attendance, and this
- 3 included meetings with the Scottish Government Cabinet,
- 4 the Scottish Government Resilience Room, the gold
- 5 meetings, COBR meetings, and the four nations calls with
- 6 Boris Johnson and Michael Gove. Is that correct?
- 7 A. That's correct.
- 8 **Q**. So it's fair to say that you were a particularly
- 9 important part of the Scottish Government's response to
- the pandemic until at least March 2021; is that correct?
- 11 A. That's for others to judge, but I was certainly there12 and certainly participating in the response.
- 13 Q. You were there in almost all the --
- 14 **A.** Yes.
- 15 Q. -- meetings --
- 16 **A.** Yes.
- 17 Q. -- important meetings and in the rooms where thedecisions were being made?
- 19 **A.** Yes.
- Q. And you were the thought partner or the sounding board
 for the First Minister when it came to stress testing
- 22 perhaps the different conflicting advice that was being
 - 23 received?
- 24 **A.** Yes.
- 25 Q. And there would be, I think, is it fair to say, very few

1 people within the Scottish Government that would perhaps 2 be in the room for all the key meetings with the 3 First Minister during the course of the pandemic? 4 A. During the course of the pandemic, it was common for --5 there would be a few other people that you would see at 6 most of the meetings. So the Cabinet Secretary for 7 Health would be present very frequently, the Deputy 8 First Minister was present a lot, sometimes remotely 9 because, for reasons, he would be working from home, 10 ken Thomson, the Chief Medical Officer, or one of the 11 other medical advisers, but there was a core group who 12 were in St Andrew's House a lot and in a lot of those 13 meetings together.

- 14 Q. And you were part of that core group?
- A. And I was part of that, yeah. 15

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

25

16 Q. Can we turn to your first statement, and it's at 17 paragraph 36, page 9. Here I think you say:

> "I would not say I advised on the adoption or not of specific NPIs [that's non-pharmaceutical interventions], that was for the clinicians and officials, but I would have given views at certain points on the interpretation of the data, of public mood and compliance, of communications and where there was politics involved -for example securing the support of other parties or governments or impact on stakeholders such as through

at funerals, weddings and civil partnerships, and those rules kicked into force on 14 September 2020, and Nicola Sturgeon was due to announce new restrictions to the Scottish Parliament on 22 September 2020, and in fact the usual briefing time was changed from 12.15 that day to 2.20 that afternoon, and here we have an exchange of messages, this is shortly before Nicola Sturgeon was due to make the announcements about the new restrictions that day, and this exchange relates to a discussion 10 about whether the rules should be changed for weddings, civil partnerships and funerals.

> If we start by reading the top message, so Nicola Sturgeon says -- and this is on 22 September at 12.09, so shortly before she's due to make the public announcement:

"We haven't thought about weddings. They are reducing but not sure what to."

You reply:

"I think as we only just put them up just leave it."

Then you go on to say:

"They aren't including churches etc as far as I know and I think -- though will check -- that they were higher than us."

11

24 Then you say:

"They had 30....we have 20."

border controls -- on that aspect." 1

2 So is it your position that you did not advise on 3 the adoption or not of specific NPIs?

4 A. I think when certain NPIs were on the table in that

5 thought partner role there would be perhaps

6 conversations between myself and the First Minister as

7 to which ones -- or exchanges as to which ones to use.

8 That could perhaps be considered advice on the adoption,

9 but it was not -- I think what I meant is I didn't

10 decide on the adoption.

Q. Yes, so you advised but I think your position, I think 11 12 more accurately, is you didn't make the ultimate

13 decision?

14 A. Yes, and nor did I sort of say "Here is your selected 15 list of NPIs", they would come in proposals from the

16 Chief Medical Officer, for example, and we would then

17 discuss the kind of things that were on the table.

18 Q. Can we turn to some WhatsApp messages that you have 19 disclosed to the Inquiry between yourself and

20 Nicola Sturgeon. I will come back to the circumstances 21 of the disclosure later on.

22 A. Okay.

3

16

17

18

25

23 Q. But first of all can we turn to INQ000287766, and we're 24 looking at page 9. And by way of context, the Scottish

25 Government announced the rules that permitted 20 people

1 Then you say:

2 "They are going to 15.

"And 30 at funerals -- I think we stay at 20."

4 Does the "they" in this conversation refer to the 5

UK Government?

6 A. Yes, it does.

7 Q. So Nicola Sturgeon in this example tells you at around 8 12.10 the day that she is due to make the announcement 9 to the public, the usual time being 12.15 but this day 10 we see that it was moved to 2.20, she tells that you 11 she's not sure about what to do and you tell her to stay 12 with 20 attendees, when the UK Government has gone down 13 from 30 to 15, and that ultimately becomes the decision 14 that day, because there is no change to the position of 15 20 as far as the Inquiry is aware.

So is this not an example of a decision that was made very much at the last minute over WhatsApp between you and Nicola Sturgeon?

19 So there are a number of aspects to this exchange. The Α. decision -- I don't view this as the decision because 20 21 the decision had been taken, so a decision had been 22 taken at Cabinet to go to 20, through the normal 23 processes. And where the First Minister is saying "We 24 haven't thought about weddings", there had been

> significant thought by I think the communities and 12

equalities team about what were the appropriate numbers of people at particular services. So that decision had been taken, that decision had gone through the proper process, and I give my view that I don't think we need to essentially re-make that decision.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

I think the message underneath that says that the statement is being forwarded to her, which is, I think, the Prime Minister's statement, and had she still wanted to take further action she could have come back on that.

I also think behind this WhatsApp, if you like,
I was having an exchange with the lead official to make
sure I had the information correct and that the
information I was giving the First Minister was the
right information.

- 15 Q. Is a decision not to change the rules still a decision?
- 16 A. I think there had been a positive, if you like, and 17 a proactive decision at Cabinet that the position in 18 Scotland was that there would be 20. There is neither 19 a confirmation or -- you know, if the First Minister had 20 come back and said "I agree", then I would support your 21 view that that was a decision. She actually doesn't 22 comment and there may be other actions elsewhere. 23 I don't think it did change, from memory, until later 24 on, but this to my mind is me giving my advice, my 25 thought in that thought partnership role that we stay

seeking scientific advice would have been the on-the-hoof aspect; suggesting that you stick at the decision that had been taken based on information was a more coherent position.

- Q. But we can see that Nicola Sturgeon's first WhatsApp to you is "We haven't thought about weddings", that seems to suggest that there wasn't really much thought process that had gone into the decision until this exchange with you, which begins at around 12.10?
- A. No, I think she means we haven't thought about changing weddings, if you like, in response to the UK Government changing weddings. We had thought about weddings when the decision had been taken positively and proactively in Cabinet to set the limit at 20.
- Q. So is it fair to say that because Nicola Sturgeon comes
 to you, not being sure what to do, and ultimately, as
 the Inquiry has seen, that on this date there was no
 change to the rules, and you were the one that suggests
 that "we stay at 20", are you effectively the main
 driver of this decision?
- 21 A. No, I don't think so. If the First Minister has -- the
 22 First Minister has a strong enough mind that if she had
 23 felt that my advice was not the right advice, she would
 24 have said so or she would have acted in another
 25 capacity, asked for further advice, delayed the position

15

at 20. If she had wanted to pursue it, to consider it further, perhaps after receiving the statement she may have, there would be exchanges in some other fashion.

- Q. There wasn't any scientific briefing that you received
 that appears to have informed your view, let's stick
 with 20, was there?
- 7 A. There would have been on the decision which had very
 8 recently, I think that, you know, a day or two before,
 9 been taken to set it at 20.
- 10 Q. I believe that the decision to move it down to 20 had 11 been taken around maybe 10 September, and the decision 12 had come into force on 14 September, and what we are 13 talking about is, here, looking at 22 September, and 14 from the documents that have been disclosed to 15 the Inquiry, there -- between -- the Inquiry's looked at 16 all of the documents between 10 September and 17 23 September, and the Inquiry can see no advice being 18 given between these dates about whether the number 19 should remain at 20 or whether it should go up or down.

20 So is this not an example of a decision simply being 21 made on the hoof, shortly before the First Minister is 22 meant to be announcing restrictions?

A. I would think that advising that shortly before the
 statement on restrictions was about to be made that
 a decision should be taken to change the limit without

1.

- on weddings, she would have acted on that. I am advising. I sought the correct information, if you like, on the factual basis to give that advice, but the decision is very much hers.
- Q. If these messages had been deleted by you -- and they
 haven't, because that's why we have them -- how would
 the Inquiry and the public be able to understand how and
 why the decision was made at this time not to change the
 number of people that can attend funerals or weddings?
- A. So as I've said in this regard I have recollection of 10 11 contacting, I think on Teams, the official responsible 12 for the sort of framework documents, if you like, to 13 check my facts, to check what it was. They would be 14 able to see the decision that was made, which was the 15 decision to stay at 20 being made previously, as 16 essentially the decision to set at 20 through the 17 process of advice and Cabinet papers, so that decision 18 would be very -- set out in very great detail. The 19 exchange I will have had the official will have said 20 "The First Minister is asking about weddings, what's the 21 position?"
- Q. But ultimately the public, if this message had been
 deleted, and the Inquiry, would not know that the
 decision -- ultimately the First Minister, as at 12.10
 that day, wasn't sure what to do and in fact within

a couple of hours when she announced the restrictions she'd reached a view that the numbers would not be changed and all of that had occurred within a very short time involving a WhatsApp discussion with you.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

23

That wouldn't be the sort of insight that the public or the Inquiry would have if these messages had been deleted; is that correct?

- A. I think there may not be that insight into, if you like,
 the moment of "Oh, should we think about this?" The
 sort of -- the reflection on "Is the advice that we have
 at the moment the correct advice?" But they would know
 why the decision on weddings was that there should be
 20 people.
- 14 Q. And the reflection is part of the decision-makingprocess, isn't it?
- A. It can be. I think in this it is, "Are the UK doing something that we should be doing?" That will be -- I would expect to find in notes from officials providing "This is what the UK is doing", and considering, in slower time, perhaps before the next update of the regulations, should we adopt any of this. But that split second, if you like, of indecision would not

necessarily be recorded elsewhere.

- Q. Could I just confirm, so do you agree with me that this
 would be an important part of the specific decision that
- Q. -- but you've also got the human side that you've touched upon, which is as being a thought partner or a sounding board, where you get to see people's real maybe struggles with the decisions that they're making, needing different viewpoints and insights, and together that forms the full context to that decision, doesn't it?
- 8 A. Yes, I think there can be moments where a bit of, 9 perhaps, reassurance is required or making sure that we 10 essentially don't take informal decisions when formal decisions have been taken. So had there been a decision 11 12 here to change, that would have been a decision based on 13 no scientific advice at all, taken in, you know, the 14 space of 20 minutes. When you have a full, proper 15 process this is essentially deferring back to the proper 16 formal process.
- 17 **Q.** The formal process which, I think, in this instance, had occurred about 12 days before or --
- 19 **A.** Yes.
- 20 Q. -- there or thereabouts?
- 21 **A.** Yes.
- 22 Q. Can we turn to INQ000287766.
- This is again your WhatsApp messages, we're looking at page 35.

19

25 A. Sorry, can that be made just a touch bigger?

was under contemplation here on this date, thisexchange?

A. I think if it had been -- I don't want to dispute this
too strongly, but I don't want to over sort of state the
importance of this particular position. There had
been a -- you know, every week there was a review of
what the decisions were, what the appropriate steps
were, what actions should be taken, and they were done

9 in a very meticulous fashion, and there will be
10 occasions where people have a moment of, "Oh, is that
11 right?" And they might ask a special adviser they

right?" And they might ask a special adviser, theymight ask a policy official, they might ask the clinical

13 adviser that happens to be in the room with them. Those

moments are quite human. But I wouldn't want to
 overstate the importance of this as opposed to the
 importance of the proper process that was followed that

set the limit at 20, because that was a very diligent process.

19 Q. Both processes, the formal and the informal, have their20 place, don't they --

21 **A.** They do, they do.

Q. -- in the decision-making process? And part of it isyou have the formal frameworks, whether it's

24 a Cabinet --

25 A. Yeah.

8

9

10

11

18

- 1 Q. I think they will hopefully come on screen a little bit2 bigger?
- 3 A. They're a little blurry.
- 4 Q. We are looking at -- does that help?
- 5 A. Yes, that does help.
- Q. Thank you, helps me as well, so I think we can bothread.

So this is a discussion between you and Nicola Sturgeon about the number of people who could meet indoors from March 2021, so if we look at the first message, it's from you saying:

"When you respond on Cabinet paper -- in June -could we make it 6/3 indoors -- it's just much more
normal!"

15 Can I just pause there, what's the significance of 16 the numbers 6 and 3?

- 17 **A.** I believe that would be 6 people, 3 households.
- 18 **Q**. And then if we -- Nicola Sturgeon's reply is:

19 "That will be after 4/3 mid may I assume?"

20 You reply saying:

21 "Indoors April 4/2, May 6/2....is what I currently 22 have."

23 Nicola Sturgeon replies:

"Is that indoors in pubs etc? thought we werewaiting til may for indoor households."

1 set of communications material that I am looking at, and 1 You reply saying: 2 2 "We appear to be waiting till June for indoors at suggesting to the First Minister that I don't think the 3 home..." 3 final part of the proposal, which is not in the Cabinet 4 4 You also reply: paper but is in these communications materials, doesn't 5 "So in pubs etc it's 4/2 in April, 6/2 in may ...and 5 really work, in my view. 6 then in June it should go to 6/3 and we allow you to 6 Q. I think your reasoning given is: 7 meet in your own home." 7 "... it's just much more normal!" 8 8 You reply -- you again say: Can you explain what you mean by that? 9 "Cabinet paper doesn't actually run all the way to 9 A. Sometimes when you looked at the advice that was given 10 June but my mock graphics do." 10 you had to think through what will this mean for people 11 Nicola Sturgeon replies: 11 living their lives in practice and how might people want 12 "We should bring indoor houses to mid may." 12 to function, what would people consider a return to 13 13 normality, if that's what you're trying to do. And You reply saying: 14 "Can you make that your feedback or do you want me 14 although we had previously had 6/2 regulations, I think, 15 to do it." 15 the year before, I actually think what I was reflecting 16 And she replies: 16 on here was 6/3 possibly enabled more of a sort of --17 "I'll do it." 17 families to gather in a slightly easier way. 18 So if we pause there, in this exchange, you are 18 But I think you accept or would you accept that just --Q. 19 pushing for or maybe advising --19 the explanation being "it's just much more normal" isn't 20 Α. 20 very scientific, is it? 21 21 Q. -- that there is a change of the rules on the amount of A. It is not, I agree, it is not hugely scientific, but one 22 people who can socialise indoors; is that right? 22 of the things that you have to do, or that certainly 23 A. So this refers to a proposal, so the numbers 4/2, 6/2, 23 I felt was necessary in this, and this was not 24 24 I'm not just pulling those out of the air, this is a function unique to me, is to think when you have a set 25 a proposal and a draft of a Cabinet paper and in a draft 25 of regulations that you're not -- it often felt like 22 1 they were proposed in the abstract without considering 1 consequences?" or "Is that a move we have space to 2 the way in which people function in their real life, and 2 make?" if you like. 3 particularly around how people interact with each other, 3 Q. So it wasn't strictly the case that the Scottish 4 you were seeking to balance caution and protection from 4 Government was following the science, because the 5 the virus with the kind of normality that might be good 5 science had a role to play but there was this other 6 for people in a more societal sense. 6 element that you, for instance, and other special 7 7 Q. Was that a consistent theme up until -- your involvement advisers, and indeed other stakeholders, would bring 8 till March 2021, that the advice that you were -- the 8 into the decision that wouldn't necessarily be 9 scientific and medical advice that you were receiving 9 science-based? 10 A. The science underpinned everything, and if you suggested often seemed very much in the abstract, devoid of kind 10 11 of the real world and how people live? 11 changes, if ministers wanted to do something different, 12 there would normally be a sort of referral back to see 12 A. I think -- I don't want to suggest that the people 13 giving the advice were sort of abstract and devoid of 13 if we could calculate what that might do, if a minister 14 understanding, but it was their job to provide, 14 proposed something that would push the R -- or that 15 you know, what is the appropriate regulation at 15 would be calculated or modelled to push the R number 16 a very -- on a very strict basis, it was not their job 16 above, then that would likely not be taken forward. So

cautioned by the science in how far you could go.

But not necessarily -- science wasn't the be-all and end-all of the Scottish Government's approach?

17

A. It was dominant but I don't think you can take decisions
 in a situation without being aware of other factors.

you were underpinned by the science and, if you like,

Q. And what we see here in this exchange is that there is
 a decision to go to Cabinet with, I think, what yourself
 and the First Minister have discussed and that's going

24

that on -- is that -- does that have serious

to consider what does this mean for people's mental

relationships. They were there to consider what will

There were other people who would feed in points about

keep the R number to its lowest level, if you like.

"Well, actually, if you could make a slight tweak to

that, does that make it better for people societally or

in a mental health sense?" and "What's the impact of

health, what does it mean for their family

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

2 terms of the change of rules. 3 A. Well, this confirms that it's going to be her feedback 4 to the Cabinet paper. That would create an opportunity, 5 if the clinicians, for example, thought that was 6 inappropriate, for them to come back on her feedback --7 and this would all be in formal exchanges, if they did 8 this -- to say "First Minister, actually we would rather 9 not do that and this is why we would rather not do 10

to be Nicola Sturgeon's view presented to Cabinet in

1

5

6

7

8

9

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

- Q. Is it fair to describe the role of the Scottish Cabinet 11 12 at times as being a decision-making ratifying body as 13 opposed to a decision-making body, so it ratified 14 decisions that had been made elsewhere, whether it's in 15 informal communications, whether it's in gold command 16 meetings or in other one-on-one discussions between key 17 decision-makers, and the role of Cabinet was, at times, 18 simply just to ratify those decisions?
- 19 Α. No, I don't think so. I think everything that went to 20 Cabinet was a proposal and Cabinet ministers would push 21 back sometimes, ask for amendments, ask for changes, 22 some decisions may be deferred because Cabinet members 23 wanted more information or the First Minister wanted 24 more information. There was an extensive process of 25 engagement with clinicians, advisers and Cabinet

1 final decision would be delegated to the First or Deputy 2 First Minister, but Cabinet members would have the 3 opportunity to comment on the additional information 4 that came in in between.

Q. Was an example of a decision that was delegated to Nicola Sturgeon, or maybe perhaps John Swinney, around the local restrictions? You'll remember when the levels system came in and decision-making around, for instance, whether Glasgow would remain in level 3 or 2 or whether 10 Edinburgh would go up or down. Is that the sort of 11 detail that was delegated to the First Minister to make?

A. You would have a broader discussion around what the levels would be, but the final check, if you like, on the morning of the announcement against that day's figures would be delegated, so to check that there wasn't a need to adjust, if you like, what had been agreed in the broader discussion.

Q. That's maybe an issue that we'll explore with further later witnesses.

I wanted to turn to the political strategy behind the Scottish Government's response to the pandemic. Is it fair to say that you spent a lot of your career, perhaps less so now, strategising about Scottish independence?

A. I think supporters of Scottish independence might be 27

1 ministers before the Cabinet paper would come to 2 Cabinet, so there would be opportunities prior the 3 Cabinet for people to feed in, but there would also be 4 genuine discussion at Cabinet.

5 Q. Would there often be instances where the ultimate 6 decision was delegated by Cabinet to, for instance, 7 Nicola Sturgeon or John Swinney?

8 A. There were certainly occasions where Cabinet would agree 9 to delegate a decision, yes.

10 Q. What sorts of decisions do you recall that were 11 delegated to Nicola Sturgeon or John Swinney during your 12 involvement in the pandemic?

13 Decisions that were delegated were, tended to be --14 sometimes in the relationship to the communications 15 around a decision, sometimes in relation to the timing 16 of the announcement of a decision, and sometimes where 17 an additional piece of information or a piece of 18 analysis was to come in, and Cabinet members would have 19 the chance to put their views in writing or to speak 20 directly to the First Minister but there would not be 21 another Cabinet meeting called. If, for example, you 22 had the Cabinet meeting, say, on the Tuesday and you 23 were looking at something that you might announce on the 24

Thursday and an additional piece of information was requested, you wouldn't necessarily recall Cabinet, the

1 disappointed with what my answer is, but not as much as 2 people would have thought or would have liked. A large 3 part of my political career's been spent strategising 4 about what the Scottish Government does in other policy 5 areas, but yes, I have had a role throughout in the 6 progress of Scottish independence.

7 Q. And how many years would you say that you've had a role 8 in the strategy for independence?

9 A. Probably from around about 2012.

10 Q. Could we turn to the Cabinet minute from 30 June 2020.

11 If we look at the first page, you will see that this 12 is a Cabinet meeting which is attended by everyone, in 13 terms of the Cabinet secretaries, that you would expect, 14 including the First Minister, and you're also in 15 attendance, you're noted as a special adviser.

> Can we turn to page 13, paragraph 56(e), and you will see here that one of the Cabinet conclusions is, and if it can be -- thank you. If I can read, it says:

"Agreed that consideration should be given to restarting work on independence and a referendum, with the arguments reflecting the experience of the coronavirus crisis and developments on EU exit."

So this is a Cabinet conclusion, and it's from 30 June 2020. Are you able to tell us what the significance of a Cabinet conclusion is?

A. Yes, so you would have a Cabinet paper, I think in this case it was on EU exit, and at the end of a Cabinet paper there are normally a set of actions proposed, and this would have been one of the actions proposed in the paper on EU exit.

1 2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

24

I -- the fact that something is in the Cabinet conclusion does not necessarily mean there was an active discussion on that particular issue. So this is (e), so there would have been five points in the EU exit paper. I have -- as you know, I have contemporaneous notes of some of these meetings. If we had had a discussion on independence and the constitution, it would have been in my notes, I was the chief political adviser to the government. It is not. So my recollection and what that tells me is that there was no substantive discussion on issues around independence and around EU exit and this had been included in the paper.

17 a referendum at this meeting. There was a discussion 18 19 Q. You've already discussed that there's a place for formal 20 structures and informal discussions within the 21 decision-making process. One can't get any more formal 22 in terms of decision-making than what's in the Cabinet 23 minutes as the agreed actions. Do you accept that? 24 Α. Yes

25 Q. And it carries perhaps more weight about what the

references that I can think of in the programme for government of the following year, so that would be the programme for government 2021/2022, where there's maybe one or two paragraphs, and they make clear that any action would be contingent on the state of the Covid pandemic. I don't think anything happens until at least after the 2021 election.

8 Q. But there is, from late 2020, some press coverage where 9 other politician parties are telling the Scottish 10 Government to stop talking or concentrating on 11 independence and focusing on the pandemic response. Do 12 you recall those sorts of press coverage starting from 13 late 2020 going into early 2021?

14 A. I think the constitutional position of the Scottish 15 Government, and I don't mean to be flippant in this 16 reply, but any breath of the word "independence" would 17 lead the opposite parties to say "You are focusing on 18 independence over the pandemic". You could have been 19 working 18 hours, 20 hours a day on the pandemic, not 20 seen anything on independence for the course of the 21 year, it would not stop an opposition member saying that 22 we were focusing too much on independence.

23 Q. We'll come back to the topic of independence. Can we look now at your notebook, and this is at 25 INQ000346141. Just before we look at the specific page,

31

1 Scottish Government is seeking to do than informal notes that may exist, this being in a Cabinet meeting minutes?

2 3 A. Normally I would agree with you, and in the other points 4 I do. What strikes me about this point is it was agreed 5 that "consideration should be given"; it wasn't agreed 6 that we would do something other than think. And the --7 following this period no action is taken on independence 8 or a referendum during this period, so to the end 9 of 2020. If it had been, I would have been involved in 10 it. There is nothing that I am aware of that the 11 government proactively did. If the government had 12 proactively done something, there would be much evidence 13

of it: there would be published papers, there would be

14 statements and there would be occasions in Parliament. 15 This was a focus on the fact that we were about to leave

16 the EU, which was, during 2020, the dominant 17 constitutional concern of the Scottish Government.

18 So when do you say that independence became a subject 19 matter under discussion in the Scottish Government

20 during the pandemic?

21 A. It generally didn't. So I worked on the pandemic 22 March 2020 to March 2021. One of the first steps we did

23 was suspend work on independence and the referendum.

24 The team that worked on it was disbanded and sent to 25 work on Covid-related activities. There are a few

30

1 can you explain what the purpose of your notebook was?

2 A. I kept notes through most of the year on Covid of 3 Cabinet meetings, of COBR meetings, of SGoRR meetings,

4 in essence to keep myself right in what had been agreed,

5 what had been discussed, what my actions were, what

6 I should be expecting different parts of the government

7 to deliver over the week. It was my way of keeping on top of what was happening. 8

9 Q. Can we turn to the entry on page 142, and you'll see at 10 the top this is headed "Gold Command" and these appear 11 to be your notes from a gold command meeting that took 12 place on 28 September 2020.

> Can we now turn over the page. And if we're able to increase the size on the second page shown on the screen? Thank you.

Just by way of, I think -- so just by way of context, first of all, these are your notes on a discussion of a potential circuit-breaker lockdown around -- I think this was being discussed in September going into October 2020; is that correct?

21 That's correct

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

22 Q. If we are able to look at the -- I'm just waiting for --23 it's the next page.

24 (Pause) 25 It might be if I can read out --

1	A.	Yeah.	1		political
2	Q.	your notes, that might assist. I think we almost had	2		a public
3		it, but	3		hand. V
4	A.	I can just about read this, so carry on.	4		strategy
5	Q.	There's a note that's written on	5	A.	It's not a
6		Yes, I think that's perfect, thank you.	6		pressure
7		And it reads:	7		falling o
8		"navigate economy avoid blunt instrument[s]."	8		the poin
9		Then it says, I think is it "FM" or "FH No"?	9		For
10	A.	I think that's FM.	10		to this
11	Q.	"FM No finances."	11		restriction
12	A.	Oh, no, sorry, that's "FH", the next one down is "FM".	12		minimal
13	Q.	Yes, who could you tell us	13		didn't ha
14	A.	That would be Fiona Hyslop.	14		individua
15	Q.	Fiona Hyslop says:	15		circuit-b
16		"No finances."	16		open up
17		And the First Minister says:	17		enable ι
18		"Starting point how do we reduce impact and	18		I think, is
19		spread [with] minimal [economic] impact."	19		wanted
20		And then there's your handwritten notes:	20		do to try
21		"Political tactics calling for things we can't do	21		were no
22		to force UK."	22		force a
23		Do you see that?	23	Q.	And you
24	A.	Yes.	24		referenc
25	Q.	So your note suggests that the Scottish Government's 33	25	A.	Yes.
1	Q.	is that correct?	1		a spat.
2		We have heard evidence from witnesses, including	2		Alth
3		Professor Devi Sridhar, of the importance of cohesion in	3		partisan
4		the response between the UK Government and the Scottish	4		support
5		Government, and this is in the context of public health.	5		trying to
6		These tactics, whether you can call them political	6		finding o
7		tactics, of going public would create more division with	7	Q.	Why did
8		the UK Government, wouldn't they?	8		regulation
9	A.	As I said, in an ideal situation the UK Government would	9		concern
10		have agreed that funding would be provided so that the	10		with the
11		Scottish Government could put in place the public health	11	A.	I think th
12		restrictions that we wanted and then there would have	12		resolve
13		been no need for any pressure.	13		privately
14		Sorry, the it's disappeared from the screen.	14		Welsh C
15		The purpose of this is not division, it's not to	15		Northern
16		have an argument, it's to be able to put in place the	16		were ma
17		public health restrictions that we were being advised	17		have to
18		were required at that time. When private discussions do	18		able to
19		not get you to the place where you have access to the	19		That me
20		finances that you need to do that, you have to explain	20		afford it,
21		to the public why you're not doing it, and in opening	21		may hav
22		that up it's to be very clear that it's	22		providin

the UK Government's decision not to provide finances

public health measures that you want. I don't call that

that is impacting on your ability to put in place the

35

23

24

25

strategy was to create what might be seen as spat with the UK Government to force their What was the political advantages of that sort of about a spat. This would be about putting e on the UK Government. It's not deliberately out; in the ideal world they would have accepted its that we were making to them. -- if I can give a bit of context and then get was weighing up how we could put further ons on, potentially, a circuit-breaker with economic impact, because the Scottish Government ave the means to provide economic support to als or businesses if we went for the full reaker. What we needed was the UK Treasury to additional funding, to extend furlough, to us to take actions to do that. And this, is about us setting out very clearly what we to do in public health terms but what we couldn't to build pressure on the UK Government, who ot amenable to this discussion in private, to change of position. would need to do that publicly, and that's the ce to the political tactic --34

Although I wrote "political [tactic]", it's not partisan, it's not about boosting or, you know, knocking support for one government or one party. It's about trying to do the job that we were trying to do and finding ourselves very frustrated in doing.

Q. Why did you feel in terms of intergovernmental regulations that you needed to go public with your concerns and you weren't able to raise these privately with the UK Government?

A. I think there would be a number of issues that we would
 resolve privately but this one was not being resolved

13 privately. We were in this position, the

14 Welsh Government were in this position, the

Northern Ireland Government were in this position and we

were making no headway, so you reach a point where you

17 have to say to the people you represent why you are not

able to do something that you are being advised to do.

That means going public on the fact that you can't

afford it, that means going public on the fact that you

21 may have asked the Treasury for money and they were not

providing it. It's not a "we are doing this to stir up

23 political contest", it's "we can't do what we're trying

to do and we need to tell you why".

25 Q. Can we go back to your WhatsApp messages, and this time,

my Lady, I wanted to give a warning that there will be 1 2 some bad language in some of these.

3 LADY HALLETT: I'm used to it.

4 MR TARIQ: Yes. I think it's partly for the broadcasters 5 rather than your Ladyship.

- 6 Α. Apologies, I thought I'd been quite restrained.
- 7 Q. We're looking at page 20.
- 8 A. Oh, it's not my language?

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

9 Q. Yes. And just to give some context, on 31 October 2020 10 at 6.30 pm the Prime Minister Boris Johnson began his 11 address announcing the second national lockdown, and 12 I want to pick up the messages between yourself and 13 Nicola Sturgeon which starts ten minutes into the 14 address.

> So if we read the first message on 31 October at 6.40 you say:

"Hitting the 15 [minutes] between the rugby and strictly to lock the country up... let us never do this like this."

Nicola Sturgeon replies:

"Their comms are behind awful. We're not perfect but we don't get nearly enough credit for how much better than them we are."

She then replies:

"This is fucking excruciating -- their comms are

work hard to mitigate, because people in Scotland see both. So, yeah, we were clearly not very complimentary about their communications handling that day.

Q. Is it fair to say that the relationship between

Nicola Sturgeon and Boris Johnson by this date had completely broken down?

A. I think "broken down" to a degree overstates what was there to break. They had met on a number of occasions, there was always a politeness, a business-like approach to it. When Boris Johnson first became Prime Minister and came to meet Nicola Sturgeon in Scotland, they had a discussion that I think has been described pub -- as it was more like a debate, you know, two intelligent people engaged in discuss about policy issues.

When we got to Covid, I think it was much harder. It was evident in his exchanges with the Scottish Government, with the First Minister -- and I think with the other First Ministers, because we would all be on the same call -- that he didn't want to be on those calls, he wasn't necessarily well briefed on those calls, and he wasn't listening to the points we were making on those calls. And so I think engagement with him came to be seen as slightly pointless during this

25 Q. I think it's going as early as -- it was March 2020, 39

AWFUL." 1

3

4

5

10

2 Then she goes on to say:

"His utter incompetence in every sense is now offending me on behalf of politicians everywhere."

You reply saying:

6 "I have a separate whatsapp [the name is redacted] 7 and davie and we are offended on behalf of Spads 8 everywhere."

9 Nicola Sturgeon says:

"He is a fucking clown."

11 So was there a perception amongst Nicola Sturgeon 12 and the wider Scottish Government that it was doing so 13 much better than the UK Government in the pandemic 14 response around this time?

15 A. I think this refers specifically to the communications 16 aspect of the response. And that's sometimes dismissed, 17 but communications is very important in a public health

18 situation, people need to know what to do and why and to 19 understand it and to trust in it, and this was the end

20 result of a day that had been quite shambolic in

21 the UK Government, and that has an impact on what people

22 see and think in Scotland about the pandemic overall.

23 So while he was announcing something that was not

24 relevant to Scotland, the sort of chaos that appeared

25 around some of the decisions they took we then had to

1 I think, in one of your notes you describe COBR as 2 a shambles.

3 A. Yes

4 Q. Was that the view that you had from very early on, from 5 March 2020, that the Prime Minister wasn't really 6 wanting to engage with --

7 A. Yes

8 Q. -- the Scottish Government?

9 A. Yes.

Q. How did that then affect, from the Scottish Government, 10 11 its working relationship with the UK Government and the 12 working relationship between the First Minister and the 13

Prime Minister?

14 A. I think in relation to the Scottish Government and the 15 UK Government in broader terms, there was fairly 16 constant and fairly good communication and co-operation.

17 I mean, particularly in health this is evident, and at

18 times, not always but at times, in the economic space.

19 And I think officials at all levels sort of had

20 discussions that were quite good. But the discussions

21 between the First Minister and the Prime Minister -- and

22 other First Ministers, I mean, it was very -- it was

23 never bilateral, there were also the First Minister of

24 Wales and the First Minister and deputy First Minister

25 of Northern Ireland on these calls as well -- they --

5

20

21

22

23

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

they didn't get us anywhere.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

So we started with a very clear approach that we should all try to work together, and moving into lockdown was all done in a co-ordinated fashion, but when you got to what I think the First Minister wanted to be substantive discussions about what direction to go in, a thrashing out of different proposals and different ideas, that wasn't what we got. We got a Prime Minister who, it certainly felt at the end of the video screen or at the end of the line, was reading a script and would summarise the contributions of the three First Ministers and the Deputy First Minister from Northern Ireland in ways which largely ignored the points that they had

- 15 Q. How early on in the pandemic response did you come to 16 that realisation?
- 17 A. It was difficult -- I mean, it was more effective at the 18 beginning, sort of March, although it was obvious that 19 they were not, you know, hugely keen on having us there 20 and being in the room. It was actually quite effective 21 with Dominic Raab for the period in which the 22 Prime Minister was in hospital. And it's when the 23 Prime Minister sort of re-engages in the discussions 24 that it is evident, as you're talking about the lifting 25 of restrictions for example, changes in messaging,

utterly incompetent, that doesn't really create any sort of functioning relationship between the two leaders of the respective governments, does it?

- A. I mean, this is later than that point that you raised earlier about May, by which point I can't think of conversations in this period that were happening directly with the Prime Minister, they were happening with Michael Gove.
- Q. Can we now turn to page 21, and we are now looking -we've now moved on to 1 November 2020, and I wanted to look at messages that begin at 6.29 pm. Here you say:

"My reason for setting a timeline for them to answer us on furlough is purely political -- especially as we expect the answer to be no, it looks awful for them, and creating that kind of pressure could possibly result in a yes (though agree we shouldn't bank on it). Think I just want a good old fashioned rammy so can think about something other than sick people."

Nicola Sturgeon replies:

"Yeah I get it. And it might be worth doing. I've sent a rough formulation of what I might say tomorrow --I could for it in there."

So if we pause there, can you help us, what do you mean by "good old fashioned rammy" with the **UK Government?** 43

1 different approaches between Scotland, Wales and 2 Northern Ireland and the UK, that he is not informed and 3 doesn't want to be there.

Q. I think there seems to be kind of a very clear

6 recall that where the UK Government messaging moved to 7 Stay Alert, the Scottish Government remained at Stay at 8 Home. Was that the point, if we're trying to identify 9 in terms of timeline, where there was now clear 10 divergence in the approach between the two governments, 11 or did it occur earlier than that?

divergence in messaging from around 10 May 2020. You'll

12 I think that's the point where it becomes clear that A. 13 there is going to be a difference in approach between 14 the two governments, that the approach to lifting 15 restrictions in England is going to be different to the 16 approach to lifting restrictions in Scotland, Wales and 17 Northern Ireland, and that I think the sort of 18 philosophy or ideology behind the lifting of 19 restrictions was coming from a different place.

> So that is, I think, the point at which it becomes clear that we're going to go in slightly different directions and we have to try to work out how to go in different directions within the UK as a whole.

24 Q. If the First Minister of Scotland thought that the 25 Prime Minister of the United Kingdom was a clown, or

I think this is an expression of frustration that we were not able to manage the pandemic at this point in time in the way that we wanted and -- I mean, "a good old fashioned rammy" is language I would rarely use, actually, but, you know, is that we needed to have the argument in public. There were a lot of things in Covid where we didn't have the argument in public, there were a lot of things in Covid where the UK Government did something and we just let it go or they didn't do something and we just let it go.

I particularly felt this issue of furlough at a time when we wanted to apply restrictions and furlough was ending was -- was materially important to the handling of the pandemic. It was a hindrance to our ability to handle the pandemic. And I can't deny it, I was angry about that position because it really did block our ability to do what we wanted to do. So I think the message reflects that frustration perhaps bubbling over a little bit.

Q. Yes, I think earlier on we'd looked at your notebook and the entry from the gold command from 28 September and I think you'd said you take an issue with how I characterised it as a public spat. By this stage on

23 24 1 November you are looking for a public spat with the

25 UK Government; is that fair to say?

9

10

11

A. I am definitely looking -- you know, I'm clearly looking 1 2 to air the issue strongly and publicly, and, as I say, 3 in the vague hope that it might get us an answer, might 4 get us a yes.

LADY HALLETT: You were looking for a public spat?

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

A. I'm looking for a public spat for a purpose. A public spat could often deliver results. If the public pressure on the UK Government was there, it had been shown in the past that they would sometimes change their mind if they felt that pressure, and what I want them to do is change their mind.

12 MR TARIQ: So the discussion is whether the furlough scheme 13 should be available to Scotland, because at this stage 14 England had just entered into the second national 15 lockdown in England, and you're setting what is 16 effectively a political trap for the UK Government if it 17 refuses to extend the furlough scheme to Scotland it 18 looks awful for them and strengthens the argument for 19 independence, because you need to go alone, or if it 20 extends the furlough scheme to Scotland there is 21 additional funding available to Scotland. Therefore, 22 for the Scottish Government, a good old fashioned rammy 23 with the UK Government is a win-win situation; is that 24 not the essence of the point that you're making here, 25 that you're looking at this from purely political

Q. Can we turn to now page 23 in these WhatsApp messages, and here, just by way of context, what's being discussed here is efforts to have a four nations approach to restrictions over Christmas in 2020, and you'll see messages from you that begin at 9.04 pm and you say:

"Gove wants to talk tomorrow -- have said to ..."

And there is a name redacted.

"... to hold off going back till the morning and suggest waiting for the proposal before agreeing."

Nicola Sturgeon replies:

"I've just seen the email. I'm happy to do call, subject to proposal...but I wonder if we should make clear in advance we won't agree anything without cabinet approval (and get Wales to sign up to that)."

"Yep Cabinet Tuesday is a good marker. Tuesday or [Wednesday] might not be bad days for us to announce either. I am increasingly leaning to just one other household after seeing the poll. But I'm also a grinch about Christmas."

Then Nicola Sturgeon replies:

"I am too -- but on this I (reluctantly) think there's merit in uk wide position. Let's see the

47

So Nicola Sturgeon's reply to you on 20 November,

perspectives? 1

2 A. I would absolute that there's any issue of independence 3 in this. So I am keen, very keen, that we get a yes in 4 this situation and that we are able to enact the 5 restrictions at the time -- public health restrictions 6 at the timing the Scottish Government deems appropriate, 7 with the financial support that should come with that.

If there is a no, what looks awful for them is that they are not enabling us to take public steps at the time that we want. If the wider world wants to read constitutional implications into that, that is for them, but I was not making them.

12

13 Q. It was around this time that I think the furlough scheme was extended to Scotland in November; is that correct?

14 15 A. It ultimately was, there was significant pressure,

16 public pressure, placed on the UK Government. 17 Ultimately it did it because it did it for England, and

18 this was the issue, was that finance decisions that

19 related to mitigating public health measures were not

20 co-ordinated with the decisions each of the four nations

21 might make on those public health measures, they were

22 only triggered, if you like, when England took

23 a decision and Scotland, Wales and Northern Ireland all

24 faced significant difficulties during this period for

25 that reason.

46

1 she seems to be emphasising that she's reluctantly 2 seeing the merit in the UK-wide position. Does this not

3 suggest that by this stage the default position for the

4 Scottish Government was to be different from

5 the UK Government?

6 A. I think it was the default position for each of the four 7 governments to take the decisions that suited their 8 geographical and pandemic-related circumstances. It was not that we would be different to the UK or different to 9

10 Wales, it was that, in taking the right decisions for

11 the people we were responsible to, the Scottish people

12 in effect, they were not necessarily the same decisions 13

that the UK was taking.

24

25

14 Q. But Nicola Sturgeon doesn't appear to be very 15 enthusiastic about four nations approach by this time, 16 does she? She's almost reluctantly having to sign up to 17

18 A. I think there was a reluctance in general around 19 Christmas positioning. We were essentially bounced by 20 the UK Government into a position about Christmas. 21 Telling people they can't have it when the UK Government have said you can was a very difficult situation to be

22 23 put in.

> There is a reluctance -- and you can see this higher up, you know, subject to the proposal, we're reading in

4

5

6

1 the public domain that people will be getting some 2 sort of relief from Covid over Christmas. We have not 3 seen a proposal that we are about to go onto a phone 4 call and be asked to agree to. So this again goes to 5 some of that what was to us a chaotic and shambolic 6 sort of approach. So it's very hard to sign up to 7 something and to enthusiastically embrace something that 8 you have had no input into.

- 9 **Q.** Were your advisers, whether it be scientific, clinical, 10 medical advisers, advising you about the benefit of 11 having a cohesive approach across the UK around the 12 restrictions over Christmas 2020?
- 13 A. Yes, to an extent, in part because of travel, and it was 14 travel that led us largely to look for a cohesive 15 approach. What I recall of the advice from advisers 16 around Christmas was, you know: we don't think this is 17 a good idea, make it as minimal as you can if you have 18 to do it at all.
- 19 Q. I now want to move on in the period to, you left your 20 role as chief of staff in March 2021, and you say that 21 after a short break you came into the role of strategic 22 political and policy adviser to the First Minister in 23 August 2021. I think you say in your statement that you 24 didn't have any involvement in the pandemic response 25 beyond this date except for COP26, which took place in

1 things like the new economic strategy, the draft energy 2 strategy, the resource spending review. I attended some 3 of the constitution secretary's independence meetings 4 but I did very little work on it. It was not my 5 purpose.

6 Q. Just so I understand, in your role as strategic 7 political and policy adviser to the First Minister, and 8 this is around the same time that there's movement 9 towards a second independence referendum, your position 10 is that you didn't actually do very much work on 11 independence?

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

A. I didn't. There was a delegated special adviser whose role was the constitution, he covered Brexit, primarily, and the development of the work on independence. I think it might be useful to say I had not been in government over that summer and I think -- there's has been a reference or material provided -- a BBC article sort of headlining this independence issue on that date in September that you remembered -- or cited, which is, again, the publication of a programme for government. I had had no involvement in the writing of that programme for government. Unusually. It was the first one in probably ten years that I hadn't been part of.

And it has maybe a page's worth of references to independence in a 180-odd page document. It was 51

Glasgow I think, in November 2021; is that correct? 1

2 Α. That's correct.

> Q. On 7 September 2021 Nicola Sturgeon announced that work would start again on the second independence referendum campaign. Does this announcement or did this

announcement coincide with your change of position from

7 chief of staff to becoming the chief political adviser

8 and strategic --

9 A. It broadly coincides in date terms but it doesn't 10 coincide in reason. I did not take a post -- my post 11 was not involved in any move on independence. 12 I attended the odd call, but it was not -- it was far

13 from the principal purpose of my job.

14 Q. What was the principal purpose of your job after 15 August 2021?

16 Initially it was the COP26 summit and to lead the sort A. 17 of Scottish Government's policy work in preparation work 18 in preparation for that. It was then to focus -- and 19 this was something I had felt as chief of staff we were

20 missing, was to step back from the frontline, from the 21 media, from the Parliament, from the day-to-day, and to

22 focus on some of the long-term commitments that we had 23 as a government and that we'd made in the 2021 election 24 around moving to renewable energy, around reaching net

25 zero, around tackling child poverty. So I worked on

1 a programme for government that set out, as we had in the election, a number of key policy objectives within 2 3 government and I had moved to lead on those policy 4 objectives because I had a reflection, which the 5 First Minister had shared, that you needed a special 6 adviser who could work across portfolios, with her

7 confidence, to try to inject some energy into them. 8 Q. Did the move towards pushing for a second independence 9 referendum, did that reflect a change of priority for 10 Nicola Sturgeon away from the pandemic response and to

11 the second independence referendum campaign in the

12 middle of 2021?

25

13 A. At that time, no, for her. I mean, I wasn't there day 14 to day, but my recollection of her in that time is that 15 she remained incredibly focused on the Covid pandemic. 16 You can think about more than one thing at a time when

17 you're First Minister, but she devoted vast amounts of

18 time to the Covid pandemic during this period, so ... 19 Was she devoting vast amounts of time to the Q.

20 independence strategy around this time? 21 A. It was largely led by the Cabinet Secretary for the

22 Constitution

23 Q. I wanted to move on to another area, and this is around 24 the public health messaging during the pandemic.

You say in your first statement, and I don't intend

12

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

21

22

23

A.

- to bring this up, that you've considerable experience in public communications. Is it fair to say that until at least March 2021 you played an important role in the Scottish Government's communications strategy in
- 6 A. Yes.

5

Q. And this included leading on, for instance, the
 preparations for the daily media briefings; is that
 correct?

relation to the pandemic?

- 10 A. I would share that responsibility with the head of the11 Covid briefing unit, but yes.
- 12 Q. And in fact we've seen some WhatsApp messages that you
 13 were actually one of the people that would decide, for
 14 instance, which adviser would appear on any given day.
- 15 Does that accord with your recollection?
- A. "Decide" is possibly strong. I would suggest who would
 come on what day, they would tell me what days they were
 and were not available and we would work out how we
 going to cover the whole week, in co-ordination with the
 health communications desk.
- Q. Were you the one effectively choosing, at least before
 checking their availability, who would be the one that
 would front a particular media briefing?
- A. I generally sought to simply just share it around and
 consider what each of them was working on and what we
- 1 **A.** Yeah.
- 2 Q. -- various measures; is that correct?
- 3 A. Yeah.
- Q. Can you tell me the importance of honesty, trust, being
 clear and transparent with the public in terms of public
 health communications strategy?
- 7 A. When -- I think to ask people to do something as extreme as, you know, stay at home, was something that was very 8 9 unusual and unprecedented in people's lives. They had 10 to have confidence that the people who were asking them 11 to do that were asking them to do that for the right 12 reasons and that it was something that we were asking of 13 everyone, and part of that was helping them to 14 understand why it was necessary and the impact it was 15 hoped that following that rule would have.
- Q. Could there be sometimes good reasons not to be open or candid or transparent with the public, and if so what
 sort of scenarios would there be where you wouldn't be open or transparent with the public?
- A. I think I can perhaps identify where you're taking me
 here. There would be occasions around patient
 confidentiality, particularly early in the pandemic,
 when, not at the time but subsequent to, there have been
 arguments that people should have known more, that we
 should have said more to the public about certain events

to be speaking about a, you know, piece of Public Health
Scotland work that had come out, I would probably look
for Professor Smith, Dr Smith, to do that. If it was we
need to give people a general update on a reminder about
behaviours because the polling maybe shows that
behaviours were slipping, I would look for
Professor Leitch to do that.

were likely to be speaking about. So if we were going

Q. So in broad terms what was the Scottish Government's
 strategy around public health communications, at least
 until the period that you were in position?

It was to be honest, to be clear, to trust people and to

- try to build cohesion amongst the public about the
 actions we were asking them to take. There was a lot of
 focus on explaining to people why we were asking them to
 do certain things, because that would boost the
 compliance, helping people understand the situation they
- were in and that we were in, and encouraging the behaviours that we needed people to undertake in order to mitigate the spread of the virus.
- Q. I think you said honest -- to be honest with the people,
 to be clear, to trust the people and try to build
 cohesion amongst the public so that the public -- you
 were able to explain to the public and the public
 understood why they were being asked to comply with -
 - and certain cases. That is an argument that has been made afterwards, and I think we can say very clearly we told people about cases. We perhaps didn't tell everybody about the personal circumstances of individual cases. So I think that that may be where you're heading. I think those are the main -- that is the main issue where you would keep something confidential, is if there was harm that could be caused to an individual, or to the process of managing Covid itself, by making
- Q. I think you probably were able to anticipate where
 I wanted to go. I wanted to ask you some questions
 about the Nike conference --

something more public.

- 14 **A.** Yeah.
- 15 Q. -- which took place between 25 and 27 February 2020.

Can we look at INQ000225995, and what this is is it's a chain of emails in which -- it's between yourself and Dr Catherine Calderwood, and you will see that other people copied in include the First Minister's office and indeed the Cabinet Secretary for Health.

If we look at what has been discussed here is whether to disclose the link between the conference and the first outbreak of Covid-19 in Scotland.

24 If we see, this is an email from you saying: 25 "All,

•

1 "Cab Sec, FM and Gregor ..."
2 If I can pause there, is that Gregor Smith?
3 **A.** Yes, it is.

Q. "... (who can discuss directly what we're looking for) -- are conscious that a number of Scotland's cases now connect to one event -- and that we are at a point where that could be reassuring information for the public around the increase in numbers, demonstrate we're still at containment, that contact tracing works and be a legitimate public interest matter.

"Ahead of the update to numbers at 2pm can FM and Cab Sec receive as full information as possible about that event, what's been done, the contract tracing, success etc. And can consideration be given with comms as to what can be said around it."

So I asked you about Professor Smith. Does this indicate that he was providing advice, information and advice, on the Nike conference around this time?

A. I think what happened, not specifically on the conference, I think the reason I'm referring to cab sec, FM and Dr Smith at the same time is, from my recollection, he had come from a meeting of SAGE to report to the Cabinet secretary and the First Minister what had been discussed and to update them, and so they were all in one room at this point. At the same time we

Q. So he had given you advice saying that this can be -the link can be --

A. That's my recollection.

4 Q. -- disclosed to the public?

If we then turn to page 1, which is a reply from Dr Catherine Calderwood, and you will see that this is on 6 March and I wanted to look at the final two, the end of that first page, her response is:

"My strong advice would be not to say anything here specifically naming the conference risks breaching patient confidentiality as a delegate list will be available."

So you've received some advice from Gregor Smith saying that he thinks that this can be disclosed, and then the CMO at the time, Dr Calderwood, says her strong advice is not to disclose.

At the time, did you think Dr Calderwood's advice

about not saying anything was the correct position?

A. I suppose I didn't think it was necessarily for me to judge the correct position, I would still have favoured making information available, but she was the doctor, she was the senior clinician, and she cited patient confidentiality, and ultimately the First Minister accepted that advice.

25 Q. Would it not have been entirely possible to tell the

were becoming aware that I think it was the second case and then a couple of subsequent cases of Covid originated with a particular event. I can't say at the time that I knew it was a Nike conference until the following email, and in a discussion with the three of them we collectively thought, "Well, perhaps we should -- if we tell people about this, it might reassure them that we don't have Covid springing up in lots of different places", although perhaps in hindsight we did. but that these three or four cases. I think it was, are all from one event.

Q. So at least your email seems to suggest that you and potentially the First Minister, the Cabinet Secretary for Health Jeane Freeman and perhaps even
 Professor Smith were in favour of telling the public about the link between this one event and the number of Scotland's first known cases of Covid-19; is that correct?

A. Yeah, I think the Cabinet secretary, the First Minister
and myself were -- and Dr Smith was asked, you know, do
you think we can and had advised that yes he thought we
could, hence why I'm saying he can discuss directly what
we're looking for. He had given us a bit of advice
on -- verbally on, you know, there will be limits, but
yes.

public about what had happened without breaching patientconfidentiality?

A. That was, if you like, the purpose of my request in the
email, to say "Can we have some advice with comms about
what can be said?" I think is how it's framed,
something like that. Well, sorry, that's -- "What is
the boundary of what we can say? What is the limit?"

Dr Calderwood I think probably had a concern heightened because the first case of Covid in Scotland had had media on their doorstep and had, you know, not been named as an individual but it was quite well known who that person was. This was cases, you know, 2 and 4 and 5, I think. So I think there was -- her concern was that it is quite easy to find people in Scotland and she didn't want to open that prospect up. I -- that's my speculation as to why she was so strong on the patient confidentiality issue here.

18 Q. Does this not give the impression of a cover-up?
19 Because the link only becomes known to the public after
20 a BBC Disclosure documentary in 2020, and that's when
21 we're still in the first lockdown. Does this not impact
22 the public's level of trust in the Scottish Government's
23 attitude?

A. As I've said, my preference was to say that there were
 a number of cases connected to a conference. I don't

1	think this is as you've described it, because the cases
2	themselves are publicly identified. Like, not
3	identified as individuals but the fact that there is
4	an increase in Covid cases, that there have been four or
5	five cases, is not kept within the government. That is
6	published in the statistical update that went out every
7	day. So that is known, as are the health boards in
8	which those individuals are located.
9	If I think I understand why people think

you know, oh, we should have said this was a conference. I thought that at the time. But I can also see the view that Dr Calderwood had, that actually you had people who were in quite a vulnerable position and you could be putting undue pressure on them at a time when they were unwell.

16 MR TARIQ: My Lady, I'm conscious of the time. Would this 17 be a good time to break?

LADY HALLETT: Certainly. 18

10

11 12

13

14

15

19 Just I have one question on -- I confess I don't 20 quite understand Dr Calderwood's advice. The delegate 21 list would, what, be hundreds on it?

22 I can't recollect the size of the conference.

23 LADY HALLETT: The chances are, if it's an international 24 company like Nike, it's going to be --

25 A. I honestly can't -- I think that is actually contained

1 again your notebook that we looked at in the morning 2 session. Can we look at page 37 you will see that this 3 is an entry that's undated but if you see at the top it 4 says:

5 "Not to be public.

"French national -- other conditions.

"Limited factual [information]."

Do you see that?

9 A. Yes.

6

7

8

Q. There was an article in the Edinburgh Evening News 10 suggesting that the first death from Covid-19 in 11 12 Scotland was a Frenchman who had attended our rugby 13 international, I think it was a Six Nations, between 14 Scotland and France on 8 March 2020. Why were details 15 not publicised at the time that -- the fact that this 16 person had travelled from France to Edinburgh to watch 17 the rugby?

A. So what was publicised at the time was that 18 19 an individual had died and that they had another 20 condition. This refers to advice -- I can't remember 21 who I was being given it from, but it's clearly a note 22 of somebody telling me that we are not to release the 23 fact that they were French. Again, this is not an issue 24 about trying to avoid disclosing the fact that they had 25 been at the rugby. I think, from memory, though my

63

1 somewhere in this Freedom of Information request, but 2 I can't recollect it.

3 LADY HALLETT: I do understand what you say about easier to 4 find people in Scotland, I just can't make the link between a delegate list being available and the patients 5 6 being identified. But did you or the First Minister not 7 challenge that assertion?

8 A. I can't remember. This would -- is a question that you 9 would need to put to the First Minister, that there may 10 have been a conversation after this advice, but this was 11 at a time when I think if you were told this was patient 12 confidentiality, you didn't necessarily feel like you 13 could challenge that. And, you know, the next day there 14 were five, ten more cases and it quickly moved on.

15 LADY HALLETT: I think you could challenge it, but there we 16 go.

17 Right, I shall return at 11.30.

18 (11.17 am)

19 (A short break)

20 (11.30 am)

25

1

4

21 LADY HALLETT: Mr Tariq.

22 MR TARIQ: Good morning again, my Lady.

23 We had just finished speaking about the Nike 24 conference

I now wanted to move on to INQ000346141, which is

recollection's not entirely clear, that this was either 2 about family contact or an issue to do with the French 3 consul and their sort of involvement in the fact that the person was French and needed -- repatriated. It was 5 not anything to do with the fact that they had travelled 6 from France to the rugby. It was some element of the 7 procedure around the death.

8 Q. I think Dr Calderwood had said at the time that the 9 patient was an older man who died under the care of 10 NHS Lothian. Did that not give the impression to the 11 public that the first person to die from Covid-19 in 12 Scotland was a local person and not a Frenchman?

13 It may have.

14 Q. And had the Scottish Government told the public that the 15 first person to die from Covid-19 in Scotland was 16 a French national who had travelled from France to

17 Edinburgh to watch the rugby, would this not have led to

18 some uncomfortable questions for the Scottish

19 Government's role in allowing the match to proceed in

20 the first place on 8 March 2020?

21 It may have but that was not the reason for not 22 disclosing the fact that they were French as far as 23 I can recall. There was no discussion about, you know,

24 did this or did this not relate to whether or not the

25 rugby should have gone ahead, this was an issue about

- the patient, the person who had died and, as far as
 I can recall, either their family or the procedures
 around working with the French Government.
- Q. But telling the Scottish public that a French national
 had died would not breach patient confidentiality when
 there's potentially hundreds, if not thousands of people
 travelling to the rugby from France, would it?
- 8 A. It would not. And again I would say I did not know the
 9 individual was connected to the rugby until shortly 10 a few days afterwards, from an external source.

LADY HALLETT: Also, if it was to do with the contacting the
 family and the French consul, surely it would be "not to
 be public until family informed" or something of that
 kind, wouldn't it?

A. It may have been, that may have been just shorthand, but the death was to be announced kind of straightaway. The French part was not to be public, certainly, at that time; I can't recollect if there was a "you can say this afterwards". But I did not know in this note that they were connected to the rugby, so the issue of not revealing the rugby was not a consider --

22 MR TARIQ: But that became --

23 A. -- in my mind.

24 Q. -- known pretty soon to the Scottish Government --

25 A. Yes.

65

pandemic, and I think you had said -- you had identified patient confidentiality, which we've discussed, but you also said it might be that one can't tell the public because -- for the purpose of the process of managing Covid itself, by making something more public. Can you explain what you meant by that?

5 Covid itself, by making something more public. Can you 6 7 A. One of the issues around the Nike conference, and 8 I think it was perhaps the subsequent line of 9 Dr Calderwood's email, was the contact tracing, and that 10 you -- or certainly clinicians, quite often, at the very 11 beginning, wanted this to conclude and to be done in 12 a contained way rather than to create some sort of 13 panic, if you like, around people who would not be 14 contact traced because they hadn't, in their view, been 15 16

Q. But does that not contradict what you said earlier on
 about the values of public health communication, being
 clear with the public, trusting the public?

A. It is a balance. So you lean towards always putting the information in the public domain -- there has to be a reason to not put the information in the public domain and that reason has to be, you know, clinical, scientific, you know, proven to be worth it. But these are, you know, a very small number of examples, and I can think of no others, to be honest, where

67

Q. -- didn't it? And there was no decision made that "we need to be honest" -- I think your words -- "honest, clear with the public, trust them, and tell them that the first person that died from Covid-19 was in fact a French person who had entered Scotland to watch our rugby international", that the Scottish Government hadn't tried to stop?
 A. I think it became known to me certainly that they were

8 **A.** I think it became known to me certainly that they were from the rugby at the same point it became known to the public through other means. I don't disagree with what you're saying. The circumstances at the time were that we were -- a lot of the time you were simply just chasing your tail and you moved from one thing to the

next very quickly. The moments of reflection that
you're perhaps suggesting would have led us to say "Oh,
actually, that death from two days ago, we can now
confirm this" just didn't occur.

Q. Could another way of looking at it be that this is
 another example of a Scottish Government trying to cover
 up what might be seen as uncomfortable information
 during the early months of the pandemic?

22 A. That would be an inaccurate way of looking at it.

Q. Before the break I'd asked you about what good reasons
 could exist for not telling the public, not being honest
 with the public about events happening during the

information about Covid cases that we had, particularly
 in the early days -- once you got to larger numbers the
 detailed information was not something that, you know,
 we had, unless there were specific outbreaks -- was not
 put in the public domain.

7 concrete strategy that "We have to be honest, candid
8 with the public, transparent at all times", but it was
9 just a matter of discretion whether the Scottish
10 Government felt perhaps "This is a matter we should not
11 disclose" --

Q. Does this not suggest that there wasn't really a kind of

12 **A.** No

6

13 Q. -- "and this is a matter that we should"?

14 No, the principle was that you were honest and 15 transparent and put as much information as -- put in the 16 public domain as you could. My understanding, and I'm 17 not the doctor here, my understanding of patient 18 confidentiality is that is an obligation on clinicians, 19 so when they say that they don't want you to release 20 something under patient confidentiality you --21 I appreciate you said earlier, my Lady, that you could 22 push back -- you do feel obliged to take account of 23 that.

Q. I now want to move on to a different topic, and that's
 the use and retention of informal communications

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

relating to the pandemic, these being, for example, relevant WhatsApp messages, and I think it's important I place in context my questions.

You voluntarily provided the first batch of your WhatsApp messages with Nicola Sturgeon along with the first draft of your statement in July 2020; is that correct?

8 A. That's correct.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

3

8

- Q. These were messages between yourself and Nicola Sturgeon
 dated between 1 September 2020 and 16 March 2021?
- 11 A. That's correct.
- 12 Q. A period of about six and a half months. We've already
 13 looked at some of those messages this morning and those
 14 were the first messages that had been provided by anyone
 15 involved in the Scottish Government's response to the
 16 pandemic to this Inquiry.

Then in November 2023, in response to a further request by the Inquiry, you provided a page of additional messages between you and the First Minister, and these were dated over one day, this being 31 August 2020 and 1 September 2020.

At the same time you provided some additional messages between yourself and Jeane Freeman, Kate Forbes and Shirley-Anne Somerville, and these messages were provided after the Inquiry had raised, publicly,

69

- 1 **Q.** Were you aware at that stage that she had deleted all the messages from her phone when you submitted you
 - the messages from her phone when you submitted your messages to the Inquiry and then passed them to the
- 4 Scottish Government for her?
- 5 A. Yes, I think I had become aware at that point that she6 didn't have the messages any more.
- 7 Q. And are you aware of how then Nicola Sturgeon came into
 - possession of those messages? Was it through the
- 9 Scottish Government?
- 10 A. Yes, I asked the Scottish Government to pass the11 messages to Ms Sturgeon.
- 12 Q. Why is it that you retained these messages but she has13 not?
- A. I can't speak for her, I'm not going to speculate on the reasons here, with the one exception of saying that, in this conversation between us, I am the official and -- she can answer if this is the case -- she may have had reason to think, "Well, Liz has them, that's the official part taken care of", because I am the official in that exchange.
- in that exchange.
 I -- to be clear, all the sort of relevant, salient,
 Covid management stuff in those emails is in the system
 in government -- sorry, WhatsApps -- in other forms.
 I retain messages for my reference, initially.
- 25 You know, it's good to be able to look back -- similar 71

concerns at the preliminary hearing about the disclosure of informal communications from the Scottish Government, and at that stage, when those concerns were raised publicly, you were still the only person who had provided any WhatsApp messages from the Scottish Government to this module.

Then, in response to another request to
Nicola Sturgeon for her messages relating to the
pandemic response, she provided in November 2023 copies
of the same first batch of messages that you had
provided to the Inquiry in July 2023, and I think she
had said that those messages were not retained on her
phone but she held copies.

Did you discuss with Nicola Sturgeon that you were going to voluntarily disclose some of the WhatsApp messages between you and her to the Inquiry, and if so what was discussed?

17 I told her that I -- so I received the Inquiry's 18 Α. 19 request. I told her that I had messages that I was 20 submitting them to the Inquiry when I submitted them to 21 the Inquiry. I also submitted them to the government 22 and asked the government to pass them to the former 23 First Minister. I asked the government to do the same 24 with the messages I submitted from Ms Freeman,

25 Ms Sommerville, Ms Forbes.

70

- 1 to my notebook, you know, I can go back and check: have
- 2 things happened as and when they are supposed to have
- 3 happened? I then thought I should keep them because of
- 4 the nature of this Inquiry.
- 5 Q. So just so I'm clear, we've looked at some of these
- 6 messages and I think we've agreed, tell me if I'm
- 7 incorrect, that they place important context on some of
- 8 the decisions that were being made; do you accept that?
- 9 **A.** I do.
- 10 $\,$ $\,$ $\,$ Q. $\,$ And those messages would be important to understand the
- 11 how, the whys, the whens, the wheres of how the Scottish
- 12 Government came to make certain decisions during the
- 13 pandemic. Do you accept that?
- 14 A. I think that they are important but I think that the
- how, why, where decisions are made is contained in the
 - official record, or it certainly should be.
- 17 Q. But they're important context.
- 18 **A.** Yes.

16

- 19 **Q.** And they're part of the decision-making process. They
- 20 may not be the only part of the decision-making process
- but they're part of the process; do you accept that?
- 22 A. Yes, to an extent, yes.
- 23 Q. You were her chief of staff --
- 24 **A.** Yes.
- 25 Q. -- during -- up till March 2021. Was it your

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

- 1 understanding of the Scottish Government policies that 2 these sorts of messages showing the decision-making 3 should be retained?
- 4 A. I think I, in the second submission to the Inquiry, have 5 set out my knowledge of Scottish Government policies in 6 this regard. In relation to records management 7 policy -- and I'm going to have to talk about the two 8 policies to give the full context here. In relation to 9 the records management policy it has always been my 10 understanding of the need, whatever form the 11 communication takes, to put salient material into the 12 official records. It's useless on my phone, it achieves 13 nothing sitting on my phone, it needs to be somewhere in 14 the government system to have any form of effect or to 15 inform government's broader thinking. I, to the best of 16 my recollection, was not familiar with the mobile 17 messaging policy.
- 18 Q. Do you know, as Nicola Sturgeon's chief of staff, 19 whether she was familiar with the mobile messaging 20
- 21 A. I couldn't speak to that.
- 22 LADY HALLETT: So you weren't aware of the policy that 23 others have told me about where they claim the policy 24 was to delete. "a bedtime ritual"?
- 25 A. I have no recollection. I can't be categoric because

1 corporate record?

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

A. Yes, largely. It would not -- and I think I set this out in my evidence -- it's not that I would write an email saying, "I have had a WhatsApp exchange with Nicola Sturgeon and ..." It might be "I have been in discussion with" or, you know, "I have had an exchange with".

It's reflective of the way in which I would have handled a conversation in the pre-Covid world and actually during Covid where we were in the same place is you have a conversation or an exchange of discussion, information, with the First Minister and for that to be useful to anyone, including me, it has to go into the system somehow. It has to be communicated to an official, to her private office, I might ask her private office to put it in, I might email an official.

Some of this might have been -- so if we go back to the weddings example, I think I would have been on Teams to the relevant official saying, "FM's asking me this question, can you provide me with information?"

I think you can see from the exchanges that they are very much about immediate issues. You know, they tend to be about things that are happening that day, the next day, and are about co-ordinating some of those things, and so me simply knowing that does not facilitate the

1 a lot of things in government would pass through my 2 inbox, but I have no recollection of specifically 3 reading that policy at any point in time.

Private secretaries would, you know, occasionally remind you to, you know, manage your inboxes, manage your email. Mine frequently breached the government limits so, you know, there would be a need to make sure you were keeping the right stuff, get rid of extraneous material, not relevant material. But no, I have no recollection of having seen that policy. I can't say 100% that I didn't, but --

- 12 LADY HALLETT: Even if you had seen it, would you have 13 deleted matters that might have been subject to an FOI 14 request?
- 15 A. No, I don't think I would.
- 16 LADY HALLETT: No.
- 17 A. Or certainly not intentionally.
- 18 MR TARIQ: I think you've said that it was your practice 19 that the salient, perhaps, messages would be recorded on 20
- to the corporate record; is that correct?
- 21 A. Yes.

9

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

else?

- 22 Q. So some of the WhatsApp messages that we've seen which 23 show some of the context or some of the decision-making 24 process, was it your habit to then record those messages
- 25 into an email so it could be uploaded on to the

- 1 business of government. It needs to enter the record to 2 facilitate the business of government.
- 3 Q. But using that example of the number of people that can 4 attend funerals or weddings, would it have been your 5 practice that you would have recorded that there had 6 been potentially a decision or a view reached that the 7 number should remain at 20 in a formal -- or an email or 8 some other form of written communication to somebody
- A. On that specific one there's, I would expect, some form 10 11 of written communication between me and an official 12 checking the facts saying "FM's asking". If there had 13 then been a push for, you know, "I want more, she wants 14 more information or she wants to question this", that 15 would have had to have gone again into the formal record 16 to say, "Can the First Minister get fresh briefing on 17 this point" or "Can you ask the CMO to consider this 18 point for the First Minister?"

So it may not have been in that case that I provided -- you know, I provide the First Minister with information and she doesn't ultimately respond to the point, then I said "I gave her to information and there's nothing back so let's stick with it", but I would certainly have said "She's asked me for this" so there is no awareness that the First Minister is asking 76

12

- a question about this. And I note in that exchange
 I then say the note from the Prime Minister is coming to
 her -- you know, the Prime Minister's statement is
 coming to her, so I would expect it to be in an exchange
 of "Do we know what they're doing, can we have it" --
- of "Do we know what they're doing, can we have it" -
 But a lot of the context of that decision and whether

 it's a decision, a positive decision, or one not to

 change the restrictions would be -- was within the

 WhatsApp messages and, if I understand your practice

 correctly, that context would not be uploaded on to the

 corporate record?
- 12 A. No, I think that context would have been there because 13 it would have been the engagement with the official, and 14 the subsequent note going to the First Minister about 15 the Prime Minister's statement would have been in the 16 context of the "Prime Minister's making a statement 17 today, the UK are doing this, the FM is asking this", 18 et cetera. That would, I expect, all be clear in --19 whether it was an email exchange or a Teams exchange, 20 that would, I expect, all be clear.
- Q. But not the communications between those two events that
 would place context on how ultimately --
- 23 A. I think if you're --
- 24 Q. -- the Scottish Government came to a decision not tochange the numbers?

77

Nicola Sturgeon cover, as I said, a six and a half month
 period, and that's between 1 September 2020 and
 16 March 2021, and then there's the later additional
 messages spanning one day.

Is it fair to assume that you were in WhatsApp communication with Nicola Sturgeon about the pandemic before 1 September 2020?

- 8 A. Yes, it would be, I think at a lesser extent and, for
 9 the record, I would like to say that I regret not being
 10 able to give the Inquiry those messages. I thought
 11 I had them, I had sourced them, I have done everything
 12 that I am able to do, as far as I can, to find them.
 13 I thought I had retained them and they're not there.
- 14 Q. Why do you say that you would be in communication with
 15 the First Minister before 1 September 2020 over WhatsApp
 16 to a lesser extent --
- 17 **A.** We were --

5

6

7

25

- 18 Q. -- when we would be going through the first lockdown,for instance?
- 20 **A.** Because we were in the same place more than we were at a later date. So I think I attended St Andrew's House the vast majority of days, including Saturdays and Sundays. Every day there would have been a briefing.

 I would have been there from early in the morning until

late at night and so would she.

A. I think if you're asking did I, you know, transcribe
 verbatim, no. I treat those messages in the same way
 that I would have treated a conversation with the
 First Minister and input the material parts of the
 discussion to the system in order that they could
 facilitate the business of government or, you know, be
 recorded in some way.

Q. I now wanted to move on to a related matter. In your
 first statement, you said, and I'll quote this, I won't
 bring the statement up:

"I have indicated to the Scottish Government that I expect all messages to be submitted."

13 Why did you feel the need to tell the Inquiry that 14 you had indicated to the Scottish Government that your 15 expectation was that all of your messages would be 16 disclosed to the Inquiry?

17 A. I think the timing of this correlates to a UK Government 18 case about whether they had to provide messages that 19 were not Covid related, about who got to do the, 20 you know, redacting, if you like, and the Scottish 21 Government had said to me that I could wait for the 22 conclusion of that before deciding whether to give you 23 everything or who was going to do the redactions and my 24 view was: just give them it.

25 **Q.** The messages that you have produced between yourself and

1 So, during that very intense period, the majority of 2 the discussion that she and I would have about thrashing 3 out what we were going to do would have been happening 4 in person but there would be some messages. I think 5 a lot of them would have been logistical around the 6 briefings, who was going to be there, the BBC are 7 offering you an address to the nation, that kind of 8 thing, if I had been in a different room, for example. 9 Q. But there would also be, for instance -- you weren't

10 working with her through every night, but there would 11 be -- you would both go home, there would be messages 12 that would continue, the conversations would continue 13 sometimes over on WhatsApp. In fact, we've seen many of 14 your messages that are late into the night, and those 15 would be messages, for instance, around March 2020 that 16 would shed perhaps some light on decision-making around 17 the first lockdown?

A. I genuinely do not think there would be much of 18 19 significance around early March 2020 in the WhatsApp 20 messages between us and around the decision-making on 21 lockdown because those discussions and decisions, and 22 I remember them very clearly, happened in 23 St Andrew's House, normally with Dr Calderwood, 24 Jeane Freeman, and, if you like, at that point, 25 you know, yes, we did go home but I think there was very

- little time left in the day by the time I was going homein those occasions.
- 3 Q. What happened to those messages that you're not able to 4 provide to the Inquiry?
- 5 A. As I've said, I genuinely don't know and I regret that
- 6 I thought I had them. I'm not the best administrator of
- 7 devices. I wish I did have them and I can't say what
- 8 happened to them. They're not there. I can't say
- 9 whether I actively deleted them. I can't say whether
- 10 they got lost. I don't know.
- 11 Q. What efforts have you made to retrieve those messages?
- 12 A. I have used that phone, the phone I have now. There are
- two previous phones with that number. I have sort of
- 14 revived them and searched on them. I have used every
- online tool that tells me how to extract from WhatsApp
- that may be there. I can't get to them and, I mean, as
- 17 I've said in my evidence, I haven't gone to the lengths
- of handing them to somebody to forensically source, but
- 19 I'm content to do that if the Inquiry wants me to.
- 10 Thi content to do that it the inquiry wants me to.
- 20 $\,$ Q. Were those messages held on a personal device by you,
- 21 a personal mobile phone?
- 22 A. Yes

- 23 Q. Did Nicola Sturgeon also use a personal mobile phone to
- 24 communicate with you?
- 25 A. I ... I believe so, but I'm not aware of the sort of
- 1 Dr Sridhar -- Professor Sridhar -- the other day. I do
- 2 know that those exchanges entered into her formal
- 3 accounts. People can send -- what people externally
- 4 send you something on is for them rather than you, if
- 5 you like. The obligation on you as a government member
- 6 or a civil servant is to then put that into the system.
- 7 Q. But if you're openly -- or did she openly volunteer her
 - SNP email accounts to others to use to be --
- 9 A. You would need to ask the First Minister -- former
- 10 First Minister these questions.
- 11 Q. There was one further question I wanted to ask before
- 12 I believe that there is a question from one of the
- 13 core participants, and this was around the -- the
- 14 question is around advisers straying into, perhaps,
- 15 political space. There was a few instances, for
- 16 instance, during the pandemic. I think at one stage
- 17 Jason Leitch got into a Twitter exchange with
- 18 Richard Leonard who was part of, I think -- he was the
- 19 leader of Scottish Labour at the time. And I think
- 20 we've seen WhatsApp messages where I think there is
- 21 reference to you and Nicola Sturgeon speaking to
- 22 Jason Leitch and telling him to stay out of the
- 23 political space. Do you recollect that?
- 24 A. I do. It's in, I think, the exchanges of Ms Freeman.
- 25 Q. And there's also -- there were instances where I think

- 1 details of what phone she had and what from, who
- 2 provided it.
- 3 Q. You were her chief of staff, weren't you, for about4 six years?
- 5 A. Her phone would be a matter for her private office, not6 for me.
- 7 Q. Did she have a government-issued phone?
- 8 A. Again, I think she only had one, and who provided that
- 9 phone is not something I can answer.
- 10 Q. If she had one phone, and we hear evidence that it was
- 11 a personal phone and that she never had a
- 12 government-issued phone, did she use that one phone to
- 13 conduct government business with you?
- 14 **A.** Evidently we had discussions about government business
- on the phone that she had.
- 16 Q. As her chief of staff, did you ever advise her that it
- 17 might be a good idea to use a government-issued phone to
- 18 conduct government business?
- 19 A. I don't know that I did. I am aware that on ministers'
- 20 personal phones the government installs a sort of secure
- 21 app, so I would be less concerned with the device and
- 22 more concerned with the security.
- 23 Q. Did Nicola Sturgeon also use an SNP email account for
- 24 government business?
- 25 A. Not really, no. I'm aware of the exchange with

8

- 1 Professor Sridhar spoke about independence and how
- 2 independence would have led to the Scottish Government
- 3 being able to better address the pandemic response. Do
- 4 you remember those sorts of press articles?
- 5 **A.** I do.
- 6 Q. And occasionally I think there was some push-back from
- 7 opposition parties about the fact that an independent
- 8 adviser to the Scottish Government was straying into
- 9 constitutional arguments.
- 10 Was the distinction between politics and medical or
- 11 scientific or clinical advice always clear to the
- 12 Scottish Government's advisers?
- 13 A. I think it was. So just -- I had no conversation with
- 14 Professor Sridhar about her articles or any of her
- 15 contributions. I think it is clear, I think it was
- 16 clear. I think Professor Leitch and Dr Smith, they took
- on a communications duty that they were not used to, and
- they made themselves incredibly available to all forms
- 19 of media, and again they weren't used to that, and
- 20 I think their, if you like, enthusiasm to try and give
- 21 the public answers sometimes led to them accidentally
- overstepping a line that they would not be as well
- 23 versed as I might be in seeing.

25

- 24 So I would occasionally have conversations with
 - Professor Leitch, for example, if there was a political

1		issue running in the day and he was going on the radio,	1	those instances had particular impact on trust.
2		to say "If they raise this, you have nothing to say,	2	MR TARIQ: My Lady, there's no further questions from me.
3		this is not a matter for you, and you refer them back to	3	Questions from THE CHAIR
4		the government or to a politician or to me". And he	4	LADY HALLETT: Just before Ms Mitchell asks a question, can
5		would sometimes ask ahead of things, if he knew that	5	I just go back to I'm afraid I do not have
6		something was running today that was political, "How do	6	the Inquiry number for the document the Cabinet
7		I get away from this subject, because this is not one	7	meeting of 30 June 2020, where there was a reference
8		that I should speak to", but occasionally and I think	8	and I appreciate you weren't part of the conclusion, you
9		this is clear from the messages with Ms Freeman they	9	were there taking notes, observing, advising,
9 10		succumbed to the pressure, I think, of being asked	10	whatever but there are some people who might see the
			11	conclusion:
11		questions and feeling that they had an obligation to	12	
12		answer because they were out there to try and inform the		"Agreed that consideration should be given to
13	_	public.	13	restarting work on independence and referendum
14	Q.	And that would create issues, potential issues, around	14	reflecting the experience of the coronavirus and
15		trust of Scottish Government communications if some of	15	EU exit".
16		the messaging coming from scientific advisers or medical	16	Oh, well done, thank you. I can't remember what
17		advisers or clinical advisers was seen to be whether	17	page it is.
18		it's party political, it was perceived to be that way,	18	A. 13, I think.
19		that would create issues of trust, wouldn't it?	19	LADY HALLETT: Well done to you too.
20	A.	I have, I think, more faith in the Scottish public than	20	A. Sorry.
21		some people do that they are able to differentiate what	21	LADY HALLETT: No, not at all. I always accept help,
22		is political from what is medical and clinical, and they	22	thank you.
23		watched a lot of information during that time. They	23	Some people might argue that looks as if the Cabinet
24		watched these people give public statements a lot during	24	members who agreed to that conclusion were going to use
25		that time and I think the public knew. I don't think	25	the work on the experience of the coronavirus crisis as
		85		86
1		part of an argument for advancing independence and	1	least some members of the Cabinet, and eventually the
2		therefore using it politically? When you see it's	2	Cabinet agreed, to capitalise on the pandemic to advance
3		associated with EU exit, which obviously a lot of people	3	the cause of independence? Doesn't that look
4		in Scotland who didn't want to leave the European Union	4	A. So, as I say, the consideration given to this was this
5		reckon reflects badly on the UK Government, it does look	5	was not done at this time.
6		a bit as if politicisation of the coronavirus	6	LADY HALLETT: No, but
7		pandemic, doesn't it?	7	A. I think if you take the discussion that we had earlier
8	A.	I think the fact that this says "consideration should be	8	about the difficulties of funding and financing the
9		given", my recollection, my view, my understanding, my	9	mitigations required for applying public health
10		experience of all of this period is that the	10	interventions, that was, at times, not in our
11		consideration given was: we're not doing this right now.	11	presentation of it at that time but it did show, and
12		There is subsequently much after this, you know, there	12	arguments could be made at a later date, that there was
13		has been a lot said and reflected on about the way in	13	a hampering that would not have been there had we been
14		which people in Scotland looked to the Scottish	14	independent.
15		Government to provide the leadership in the Covid	15	But I would be at lengths to say to you that this
16		pandemic and what they then felt about the	16	was not done at this point in time. I have no
17		constitutional situation, but our actions were not	17	recollection, no notes, no work. If anything had been
18		designed to produce that result. If the public were	18	done in this period, it would be publicly available.
		<u> </u>		· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·

20

21

22

23

24 25 making their own decisions on that, we were not driving

LADY HALLETT: Well, I understand why you answered in the

way you did but my question is: doesn't it look as if at

87

LADY HALLETT: It's not the point of my question, really,

it through our actions on the pandemic.

which is that --

A. Sorry.

There would be, you know, reams of evidence of the
Scottish Government going out and selling independence
during this period, and there just isn't.
LADY HALLETT: Thank you.

23 Ms Mitchell.

24 Questions from MS MITCHELL KC

25 MS MITCHELL: I'm obliged.

·

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

19

Ms Lloyd, I appear as instructed by Aamer Anwar & Company on behalf of the Scottish Covid Bereaved.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

8

9

I'm obliged to my learned friend for his questioning, which raises a lot of issues the Scottish Covid Bereaved are interested in, but I would just like to ask you one thing, and it relates to paragraph 42 of your statement. I don't need that brought up but I'll just read it out so you can understand the question that I'm asking. You say:

"Communication within Scottish Government and the stakeholders whilst strong and effective under considerable pressure could at times have been improved, particularly around the application of the framework and the application or the lifting of restrictions. Teams within [Scottish Government] did not always appear to be hearing each other, particularly on the interaction between economic and Covid harms, and economic teams did not seem equipped or prepared to explain to stakeholders why certain restrictions were in place and why decisions were taken not to lift them."

Now, can I ask you to expand upon that. In particular, why do you think that was, and my second question is: if that being so, what could be put in place to improve it?

Α. When your role, I think, as a civil servant, as a policy

1 government's engagement with economic stakeholders, 2 which I think the relationship was not great going into 3 it, so it deteriorated during it. But I'm not sure you 4 can put that in place other than a sort of building the 5 confidence of the officials that you are asking to 6 explain the situation in the information that you're

7 asking them to explain.

Q. The reluctance of those people whose job it was to explain that and sort of pass that over on to those who 10 were the scientists, as it were, is that a reflection of 11 the anxiety about the information or just 12 an unwillingness to be the ones who were breaking the bad news?

13 14 A. I think it's a reflection of the pressure you can feel 15 in government. When a group of people are telling you 16 that they disagree strongly with the actions that you're 17 taking, to be the one that has to then stand up for 18 those actions, explain them, defend them, that can, 19 I expect -- and I think I understand this -- feel like 20 quite a burden on somebody. If you are in a call and 21 there are 15 people telling you that they're wrong --

that you are wrong, they may be right and you have a

22 23 duty to listen to them and to feed that back.

24 Q. Indeed, but --

25 **A**. But if you've been given information to put out there, official, is to engage with stakeholders, it often becomes your job to listen to them rather than to make arguments back as to why the government is doing a particular thing. I think that's something I've experienced in the Scottish Government frequently, and the economic officials I found in particular -- and they worked incredibly hard, I don't want to cast any sort of aspersions on them -- when they were engaging with economic stakeholders, I felt, and had reports back from some of the calls, that they would not explain why certain things were happening. They would listen to why stakeholders perhaps didn't want certain things to happen but they would not make the argument for.

I know that the clinicians who were often on these calls felt that they were sort of left to be the bad guys, if you like, explaining why we cannot open your pub this week, or we cannot allow shops to open just yet, and the balance of the virus. In that particular case, I think this was -- this was a very difficult situation because you were taking actions to save people's lives but they impacted people's livelihoods, and, you know, you had to acknowledge that was a very difficult balance to strike.

I'm not sure what can be put in place to deal with it. I think there are broader reflections on the

1 it's your duty to put that out there, and I think people 2 tended to step back a little bit when confronted with 3 arguments against the actions we were taking. 4 Q. Indeed, one would think it would be an important part of 5 the communication between government and stakeholders

6 that they listened to what they were saying, and if 7 there was a good argument, which no doubt the Scottish 8 Government would contend that the argument was good, to 9 give that to them so, even if they didn't accept what it

10 was, they understood and what you are saying was that

11 was lacking within the ministers --

12 A. I'm not saying they didn't do it, I'm not always 13 convinced it was done with a level of detail, 14 understanding, explanation, that was helpful. It didn't 15 help bring people to a better understanding of what was 16 happening.

MS MITCHELL: My Lady. 17

18 LADY HALLETT: Thank you, Ms Mitchell.

Further questions from THE CHAIR

20 LADY HALLETT: Just before you go, Ms Lloyd, may I ask you 21 to help me on another matter, in relation to M2.

22 As you may have followed, I heard a certain amount 23 of evidence about the role of special advisers in

24 Number 10 and the role of Mr Dominic Cummings as 25 an example. You talked about the -- there's a special

1	advisers code that applied to you. I think technically		
2	what happens is that special advisers, as you were and		
3	Dominic Cummings was, are technically part of the civil		
4	service but they don't answer to any of, as it were, the		
5	governance or management structure of the civil service,		
6	they answer to the minister or the First Minister or the		
7	Prime Minister?		
8	A. Yeah.		
9	LADY HALLETT: I just find that a bit troubling. I, mean,		
10	don't you end up with a conflict then between?		
11	A. I think it's how you do it. I don't think I ended up		
12	with a conflict. The special adviser code sits		
13	alongside the Civil Service Code. You are governed by		
14	both, with an exemption from certain parts of the Civil		
15	Service Code that enables your political activities, and		
16	you are appointed by the First Minister.		
17	I think if you are conscious that the civil servants		
18	around you have to comply with the Civil Service Code,		
19	and they have obligations on them, then a conflict		
20	doesn't arise. And whilst the First Minister is, if you		
21	like, my line manager, the person that appointed me, the		
22	person that could fire me, I was cognisant of the senior		
23	officials in the Scottish Government and my relationship		
24	with them. So as much as I was sort of on a par, if you		
25	like, I knew that, you know, I needed to be aware if		
	93		
1	Thank you.		
2	(12.11 pm) (The short adjournment)		
3 4	(The short adjournment) (1.45 pm)		
4 5	LADY HALLETT: Mr Dawson.		
6 7	MR DAWSON: Good afternoon, my Lady. The next witness is the Right Honourable Humza Yousaf MSP.		
8	MR HUMZA YOUSAF (sworn)		
9	Questions from LEAD COUNSEL TO THE INQUIRY for MODULE 2A		
10	LADY HALLETT: I appreciate the other demands on your time,		
11	obviously, and I can guarantee you that everyone is		
12			
13	latest.		
14	THE WITNESS: Thank you, my Lady.		
15	MR DAWSON: You are Humza Yousaf?		

17

18

19 20

22 23

24

25

21 A. That is.

A. I have.

A. That is right.

Q. You have helpfully provided two statements to

2 November 2023. Is that your statement?

Q. Have you signed the statement?

the Inquiry, if we could just look at these, the first is INQ000273956. It's a statement dated

1	they were unhappy, perhaps thought a special adviser was		
2	stepping over the line. That is a back and forth		
3		relationship. That's a relationship that exists because	
4	you build that relationship.		
5	But I don't think I found a conflict, and I don't		
6		think such a conflict existed in the Scottish	
7		Government.	
8	LAI	DY HALLETT: So it's not a question of improving	
9		structures or anything, you think it's a personality	
10		matter?	
11	Α.	My views on the operation at Number 10 are available in	
12		my notebooks. I don't think I should particularly	
13		comment on the relationship between Dominic Cummings	
14	ΙΔΙ	DY HALLETT: I've probably pressed you too far.	
15		Thank you very much indeed, Ms Lloyd, very grateful	
16		for your help.	
17		(The witness withdrew)	
18	1 4 1	OY HALLETT: Right, I think the next witness is the	
19	LAL	First Minister, who has other demands on his time, and	
		I think the hope is that he will be here by about	
20		•	
21		1/1.15, so we're going to have to take the usual	
22		TARIQ: 1.45.	
23		DY HALLETT: 1.45 start	
24		TARIQ: Obliged.	
25	LAL	OY HALLETT: so everyone has a longer lunch. 94	
1	Α.	I can confirm that is the case.	
2	Q.	You provided a second statement, I understand, dated 16	
3		November 2023; is that correct?	
4	Α.	That is correct.	
		· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	
4 5 6	Α.	That is correct. It's under reference INQ000273973, is that your statement?	
4 5	Α.	That is correct. It's under reference INQ000273973, is that your statement? That is.	
4 5 6 7 8	A. Q. A. Q.	That is correct. It's under reference INQ000273973, is that your statement? That is. Have you signed the statement?	
4 5 6 7 8 9	A. Q.	That is correct. It's under reference INQ000273973, is that your statement? That is. Have you signed the statement? I have.	
4 5 6 7 8 9	A. Q. A. Q.	That is correct. It's under reference INQ000273973, is that your statement? That is. Have you signed the statement? I have. Do the contents of that statement remain true and	
4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11	A. Q. A. Q. A. Q.	That is correct. It's under reference INQ000273973, is that your statement? That is. Have you signed the statement? I have. Do the contents of that statement remain true and accurate as at today's date?	
4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11	A. Q. A. Q.	That is correct. It's under reference INQ000273973, is that your statement? That is. Have you signed the statement? I have. Do the contents of that statement remain true and	
4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11	A. Q. A. Q. A. Q.	That is correct. It's under reference INQ000273973, is that your statement? That is. Have you signed the statement? I have. Do the contents of that statement remain true and accurate as at today's date?	
4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11	A. Q. A. Q. A. Q.	That is correct. It's under reference INQ000273973, is that your statement? That is. Have you signed the statement? I have. Do the contents of that statement remain true and accurate as at today's date? They do.	
4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	A. Q. A. Q. A. Q.	That is correct. It's under reference INQ000273973, is that your statement? That is. Have you signed the statement? I have. Do the contents of that statement remain true and accurate as at today's date? They do. Thank you. You are the current First Minister of Scotland? That's correct.	
4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	A. Q. A. Q. A. Q.	That is correct. It's under reference INQ000273973, is that your statement? That is. Have you signed the statement? I have. Do the contents of that statement remain true and accurate as at today's date? They do. Thank you. You are the current First Minister of Scotland?	
4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	A. Q. A. Q. A. Q. A. Q.	That is correct. It's under reference INQ000273973, is that your statement? That is. Have you signed the statement? I have. Do the contents of that statement remain true and accurate as at today's date? They do. Thank you. You are the current First Minister of Scotland? That's correct.	
4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	A. Q. A. Q. A. Q. A. Q.	That is correct. It's under reference INQ000273973, is that your statement? That is. Have you signed the statement? I have. Do the contents of that statement remain true and accurate as at today's date? They do. Thank you. You are the current First Minister of Scotland? That's correct. You explain in your statement that you are responsible	
4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	A. Q. A. Q. A. Q. A. Q.	That is correct. It's under reference INQ000273973, is that your statement? That is. Have you signed the statement? I have. Do the contents of that statement remain true and accurate as at today's date? They do. Thank you. You are the current First Minister of Scotland? That's correct. You explain in your statement that you are responsible for leading the Scottish Government with the support of	
4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	A. Q. A. Q. A. Q. A. Q.	That is correct. It's under reference INQ000273973, is that your statement? That is. Have you signed the statement? I have. Do the contents of that statement remain true and accurate as at today's date? They do. Thank you. You are the current First Minister of Scotland? That's correct. You explain in your statement that you are responsible for leading the Scottish Government with the support of Cabinet secretaries and ministers; is that correct?	
4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	A. Q. A. Q. A. Q. A. Q. A. Q.	That is correct. It's under reference INQ000273973, is that your statement? That is. Have you signed the statement? I have. Do the contents of that statement remain true and accurate as at today's date? They do. Thank you. You are the current First Minister of Scotland? That's correct. You explain in your statement that you are responsible for leading the Scottish Government with the support of Cabinet secretaries and ministers; is that correct? That is correct.	
4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	A. Q. A. Q. A. Q. A. Q. A. Q.	That is correct. It's under reference INQ000273973, is that your statement? That is. Have you signed the statement? I have. Do the contents of that statement remain true and accurate as at today's date? They do. Thank you. You are the current First Minister of Scotland? That's correct. You explain in your statement that you are responsible for leading the Scottish Government with the support of Cabinet secretaries and ministers; is that correct? That is correct. You became First Minister on 29 March 2023, taking over	
4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	A. Q. A. Q. A. Q. A. Q. A. Q.	That is correct. It's under reference INQ000273973, is that your statement? That is. Have you signed the statement? I have. Do the contents of that statement remain true and accurate as at today's date? They do. Thank you. You are the current First Minister of Scotland? That's correct. You explain in your statement that you are responsible for leading the Scottish Government with the support of Cabinet secretaries and ministers; is that correct? That is correct. You became First Minister on 29 March 2023, taking over the role from former First Minister Nicola Sturgeon; is	

Cabinet secretary roles, as I understand it; is that

1	cor	rect?
	COL	ICUL!

- 2 A. That is correct.
- 3 Q. The first role was Cabinet Secretary for Justice, which 4 you held from 26 June 2018 to 19 May 2021?
- 5 That is correct.
- 6 **Q.** And the second, following the Scottish Parliamentary
- 7 election in May 2021, you took over the Health and
- 8 Social Care portfolio, you took that over from
- 9 Ms Jeane Freeman, who had held the role during the
- 10 earlier stages of the pandemic. Is that correct?
- A. That is correct. 11
- 12 Q. And you held that portfolio until you became
- 13 First Minister on 28 March 2023?
- A. Absolutely correct. 14
- Q. Could I just clarify that when Ms Freeman held the role, 15
- 16 prior to the election, I understand the role was
- 17 entitled Cabinet Secretary for Health and Sport, but
- 18 when you held it, Cabinet Secretary for Health and
- 19 Social Care: is that correct?
- 20 A. That is correct.
- 21 Q. Is there any significance in the change of name with
- 22 regard to the portfolios that you covered in your
- 23 ministerial Cabinet secretary role?
- 24 A. No. I don't think there would have been much of
- 25 a change, although having taken sport out of the title
- 1 include -- it would always include Ms Sturgeon and 2 sometimes include others, including Mr Swinney,
- 3 yourself, Ms Forbes at various different times?
- 4 A. Absolutely correct.

6

10

11

Q. Thank you. Could I have a look, please, at paragraph 35 of your statement where you provide us a little bit more detail about this. You say at paragraph 35 that:

7 "In relation to how decision-making could have been 8 9 improved during the pandemic, I believe there were times

- when a decision made by the former First Minister or discussed within Gold Command was not cascaded to the
- 12 rest of Cabinet or all Ministers due to the fast nature
- 13 of decision-making during the pandemic. We did our best
- 14 to explain the rationale of decision making but the
- 15 feedback from some groups, in particular the hospitality
- 16 industry, was that the rules were changing too often,
- 17 with decisions made before guidance was available. On
- 18 reflection there may have been instances where we could
- 19 have worked with industry on guidance before making
- 20 a final decision on restrictions. I believe this could
- 21 have been improved. In relation to advisory structures,
- 22 my experience is that the advice was always ready and
- 23 available when needed."
- 24 What do you mean when you suggest that decisions 25
 - were made by the former First Minister which were not 99

- and replaced it with social care, I did have a minister 1
- 2 that took on the title of sport in her title, but
- 3 ultimately, as the Cabinet secretary, I would have been
- 4 responsible for the entirety of the portfolio.
- So you and she were both responsible for health, 5
- 6 including public health?
- 7 That's correct.
- Q. And you and she were both responsible for social care? 8
- 9 A. That's correct.
- 10 Q. Thank you.

11 I'd like to ask you some questions about some of the 12 decision-making structures which existed within the 13 Scottish Government during the course of the pandemic. 14 Some of these are things we've heard about, but we think

15 you might have some insights into how they operated.

16 We've heard some talk, and you mention in your 17 statement, of a group or decision-making body called

"gold" or "gold command". Are you aware of what that 18

- 19 group did?
- 20 A. I am.

23

- 21 Q. I understand that you attended that group, not always
- 22 but sometimes? A. Correct.
- 24 Q. Am I correct in understanding that this was a selected
- 25 group of Cabinet ministers which would tend to

- 1 cascaded to the rest of Cabinet?
- 2 With my Lady's permission, before I answer the substance
- 3 of that question, I just wonder if I can begin, before
- 4 I respond to the first substantial question, by
- 5 acknowledging the trauma and the grief that so many
- 6 families and individuals faced and continue to face
- 7 during the course of the pandemic, particularly those
- 8 who have been bereaved by Covid. I want to offer my
- 9 condolences once again to every single person who has
- 10 been bereaved by Covid. However, let me also
- 11 acknowledge that it is not sympathies that they require
- 12 from witnesses but straight answers to straight
- 13 questions, which of course I endeavour to give during
- 14 the course of the next few hours.

15 In relation to the substance of the question that 16 you have asked, Mr Dawson, for me, given the fast paced

nature of what we were dealing with, therefore the need 17

18 for urgent decisions to be made, decisions were

19 sometimes delegated to the former First Minister.

20 Cabinet would agree to that and the former

21 First Minister was then entrusted to make those

22 discussions

23

24

25

And there were -- there was the rare occasions where sometimes a decision was made, again responding to a particular development, and it was therefore not

cascaded to the rest of Cabinet until that decision was
announced, and that happened on the rare occasion, but
we were often -- I know special advisers, I know
government officials worked hard to ensure that Cabinet
was informed of decisions when they were made as opposed
to once they were announced.

Q. So I think you've identified there situations in which

Q. So I think you've identified there situations in which
 decisions were made by the First Minister, the former
 First Minister, based on a delegated authority from
 Cabinet. That's one type of decision-making process; is
 that right?

12 A. That's absolutely correct.

13 Q. And there were other times when I think you
 14 characterised them as being -- because of the pressures
 15 of the pandemic, decisions were taken by the
 16 First Minister where there had not been that delegation
 17 but that that process was necessary because a decision
 18 needed to be made immediately; is that right?

19 A. That would be correct.

Q. So therefore it is the case, I think, that you're saying
 that some decisions were made in those circumstances
 which did not have the approval of the Cabinet?

A. So, again, there would have been some decisions that may
 have been made in that way. For the most part Cabinet
 would agree decisions that had to be made. There may

So discussions were engaging in Cabinet. There was sometimes differences of opinion, as you can well imagine, but decisions were made often at Cabinet. Gold command, though, was there for a reason because the situation could of course change between one week's Cabinet meeting and the next, given the fast paced nature of the virus that we were dealing with.

So gold command was an important structure and ultimately also the First Minister, we knew, was doing daily briefings, virtually every single day, and therefore there was also that delegated authority, should she have to make a decision because of a development in the virus that particular day.

So I think it is, to answer your question, a mixture fall of those.

Q. We've heard evidence about the constitutional structure within which the Scottish Government purports to operate, from a political expert,
Professor Paul Cairney. He confirmed that the basic structure is that decisions are to be made in Cabinet, as is the case within the UK Government, and that there are good constitutional reasons for that.

Do you accept that as a matter of principle, as the way in which decisions are meant to be made within our constitutional system?

well be times when the exact detail of a decision, so for example if we were to -- if Cabinet agreed to impose restrictions around household numbers mixing indoors, there may be not be a final decision on the number of households or the number of people from a certain number of households, and therefore we would seek to delegate that decision to the First Minister, to the Deputy First Minister, Cabinet Secretary for Health to make. And that may well be because the decision was going to be announced in a couple or a few days' time and of course the situation could develop in terms of the epidemiology of the virus and factors such as the R number, so we would -- there would be times when we would entrust the former First Minister to make that decision, on delegated authority.

It would be unusual, rare, very rare, I think, for the former First Minister to make a decision without either that delegated authority or without informing Cabinet. The decision was made before it was announced.

Q. Were decisions made in Cabinet or were they made by the
 First Minister and/or within this gold command
 structure?

A. A variety of all of those. Decisions were made at
 Cabinet, and of course the Inquiry has a number of
 documents in relation to Cabinet minutes and meetings.

A. Yes, I agree that, absolutely, that Cabinet is
 an important structure for decision-making.

Q. Because within Cabinet there are a number of voices that
are able to approach important questions from a number
of perspectives, and if there is real discussion and
debate within that forum, those perspectives can all be
given the respect that they deserve, such that better
decisions can be made; would that be a fair summary of
why the system is as it is?

A. That is a fair summary, and as somebody who has had a number of Cabinet secretary positions in the past and is now in the very privileged position of being First Minister, there is very good reason for decisions being made at Cabinet, and that is how decisions are made on most occasions, particularly during normal times. We were not of course in normal times in the course of the pandemic, and therefore there will often be more delegated decisions made during the pandemic than you would make in normal times.

But I, as First Minister, also will ask Cabinet for delegated authority of decision-making, most recently done in the course of the budget last year, where I asked the Cabinet to delegate final decision-making to myself and the finance secretary, and Cabinet approved that.

- Q. But, to be clear, you've told us that there were
 occasions on which the First Minister either with or
 without the benefit of discussions within gold command
 took decisions without the delegated authority of the
 Cabinet?
- 6 A. Again, I think those times would be very rare, very rare 7 occasions. Often the former First Minister would seek 8 Cabinet's delegated authority, but I think there was 9 an understanding in exceptional cases, where the 10 epidemiology of the virus had changed, if there had been a sudden spike in cases in 24 hours and therefore 11 12 a decision had to be made there and then, that there was 13 an understanding that, given this was not normal times,
- Q. You suggested, I think, in your evidence that there was
 a certain regularity with which Cabinet met. Was it not
 possible to convene Cabinet meetings at short notice in
 those urgent situations?

that such decisions could be made by the First Minister.

14

- A. Of course it could, gold command, in essence, was
 a tighter cast list of Cabinet secretaries that were
 necessary to make a particular decision. Gold command
 and the attendance of gold command, of course, would
 change depending on the decision that was required to be
 made. I attended some gold command meetings in my
 various Cabinet secretary roles and in other I did not,
- indeed, of course, any other documentation that might be
 necessary and might have been relevant to any decision
 that was made.
- Q. Was the Scottish Cabinet during the pandemic
 a decision-ratifying body rather than the main
 decision-making body?
- 7 A. No, I wouldn't agree with that characterisation. For my 8 attendance at Cabinet meetings there was good engaging 9 conversation, as I said at times disagreement on the 10 approach that was to be taken, but our Cabinet meetings 11 were a good discursive fora by which to have those 12 discussions. We weren't there simply to ratify. As 13 I say, I can think of instances where challenge was 14 brought forward and what was in the original submission 15 or advice from officials was therefore amended 16 accordingly depending on the decision that was then taken.
- 17 Q. Was it the former First Minister's practice to take 18 19 important decisions as a result of discussions with a close group of ministerial colleagues, whether in gold 20 21 command or not, not calling upon Cabinet or the wider 22 advisory structures available to the Scottish 23 Government? 24 Α. Again, it will be for the former First Minister
- A. Again, it will be for the former First Minister
 of course to answer exactly how she would make
 107

- because it just depended on the decision that wasrequired to be made.
- Q. Cabinet minutes are a record of discussions taken atCabinet meetings and they are published, are they not?
- 5 A. That is correct.
- Q. Discussions within gold command were not generally
 minuted and published; is that correct?
- A. My understanding was that gold command meetings should
 have been minuted, but if that was not the case, then
 that would not have been the usual protocol for
- that would not have been the usual protocol forgovernment meetings, they should be minuted, and
- of course be available should there be the appropriate request.
- Q. If an interested citizen of Scotland wished to know what
 discussions had taken place within gold command that had
 led to significant decisions which impacted upon
- people's most fundamental freedoms, such a citizen would
 be generally entitled to be able to see how those
- decisions had been made; would you agree?
- 20 A. Yes.
- Q. If it transpires to be the case that gold command
 meetings were not minuted, it would be difficult for
 such a citizen to access that information, wouldn't it?
- A. It would be difficult, but of course there could also be
 requests for information of discussions at Cabinet, or
 106
- 1 decisions, but in my experience as a Cabinet secretary who served under her, in a variety of roles, she found 2 3 great value in the discursive nature of Cabinet, of gold 4 command. But also, equally, if Cabinet as a whole did 5 not have to be brought together, given the very precise 6 nature of a decision that had to be made, then gold 7 command was the -- I think the appropriate fora by which 8 to make that decision.
- Q. Could I have you -- you've provided to the Inquiry
 a number of WhatsApp exchanges in which you were
 involved from the period of the pandemic, as requested
 by the Inquiry; is that not correct?
- 13 A. That is correct.
- 14 Q. Thank you.
- 15 Could we have a look, please, at INQ000334792.

 16 This is a record of some WhatsApp exchanges between

17 yourself and Professor Jason Leitch, who was the

- 18 National Clinical Director; is that correct?
- 19 A. That is correct.
- Q. In fact, I think this comes from the very day on which
 you were appointed as Cabinet Secretary for Health and
 Social Care; is that right?
- 23 A. I think that is correct.
- Q. Yes. There's some discussion here which we'll get on to
 in a bit more detail about you arriving at your desk,

- 1 approaching the new job and immediately getting stuck 2 into some of the difficult decisions that you had to 3 engage in, in particular the context is that you are 4 discussing figures which have arisen relating to 5 concerns about the rise in cases in the Glasgow area and 6 in particular East Renfrewshire, which seemed, on your 7 analysis, to be indicating a cause for concern as the 8 cases were going up. Is that a fair summary of the 9 context?
- 10 A. That is fair.
- 11 Q. You are seeking Professor Leitch's input and counsel onthat decision; is that right?
- 13 A. That is correct, yeah.
- 14 Q. And you refer at 11.52, wrapping up, I think, your
 15 discussion with Professor Leitch on that subject, that
 16 you'll be "on the deep dive", and then Professor Leitch
 17 replies:

"Good. There was some FM 'keep it small' shenanigans as always. She actually wants none of us."

This is Professor Leitch giving you guidance and advice on your first day in the new job; is that right?

22 A. Yes.

18

19

20

21

- Q. And he refers to the First Minister's "keep it small'
 shenanigans" and that "She actually wants none of us".
 Was this an indication in fact that the First Minister
- gold command could often come in or gold command may
 well come in, when there was a development in the virus
 and a decision had to be made either that evening or
 indeed the next day.
- 5 Q. So to put this in this particular context, because one 6 sees in the period of you being Cabinet Secretary for 7 Health and Social Care a number of exchanges of this 8 nature where you are trying to take the counsel of 9 Professor Leitch in particular around the question of 10 levels that different areas should be applied -- should 11 be put into, when you say the principle would be agreed 12 by Cabinet but the finer detail delegated, in this 13 context would that mean that the Cabinet had said there 14 should be a levels system but the First Minister and her 15 close group would decide which levels would be applied 16 to which areas?
- A. So, forgive me, I couldn't tell you exactly the -- how
 the final decision on this particular --
- 19 Q. I'm talking more broadly about that type of --
- 20 A. Yes --
- 21 Q. -- decision --
- 22 A. -- answer that question.

23 It would often be the case that we would come to 24 an agreement in Cabinet about exactly what level 25 a particular area would be in. There would be some

111

really took decisions in connection with the pandemic herself or at least would have preferred it that way?

2 herself or at least would have preferred it that way?
3 **A.** I think that was, as Jason said when he gave evidence to

this very Inquiry, an example of him perhaps

5 overspeaking. I don't doubt of course that there were

6 times when the former First Minister needed a tighter

7 cast list and wanted a tighter cast list to make

8 a decision on a very specific issue, but I think this
9 was a classic example of Jason perhaps overspeaking.

10 **Q.** When you talk about the "tighter cast list", are you

11 talking about the gold command or something similar?

- 12 A. Yes, generally gold command.
- Q. So in essence, as I suggested to you earlier, the
 practice was that the decisions would be made by the
 First Minister gathering around her a small number of
 close advisers rather than putting the matter to Cabinet
 or exposing herself to the wider advisory structures of
- the Scottish Government; is that correct?
- A. No, I would say that, again, a number of decisions were
 taken at Cabinet, particularly in terms of the overall
 direction in which the government was going in relation
- to restrictions -- or any decision in fact connected to
 - the pandemic. It may well be that the finer detail of
 - that decision was then delegated to the First Minister
 - 25 or indeed other Cabinet secretaries and that's where 110

areas where, given the thresholds that we'd look at, in terms of whether a local authority was in one level or another, that they might well be right on that threshold or close to that threshold, so there would be the

5 decision to delegate the final decision on

East Renfrewshire or Glasgow or Moray to gold command or
 to First Minister to make that very final decision.

Q. So in essence it was the small group and the
 First Minister who made the decision, which is
 important, which is which level the particular area

11 something into?

12 Not always. As I said, on a number of occasions Cabinet 13 would agree the exact level for the exact local 14 authority to have to go on. There was always going to 15 be, within 32 local authorities, some that were perhaps 16 on the cusp of going into level 3, some on the cusp of 17 level 2. And ultimately, before a decision was made, it 18 was right that that final decision was delegated, be it 19 to the First Minister, the Cabinet Secretary for Health

or others, with the most up-to-date information on case

21 numbers, the R number and test positivity.

Q. The Inquiry has heard significant evidence about theprinciples of transparency and accountability in

24 documents such as the National Performance Framework.

25 These are principles to which the Scottish Government is

10

- 1 committed; is that correct?
- 2 A. Yes.
- 3 Q. We have also seen these principles reiterated throughout 4 documents relating to the pandemic response itself.
- 5 For example, the four harms framework of April 2020. Is
- 6 that correct?
- 7 A. That is correct.
- 8 Q. And that tells us that the Scottish Government's
- 9 position, as far as its public-facing aspect was
- 10 concerned, was that it wished to apply those important
- 11 principles in the way that it handled the pandemic; is
- 12 that correct?

15

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

18

19

20

21

22

- 13 A. That is correct.
- 14 Q. And indeed there have been a number of opportunities for
 - yourself and others on behalf of the Scottish Government
- 16 to reiterate your commitment to those principles with
- 17 regard to your participation in this very Inquiry; is
- 18 that correct?
- 19 Α. That is correct.
- 20 Q. On 29 June you said to the -- in response to a question
- 21 in the Scottish Parliament:
- 22 "It is important that I abide by the rules of the UK
- 23 public inquiry and the Scottish public inquiry ... to 24 ensure that there is simply no doubt whatsoever, any
- 25 material that is asked for -- WhatsApp messages, emails,
 - 113
 - There is no excuse for it, we should have done better, and it's why I reiterate that public apology today.
 - Ministers are -- and there is awareness amongst minsters, amongst Cabinet secretaries, regardless of the medium of communication, that any key decision that is in relation to government business should be recorded in the corporate record, and the salient points recorded on the corporate record, and that's usually done via the private office or via government officials. But I'm afraid for a long time the corporate mindset of the government -- the organisational mindset of the government was, because the corporate record had those key decisions and salient points, that was the only thing really that was required to hand over to
- 15 the Inquiry, when the Inquiry made it clear, of course, 16 that you were seeking more than that. 17
 - And there is a gap -- regardless of the Records Management Plan, the mobile messaging policy, there is clearly a gap that exists in relation to how material in informal communications should be retained in relation to a statutory public inquiry, and that's why I've instructed an externally-led review to look at this issue and other issues such as what ministers and
- 23 24 Cabinet secretaries should do should they, for example,
- 25 change device in the midst, particularly, of

- 1 Signal messages, Telegram messages or whatever -- will 2 absolutely be handed over to the Covid inquiries and
- 3 handed over to them in full."
 - Has that always been your position?
- 5 **A.** That has been my position, yes.
- 6 This remains your position?
- 7 Yes, that any messages we have should be handed over in 8
- 9 Q. It is important, is it not, not just for the very
 - important purpose of engaging with subsequent public
- 11 inquiries such as this and the Scottish Inquiry, but
- 12 also, during the course of a public emergency which does
- 13 not derive from a single event but is continuous, that
- 14 material relating to the way in which decisions were
- 15 taken must be retained so that proper lessons could be
- 16 learned and a better response to the pandemic developed;
- 17 is that correct?
- 18 A. That is correct. And perhaps on this issue of informal
- 19 messaging, including of course WhatsApp messages, let me
- 20 reiterate what I have said in the Chamber just a couple
- 21 of hours ago. Let me unreservedly apologise to this
- 22 Inquiry but also to those who are mourning the loss of
- 23 a loved one, that was bereaved by Covid, for the
- 24 government's frankly poor handling of the various Rule 9
- 25 requests in relation to informal messaging, messages.
 - 114
- 1 an emergency such as a pandemic or anything that is 2

 - analogous to that. Q. Thank you.
- 4 In answering questions about this area, one of the 5 senior civil servants, Ms Fraser, from the Corporate
- 6 directorate general, accepted that it was important in
- 7 the interests of transparency and accountability to the 8 Scottish public that information about how decisions
- 9 were reached should be retained. Do you agree with her?
- 10 A. I do.

3

- Q. You mentioned in your response there the requirement, as 11
- 12 I understood you, to retain information within the
- 13 system about key decisions that were made. Would you
- 14 accept that both the policy in existence at the time and
- 15 indeed the principles of transparency and accountability
- 16 require there to be careful record-keeping of how
- 17 decisions are made, meaning that discussions leading to
- 18 decisions also require to be recorded?
- 19 A. Yes, and again our record management policy will make
- 20 clear that it's not just the decision that has to be
- 21 recorded but -- I think the wording is used, "the
- 22 salient points of any decisions that are made should
- 23 also be recorded for the corporate record".
- 24 Q. There's a difference, though, perhaps, it might be quite subtle, but the salient points of a decision is one 25

1 thing, but the salient government business involved in 2 the process leading to the decision is another. Do you 3 accept that both categories require to be retained in 4 order to fulfil the ultimate objective of transparency 5 and accountability?

6 A. Yes, and I accept the point that you're making. I would 7 say, of course, our Records Management Policy is 8 important for a couple of reasons: one, of course, for 9 all of the reasons that you have just articulated in 10 relation to transparency, good governance, but also for record management. We cannot possibly, as 11 12 an organisation, keep every single piece of 13 documentation that is produced by the organisation, it 14 would be very, very challenging and difficult to do so, 15 so there is a need for that Records Management Policy, 16 and ultimately there will be a point where it is for the 17 interpretation -- the interpretation of the receiver of 18 that information to decide whether or not that should be 19 recorded in the corporate record or not.

20 Q. But those principles of transparency and accountability 21 should aid in that interpretation?

22 A. They should, of course.

23 Q. Because if there's material relating to discussions in 24 the business of government, it would be necessary for 25 an interested member of the Scottish public to be able 117

> amongst other things in this table what we see is the Scottish Government's response as to what was used during the course of the pandemic, and it says there, as regards your WhatsApp, other informal communication systems, that you:

> "Used WhatsApps with Nicola Sturgeon and John Swinney to discuss matters. Any decisions made were recorded through the appropriate channels as per Scot Gov guidance. No other informal communications platforms were used.

"Communicated with Kevin Stewart and Maree Todd through WhatsApp."

Just to pause there, they were ministers who were working with you in the time as health secretary; is that right?

A. That's absolutely right, yeah --16

17 Q. Yeah --

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

20

21

22

23

24

25

A. -- ministers in my portfolio. 18

19 Thank you very much. Q.

"WhatsApp used to discuss information and advice relating to Covid-19, more frequently at the beginning of the pandemic due to restrictions on in person meetings. Deleted all messages after a month for cyber security purposes as per their understanding of the Scottish Government Mobile Messaging Apps Usage and

119

to access that material in order to know how decisions 1 2 were taken and ultimately to know whether decisions were

3 taken in a way with which they were satisfied?

4 A. Yes, I think that's fair.

5 Q. As far as your production of WhatsApps and other 6 informal messages to the Inquiry is concerned, I think 7 it is apparent, is it not, and I think you have accepted

8 this, that you are a heavy user of WhatsApp as a means

9 of communication?

10 A. I use it on a daily basis.

11 Q. Is it the case that you used your own personal phones, 12 plural, for WhatsApp messages during the course of the 13 pandemic rather than a government-issued phone?

14 A. Yes, that's correct.

15 Q. And I think it has transpired from the material you have 16 provided that you in fact had multiple phones over the 17 period from January 2020 to April 2022?

18 Both personal and government devices, yes.

19 Q. Yes.

22

23

24

25

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

20 Could I ask you, please, to look at INQ000319509. 21

This is a table that we went to with some previous witnesses, which was very helpfully produced to us by the team with whom we are dealing within Scottish Government, in connection with our enquiries about the usage of materials -- of informal messaging systems, and 118

Policy. Does not recall being part of any decision making via WhatsApp.

"Part of 'Health 4 Nations' WhatsApp administered by Matt Hancock, and this was disbanded after Matt Hancock left office. Used for information sharing as opposed to decision making, such as number of Cases, R number etc. Messages not retained."

This document is dated 13 October 2023. This is what the Scottish Government represented to us as being your position as at that time, to the effect that you had retained none of the messages, although that you had used WhatsApp to discuss information and advice relating to Covid-19. Is that an accurate representation of your position as at that time?

15 A. Of course that position developed --

16 Q. We'll get on to that, I just --

17 A. Sure --

18 Q. -- this particular --

19 Sure, mm-hm.

20 Q. Is that right, then, this is an accurate representation 21 of your position?

22 **A**. Yes.

23 Q. When you say that -- in the opening paragraph -- "Any 24 decisions made were recorded through the appropriate 25 channels as per Scot Gov guidance", does that indicate

- that your understanding of the Scottish Government 1 2 guidance or policy was that only decisions made required
- 3 to be recorded through the appropriate channels?
- 4 A. No, decisions and salient points in relation to
- 5 decision-making should have been recorded in the 6 corporate record.
- 7 Q. Thank you, so the reference to decision there is really
- 8 a shorthand for that wider group that we discussed
- 9 earlier: is that correct?
- 10 A. Yes.
- Q. When you say "recorded through the appropriate channels" 11
- 12 is that another of way of saying -- we've heard this
- 13 expression before, from Ms Fraser and others -- that
- 14 that material has been recorded on the corporate record?
- 15 A. Yes.
- 16 Q. And how, as a matter of practice, would you have gone
- 17 about transferring the salient points of discussions
- 18 relating to important decisions onto the corporate
- 19 record as a matter of practicality?
- 20 A. Yes -- and forgive me, I said that this was a statement
- 21 that was correct as per 13 October, there's probably
- 22 some areas that were obviously updated thereafter which
- 23 would abrogate some of what is in here, but I assume --
- 24 I am -- to be absolutely fair, what I'm trying to do is Q.
- 25 just understand your position at that time. I will take 121
- 1 after that, and in between the material would be
 - communicated through your private office and put on the
- 3 corporate record by whoever it was in your private
- 4 office?

- 5 A. That was the guidance in the mobile messaging policy.
- 6 Q. So at that stage you hadn't produced any messages to us
- 7 because they had by that time, 13 October, been deleted
- 8 in accordance with the practice that you have laid out?
- 9 A. They were no longer available. Or so I thought
- 10 of course.
- Q. Yes, indeed. 11
- 12 So after that, there were discussions -- there was
- 13 a development in your position, as I understand it, and 14 you provided a supplementary statement to the Inquiry
- 15 explaining what the process had been, because although
- 16 your position as at 13 October was that you didn't have
- 17 any messages because they weren't available to you, you
- 18 found a phone on -- where the messages were
- 19 ascertainable; is that right?
- 20 A. I wouldn't say I found, I retained a handset, my
- 21 previous handset, that I used up until about the middle
- 22 of March --
- 23 Q. Sorry, of?
- 24
- 25 So you were aware that you still had in your possession Q. 123

1 you to the developments thereafter, I won't --

2 Α. Of course

16

3 In terms of how that was recorded, if there was 4 a discussion of salient points or a decision that was 5 made over any informal communication, then it would 6 often be for one of the Cabinet secretaries or ministers 7 to inform their private office or another government 8 official, who would then put it into the corporate 9 record. No decision could be actioned, of course, unless it was in some way in the system, and that was 10

- 11 usually done through private office. 12 And your position is you did that in connection with all Q. 13 of the communications that you had but then you deleted
- 14 the actual original messages; is that right? 15 Some messages would have been deleted, still recoverable A.

but not -- but may well have been deleted. 17 I have to confess in the midst of a global pandemic 18 and the issues that we were engulfed in at that point, 19 deleting messages routinely was not always the top 20

21 Q. But your understanding of the policy was that what you 22 needed to do was to record the information on the 23 corporate record through that mechanism, your 24 private office, and that there was then an obligation to 25 delete the messages for cybersecurity reasons a month

- 1 that handset before 13 October; is that right?
- 2 Yeah, that's correct.
- 3 Q. Had you not checked that when you said that all the
- 4 messages had been deleted?
- 5 A. I had. And because I had migrated my WhatsApp account
- 6 on to the new device, so same number, migrated it on to
- 7 the new device, when I went back to the old handset,
- when I went back to WhatsApp, there was just -- there 8
- 9 was no messages at all, it was blank. Now, of course
- 10 I'm happy to talk to the fact that messages were
- 11 recoverable, thankfully, by -- not any amazing technical
- 12 wizardry but actually by logging out of the WhatsApp
- 13 account in my current handset and logging back in on the
- 14 old handset. Because those messages were still on the
- 15 phone storage, they would be able -- they were fairly
- 16 easily recoverable.
- 17 Q. So you were under the impression that the messages had
- 18 been deleted previously in accordance with an existing
- 19 government policy, but in fact it transpired that they
- had not been deleted and that they were in fact 20
- 21 recoverable relatively easily?
- 22 A. Yes.
- 23 Q. The position then was that you were able to provide us
- 24 with a large number of messages, including, for example,
- 25 with a number of other people, but including extensive

12

1

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

- exchanges between yourself and Professor Leitch, of the
 nature that we've looked at already, so that there was
 a large number of messages on that handset, although in
 some way embedded within it in a way that you couldn't
 originally access; is that correct?
 - A. In a way that was -- I didn't realise I could access when I changed device, yes, that's correct.
- 8 Q. Thank you.

6

7

9

10

11 12

13

Your position is, I think, that those messages were -- or the salient business points relating to discussions or decisions, were uploaded to the corporate record at or around the time when they were exchanged before the 30-day deadline expired --

- 14 A. Yes.
- 15 Q. -- is that right?

So we have recovered, as you have said, during the course of your evidence and, you have said, in other fora, a significant amount of documentation which the Scottish Government has provided to us which relates to decision-making discussions relating to the way that the Covid-19 pandemic was managed in Scotland; that's correct, isn't it?

- 23 A. Yes.
- Q. Given the fortuitous revelation of the messages which
 were unavailable to you but became available when you
- was also discussions relating to decisions, so will that be included on the corporate record?
- A. I think salient points would be recorded on the records,
 salient points, and that includes decision-making but
 any other salient points in relation to that decision.
- Q. Will that include the types of discussions or the tenor
 of the types of discussions that you have been having
 with Professor Leitch in the exhaustive messages that
 you have now sent to this Inquiry?
- A. So not every sentence, full stop, apostrophe, would be recorded, nor would it be required to be recorded, but
 if a decision was made and -- any of the salient points
 related to that decision being made, they should be of course recorded on the corporate record.
- Q. Because, of course, you're now telling me that they
 should be recorded but you represented previously that
 they were on the corporate record; is that right?
- 18 A. I would always endeavour to put them on the corporate19 record, yes.
- 20 **Q.** Yes.
- A. If there was any times that that was not done then that
 would have been a mistake made by a Cabinet secretary,
 by a minister, if they did not do that, but of course
 the guidance is that those decisions made should be
 recorded and the salient points in relation to that

1 followed the process that you've set out, it would now

- 2 be possible, would it not, for us to conduct
- a comparison between effectively what the government has
 - given us, the corporate record relating to these
- 5 matters, and your messages, in order to ascertain
- 6 whether in fact you had recorded the salient points on
- 7 the corporate record?
- 8 **A.** Yes, although I would make the point that salient points
- 9 as -- is open to interpretation. Key decisions
- 10 of course and salient points relating to that decision
- 11 should be noted in the corporate record, but you're
 - absolutely right, you could cross-reference.
- 13 Q. And we'll find there, will we, that the salient points14 of the business you conducted over WhatsApp will be
- 15 included within the corporate record?
- 16 **A.** Key decisions and salient points related to that
- decision should, of course, be recorded, and it was my practice to then inform my private office of those key
- decisions of any salient points related to that. And if
- 20 I did not do that then of course those decisions would
- 21 not be taken forward.
- Q. Just to be clear, again, slightly terminology but it
 might be important, again you're talking about decisions
- 24 and salient points of decisions, but what I think you
- 25 accept you were required to put on the corporate record
 - 12
 - decision also.
- Q. And in your case they were so we should find them onthat corporate record?
- 4 A. Certainly that was always my intention to do that.
- 5 **Q.** But just to be clear, I'm not asking you about your
- 6 intention, my understanding is that you have told us in
- your evidence and also previously that you did make sure
- 8 that the stuff, the relevant material was on the
- 9 corporate record?
- A. Yes, we would always, when decisions were made, record
 on the corporate record, as per the Records Management
 Policy.
- Q. In any event, First Minister, given the fortuitous discovery of these many messages -- which we've read with great interest, and we're obliged to you for producing them subsequently -- we can carry out a comparison between these two bodies to ascertain whether that's correct.

Could I ask you, you also provided some WhatsApp messages, not -- although Professor Leitch is a frequent correspondent, there are others with whom you corresponded via that mechanism. One of them was the former First Minister, and you helpfully provided us with some messages. Helpfully because the former First Minister's position is that she does not have access to

1 any of those messages conducted -- the WhatsApp 2 messages -- involving conversations with you or indeed 3 anyone else.

> Did you discuss the production of your WhatsApp messages to this Inquiry with the First Minister, the former First Minister?

A. No. 7

4

5

6

- 8 Q. We noted in your WhatsApp messages with Professor Leitch 9 that there were frequently voice notes received from
- 10 him. Was that a frequent practice of his, do you recall? 11
- 12 It was certainly on occasion and I would also A. 13 occasionally use voice notes as well.
- 14 Q. Were the contents of those voice notes, in so far as 15 relating to significant decisions made in the course of 16 the pandemic or discussions around them, transcribed or
- 17 copied into the corporate record?
- 18 A. Again, if there were salient points from those voice
- 19 notes, then they would -- and decisions that were made
- 20 in those voice notes, then of course we would always
- 21 seek to record them on the public record, on the
- 22 corporate record.
- 23 Q. You would say you would seek to do so but can you tell 24 me whether that did happen or not?
- 25 Α. Again, when so many decisions were made in the course of 129
- 1 about the decision that was made after discussion with 2 the former First Minister, and if there are salient
- 3 points to record as well as that decision, then I would
- 4 pass them on usually through an email in to my
- 5 private office or indeed through a telephone call or
- 6 a face-to-face exchange.
- 7 So the process by which the information was passed was 8 by email, so those emails should also exist showing how 9 the --
- 10 A. Emails or face-to-face or telephone calls. Granted,
- 11 less face-to-face during the early parts of the
- 12 pandemic, given the restrictions, but there could be
- 13 a number of ways of communicating the decision, or
- 14 indeed the salient points, it wouldn't just be by email.
- 15 Certainly it was not done by handing a phone over or
- 16 copying and pasting a whole WhatsApp exchange. It would
- 17 be, again, the decision that was made and the salient
- 18 points thereafter.
- 19 Q. Okay. But on the occasions when you did pass that
- 20 information by email, those emails would still exist and
- 21 we would be able to look at those emails to understand
- 22 what you had passed on?
- 23 A. Yes, and I hope they would be passed on to the Inquiry
- 24 already if requested.
- 25 Sometimes the exchanges -- a good example actually is Q. 131

1 the pandemic, it would always be the practice that we

2 would seek to do that, government ministers,

3 Cabinet secretaries would seek to do that. If there was

4 occasions when that did not happen -- that, I would

5 hope, would be the very rare occasion but it should not

6 happen -- it should be the case that every single

7 minister, Cabinet secretary, myself included, would 8 ensure that those decisions and salient points related

9 to those decisions were indeed on the corporate record.

10 Q. As you used your personal phones, because there were

11 multiple phones, for conducting these exchanges, and

12 you've explained to us the process by which the 13

corporate record would be updated by you passing 14 material to your private office, who would then include

15 it in the corporate record, was it your habit then to

16 give your phone, including these messages and voice

17 notes, et cetera, to your private office to undertake

18 that process?

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

19 Α. No. because -- that would not be the usual practice. 20 because, again, it wouldn't be the case that we would 21 expect every word verbatim, full stop, apostrophe, to be 22 recorded, it's the salient points. So if I had a voice

23 note from the former First Minister about a decision

24 that we had made and it was for me to action, then

25 I would make sure that I would inform my private office 130

> the exchange you had on your very first day, where you're trying to get to grips with some of the complex information, you were discussing things, thoughts with Professor Leitch. He is giving you some advice. There are numerous such exchanges. They can be quite complex and the thinking expressed within them can be quite complex.

Are you certain that where you conveyed the information to your private office verbally, as you said sometimes happened, although perhaps not in the early stages of the pandemic, it was conveyed such that all of the salient points relating to the discussion made their way onto the corporate record?

14 A. Again, where there was decisions that were made, 15 absolutely certain of that, and if there was any 16 misunderstanding from my private office they would 17 usually seek clarification. If Jason and I were having 18 a conversation because I was asking his advice on case 19 numbers, trajectory or a particular area of clinical 20 expertise that he had, it's not necessary that that 21 would be fed back into the private office or the 22 corporate record. If there was a decision that was made

23 or a salient point relating to that decision, then that

24 was recorded on the corporate record.

25 Q. These processes are an important part of the Scottish

2

3

4

5

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

- Government and its key ministers upholding the
 principles of accountability and transparency upon which
 their bond of trust with the Scottish people is based;
 is that correct?
- 5 A. Yes.

24

25

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11 12

13

14

15

16

17

18

- Q. If it were to transpire that the material which we can
 now see in the messages has not been put onto the
 corporate record and therefore would not be available
 for a citizen to see on the corporate record, would that
 bond of trust have been broken?
- A. No, I would disagree with that characterisation. 11 12 I think it's important that we record the decisions that 13 are made and any salient points related to that 14 decision. We cannot, I don't think, reasonably be 15 expected as a government to record every single 16 sentence, as I say, every full stop or apostrophe, nor 17 is that required of us. I think what's really important 18 in terms of that bond of trust, and this was 19 exceptionally important for issues around public 20 compliance with restrictions, was explaining the 21 rationale for why we made certain decisions. And that 22 was done regularly. It was the former First Minister's 23 practice to, almost daily, do a briefing with the media,

to explain -- they were well watched, as the Inquiry

will know, and therefore exceptionally important that we

situation. You say:

"In February 2020, my awareness of the number of people likely to be infected with Covid-19 in Scotland and in the UK (including details of any reasonable worst-case scenario (RWCS)) was dependent on the advice that we received from the CMO in terms of the forecast numbers of those affected. The SGoRR paper dated 17 February 2020 noted the RWCS figures and this was discussed at Cabinet the day after SGoRR met on 18 February 2020. These figures were clearly alarming and only underlined the rationale for the Government's focus being dominated by its response to the pandemic."

At around this time, can you tell us what steps you took to try to prepare the justice system for this clearly alarming situation, in particular because within the document that was prepared for that very meeting criminal justice is an entire section that is highlighted as something likely to be impacted by the threat?

threat?
A. Yes, there was immediate discussions of course with my officials, and they focused -- and with stakeholders, some external and some as part of government bodies and agencies. They were predominantly focused on three areas: on the court system, what might be the impact, although that came slightly later on than this; clearly

demonstrate the rationale for the decisions that were made. That isn't always done through the corporate record, maybe it will be done through ministerial statement, through daily briefing, through questioning from journalists or parliamentarians.

6 Q. Thank you.

I'd like to ask you some questions about the Cabinet Secretary role you held in the early pandemic, that was the Cabinet Secretary for Justice. I think you were able to be -- you were present at a number of the early meetings which took place in February of 2020 when information about the emerging threat had started to come through and the Scottish Government was trying to put together some element of co-ordination of its response; is that right?

16 A. That's correct.

17 Q. For example, you attended a meeting of a body called
 18 SGoRR, the Resilience Room, about which we've heard
 19 other evidence, on 17 February. Is that right?

20 A. That is correct.

Q. One of the responsibilities you had was for policing; isthat right?

23 A. That is correct.

Q. Could I have paragraph 143, please, of the statement up,
 where you helpfully give us some information about this
 134

in relation to prisons, and that's where some of the early focus was if this virus spread throughout a prison population, which I'm afraid to say was and continues to be overcrowded; and with police.

And again I think conversations with the police came slightly later than this, but those were the areas of focus for me immediately, once we received this reasonable worst-case scenario modelling paper.

- 9 Q. Well, that's a very helpful summary, because I was going
 10 to ask you about the prison situation as well, because
 11 that was another thing within your portfolio; is that
 12 right?
- 13 A. That's correct.
- 14 Q. You've touched on the very issue which I wanted to 15 address with you, which was prisons, for example, 16 weren't discussed at Cabinet until 17 March. Is it the 17 case that as far as policing and prisons were concerned, 18 it was predictable that this alarming threat would 19 require action both in terms of policing for enforcement 20 but also in terms of the real risk that it posed to the 21 prison population, given their particular circumstances, 22 by this virus?
- A. I think it was immediately clear once we had detail of
 the significant threat of Covid how damaging it could be
 to a prison population and there was European examples
 136

4

5

6

7

8

q

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

1

- 1 of where prisons had seen the virus rip through it, 2 through the prison estate, and therefore that was one of 3 the earliest conversations I had with my prison
 - officials and, where necessary, with the Scottish
- 5 Prison Service

4

25

4

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

- 6 Q. Given that there was no discussion of prisons until 7 17 March does it suggest that perhaps Scotland was 8 a little slow off the mark to deal with the policing and 9 prison situation?
- 10 A. No, no, just because it wasn't discussed at Cabinet, 11 that didn't stop or inhibit Cabinet secretaries and 12 myself, as Cabinet Secretary for Justice, from having 13 those conversations earlier, be it with officials or 14 indeed with the bodies themselves, be it Police Scotland 15 or the Scottish Prison Service.
- 16 Q. But what systems were -- discussions, obviously, but 17 what systems were put in place, first of all, to deal 18 with what I would suggest would be the inevitable 19 requirement for the police to be involved in some level 20 of enforcement of rules, but also the very real threat 21 that would be posed to the prison population? The 22 prison population not, in some ways, being that 23 different from the type of situation one saw with the 24 Diamond Princess; although it wouldn't necessarily have
- 1 Constable to determine how they enforced and the four Es 2 approach that they took was an example of a decision

an elderly population, it would involve people in

- 3 that was made very much by the Chief Constable. Q. What concrete plans were put in place with regard to the 5 police and prisons at this early stage in March?
 - Α. The discussions were held around -- with clinical experts to understand what needed to be done to try to slow the transmission of the virus in a setting such as a crowded prison estate. So at the time the Scottish Prison Service tried to use whatever capacity it had, whatever additional space it had, to try to create, for example, social distancing measures. We were, of course, in the early, early days of trying to see what testing was available, at that stage, of course, in its development phase.

And then regular discussions with Police Scotland -and I instructed regular discussions with Police Scotland in order to determine what actions we could take collectively in relation to enforcement when -when that became apparent.

- 21 Q. Another area which I think from your statement you had 22 responsibility for was travel restrictions in that post; 23 is that right?
- 24 For a period, yes.
- 25 Yes -- for a period? Over what period was that? 139

1 confined circumstances where the virus may spread 2 rampantly.

A. I think this is exactly the point, there was no need for Cabinet to sign off the Scottish Prison Service looking to, for example, create extra capacity so they can try to introduce some sort of measure of be it social distancing or, for example, to see if they could remove people from double cells into single cells if possible, and those decisions wouldn't require a Cabinet decision to have to be made.

Similarly discussions with police. When it came to

issues of potential enforcement when it comes to legislation being introduced to the Scottish Parliament and being passed by Scottish Parliament, it wouldn't necessarily require a Cabinet decision in relation to the operational independence of the police, Police Scotland had operational independence to make decisions based on any legislation that was passed and the subsequent enforcement action.

- 20 Q. So these matters were, you explain, not necessarily 21 matters that Cabinet would have to decide but they were 22 within your remit to decide; is that right?
- 23 A. They were my remit to have an overview. I should stress 24 the point about operational independence for the police. 25 I mean, it would absolutely a matter for the Chief

138

Yes, I think it should be, I hope, in my statement but

2 3 4 5 have the exact date before me --6 7 8 9 10 11 12

13 It's an area in which we have an interest. You explain 14 in your statement that the engagement was primarily at 15 the UK Government level for the transport minister but 16 that you did have limited engagement with Mr Jack, who 17 was the Secretary of State for Scotland.

18 Was the -- what role did Mr Jack play? Because in 19 our assessment one might have expected in an area like 20 this, where there is an obvious need for UK four nations 21 cross-border co-operation to the extent that it could be 22 achieved, for the Secretary of State for Scotland to 23 play some sort of role more than what you describe as 24 limited engagement?

25 **A**. Yes and I can't obviously speak for the

3 Q.

12

13

14

15

1 Secretary of State for Scotland in terms of what 2 engagement he had with his UK counterparts. I can only 3 speak for the fact that when we're on these four nation 4 calls, his engagement was very limited and there would 5 often be meetings where he wouldn't say anything at all, 6 and perhaps he was there to observe what was said on the 7 meetings as opposed to necessarily contribute, but 8 of course I couldn't speak to the discussions he was 9 involved in privately with colleagues and UK 10 counterparts behind the scenes. Constitutionally would you have expected the 11 Q.

12 Secretary of State for Scotland to have played a more 13 prominent role in these discussions, given the 14 importance, I think you'll accept, of the need to try to 15 come so some sort of consensus over travel restrictions? 16 A. I was curious at times why he was on the calls if there

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

was no contribution that was being made, call after call, if that was the case. But no, ultimately there was a devolved responsibility for us in the Scottish Government and there was devolved responsibility to other governments in terms of their jurisdictions, England, Wales and Northern Ireland. With travel it was always going to be more difficult for those other nations outside of England because whatever decisions were made by the UK Government for England were largely

for example, but that was rarely done because ultimately there was implications when the UK Government made a decision to put a country -- England -- on a green list, ultimately if we went -- put that country on an amber or red list, people may well just arrive into a port in England and come up to Scotland, therefore we would be at a disadvantage both in terms of the virus but also in terms of our airports as well.

So we could make decisions around inbound travel and what lists countries were on. Immigration of course mattered. It was still a reserved matter and remains that way.

- 13 Q. So would you say that in practice and constitutionally 14 the question about who ultimately controlled the borders 15 was a blurry distinction?
- A. Yes, to an extent I think that's right. I think it was 16 17 known that we could -- when it came to determining 18 whether countries were on a particular list, we could, 19 as a Scottish Government, make a decision, and that 20 decision could be different to other nations in the UK, 21 and vice versa, but I think it was also well understood 22 that if there was divergence then ultimately the 23 decision that was made by the UK Government for England, 24 that was going to have an impact on Scotland, Wales and 25 Northern Ireland, given the ports of entry.

1 going to impact the decisions that we made in Scotland, 2 particularly around international travel --This is what I wanted to focus on, because our

4 understanding from the evidence given by 5 Mr Kenneth Thomson, who you will know was a senior civil 6 servant, was that Scotland always -- the Scottish 7 Government always had responsibility for external 8 borders, the external border of Scotland, because of the 9 fact that public health was a devolved matter, and that 10 was effectively a public health decision, even although 11 the question of borders, as far as immigration and

> nationality is concerned, is a reserved matter. So as far as we understand the position, from the very beginning Scotland effectively controlled its own borders, but -- is that correct, is that your understanding?

16 17 A. It's a very complex matter, and complex issue, just as you have articulated it. Ultimately if we -- when we 18 19 got to the phase of decision-making when we were looking 20 at international travel corridors, we were looking at 21 various different lists, whether countries should be on

22 a green list, an amber list, a red list, you're 23 absolutely correct, Scotland could have made a decision 24 and there was occasions when we made decisions where we

25 put countries on a different list to the UK Government, 142

1 Q. Yes, so for the reasons you just discussed, which 2 I think was people could arrive in England and travel to 3 Scotland, and therefore Scotland would still have the 4 public health detriment, if you like, of that, so there 5 was a need --

6 A. -- and economic detriment --

7 Q. Yes, yes indeed, the detriments.

8 I think, therefore, that -- is it correct to say 9 that this was an area in which there was a requirement 10 for good intra-governmental relations to try to be 11 consistent about the policy, to try to do the best for 12 the people of Scotland to protect them from any of these 13 threats?

14 A. Yes, it certainly required collaboration in the -- in 15 the interest of public health.

Q. Did you find you got that collaboration? 16

17 A. It was frustrating at times. For me, in my engagement 18 with the UK Government -- and if you're asking me 19 specifically around international travel --

20 Q. Yes.

22

23

24

25

21 A. -- I had a good working relationship, a professional relationship. Personally and politically, of course, often differences, but we had to just put that aside and work collaboratively as best we could in the interests of public health. But there were occasions,

1 particularly in relation to international travel, where 2 I was deeply frustrated with the fact that either 3 information coming to us -- and it was usually 4 information from the JBC, the Joint Biosecurity Centre, 5 or other sources -- was coming to us at the absolute 6 last minute before a meeting, five, ten minutes before 7 a meeting was to start, or we were reading about 8 an announcement of a decision already being made by 9 the UK Government -- which, again, was their 10 prerogative, it was their right to make a decision about 11 what countries were on what list for England, but that 12 undoubtedly had an impact on decisions that we were then 13 going to have to make.

14 Q. You say as a result of that phenomenon, at paragraph 53of your report, that:

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

25

"... if the UK Government had decided unannounced, in relation to international travel restrictions, that a country was on the green list, the Scottish Government would often have to follow the decision made by the UK Government, as international travellers could arrive in England and travel domestically to Scotland otherwise. This is also an example of decision-making by the UK Government which was driven by an England-only understanding of policy issues."

So from that assessment and the analysis you have 145

Police Scotland, but ultimately it would be an operational decision for Police Scotland to determine how they might well enforce any ban that may have existed between cross-border travel. So my real role was with interaction with Police Scotland, accepting of course it was an operational decision about how many resources or assets they deployed to the border, but yes, my main interaction would be with Police Scotland in that regard.

10 Q. We understand it was certainly reported in December 2020
 11 that there was a ban from the Scottish Government side
 12 on travel between Scotland and the rest of the UK; is
 13 that right?

14 A. Yes, I think that's the correct date.

Q. And you would therefore -- you detail in your statement
 you had very regular contact with Police Scotland
 throughout this and the whole of this period; was that
 something that you discussed with them as regards how
 that would be enforced?

A. I discussed the decision that was made and the Chief
 Constable informed me of his intention, in terms of how
 to react. My memory, and of course I will correct it if
 I'm wrong, was that he was going to double the number of
 patrols that were near the border at that point.

Now, there would be no checkpoints and he was very, 147

given about the way in which these decision were often
announced before the Scottish Government knowing
anything about them in the press, it does tend to
suggest in this regard that there was not a good working
relationship over this important issue; is that your
position?

A. No, again, it was done on occasion and that was

frustrating but ultimately I found that where we had to
 work together, where we had to collaborate with the
 UK Government, in the areas where I had responsibility,
 as Justice Secretary and as Cabinet Secretary for Health

as Justice Secretary and as Cabinet Secretary for Healt
 and Social Care, often we could collaborate in the

interests of public health. But, to be frank, it could

be frustrating on occasion.

15 Q. What responsibilities did you have in that post for the
 internal border, the border between Scotland and

17 England?

18 A. Could you say that again?

Q. Sorry. What responsibilities did you have in that post
 for the border between Scotland and England, the
 internal border?

22 A. Yes, for the internal border, again, where decisions
 23 were made, and there was periods throughout the pandemic
 24 where decisions were made around cross-border travel,

25 the responsibility I would have would be liaising with 146

very clear about that, but he was looking to increase
the number of police assets near the border to
effectively act as a deterrent.

So when you say there was a ban, it seems that there was

a reluctance on the part of Police Scotland to do very
 much about enforcing it; is that correct?

A. Again, I think there was an understanding also from the

Scottish Government that police resources were very,
very stretched. Nobody expected there to be a mass
deployment of police resources down at the border. We
understood how busy Police Scotland were and they were
very integral to our response to ensuring public health
at the time of the pandemic.

14 Q. Thank you.

7

15 While we're on the subject of enforcement, I had
16 a few questions for you about that as well. The
17 government, the Scottish Government chose to enforce the
18 regulations such as the stay-at-home requirements by way
19 of fixed penalty notices; is that correct?

20 A. That is correct.

Q. And we understand from your statement that the level of
 the fixed penalty notices were a matter which you
 decided upon; is that right?

24 A. Yes, that's correct.

25 **Q.** A fixed penalty notice is, in essence, an on-the-spot

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

- fine typically issued by police officers in respect of
 minor breaches of the law which does not count as
 a criminal conviction but is recorded on police systems
 and may be disclosed via an enhanced disclosure
 application within a certain period of time; is that
 your broad understanding?

 A. Yes, that is correct.
- Q. Why was it that you chose to enforce -- the Scottish
 Government chose to enforce the regulations in that
- 10 particular way?

11 12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

A. Can I say that I understand that there would be very different viewpoints on the use of fixed penalty notices and, from a government perspective, we had to have some sort of deterrent once the regulations were in place, we thought that was important in relation to compliance, but understanding that the vast majority of compliance would take place without any police interaction whatsoever.

In fact if I went a step further, even when it came to police interaction or police activity, the vast overwhelming majority of that would be done without enforcement. The police had their four Es approach, with enforcement being the very last E that they chose to deploy. And my understanding from the figures that I've seen is that police activity during this period --

more difficult and nuanced question to answer?

I'm interested in whether consideration was given within the Scottish Government to alternative means of trying to ensure that the rules were followed other than the FPN system?

A. Forgive me, I would have to look over previous Cabinet discussions, but certainly I know that there was certainly an understanding that there was other systems available, such as formally recorded police warnings. I think for the confidence that we had in police officers was that every single day, I suspect, police officers have to try to exercise judgement. You're right, there are some issues which are just cut and paste, they are dry, they are black and white, you understand exactly whether or not an offence has been committed and therefore a fixed penalty notice must be issued, but Police Scotland, police officers I think every day probably are in that area where they have to make a judgement about whether an offence has been committed or not, so there was certainly a belief in Police Scotland's ability, if it was necessary to issue a fixed penalty notice, that they would do that in the correct and appropriate manner.

There was also an understanding amongst all of us, government, Police Scotland, that enforcement such as 151

1 94% of police activity didn't require an FPN, a fixed 2 penalty notice, whereas only 6% required that level of 3 enforcement action.

Q. Did you or the Scottish Government more broadly give
 consideration to the possibility of seeking to enforce
 the regulations without using the fixed penalty notices?

7 A. I think our -- my recollection is that our concern would 8 be that if we used anything else, so, for example, 9 a recorded warning, that it would not have the same 10 impact or effect or understanding. I think we were very 11 conscious that people understood what a fixed penalty 12 notice was, people may have had it for speeding, 13 littering and so on, so it was an understood -- well 14 understood system. Whereas a formal police recorded 15 warning might not have the same impact or effect. So it 16 was the government's view that a fixed penalty notice 17

was the right mechanism to use for deterrence purposes.

Q. Was it -- was that not precisely potentially the problem with fixed penalty notices in this circumstance?

Because whereas they might be used and there is an existing administrative system to process them for things like speeding, speeding offences are relatively cut and dry, whereas the question as to whether someone is breaking one of these regulations by, for example, not being at home without a reasonable excuse, is a much

a fixed penalty notice would only ever be the absolute
 last resort, therefore we did not expect there to be
 a significant amount of fixed penality notices issued.
 Q. The Inquiry has heard some evidence from Professor McVie on the subject of enforcement. In her statement at

on the subject of enforcement. In her statement at paragraphs 8.1 to 8.2 she suggests that internal Scottish Government correspondence suggests that Scottish ministers took the lead from the UK Government on offences and fixed penalties. Government.

At paragraph 13 of a separate document which she relies upon, she also suggests that the decision also administratively, as you've suggested, fitted in with an existing system of anti-social behaviour legislation.

What I'm interested to try to explore, First
Minister, is the extent to which any real consideration
was given to the possibility of not using this method of
enforcement or whether it was simply adopted because it
was the approach the UK Government had decided upon?

A. I think our default position was to go down the fixed
 penality notice route, so Professor McVie, whose
 evidence I've read, and summary of her work I've also
 read, makes some very important points for us to
 absolutely reflect on as a government. I think it was
 our default to go to the FPN -- down the FPN route
 because it was well understood and all of our

behavioural scientists would tell us that, in order to get greater levels of compliance, those decisions, regulations, guidance, all of that, should be well understood. And if it's well understood, then there's a greater chance of compliance.

There were some differences in terms of the FPN structure in Scotland and England, I think we had different levels of fines. If I remember correctly, our fine level slightly lower than -- than what was in England, so slightly different -- slight differences, but ultimately, yes, the FPN route was the default.

11 12 LADY HALLETT: I've just had a -- the transcript's got 13 "(Webinar freeze)". Has that transcript got "(Webinar 14 freeze)" at the bottom? I'm wondering whether we ought 15 to take the break now.

16 MR DAWSON: We're very close to the break anyway, my Lady, 17 I think that sounds like a good option.

LADY HALLETT: Sorry about this, but it's obviously 18 19 important. I don't know if that means that people 20 aren't following it -- able to follow it online.

21 MR DAWSON: We can look into that, of course, my Lady. 22 LADY HALLETT: Thank you. I shall be back in -- provided 23 everything is up and running -- at 3.10.

24 (2.57 pm)

25

1

2

4

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

(A short break) 153

A. Yes, yes, and I think I, in answer to your question, referenced FOI, because that's exactly how somebody 3 might be able toll obtain some documents. Of course exemptions do apply to FOI legislation, but yes, that's 5 correct.

Q. Thank you very much.

We were talking before the short break about the process which had been undertaken to try to work out how Scotland would go about enforcing the relations, and you told us about some of the processes. You intimated that Scotland had some differences, although the fixed penalty notice system was broadly similar to that in England.

One other matter which has been brought up with other witnesses is the fact that one difference was that Scotland's FPN system applied to 16 to 18-year olds. This was a matter which, again, was covered with Professor McVie.

What active consideration was given to that difference between the UK Government system and the Scottish Government system such that younger people would be caught by the FPN system in Scotland?

23 A. Yes, it's my recollection, though, again, I'll be happy 24 to be corrected if wrong, but that of course was changed 25 by regulation --

(3.10 pm) 1

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

2 LADY HALLETT: I gather we're back up and running, 3 Mr Dawson. If it happens again, I will continue on the 4 basis that we can still have a transcript made, because 5 obviously although I have a duty to make sure these 6 proceedings are as accessible as possible, there are 7 limits when technology fails us.

MR DAWSON: Thank you very much, my Lady.

First Minister, if I could just return to a point we were discussing a little bit earlier in the conversation, it's been brought to my attention by the Scottish Government legal team, it related to our discussion about publication of Cabinet minutes.

We were discussing matters on the basis that Cabinet minutes would be accessible, and they've asked me to clarify or point out, perhaps, that in fact automatically Cabinet minutes are not released until after a period of 15 years. Is that your understanding?

19 A. Yes, we just released a whole tranche of papers, in 20

21 Q. Yes, but -- but for our purposes in our discussion, 22 I think the material point is: do you accept that 23 documents which exist are susceptible to a Freedom of 24 Information request by an interested citizen, documents 25 which do not exist are not, isn't that right?

154

1 It was changed subsequently, yes.

2 A. Yes -- and pretty early on after regulations were 3 passed, in order to bring us into line with our 4 requirements in relation to the United Nations 5 Convention of the rights of the child, so it was raised 6 to 18. The reason why that was perhaps not given 7 consideration early on was the thinking that if this was 8 to act as a deterrent, it should capture as many people 9 as possible in order to then subsequently have the 10 public health benefits. But on reflection that wasn't 11 the right calculation to make, or the right factors to 12 consider. The correct factor in relation to those who 13 are 16 to 18 is, of course, their rights, and that's why 14 we made the change, as I say, to align us more closely 15 with the UNCRC.

Q. So the change was made, you're absolutely right, 16 17 First Minister, it was -- the Coronavirus (Scotland) 18 (No.2) Act amended the existing regulation 9 to raise 19 the age to 18, which came into effect on 27 May 2020. 20 However, what I'm interested in is the extent to which 21 consideration was given to Scotland's -- the Scottish 22 Government's international obligations with regard to 23 children in setting the age at 16 at the start. Was

24 that considered?

25 A. Again, my recollection is that the default position that 156

3

4

5

6

7

8

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

- 1 we landed on at the beginning was FPNs to include 16 to 2 18-year olds, so we were always, throughout any decision 3 that was made, always trying to balance a number of 4 rights. So, again, I would have to look over previous 5 discussions and minutes. I would be surprised if we did 6 not consider whether or not we should raise the age at 7 that point, but decided on balance not to. But 8 of course that was again subsequently changed upon 9 further reflection and representations made by the likes 10 of the Children's Commissioner, Scottish Human Rights
- 11 Commission and others. 12 In her report Professor McVie suggests at paragraph 8.3 Q. 13 that there is no available evidence to suggest that 14 Scottish or UK lawmakers gave consideration to equality 15 issues in respect of the decision to use fixed 16 penalties. Is that a correct assessment of the 17 position?
- 18 A. It is technically correct, although we used EQIAs, 19 equalities impact assessments, across a range of 20 different decisions. I don't think --
- Q. -- I'm interested in --21
- 22 A. -- specifically on the issue around fixed penalty 23 notices.
- 24 Q. So there was no such assessment and Professor McVie's 25 impression is correct?

157

1 "Maximalist approach" appears in inverted commas; 2 was that your expression? 3 A. I don't recall if it was my expression or another

4 Cabinet secretary's expression, but I certainly 5 associated myself with the remarks and with that 6 approach.

7 Q. Whether you used that exact word or not, what was meant 8 by that approach?

9 A. Yes, what was meant by a maximalist approach was -- and, again, setting the context exactly as you have already 10 11 done -- that we were dealing with the resurgence of the 12 virus, I think at that point a new variant of the virus 13 recently having been discovered, more transmissible than 14 the previous, real concern around the spread of that 15 virus, and therefore a real need to ensure that 16 restrictions were abided by. So "maximalist approach" 17 meaning, I suppose, what is said in -- in the rest of 18 that sentence, that there would be a greater police 19 resource allocation towards enforcement of the regulations, and again that enforcement always took that 20 21 four Es approach, with enforcement being the very last 22

23 Q. Does it not suggest that there should be more emphasis 24 on the enforcement element rather than the other Es in 25 the policy?

Her impression is correct.

2 Thank you very much.

> In January 2021, as we know, the Scottish Government introduced a new stay-at-home order and some consideration was given around that time, as I understand it, to the way in which the enforcement should continue over that period, and you were involved in that at that time; is that correct?

9 A. Yes that's correct.

10 Q. Could I look, please, at INQ000214456. I'm looking at 11 paragraph 20, please.

Excuse me just one second.

Yes, sorry, I think I have -- I think it's subsection (h). This is from the minutes of 4 January. It says there -- obviously there was a question about how enforcement should work in the second lockdown, effectively. You said -- where it says:

"Mr Yousaf undertook to speak to the Chief Constable to ensure that enforcement actions were being taken forward with due speed and rigour, based on a 'maximalist' approach, and that it was likely this would be met with a call for increased police resources. In addition, Environmental Health Officers, with appropriate police support, would need to enhance their monitoring of compliance with local restrictions."

158

No, not necessarily. It's a maximalist approach, so trying to cover -- I think it's trying to cover geographically as much of the country as we could but also the various sectors and elements of the society where regulations impacted and affected, and therefore a greater coverage of police resource may well be required, hence the rest of the sentence:

"... likely that this would be met with a call for increased police resources."

As opposed to any additional focus on the enforcement element. That was never a conversation that was had. The Chief Constable was very, very -- the former Chief Constable was always very, very keen to stress to me that he did not want the policing by consent model to be diluted in any way, shape or form, and that he and his officers would always put an emphasis on the first three Es, the engage, the explain, the encourage, before they would end up at the enforcement space.

- 20 Q. What equality impact assessment was done of your 21 proposal that there should be a new maximalist approach?
- 22 A. I don't think there would be an EQIA on a decision to, 23 for example, increase police resource. There will have 24 been EQIAs in relation to the regulations themselves,

25 but you wouldn't necessarily do an equalities impact

160

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

20

21

24

25

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

- 1 assessment on an approach, an operational approach, that 2 was perhaps taken.
- 3 Q. It would be important in order to try to adhere to the 4 four Es approach that you've referred to that people 5 should be able to understand the regulations clearly; is 6 that correct?
- 7 A. That is correct.

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

- 8 Q. What was done at this time in particular to try to 9 ensure that people understood precisely what the 10 regulations were?
- A. A whole range of activity. Of course, the well watched 11 12 media briefings were going to be important. There was 13 communication that would have gone out from the 14 government, where necessary from Police Scotland as 15 well, and that would be materials not just on the 16 television, on the radio, social media assets would be 17 deployed as well. So we always endeavoured to do our 18 best to ensure that there was as wide understanding as 19 possible of the regulations and indeed the guidance, and 20 we know that at times and on occasion that could be 21 particularly complex.
- 22 Q. The rules required to be clear so that people could 23 comply with them; is that correct?
- 24 Yes, as clear as they could be would help in relation to A. 25 compliance, yes, that's correct.

1 face masks, what chance do others have in understanding 2 the rules?

3 A. Look, again, as -- let me try to wrap some context, if 4 I can.

> As the Cabinet Secretary for Health and Social Care I didn't just double check the rules, triple check them, I would quadruple check them if I had to, because the intensity of the public scrutiny that we were under, as politicians of all stripes and colours, but particularly as the Cabinet Secretary for Health, I knew that I would always be under scrutiny to make sure that I was absolutely following every regulation and every guidance. And so it should be thus, that is absolutely right and I'm not complaining about that. So it would not be unusual for me to check in with either the National Clinical Director, Professor Leitch, or the CMO to, as I say, double, triple, quadruple check my understanding of particular nuances in relation to guidance. I always wanted to make sure that I was absolutely complying. And this was a nuance in particular guidance.

> And I also can't deny, Mr Dawson, that there was times when the rules were complex and we got ourselves into a position, I remember, during the course of the pandemic where we were talking about things like 163

Q. Could I go to INQ000334792, please. 1

> This is from a later period when you had moved into your new position as the Cabinet Secretary for Health and Social Care. I would like to ask you some questions about an exchange in this page, on 19 November 2021, from 19.58. Again, this is one of your regular conversations with Professor Leitch. You ask a question of Professor Leitch:

"... I know ..."

You refer, in the blank passage, to an event that you're going to attend, and it says:

"... I know sitting at the table i don't need my mask. If I'm standing talking to folk need my mask on?" You ask.

15 Professor Leitch says:

16 "Officially yes. But literally no one does. Have 17 a drink in your hands at ALL times. Then you're exempt. 18 So if someone comes over and you stand, lift your 19

And then you say in response to that, after a couple of further comments, at 20.05:

22 "That's what I've been doing at the other events 23 I'm at ...!"

> When you, the Cabinet Secretary for Health and Social Care, feel the need to clarify the rules about 162

"vertical drinking". I mean, these were phrases that we hadn't used before, didn't mean much to folk, and we were responding in real time to events, trying to balance the four harms as best we possibly could.

So I would say on the vast overwhelming majority of cases when we produced regulation and the associated guidance they were well understood, but clearly --I believe one of the lessons we could and should learn is that in a development of that guidance could we have taken a bit more time, engagement sometimes with industry, be it hospitality or others, and was there more that we could have done to simplify some of the more complex guidance, as this was.

But look, my ultimate assertion is that for the vast overwhelming majority of cases the rules were well understood, aided by media briefing, aided by additional marketing, social media campaigns, et cetera.

- Q. The requirement to wear a face mask in certain 18 19 circumstances was a part of the Scottish Government's 20 strategy towards fighting the virus at this time?
- 21 **A**.
- 22 **Q.** It was an important part or else it wouldn't have been 23 part of the strategy; isn't that right?
- 24 That is correct, yes.
- 25 Q. Was it a matter of concern to you that the National

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

25

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

- Clinical Director informed you that "literally no one" 2 follows this particular rule? 3 A. Again, for those that know Jason, I think by his own 4 admission he would perhaps have a casual way of speaking 5 and perhaps overspeak, as he described it. So when he 6 says "But literally no one does", that to me suggested 7 that yes, on this particular nuance, when it comes to 8 being at a dinner or a reception, that when standing 9 speaking to people there wasn't people wearing masks as 10 per the guidance we had.
- You were seeking his counsel as regards what the rule 11 12 was; isn't that right?
- 13 **A**. Yes.

1

- 14 Q. And, as you said already, as the Cabinet Secretary for 15 Health and Social Care, you were under particular 16 scrutiny to follow the rules to the letter; isn't that 17 right?
- 18 A. Yes.

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

- 19 Q. Professor Leitch was giving you a loophole or 20 a work-around to try to enable you not to comply with 21 the rules; isn't that right?
- 22 A. No, again, I was asking if I -- just a clear 23 clarification on how to comply. He was of course 24 telling me how to comply. If someone comes over to you 25 and you stand and you lift your drink, so if you have

165

1 they have shown an arrogance and retrograde thinking, 2 Chief was livid last night."

Police Federation were, in your view, a disgrace? A. Well, again, this was me expressing my frustration in a -- what would have been a private conversation with a colleague, and sometimes you -- when you are venting those private frustrations to a colleague, you use language that you regret.

Can you explain, please, in what regard the Scottish

Look, I had a good relationship with the Scottish Police Federation. We didn't always get along, the previous leadership of the Scottish Police Federation -in fact I think it's fair to say at times we would have very robust disagreements.

My concern in this particular instance, if I remember correctly, was that I didn't think that they were being supportive of the Chief Constable, and police officers more generally, in relation to enforcement of regulations, and I thought that the way they articulated that was deeply, deeply unhelpful.

- 20 21 Q. These were the people upon whom you relied, the police 22 officers, to enforce the regulations which the 23 government had imposed; isn't that right?
- 24 Police Scotland of course and police officers, as part of Police Scotland, were the ones that we relied on. Of 25

a drink in your hand, if you're sipping, taking a drink, then obviously you cannot do that with a mask. I never asked for a work-around or how not to comply, and neither would I suggest that he was giving that.

For me, it was important, given the public scrutiny, in my role, that I absolutely double and triple checked the rules, and I did that on occasion with Jason, sometimes with others as well.

9 Q. Thank you, First Minister.

> I'm sorry to jump around in the time, in the chronology, but I would like to ask you a question about something which happened again in your first role, before the election.

Could I look at INQ000334682, please.

This, again, is in a slightly different format, I think, some of the WhatsApp messages that you helpfully provided to us. It's a WhatsApp exchange. The one I'm looking at is between yourself and Mr Swinney. I'm looking at 19/6/2020 at 10.26.

20 Mr Swinney says to you that you have just caught up 21 with the "latest insight into SPF thinking".

22 Is that the Scottish Police Federation?

- 23 A. That's correct.
- 24 Q. And you reply:

"They're a disgrace. Right through this pandemic

course the Scottish Police Federation were the professional body that represented police officers. But my concern was not with police officers or individual police officers, far from it, I had the greatest amount and continue to have the greatest amount of respect, they were absolutely integral to our public health efforts. My concern was with the leadership, at the time, of the Scottish Police Federation, with whom, as I say, had a good relationship, one where we spoke on -on regular occasion had robust exchanges. But at this point, as I say, venting a frustration to a colleague in a private space.

13 Q. Thank you.

> I'd like to ask you some more questions, please -again, sorry to jump around in the timeline -- about the period during which you were Cabinet Secretary for Health and Social Care. It might be helpful, first of all, to try and place your appointment in some degree of context before we do so in terms of what happened over the period but in particular what the state of the pandemic was at the time of your appointment.

In April of 2020, Scotland's R number -- sorry, 2021 -- had fallen for the first time in four weeks, dropping from between 1 and 0.8 to 0.7 to 0.9.

> On 25 April free lateral flow kits had been made 168

available for anyone without symptoms.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

On 26 April there had been a significant opening up, with non-essential shops, gyms, swimming pools, pubs, restaurants and cafés allowed to re-open, while travel between Scotland and the rest of the UK was also permitted again.

On 6 May, which was the day of the election, you'll recall, First Minister, public health officials warned in that Moray they were experiencing an uncontrolled sustained community transmission of Covid-19, with a case rate of 81 in 100,000.

On 17 May most of mainland Scotland, with the exception of Moray and Glasgow, moved from level 3 to level 2 restrictions, allowing pubs and restaurants to open for indoor service.

And indeed, as I think we've seen from some earlier messages, there was a concern -- really at almost exactly the point of your appointment, First Minister -- about cases started to rise in the Glasgow area.

Does that give a fair description as to the background of the situation that you walked into, or are there any other salient features of the pandemic that you would wish to point out?

A. No, I think that's a fair description of the point by
 which I was appointed. I think the only thing I would

- was associated with the Delta variant of the virus; is that your broad recollection?
- 3 A. Yes, it is.
- Q. And as you say correctly, cases remained high, they were
 up and down, but they remained comparatively high in
 Scotland compared with the rest of the United Kingdom
 over that period. Do you remember that being the case?
- 8 A. Over what period?
- 9 Q. The period from the summer till the Omicron arrivaltowards the end of the year that you described.
- A. Yes, cases were fluctuating, rising often. In terms of
 how they compared to the rest of the UK throughout that
 period, from the summer till the arrival of Omicron,
 there will have been, I'm sure, periods where case
 numbers in Scotland -- the R number may well have been
 lower than other nations in the UK, but, for a period,
- 17 absolutely, were higher.
- 18 Q. I'm simply seeking to paint a broad picture,
- 19 First Minister, we have been through the detail of it
- 20 with other witnesses, but, as you say, what then
- 21 happened towards the end of the year is it was a further
- 22 wave of the Omicron which was a much more transmissible
- variant of the virus, resulting in huge increases in the
- 24 number of cases in Scotland; would that be broadly fair?
- 25 **A.** Yes.

- add to that is there continued to be extreme pressure on
- 2 the health service as well --
- 3 Q. Yes.
- 4 $\,$ **A.** -- and usually by spring, outwith the pandemic, you
- 5 could begin to see some sort of easing, though you'd
- 6 tend to have respiratory viruses sometimes during the
- 7 Easter holidays, but you would tend to see a bit of
- 8 easing. That was simply not the case. Other than that,
- 9 I think you've covered the salient points.
- 10 $\,$ $\,$ $\,$ $\,$ $\,$ $\,$ $\,$ $\,$ $\,$ Looking prospectively during the period in which you did
- serve in the post up to April 2022, the period in which
- 12 we are interested in this module --
- 13 A. Yeah.

15

1

- 14 $\,$ **Q.** -- would it be fair to say that your period in office
 - was characterised by very considerable rises in the
- 16 number of cases, broadly speaking, from around about the
- 17 summer of 2021?
- 18 A. Yes, there would be fluctuations, of course there would
- be, but at the time that I was appointed there was
- 20 a number of waves of the pandemic and of course in 2021
- we also then had to deal with the Omicron variant.
- 22 Q. Yes, if we just take it in a stepwise fashion, we've
- 23 seen some evidence from some statistical experts that in
- the summer of 2021, not long after your appointment to
- 25 this post, cases started rising significantly and that
 - We've seen some statistics that would suggest that at

170

- the peak of the Omicron wave 8% of people in Scotland
- 3 were infected whereas at the peak of the first wave only
- 4 around 1% were infected, based on analysis of
- 5 retrospective figures. So there were huge numbers of
- 6 infections to deal with. And is that broadly, again,
- 7 your recollection?
- 8 A. Yes, absolutely.
- 9 Q. Again over this period we've seen evidence that although
- 10 the Omicron variant was generally deemed to be less
- 11 virulent, it was much more transmissible, but it also
- 12 resulted in Scotland, in this third wave combined, in
- very nearly as many deaths as had occurred in each of
- the first two waves, with somewhere around about 5,000
- deaths having occurred in each wave, broadly. Again, is
- 16 that broadly your recollection of the experience that
- 17 you had as Cabinet Secretary over that period?
- 18 A. Yes, I couldn't swear by the exact number, but
- 19 broadly -- broadly that's --
- 20 $\,$ Q. I'm simply seeking to illustrate that, even although
- 21 Omicron was less virulent, it was way more
- 22 transmissible.
- 23 A. Way more transmissible, highly transmissible.
- 24 Q. Which resulted in the same number of deaths in this
- 25 third wave as there had been in each of the first two

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

25

7

8

9

10

11

23

24

25

- 1 waves; was that broadly your recollection? 2 A. Yes. 3 Q. And another characteristic which you touched upon yourself of this period was that, in many areas, 4 5 hospitals started to become overwhelmed; isn't that 6 right? 7 A. Extreme pressure on our hospitals, yes.
- 8 Q. Many health boards required to suspend non-urgent 9 surgery at different times? A. That is correct. Particularly in the run-up to winter
- 11 they had to make the really difficult decision of 12 stopping elective care, in some cases, altogether.
- 13 Q. The military required to be called until at times to 14
- A. Yes, we made MACA requests at times, in relation to 15 16 ambulance services in particular.
- 17 Q. You described at one point over this period as 18 Scotland -- the situation as Scotland facing a perfect 19 storm: do vou recall that?
- 20 A. I do.

10

- 21 Q. Given that NHS capacity had been such a priority in the 22 strategy which had been adopted in connection with the
- 23 first wave of the virus, why was it that hospitals were
- 24 allowed to become overwhelmed in this wave of the virus?
- 25 Α. It wasn't the case that they were "allowed to become 173
- 1 you turned for clinical, rather than medical, advice was 2 Professor Leitch?
- 3 A. Yes, and the CMO, who would attend virtually every 4 Cabinet, but I probably spoke to the National Clinical 5 Director more than I spoke to another clinical expert.
- 6 Q. But on a day-to-day basis the WhatsApps, which you 7 helpfully provided, show you interacting with
- 8 Professor Leitch on a regular basis?
- 9 A. Yes.
- Q. Sometimes several times an hour in relation to queries 10 11 which have arisen from your analysis of the paperwork or 12 the issues and seeking counsel from him. Was that your 13 default position, to use your own expression?
- 14 A. Yes. It would depend also on the nature of the advice 15 that was required, but yes, I would turn to 16 Professor Leitch as the health adviser and a clinical 17 expert when I needed that health advice. And you're 18 right, that could be multiple times a week, it could be 19 multiple times a day, depending on what was going on at 20 the time.
- 21 You say it would depend on the type of advice that would 22 be required as to when you would turn to 23 Professor Leitch or perhaps others. What advice would 24 you seek from others that you wouldn't seek from Professor Leitch? 25

overwhelmed", we had a perfect storm of issues and factors that came together. We had, as you have very well articulated, a highly transmissible variant of the virus. We had, of course, been opening up society; that was right because of the vaccination programme. We had some element of other respiratory viruses, although flu didn't hit in as big a way as it did in 2022. And of course we had the other peak pressures that you tend to see during the winter period.

10 But when you have a highly transmissible variant, as 11 Omicron was, way more transmissible than previous 12 variants, hitting you at about the winter time, where 13 of course not just where you often see other respiratory 14 viruses but people tend to mingle more, go to social 15 events more often, Christmas parties, New Year 16 functions, then all of these factors coming in together 17 made the pressure on the NHS extreme.

18 You say in your statement at paragraph 23 that you were 19 provided with advice, information and evidence from 20 a myriad of clinical and scientific experts, Scottish 21 and intergovernmental advisory groups and stakeholders. 22 Then you say at paragraph 63 that there wasn't a risk of 23 information overload or repetition for key 24 decision-makers.

> Would it be fair to say that the main person to whom 174

1 So, for example, if there was issues particularly in 2 relation to -- to medicines, to antiviral treatments, 3 I may well go to Alison Strath, who was the Chief 4 Pharmaceutical Officer at the time. So dependent on 5 what was needed or what was required, it'd depend who 6 I'd go to.

> But I'm not arguing with your assertion, your assertion is correct, but in terms of my health advisers -- which I have to say were excellent throughout the course of the pandemic -- I would most often go to Professor Leitch.

12 We have looked at the paperwork for the Scottish Covid 13 Advisory Group over this period, of which you'll no 14 doubt be aware and we've heard evidence from a number of 15 its prominent members. One thing which is perhaps 16 striking about the frequency of the meetings of that 17 group is that they became very less frequent in the 18 period when you were in this particular position. From 19 June 2021 they met only monthly, although they had met 20 much more frequently previously, with the exception of 21 a cluster of meetings in December of 2021 in connection 22 with the Omicron threat that we've discussed.

> Was it the case that very much less advice was sought from that expert group and more reliance was placed on the in-house medical and clinical and

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

1 scientific advisers, given the fact that over this 2 period attention had turned away from managing the 3 threat of the virus and towards managing the recovery 4 from Covid?

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

20

21

22

A. I think from my perspective it was only natural that the C-19 advisory group would be relied on more heavily in the early days of the emergency phase of the pandemic, while we're still trying to grapple with the epidemiology of the virus, the characteristics of the virus, and of course work was still ongoing in relation to a vaccine, what can you do in relation to NPIs -non-pharmaceutical interventions in advance of a vaccine, so the reliance on an advisory group that would often engage with the CMO or would give written submissions to Cabinet secretaries or the government as a whole, the reliance on that group would have been far greater when the group first set up and in that real emergency phase of the pandemic.

You're right to point out that the frequency of the meetings increased when the Omicron variant came in, and that stands to reason, because during the recovery phase by this point, by just kind of pre-Omicron, we would have had a good handle on understanding the characteristics of the virus, we would have had, of course, our vaccination programme under way, we would 177

that recovery phase at this point. But was it a health emergency? Was it a health crisis? For sure. We were facing the most extreme pressure that the NHS had seen at that point in its over 70-year existence. I think, again, up until that point, the winter of 2021, I don't think the NHS would have had a more difficult winter in its history.

Q. In the period before your appointment we're aware of a number of what were called "deep dive" meetings taking 10 place -- there were a number of deep dive meetings in 11 a number of different areas but the deep dive meetings 12 with the Covid-19 Advisory Group?

- 13 A. I was aware of them.
- 14 Q. On various issues, testing and the like?
- A. I was aware of them. 15
- Q. In the period when you were Cabinet Secretary only one 16 17 such meeting took place as far as we're aware, right at 18 the end of the period in which we're interested, to do 19 with the future of Covid.

Is it the case that in this significant health emergency, more reliance should have been placed on that expert group in order to assist with the response?

23 A. Not necessarily. And the example that you gave I think 24 is very pertinent. You mentioned the C-19 group did 25 a deep dive, I think you said testing or the like. So

have understood the non-pharmaceutical interventions and the impacts that they would have on the virus and containment and delay of the spread of the virus. But where we needed that C-19 group, for example, if a new variant came on, and to understand its impact and effects, then we knew we could always rely on the C-19 aroup.

And there was, of course, other groups, which I know the Inquiry is well aware of. Some are UK level, SAGE, NERVTAG and the Joint Biosecurity Council(sic), UKHSA, and some, of course, at a Scotland level that we could rely on too.

13 Q. Eight times as many infections as in the first wave, 14 almost 5,000 deaths, hospitals overwhelmed, the military 15 called in. Why was this not an emergency phase of the 16 pandemic?

A. The emergency phase that we tend to talk about, I think, was pre -- when the virus first came and arrived into the UK and therefore the very first non-pharmaceutical interventions had to be considered. In my experience, and I said this, I believe, at the time, this was an emergency in relation to our health service, there was no doubting that, but you yourself have used the phrase that this was seen as the recovery phase. I think that's right, we were generally seen as being in 178

that's right by this point of course we'd have had a testing system, Test & Protect, well established, up and running, well under way, a vaccination programme well understood, well established, well under way, so we wouldn't have to call the C-19 Advisory Group back in to begin to do deep dives into well-established protocols.

Given the Omicron was another wave of the virus, although I absolutely accept fully that it was a more highly transmissible variant of the virus, we knew what we had to do in -- when we were hit with waves: we knew we had to look at NPIs, we had to look at the route map, we had to look at the four harms considerations that we had to take, and we had to make decisions on what action we were going to do based on the four harms, protecting people's health, the indirect health issues, societal impacts and of course the impact on the economy as well. But the C-19 group I always knew was available should it be required during any point in the pandemic.

19 Q. It may have been available, what I'm suggesting to you 20 is you didn't use it.

21 A. But again I go back to the point of why it wasn't used 22 as often. Now, the C-19 group would often engage with 23 the CMO. The CMO would then -- I would have regular 24 engagement with the CMO and then regular engagement --25 sorry, the CMO would attend Cabinet virtually every 180

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

1 single week during this phase. My point being is that 2 the C-19 group, as you yourself said, was there to help 3 with deep dives into things like testing. These were 4 already established. I wouldn't have to bring the C-19 5 group back in to have a deep dive into testing 6 established, vaccination established, and so on and so 7 forth. But, again, there was advisers available within 8 the C-19 group should I have needed them bilaterally as 9 well as part of a group.

Q. Even although systems were in place, would that C-19
 group not have been able to assist with the strategy in
 this further emergency phase of the pandemic?

13 A. I think, again, advisers took advice from clinical 14 advisers, from the Chief Medical Officer, from the chief 15 executive of the NHS, from health boards directly, from 16 experts in social care, a range of experts and advisers, 17 but I think we knew, given that we were facing this 18 highly transmissible variant, one of the pieces of 19 advice that we got was that we had to increase quite 20 significantly the booster vaccine programme, and that's 21 why the decision was taken to implement what was known 22 as the "boosted by the bells" programme, effectively, 23 getting as many people their booster vaccination before 24 the end of the year. 25 Q. What briefing did you receive on taking the post about

the period before that.

1

2

3

4

5

Was it the case that your impression of the vaccine being a game-changer resulted in the fight against the virus, harm 1, getting less attention than it ought to have done?

6 A. It's not my impression at all. And maybe I'm saying 7 this as the person who was Cabinet Secretary for Health 8 and Social Care, but harm 1 was always the one that was 9 at the forefront of my mind. Harm 1 and harm 2 are 10 probably the ones that were the most forefront of my 11 mind, given that I was Cabinet Secretary for Health and 12 Social Care from May 2021 to -- the period of interest 13 to you. So for me there was never any dilution, 14 diminution of harm 1, it was at the forefront of our 15 minds as a government constantly throughout the course 16 of the pandemic.

Q. As far as harm 2 is concerned, which you've mentioned,
 obviously that would fall within your remit as well
 because although it's not Covid harms -- there's other
 health harms --

21 **A.** Yes.

Q. -- to remind people -- what information were you
 provided with in order to try to manage the extent of
 that harm?

25 **A.** Again, I think when we had conversations, we were alive 183

the role that vaccination was likely to play in the pandemic in Scotland in that period?

A. When I first came into role -- again, I would have to look back over of course paperwork, but there was no doubt at all even before I was in the role as health secretary that we all knew what a game-changer the vaccination was.

Now, the question when a new variant always came into play was whether or not it had what was termed at the time -- it's still used, the terminology -- immune escape, and for me there was no doubting at all when I had my first briefing with the Chief Medical Officer, with the National Clinical Director and others that vaccination was the game-changer in how we respond to the virus and open our society back up as best we can in the face of Covid-19.

16 17 Q. In her evidence Professor Devi Sridhar, she was 18 of course a member of the Covid-19 Advisory Group, she 19 explained that at the time when the vaccination 20 programme started, which was towards the end of 2020 21 increasing into the beginning of 2021, that her advice, 22 her role in providing advice relating to what was known 23 within the four harms strategy as harm 1, the harm 24 caused by the virus, diminished, on the basis that her 25 role had been more prominent in fighting the virus in

and alert to obviously all four harms. In respect to harm 2, particularly the impact on mental wellbeing, the most important thing that I could do was speak to those who were directly impacted, or represented those who were directly impacted, by harm 2, in particular if I think about the mental wellbeing aspects that people suffered, or chronic illnesses that they suffered, then I would often engage with those representative groups or indeed those with lived experience directly -- as well as getting the usual briefing. There would always be briefing made available. When you first come into position you're given multitudes, plethora of briefing to get your head round, but the best briefing, if I could put it that way, that I received in relation to harm 2 was undoubtedly the engagement with those that had been impacted not by the direct effects of Covid-19 but the perhaps indirect health consequences.

18 Q. Given the significant consequences which occurred over
19 this period within the health service, non-urgent
20 healthcare having to be cancelled in a number of health
21 boards, is it not the case that, irrespective of the
22 efforts that you have described as having taken with
23 regard to harm 2, significant non-Covid harm was caused
24 to the people of Scotland over this period?

25 **A.** There's no doubt at all that when you cancel elective 184

(46) Pages 181 - 184

5

7

8 9

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1		surgery people waiting on a waiting list is not a benign
2		act, there's completely there's absolutely an
3		impact
4	Q.	So the discussion sorry.
5	A.	So there's undoubtedly an impact on their health. It
6		may be chronic health, it may be that hip replacement
7		that Mrs Smith needed and that she now had to wait
8		a year later would undoubtedly mean further
9		deterioration, deconditioning and then impacting the
10		quality of her life. That was absolutely a harm that we
11		had to try to balance, and that's why nobody took the
12		decision at that health board level, government level or
13		any other level, to stop elective care lightly at all.
14		We absolutely understood that if we took these decisions
15		to protect people from and protect their lives in
16		relation to the first harm, harm 1, then that would have
17		an impact potentially on other aspects, including those
18		that fall under the bracket of harm 2.
19	Q.	During the period when you were Cabinet Secretary for
20		Health and Social Care, significant harm under harm 1
21		was done, the virus was rampant, thousands of deaths,
22		and record levels compared to the rest of the pandemic
23		and the rest of the UK as regards the number of
24		infections; is that correct?
25	A.	Well, I would say that the emergence of Omicron, and 185

2 over this period was a number of issues and questions 3 that you had to address with regard to large scale 4 events; would that be fair? 5 A. Yes, absolutely. 6 Q. There were issues that arose about the Euros and the 7 opening of fan zones in particular --8 Α. Yes. Q. -- is that right? 9 10 A. That's correct. 11 Q. And there was also the issue of COP26, which has come up a few times in our evidence, and the management of 12 13 infection around that, given the number of people 14 involved and the fact that that was obviously an unusual 15 event; that's also correct, isn't it?

Q. One of the aspects of the management of the pandemic

17 Q. Could we look, please, at the Euro fan zone position, 18 again some WhatsApps, please.

A. That is correct, yes.

1

16

19 20

21

22

23

24

25

INQ000334792.

This is an exchange between yourself and Jason Leitch again in which there is some discussion, as one sees this regularly, between the two of you about what you were going to do and what the solution is, and at 13.39 you -- just get that up, yes, thank you, you say:

187

of course the Delta variant that was more transmissible 2 than the Alpha variant before it, that was the reason 3 why we had high levels of infection, and in terms of 4 Covid deaths that was a result of course of the Omicron variant, not because -- and I would contend -- of 6 particular policy choices that I made as Cabinet Secretary for Health and Social Care or indeed that the government made. We were dealing with a highly transmissible virus that you have rightly described in 10 your earlier contributions as being far more 11 transmissible than the previous variant. 12 But yes, that resulted, I'm afraid, in a number of 13

people losing their lives.

- Q. As far as harm 2 is concerned, again I think the 14 position is there was record levels of harm under harm 2 15 16 because of the hospital closures and pressures; is that 17 not correct?
- A. Again, your definition of "record levels" but there were 18 19 certainly people because we took decisions to stop 20 elective care then they would be added to the waiting 21 list. Of course we took action to try to increase, 22 for example, spend on mental health, as best we possibly 23 could, to try to make sure that we dealt with some of 24 the harm 2 impacts, such as on people's mental 25 wellbeing.

186

"At its lowest over the last 7 days we saw Glasgow case numbers dip to around 87 new cases, obviously now seeing an increase over the last two days -- test [percentage] remaining relatively stable?

"Understand FM's worry about losing the dressing room, but can't do anything other than leave Glasgow in Level 3 for now.

"Big question (and opposition are asking it, not unreasonably) what is the way out? Are *we* doing enough here to break the community transmission. Instead of just targeting the hotspots does enhanced testing/prioritising vaccines etc need to be done city-wide?"

Then there's a further discussion about all of this. And then at 14.02 this is particularised in relation to the question about whether the Euros should be allowed to -- well, whether events relating to the Euros should be allowed to proceed.

Jason Leitch says:

"And I agree. If trajectory continues and doesn't accelerate everyone down a level. That would allow EUROS."

He then says:

"Cancelling crowds and the fanzone would be VERY difficult."

2

3

4

5

6

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

24

25

14.04, you say: "That's the danger though. Football is on, pubs open, lots of people mingling indoors including in households to watch the game, all the while Glasgow is still picking up 100-odd new cases a day..." And there's some surprise . Then over the page, at 14.07 you say: "All that said, we will lose the dressing room. People want to watch the match with friends and family, after waiting 23 [years] for Scotland to qualify." Further exchanges, and then you say at 14.11: "To mitigate the surge in cases, we will possibly see as a result of the Euros, not better keeping Glasgow in Level 3 as long as possible before the first game...fanzone makes that tricky right enough." Then at 14.29 Professor Leitch says:

"So more testing. Case finding. Exactly what we want. As trump said, the problem with you public health idiots is if you do tests you find disease."

So this is a discussion between the two of you about the case rises in Glasgow and the extent to which it would be wise to continue with the planned fan zone in Glasgow to allow people to watch the Euros; is that riaht?

25 A. That's absolutely correct.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

189

1 "She needs to do it before or at FMQs if at all." 2 And you say: 3 "I'll tell you what, from knowing her for 4 15 [years], it is not often her instincts are wrong." 5 And ultimately I think the position is that the fan 6 zone is allowed to go ahead. 7 Does this exchange show you being very concerned, 8 understandably, about the situation in Glasgow, but 9 ultimately there being a reliance on the 10 First Minister's instincts as to what to do? 11 A. No, I think the exchange is an understanding that this 12 is not an easy call. You've got high case numbers in 13 Glasgow, you've got a huge footballing event, for which 14 Scotland have qualified for the first time in over 15 20 years, and you've got to make a decision about 16 whether or not a fan zone, which is an outdoor fairly 17 regulated space, and I went to the fan zone to see it 18 myself, hand hygiene systems in place, one-way systems 19 in place, six -- and so on, we put other mitigations 20 which I can talk to as well. Do you have that highly 21 regulated space? And if you don't have it, then do more 22 people go into spaces which are more conducive to the 23 transmission of the virus, ie into pubs or in each 24 others' households, less ventilation, less regulation of 25 the space? And which one do we go with?

191

Q. And I think your position here, as I understand, is that you are quite concerned about whether these events could be allowed to go ahead, given the fact that the background is there's high levels of cases, and you are rightly debating that with Professor Leitch; is that right?

7 Α. Very concerned.

> Q. Could we then go to pages 12 to 13. I think it's the same exchange, yes, 4792, pages 12 to 13.

This is now on 10 June, I'm looking at 10/6/2021 at 11.45. Just up at the top there you can see Professor Leitch says:

"And it still goes on...FM wants more advice. Her instinct says cancel fanzone. Her office will write back (which Ken is writing) to ask for more and then Ken will gather the legal etc to reply."

Then there's a further exchange. You indicate that there's been some attention paid to the cost of cancelling the event, which might be £6 million. You raise the question of whether that would or would not include compensation for those who have lost money.

22 And then at 11.55 Professor Leitch says: 23 "Yep. I think that's costs not profit."

24 In the £6 million analysis.

25 And then he says:

190

And ultimately I remember the First Minister was asking questions to which, to be frank, you would not be able to answer: if you close the fan zone, how many people, extra people end up in pubs? And therefore this was -- I think the message exchange demonstrates that this was not an easy decision to make, and saying that: yes, the First Minister who -- the former First Minister had shown very good instincts, I believe, in relation to decisions being made in regards to the pandemic. There was ultimately a decision that had to be made here and we had provided her clinical advisers and I had also spoken to her, of course, about the fan zone and given my view, but it was not an easy decision to make at all. I think ultimately the right decision was made, given the mitigations that we were able to put in place in relation to testing and so on and so forth.

17 Q. My question was whether ultimately it was a matter which 18 relied -- this very difficult situation with lots of 19 different considerations, financial, health, moving 20 picture -- ultimately that relied on an instinctive 21 judgement by the First Minister? 22 A. No, didn't rely on that. Her instinctive judgement was 23

important but it relied on, I think, being -- all of those involved in the decision being confident that the appropriate mitigations were in place and understanding

the impacts and potential effects of cancelling the
 fan zone and what that would mean for public health as
 well as other issues too.

Q. There is a further exchange at page 17, which is a little bit later, I think after, perhaps, the fan zone has, at least to some extent, been in existence. This is now on 24 June, looking at the exchange, which starts at the 24th at 12.26.

You are discussing, I think, the position with regard to the numbers and you say:

"I was certain we'd be well above the 3,000 mark...

"Just doesn't feel right that we aren't effectively able to do anything in the immediate and short term to drive those numbers down, other than imposing restrictions, which as the FM says the public just wouldn't stand for."

Professor Leitch says:

A.

"Keep your fingers crossed it [is] a temporary Euros phenomenon."

The expression "keep your fingers crossed" is one which appears on a number of occasions in these exchanges. Is it the case by this stage that you were relying on instinct and luck to manage the pandemic? No, I would reject that charge in its entirety.

Look, I'm -- I was the Cabinet Secretary for Health

of the public such that you just allowed the virus to run rampant?

A. No. You see, it's not a case of simply losing the dressing room, or the public won't stand for it. What that in effect means, of course, is that we don't -- we will not have compliance, and that is the worst of both worlds. So you end up in a position where people aren't complying, they just won't stand for it -- at this point we'd been living with the virus for over a year and people have been through numerous restrictions -- so you get the worst of both worlds: they don't comply and then that therefore means that you continue to get increased levels and numbers of cases.

I think that was particularly -- it was more difficult, I think, to bring forward the NPIs, the non-pharmaceutical interventions, when we had a vaccination programme also well under way and a testing system that was well established as well.

But I go back to the central point in this exchange, that we were facing an incredibly difficult set of circumstances, with not just the fan zone but, generally speaking, having lived for over a year with this virus people's patience, understandably so, with restrictions wearing relatively thin.

Q. But at this stage was it not possible to try to mitigate 195

and Social Care, I was always going to be the guy in the Cabinet that pushed for us to go the hardest, the fastest, to do more in terms of NPIs and restrictions I suspect that is true of every health secretary right across the United Kingdom. That was often our position, and my position as Cabinet Secretary for Health was no different.

So there was occasions in Cabinet and in gold command other fora where I would be pushing harder, but ultimately it became a collective decision and in this case, for example, the First Minister, the former First Minister's belief that if we had imposed restrictions, particularly during the Euros, the public just would not accept it. And that, of course, would be dangerous for compliance and then we would not just lose the public, which was important in relation to future compliance, but we'd also have no impact on the virus either.

Q. You used the expression in one of the passages I went to there, the possibility of "losing the dressing room", that expression features on a number of occasions in your exchanges with Professor Leitch. Again, at this stage, are you effectively suggesting that although there is good evidence to suggest that more needed to be done, the concern was that you would lose the confidence

the possibility of losing the dressing room by using strategies you suggested were used early in the pandemic: explaining things to people, explaining what the data was, explaining why it was in their interests to adhere to the restrictions. It seems here that there is a discussion about those risks, a discussion about that data, but you simply give up and rely on instinct?

A. No, again, I don't agree that we gave up. There was first and foremost at this point restrictions in place. It'd be wrong for anybody to suggest there wasn't any level of restriction in place. But what we also did was we took additional measures, particularly in relation to the fan zone but also of course, you'll be aware, in addition to the fan zone there was some matches being played at Hampden, with a reduced capacity, so we made sure that significant mitigations were put in place in relation to testing availability, test kits being sent out to people, mitigations around hand hygiene, one-way systems, and so on and so forth. We took a number of mitigations. So this wasn't a case of, "Look, we're not going to take any action, we just have to live with what will happen".

And ultimately of course the data demonstrates that, when we look at the Public Health Scotland Covid-19 statistical report of 28 June 2021, that between 11 and

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

25

1 28 June, 1,991 people in Scotland with a Covid diagnosis 2 were identified as having attended one or more Euro 2020 3 events during the infectious period, but they were 4 tagged in terms of what events they attended, and nearly 5 two-thirds of the cases, 1,294 people, reported 6 travelling to London for a Euro-related event and game. 7 When we look at those who were tagged for the fan zone, 8 out of the 1,991, 55 cases came as part of the fan zone 9 or travelled to the fan zone, and the Scotland match 10 against Croatia, 38 tags, and the Scotland match versus the Czech Republic, 37 tags. 11 12

So really a small proportion of those positive cases went to the fan zone or indeed attended a game at Hampden, and that, to me, says that the mitigations we put in place were relatively effective.

Q. Could I then follow this attempt to try to understand the decision-making process over this period into the later variant emergence which you mentioned yourself, the Omicron variant, so if we could go then to --I think it's the same document, 4792, at page 45.

So at this stage late November Omicron has started to become the next issue that we have to deal with. I think that you say in your statement that there were some gaps in data around Omicron which caused some issues around that time. Could you tell us, do you

immune escape, such that the vaccines might not work as effectively against this new variant. Is that broadly

correct? 4 A. Yes, correct.

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1

2

3

5 Q. Yes. So at this stage one might think that one required 6 to reimpose or reconsider a precautionary approach, 7 because of the possibility that the great protector, the 8 game-changer, as you described it, the vaccine, may no 9 longer be the protection which it might at once have 10 been; is that right?

A. That is one conclusion, yes. 11

Q. Is that a fair assessment of the approach which ought to 12 13 have been taken?

14 A. Well, again, it depends when the decision was taken 15 because every day we were learning more and more about 16 the variant, its characteristics, possible immune 17 escape, et cetera, et cetera.

Q. So if I could take you to an exchange, please -- I'd 18 19 taken you to at page 45, sorry, before asking you that 20 question -- at 13 December at 19.56.

A. Yeah. 21

24

25

22 Q. Discussion here in this context where you again 23 discussing, as we see often, with Professor Leitch:

> "Keep me updated on what comes out FM call. I will be really disappointed if we end up with just window 199

recall what the gaps in data were around this period 1 2 that caused difficulty in trying to come up with 3 a strategy?

A. In terms of Omicron?

Q. Yes. I could read the passage out if it's more helpful, it might refresh your memory:

"I do recall times when there were gaps in the data, scientific information or advice, particularly in relation to a new variant. For example, when information emerged about a new Covid-19 variant, Omicron, in late November 2021, advisors were understandably unsure about the extent of immune-escape or severity of Omicron. The scientific research was still in the early stages in South Africa (where Omicron was first identified) and while it was quickly established that it had a high transmission rate, other factors such as how it would impact those who had the booster vaccine were unknown. The lack of scientific understanding was communicated to Cabinet at the time. both from the CMO and in papers provided to Cabinet and taken into account when making decisions."

So I think you're trying to say there that, simply as a result of the fact it was a new variant. There was inevitably a lack of data about -- one of the particular factors about it was whether there was going to be 198

dressing."

To which, at 20.13, Professor Leitch described: "It's window dressing. We edged her to limiting households everywhere we could but it's marginal. Nothing significant."

You say:

"Just don't get it. Take it it's coming down to finance? So big events can continue, people can meet in as big as numbers as they like in pubs and restaurants? Madness."

11 You say:

12 "Working from home?" 13 Professor Leitch says: 14 "All about money." 15 Professor Leitch says:

16 "Үер.

"Yes. In regs." 17

18 You say:

19 "Frustrating. Thought Kate [which I assume is 20 a reference to Ms Forbes, is that right?] might have 21 pulled something out of the bag. Was she on the call? 22 I have might try and call her tonight will have limited 23 effect i suspect but be helpful to understand the 24 analysis she has done of costs involved."

> So is the position here that you are suggesting that 200

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

greater steps require to be taken to deal with this situation but for, amongst other reasons, financial reasons those steps are not being taken, which is causing you a great deal of frustration?

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

A. That is a fair summary, so -- and I remember this period very, very well, and I go back to the comments I made a moment ago in response to a different question that you asked. As Cabinet Secretary for Health I was always going to be the person round the Cabinet table that was pushing the government to go further, to go faster, to go harder, given that I was the one that was dealing with health on a day-to-day basis and seeing the impacts on the health service.

I think the other important point of context are in funding and finance here, which is exceptionally important, is of course by this point I believe the UK Government had already significantly reduced, if not entirely withdrawn, its funding in relation to business support. So therefore if we were going to try to find money for business support, if we were going to introduce restrictions on hospitality, then we would have to find that compensation within the Scottish Government's budget, which was already under extreme pressure given that we were still -- we had been fighting the pandemic that whole year.

limited households -- limiting households everywhere, you know, but it's marginal. I would have wanted us to

I think by this point we also had a better understanding about immune escape and that the vaccine was still very effective against -- a booster dose of that vaccine was incredibly effective against Omicron variant. So, again, as well as NPIs, the non-pharmaceutical interventions, we were also looking at how we would rapidly increase the level of vaccination as well

Q. There are some further exchanges in this regard expressing your frustration with the position the First Minister seemed to take. This period -- the correspondence goes on in this vein over this period.

If I could take you down a bit further, please, to 5 January 2022 at 1.19 -- sorry 1.18, page 48? 1.18, yes:

"It is grim [you say] but FM is right, public aren't with us. They now hear what they want to hear 'less severe' 'one in ICU with Omicron'."

Professor Leitch says:

"Yep. I agree. And I kind of agree with them. I can't find any evidence of ICU increases or deaths globally. So...it's a health service problem now."

So there is no doubt that I had thought at this period in time that we should have gone further, and I'm not sure if it's quite at this time or slightly later in the month that we end up with an options paper around various different options that Cabinet considers. Now it's no surprise that I am the one who opts for what I think was option C at the time, which was the one with the most restriction in place, including further restriction on hospitality and leisure. But we had to consider not just all four harms, which was our guiding light, but we had to consider whether or not we would be able to compensate businesses or not if we added further restriction.

So, yes, I think your summary is fair, I wanted to go further, but ultimately that had to be a collective decision that Cabinet would have had in considering all of the factors, including finance of course, as well as ultimately the priority, which is public health.

19 Q. First Minister, over this period, as we describe, there 20 was considerable uncertainty as to what might happen. 21 There was a threat from a new variant, cases were 22 rising; there was a need to take a precautionary 23 approach, was there not?

24 A. Yes, and that's why further limitations were brought in 25 and you can see that from the exchange with Jason, 202

You say:

"So means we have to deal with the consequences, ie somehow ensure our NHS doesn't completely collapse. I'm not entirely sure we can deliver on that but I'm going to have to do everything in my power to make sure it doesn't."

Then at 1.22 you say:

"We have asked a lot of the public. But we've lost the dressing room on this one. After 21 months 'save the NHS' isn't enough to stop them living their lives as close to normal as they can get."

Does this exchange indicate, First Minister, that by this stage, in light of record numbers of cases and the NHS in collapse, you had lost the faith of the Scottish people such that the virus was able to run rampant without control?

A. No, that is not the interpretation. The interpretation is that we have, as we say in the exchange that's highlighted, we have asked a lot of the public. That was true. Never, never in my life could I have imagined that I would ever be in a position in politics that would require me, necessitate me to now have to effectively keep people under lockdown. Not in effect; we did keep people in lockdown. This was the biggest decisions I think a government has ever made, certainly 204

in recent times, and we didn't just ask the public to do that once, we asked them to live by these restrictions on multiple occasions.

So there's not a blame here, neither on the public but nor do I think it is correct to attribute blame to the government for the fact that the public had had enough of restrictive measures. But when you have a vaccination programme in place that was effective, when you have a testing system that's in place that has shown to be effective, then -- and when we are seeing a new variant but that new variant, thankfully, because of the vaccine, largely down to the vaccine, is not causing as much severe illness perhaps as if we didn't have the vaccine, and people are hearing that there's one person in ICU for example with Omicron, then it would have been if not virtually impossible, extremely difficult to impose a level of restriction akin to lockdown that would have undoubtedly had the impact of reducing case numbers, but I don't think we would have had compliance with -- from the public.

Q. I've two very brief further questions.

I understand that during the course of your evidence, I think you alluded to this earlier in connection with the WhatsApp situation, that you have announced an externally led review into the Scottish 205

from hospital care. The Scottish Government are aware that older people were more at risk of serious illness from the virus, but in the initial stages of the pandemic there was an evolving understanding of asymptomatic transmission. As the knowledge and understanding grew, our testing regime was changed accordingly in response."

Then you explain that this is why there was a change in routinely testing from those -- from hospital to care homes who were asymptomatic to testing all people moving from hospital to care homes on 21 April 2020.

We see from our discussion of Cabinet meetings that the issue of care homes was frequently discussed, and I would like to ask you, as a member, I appreciate, of the Cabinet but not as the member who had specific responsibility for this, but nevertheless a member of the Cabinet who was making these decisions: what was your understanding, and when did you become aware of the possibility of asymptomatic transfer of Covid-19?

Now, before you respond to that, I use the word "possibility" with care. Not when did it become clear that that was an issue, but can you recall when the live issue of asymptomatic transfer was a possibility?

24 A. Thank you.

Can I reiterate, now that I'm speaking directly to 207

- Government's use of WhatsApp and non-corporate technology; is that correct?
- 3 A. Yes.
- Q. That review will not have access to WhatsApps which have
 been destroyed by ministers and senior officials, will
 it?
- 7 A. No.

8 MR DAWSON: I have no further questions, my Lady.
 9 There are some pre-Rule 10 questions from
 10 Ms Mitchell.

11 LADY HALLETT: Yes, there are.

Ms Mitchell.

Questions from MS MITCHELL KC

MS MITCHELL: First Minister, I appear as instructed by
 Aamer Anwar & Company on behalf of the Scottish Covid
 Bereaved.

I wish to ask you some questions particularly in relation to Covid symptoms.

I would like a document brought up, please. It is INQ000273956, paragraph 341.

I'll start by explaining that paragraph says:

"In 2020, the Cabinet Secretary for Health and Sport would have received advice from scientific and clinical experts in relation to the risk of transmission within care homes of patients being discharged to care homes 206

you as the representative of Scottish Covid Bereaved, can I reiterate that apology that I made at the beginning for the way that we've handled the WhatsApp issue. It was not good enough and it has caused, I know, serious grief and re-trauma for those that you represent, and there's no excuses from me, that should have been handled better and in the future will be handled better.

In relation to the substance of your question,
I couldn't give you an absolute date of when the
possibility became clear. As you can imagine, many of
us in government, regardless of whether they were
health secretary at the time or not, have reflected on
this issue and this question of asymptomatic testing for
those who were being discharged from hospitals into
care homes, and there will be a long list of potential
lessons that the government and governments could have
learnt.

I think the issue around possible asymptomatic transmission of the virus was known as a possibility early on, through various international journals, through various academic articles, and there will be a number of things that we could have done better.

It is in my view, as the current First Minister,
that we should have been testing those who were leaving
208

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

- 1 hospitals, going into care homes who were asymptomatic 2 sooner than we actually did.
- 3 Q. Can I press you: when you say early, when are we talking 4 about, January, February?
- 5 A. Forgive me, I couldn't recall exactly when that was --
- 6 **Q.** So I suppose implicit in your response was that you were 7 aware of the possibility of asymptomatic transfer at the 8 time it was decided to move people from hospitals into
- 9 care homes?

21

1

2

3

4

5

6

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

- 10 A. Yes. Yes, I mean, I would certainly say that 11 pre-21 April 2020 I think it would be fair to say that 12 there was a possibility -- and that was the word you 13 very specifically used -- because it wasn't clear, may 14 not have been clear well in advance of that date, but it 15 was certainly a possibility that asymptomatic 16 transmission could have happened and therefore, as 17 I say, if there's an area of reflection that I think 18 about very often, it is whether we should have -- and it 19 is my view actually we should have -- perhaps more 20 routinely tested those moving from hospitals to care
- homes who were asymptomatic sooner. 22 Q. I understand that you've reflected upon that and that's 23 your view now. Can you explain to the Inquiry what your 24 thinking -- what the impact of that was at the time, 25 what your thinking was at the time when you decided:

209

tests, rapid tests, which became -- again, evolved over time to become far more accurate than they were.

But when it became clearer, because we talked about a possibility of asymptomatic transmission, when it became clearer of course we moved to a position of routinely testing.

- 7 Q. But prior to that time it appears that, balancing things 8 out, that was a risk you had to take?
- 9 A. We were always trying to balance a number of factors and risks, overwhelming of the NHS, nosocomial infection, 10 11 impact on care homes, and so on and so forth, and --
- 12 May I move on to my next question, and that is in 13 relation to the changing picture of Covid symptoms over 14 the piece.

Now, we've heard evidence even as early as February and certainly in March of 2020, we heard evidence from Dr Donald Macaskill saying that they were aware at Scottish Care that symptoms demonstrated as being Covid symptoms were not manifesting in the same way as in a population which was particularly old and with multiple comorbidities.

We have then at a later stage, June 2020, Public Health Scotland highlighting the fact that symptoms in the elderly are different, and also Public Health Scotland, in June 2021, indicating that older

well, there might be a possibility of asymptomatic transfer but I'm still going to be a collective part of a decision to transfer from the hospital environment into the care home environment?

A. Yes, so I can try to talk you through that to the best of my ability. So, first of all, it is the issue around a possibility. And I should say at this point I also had a family member in a care home, my wife's gran, who's in a care home to this day. And therefore we always try to understand the issues that were affecting care home relatives, in particular, and those who were in care homes, because for them it wasn't the care home, it was their home.

In terms of the possibility, the various factors we had to consider were at this point, in early days of the pandemic, we were extremely concerned about the overwhelming of the NHS and whether or not we would have the sufficient bed capacity or not, particularly in advance of any vaccine.

The other thing that we had to consider was the testing infrastructure. Now, the testing infrastructure built up over a period of months and years, even -- but certainly over a period of months we were able to ramp it up, but we did have limitations in terms of the testing infrastructure and also the reliability of

210

compromised residents may present with atypical or non-specific symptoms, and list them.

My Lady, for reference, that is INQ000241655.

After you became Cabinet Secretary for Health and Social Care in May 2021, you met the group now known as the Scottish Covid Bereaved on 17 August 2021, and during the course of that conversation they raised with you the issue of Covid-19 symptoms being restricted to temperature, persistent cough and a loss of sense of taste or smell, and you recall that you confirmed that the UK Health Security Agency was responsible for the symptoms and would not at that stage change it.

You say that in respect of the steps taken to revise the symptoms, you recall enquiring of the CMO as to the potential scope for expanding the line of symptoms.

In that regard, this would be Gregor Smith that you would have been asking, do you recall if you asked him in person or in writing?

Forgive me, it certainly would have been in person, Α. I can't remember whether or not there was also a written exchange, be that over informal communication or formally, but the Scottish Covid Bereaved of course raised it, as you rightly say, and that's minuted. It was also raised by other groups as well that there may be additional symptoms, and there was of course primary 212

211

(53) Pages 209 - 212

1		core symptoms and then what was known sometimes as
2		secondary symptoms. But ultimately these were clinical
3		decisions. There is no way that I, nor the previous
4		DFM, who met Scottish Covid Bereaved
5	Q.	No, I'm sorry to interrupt you, First Minister, I'm just
6		wanting to see whether or not you asked him, and
7		presumably he followed that up, because in the paragraph
8		you give, we don't hear what the response was. Can you
9		remember what the response
10	A.	Yes, he would have had a discussion with the other CMOs
11		of the United Kingdom and for the clinical expertise
12		would have been to maintain those core symptoms as they
13		were. Now, they would have taken a whole raft and range
14		of clinical advice and used their clinical expertise to
15		come to that decision, and I go back to saying that
16		ultimately it was always going to be a clinical
17		decision.
18	Q.	Finally, why when health is a devolved matter did it
19		require the UK Health Security Agency to identify the
20		symptom profile, as fed into it by the four CMOs? Why
21		couldn't Scotland go its own way in that regard?
22	A.	Yeah. I think in essence if we had if the CMO and
23		the clinical advice had come back to say very strongly
24		that "We believe that there should be XYZ symptom added
25		to the core symptoms", that may have been a possibility. 213

1	INDEX	
2		PAGE
3	MS RACHEL ELIZABETH LLOYD (affirmed)	1
4		
5	Questions from COUNSEL TO THE INQUIRY	. 1
6		
7	Questions from THE CHAIR	86
8		
9	Questions from MS MITCHELL KC	88
10		
11	Further questions from THE CHAIR	92
12		
13	MR HUMZA YOUSAF (sworn)	95
14		
15	Questions from LEAD COUNSEL TO THE INQUIR	Y95
16	for MODULE 2A	
17		
18	Questions from MS MITCHELL KC	206
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		

1	I think we were very, very keen in this sense to try to
2	keep UK alignment, to try to make the issue more simply
3	understood in relation to the core symptoms right across
4	the UK. But this again, I go back to the point, there's
5	always going to be an issue of clinical advice as
6	opposed to ministerial decision or direction.
7	MS MITCHELL: My Lady, those are my questions.
8	LADY HALLETT: Thank you, Ms Mitchell.
9	Thank you very much, First Minister, I'm very
10	grateful to you.
11	Sorry about the constant coughing, I'm afraid it's
12	been a feature of this Inquiry, certainly in Scotland.
13	I will see everybody on Monday at 10 am.
14	THE WITNESS: Thank you my Lady.
15	(The witness withdrew)
16	(4.33 pm)
17	(The hearing adjourned until 10 am
18	on Monday, 29 January 2024)
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	244
	214

1/1.15 [1] 94/21 **10 [3]** 92/24 94/11 LADY HALLETT: 206/9 **[35]** 1/3 37/3 45/5 **10 am [2]** 214/13 61/18 61/23 62/3 214/17 62/15 62/21 65/11 **10 June [1]** 190/10 73/22 74/12 74/16 **10 May 2020 [1]** 42/5 86/4 86/19 86/21 10 September [2] 87/21 87/24 88/6 14/11 14/16 88/22 92/18 92/20 **10.00 am [1]** 1/2 93/9 94/8 94/14 94/18 10.26 [1] 166/19 94/23 94/25 95/5 **10/6/2021 [1]** 190/10 95/10 153/12 153/18 **100 [1]** 74/11 153/22 154/2 206/11 **100,000 [1]** 169/11 **100-odd [1]** 189/5 MR DAWSON: [6] **11 [1]** 196/25 95/6 95/15 153/16 **11.17 am [1]** 62/18 153/21 154/8 206/8 **11.30 [1]** 62/17 **MR TARIQ: [11]** 1/4 11.30 am [1] 62/20 1/8 37/4 45/12 61/16 **11.45 [1]** 190/11 62/22 65/22 74/18 **11.52 [1]** 109/14 86/2 94/22 94/24 11.55 [1] 190/22 MS MITCHELL: [4] **12 [3]** 19/18 190/8 88/25 92/17 206/14 190/9 214/7 **12.09 [1]** 11/14 THE WITNESS: [2] **12.10 [3]** 12/8 15/9 95/14 214/14 16/24 **12.11 pm [1]** 95/2 **12.15 [2]** 11/5 12/9 'Health [1] 120/3 **12.26 [1]** 193/8 'keep [2] 109/18 **13 [7]** 1/23 1/24 109/23 28/16 86/18 152/10 'less [1] 203/20 190/8 190/9 'maximalist' [1] 13 December [1] 158/21 199/20 one [1] 203/21 13 October [4] 'save [1] 204/9 121/21 123/7 123/16 124/1 13 October 2023 [1] ...**and [1]** 21/5 120/8 0 **13.39 [1]** 187/24 **0.7 [1]** 168/24 14 September [1] 14/12 **0.8 [1]** 168/24 14 September 2020 **0.9 [1]** 168/24 **[1]** 11/2 **14.02 [1]** 188/15 **14.04 [1]** 189/1 1 November [1] **14.07 [1]** 189/7 1 November 2020 [1] **14.11 [1]** 189/11 14.29 [1] 189/16 1 September 2020 [5] 142 [1] 32/9 69/10 69/21 79/2 **143 [1]** 134/24 **15** [**5**] 12/2 12/13 79/7 79/15 37/17 91/21 191/4 1,294 people [1] 15 November 2023 197/5 **[2]** 1/18 2/11 **1,991 [2]** 197/1 197/8 **1.15 [1]** 94/21 15 years [1] 154/18 **1.18 [2]** 203/17 **16** [5] 96/2 155/16 156/13 156/23 157/1 203/18 **1.19 [1]** 203/17 16 March 2021 [2] **1.22 [1]** 204/7 69/10 79/3 **1.45 [2]** 94/22 94/23 **17 [2]** 169/12 193/4

1.45 pm [1] 95/4

17 February [2] 134/19 135/8 **17 March [2]** 136/16 137/7 **18 [3]** 156/6 156/13 156/19 18 February [1] 135/10 **18 hours [1]** 31/19 **18-year [2]** 155/16 157/2 **180-odd [1]** 51/25 **19 [30]** 56/23 58/17 63/11 64/11 64/15 66/4 119/21 120/13 125/21 135/3 169/10 177/6 178/4 178/6 179/12 179/24 180/5 180/17 180/22 181/2 181/4 181/8 181/10 182/16 182/18 184/16 196/24 198/10 207/19 212/8 **19 May 2021 [1]** 97/4 **19 November 2021 [1]** 162/5 **19.56 [1]** 199/20 **19.58 [1]** 162/6 **19/6/2020 [1]** 166/19 2 November 2023 [1] 95/20 **2....is [1]** 20/21 **2.20 [2]** 11/6 12/10 **2.57 pm [1]** 153/24 **20 [18]** 11/25 12/3 12/15 12/22 13/18 14/1 14/6 14/9 14/10 14/19 15/14 15/19 16/15 16/16 18/17 37/7 76/7 158/11 20 attendees [1] 12/12 **20 hours [1]** 31/19 **20 minutes [1]** 19/14 20 November [1] 47/25 **20 people [2]** 10/25 17/13 **20 years [1]** 191/15 **20.05 [1]** 162/21 **20.13 [1]** 200/2 **2012 [2]** 2/24 28/9 **2015 [2]** 3/8 6/7 **2018 [1]** 97/4 **2019 [1]** 2/4 2019/early [1] 2/1 2020 [51] 2/2 2/4 11/2 11/4 28/10 28/24 28 June [1] 197/1

31/13 32/12 32/20

43/10 47/4 49/12

17 August 2021 [1]

212/6

37/9 39/25 40/5 42/5

79/15 80/15 80/19 86/7 113/5 118/17 134/11 135/2 135/8 135/10 147/10 156/19 214/18 197/2 206/22 207/11 209/11 211/16 211/22 96/20 2020/early [1] 2/1 **2021 [41]** 2/1 2/25 3/3 3/8 3/11 8/10 20/10 23/8 30/22 31/7 31/13 49/20 49/23 52/12 53/3 69/10 72/25 79/3 97/4 97/7 158/3 162/5 168/23 176/19 176/21 179/5 212/5 212/6 2021/2022 [1] 31/3 **2022 [5]** 31/3 118/17 170/11 174/7 203/17 **2023 [12]** 1/18 2/11 3/4 3/18 69/17 70/9 70/11 95/20 96/3 96/20 97/13 120/8 **2024 [2]** 1/1 214/18 **21 [1]** 43/9 21 April 2020 [1] 207/11 **21 months [1]** 204/9 22 September [2] 11/13 14/13 22 September 2020 **[1]** 11/4 **23 [3]** 47/1 174/18 189/10 23 March 2021 [2] 2/25 3/8 23 September [1] 14/17 **24 hours [1]** 105/11 **24 June [1]** 193/7 **24th [1]** 193/8 **25 [1]** 56/15 25 April [1] 168/25 25 January 2024 [1] **26 April [1]** 169/2 26 June 2018 [1] 97/4 **27 [1]** 56/15 27 May 2020 [1] 156/19 30/9 30/16 30/22 31/8 28 June 2021 [1] 196/25 **6.29 pm [1]** 43/11 28 March 2023 [2] **6.30 pm [1]** 37/10 3/4 97/13

56/15 60/20 63/14

64/20 69/6 69/10

69/21 69/21 79/2 79/7 28 September 2020 **[1]** 32/12 **29 [1]** 6/13 29 January 2024 [1] 166/19 168/22 182/20 **29 June [1]** 113/20 29 March 2023 [1] **2A [2]** 95/9 215/16 **2pm [1]** 57/11 **3,000 [1]** 193/11 50/1 50/3 50/15 50/23 **3.10 [1]** 153/23 **3.10 pm [1]** 154/1 **30 [2]** 12/3 12/13 30 June 2020 [3] 170/17 170/20 170/24 28/10 28/24 86/7 **30-day [1]** 125/13 182/21 183/12 190/10 **30....we [1]** 11/25 196/25 198/11 211/25 31 August 2020 [1] 69/21 31 October [1] 37/15 31 October 2020 [1] 37/9 **32 [1]** 112/15 **341 [1]** 206/20 **35 [3]** 19/24 99/5 99/7 **36 [1]** 9/17 **37 [1]** 63/2 **37 tags [1]** 197/11 **38 tags [1]** 197/10 **4 January [1]** 158/14 4.30 [1] 95/12 **4.33 pm [1]** 214/16 **4/2 [2]** 21/5 21/23 4/3 [1] 20/19 **42 [1]** 89/6 **45 [2]** 197/20 199/19 **4792 [2]** 190/9 197/20 **48 [1]** 203/17 5 5 January 2022 [1] 203/17 **5,000 [2]** 172/14 178/14 **53 [1]** 145/14 **55 cases [1]** 197/8 **56 [1]** 28/16 6 March [1] 59/7 6 May [1] 169/7 **6 million [2]** 190/19 190/24

28 September [1]

44/21

	56/42 57/42 57/46	144/44 454/00 400/0	44/00 44/5 54/40	advice [0] 40/2 92/46
6	56/13 57/12 57/16 58/7 58/16 59/18 60/1	141/14 154/22 180/8 194/14	41/20 44/5 51/10 53/13 61/12 61/25	advise [2] 10/2 82/16 advised [5] 9/18
6.40 [1] 37/16	60/4 62/3 62/23 63/24		66/16 75/10 109/19	10/11 35/17 36/18
6/2 [3] 21/5 21/23 22/14	64/2 64/23 64/25	59/24 116/6 118/7	109/24 124/12 131/25	
6/3 [3] 20/13 21/6	66/23 66/25 67/17	accepting [1] 147/5	209/2 209/19	adviser [22] 2/24 3/3
22/16	68/1 69/12 70/1 73/7	access [7] 35/19	add [1] 170/1	3/12 3/13 4/4 4/20 5/8
63 [1] 174/22	73/23 75/22 75/23	106/23 118/1 125/5	added [3] 186/20	7/19 18/11 18/13
I———	75/24 77/1 77/14	125/6 128/25 206/4	202/12 213/24	28/15 29/13 49/22
7	78/18 78/19 79/6 80/2 82/3 82/14 84/1 84/7	accessible [2] 154/6 154/15	adding [1] 4/5	50/7 51/7 51/12 52/6
7 September 2021 [1]	84/14 87/13 87/16	accidentally [1]	addition [2] 158/23 196/14	53/14 84/8 93/12 94/1 175/16
50/3	88/8 91/11 92/23	84/21	additional [13] 26/17	advisers [32] 3/24
70-year [1] 179/4	92/25 94/20 98/11	accord [1] 53/15	26/24 27/3 34/16	4/10 4/14 4/17 5/2
8	98/14 99/7 103/16	accordance [2]	45/21 69/19 69/22	5/13 5/17 6/1 7/7 9/11
8 March 2020 [2]	108/25 109/5 110/10	123/8 124/18	79/3 139/11 160/10	24/7 25/25 49/9 49/10
63/14 64/20	110/11 111/19 111/24		164/16 196/12 212/25	l .
8.1 [1] 152/6	112/22 116/4 116/8	107/16 207/7	address [6] 37/11	85/16 85/17 85/17
8.2 [1] 152/6	116/13 118/24 121/17	account [5] 68/22	37/14 80/7 84/3	92/23 93/1 93/2 101/3
8.3 [1] 157/12	123/21 126/23 128/5 130/23 131/1 134/7	82/23 124/5 124/13 198/21	136/15 187/3 adhere [2] 161/3	110/16 176/9 177/1 181/7 181/13 181/14
81 [1] 169/11	134/12 134/18 134/25		196/5	181/16 192/11
87 [1] 188/2	136/10 138/24 143/14	, , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , ,	adjourned [1] 214/17	l .
9	144/11 145/7 145/10	117/5 117/20 133/2	adjournment [1] 95/3	
9.04 pm [1] 47/5	146/1 146/3 147/6	accountable [3] 5/14		16/2 21/19 21/20
94 [1] 150/1	148/1 148/6 148/16	5/18 5/19	administered [1]	49/10 86/9
	151/19 153/18 154/13		120/3	advisors [1] 198/11
<u>A</u>	155/7 155/9 155/10	83/8	administrative [1]	advisory [10] 99/21
Aamer [2] 89/1	158/15 162/5 162/25	accurate [5] 95/25	150/21	107/22 110/17 174/21
206/15	163/14 163/25 166/11 168/15 169/19 170/16	96/11 120/13 120/20 211/2	administratively [1] 152/12	176/13 177/6 177/13 179/12 180/5 182/18
Aamer Anwar [2] 89/1 206/15	172/14 174/12 176/16		administrator [1]	affect [1] 40/10
abide [1] 113/22	178/17 181/25 184/6	achieved [1] 140/22	81/6	affected [2] 135/7
abided [1] 159/16	187/6 187/22 188/5	achieves [1] 73/12	admission [1] 165/4	160/5
ability [5] 35/24	188/14 188/16 189/20		adopt [1] 17/21	affecting [1] 210/10
44/14 44/17 151/21	190/2 191/8 191/15	90/22 100/11	adopted [2] 152/17	affirmed [2] 1/6
210/6	192/12 196/6 196/6	acknowledging [1]	173/22	215/3
able [37] 6/23 7/20	198/10 198/12 198/24		adoption [4] 9/18	afford [1] 36/20
16/7 16/14 28/24 32/13 32/22 35/16	203/5 209/4 209/18	across [5] 49/11 52/6 157/19 194/5 214/3	10/3 10/8 10/10 advance [5] 47/13	afraid [5] 86/5 115/10 136/3 186/12 214/11
36/9 36/18 44/2 46/4	210/16 211/3 214/11	act [4] 148/3 156/8	88/2 177/12 209/14	Africa [1] 198/14
54/24 56/11 71/25	above [2] 24/16	156/18 185/2	210/19	after [27] 3/2 14/2
79/10 79/12 81/3 84/3		acted [3] 6/20 15/24	advancing [1] 87/1	20/19 31/7 47/19
85/21 104/4 106/18	abrogate [1] 121/23	16/1	advantages [1] 34/3	49/21 50/14 60/19
117/25 124/15 124/23		action [12] 6/20 7/9	advice [64] 4/5 4/9	62/10 69/25 87/12
131/21 134/10 153/20		13/9 30/7 31/5 130/24		119/23 120/4 123/1
155/3 161/5 181/11	absolutely [26] 97/14		7/21 8/22 10/8 13/24	123/12 131/1 135/9
192/3 192/15 193/13	99/4 101/12 104/1 114/2 119/16 121/24	180/13 186/21 196/21 actioned [1] 122/9	14/17 15/1 15/23 15/23 15/25 16/3	140/2 141/17 154/18 156/2 162/20 170/24
about [178] 2/4 2/12	126/12 132/15 138/25		16/17 17/10 17/11	189/10 193/5 204/9
	142/23 152/23 156/16		19/13 22/9 23/8 23/9	212/4
12/11 12/24 13/1	163/12 163/13 163/20			afternoon [2] 11/6
14/13 14/18 14/24	166/6 168/6 171/17	54/14 87/17 87/20	57/18 58/23 59/1 59/9	
15/6 15/10 15/12	172/8 180/8 185/2	90/20 91/16 91/18	59/13 59/16 59/17	afterwards [3] 56/2
16/20 17/9 19/18 20/9	l .	92/3 139/18 158/19	59/24 60/4 61/20	65/10 65/19
23/21 27/23 28/4 28/9	l .	active [2] 29/7	62/10 63/20 84/11	again [69] 19/23 21/8
29/25 30/4 30/15 33/4 34/5 34/5 34/18 36/3	23/10 23/13	155/19 actively [1] 81/9	99/22 107/15 109/21 119/20 120/12 132/4	49/4 50/4 51/20 62/22 63/1 63/23 65/8 76/15
I .	academic [1] 208/22	activities [2] 30/25	132/18 135/5 174/19	82/8 84/19 100/9
	accelerate [1] 188/21		175/1 175/14 175/17	100/24 101/23 105/6
44/16 47/20 48/15	accept [17] 22/18	activity [4] 149/20	175/21 175/23 176/23	
48/20 49/3 49/10	22/18 29/23 72/8	149/25 150/1 161/11	181/13 181/19 182/21	l .
52/16 54/1 54/2 54/5	72/13 72/21 86/21	actual [1] 122/14	182/22 190/13 198/8	129/25 130/20 131/17
54/13 55/25 56/3 56/4		actually [19] 13/21	206/23 213/14 213/23	
	117/3 117/6 126/25	21/9 22/15 23/22 25/8	214/5	146/7 146/18 146/22
1	İ	İ	İ	İ

46/23 49/18 56/25 57/25 58/11 68/8 71/1 again... [38] 148/7 71/21 77/18 77/20 154/3 155/17 155/23 78/12 78/15 84/18 156/25 157/4 157/8 86/21 87/10 99/12 159/10 159/20 162/6 102/23 103/15 104/6 163/3 165/3 165/22 117/9 119/23 122/12 166/12 166/15 167/5 124/3 124/9 132/11 168/15 169/6 172/6 137/17 141/5 151/24 172/9 172/15 179/5 152/25 153/3 162/17 180/21 181/7 181/13 163/9 168/18 174/16 182/3 183/25 186/14 182/5 182/6 182/11 186/18 187/18 187/21 183/6 184/1 184/25 194/22 196/8 199/14 185/13 188/14 189/4 199/22 203/8 211/1 189/8 191/1 192/13 214/4 192/23 200/14 202/10 against [7] 27/14 202/16 207/10 210/6 92/3 183/3 197/10 allocation [1] 159/19 199/2 203/6 203/7 allow [4] 21/6 90/17 age [3] 156/19 188/21 189/23 156/23 157/6 allowed [8] 169/4 agencies [1] 135/23 173/24 173/25 188/17 **Agency [2]** 212/11 188/18 190/3 191/6 213/19 195/1 **ago [3]** 66/16 114/21 allowing [2] 64/19 201/7 169/14 agree [19] 13/20 alluded [1] 205/23 17/24 22/21 26/8 30/3 almost [8] 7/17 7/20 43/16 47/13 49/4 8/13 33/2 48/16 100/20 101/25 104/1 133/23 169/17 178/14 106/19 107/7 112/13 alone [1] 45/19 116/9 188/20 196/8 along [2] 69/5 167/11 203/23 203/23 alongside [1] 93/13 agreed [13] 27/17 **Alpha [1]** 186/2 28/19 29/23 30/4 30/5 already [10] 29/19 32/4 35/10 72/6 86/12 69/12 125/2 131/24 86/24 88/2 102/2 145/8 159/10 165/14 111/11 181/4 201/17 201/23 agreeing [1] 47/9 also [66] 2/10 2/11 agreement [1] 3/18 13/10 19/1 21/4 111/24 26/3 28/14 40/23 ahead [5] 57/11 47/19 61/11 65/11 64/25 85/5 190/3 67/3 70/21 80/9 81/23 191/6 82/23 83/25 100/10 aid [1] 117/21 103/9 103/11 104/20 aided [2] 164/16 106/24 108/4 113/3 164/16 114/12 114/22 116/18 air [2] 21/24 45/2 116/23 117/10 127/1 airports [1] 143/8 128/1 128/7 128/19 akin [1] 205/17 129/12 131/8 136/20 alarming [3] 135/10 137/20 143/8 143/21 135/15 136/18 145/22 148/7 151/24 alert [2] 42/7 184/1 152/11 152/11 152/21 align [1] 156/14 160/4 163/22 169/5 alignment [1] 214/2 **Alison [1]** 176/3 187/11 187/15 192/11 Alison Strath [1] 176/3 196/13 203/4 203/9 alive [1] 183/25 210/7 210/25 211/24 **all [68]** 7/11 8/13 9/2 212/20 212/24 10/23 14/16 17/3 **alternative** [1] 151/3 19/13 21/9 24/19 although [25] 22/14 24/20 25/7 32/17 36/2 41/18 58/9 97/25 39/18 40/19 41/3 41/4 120/11 123/15 125/3

126/8 128/20 132/10 announcement [7] 135/25 137/24 142/10 11/15 12/8 26/16 154/5 155/11 157/18 172/9 172/20 174/6 176/19 180/8 181/10 183/19 194/23 altogether [1] 173/12 | 14/22 37/11 38/23 always [46] 5/19 39/9 another [19] 7/15 40/18 67/19 73/9 84/11 86/21 89/15 92/12 98/21 99/1 99/22 109/19 112/12 112/14 114/4 122/19 127/18 128/4 128/10 129/20 130/1 134/2 141/23 142/6 142/7 157/2 157/3 159/20 160/13 160/16 161/17 163/11 163/19 167/11 178/6 180/17 182/8 183/8 184/10 194/1 201/8 210/10 211/9 213/16 214/5 am [22] 1/2 1/10 5/7 16/1 22/1 30/10 45/1 46/3 47/18 47/22 62/18 62/20 71/16 71/19 79/12 82/19 98/20 98/24 121/24 202/6 214/13 214/17 amazing [1] 124/11 amber [2] 142/22 143/5 ambulance [1] 173/16 amenable [1] 34/21 amended [2] 107/15 156/18 amendment [1] 2/5 amendments [1] 25/21 amongst [8] 38/11 54/13 54/23 115/3 115/4 119/1 151/24 201/2 amount [6] 21/21 92/22 125/18 152/3 168/4 168/5 amounts [2] 52/17 52/19 analogous [1] 116/2 **analysis** [7] 26/18 109/7 145/25 172/4 175/11 190/24 200/24 anything [14] 31/6 170/21 172/11 175/14 **Andrew's [3]** 9/12 79/21 80/23 194/17 195/17 196/11 angry [1] 44/15 **Anne [1]** 69/24 **announce [3]** 11/3 26/23 47/17 announced [10] 10/25 17/1 50/3 65/16 101/2 101/6 102/10

102/19 146/2 205/25

27/14 50/5 50/6 145/8 app [1] 82/21 announcements [1] 11/8 announcing [3] 15/24 26/21 52/23 63/19 66/18 66/19 70/7 92/21 112/3 117/2 121/12 122/7 136/11 139/21 159/3 173/3 175/5 180/7 answer [16] 28/1 43/12 43/14 45/3 71/17 82/9 85/12 93/4 113/10 155/4 93/6 100/2 103/14 107/25 111/22 151/1 155/1 192/3 answered [1] 87/24 **answering [1]** 116/4 answers [2] 84/21 100/12 anti [1] 152/13 anti-social [1] 152/13 86/8 95/10 207/14 **anticipate** [1] 56/11 **antiviral** [1] 176/2 Anwar [2] 89/1 206/15 anxiety [1] 91/11 any [59] 1/15 14/4 17/21 29/21 31/4 31/16 35/13 43/1 46/2 49/24 50/11 53/14 70/5 71/6 73/14 74/3 84/14 90/7 93/4 97/21 107/1 107/2 110/22 113/24 114/7 115/5 116/22 119/7 120/1 120/23 122/5 123/6 123/17 124/11 126/19 18/7 23/15 46/6 127/5 127/12 127/21 128/13 129/1 132/15 133/13 135/4 138/18 144/12 147/3 149/17 152/15 157/2 160/10 160/15 169/22 180/18 approved [1] 104/24 183/13 185/13 196/10 Apps [1] 119/25 196/21 203/24 210/19 **April [10]** 20/21 21/5 **anybody [1]** 196/10 anyone [4] 69/14 75/13 129/3 169/1 31/20 47/13 59/9 59/18 64/5 88/17 94/9 April 4/2 [1] 20/21 116/1 141/5 146/3 150/8 188/6 193/13 **anyway [1]** 153/16 anywhere [1] 41/1 **Apologies [1]** 37/6 apologise [1] 114/21 **apology [2]** 115/2 208/2

apostrophe [3] 127/10 130/21 133/16 apparent [2] 118/7 139/20 appear [7] 21/2 32/10 48/14 53/14 89/1 89/15 206/14 appeared [1] 38/24 appears [4] 14/5 159/1 193/21 211/7 application [4] 5/4 89/13 89/14 149/5 applied [4] 93/1 111/10 111/15 155/16 apply [3] 44/12 applying [1] 88/9 **appointed [6]** 4/15 93/16 93/21 108/21 169/25 170/19 appointment [5] 168/18 168/21 169/18 170/24 179/8 appreciate [4] 68/21 approach [32] 24/20 39/9 41/2 42/10 42/13 42/14 42/16 47/3 48/15 49/6 49/11 49/15 104/4 107/10 139/2 149/22 152/18 158/21 159/1 159/6 159/8 159/9 159/16 159/21 160/1 160/21 161/1 161/1 161/4 199/6 199/12 202/23 approaches [1] 42/1 approaching [1] 109/1 **appropriate** [13] 13/1 106/12 108/7 119/8 120/24 121/3 121/11 151/23 158/24 192/25 approval [2] 47/14 101/22 113/5 118/17 168/22 168/25 169/2 170/11 207/11 209/11 **April 2020 [1]** 113/5 April 2022 [1] 170/11 are [144] 1/15 1/18 2/7 2/7 2/9 2/17 2/19 4/15 5/2 5/13 6/23 7/10 11/16 12/2 12/19 14/12 15/19 17/16 18/14 20/4 21/18 28/24 29/3 30/25 31/9 31/17 32/17 32/22

are... [116] 36/17 36/18 36/22 37/21 37/23 37/25 38/7 43/9 44/24 46/4 46/9 49/3 56/6 57/5 57/6 58/11 61/2 61/7 61/8 61/23 63/22 67/24 71/7 72/2 72/14 72/15 75/21 75/23 75/24 77/17 80/6 80/14 81/12 85/21 86/10 89/5 90/25 91/5 91/15 91/20 91/21 91/22 92/10 93/3 93/13 93/16 93/17 94/11 95/15 96/14 96/16 98/14 98/18 103/20 103/22 103/24 104/3 104/4 104/14 106/3 106/4 106/4 109/3 109/11 110/10 111/8 112/25 114/22 115/3 116/17 116/22 118/8 118/23 128/21 131/2 132/5 132/8 132/25 133/13 150/22 151/13 151/13 151/14 151/14 151/18 154/6 154/6 154/17 154/23 154/25 156/13 167/7 169/21 170/12 178/9 183/9 188/8 188/9 190/2 190/4 191/4 191/22 193/9 194/23 200/25 201/3 201/14 203/12 205/10 205/14 206/9 206/11 207/1 209/3 211/24 214/7 area [13] 52/23 109/5 111/25 112/10 116/4 132/19 139/21 140/13 140/19 144/9 151/18 169/19 209/17 areas [10] 28/5 111/10 111/16 112/1 121/22 135/24 136/6 146/10 173/4 179/11 aren't [5] 11/21 153/20 193/12 195/7 203/19 argue [1] 86/23 arguing [1] 176/7 argument [9] 35/16 44/6 44/7 45/18 56/1 87/1 90/13 92/7 92/8 arguments [6] 28/21 55/24 84/9 88/12 90/3 92/3 arise [1] 93/20 arisen [2] 109/4 175/11 arose [1] 187/6

around [77] 3/3 12/7 213/6 14/11 15/9 23/3 26/15 asking [23] 6/19 27/6 27/8 27/12 28/9 29/16 29/18 32/19 38/14 38/25 42/5 46/13 48/18 49/11 49/16 50/24 50/24 50/25 51/8 52/20 52/23 53/24 54/10 55/21 57/8 57/15 57/18 64/7 65/3 67/7 67/13 80/5 80/15 80/16 80/19 80/20 83/13 83/14 85/14 89/13 93/18 102/3 110/15 111/9 125/12 129/16 133/19 135/13 139/6 142/2 143/9 144/19 146/24 157/22 158/5 159/14 165/20 166/3 166/10 168/15 170/16 172/4 172/14 187/13 188/2 196/18 197/24 197/25 198/1 202/4 208/19 210/6 arrival [2] 171/9 171/13 arrive [3] 143/5 144/2 145/20 arrived [1] 178/18 arriving [1] 108/25 arrogance [1] 167/1 article [2] 51/17 63/10 articles [3] 84/4 84/14 208/22 articulated [4] 117/9 142/18 167/19 174/3 as [344] **As I said [1]** 112/12 ascertain [2] 126/5 128/17 ascertainable [1] 123/19 aside [1] 144/23 ask [32] 3/23 7/11 18/11 18/12 18/12 25/21 25/21 55/7 56/12 75/15 76/17 83/9 83/11 85/5 89/6 89/21 92/20 98/11 104/20 118/20 128/19 134/7 136/10 162/4 162/7 162/14 166/11 168/14 190/15 205/1 206/17 207/14 asked [23] 15/25 36/21 49/4 54/25 57/16 58/20 66/23 70/22 70/23 71/10 76/24 85/10 100/16 104/23 113/25 154/15 166/3 201/8 204/8

204/19 205/2 212/17

16/20 54/14 54/15 55/10 55/11 55/12 75/19 76/12 76/25 77/17 78/1 89/9 91/5 91/7 128/5 132/18 144/18 165/22 188/8 192/2 199/19 212/17 asks [1] 86/4 aspect [4] 10/1 15/2 38/16 113/9 aspects [4] 12/19 184/6 185/17 187/1 aspersions [1] 90/8 assertion [4] 62/7 164/14 176/7 176/8 assessment [7] 140/19 145/25 157/16 157/24 160/20 161/1 199/12 assessments [1] 157/19 assets [3] 147/7 148/2 161/16 assist [5] 5/4 33/2 173/14 179/22 181/11 assistance [1] 4/6 associated [4] 87/3 159/5 164/6 171/1 assume [4] 20/19 79/5 121/23 200/19 asymptomatic [12] 207/5 207/10 207/19 207/23 208/14 208/19 209/1 209/7 209/15 209/21 210/1 211/4 at [320] at 20 [1] 14/1 attempt [1] 197/16 attend [6] 8/1 16/9 76/4 162/11 175/3 180/25 attendance [4] 8/2 28/15 105/22 107/8 attended [11] 28/12 50/12 51/2 63/12 79/21 98/21 105/24 134/17 197/2 197/4 197/13 attendees [1] 12/12 attention [4] 154/11 177/2 183/4 190/18 attitude [1] 60/23 attribute [1] 205/5 atypical [1] 212/1 August [6] 3/3 3/11 49/23 50/15 69/21 212/6 August 2021 [4] 3/3 3/11 49/23 50/15 authorities [1] 112/15 authority [9] 101/9

102/15 102/18 103/11 104/21 105/4 105/8 112/2 112/14 automatically [1] 154/17 availability [2] 53/22 196/17 available [26] 4/6 45/13 45/21 53/18 59/12 59/21 62/5 84/18 88/18 94/11 99/17 99/23 106/12 107/22 123/9 123/17 125/25 133/8 139/14 151/9 157/13 169/1 180/17 180/19 181/7 184/11 avoid [2] 33/8 63/24 aware [25] 12/15 24/22 30/10 58/1 71/1 because [84] 1/14 71/5 71/7 73/22 81/25 82/19 82/25 93/25 98/18 123/25 176/14 178/9 179/8 179/13 179/15 179/17 196/13 207/1 207/18 209/7 211/17 awareness [3] 76/25 115/3 135/2 away [3] 52/10 85/7 177/2 awful [5] 37/21 38/1 43/14 45/18 46/8 В back [42] 3/2 10/20 13/9 13/20 19/15 24/12 25/6 25/21 31/23 36/25 47/8 50/20 68/22 71/25 72/1 75/17 76/23 84/6 85/3 86/5 90/3 90/9 91/23 92/2 94/2 124/7 124/8 124/13 132/21 153/22 154/2 180/5 180/21 181/5 182/4 182/15 190/15 195/19 201/6 213/15 213/23 214/4 background [3] 2/22 169/21 190/4 bad [4] 37/2 47/17 90/15 91/13

badly [1] 87/5

bag [1] 200/21

185/11 211/9

bank [1] 43/16

148/4

balance [9] 23/4

67/19 90/18 90/23 157/3 157/7 164/4 balancing [1] 211/7 ban [3] 147/3 147/11 based [9] 15/3 19/12

138/18 158/20 172/4 180/14 basic [1] 103/19 basis [9] 16/3 23/16 118/10 154/4 154/14 175/6 175/8 182/24 201/12 batch [2] 69/4 70/10 **BBC [3]** 51/17 60/20 80/6 be [450] be-all [1] 24/19 **became [16]** 30/18 39/10 65/22 66/8 66/9 96/20 97/12 125/25 139/20 176/17 194/10 208/11 211/1 211/3 211/5 212/4 9/9 12/14 12/20 15/15 16/6 18/17 24/4 25/22 34/12 39/1 39/18 44/16 45/13 45/19 46/17 49/13 52/4 54/6 54/16 60/9 60/19 61/1 67/4 67/14 71/19 72/3 73/25 77/12 79/20 80/21 85/7 85/12 90/20 94/3 101/14 101/17 102/9 103/4 103/12 104/3 106/1 111/5 115/12 117/23 123/7 123/15 123/17 124/5 124/14 127/15 128/24 130/10 130/19 130/20 132/18 135/15 136/9 136/10 137/10 140/18 141/24 142/3 142/8 143/1 150/20 152/17 152/25 154/4 155/2 163/7 174/5 177/21 183/19 186/5 186/16 186/19 199/7 199/15 205/11 209/13 210/12 211/3 213/7 become [8] 71/5 173/5 173/24 173/25 197/22 207/18 207/21 211/2 becomes [5] 12/13 42/12 42/20 60/19 90/2 **becoming [2]** 50/7 58/1 bed [1] 210/18 bedtime [1] 73/24 been [150] 12/21 12/21 12/24 13/3 13/16 14/7 14/9 14/11 14/14 15/1 15/3 15/13 16/5 16/22 17/6 18/3 18/6 19/11 19/11 19/12 25/14 27/16 (58) are... - been

24/9 101/9 133/3

В been... [128] 28/3 29/4 29/9 29/12 29/18 30/9 30/9 31/18 32/4 32/5 35/13 37/6 38/20 39/12 45/8 51/15 51/17 51/23 55/23 56/1 56/21 57/13 57/24 59/25 60/11 61/4 62/10 63/25 65/15 65/15 67/14 69/14 73/9 74/13 75/5 75/17 75/18 76/4 76/6 76/13 76/19 77/12 77/13 77/15 79/23 79/24 80/3 80/5 80/8 87/13 88/13 88/13 88/17 89/12 91/25 97/24 98/3 99/8 99/18 99/21 100/8 100/10 101/16 101/23 101/24 105/10 106/9 106/10 106/19 107/2 113/14 114/4 114/5 121/5 121/14 122/15 122/16 123/7 123/15 124/4 124/18 124/20 127/7 127/22 133/7 133/10 151/15 151/19 154/11 155/8 155/14 159/13 160/24 162/22 164/22 167/6 168/25 169/2 171/14 171/15 171/19 172/25 173/21 173/22 174/4 177/16 179/21 180/19 181/11 182/25 184/16 190/18 193/6 195/9 195/10 199/10 199/13 201/24 205/16 206/5 208/7 208/25 209/14 212/17 212/19 213/12 213/25 214/12 been a [1] 18/6 before [50] 1/12 2/22 3/24 7/13 11/7 11/14 14/8 14/21 14/23 17/20 19/18 22/15 26/1 31/25 47/9 53/21 66/23 78/22 79/7 79/15 83/11 86/4 92/20 99/17 99/19 100/2 100/3 102/19 112/17 121/13 124/1 125/13 140/5 145/6 145/6 146/2 155/7 160/18 164/2 166/13 168/19 179/8 181/23 182/5 183/1 186/2 189/14 191/1 199/19 207/20 began [1] 37/10 begin [5] 43/11 47/5 100/3 170/5 180/6

beginning [7] 41/18 67/11 119/21 142/14 157/1 182/21 208/3 begins [1] 15/9 behalf [6] 6/18 38/4 38/7 89/2 113/15 206/15 behaviour [1] 152/13 behavioural [1] 153/1 behaviours [3] 54/6 54/7 54/19 **behind [5]** 13/10 27/20 37/21 42/18 141/10 being [72] 6/16 6/17 7/5 8/18 8/22 12/9 13/7 14/17 14/20 15/16 16/15 19/2 22/19 24/22 25/12 30/2 32/19 35/17 36/12 36/18 41/20 47/2 54/25 55/4 62/5 62/6 63/21 66/24 67/17 69/1 69/20 72/8 bigger [2] 19/25 20/2 79/9 84/3 85/10 89/23 biggest [1] 204/24 101/14 104/12 104/14 bilateral [1] 40/23 111/6 120/1 120/9 127/13 135/12 137/22 Biosecurity [2] 145/4 138/13 138/14 141/17 145/8 149/23 150/25 158/19 159/21 165/8 167/17 171/7 178/25 181/1 183/3 186/10 191/7 191/9 192/9 192/23 192/24 196/14 196/17 201/3 206/25 208/15 211/18 212/8 belief [4] 2/8 2/18 151/20 194/12 believe [12] 2/25 14/10 20/17 81/25 83/12 99/9 99/20 164/8 178/21 192/8 201/16 213/24 bells [1] 181/22 benefit [2] 49/10 105/3 benefits [1] 156/10 benign [1] 185/1 bereaved [10] 89/2 89/5 100/8 100/10 114/23 206/16 208/1 212/6 212/22 213/4 best [13] 2/8 2/17 73/15 81/6 99/13 144/11 144/24 161/18 164/4 182/15 184/13 186/22 210/5 better [14] 6/19 23/23 37/23 38/13 84/3 92/15 104/7 114/16 115/1 189/13 203/4 208/7 208/8

208/23 between [60] 5/11 10/6 10/19 12/17 14/15 14/16 14/18 20/8 25/16 27/4 35/4 37/12 37/17 39/4 40/12 40/21 42/1 42/10 42/13 43/2 56/15 56/17 56/22 58/16 62/5 63/13 69/9 69/10 69/19 69/23 70/16 71/16 76/11 77/21 78/25 79/2 80/20 84/10 89/17 92/5 93/10 94/13 103/5 108/16 123/1 125/1 126/3 128/17 146/16 146/20 147/4 147/12 155/20 166/18 boundaries [1] 5/11 168/24 169/5 187/20 187/22 189/20 196/25 beyond [1] 49/25 big [4] 174/7 188/8 200/8 200/9 **bilaterally [1]** 181/8 178/10 bit [15] 19/8 20/1 34/9 44/19 58/23 87/6 34/11 34/15 92/2 93/9 99/6 108/25 breaking [2] 91/12 154/10 164/10 170/7 193/5 203/16 black [1] 151/14 blame [2] 205/4 205/5 **blank [2]** 124/9 162/10 block [1] 44/16 blunt [1] 33/8 **blurry [2]** 20/3 143/15 board [4] 6/21 8/20 19/3 185/12 board/thought [1] 6/21 boards [4] 61/7 173/8 181/15 184/21 bodies [3] 128/17 135/22 137/14 **body [7]** 25/12 25/13 98/17 107/5 107/6 134/17 168/2 bond [3] 133/3 133/10 133/18 **boost [1]** 54/16 boosted [1] 181/22 booster [4] 181/20 181/23 198/18 203/6 **boosting** [1] 36/3 border [14] 10/1 140/21 142/8 146/16

146/22 146/24 147/4 147/7 147/24 148/2 148/10 borders [4] 142/8 142/11 142/15 143/14 budget [2] 104/22 Boris [4] 8/6 37/10 39/5 39/10 **Boris Johnson [4]** 8/6 37/10 39/5 39/10 **both [16]** 1/18 18/19 20/6 39/2 80/11 93/14 burden [1] 91/20 98/5 98/8 116/14 117/3 118/18 136/19 143/7 195/6 195/11 198/20 **bottom [1]** 153/14 bounced [1] 48/19 **boundary [1]** 60/7 bracket [1] 185/18 breach [1] 65/5 breached [1] 74/6 breaches [1] 149/2 breaching [2] 59/10 60/1 break [11] 3/2 39/8 49/21 61/17 62/19 66/23 153/15 153/16 153/25 155/7 188/10 breaker [3] 32/18 150/24 breath [1] 31/16 **Brexit [1]** 51/13 brief [1] 205/21 briefed [1] 39/20 **briefing [15]** 11/5 14/4 53/11 53/23 76/16 79/23 133/23 134/4 164/16 181/25 182/12 184/10 184/11 184/12 184/13 **briefings** [5] 7/17 53/8 80/6 103/10 161/12 bring [8] 21/12 24/7 53/1 78/10 92/15 156/3 181/4 195/15 broad [4] 54/9 149/6 171/2 171/18 broadcasters [1] 37/4 broader [6] 7/2 27/12 27/17 40/15 73/15 90/25 **broadly [14]** 5/19 50/9 111/19 150/4 155/12 170/16 171/24 172/6 172/15 172/16 172/19 172/19 173/1 199/2 broken [3] 39/6 39/7

146/16 146/20 146/21 133/10 brought [7] 89/7 107/14 108/5 154/11 155/14 202/24 206/19 **bubbling [1]** 44/18 201/23 **build [5]** 6/1 34/20 54/13 54/22 94/4 **building [1]** 91/4 built [1] 210/22 business [15] 39/9 76/1 76/2 78/6 82/13 82/14 82/18 82/24 115/6 117/1 117/24 125/10 126/14 201/18 201/20 businesses [2] 34/14 202/12 busy [1] 148/11 but [281] C-19 [11] 177/6 178/4 178/6 179/24 180/5 180/17 180/22 181/2 181/4 181/8 181/10 cab [3] 57/1 57/12 57/20 cabinet [165] 8/3 9/6 12/22 13/17 15/14 16/17 18/24 20/12 21/9 21/25 22/3 24/24 25/1 25/4 25/11 25/17 25/20 25/20 25/22 25/25 26/1 26/2 26/3 26/4 26/6 26/8 26/18 26/21 26/22 26/25 27/2 28/10 28/12 28/13 28/17 28/23 28/25 29/1 29/2 29/6 29/22 30/2 32/3 47/13 47/16 52/21 56/20 57/23 58/13 58/19 86/6 86/23 88/1 88/2 96/18 96/25 97/3 97/17 97/18 97/23 98/3 98/25 99/12 100/1 100/20 101/1 101/4 101/10 101/22

101/24 102/2 102/8

102/25 103/1 103/3

103/6 103/20 104/1

104/3 104/11 104/14

104/20 104/23 104/24

105/5 105/16 105/17

105/20 105/25 106/3

107/8 107/10 107/21

108/21 110/16 110/20

110/25 111/6 111/12

106/4 106/25 107/4

108/1 108/3 108/4

102/19 102/20 102/24

C cabinet... [57] 111/13 111/24 112/12 112/19 115/4 115/24 122/6 127/22 130/3 130/7 134/8 134/9 135/9 136/16 137/10 137/11 137/12 138/4 138/9 138/15 138/21 146/11 151/6 154/13 154/14 154/17 159/4 162/3 162/24 163/5 163/10 165/14 168/16 172/17 175/4 177/15 179/16 180/25 183/7 183/11 185/19 186/7 193/25 194/2 194/6 194/8 198/19 198/20 201/8 201/9 202/5 202/16 206/22 207/12 207/15 207/17 212/4 Cabinet secretaries **[10]** 28/13 96/18 105/20 110/25 115/4 115/24 122/6 130/3 137/11 177/15 Cabinet Secretary **[39]** 9/6 52/21 56/20 57/23 58/13 58/19 96/25 97/3 97/17 97/18 97/23 98/3 102/8 105/25 108/1 108/21 111/6 112/19 134/8 134/9 137/12 146/11 162/3 162/24 163/5 163/10 165/14 168/16 172/17 179/16 183/7 183/11 185/19 186/7 193/25 194/6 201/8 206/22 212/4 Cabinet secretary's **[1]** 159/4 Cabinet's [1] 105/8 cafés [1] 169/4 Cairney [2] 4/13 103/19 calculate [1] 24/13 calculated [1] 24/15 calculation [1] 156/11 Calderwood [7] 56/18 59/6 59/15 60/8 61/12 64/8 80/23 Calderwood's [3] 59/17 61/20 67/9 call [18] 1/4 35/6 35/25 39/19 47/11 49/4 50/12 91/20 131/5 141/17 141/18 158/22 160/8 180/5 191/12 199/24 200/21 200/22

called [6] 26/21

98/17 134/17 173/13 178/15 179/9 calling [2] 33/21 107/21 calls [10] 8/5 39/20 39/21 39/22 40/25 90/10 90/15 131/10 141/4 141/16 came [22] 8/21 27/4 27/8 39/11 39/23 49/21 71/7 72/12 77/24 135/25 136/5 138/11 143/17 149/19 156/19 174/2 177/20 178/5 178/18 182/3 182/8 197/8 **campaign [2]** 50/5 52/11 campaigns [1] 164/17 can [128] 1/13 1/13 1/16 2/5 2/14 4/9 6/1 6/12 7/4 7/21 9/16 10/18 10/23 14/17 15/5 16/9 17/16 19/8 19/22 19/25 20/6 20/15 21/14 21/22 22/8 24/21 28/16 28/18 28/18 31/1 31/24 32/1 32/9 32/13 32/25 33/4 34/9 35/6 36/25 43/9 43/17 43/23 47/1 48/22 48/24 49/17 52/16 55/4 55/20 56/2 56/16 57/2 57/4 57/11 57/14 57/15 58/21 58/22 59/1 59/2 59/14 60/4 60/5 60/7 61/11 63/2 64/23 65/2 65/18 66/16 67/5 67/25 71/17 72/1 75/20 75/21 76/3 76/16 76/17 77/5 79/12 82/9 83/3 86/4 89/8 89/21 90/24 91/4 91/14 91/18 95/11 95/24 96/1 100/3 103/2 104/6 104/8 107/13 128/16 129/23 132/5 132/6 133/6 135/13 138/5 141/2 149/11 153/21 154/4 163/4 167/3 177/11 182/15 190/11 191/20 200/8 200/8 202/25 204/4 204/11 207/22 207/25 208/2 208/11 209/3 209/23 210/5 213/8 can't [29] 29/21 33/21 36/19 36/23 43/5 44/15 48/21 58/3 61/22 61/25 62/2 62/4 62/8 63/20 65/18 67/3

71/14 73/25 74/10 81/7 81/8 81/9 81/16 86/16 140/25 163/22 188/6 203/24 212/20 cancel [2] 184/25 190/14 cancelled [1] 184/20 cancelling [3] 188/24 190/19 193/1 candid [2] 55/17 68/7 cannot [5] 90/16 90/17 117/11 133/14 166/2 capacity [6] 15/25 138/5 139/10 173/21 196/15 210/18 capitalise [1] 88/2 capture [1] 156/8 care [43] 64/9 71/19 97/8 97/19 98/1 98/8 108/22 111/7 146/12 162/4 162/25 163/5 165/15 168/17 173/12 181/16 183/8 183/12 185/13 185/20 186/7 186/20 194/1 206/25 206/25 207/1 207/10 207/11 207/13 207/21 208/16 209/1 209/9 209/20 210/4 210/8 210/9 210/11 210/12 210/12 211/11 211/18 54/16 55/25 56/1 212/5 care home [3] 210/4 210/11 210/12 care homes [10] 206/25 206/25 207/10 164/18 193/11 207/11 207/13 208/16 certainly [30] 6/8 209/1 209/9 210/12 211/11 career [1] 27/22 career's [1] 28/3 careful [1] 116/16 carries [1] 29/25 carry [2] 33/4 128/16 cascaded [3] 99/11 100/1 101/1 case [42] 24/3 29/2 58/1 60/9 71/17 76/19 78/18 90/19 96/1 101/20 103/21 106/9 118/11 128/2 130/6 130/20 132/18 135/5 136/8 136/17 141/18 169/11 170/8 171/7 171/14 173/25 176/23 117/14 179/20 183/2 184/21 188/2 189/17 189/21 191/12 193/22 194/11 195/3 196/20 205/19 cases [38] 56/1 56/3 56/5 57/5 58/2 58/10 58/17 60/12 60/25

61/1 61/4 61/5 62/14 68/1 105/9 105/11 109/5 109/8 120/6 164/6 164/15 169/19 170/16 170/25 171/4 171/11 171/24 173/12 188/2 189/5 189/12 190/4 195/13 197/5 197/8 197/12 202/21 204/13 cast [5] 90/7 105/20 110/7 110/7 110/10 casual [1] 165/4 categoric [1] 73/25 categories [1] 117/3 **Catherine [2]** 56/18 59/6 caught [2] 155/22 166/20 cause [2] 88/3 109/7 caused [6] 56/8 182/24 184/23 197/24 198/2 208/4 causing [2] 201/4 205/13 caution [1] 23/4 cautioned [1] 24/18 cells [2] 138/8 138/8 central [1] 195/19 **Centre [1]** 145/4 72/12 89/19 90/11 90/12 92/22 93/14 102/5 105/16 132/8 132/15 133/21 149/5 8/11 8/12 22/22 26/8 41/9 61/18 65/17 66/8 checkpoints [1] 67/10 72/16 74/17 76/24 128/4 129/12 151/7 151/8 151/20 159/4 186/19 204/25 209/10 209/15 210/23 211/16 212/19 214/12 cetera [5] 77/18 130/17 164/17 199/17 199/17 **chain [1]** 56/17 106/21 111/23 112/20 **CHAIR [4]** 86/3 92/19 215/7 215/11 **challenge** [4] 62/7 62/13 62/15 107/13 challenging [1] **Chamber [1]** 114/20 **chance [3]** 26/19 153/5 163/1 **chances [1]** 61/23 change [25] 12/14 13/15 13/23 14/25 15/18 16/8 19/12

21/21 25/2 34/22 45/9 45/11 50/6 52/9 77/8 77/25 97/21 97/25 103/5 105/23 115/25 156/14 156/16 207/8 212/12 changed [9] 11/5 11/10 17/3 105/10 125/7 155/24 156/1 157/8 207/6 changer [4] 182/6 182/14 183/3 199/8 changes [3] 24/11 25/21 41/25 **changing [4]** 15/10 15/12 99/16 211/13 **channels [4]** 119/8 120/25 121/3 121/11 chaos [1] 38/24 chaotic [1] 49/5 characterisation [2] 107/7 133/11 characterised [3] 44/23 101/14 170/15 characteristic [1] 173/3 characteristics [3] 177/9 177/24 199/16 charge [1] 193/24 **chasing [1]** 66/13 certain [19] 9/21 10/4 check [12] 1/8 11/22 16/13 16/13 27/13 27/15 72/1 163/6 163/6 163/7 163/15 163/17 checked [2] 124/3 166/6 checking [2] 53/22 76/12 147/25 chief [26] 3/6 4/20 131/15 144/14 147/10 6/7 9/10 10/16 29/13 49/20 50/7 50/7 50/19 72/23 73/18 82/3 82/16 138/25 139/3 147/20 158/18 160/12 160/13 167/2 167/17 176/3 181/14 181/14 182/12 child [2] 50/25 156/5 **children [1]** 156/23 Children's [1] 157/10 **choices [1]** 186/6 **choosing [1]** 53/21 chose [5] 3/18 148/17 149/8 149/9 149/23 **Christmas** [8] 47/4 47/20 48/19 48/20 49/2 49/12 49/16 174/15 **chronic [2]** 184/7 185/6

C 68/18 90/14 26/1 26/18 31/23 12/25 **condition [1]** 63/20 close [9] 6/1 6/6 41/15 46/7 53/17 54/3 community [2] conditions [1] 63/6 chronology [1] 107/20 110/16 111/15 57/22 111/1 111/2 169/10 188/10 condolences [1] 166/11 112/4 153/16 192/3 111/23 134/13 141/15 comorbidities [1] 100/9 churches [1] 11/21 204/11 143/6 184/11 187/11 211/21 conducive [1] 191/22 circuit [3] 32/18 closely [1] 156/14 198/2 213/15 213/23 company [3] 61/24 conduct [4] 4/1 82/13 34/11 34/15 comes [7] 15/15 closest [1] 6/9 89/2 206/15 82/18 126/2 circuit-breaker [3] 108/20 138/12 162/18 comparatively [1] **closures [1]** 186/16 conducted [2] 32/18 34/11 34/15 clown [2] 38/10 165/7 165/24 199/24 171/5 126/14 129/1 circumstance [1] 42/25 coming [9] 7/17 **compared** [3] 171/6 conducting [1] 150/19 **cluster [1]** 176/21 42/19 77/2 77/4 85/16 171/12 185/22 130/11 circumstances [9] 145/3 145/5 174/16 **CMO [13]** 59/15 comparison [2] conference [11] 10/20 48/8 56/4 66/11 76/17 135/6 163/16 200/7 126/3 128/17 56/13 56/22 57/18 101/21 136/21 138/1 175/3 177/14 180/23 command [27] 25/15 compensate [1] 57/20 58/4 59/10 164/19 195/21 180/23 180/24 180/25 32/10 32/11 44/21 202/12 60/25 61/10 61/22 cited [2] 51/19 59/22 198/20 212/14 213/22 98/18 99/11 102/21 62/24 67/7 compensation [2] citizen [5] 106/14 103/4 103/8 105/3 **CMOs [2]** 213/10 190/21 201/22 confess [2] 61/19 106/17 106/23 133/9 213/20 105/19 105/21 105/22 competing [2] 7/16 122/17 154/24 **co [7]** 40/16 41/4 105/24 106/6 106/8 confidantes [1] 6/10 7/16 city [1] 188/13 106/15 106/21 107/21 complaining [1] 46/20 53/19 75/24 confidence [5] 52/7 city-wide [1] 188/13 108/4 108/7 110/11 55/10 91/5 151/10 134/14 140/21 163/14 civil [14] 4/8 4/10 completely [3] 39/6 co-operation [2] 110/12 111/1 111/1 194/25 11/1 11/11 83/6 89/25 confident [1] 192/24 40/16 140/21 112/6 194/9 185/2 204/3 93/3 93/5 93/13 93/14 co-ordinated [1] commas [1] 159/1 complex [8] 132/2 confidential [1] 56/7 93/17 93/18 116/5 132/5 132/7 142/17 46/20 comment [3] 13/22 confidentiality [10] 142/5 27/3 94/13 142/17 161/21 163/23 55/22 59/11 59/23 co-ordinating [1] **claim [1]** 73/23 164/13 60/2 60/17 62/12 65/5 75/24 comments [2] clarification [2] co-ordination [2] 162/21 201/6 compliance [13] 9/22 67/2 68/18 68/20 132/17 165/23 53/19 134/14 54/17 133/20 149/15 confined [1] 138/1 Commission [1] clarify [3] 97/15 confirm [6] 2/5 2/14 149/16 153/2 153/5 **COBR [3]** 8/5 32/3 157/11 154/16 162/25 158/25 161/25 194/15 17/24 66/17 95/24 40/1 Commissioner [1] classic [1] 110/9 code [7] 4/1 4/6 93/1 157/10 194/17 195/6 205/20 96/1 clear [37] 5/11 31/4 93/12 93/13 93/15 commitment [1] complimentary [1] confirmation [1] 35/22 41/2 42/4 42/9 93/18 113/16 39/2 13/19 42/12 42/21 47/13 cognisant [1] 93/22 commitments [1] comply [8] 54/25 confirmed [2] 103/19 54/12 54/22 55/5 64/1 93/18 161/23 165/20 212/10 **coherent [1]** 15/4 50/22 66/3 67/18 71/21 72/5 cohesion [3] 35/3 **committed** [3] 113/1 165/23 165/24 166/3 confirms [1] 25/3 77/18 77/20 84/11 151/16 151/20 195/11 54/13 54/23 conflict [5] 93/10 84/15 84/16 85/9 complying [2] 163/20 93/12 93/19 94/5 94/6 cohesive [2] 49/11 common [1] 9/4 105/1 115/15 116/20 49/14 **commonly** [1] 1/8 195/8 conflicting [2] 7/21 126/22 128/5 136/23 coincide [2] 50/6 comms [4] 37/21 compromised [1] 8/22 148/1 161/22 161/24 50/10 37/25 57/14 60/4 212/1 confronted [1] 92/2 165/22 207/21 208/11 coincides [1] 50/9 communicate [1] concentrating [1] connect [1] 57/6 209/13 209/14 collaborate [2] 146/9 81/24 31/10 **connected [4]** 60/25 clearer [2] 211/3 concern [12] 30/17 65/9 65/20 110/22 146/12 communicated [4] 211/5 75/14 119/11 123/2 60/8 60/13 109/7 connection [6] 110/1 collaboration [2] clearly [12] 34/18 198/19 150/7 159/14 164/25 118/24 122/12 173/22 144/14 144/16 39/2 45/1 56/2 63/21 collaboratively [1] communicating [1] 167/15 168/3 168/7 176/21 205/24 80/22 115/19 135/10 144/24 131/13 169/17 194/25 conscious [4] 57/5 135/15 135/25 161/5 61/16 93/17 150/11 collapse [2] 204/3 communication [17] concerned [12] 164/7 204/14 5/5 6/17 40/16 67/17 82/21 82/22 113/10 consensus [1] clinical [28] 18/12 colleague [3] 167/7 73/11 76/8 76/11 79/6 118/6 136/17 142/12 141/15 49/9 67/22 84/11 79/14 89/10 92/5 183/17 186/14 190/2 167/8 168/11 consent [1] 160/15 85/17 85/22 108/18 115/5 118/9 119/4 190/7 191/7 210/16 colleagues [2] consequences [5] 132/19 139/6 163/16 107/20 141/9 122/5 161/13 212/21 concerns [4] 36/9 7/9 24/1 184/17 165/1 174/20 175/1 **collective [3]** 194/10 communications [221] 70/1 70/3 109/5 184/18 204/2 175/4 175/5 175/16 202/15 210/2 2/13 9/23 22/1 22/4 conclude [1] 67/11 consider [13] 14/1 176/25 181/13 182/13 25/15 26/14 38/15 **conclusion [8]** 28/23 22/12 23/17 23/19 collectively [2] 58/6 192/11 206/23 213/2 28/25 29/7 78/22 86/8 53/25 65/21 76/17 38/17 39/3 53/2 53/4 139/19 213/11 213/14 213/14 colours [1] 163/9 53/20 54/10 55/6 86/11 86/24 199/11 156/12 157/6 202/10 213/16 213/23 214/5 **combined** [1] 172/12 68/25 70/2 77/21 202/11 210/15 210/20 conclusions [1] clinician [1] 59/22 considerable [4] come [28] 4/9 7/10 84/17 85/15 115/20 28/17 clinicians [7] 6/19 10/15 10/20 13/9 53/1 89/12 170/15 119/9 122/13 **concrete [2]** 68/7 9/20 25/5 25/25 67/10 13/20 14/12 20/1 25/6 communities [1] 139/4 202/20

C 195/12 200/8 4/12 4/19 5/7 5/10 88/12 89/12 89/23 157/8 161/11 163/24 continued [1] 170/1 5/15 5/16 5/19 5/25 93/22 95/18 97/15 165/23 167/24 168/1 consideration [15] **continues** [2] 136/3 6/3 8/6 8/7 8/10 13/12 99/5 99/8 99/18 99/20 170/18 170/20 174/4 28/19 30/5 57/14 188/20 16/2 17/7 17/11 32/20 102/11 103/5 105/14 174/8 174/13 176/10 86/12 87/8 87/11 88/4 continuous [1] 32/21 35/1 46/14 50/1 105/19 106/24 108/9 177/10 177/25 178/8 150/5 151/2 152/15 108/15 111/1 114/15 114/13 50/2 53/9 55/2 58/18 178/11 180/1 180/16 155/19 156/7 156/21 contract [1] 57/13 59/18 59/20 69/7 69/8 118/20 122/9 125/6 182/4 182/18 183/15 157/14 158/5 69/11 74/20 96/3 96/4 126/12 128/19 131/12 186/1 186/4 186/21 **contradict** [1] 67/16 considerations [3] **contribute** [1] 141/7 96/15 96/18 96/19 134/24 136/24 138/7 192/12 194/14 195/5 7/16 180/12 192/19 96/22 96/23 97/1 97/2 139/18 140/21 142/23 196/13 196/23 201/16 contribution [1] considered [3] 10/8 141/17 97/5 97/10 97/11 143/9 143/17 143/18 202/17 205/22 211/5 156/24 178/20 97/14 97/19 97/20 143/20 144/2 144/24 212/7 212/22 212/25 contributions [3] considering [3] 145/20 146/12 146/13 court [1] 135/24 41/11 84/15 186/10 98/7 98/9 98/23 98/24 17/19 23/1 202/16 99/4 101/12 101/19 146/18 154/9 158/10 cover [6] 53/19 60/18 **control** [1] 204/16 **considers** [1] 202/5 66/19 79/1 160/2 controlled [2] 142/14 106/5 106/7 108/12 160/3 161/20 161/22 **consistent** [2] 23/7 143/14 108/13 108/18 108/19 161/24 162/1 164/4 160/2 144/11 108/23 109/13 110/18 164/8 164/9 164/12 controls [1] 10/1 coverage [3] 31/8 Constable [7] 139/1 **convene [1]** 105/17 113/1 113/6 113/7 166/14 170/5 175/18 31/12 160/6 139/3 147/21 158/18 **Convention [1]** 156/5 113/12 113/13 113/18 175/18 178/6 178/11 covered [4] 51/13 160/12 160/13 167/17 113/19 114/17 114/18 184/3 184/14 186/23 97/22 155/17 170/9 conversation [13] constant [2] 40/16 12/4 62/10 71/16 75/9 118/14 121/9 121/21 187/17 190/2 190/8 Covid [64] 30/25 31/5 214/11 75/11 78/3 84/13 124/2 125/5 125/7 197/16 197/19 197/25 32/2 39/15 44/6 44/8 constantly [1] 183/15 107/9 132/18 154/11 125/22 128/18 133/4 198/5 199/18 200/4 49/2 52/15 52/18 constitution [4] 160/11 167/6 212/7 134/16 134/20 134/23 203/16 204/20 208/17 53/11 56/9 56/23 58/2 29/12 51/3 51/13 conversations [10] 136/13 142/15 142/23 208/23 209/16 58/8 58/17 60/9 61/4 52/22 10/6 43/6 80/12 84/24 144/8 147/14 147/22 couldn't [9] 34/19 63/11 64/11 64/15 constitutional [8] 148/6 148/19 148/20 73/21 111/17 125/4 66/4 67/5 68/1 71/22 129/2 136/5 137/3 30/17 31/14 46/11 137/13 162/7 183/25 148/24 149/7 151/23 75/9 75/10 78/19 141/8 172/18 208/10 84/9 87/17 103/16 conveyed [2] 132/8 155/5 156/12 157/16 209/5 213/21 87/15 89/2 89/5 89/17 103/22 103/25 157/18 157/25 158/1 Council [1] 178/10 100/8 100/10 114/2 132/11 constitutionally [2] **conviction [1]** 149/3 158/8 158/9 161/6 **counsel [8]** 1/7 95/9 114/23 119/21 120/13 141/11 143/13 convinced [1] 92/13 161/7 161/23 161/25 109/11 111/8 165/11 125/21 135/3 136/24 consul [2] 64/3 65/12 164/24 166/23 173/10 175/12 215/5 215/15 169/10 176/12 177/4 **COP26 [3]** 49/25 contact [5] 57/9 64/2 50/16 187/11 179/12 179/19 182/16 176/8 185/24 186/17 count [1] 149/2 67/9 67/14 147/16 copied [2] 56/19 187/10 187/15 187/16 counterparts [2] 182/18 183/19 184/16 **contacting** [2] 16/11 189/25 199/3 199/4 141/2 141/10 184/23 186/4 196/24 129/17 65/11 **copies [2]** 70/9 70/13 197/1 198/10 206/15 205/5 206/2 countries [5] 142/21 **contained [3]** 61/25 **copying [1]** 131/16 corrected [1] 155/24 142/25 143/10 143/18 206/18 207/19 208/1 67/12 72/15 core [7] 9/11 9/14 correction [1] 1/22 145/11 211/13 211/18 212/6 containment [2] 57/9 83/13 213/1 213/12 212/8 212/22 213/4 **correctly [4]** 77/10 **country [5]** 37/18 178/3 213/25 214/3 153/8 167/16 171/4 143/3 143/4 145/18 Covid-19 [19] 56/23 contemplation [1] core participants [1] correlates [1] 78/17 160/3 58/17 63/11 64/11 18/1 83/13 **couple [6]** 17/1 58/2 64/15 66/4 119/21 corresponded [1] contemporaneous 102/10 114/20 117/8 120/13 125/21 135/3 coronavirus [5] 128/22 **[1]** 29/10 28/22 86/14 86/25 162/20 169/10 179/12 182/16 correspondence [2] contend [2] 92/8 course [92] 9/3 9/4 182/18 184/16 196/24 87/6 156/17 152/7 203/15 186/5 corporate [41] 74/20 31/20 96/24 98/13 198/10 207/19 212/8 correspondent [1] content [1] 81/19 100/7 100/13 100/14 75/1 77/11 115/7 128/21 Covid-related [1] contents [5] 2/7 2/17 corridors [1] 142/20 115/8 115/10 115/12 102/10 102/24 103/5 30/25 95/24 96/10 129/14 116/5 116/23 117/19 104/16 104/17 104/22 create [9] 25/4 34/1 cost [1] 190/18 contest [1] 36/23 121/6 121/14 121/18 costs [2] 190/23 105/19 105/22 106/12 35/7 43/1 67/12 85/14 context [27] 7/14 85/19 138/5 139/11 122/8 122/23 123/3 200/24 106/24 107/1 107/25 10/24 19/6 32/17 34/9 125/11 126/4 126/7 110/5 114/12 114/19 cough [1] 212/9 **creating [1]** 43/15 35/5 37/9 47/2 69/3 126/11 126/15 126/25 115/15 117/7 117/8 coughing [1] 214/11 credit [1] 37/22 72/7 72/17 73/8 74/23 127/2 127/14 127/17 could [107] 1/8 10/8 117/22 118/12 119/3 criminal [2] 135/17 77/6 77/10 77/12 127/18 128/3 128/9 13/9 17/24 20/9 20/13 120/15 122/2 122/9 149/3 77/16 77/22 109/3 128/11 129/17 129/22 23/22 24/13 24/18 123/10 124/9 125/17 crisis [3] 28/22 86/25 109/9 111/5 111/13 130/9 130/13 130/15 28/10 31/18 33/13 126/10 126/17 126/20 179/2 159/10 163/3 168/19 132/13 132/22 132/24 34/10 35/11 43/15 127/14 127/15 127/23 Croatia [1] 197/10 199/22 201/14 129/15 129/20 129/25 cross [4] 126/12 133/8 133/9 134/2 43/22 45/7 52/6 55/16 contingent [1] 31/5 206/1 56/8 57/7 58/22 61/13 135/20 139/13 139/14 140/21 146/24 147/4 continue [9] 80/12 correct [131] 2/25 62/13 62/15 66/18 141/8 143/10 144/22 cross-border [3] 80/12 100/6 154/3 140/21 146/24 147/4 66/24 68/16 68/21 147/6 147/22 153/21 3/4 3/5 3/8 3/9 3/14 158/7 168/5 189/22 3/15 3/19 4/2 4/11 74/25 78/5 78/21 155/3 155/24 156/13 cross-reference [1]

С	days [12] 19/18	107/2 107/5 107/6	125/11 126/9 126/16	demands [2] 94/19
cross-reference [1]	47/17 53/17 65/10	107/16 108/6 108/8	126/19 126/20 126/23	95/10
126/12	66/16 68/2 79/22	109/12 110/8 110/22	126/24 127/1 127/24	demonstrate [2] 57/8
crossed [2] 193/18	139/13 177/7 188/1	110/24 111/3 111/18	128/10 129/15 129/19	
193/20	188/3 210/15	111/21 112/5 112/5	129/25 130/8 130/9	demonstrated [1]
crowded [1] 139/9	days' [1] 102/10	112/7 112/9 112/17	132/14 133/12 133/21	211/18
crowds [1] 188/24	deadline [1] 125/13	112/18 115/5 116/20	134/1 138/9 138/18	demonstrates [2]
Cummings [3] 92/24	deal [10] 90/24 137/8	116/25 117/2 120/1	141/24 142/1 142/24	192/5 196/23
93/3 94/13	137/17 140/12 170/21	120/6 121/5 121/7	143/9 145/12 146/22	deny [2] 44/15
curious [1] 141/16	172/6 197/22 201/1	122/4 122/9 125/20	146/24 153/2 157/20	163/22
current [3] 96/14	201/4 204/2	126/10 126/17 127/4	180/13 185/14 186/19	
124/13 208/24	dealing [6] 100/17 103/7 118/23 159/11	127/5 127/12 127/13 128/1 130/23 131/1	192/9 198/21 204/25 207/17 213/3	175/21 176/5 depended [1] 106/1
currently [1] 20/21	186/8 201/11	131/3 131/13 131/17	deconditioning [1]	dependent [2] 135/5
cusp [2] 112/16	dealt [1] 186/23	132/22 132/23 133/14		176/4
112/16	death [4] 63/11 64/7	138/9 138/15 139/2	deemed [1] 172/10	depending [3]
cut [2] 150/23 151/13	65/16 66/16	142/10 142/19 142/23		105/23 107/16 175/19
cyber [1] 119/23	deaths [7] 172/13	143/3 143/19 143/20	deep [8] 109/16	depends [1] 199/14
cybersecurity [1]	172/15 172/24 178/14	143/23 145/8 145/10	179/9 179/10 179/11	deploy [1] 149/24
122/25	185/21 186/4 203/24	145/19 145/22 146/1	179/25 180/6 181/3	deployed [2] 147/7
Czech [1] 197/11	debate [2] 39/13	147/2 147/6 147/20	181/5	161/17
Czech Republic [1]	104/6	152/11 157/2 157/15	deep dive [4] 109/16	deployment [1]
	debating [1] 190/5	160/22 173/11 174/24	179/9 179/10 179/11	148/10
D	December [3] 147/10		deep dives [2] 180/6	deputy [5] 9/7 27/1
daily [5] 53/8 103/10	176/21 199/20	192/6 192/10 192/13	181/3	40/24 41/12 102/7
118/10 133/23 134/4	December 2020 [1]	192/14 192/24 194/10		derive [1] 114/13
damaging [1] 136/24	147/10	197/17 199/14 202/16	1	describe [4] 25/11
danger [1] 189/2	decide [7] 10/10	210/3 213/15 213/17	default [7] 48/3 48/6	40/1 140/23 202/19
dangerous [1]	53/13 53/16 111/15	214/6	152/19 152/24 153/11	1
194/15	117/18 138/21 138/22	decision-makers [3]	156/25 175/13	61/1 165/5 171/10
data [8] 9/22 196/4	decided [6] 145/16 148/23 152/18 157/7	5/12 25/17 174/24	defend [1] 91/18	173/17 184/22 186/9 199/8 200/2
196/7 196/23 197/24	209/8 209/25	decision-making [28] 5/3 8/1 17/14 18/22	deferring [1] 19/15	describes [1] 4/4
198/1 198/7 198/24	deciding [1] 78/22	27/8 29/21 29/22	definitely [1] 45/1	description [2]
date [16] 1/25 15/17	decision [182] 5/2	72/19 72/20 73/2	definition [1] 186/18	169/20 169/24
18/1 39/5 49/25 50/9	5/3 5/12 7/14 7/22 8/1	74/23 80/16 80/20	definitive [1] 7/6	deserve [1] 104/7
51/18 79/21 88/12	10/13 12/13 12/16	98/12 98/17 99/8	degree [2] 39/7	designed [1] 87/18
95/25 96/11 112/20 140/5 147/14 208/10	12/20 12/20 12/21	99/13 101/10 104/2	168/18	desk [2] 53/20
209/14	12/21 13/2 13/3 13/5	104/21 104/23 107/6	delay [1] 178/3	108/25
dated [8] 1/18 2/11	13/15 13/15 13/17	121/5 125/20 127/4	delayed [1] 15/25	destroyed [1] 206/5
69/10 69/20 95/19	13/21 14/7 14/10	142/19 145/22 197/17	delegate [7] 26/9	detail [11] 16/18
96/2 120/8 135/7	14/11 14/20 14/25	decisions [106] 5/6	59/11 61/20 62/5	27/11 92/13 99/7
dates [1] 14/18	15/3 15/8 15/13 15/20	5/8 8/18 18/7 19/4	102/6 104/23 112/5	102/1 108/25 110/23
davie [1] 38/7	16/4 16/8 16/14 16/15		delegated [21] 4/20	111/12 136/23 147/15
Dawson [4] 95/5	16/16 16/17 16/24	25/14 25/18 25/22	26/6 26/11 26/13 27/1	
100/16 154/3 163/22	17/12 17/14 17/25	26/10 26/13 38/25	27/5 27/11 27/15	detailed [1] 68/3
day [47] 4/19 4/19	18/22 19/6 19/11	46/18 46/20 48/7	51/12 100/19 101/9	details [3] 63/14 82/1
11/6 11/9 12/8 12/9	19/12 24/8 24/24	48/10 48/12 72/8	102/15 102/18 103/11	
12/14 14/8 16/25	25/12 25/13 25/17 26/6 26/9 26/15 26/16	72/12 72/15 80/21 87/19 89/19 99/17	104/18 104/21 105/4 105/8 110/24 111/12	deteriorated [1] 91/3
31/19 38/20 39/3	27/1 27/5 27/8 29/21	99/24 100/18 100/18	112/18	deterioration [1]
50/21 50/21 52/13	29/22 35/23 46/23	101/5 101/8 101/15	delegation [1] 101/16	
52/14 53/14 53/17	66/1 72/19 72/20 73/2	101/21 101/23 101/25		139/18 147/2
61/7 62/13 69/20	74/23 76/6 77/6 77/7	102/20 102/23 103/3	122/25	determining [1]
75/23 75/24 79/4	77/7 77/24 80/16	103/20 103/24 104/8	deleted [14] 16/5	143/17
79/23 81/1 83/1 85/1 103/10 103/13 108/20	00/20 00/42 00/47	104/13 104/14 104/18		
109/21 111/4 125/13	99/8 99/10 99/13	105/4 105/14 106/16	81/9 119/23 122/13	150/17
132/1 135/9 151/11	99/14 99/20 100/24	106/19 107/19 108/1	122/15 122/16 123/7	deterrent [3] 148/3
151/18 169/7 175/6	101/1 101/10 101/17	109/2 110/1 110/14	124/4 124/18 124/20	149/14 156/8
175/6 175/19 189/5	102/1 102/4 102/7	110/19 114/14 115/13		detriment [2] 144/4
199/15 201/12 201/12	102/9 102/14 102/17	116/8 116/13 116/17	deliberately [1] 34/6	144/6
210/9	102/19 103/12 104/2	116/18 116/22 118/1	deliver [3] 32/7 45/7	detriments [1] 144/7
day's [1] 27/14	104/21 104/23 105/12	118/2 119/7 120/24	204/4	develop [1] 102/11
	105/21 105/23 106/1	121/2 121/4 121/18	Delta [2] 171/1 186/1	developed [2] 114/16

205/1 205/13 D disappeared [1] disease [1] 189/19 die [2] 64/11 64/15 35/14 disgrace [2] 166/25 developed... [1] died [5] 63/19 64/9 disappointed [2] 167/4 120/15 65/1 65/5 66/4 28/1 199/25 dismissed [1] 38/16 development [7] **difference [4]** 42/13 disbanded [2] 30/24 **dispute [1]** 18/3 51/14 100/25 103/13 116/24 155/15 155/20 120/4 **distancing [2]** 138/7 111/2 123/13 139/15 differences [5] 103/2 discharged [2] 139/12 164/9 144/23 153/6 153/10 206/25 208/15 distinction [2] 84/10 developments [2] 155/11 disclose [4] 56/22 143/15 28/22 122/1 dive [6] 109/16 179/9 different [37] 7/17 59/16 68/11 70/15 Devi [2] 35/3 182/17 7/20 8/22 19/5 24/11 disclosed [6] 10/19 179/10 179/11 179/25 device [6] 81/20 32/6 41/7 41/7 42/1 14/14 59/4 59/14 181/5 82/21 115/25 124/6 42/15 42/19 42/21 78/16 149/4 divergence [3] 42/5 124/7 125/7 42/23 48/4 48/9 48/9 42/10 143/22 disclosing [2] 63/24 devices [2] 81/7 58/9 68/24 80/8 99/3 64/22 dives [2] 180/6 181/3 118/18 111/10 137/23 142/21 disclosure [4] 10/21 division [2] 35/7 devoid [2] 23/10 142/25 143/20 149/12 60/20 70/1 149/4 35/15 23/13 discovered [1] 153/8 153/10 157/20 do [143] 3/22 7/11 devolved [4] 141/19 166/15 173/9 179/11 12/11 15/16 16/25 159/13 141/20 142/9 213/18 192/19 194/7 201/7 17/24 18/21 18/21 discovery [1] 128/14 devoted [1] 52/17 202/5 211/24 discretion [1] 68/9 21/10 21/14 21/15 devoting [1] 52/19 differentiate [1] discursive [2] 107/11 21/17 22/13 22/22 **DFM [1]** 213/4 85/21 108/3 24/11 24/13 25/9 25/9 diagnosis [1] 197/1 difficult [17] 41/17 discuss [10] 1/11 26/10 29/23 30/1 30/4 doesn't [17] 13/21 **Diamond [1]** 137/24 48/22 90/19 90/23 10/17 39/14 57/4 30/6 30/18 31/11 **Diamond Princess** 106/22 106/24 109/2 58/22 70/14 119/7 33/18 33/21 33/23 **[1]** 137/24 119/20 120/12 129/4 117/14 141/23 151/1 34/17 34/19 34/20 did [78] 10/2 10/14 173/11 179/6 188/25 discussed [19] 24/25 34/23 35/18 35/20 13/23 25/7 30/11 192/18 195/15 195/20 29/19 32/5 32/19 47/2 36/5 36/5 36/18 36/18 30/22 36/7 40/10 205/17 56/21 57/24 67/2 36/23 36/24 37/18 41/15 42/11 44/8 difficulties [2] 46/24 70/17 99/11 121/8 38/18 43/23 44/9 44/16 46/17 46/17 88/8 135/9 136/16 137/10 44/17 44/17 45/11 50/5 50/10 51/4 52/8 **difficulty [1]** 198/2 144/1 147/18 147/20 47/11 49/18 51/10 52/9 58/10 59/17 62/6 diligent [1] 18/17 176/22 207/13 54/4 54/8 54/16 55/7 64/10 64/24 64/24 diluted [1] 160/15 discussing [7] 2/21 55/11 55/11 58/20 65/8 65/19 70/14 78/1 dilution [1] 183/13 109/4 132/3 154/10 62/3 63/8 64/2 64/5 78/13 80/25 81/7 dimension [1] 4/5 154/14 193/9 199/23 65/11 68/22 70/23 81/23 82/7 82/12 discussion [40] 11/9 72/8 72/9 72/13 72/21 diminished [1] 82/16 82/19 82/23 73/18 77/5 78/19 182/24 17/4 20/8 26/4 27/12 83/7 87/25 88/11 diminution [1] 78/23 79/12 79/14 27/17 29/8 29/11 89/15 89/17 98/1 80/3 80/18 81/19 83/1 dominant [2] 24/21 183/14 29/16 29/17 30/19 98/19 99/13 101/22 dinner [1] 165/8 32/18 34/21 39/12 83/23 83/24 84/3 84/5 30/16 105/25 108/4 122/12 45/12 58/5 64/23 75/6 85/6 85/21 86/5 89/22 dominated [1] dip [1] 188/2 126/20 127/23 128/7 direct [1] 184/16 75/11 78/5 80/2 88/7 92/12 93/11 96/10 129/4 129/24 130/4 104/5 108/24 109/15 96/12 99/24 103/23 direction [3] 41/6 131/19 140/16 140/18 115/24 116/9 116/10 122/4 131/1 132/12 110/21 214/6 144/16 146/15 146/19 137/6 154/13 154/21 117/2 117/14 121/24 directions [2] 42/22 150/4 152/2 157/5 42/23 185/4 187/21 188/14 122/22 126/20 127/23 160/14 166/7 170/10 directly [9] 26/20 189/20 196/6 196/6 128/4 129/10 129/23 174/7 179/24 181/25 199/22 207/12 213/10 130/2 130/3 133/23 43/7 57/4 58/22 196/11 204/24 207/18 181/15 184/4 184/5 discussions [39] 144/11 148/5 151/22 207/21 209/2 210/24 184/9 207/25 25/16 29/20 35/18 154/22 154/25 155/4 213/18 40/20 40/20 41/6 160/25 161/17 163/1 **Director [5]** 108/18 didn't [37] 10/9 10/12 163/16 165/1 175/5 41/23 80/21 82/14 166/2 168/19 171/7 30/21 34/13 39/19 182/13 100/22 103/1 105/3 173/19 173/20 177/11 41/1 44/7 44/9 49/24 directorate [1] 116/6 106/3 106/6 106/15 179/18 180/6 180/10 51/10 51/12 56/3 disadvantage [1] 106/25 107/12 107/19 180/14 184/3 187/23 59/19 60/15 62/12 143/7 116/17 117/23 121/17 188/6 189/19 191/1 66/1 66/17 71/6 74/11 disagree [3] 66/10 123/12 125/11 125/20 191/10 191/20 191/21 87/4 90/12 92/9 92/12 91/16 133/11 127/1 127/6 127/7 191/25 193/13 194/3 92/14 123/16 125/6 197/25 198/7 204/5 disagreement [1] 129/16 135/20 137/16 137/11 150/1 163/6 138/11 139/6 139/16 205/1 205/5 212/17 107/9 164/2 167/11 167/16 139/17 140/11 141/8 disagreements [1] doctor [2] 59/21 174/7 180/20 192/22 167/14 141/13 151/7 157/5 68/17

13/23 15/21 18/3 18/4 18/20 19/10 22/2 23/12 24/21 25/19 31/6 31/15 35/25 37/22 49/16 52/25 58/8 60/25 61/19 66/10 68/19 74/15 81/5 81/10 82/19 85/25 89/7 90/7 93/4 93/10 93/11 94/5 94/5 94/12 97/24 110/5 133/14 140/4 153/19 157/20 159/3 160/22 (64) developed... - don't

document [7] 51/25

152/10 197/20 206/19

86/6 120/8 135/16

documentary [1]

documentation [3]

107/1 117/13 125/18

documents [9] 14/14

14/16 16/12 102/25

154/24 155/3

112/24 113/4 154/23

does [36] 12/4 12/6

20/4 20/5 23/17 23/18

23/23 23/25 28/4 29/7

43/3 48/2 48/16 50/5

53/15 57/16 60/18

75/25 87/5 114/12

137/7 146/3 149/2

204/12

204/6

68/16

145/21

135/12

41/21

120/1 120/25 128/25

159/23 162/16 165/6

169/20 188/11 191/7

19/6 21/9 22/4 42/3

43/1 48/14 50/9 76/21

87/7 87/25 88/3 93/20

188/20 193/12 204/3

doing [15] 17/16

36/6 36/22 38/12

43/20 77/5 77/17

87/11 90/3 103/9

domain [5] 49/1

domestically [1]

Dominic [4] 41/21

92/24 93/3 94/13

Dominic Raab [1]

[2] 93/3 94/13

Dominic Cummings

don't [53] 12/20 13/4

67/20 67/21 68/5

162/22 188/9

17/17 17/19 35/21

60/21 67/16 68/6

60/20

144/17 164/10 180/24 D 166/1 **economic** [12] 7/18 emergence [2] drinking [1] 164/1 33/19 34/12 34/13 185/25 197/18 180/24 184/15 don't... [9] 162/12 drive [1] 193/14 40/18 51/1 89/17 emergency [10] engages [1] 41/23 179/5 191/21 195/5 driven [1] 145/23 89/17 90/6 90/9 91/1 114/12 116/1 177/7 **engaging [4]** 90/8 195/11 196/8 200/7 driver [1] 15/20 144/6 177/18 178/15 178/17 103/1 107/8 114/10 205/19 213/8 driving [1] 87/19 178/22 179/2 179/21 England [20] 42/15 economy [2] 33/8 **Donald [1]** 211/17 181/12 dropping [1] 168/24 180/16 45/14 45/15 46/17 done [35] 18/8 30/12 emerging [1] 134/12 46/22 141/22 141/24 dry [2] 150/23 151/14 edged [1] 200/3 41/4 57/13 67/11 due [7] 11/3 11/8 Edinburgh [4] 27/10 emphasis [2] 159/23 141/25 143/3 143/6 79/11 86/16 86/19 11/14 12/8 99/12 143/23 144/2 145/11 63/10 63/16 64/17 160/17 88/5 88/16 88/18 effect [9] 48/12 73/14 emphasising [1] 48/1 119/22 158/20 145/21 145/23 146/17 92/13 104/22 115/1 during [52] 2/23 6/15 120/10 150/10 150/15 employed [1] 2/23 146/20 153/7 153/10 115/8 122/11 127/21 9/3 9/4 26/11 30/8 156/19 195/5 200/23 enable [2] 34/17 155/13 131/15 133/22 134/2 30/16 30/20 39/23 204/23 165/20 England-only [1] 134/3 139/7 143/1 46/24 52/18 52/24 effective [8] 41/17 enabled [1] 22/16 145/23 146/7 149/21 159/11 **enables [1]** 93/15 66/21 66/25 72/12 41/20 89/11 197/15 engulfed [1] 122/18 160/20 161/8 164/12 72/25 75/10 80/1 203/6 203/7 205/8 **enabling [1]** 46/9 enhance [1] 158/24 183/5 185/21 188/12 enact [1] 46/4 83/16 85/23 85/24 205/10 enhanced [2] 149/4 194/25 200/24 208/23 88/21 91/3 96/24 97/9 **effectively [13]** 15/19 encourage [1] 188/11 doorstep [1] 60/10 98/13 99/9 99/13 45/16 53/21 126/3 160/18 enough [7] 15/22 dose [1] 203/6 100/7 100/13 104/15 142/10 142/14 148/3 encouraging [1] 37/22 188/10 189/15 double [5] 138/8 158/17 181/22 193/12 104/18 107/4 114/12 54/18 204/10 205/7 208/4 147/23 163/6 163/17 end [19] 3/17 24/20 118/12 119/3 125/16 194/23 199/2 204/23 enquiries [1] 118/24 166/6 131/11 149/25 163/24 effects [3] 178/6 29/2 30/8 38/19 41/9 enquiring [1] 212/14 double check [1] 168/16 170/6 170/10 184/16 193/1 41/10 59/8 93/10 ensure [9] 101/4 163/6 174/9 177/21 180/18 160/18 171/10 171/21 113/24 130/8 151/4 efforts [4] 47/3 81/11 doubt [7] 92/7 110/5 181/1 185/19 194/13 179/18 181/24 182/20 168/7 184/22 158/19 159/15 161/9 113/24 176/14 182/5 197/3 205/22 212/7 192/4 195/7 199/25 **Eight [1]** 178/13 161/18 204/3 184/25 202/1 duty [4] 84/17 91/23 either [9] 47/18 64/1 202/4 ensuring [1] 148/12 doubting [2] 178/23 92/1 154/5 65/2 102/18 105/2 end-all [1] 24/20 enter [1] 76/1 182/11 111/3 145/2 163/15 endeavour [2] entered [3] 45/14 down [16] 12/12 66/5 83/2 194/18 100/13 127/18 14/10 14/19 27/10 each [9] 23/3 46/20 elderly [2] 137/25 endeavoured [1] enthusiasm [1] 33/12 39/6 39/7 48/6 53/25 89/16 211/24 161/17 84/20 148/10 152/19 152/24 172/13 172/15 172/25 **elected [2]** 5/14 5/17 ended [2] 93/11 enthusiastic [1] 171/5 188/21 193/14 191/23 140/3 48/15 **election [7]** 31/7 200/7 203/16 205/12 earlier [14] 42/11 50/23 52/2 97/7 97/16 ending [1] 44/13 enthusiastically [1] Dr [16] 54/4 56/18 energy [3] 50/24 51/1 49/7 43/5 44/20 67/16 166/13 169/7 57/21 58/20 59/6 68/21 88/7 97/10 elective [4] 173/12 52/7 entire [1] 135/17 59/15 59/17 60/8 110/13 121/9 137/13 184/25 185/13 186/20 enforce [6] 147/3 entirely [4] 59/25 61/12 61/20 64/8 67/9 154/10 169/16 186/10 element [6] 24/6 64/6 148/17 149/8 149/9 64/1 201/18 204/4 80/23 83/1 84/16 205/23 134/14 159/24 160/11 150/5 167/22 entirety [2] 98/4 211/17 earliest [1] 137/3 174/6 enforced [2] 139/1 193/24 Dr Calderwood [5] early [28] 2/1 2/1 elements [1] 160/4 147/19 entitled [2] 97/17 59/15 60/8 61/12 64/8 31/13 39/25 40/4 Elizabeth [3] 1/5 1/6 enforcement [22] 106/18 80/23 41/15 55/22 66/21 136/19 137/20 138/12 entrust [1] 102/13 215/3 Dr Calderwood's [3] 68/2 79/24 80/19 138/19 139/19 148/15|entrusted [1] 100/21 Elizabeth Lloyd [1] 59/17 61/20 67/9 131/11 132/10 134/8 1/5 149/22 149/23 150/3 entry [4] 32/9 44/21 Dr Catherine 134/11 136/2 139/5 else [4] 76/9 129/3 151/25 152/5 152/17 63/3 143/25 Calderwood [2] 139/13 139/13 156/2 environment [2] 150/8 164/22 158/6 158/16 158/19 56/18 59/6 156/7 177/7 196/2 **elsewhere [3]** 13/22 159/19 159/20 159/21 210/3 210/4 Dr Donald Macaskill 198/14 208/21 209/3 159/24 160/11 160/19 Environmental [1] 17/23 25/14 **[1]** 211/17 210/15 211/15 167/18 email [18] 47/11 158/23 **Dr Smith [4]** 54/4 easier [2] 22/17 62/3 56/24 58/5 58/12 60/4 enforcing [2] 148/6 epidemiology [3] 57/21 58/20 84/16 easily [2] 124/16 67/9 74/6 74/25 75/4 155/9 102/11 105/10 177/9 **Dr Sridhar [1]** 83/1 124/21 75/16 76/7 77/19 engage [9] 7/7 40/6 **EQIA** [1] 160/22 draft [4] 21/25 21/25 easing [2] 170/5 82/23 83/8 131/4 90/1 109/3 140/11 **EQIAs [2]** 157/18 51/1 69/6 170/8 131/8 131/14 131/20 160/17 177/14 180/22 160/24 dressing [8] 188/5 East [2] 109/6 112/6 184/8 emails [7] 56/17 equalities [3] 13/1 189/8 194/20 195/4 **East Renfrewshire** 71/22 113/25 131/8 engaged [1] 39/14 157/19 160/25 196/1 200/1 200/3 [2] 109/6 112/6 engagement [14] 131/10 131/20 131/21 equality [2] 157/14 204/9 Easter [1] 170/7 **embedded [1]** 125/4 25/25 39/22 77/13 160/20 drink [5] 162/17 easy [4] 60/14 91/1 140/14 140/16 embrace [1] 49/7 equally [1] 108/4 162/19 165/25 166/1 191/12 192/6 192/13 **emerged [1]** 198/10 140/24 141/2 141/4 equipped [1] 89/18

188/17 190/2 197/3 170/1 173/7 174/17 Ε **exception [3]** 71/15 **expecting [1]** 32/6 197/4 200/8 169/13 176/20 experience [10] 179/3 201/23 error [1] 1/25 exceptional [1] 105/9 28/21 53/1 86/14 eventually [1] 88/1 **extremely [2]** 205/16 **Es [6]** 139/1 149/22 ever [4] 82/16 152/1 exceptionally [3] 86/25 87/10 99/22 210/16 159/21 159/24 160/17 204/21 204/25 133/19 133/25 201/15 108/1 172/16 178/20 161/4 every [22] 18/6 38/3 exchange [38] 11/6 184/9 escape [5] 182/11 61/6 79/23 80/10 11/9 12/19 13/11 15/8 experienced [1] 90/5 face [10] 100/6 131/6 198/12 199/1 199/17 131/6 131/10 131/10 81/14 100/9 103/10 16/19 18/2 21/18 experiencing [1] 203/5 131/11 131/11 163/1 117/12 127/10 130/6 24/23 71/20 75/4 75/6 169/9 **especially [1]** 43/13 164/18 182/16 75/11 77/1 77/4 77/19 expert [5] 103/18 130/21 133/15 133/16 **essence [7]** 32/4 face masks [1] 163/1 151/11 151/18 163/12 77/19 82/25 83/17 175/5 175/17 176/24 45/24 105/19 110/13 faced [2] 46/24 100/6 163/12 175/3 180/25 131/6 131/16 132/1 179/22 112/8 148/25 213/22 162/5 166/17 187/20 facilitate [3] 75/25 194/4 199/15 **expertise [3]** 132/20 essential [1] 169/3 76/2 78/6 **everybody** [2] 56/4 190/9 190/17 191/7 213/11 213/14 essentially [6] 7/5 facing [6] 5/24 113/9 214/13 191/11 192/5 193/4 **experts** [6] 139/7 13/5 16/16 19/10 170/23 174/20 181/16 173/18 179/3 181/17 everyone [5] 28/12 193/7 195/19 199/18 19/15 48/19 55/13 94/25 95/11 202/25 204/12 204/18 181/16 206/24 195/20 established [8] 180/2 fact [40] 11/5 16/25 188/21 212/21 **expired [1]** 125/13 180/4 180/6 181/4 29/6 30/15 36/19 **everything [6]** 24/10 exchanged [1] explain [20] 22/8 181/6 181/6 195/18 36/20 53/12 61/3 32/1 35/20 54/24 67/6 25/19 78/23 79/11 125/12 198/16 63/15 63/23 63/24 89/18 90/10 91/6 91/7 153/23 204/5 **exchanges** [19] 10/7 estate [2] 137/2 64/3 64/5 64/22 66/4 everywhere [4] 38/4 14/3 25/7 39/16 75/21 91/9 91/18 96/16 139/9 80/13 84/7 87/8 38/8 200/4 203/1 83/2 83/24 108/10 99/14 133/24 138/20 et [5] 77/18 130/17 108/20 109/25 110/22 evidence [32] 1/13 108/16 111/7 125/1 140/13 160/18 167/3 164/17 199/17 199/17 1/15 4/13 30/12 35/2 130/11 131/25 132/5 207/8 209/23 118/16 124/10 124/19 et cetera [4] 77/18 168/10 189/11 193/22 explained [2] 130/12 124/20 126/6 141/3 75/3 81/17 82/10 164/17 199/17 199/17 142/9 145/2 149/19 88/19 92/23 103/16 194/22 203/12 182/19 etc [7] 11/21 20/24 154/16 154/20 155/15 105/15 110/3 112/22 excruciating [1] **explaining [8]** 54/15 21/5 57/14 120/6 167/13 177/1 187/14 125/17 128/7 134/19 37/25 90/16 123/15 133/20 188/12 190/16 190/3 198/23 205/6 142/4 152/4 152/21 196/3 196/3 196/4 excuse [3] 115/1 EU [8] 28/22 29/2 211/23 157/13 170/23 172/9 150/25 158/12 206/21 29/5 29/9 29/18 30/16 174/19 176/14 182/17 excuses [1] 208/6 factor [1] 156/12 **explains** [1] 1/20 86/15 87/3 187/12 194/24 203/24 **executive [1]** 181/15 explanation [2] 22/19 factors [10] 24/22 EU exit [7] 28/22 102/12 156/11 174/2 205/23 211/15 211/16 exempt [1] 162/17 92/14 29/2 29/5 29/9 29/18 174/16 198/17 198/25 evident [3] 39/16 **exemption** [1] 93/14 **explore** [3] 7/12 86/15 87/3 202/17 210/14 211/9 40/17 41/24 27/18 152/14 exemptions [1] Euro [3] 187/17 facts [2] 16/13 76/12 Evidently [1] 82/14 155/4 **exposed [1]** 67/15 197/2 197/6 factual [2] 16/3 63/7 exercise [1] 151/12 evolved [1] 211/1 **exposing [1]** 110/17 Euro 2020 [1] 197/2 evolving [1] 207/4 **exhaustive** [1] 127/8 fails [1] 154/7 **expressed [1]** 132/6 **Euro fan [1]** 187/17 expressing [2] 167/5 | fair [28] 6/5 6/9 8/8 exist [6] 30/2 66/24 exact [6] 102/1 **European [2]** 87/4 8/25 15/15 25/11 112/13 112/13 140/5 131/8 131/20 154/23 203/13 136/25 27/22 39/4 44/25 53/2 159/7 172/18 154/25 **expression** [9] 44/1 **European Union [1]** 79/5 104/8 104/10 exactly [10] 107/25 existed [3] 94/6 121/13 159/2 159/3 87/4 111/17 111/24 138/3 98/12 147/4 109/8 109/10 118/4 159/4 175/13 193/20 Euros [8] 187/6 121/24 167/13 169/20 151/15 155/2 159/10 194/19 194/21 **existence** [3] 116/14 188/16 188/17 188/22 169/18 189/17 209/5 169/24 170/14 171/24 179/4 193/6 **extend [2]** 34/16 189/13 189/23 193/18 174/25 187/4 199/12 existing [4] 124/18 example [41] 9/24 45/17 194/13 201/5 202/14 209/11 10/16 12/7 12/16 150/21 152/13 156/18 extended [1] 46/14 even [10] 58/14 fairly [5] 1/24 40/15 14/20 25/5 26/21 27/5 exists [2] 94/3 **extends** [1] 45/20 74/12 92/9 142/10 41/25 66/19 69/1 40/16 124/15 191/16 115/19 **extensive** [2] 25/24 149/19 172/20 181/10 exit [7] 28/22 29/2 faith [2] 85/20 204/14 75/18 76/3 80/8 84/25 124/25 182/5 210/22 211/15 fall [2] 183/18 185/18 92/25 102/2 110/4 29/5 29/9 29/18 86/15 extent [12] 49/13 evening [2] 63/10 110/9 113/5 115/24 72/22 79/8 79/16 fallen [1] 168/23 111/3 140/21 143/16 152/15 falling [1] 34/7 124/24 131/25 134/17 expand [1] 89/21 Evening News [1] expanding [1] 212/15 156/20 183/23 189/21 familiar [2] 73/16 136/15 138/5 138/7 63/10 73/19 139/2 139/12 143/1 expect [11] 17/18 193/6 198/12 event [12] 57/6 57/13 145/22 150/8 150/24 28/13 43/14 76/10 families [2] 22/17 **external [4]** 65/10 58/3 58/11 58/16 100/6 160/23 176/1 178/4 77/4 77/18 77/20 135/22 142/7 142/8 114/13 128/13 162/10 family [7] 23/18 64/2 179/23 186/22 194/11 78/12 91/19 130/21 **externally [3]** 83/3 187/15 190/19 191/13 65/2 65/12 65/13 198/9 205/15 152/2 115/22 205/25 197/6 189/9 210/8 examples [2] 67/24 expectation [1] extra [2] 138/5 192/4 events [12] 55/25 fan [17] 187/7 187/17 136/25 78/15 extract [1] 81/15 66/25 77/21 162/22 excellent [1] 176/9 189/22 191/5 191/16 **expected [4]** 133/15 extraneous [1] 74/8 164/3 174/15 187/4 191/17 192/3 192/12 except [1] 49/25 140/19 141/11 148/9 **extreme [6]** 55/7

F	final [11] 22/3 27/1	96/21 97/3 97/13	203/14 204/12 206/14	183/10 183/14
for [0] 103/2 103/5	27/13 59/7 99/20	99/10 99/25 100/4	208/24 213/5 214/9	foremost [1] 196/9
fan [9] 193/2 193/5	102/4 104/23 111/18	100/19 100/21 101/8	First Minister's [7]	forensically [1] 81/18
195/21 196/13 196/14	112/5 112/7 112/18	101/9 101/16 102/7	6/18 56/19 107/18	
197/7 197/8 197/9				forgive [6] 111/17
197/13	Finally [1] 213/18	102/7 102/14 102/17	109/23 133/22 191/10	
	finance [5] 46/18	102/21 103/9 104/13	194/12	209/5 212/19
fan zone [1] 193/2	104/24 200/8 201/15	104/20 105/2 105/7	First Ministers [3]	form [5] 73/10 73/14
fanzone [2] 188/24	202/17	105/14 107/18 107/24	39/18 40/22 41/11	76/8 76/10 160/15
190/14				
far [21] 11/21 12/15	finances [4] 33/11	109/21 109/23 109/25		formal [12] 18/19
24/18 50/12 64/22	33/16 35/20 35/23	110/6 110/15 110/24	five [4] 29/9 61/5	18/23 19/10 19/16
I	financial [3] 46/7	111/14 112/7 112/9	62/14 145/6	19/17 25/7 29/19
65/1 79/12 94/14	192/19 201/2	112/19 128/13 128/23		29/21 76/7 76/15 83/2
113/9 118/5 129/14				l .
136/17 142/11 142/13	financing [1] 88/8	128/24 129/5 129/6	148/22 148/25 149/12	l .
168/4 177/16 179/17	find [12] 17/18 60/14	130/23 131/2 132/1	150/1 150/6 150/11	formally [4] 5/22 5/23
183/17 186/10 186/14	62/4 79/12 93/9	133/22 137/17 140/7	150/16 150/19 151/16	151/9 212/22
	126/13 128/2 144/16	152/14 154/9 156/17	151/22 152/1 152/3	format [1] 166/15
211/2	189/19 201/19 201/22		152/9 152/19 155/11	former [23] 70/22
fashion [4] 14/3 18/9				
41/4 170/22	203/24	168/17 168/23 169/8	157/15 157/22	83/9 96/21 99/10
fashioned [4] 43/17	finding [2] 36/6	169/18 171/19 172/3	flippant [1] 31/15	99/25 100/19 100/20
	189/17	172/14 172/25 173/23	flow [1] 168/25	101/8 102/14 102/17
43/24 44/4 45/22	fine [2] 149/1 153/9	177/17 178/13 178/18		105/7 107/18 107/24
fast [3] 99/12 100/16	finer [2] 110/23	178/19 182/3 182/12	fluctuating [1]	110/6 128/23 128/24
103/6				
faster [1] 201/10	111/12	184/11 185/16 189/14		129/6 130/23 131/2
	fines [1] 153/8	191/10 191/14 192/1	fluctuations [1]	133/22 160/13 192/7
fastest [1] 194/3	fingers [2] 193/18	192/7 192/7 192/21	170/18	194/11
favour [1] 58/15	193/20	194/11 194/12 196/9	FM [12] 33/9 33/10	forms [3] 19/6 71/23
favoured [1] 59/20				84/18
feature [1] 214/12	finish [1] 95/12	198/15 202/19 203/14		
features [2] 169/22	finished [1] 62/23	204/12 206/14 208/24	57/11 57/21 77/17	formulation [1] 43/21
	Fiona [2] 33/14 33/15	210/6 213/5 214/9	109/18 193/15 199/24	forth [5] 94/2 181/7
194/21	Fiona Hyslop [2]	First Minister [115]	203/19	192/16 196/19 211/11
February [8] 56/15	33/14 33/15	3/7 3/13 3/17 4/15	FM's [3] 75/19 76/12	
134/11 134/19 135/2				
135/8 135/10 209/4	fire [1] 93/22	4/17 4/24 6/22 6/25	188/5	128/13
211/15	first [194] 1/19 3/7	7/15 8/2 8/21 9/3 9/8	FMQs [1] 191/1	forum [1] 104/6
	3/13 3/17 4/15 4/17	10/6 12/23 13/13	focus [9] 30/15 50/18	forward [5] 24/16
February 2020 [2]	4/23 4/24 4/25 6/12	13/19 14/21 15/21	50/22 54/15 135/12	107/14 126/21 158/20
56/15 135/2	6/19 6/22 6/25 7/15	15/22 16/20 16/24	136/2 136/7 142/3	195/15
fed [2] 132/21 213/20				
Federation [6]	8/2 8/21 9/3 9/8 9/16	22/2 24/25 25/8 26/20	160/10	forwarded [1] 13/7
166/22 167/4 167/11	10/6 10/23 12/23	27/2 27/11 28/14	focused [3] 52/15	found [6] 90/6 94/5
	13/13 13/19 14/21	33/17 39/17 40/12	135/21 135/23	108/2 123/18 123/20
167/12 168/1 168/8	15/5 15/21 15/22	40/21 41/5 41/12	focusing [3] 31/11	146/8
feed [3] 23/21 26/3	16/20 16/24 20/10	42/24 49/22 51/7 52/5	31/17 31/22	four [23] 8/5 46/20
91/23				
feedback [4] 21/14	22/2 24/25 25/8 25/23		FOI [3] 74/13 155/2	47/3 48/6 48/15 58/10
25/3 25/6 99/15	26/20 27/1 27/2 27/11		155/4	61/4 113/5 139/1
	28/11 28/14 30/22	69/19 70/23 75/12	folk [2] 162/13 164/2	140/12 140/20 141/3
feel [8] 36/7 62/12	32/17 33/17 37/15	76/16 76/18 76/20	follow [4] 145/19	149/22 159/21 161/4
68/22 78/13 91/14	39/10 39/17 39/18	76/25 77/14 78/4	153/20 165/16 197/16	
91/19 162/25 193/12	40/12 40/21 40/22	79/15 83/9 83/10 93/6		180/14 182/23 184/1
feeling [1] 85/11				l .
felt [12] 5/19 15/23	40/23 40/24 40/24	93/16 93/20 94/19	92/22 126/1 151/4	202/10 213/20
22/23 22/25 41/9	41/5 41/11 41/12	96/14 96/20 96/21	213/7	four Es [4] 139/1
I	42/24 49/22 51/7	97/13 99/10 99/25	following [8] 24/4	149/22 159/21 161/4
44/11 45/10 50/19	51/22 52/5 52/17	100/19 100/21 101/8	30/7 31/2 55/15 58/5	four harms [7] 113/5
68/10 87/16 90/9	52/25 56/19 56/23	101/9 101/16 102/7	97/6 153/20 163/12	164/4 180/12 180/14
90/15				
few [10] 1/11 8/25	57/23 58/13 58/17	102/14 102/17 102/21	follows [1] 165/2	182/23 184/1 202/10
9/5 30/25 65/10 83/15	58/19 59/8 59/23 60/9		Football [1] 189/2	four nation [1] 141/3
100/14 102/10 148/16		105/2 105/7 105/14	footballing [1]	four nations [4] 8/5
	64/11 64/15 64/20	107/24 109/25 110/6	191/13	46/20 48/15 140/20
187/12	66/4 69/4 69/6 69/14		fora [4] 107/11 108/7	
FH [2] 33/9 33/12	69/19 70/10 70/23	112/7 112/9 112/19	125/18 194/9	168/23
fight [1] 183/3				
fighting [3] 164/20	75/12 76/16 76/18	128/13 128/23 129/5	Forbes [4] 69/23	FPN [8] 150/1 151/5
182/25 201/25	76/20 76/25 77/14	129/6 130/23 131/2	70/25 99/3 200/20	152/24 152/24 153/6
	78/4 78/9 79/15 79/18	140/7 154/9 156/17	force [5] 11/2 14/12	153/11 155/16 155/22
figures [6] 27/15	80/17 83/9 83/10 93/6		33/22 34/2 34/22	FPNs [1] 157/1
109/4 135/8 135/10	93/16 93/20 94/19	171/19 192/1 192/7	forecast [1] 135/6	framed [1] 60/5
149/24 172/5	95/18 96/14 96/20	192/7 194/11 202/19		
	95/10 90/14 90/20	132/1 134/11 202/19	forefront [3] 183/9	framework [4] 16/12
	1			(67) fan - framework

204/11 70/15 71/14 73/7 40/10 40/11 40/14 funding [6] 34/16 getting [5] 49/1 109/1 35/10 45/21 88/8 77/14 78/23 79/18 40/15 42/6 42/7 43/25 framework... [3] 201/15 201/18 181/23 183/4 184/10 80/3 80/6 81/1 85/1 44/8 44/25 45/8 45/16 89/13 112/24 113/5 funerals [5] 11/1 give [24] 13/4 16/3 86/24 88/20 91/2 45/22 45/23 46/6 frameworks [1] 34/9 37/1 37/9 54/5 11/11 12/3 16/9 76/4 94/21 102/9 109/8 46/16 48/4 48/5 48/20 18/23 furlough [8] 34/16 60/18 64/10 73/8 110/21 112/14 112/16 48/21 50/23 51/16 France [5] 63/14 78/22 78/24 79/10 136/9 141/23 142/1 51/20 51/22 52/1 52/3 43/13 44/11 44/12 63/16 64/6 64/16 65/7 45/12 45/17 45/20 84/20 85/24 92/9 143/24 145/13 147/23 61/5 64/14 65/3 65/24 frank [2] 146/13 46/13 100/13 130/16 134/25 161/12 162/11 175/19 66/6 66/19 68/10 70/2 192/2 further [32] 6/20 13/9 150/4 169/20 177/14 180/14 187/23 194/1 70/6 70/21 70/22 frankly [1] 114/24 14/2 15/25 27/18 196/7 208/10 213/8 196/21 198/25 201/9 70/23 71/4 71/9 71/10 Fraser [2] 116/5 given [52] 9/21 14/18 34/10 69/17 83/11 201/19 201/20 204/4 71/23 72/12 73/1 73/5 121/13 86/2 92/19 149/19 22/6 22/9 28/19 30/5 209/1 210/2 213/16 73/14 74/1 74/6 76/1 free [1] 168/25 157/9 162/21 171/21 53/14 57/14 58/23 214/5 76/2 77/24 78/6 78/11 Freedom [2] 62/1 59/1 63/21 86/12 87/9 181/12 185/8 188/14 gold [29] 8/4 25/15 78/14 78/17 78/21 154/23 189/11 190/17 193/4 87/11 88/4 91/25 32/10 32/11 44/21 82/7 82/12 82/13 freedoms [1] 106/17 201/10 202/2 202/8 100/16 103/6 104/7 98/18 98/18 99/11 82/14 82/17 82/18 Freeman [8] 58/14 202/12 202/15 202/24 105/13 108/5 112/1 102/21 103/3 103/8 82/20 82/24 83/5 84/2 69/23 70/24 80/24 203/3 203/12 203/16 125/24 126/4 128/13 105/3 105/19 105/21 84/8 85/4 85/15 87/5 83/24 85/9 97/9 97/15 205/21 206/8 215/11 131/12 136/21 137/6 105/22 105/24 106/6 87/15 88/20 89/10 freeze [2] 153/13 141/13 142/4 143/25 106/8 106/15 106/21 89/15 90/3 90/5 91/15 future [3] 179/19 153/14 194/16 208/7 146/1 151/2 152/16 107/20 108/3 108/6 92/5 92/8 93/23 94/7 French [11] 63/6 155/19 156/6 156/21 110/11 110/12 111/1 96/17 98/13 101/4 63/23 64/2 64/4 64/16 G 158/5 166/5 173/21 111/1 112/6 194/8 103/17 103/21 106/11 64/22 65/3 65/4 65/12 game [7] 182/6 177/1 180/7 181/17 gone [9] 12/12 13/3 107/23 110/18 110/21 65/17 66/5 182/14 183/3 189/4 112/25 113/15 115/6 183/11 184/12 184/18 15/8 64/25 76/15 Frenchman [2] 63/12 197/6 197/13 199/8 187/13 190/3 192/12 81/17 121/16 161/13 115/9 115/11 115/12 64/12 game-changer [2] 192/14 201/11 201/24 117/1 117/24 118/13 202/2 frequency [2] 176/16 182/14 199/8 giving [7] 13/13 **good [36]** 1/4 23/5 118/18 118/24 119/25 177/19 game...fanzone [1] 13/24 23/13 109/20 40/16 40/20 43/17 120/9 121/1 122/7 frequent [3] 128/20 189/15 43/24 44/3 45/22 132/4 165/19 166/4 124/19 125/19 126/3 129/10 176/17 gap [2] 115/17 Glasgow [14] 27/9 47/16 49/17 55/16 130/2 133/1 133/15 frequently [8] 7/7 9/7 115/19 50/1 109/5 112/6 61/17 62/22 66/23 134/13 135/22 140/15 74/6 90/5 119/21 gaps [3] 197/24 169/13 169/19 188/1 71/25 82/17 92/7 92/8 141/20 141/25 142/7 129/9 176/20 207/13 198/1 198/7 142/25 143/2 143/19 188/6 189/4 189/13 95/6 103/22 104/13 fresh [1] 76/16 gather [3] 22/17 189/21 189/23 191/8 107/8 107/11 109/18 143/23 144/18 145/9 friend [1] 89/3 154/2 190/16 145/16 145/18 145/20 191/13 117/10 131/25 144/10 friends [1] 189/9 gathering [1] 110/15 global [1] 122/17 144/21 146/4 153/17 145/23 146/2 146/10 front [1] 53/23 gave [7] 2/10 4/13 globally [1] 203/25 167/10 168/9 177/23 147/11 148/8 148/17 frontline [1] 50/20 76/22 110/3 157/14 go [52] 11/20 12/22 192/8 194/24 208/4 148/17 149/9 149/13 frustrated [2] 36/6 179/23 196/8 14/19 21/6 24/18 got [18] 19/1 39/15 150/4 151/3 151/25 145/2 general [4] 6/15 24/24 27/10 36/8 41/5 41/8 41/8 68/2 152/7 152/8 152/18 frustrating [4] 48/18 54/5 116/6 36/25 41/6 42/21 78/19 81/10 83/17 152/23 154/12 155/20 144/17 146/8 146/14 generally [11] 3/24 42/22 44/9 44/10 142/19 144/16 153/12 155/21 158/3 161/14 200/19 5/23 30/21 53/24 45/19 49/3 56/12 153/13 163/23 181/19 167/23 177/15 183/15 frustration [6] 44/1 106/6 106/18 110/12 191/12 191/13 191/15 62/16 72/1 75/13 185/12 186/8 201/10 44/18 167/5 168/11 167/18 172/10 178/25 201/17 204/25 205/6 75/17 80/11 80/25 **Gov [2]** 119/9 120/25 201/4 203/13 195/21 86/5 92/20 112/14 Gove [3] 8/6 43/8 207/1 208/12 208/17 frustrations [1] genuine [1] 26/4 152/19 152/24 155/9 47/6 government's [24] 167/8 genuinely [2] 80/18 162/1 174/14 176/3 1/21 8/9 24/20 27/21 governance [2] 93/5 fucking [2] 37/25 81/5 176/6 176/11 180/21 117/10 33/25 35/23 50/17 38/10 geographical [1] 190/3 190/8 191/6 governed [1] 93/13 53/4 54/9 60/22 64/19 fulfil [1] 117/4 48/8 191/22 191/25 194/2 69/15 73/15 84/12 government [199] full [10] 19/6 19/14 geographically [1] 195/19 197/19 201/6 2/24 3/10 3/19 8/3 8/4 91/1 113/8 114/24 34/14 57/12 73/8 160/3 201/10 201/10 201/11 9/1 10/25 12/5 12/12 119/2 135/11 150/16 114/3 114/8 127/10 qet [29] 1/12 2/22 202/15 203/3 213/15 15/11 24/4 28/4 29/14 156/22 164/19 201/23 130/21 133/16 3/24 19/3 29/21 34/9 213/21 214/4 30/1 30/11 30/11 206/1 fully [1] 180/8 35/19 37/22 41/1 30/17 30/19 31/2 31/3 government-issued goes [4] 38/2 49/4 function [3] 22/12 43/20 45/3 45/4 46/3 31/10 31/15 32/6 34/2 [1] 82/12 190/13 203/15 22/24 23/2 47/14 74/8 76/16 going [57] 12/2 24/25 34/6 34/12 34/20 35/4 governmental [1] functioning [1] 43/2 81/16 85/7 108/24 25/3 31/13 32/20 35/7 35/5 35/8 35/9 35/11 144/10 functions [1] 174/16 120/16 132/2 153/2 36/19 36/20 39/25 36/4 36/10 36/14 governments [7] fundamental [1] 167/11 184/13 187/24 42/13 42/15 42/21 36/15 38/12 38/13 9/25 42/10 42/14 43/3 106/17 195/11 195/12 200/7 47/8 53/19 54/1 61/24 38/21 39/17 40/8 48/7 141/21 208/17

G	hamp
	Hance
gran [1] 210/8 Granted [1] 131/10	120/4
graphics [1] 21/10	hand
grapple [1] 177/8	166/1
grateful [2] 94/15	hande 114/3
214/10	handi
great [6] 16/18 91/2 108/3 128/15 199/7	131/1
201/4	handl
greater [6] 153/2	177/2
153/5 159/18 160/6	handl
177/17 201/1	113/1 208/8
greatest [2] 168/4	handl
168/5	44/13
green [3] 142/22 143/3 145/18	hands
Gregor [4] 57/1 57/2	hands
59/13 212/16	123/2 124/1
Gregor Smith [3]	hand
57/2 59/13 212/16	33/20
grew [1] 207/6	happe
grief [2] 100/5 208/5 grim [1] 203/19	129/2
grinch [1] 47/19	196/2
grips [1] 132/2	happe 60/1
group [33] 9/11 9/14	81/3
91/15 98/17 98/19	132/1
98/21 98/25 107/20 111/15 112/8 121/8	171/2
176/13 176/17 176/24	happe
177/6 177/13 177/16	43/6
177/17 178/4 178/7	80/3
179/12 179/22 179/24	happe 31/6 9
180/5 180/17 180/22	happy
181/2 181/5 181/8 181/9 181/11 182/18	124/1
212/5	hard
groups [5] 99/15	90/7
174/21 178/8 184/8	harde 194/9
212/24	harde
guarantee [1] 95/11 guidance [17] 99/17	harm
99/19 109/20 119/9	182/2
120/25 121/2 123/5	183/8
127/24 153/3 161/19	183/1 184/2
163/13 163/19 163/21	184/2
164/7 164/9 164/13	185/1
165/10 guiding [1] 202/10	185/2
guy [1] 194/1	186/1
guys [1] 90/16	harm
gyms [1] 169/3	183/4 183/1
H	harm
habit [2] 74/24	184/2
130/15	184/2
had [273]	186/1
hadn't [5] 51/23 66/7	harms 113/5
67/14 123/6 164/2	180/1

half [2] 69/12 79/1

197/14

Hampden [2] 196/15

38/21 39/12 51/16 pering [1] 88/13 ock [2] 120/4 **[5]** 34/3 115/14 1 191/18 196/18 ed [3] 114/2 3 114/7 ing [2] 81/18 15 **le [2]** 44/15 23 led [5] 75/9 11 208/3 208/7 ling [**3**] 39/3 3 114/24 **s [1]** 162/17 set [7] 123/20 21 124/1 124/7 13 124/14 125/3 written [1] en [6] 90/13 24 130/4 130/6 22 202/20 ened [13] 57/19 72/2 72/3 80/22 81/8 101/2 10 166/12 168/19 21 209/16 ening [8] 32/8 43/7 66/25 75/23 90/11 92/16 ens [4] 18/13 93/2 154/3 **y [3]** 47/11 10 155/23 **[4]** 39/1 49/6 101/4 er [3] 39/15 9 201/11 est [1] 194/2 **[25]** 56/8 23 182/23 183/4 8 183/9 183/9 14 183/17 183/24 2 184/5 184/15 23 184/23 185/10 16 185/16 185/18 20 185/20 186/14 15 186/15 186/24 **1 [7]** 182/23 4 183/8 183/9 14 185/16 185/20 **2 [9]** 183/17 2 184/5 184/15 23 185/18 186/14| 15 186/24 **s [10]** 89/17 5 164/4 180/12 180/14 182/23 183/19 183/20 184/1 202/10 has [46] 5/11 12/12 15/17 15/21 15/22

51/24 56/1 56/21 67/20 67/22 71/12 71/18 73/9 75/13 75/14 87/13 91/17 94/19 94/25 100/9 102/24 104/10 112/22 114/4 114/5 116/20 118/15 121/14 125/19 126/3 133/7 151/15 151/19 152/4 153/13 155/14 187/11 193/6 197/21 200/24 204/25 213/19 205/9 208/4 have [336] haven't [6] 11/16 12/24 15/6 15/10 16/6 184/20 81/17 having [17] 6/2 6/6 13/11 41/19 48/16 49/11 74/10 97/25 127/7 132/17 137/12 159/13 172/15 184/20 184/22 195/22 197/2 he [45] 4/14 9/9 38/10 38/23 39/19 39/20 39/21 42/2 51/13 57/17 57/22 58/21 58/22 58/23 59/1 59/14 83/18 85/1 85/4 85/5 94/20 103/19 109/23 110/3 132/4 132/20 141/2 141/5 141/6 141/8 141/16 147/23 147/25 148/1 160/14 160/16 165/4 165/5 165/5 165/23 166/4 188/23 190/25 213/7 213/10 head [2] 53/10 184/13 headed [1] 32/10 heading [1] 56/6 **headlining [1]** 51/18 headway [1] 36/16 health [96] 9/7 23/18 23/24 34/19 35/5 35/11 35/17 35/25 38/17 40/17 46/5 46/19 46/21 52/24 53/20 54/2 54/10 55/6 56/20 58/14 61/7 67/17 88/9 97/7 97/17 97/18 98/5 98/6 102/8 70/19 71/2 71/4 71/14 108/21 111/7 112/19 119/14 142/9 142/10 144/4 144/15 144/25 156/10 158/23 162/3 162/24 163/5 163/10 165/15 168/6 168/17 169/8 170/2 173/8 175/16 175/17 176/8 178/22 179/1 179/2

179/20 180/15 180/15 191/3 191/4 192/11 181/15 182/6 183/7 183/11 183/20 184/17 184/19 184/20 185/5 185/6 185/12 185/20 186/7 186/22 189/18 192/19 193/2 193/25 194/4 194/6 196/24 201/8 201/12 201/13 202/18 203/25 206/22 208/13 211/23 211/24 212/4 212/11 213/18 health secretary [3] 182/6 194/4 208/13 healthcare [1] 203/20 213/8 98/14 98/16 103/16 112/22 121/12 134/18 152/4 176/14 211/15 211/16 hearing [4] 70/1 89/16 205/14 214/17 heavily [1] 177/6 heavy [1] 118/8 heightened [1] 60/9 97/15 97/18 134/8 139/6 92/15 92/21 94/16 161/24 181/2 helpful [5] 92/14 136/9 168/17 198/5 200/23 helpfully [7] 95/17 118/22 128/23 128/24 134/25 166/17 175/7 helping [2] 54/17 55/13 helps [1] 20/6 hence [2] 58/22 160/7 her [60] 6/7 6/9 12/11 13/7 25/3 25/6 52/6 52/13 52/14 59/8 59/15 60/13 70/8 70/12 70/16 70/18 72/23 75/15 75/15 82/3 82/5 82/5 82/16 146/11 146/13 148/12 82/16 83/2 83/7 84/14 84/14 95/24 98/2 108/2 110/15 111/14 116/9 152/5 152/21 157/12 158/1 182/17 182/21 182/22 182/24 185/10 190/13 190/14

192/12 192/22 200/3 200/22 her Ladyship [1] 95/24 here [32] 6/13 9/17 10/14 11/6 14/13 18/1 19/12 22/16 24/23 28/17 43/11 45/24 47/2 47/3 55/21 56/21 59/9 60/17 68/17 71/15 73/8 94/20 108/24 121/23 188/10 190/1 192/10 196/5 199/22 200/25 201/15 205/4 hers [1] 16/4 hear [4] 82/10 203/20 herself [2] 110/2 110/17 heard [12] 35/2 92/22 high [6] 171/4 171/5 186/3 190/4 191/12 198/16 higher [3] 11/23 48/24 171/17 highlighted [2] 135/18 204/19 highlighting [1] 211/23 highly [7] 172/23 held [10] 70/13 81/20 174/3 174/10 180/9 96/24 97/4 97/9 97/12 181/18 186/8 191/20 him [7] 39/23 83/22 110/4 129/10 175/12 help [12] 7/8 7/9 7/12 212/17 213/6 20/4 20/5 43/23 86/21 hindrance [1] 44/14 hindsight [1] 58/9 hip [1] 185/6 his [14] 4/14 37/10 38/3 39/16 89/3 94/19 129/10 132/18 141/2 141/4 147/21 160/16 165/3 165/11 **history** [1] 179/7 **hit [2]** 174/7 180/10 hitting [2] 37/17 174/12 **hm [1]** 120/19 **hold [1]** 47/8 holidays [1] 170/7 home [18] 9/9 21/3 21/7 42/8 55/8 80/11 80/25 81/1 148/18 150/25 158/4 200/12 210/4 210/8 210/9 210/11 210/12 210/13 76/22 77/3 77/4 80/10 homes [11] 206/25 206/25 207/10 207/11 207/13 208/16 209/1 209/9 209/21 210/12 211/11 honest [9] 54/12 54/21 54/21 66/2 66/2 66/24 67/25 68/7 68/14

Н	95/7 95/15	I confess [1] 61/19	29/10 38/6 74/2 75/4	I retained [1] 123/20
honestly [1] 61/25	hundreds [2] 61/21	I correct [2] 5/7	75/6 78/11 79/11	I said [4] 35/9 107/9
honesty [1] 55/4	65/6	98/24	81/12 81/12 81/13	121/20 178/21
Honourable [1] 95/7	hygiene [2] 191/18	I could [7] 78/21	81/14 85/20 88/16	I say [10] 45/2 88/4
hoof [2] 14/21 15/2	196/18	125/6 154/9 184/3	95/23 96/9 99/5 108/9	
hope [6] 1/24 45/3	Hyslop [2] 33/14 33/15	184/14 198/5 203/16	114/20 122/17 134/24 154/5 158/13 176/9	156/14 163/17 168/9 168/11 209/17
94/20 130/5 131/23	33/13	I couldn't [6] 73/21 111/17 141/8 172/18		I set [1] 75/2
140/1	I	208/10 209/5	206/8	I shall [1] 62/17
hoped [1] 55/15	I abide [1] 113/22	I currently [1] 20/21	I haven't [1] 81/17	I should [5] 32/6 72/3
hopefully [1] 20/1 hospital [6] 41/22	I absolutely [2] 166/6	I did [9] 50/10 51/4	I heard [1] 92/22	85/8 94/12 138/23
186/16 207/1 207/9	180/8	65/19 81/7 82/19 98/1		I sort of [1] 10/14
207/11 210/3	I accept [1] 117/6	105/25 126/20 166/7	131/23	I sought [1] 16/2
hospitality [4] 99/15	I actively [1] 81/9 I actually [1] 22/15	I didn't [7] 10/9 51/12 59/19 74/11 125/6		I spoke [1] 175/5
164/11 201/21 202/9	l advised [1] 9/18	163/6 167/16	l just [8] 17/24 20/15	I submitted [2] 70/20 70/24
hospitals [8] 173/5	l agree [4] 13/20	I discussed [1]	43/17 62/4 86/5 93/9	I suggest [1] 166/4
173/7 173/23 178/14	22/21 104/1 203/23	147/20	97/15 100/3	I suggested [1]
208/15 209/1 209/8 209/20		I do [11] 3/22 30/4	I kept [1] 32/2	110/13
hotspots [1] 188/11	163/22 210/7	62/3 72/9 83/1 83/24	I kind [1] 203/23	I suppose [3] 59/19
hour [1] 175/10	l always [4] 5/19	84/5 86/5 116/10	I knew [3] 58/4 93/25	159/17 209/6
hours [6] 17/1 31/19	86/21 163/19 180/17 I am [14] 1/10 16/1	173/20 198/7	163/10	I suspect [2] 151/11
31/19 100/14 105/11	22/1 30/10 45/1 46/3	i don't [37] 12/20 13/4 13/23 15/21 18/3	I know [9] 11/21 90/14 101/3 101/3	194/4 I then [3] 72/3 77/2
114/21	47/18 71/16 71/19	18/4 22/2 23/12 24/21	151/7 162/9 162/12	197/16
house [4] 9/12 79/21	79/12 82/19 98/20	25/19 31/6 31/15	178/8 208/5	I think [224]
80/23 176/25 household [2] 47/19	121/24 202/6	35/25 52/25 60/25	I look [2] 158/10	I thought [7] 37/6
102/3	I answer [1] 100/2	61/19 66/10 74/15	166/14	61/11 79/10 79/13
households [9]	l appear [2] 89/1	81/10 82/19 85/25	I made [2] 186/6	81/6 123/9 167/19
20/17 20/25 102/5	206/14 I appreciate [3]	90/7 93/11 94/5 94/5 94/12 97/24 110/5	208/2	I told [2] 70/18 70/19
102/6 189/4 191/24	68/21 86/8 207/14	133/14 140/4 157/20	I may [1] 176/3 I mean [6] 40/22	I treat [1] 78/2 I understand [14]
200/4 203/1 203/1	l ask [4] 89/21 92/20	159/3 160/22 162/12	41/17 43/4 44/3 52/13	
houses [1] 21/12	118/20 128/19	179/5 196/8 205/19	209/10	91/19 96/2 96/25
how [56] 16/6 16/7 22/11 23/3 23/11	l asked [4] 57/16	I endeavour [1]	I meant [1] 10/9	97/16 98/21 123/13
24/18 28/7 33/18	70/23 71/10 104/23	100/13	I might [3] 75/15	149/11 158/6 205/22
34/10 37/22 40/10	l assume [2] 20/19 121/23	l ended [1] 93/11	75/16 84/23	209/22
41/15 42/22 44/22	Lattended [3] 50/12	1 expect [4] 77/18 77/20 78/12 91/19	I move [1] 211/12 I needed [2] 93/25	I understood [1] 116/12
53/18 60/5 71/7 72/11	51/2 79/21	I felt [2] 22/23 90/9	175/17	I use [2] 118/10
72/11 72/15 77/22 81/15 84/1 85/6 93/11	I believe [10] 2/25	I first [1] 182/3	I never [1] 166/2	207/20
98/15 99/8 104/14	14/10/20/17/01/25	I found [4] 90/6 94/5	I note [1] 77/1	I used [1] 123/21
106/18 107/25 111/17	83/12 99/9 99/20	123/20 146/8	I now [5] 3/23 49/19	I want [4] 37/12
115/19 116/8 116/16	164/8 178/21 192/8 I can [22] 1/16 28/18	I gather [1] 154/2	62/25 68/24 78/8	45/10 76/13 100/8
118/1 121/16 122/3	31/1 32/25 33/4 34/9	I gave [1] 76/22 I generally [1] 53/24	I particularly [1] 44/11	I wanted [13] 1/11 2/21 27/20 37/1 43/10
131/8 136/24 139/1	55/20 57/2 61/11	I genuinely [2] 80/18	I place [1] 69/3	52/23 56/12 56/12
147/3 147/6 147/18 147/21 148/11 155/2	64/23 65/2 67/25	81/5	I played [1] 6/18	59/7 83/11 136/14
155/8 158/16 165/23	79/12 82/9 95/11 96/1	I get [2] 43/20 85/7	I please [1] 1/4	142/3 202/14
165/24 166/3 171/12	100/3 107/13 141/2	I give [1] 13/4	I press [1] 209/3	I was [28] 8/11 13/11
182/14 192/3 198/17	163/4 191/20 210/5	I go [4] 162/1 180/21	I probably [1] 175/4	13/13 22/15 29/13
203/10	I can't [15] 43/5 44/15 58/3 61/22	195/19 214/4 I had [25] 13/12	I provide [1] 76/20 I provided [1] 76/20	44/15 63/21 70/19 81/1 93/22 93/24
However [2] 100/10	63/20 65/18 71/14	50/19 51/15 51/21	I recall [1] 49/15	132/18 136/9 140/7
156/20	74/10 81/7 81/8 81/9	52/3 52/4 70/19 71/5	I received [2] 70/18	141/16 163/11 163/19
huge [3] 171/23 172/5 191/13	86/16 140/25 203/24	79/11 79/11 79/13	184/14	165/22 169/25 170/19
hugely [2] 22/21	212/20	81/6 84/13 124/5	I regret [2] 79/9 81/5	179/13 179/15 182/5
41/19	I can't recollect [1]	124/5 130/22 137/3	I reiterate [3] 115/2	183/11 193/11 194/1
human [3] 18/14 19/1	62/2 I certainly [1] 159/4	146/10 148/15 163/7	207/25 208/2	201/8 201/11
157/10	I changed [1] 125/7	167/10 168/4 182/12 192/11 202/1	I remember [5] 80/22 163/24 167/16 192/1	I wasn't [1] 52/13 I went [5] 124/7
Humza [4] 95/7 95/8	I characterised [1]	I hadn't [1] 51/23	201/5	124/8 149/19 191/17
95/15 215/13 Humza Yousaf [2]	44/23	I have [31] 1/25	I respond [1] 100/4	194/19
Tiumza Tousal [2]	I check [1] 1/8	16/10 28/5 29/10	I retain [1] 71/24	I were [1] 132/17

141/16 141/18 142/18 implicit [1] 209/6 I'm at [1] 162/23 increasing [1] I've [15] 16/10 43/20 143/4 143/22 144/4 importance [6] 18/5 182/21 I will [6] 10/20 16/19 18/15 18/16 35/3 55/4 increasingly [1] 47/11 60/24 81/5 144/18 145/16 147/22 121/25 147/22 154/3 81/17 90/4 94/14 149/19 150/8 151/21 141/14 47/18 214/13 115/21 149/25 152/21 153/4 153/8 153/19 important [43] 8/9 incredibly [5] 52/15 I wish [2] 81/7 152/21 153/12 162/22 154/3 154/9 155/24 8/17 17/25 38/17 84/18 90/7 195/20 206/17 156/7 157/5 159/3 44/13 53/3 69/2 72/7 205/21 203/7 I won't [2] 7/24 78/9 162/13 162/18 163/3 72/10 72/14 72/17 ICU [3] 203/21 indecision [1] 17/22 I worked [2] 30/21 203/24 205/15 163/7 165/22 165/24 92/4 103/8 104/2 indeed [24] 1/10 3/20 idea [2] 49/17 82/17 165/25 166/1 167/15 104/4 107/19 112/10 24/7 56/20 91/24 92/4 I would [64] 4/19 ideal [2] 34/7 35/9 170/22 176/1 178/4 113/10 113/22 114/9 94/15 107/1 110/25 6/11 9/18 9/20 13/20 114/10 116/6 117/8 ideas [2] 7/8 41/8 184/5 184/13 185/14 111/4 113/14 116/15 14/23 17/18 30/3 30/9 identified [7] 61/2 188/20 189/19 191/1 121/18 126/23 132/25 123/11 129/2 130/9 44/4 46/2 53/10 53/16 61/3 62/6 67/1 101/7 191/21 192/3 194/12 133/12 133/17 133/19 131/5 131/14 137/14 54/3 54/7 59/20 74/15 144/7 161/19 169/16 197/2 198/15 197/19 198/5 199/18 133/25 146/5 149/15 75/8 75/18 76/10 identify [3] 42/8 199/25 201/17 201/19 152/22 153/19 161/3 184/9 186/7 197/13 76/24 78/3 79/9 79/24 201/20 202/3 202/12 161/12 164/22 166/5 55/20 213/19 independence [38] 80/2 82/21 84/24 ideology [1] 42/18 203/16 205/13 205/16 184/3 192/23 194/16 27/24 27/25 28/6 28/8 88/15 89/5 98/3 201/14 201/16 idiots [1] 189/19 209/17 212/17 213/22 28/20 29/12 29/16 110/19 117/6 126/8 ie [2] 191/23 204/2 30/7 30/18 30/23 213/22 impose [2] 102/2 127/18 129/12 130/4 if [201] 1/15 7/12 ignored [1] 41/13 205/17 31/11 31/16 31/18 130/25 130/25 131/3 11/12 13/10 13/16 illness [2] 205/13 imposed [2] 167/23 31/20 31/22 31/23 133/11 137/18 146/25 13/19 14/1 15/11 207/2 194/12 45/19 46/2 50/4 50/11 151/6 157/4 157/5 15/21 15/22 16/2 16/5 illnesses [1] 184/7 **imposing [1]** 193/14 51/3 51/9 51/11 51/14 162/4 163/7 163/10 16/12 16/22 17/6 17/8 51/18 51/25 52/8 illustrate [1] 172/20 impossible [1] 164/5 166/11 169/25 17/22 18/3 20/10 52/11 52/20 84/1 84/2 imagine [2] 103/3 205/16 175/15 176/10 180/23 86/13 87/1 88/3 88/20 20/18 21/18 22/13 **impression** [7] 60/18 208/11 182/3 184/8 185/25 23/20 23/22 24/2 imagined [1] 204/20 64/10 124/17 157/25 138/16 138/17 138/24 186/5 193/24 194/9 24/10 24/11 24/13 immediate [3] 75/22 158/1 183/2 183/6 independent [2] 84/7 204/21 206/19 207/14 24/13 24/17 25/5 25/7 135/20 193/13 88/14 improve [1] 89/24 209/10 26/21 27/13 27/16 immediately [4] **improved [3]** 89/12 **INDEX [1]** 214/19 I wouldn't [4] 18/14 28/11 28/18 28/18 101/18 109/1 136/7 99/9 99/21 indicate [4] 57/17 107/7 123/20 181/4 29/11 30/9 30/11 136/23 improving [1] 94/8 120/25 190/17 204/12 I wrote [1] 36/2 32/13 32/22 32/25 immigration [2] **inaccurate** [1] 66/22 indicated [2] 78/11 I'd [7] 37/6 66/23 34/9 34/14 37/15 42/8 142/11 143/10 inappropriate [1] 78/14 98/11 134/7 168/14 42/24 43/23 45/7 25/6 immune [5] 182/10 indicating [2] 109/7 176/6 199/18 45/10 45/16 45/19 198/12 199/1 199/16 inbound [1] 143/9 211/25 **I'II [7]** 4/25 21/17 78/9 46/8 46/10 46/22 203/5 **indication [1]** 109/25 inbox [1] 74/2 89/7 155/23 191/3 47/12 49/17 54/1 54/4 immune-escape [1] indirect [2] 180/15 **inboxes** [1] 74/5 206/21 55/17 56/7 56/21 198/12 include [8] 56/19 184/17 l'm [64] 21/24 32/22 56/24 57/2 58/7 59/5 impact [29] 9/25 99/1 99/1 99/2 127/6 individual [6] 56/4 37/3 45/1 45/6 47/11 60/3 61/9 61/23 62/11 23/24 33/18 33/19 130/14 157/1 190/21 56/8 60/11 63/19 65/9 47/19 57/20 58/22 63/3 65/6 65/11 65/18 34/12 38/21 55/14 168/3 included [6] 8/3 61/16 68/16 71/14 29/18 53/7 126/15 67/13 70/16 71/17 60/21 86/1 135/24 individuals [4] 34/14 72/5 72/6 73/7 81/6 72/6 74/12 75/17 142/1 143/24 145/12 127/2 130/7 61/3 61/8 100/6 81/19 81/25 82/25 76/12 77/9 77/23 78/1 150/10 150/15 157/19 includes [1] 127/4 indoor [3] 20/25 86/5 88/25 89/3 89/9 78/20 80/8 80/24 160/20 160/25 178/5 21/12 169/15 including [16] 11/21 90/24 91/3 92/12 81/19 82/10 83/4 83/7 180/16 184/2 185/3 28/14 35/2 75/13 indoors [8] 20/10 92/12 111/19 115/10 84/20 84/25 85/2 85/5 185/5 185/17 194/17 79/22 98/6 99/2 20/13 20/21 20/24 121/24 124/10 128/5 85/15 86/23 87/6 198/17 205/18 209/24 114/19 124/24 124/25 21/2 21/22 102/3 136/3 147/23 151/2 87/18 87/25 88/7 211/11 130/16 135/4 185/17 189/3 152/14 153/14 156/20 88/17 89/23 90/16 impacted [7] 90/21 189/3 202/8 202/17 industry [3] 99/16 157/21 158/10 162/13 91/20 91/25 92/6 92/9 106/16 135/18 160/5 99/19 164/11 incompetence [1] 162/23 163/14 166/10 184/4 184/5 184/16 93/17 93/20 93/24 38/3 inevitable [1] 137/18 166/18 166/19 171/14 93/25 95/18 100/3 impacting [2] 35/24 incompetent [1] 43/1 inevitably [1] 198/24 171/18 172/20 176/7 102/2 102/2 104/5 185/9 infected [3] 135/3 incorrect [1] 72/7 180/19 183/6 186/12 105/10 106/9 106/14 impacts [5] 178/2 increase [9] 32/14 172/3 172/4 190/10 193/25 202/2 106/21 108/4 117/23 180/16 186/24 193/1 57/8 61/4 148/1 infection [3] 186/3 204/3 204/4 207/25 122/3 126/19 127/12 160/23 181/19 186/21 187/13 211/10 201/12 210/2 213/5 213/5 127/21 127/23 129/18 impartiality [1] 4/8 188/3 203/10 infections [3] 172/6 214/9 214/11 130/3 130/22 131/2 implement [1] increased [4] 158/22 178/13 185/24 I'm afraid [5] 86/5 131/24 132/15 132/17 181/21 160/9 177/20 195/12 infectious [1] 197/3 115/10 136/3 186/12 132/22 133/6 136/2 implications [2] increases [2] 171/23 **inform [5]** 73/15 214/11 138/7 138/8 140/4 46/11 143/2 203/24 85/12 122/7 126/18

31/25 62/25 183/12 51/21 64/3 183/6 183/19 190/8 inquiries [2] 114/2 interested [11] 89/5 involving [2] 17/4 195/3 197/20 198/5 inform... [1] 130/25 114/11 106/14 117/25 140/7 129/2 200/3 200/4 200/7 **informal [17]** 2/13 inquiry [56] 1/7 1/17 151/2 152/14 154/24 Ireland [8] 36/15 202/3 202/6 203/2 18/19 19/10 25/15 2/3 2/11 4/14 10/19 156/20 157/21 170/12 40/25 41/12 42/2 214/11 29/20 30/1 68/25 70/2 12/15 14/15 14/17 179/18 42/17 46/23 141/22 its [17] 23/20 40/11 114/18 114/25 115/20 15/17 16/7 16/23 17/6 interests [5] 7/17 143/25 113/9 133/1 134/14 118/6 118/25 119/4 69/16 69/18 69/25 116/7 144/24 146/13 135/12 139/15 142/14 irrespective [1] 119/9 122/5 212/21 70/11 70/16 70/20 196/4 184/21 176/15 178/5 179/4 information [58] 7/2 70/21 71/3 72/4 73/4 179/7 188/1 193/24 intergovernmental is [515] 7/11 7/13 13/12 13/13 **[2]** 36/7 174/21 78/13 78/16 79/10 isn't [14] 17/15 22/19 199/16 201/18 213/21 13/14 15/3 16/2 25/23 81/4 81/19 86/6 95/9 internal [4] 146/16 88/21 125/22 134/2 itself [3] 56/9 67/5 25/24 26/17 26/24 95/18 102/24 108/9 146/21 146/22 152/6 154/25 164/23 165/12 113/4 27/3 57/7 57/12 57/17 108/12 110/4 112/22 international [11] 165/16 165/21 167/23 59/21 62/1 63/7 66/20 113/17 113/23 113/23 61/23 63/13 66/6 173/5 187/15 204/10 67/20 67/21 68/1 68/3 issue [35] 27/18 29/8 Jack [2] 140/16 114/11 114/22 115/15 142/2 142/20 144/19 68/15 75/12 75/20 115/15 115/21 118/6 145/1 145/17 145/20 44/11 44/22 45/2 46/2 140/18 76/14 76/21 76/22 January [9] 1/1 2/24 123/14 127/9 129/5 156/22 208/21 46/18 51/18 56/7 85/23 91/6 91/11 3/8 118/17 158/3 131/23 133/24 152/4 interpretation [7] 60/17 63/23 64/2 91/25 106/23 106/25 178/9 209/23 214/12 9/21 117/17 117/17 64/25 65/20 85/1 158/14 203/17 209/4 112/20 116/8 116/12 214/18 110/8 114/18 115/23 215/5 215/15 117/21 126/9 204/17 117/18 119/20 120/5 January 2012 [1] Inquiry's [2] 14/15 204/17 136/14 142/17 146/5 120/12 122/22 131/7 2/24 70/18 interrupt [1] 213/5 151/21 157/22 187/11 131/20 132/3 132/9 197/22 207/13 207/22 January 2015 [1] 3/8 insight [3] 17/5 17/8 interventions [7] 134/12 134/25 145/3 9/19 88/10 177/12 207/23 208/4 208/14 January 2021 [1] 166/21 145/4 154/24 174/19 178/1 178/20 195/16 208/19 210/6 212/8 158/3 insights [2] 19/5 174/23 183/22 198/8 Jason [11] 83/17 98/15 203/9 214/2 214/5 198/10 83/22 108/17 110/3 issued [7] 82/7 82/12 installs [1] 82/20 intimated [1] 155/10 informed [6] 14/5 110/9 132/17 165/3 instance [11] 19/17 into [63] 2/4 11/2 82/17 118/13 149/1 42/2 65/13 101/5 166/7 187/21 188/19 24/6 26/6 27/8 53/7 14/12 15/8 17/8 24/8 151/17 152/3 147/21 165/1 202/25 53/14 79/19 80/9 31/13 32/20 37/13 issues [26] 29/16 informing [1] 102/18 Jason Leitch [3] 80/15 83/16 167/15 41/3 45/14 46/11 36/11 39/14 67/7 infrastructure [3] 75/22 85/14 85/14 83/17 83/22 187/21 instances [6] 26/5 48/20 49/8 49/21 52/7 210/21 210/21 210/25 **JBC [1]** 145/4 83/15 83/25 86/1 71/7 73/11 74/25 85/19 89/4 115/23 inhibit [1] 137/11 122/18 133/19 138/12 Jeane [4] 58/14 99/18 107/13 75/13 76/15 80/14 initial [1] 207/3 69/23 80/24 97/9 Instead [1] 188/11 83/2 83/6 83/14 83/17 145/24 151/13 157/15 initially [2] 50/16 84/8 91/2 98/15 109/2 Jeane Freeman [3] instinct [3] 190/14 174/1 175/12 176/1 71/24 58/14 69/23 80/24 193/23 196/7 111/11 112/11 112/16 179/14 180/15 187/2 inject [1] 52/7 job [9] 23/14 23/16 122/8 129/17 132/21 187/6 193/3 197/25 instinctive [2] 192/20 input [3] 49/8 78/4 36/5 50/13 50/14 90/2 192/22 138/8 143/5 153/21 210/10 109/11 91/8 109/1 109/21 instincts [3] 191/4 156/3 156/19 162/2 it [497] INQ000214456 [1] John [4] 26/7 26/11 191/10 192/8 163/24 166/21 169/21 it'd [2] 176/5 196/10 158/10 178/18 180/6 181/3 it's [86] 4/23 5/13 27/6 119/7 instructed [4] 89/1 INQ000225995 [1] 181/5 182/3 182/9 6/13 8/8 9/16 18/23 John Swinney [4] 115/22 139/17 206/14 56/16 26/7 26/11 27/6 119/7 182/21 184/11 191/22 20/11 20/13 21/5 22/7 instructions [1] INQ000241655 [1] 191/23 197/17 198/21 22/19 25/3 25/14 Johnson [4] 8/6 95/12 212/3 37/10 39/5 39/10 205/25 208/15 209/1 25/15 28/23 32/23 instrument [1] 33/8 INQ000273956 [2] 34/5 34/6 35/14 35/15 Joint [2] 145/4 integral [2] 148/12 209/8 210/4 213/20 95/19 206/20 178/10 intra [1] 144/10 168/6 35/16 35/22 35/22 INQ000273973 [1] 36/2 36/3 36/4 36/22 journalists [1] 134/5 intelligent [1] 39/13 intra-governmental 96/5 36/23 37/4 37/8 39/25 journals [1] 208/21 intend [1] 52/25 **[1]** 144/10 INQ000274004 [1] judge [2] 8/11 59/20 41/22 49/6 56/17 intense [1] 80/1 introduce [2] 138/6 2/12 56/17 60/5 61/23 judgement [4] intensity [1] 163/8 201/21 INQ000274006 [1] 151/12 151/19 192/21 61/24 63/21 69/2 intention [3] 128/4 introduced [2] 1/19 71/25 73/12 75/3 75/8 192/22 128/6 147/21 138/13 158/4 INQ000287766 [2] 77/7 83/24 85/18 87/2 July [2] 69/6 70/11 inverted [1] 159/1 intentionally [1] 10/23 19/22 87/21 91/14 92/1 July **2020 [1]** 69/6 74/17 involve [1] 137/25 INQ000319509 [1] 93/11 94/8 94/9 95/19 July 2023 [1] 70/11 interact [1] 23/3 involved [12] 9/23 118/20 jump [2] 166/10 interacting [1] 175/7 30/9 50/11 69/15 96/5 115/2 116/20 INQ000334682 [1] 130/22 132/20 133/12 168/15 interaction [5] 89/16 108/11 117/1 137/19 166/14 141/9 158/7 187/14 140/13 142/17 153/4 June [16] 20/12 21/2 147/5 147/8 149/17 INQ000334792 [3] 21/6 21/10 28/10 149/20 192/24 200/24 153/18 154/11 155/23 108/15 162/1 187/19 28/24 86/7 97/4 158/13 160/1 160/2 interest [5] 57/10 involvement [6] 3/25 INQ000346141 [2] 113/20 176/19 190/10 128/15 140/13 144/15 23/7 26/12 49/24 166/17 167/13 182/10

Kenneth [1] 142/5 **Lady [16]** 1/4 37/1 84/21 106/16 115/22 204/20 kept [2] 32/2 61/5 61/16 62/22 68/21 205/25 lift [3] 89/20 162/18 June... [5] 193/7 Kevin [1] 119/11 86/2 92/17 95/6 95/14 left [4] 49/19 81/1 165/25 196/25 197/1 211/22 **Kevin Stewart [1]** 153/16 153/21 154/8 90/15 120/5 lifting [5] 41/24 42/14 211/25 119/11 206/8 212/3 214/7 legal [2] 154/12 42/16 42/18 89/14 June 2020 [1] 211/22 key [11] 9/2 25/16 214/14 190/16 light [3] 80/16 202/11 June 2021 [2] 176/19 legislation [4] 138/13 204/13 52/2 115/5 115/13 **Lady's [1]** 100/2 211/25 116/13 126/9 126/16 **Ladyship [2]** 37/5 138/18 152/13 155/4 lightly [1] 185/13 jurisdictions [1] legislative [1] 7/3 126/18 133/1 174/23 95/24 like [51] 7/12 13/10 141/21 13/16 15/11 16/3 kicked [1] 11/2 laid [1] 123/8 **legitimate** [1] 57/10 just [93] 11/19 11/19 kind [11] 10/17 23/5 leisure [1] 202/9 16/12 17/8 17/22 landed [1] 157/1 17/24 19/25 20/13 23/10 42/4 43/15 language [4] 37/2 22/25 23/20 24/2 Leitch [39] 54/8 20/15 21/24 22/7 65/14 65/16 68/6 80/7 37/8 44/4 167/9 83/17 83/22 84/16 24/17 27/13 27/16 22/18 22/19 25/18 177/22 203/23 large [4] 28/2 124/24 84/25 108/17 109/15 37/19 39/9 39/13 31/25 32/16 32/16 Kingdom [4] 42/25 125/3 187/3 109/16 109/20 111/9 46/22 51/1 60/3 60/6 32/22 33/4 37/9 43/17 171/6 194/5 213/11 largely [6] 41/13 125/1 127/8 128/20 61/2 61/24 62/12 44/9 44/10 45/14 47/2 49/14 52/21 75/2 129/8 132/4 162/7 67/13 78/20 79/9 kits [2] 168/25 47/11 47/18 51/6 196/17 141/25 205/12 162/8 162/15 163/16 80/24 83/5 84/20 89/5 53/24 61/19 62/4 knew [12] 58/4 85/5 larger [1] 68/2 165/19 175/2 175/8 90/16 91/19 93/21 62/23 65/15 66/12 175/16 175/23 175/25 93/25 98/11 134/7 85/25 93/25 103/9 last [10] 12/17 66/17 68/9 72/5 78/24 176/11 187/21 188/19 140/19 144/4 150/22 163/10 178/6 180/9 104/22 123/24 145/6 84/13 86/4 86/5 88/21 153/17 162/4 163/25 180/10 180/17 181/17 149/23 152/2 159/21 189/16 190/5 190/12 89/5 89/8 90/17 91/11 182/6 167/2 188/1 188/3 190/22 193/17 194/22 166/11 168/14 179/14 92/20 93/9 95/18 knocking [1] 36/3 last resort [1] 152/2 199/23 200/2 200/13 179/25 181/3 200/9 97/15 100/3 106/1 200/15 203/22 206/19 207/14 know [75] 7/2 7/10 late [8] 1/25 2/1 31/8 114/9 114/20 116/20 11/21 13/19 14/8 31/13 79/25 80/14 **Leitch's [1]** 109/11 liked [1] 28/2 117/9 119/13 120/16 16/23 17/11 18/6 197/21 198/11 likely [7] 24/16 54/1 lengths [2] 81/17 121/25 124/8 126/22 19/13 23/15 29/10 later [16] 10/21 13/23 88/15 135/3 135/18 158/21 128/5 131/14 137/10 36/3 38/18 39/13 27/19 43/4 79/3 79/21 Leonard [1] 83/18 160/8 182/1 142/17 143/5 144/1 41/19 44/5 45/1 48/25 88/12 135/25 136/6 less [10] 27/23 82/21 likes [1] 157/9 144/23 151/13 153/12 131/11 172/10 172/21 limit [4] 14/25 15/14 54/2 55/8 58/20 58/24 140/2 162/2 185/8 154/9 154/19 158/12 18/17 60/7 60/10 60/12 61/10 193/5 197/18 202/3 176/17 176/23 183/4 161/15 163/6 165/22 62/13 64/23 65/8 211/22 191/24 191/24 limitations [2] 202/24 166/20 170/22 174/13 65/19 67/22 67/23 lateral [1] 168/25 lesser [2] 79/8 79/16 210/24 177/22 187/24 188/11 67/24 68/3 71/25 72/1 latest [2] 95/13 lessons [3] 114/15 limited [6] 63/7 190/11 193/12 193/15 73/18 74/4 74/5 74/7 164/8 208/17 140/16 140/24 141/4 166/21 194/14 194/15 195/1 75/6 75/22 76/13 law [1] 149/2 let [7] 37/18 44/9 200/22 203/1 195/8 195/21 196/21 76/20 77/3 77/5 78/1 44/10 100/10 114/19 lawmakers [1] limiting [2] 200/3 199/25 200/7 202/10 78/6 78/20 80/25 81/5 114/21 163/3 203/1 157/14 205/1 213/5 lead [7] 13/11 31/17 81/10 82/19 83/2 let's [3] 14/5 47/23 limits [3] 58/24 74/7 justice [6] 97/3 134/9 87/12 88/19 90/14 50/16 52/3 95/9 152/8 76/23 154/7 135/14 135/17 137/12 90/22 93/25 101/3 215/15 **letter [1]** 165/16 line [7] 41/10 67/8 146/11 101/3 106/14 118/1 leader [1] 83/19 level [291 23/20 27/9 84/22 93/21 94/2 Justice Secretary [1] 118/2 133/25 142/5 leaders [1] 43/2 60/22 92/13 111/24 156/3 212/15 146/11 151/7 153/19 158/3 112/2 112/10 112/13 link [5] 56/22 58/16 **leadership [3]** 87/15 161/20 162/9 162/12 112/16 112/17 137/19 59/2 60/19 62/4 167/12 168/7 165/3 178/8 203/2 leading [4] 53/7 140/12 140/15 148/21 list [21] 10/15 59/11 Kate [2] 69/23 200/19 96/17 116/17 117/2 61/21 62/5 105/20 208/5 150/2 153/9 169/13 Kate Forbes [1] know: [1] 49/16 lean [1] 67/19 169/14 178/9 178/11 110/7 110/7 110/10 69/23 185/12 185/12 185/13 knowing [3] 75/25 leaning [1] 47/18 142/22 142/22 142/22 **KC [4]** 88/24 206/13 146/2 191/3 learn [1] 164/8 188/7 188/21 189/14 142/25 143/4 143/5 215/9 215/18 knowledge [4] 2/8 learned [2] 89/3 196/11 203/10 205/17 143/18 145/11 145/18 keen [5] 41/19 46/3 185/1 186/21 208/16 2/18 73/5 207/5 114/16 level 2 [2] 112/17 46/3 160/13 214/1 learning [1] 199/15 known [15] 1/8 55/24 169/14 212/2 keep [12] 1/13 23/20 58/17 60/11 60/19 learnt [1] 208/18 level 3 [4] 27/9 listen [3] 90/2 90/11 32/4 56/7 72/3 117/12 61/7 65/24 66/8 66/9 112/16 169/13 188/7 91/23 least [9] 8/10 31/6 193/18 193/20 199/24 143/17 181/21 182/22 53/3 53/21 54/10 levels [14] 27/7 listened [1] 92/6 204/23 204/24 214/2 listening [1] 39/21 208/20 212/5 213/1 58/12 88/1 110/2 27/13 40/19 111/10 keeping [4] 32/7 74/8 111/14 111/15 153/2 lists [2] 142/21 193/6 116/16 189/13 leave [5] 3/18 11/19 153/8 185/22 186/3 143/10 ken [3] 9/10 190/15 Labour [1] 83/19 30/15 87/4 188/6 186/15 186/18 190/4 **literally [3]** 162/16 190/15 lack [2] 198/18 leaving [1] 208/25 195/13 165/1 165/6 ken Thomson [1] 198/24 led [9] 49/14 52/21 **liaising [1]** 146/25 littering [1] 150/13 9/10 lacking [1] 92/11 little [10] 20/1 20/3 64/17 66/15 84/2 life [3] 23/2 185/10

little... [8] 44/19 51/4 81/1 92/2 99/6 137/8 154/10 193/5 live [4] 23/11 196/21 205/2 207/22 lived [2] 184/9 195/22 livelihoods [1] 90/21 lives [6] 22/11 55/9 90/21 185/15 186/13 204/10 livid [1] 167/2 living [3] 22/11 195/9 204/10 **Liz [2]** 1/9 71/18 Liz Lloyd [1] 1/9 Lloyd [7] 1/5 1/6 1/9 89/1 92/20 94/15 215/3 local [6] 27/7 64/12 112/2 112/13 112/15 158/25 located [1] 61/8 lock [1] 37/18 lockdown [12] 32/18 37/11 41/4 45/15 60/21 79/18 80/17 80/21 158/16 204/23 204/24 205/18 logging [2] 124/12 124/13 logistical [1] 80/5 **London [1]** 197/6 long [5] 50/22 115/10 170/24 189/14 208/16 long-term [1] 50/22 longer [3] 94/25 123/9 199/9 look [41] 20/10 28/11 31/24 31/25 32/22 43/11 49/14 54/3 54/7 56/16 56/21 59/7 63/2 71/25 87/5 87/25 88/3 95/18 99/5 108/15 112/1 115/22 118/20 131/21 151/6 153/21 157/4 158/10 163/3 164/14 166/14 167/10 180/11 180/11 180/12 182/4 187/17 193/25 196/20 196/24 197/7 looked [9] 14/15 22/9 44/20 63/1 69/13 72/5 87/14 125/2 176/12 looking [30] 7/2 10/24 14/13 19/23 20/4 22/1 26/23 37/7 43/9 44/24 45/1 45/1 45/5 45/6 45/25 57/4 58/23 66/18 66/22 138/4 142/19 142/20

148/1 158/10 166/18

193/7 203/9 looks [4] 43/14 45/18 46/8 86/23 loophole [1] 165/19 lose [3] 189/8 194/15 194/25 losing [5] 186/13 188/5 194/20 195/3 196/1 loss [2] 114/22 212/9 lost [4] 81/10 190/21 204/8 204/14 lot [18] 9/8 9/12 9/12 27/22 44/6 44/8 54/14 66/12 74/1 77/6 80/5 85/23 85/24 87/3 87/13 89/4 204/8 204/19 Lothian [1] 64/10 lots [3] 58/9 189/3 192/18 **loud [1]** 7/5 loved [1] 114/23 **lower [2]** 153/9 171/16 lowest [2] 23/20 188/1 luck [1] 193/23 lunch [1] 94/25

M2 [1] 92/21 **MACA [1]** 173/15 Macaskill [1] 211/17 made [108] 8/18 12/17 14/21 14/24 16/8 16/14 16/15 19/25 25/14 41/14 50/23 56/2 66/1 72/8 72/15 81/11 84/18 88/12 99/10 99/17 99/25 100/18 100/24 101/5 101/8 101/18 101/21 101/24 101/25 102/19 102/20 102/20 102/23 103/3 103/20 103/24 104/8 104/14 104/15 104/18 105/12 105/14 105/24 106/2 106/19 107/3 108/6 110/14 111/3 112/9 112/17 115/15 116/13 116/17 116/22 119/7 120/24 121/2 122/5 127/12 127/13 127/22 man [1] 64/9 127/24 128/10 129/15 manage [5] 44/2 74/5 129/19 129/25 130/24 131/1 131/17 132/12 132/14 132/22 133/13 133/21 134/2 138/10 139/3 141/17 141/25 142/1 142/23 142/24 143/2 143/23 145/8

166/19 170/10 190/10 145/19 146/23 146/24 187/12 147/20 154/4 156/14 156/16 157/3 157/9 168/25 173/15 174/17 184/11 186/6 186/8 192/9 192/10 192/14 196/15 201/6 204/25 208/2 Madness [1] 200/10 main [6] 15/19 56/6 56/6 107/5 147/8 174/25 mainland [1] 169/12 maintain [1] 213/12 majority [6] 79/22 80/1 149/16 149/21 164/5 164/15 make [57] 1/23 7/15 7/21 10/12 11/8 11/14 12/8 13/5 13/11 20/13 21/14 23/22 23/23 24/2 27/11 31/4 46/21 47/12 49/17 62/4 72/12 74/7 90/2 90/13 100/21 102/8 102/14 102/17 103/12 104/19 39/25 40/5 80/15 105/21 107/25 108/8 110/7 112/7 116/19 126/8 128/7 130/25 138/17 143/9 143/19 154/5 156/11 163/11 163/19 173/11 180/13 Maree Todd [1] 186/23 191/15 192/6 192/13 204/5 214/2 makers [3] 5/12 25/17 174/24 makes [2] 152/22 189/15 making [49] 5/3 8/1 17/14 18/22 19/4 19/9 25/12 25/13 27/8

29/21 29/22 34/8 36/16 39/22 45/24 46/12 56/9 59/21 67/5 mass [1] 148/9 72/19 72/20 73/2 74/23 77/16 80/16 80/20 87/19 98/12 98/17 99/8 99/13 99/14 99/19 101/10 104/2 104/21 104/23 107/6 117/6 120/2 120/6 121/5 125/20 127/4 142/19 145/22 197/17 198/21 207/17 74/5 183/23 193/23 managed [1] 125/21 management [14] 4/16 4/19 71/22 73/6 73/9 93/5 115/18 116/19 117/7 117/11 117/15 128/11 187/1

manager [1] 93/21 managing [5] 6/16 56/9 67/4 177/2 177/3 manifesting [1] 211/19 manner [1] 151/23 many [15] 6/3 28/7 80/13 100/5 128/14 129/25 147/6 156/8 172/13 173/4 173/8 178/13 181/23 192/3 208/11 map [1] 180/11 March [29] 2/25 3/4 3/8 3/18 8/10 20/10 23/8 30/22 30/22 39/25 40/5 41/18 49/20 53/3 59/7 63/14 64/20 69/10 72/25 79/3 80/15 80/19 96/20 97/13 123/22 136/16 137/7 139/5 211/16 March 2020 [5] 30/22 80/19 March 2021 [7] 8/10 20/10 23/8 30/22 49/20 53/3 72/25 145/10 145/13 151/19 March 2023 [1] 3/18 Maree [1] 119/11 119/11 marginal [2] 200/4 203/2 mark [2] 137/8 193/11 marker [1] 47/16 marketing [1] 164/17 mask [4] 162/13 162/13 164/18 166/2 masks [2] 163/1 165/9 match [4] 64/19 189/9 197/9 197/10 matches [1] 196/14 material [18] 22/1 51/17 73/11 74/9 74/9 78/4 113/25 114/14 115/19 117/23 118/1 118/15 121/14 123/1 128/8 130/14 133/6 154/22 materially [1] 44/13 materials [3] 22/4 118/25 161/15 Matt [2] 120/4 120/4 Matt Hancock [2] 120/4 120/4 matter [25] 30/19 57/10 68/9 68/10

68/13 78/8 82/5 85/3

110/16 121/16 121/19 138/25 142/9 142/12 142/17 143/11 148/22 155/14 155/17 164/25 192/17 213/18 mattered [1] 143/11 matters [7] 1/11 74/13 119/7 126/5 138/20 138/21 154/14 maximalist [5] 159/1 159/9 159/16 160/1 160/21 may [62] 1/4 7/16 7/16 13/22 14/2 17/8 20/19 20/21 20/25 21/5 21/12 25/22 30/2 36/21 42/5 43/5 56/5 62/9 64/13 64/21 65/15 65/15 71/17 72/20 76/19 81/16 91/22 92/20 92/22 97/4 97/7 99/18 101/23 101/25 102/4 102/9 110/23 111/1 122/16 138/1 140/6 143/5 147/3 149/4 150/12 156/19 160/6 169/7 169/12 171/15 176/3 180/19 183/12 185/6 185/6 199/8 209/13 211/12 212/1 212/5 212/24 213/25 May 2021 [3] 97/7 183/12 212/5 May 6/2....is [1] 20/21 maybe [10] 14/11 19/4 21/19 27/6 27/18 31/3 51/24 54/6 134/3 183/6 McVie [4] 152/4 152/20 155/18 157/12 McVie's [1] 157/24 me [66] 6/23 13/24 17/24 20/6 21/14 22/24 29/15 30/4 38/4 53/17 55/4 55/20 59/19 63/22 66/8 72/6 73/23 75/13 75/19 75/20 75/25 76/11 76/24 78/21 81/15 81/19 82/6 85/4 86/2 92/21 93/21 93/22 100/10 100/16 111/17 114/19 114/21 121/20 127/15 129/24 130/24 136/7 140/4 140/5 144/17 144/18 147/21 151/6 154/15 158/12 160/14 163/3 163/15 165/6 165/24 166/5 167/5 182/11 183/13 197/14 199/24 204/22 204/22 208/6 209/5

92/21 94/10 103/23

176/15 122/17 101/16 102/7 102/8 М **mm [1]** 120/19 memory [4] 13/23 might [53] 7/8 18/11 102/14 102/17 102/21 mm-hm [1] 120/19 me... [1] 212/19 63/25 147/22 198/6 18/12 18/12 22/11 103/9 104/13 104/20 mobile [7] 73/16 mean [24] 6/23 22/8 73/19 81/21 81/23 mental [6] 23/17 23/5 24/13 26/23 105/2 105/7 105/14 22/10 23/17 23/18 23/24 184/2 184/6 27/25 32/25 33/2 34/1 107/24 109/25 110/6 115/18 119/25 123/5 29/7 31/15 40/17 186/22 186/24 43/20 43/21 45/3 45/3 110/15 110/24 111/14 mock [1] 21/10 40/22 41/17 43/4 46/21 47/17 51/15 112/7 112/9 112/19 model [1] 160/15 mention [2] 98/16 43/24 44/3 52/13 58/7 66/20 67/3 74/13 127/23 128/13 128/23 modelled [1] 24/15 140/10 81/16 93/9 99/24 mentioned [4] 75/5 75/15 75/16 129/5 129/6 130/7 modelling [1] 136/8 111/13 138/25 164/1 116/11 179/24 183/17 75/17 82/17 84/23 130/23 131/2 140/3 module [4] 70/6 95/9 164/2 185/8 193/2 197/18 86/10 86/23 98/15 140/7 140/15 152/15 170/12 215/16 209/10 107/1 107/2 112/3 154/9 156/17 166/9 merit [2] 47/23 48/2 moment [4] 17/9 meaning [2] 116/17 message [7] 11/12 116/24 126/23 135/24 169/8 169/18 171/19 17/11 18/10 201/7 159/17 13/6 16/22 20/11 140/19 147/3 150/15 192/1 192/7 192/7 moments [3] 18/14 means [11] 15/10 37/15 44/18 192/5 150/20 155/3 168/17 192/21 194/11 202/19 19/8 66/14 34/13 36/19 36/20 messages [98] 2/14 190/19 198/6 199/1 203/14 204/12 206/14 Monday [2] 214/13 66/10 118/8 151/3 10/18 11/7 16/5 17/6 199/5 199/9 200/20 208/24 213/5 214/9 214/18 153/19 195/5 195/12 19/23 36/25 37/12 200/22 202/20 210/1 Minister's [12] 6/18 money [4] 36/21 204/2 43/11 47/1 47/5 53/12 migrated [2] 124/5 13/8 56/19 77/3 77/15 190/21 200/14 201/20 meant [7] 5/23 10/9 69/2 69/5 69/9 69/13 77/16 107/18 109/23 124/6 monitoring [1] 14/22 67/6 103/24 128/25 133/22 191/10 158/25 69/14 69/19 69/23 military [2] 173/13 159/7 159/9 69/24 70/5 70/8 70/10 178/14 194/12 month [4] 79/1 measure [1] 138/6 70/12 70/16 70/19 million [2] 190/19 ministerial [6] 5/4 5/5 119/23 122/25 202/4 measures [8] 35/25 70/24 71/2 71/3 71/6 190/24 97/23 107/20 134/3 monthly [1] 176/19 46/19 46/21 55/2 71/8 71/11 71/12 mind [7] 13/24 15/22 214/6 months [6] 66/21 139/12 140/4 196/12 71/24 72/6 72/10 73/2 45/10 45/11 65/23 ministers [26] 4/6 69/12 140/2 204/9 205/7 74/19 74/22 74/24 183/9 183/11 5/12 5/13 6/2 6/25 210/22 210/23 mechanism [3] 77/9 78/2 78/12 78/15 minds [1] 183/15 6/25 7/4 24/11 25/20 mood [1] 9/22 122/23 128/22 150/17 78/18 78/25 79/4 mindset [2] 115/10 26/1 39/18 40/22 Moray [3] 112/6 media [10] 50/21 79/10 80/4 80/11 41/11 92/11 96/18 169/9 169/13 115/11 53/8 53/23 60/10 80/14 80/15 80/20 Mine [1] 74/6 98/25 99/12 115/3 more [80] 3/24 6/19 84/19 133/23 161/12 81/3 81/11 81/20 mingle [1] 174/14 115/23 119/13 119/18 10/12 15/4 20/13 22/7 161/16 164/16 164/17 83/20 85/9 113/25 mingling [1] 189/3 122/6 130/2 133/1 22/16 22/19 23/6 medical [13] 7/19 114/1 114/1 114/7 minimal [3] 33/19 152/8 206/5 25/23 25/24 29/21 9/10 9/11 10/16 23/9 114/19 114/25 118/6 34/12 49/17 ministers' [1] 82/19 29/25 35/7 39/13 49/10 84/10 85/16 118/12 119/23 120/7 minister [145] 3/7 minor [1] 149/2 41/17 52/16 55/24 85/22 175/1 176/25 120/11 122/14 122/15 55/25 56/10 62/14 3/13 3/17 4/15 4/17 minsters [1] 115/4 181/14 182/12 122/19 122/25 123/6 4/23 4/24 6/22 6/25 minute [3] 12/17 67/5 71/6 76/13 76/14 medicines [1] 176/2 123/17 123/18 124/4 7/15 7/15 7/21 8/2 28/10 145/6 79/20 82/22 85/20 medium [1] 115/5 124/9 124/10 124/14 8/21 9/3 9/8 10/6 99/6 104/18 108/25 minuted [5] 106/7 meet [4] 20/10 21/7 124/17 124/24 125/3 12/23 13/13 13/19 106/9 106/11 106/22 111/19 115/16 119/21 39/11 200/8 125/9 125/24 126/5 14/21 15/21 15/22 212/23 140/23 141/12 141/23 meeting [14] 26/21 127/8 128/14 128/20 16/20 16/24 22/2 minutes [13] 19/14 150/4 151/1 156/14 26/22 28/12 29/17 128/24 129/1 129/2 24/13 24/25 25/8 159/13 159/23 164/10 29/23 30/2 37/13 30/2 32/11 57/22 86/7 129/5 129/8 130/16 25/23 26/20 27/2 37/17 102/25 106/3 164/12 164/13 167/18 103/6 134/17 135/16 133/7 166/16 169/17 145/6 154/13 154/15 168/14 171/22 172/11 27/11 28/14 33/17 145/6 145/7 179/17 154/17 157/5 158/14 172/21 172/23 174/11 messaging [13] 37/10 39/10 39/17 meetings [35] 8/1 8/3 41/25 42/5 42/6 52/24 40/5 40/12 40/13 missing [1] 50/20 174/14 174/15 175/5 8/5 8/5 8/15 8/17 9/2 73/17 73/19 85/16 40/21 40/21 40/23 mistake [1] 127/22 176/20 176/24 177/6 9/6 9/13 25/16 29/11 40/24 40/24 41/5 41/8 misunderstanding 179/6 179/21 180/8 114/19 114/25 115/18 32/3 32/3 32/3 51/3 118/25 119/25 123/5 41/12 41/22 41/23 **[1]** 132/16 182/25 186/1 186/10 102/25 105/17 105/24 met [9] 39/8 105/16 42/24 42/25 43/7 Mitchell [10] 86/4 189/17 190/13 190/15 106/4 106/8 106/11 49/22 51/7 52/5 52/17 88/23 88/24 92/18 191/21 191/22 194/3 135/9 158/22 160/8 106/22 107/8 107/10 176/19 176/19 212/5 57/23 58/13 58/19 206/10 206/12 206/13 194/24 195/14 197/2 119/23 134/11 141/5 59/23 62/6 62/9 69/19 214/8 215/9 215/18 213/4 198/5 199/15 199/15 141/7 176/16 176/21 mitigate [4] 39/1 method [1] 152/16 70/23 75/12 76/16 207/2 209/19 211/2 177/20 179/9 179/10 76/18 76/20 76/25 54/20 189/12 195/25 meticulous [1] 18/9 214/2 179/11 207/12 Michael [2] 8/6 43/8 77/2 77/14 78/4 79/15 mitigating [1] 46/19 morning [7] 1/4 member [8] 31/21 mitigations [8] 88/9 Michael Gove [2] 8/6 83/9 83/10 93/6 93/6 27/14 47/8 62/22 63/1 83/5 117/25 182/18 191/19 192/15 192/25 43/8 93/7 93/16 93/20 69/13 79/24 207/14 207/15 207/16 mid [2] 20/19 21/12 94/19 96/14 96/20 196/16 196/18 196/20 most [13] 9/6 32/2 210/8 middle [2] 52/12 96/21 97/13 98/1 197/14 101/24 104/15 104/21 members [6] 25/22 99/10 99/25 100/19 106/17 112/20 169/12 123/21 mixing [1] 102/3 26/18 27/2 86/24 88/1 mixture [1] 103/14 midst [2] 115/25 100/21 101/8 101/9 176/10 179/3 183/10

М **most... [2]** 184/3 202/8 mourning [1] 114/22 move [12] 2/21 14/10 24/1 49/19 50/11 52/8 52/23 62/25 68/24 78/8 209/8 211/12 moved [9] 12/10 42/6 43/10 52/3 62/14 66/13 162/2 169/13 211/5 movement [1] 51/8 moving [5] 41/3 50/24 192/19 207/11 209/20 Mr [16] 1/3 62/21 92/24 95/5 95/8 99/2 184/12 100/16 140/16 140/18 142/5 154/3 158/18 151/16 163/22 166/19 166/20 215/13 Mr Dawson [4] 95/5 100/16 154/3 163/22 Mr Dominic **Cummings [1]** 92/24 Mr Jack [2] 140/16 140/18 Mr Kenneth **Thomson [1]** 142/5 Mr Swinney [2] 166/19 166/20 Mr Tariq [2] 1/3 62/21 Mr Yousaf [1] 158/18 Mrs [1] 185/7 Mrs Smith [1] 185/7 MS [28] 1/6 70/24 70/25 70/25 71/11 83/24 85/9 86/4 88/23 88/24 89/1 92/18 92/20 94/15 97/9 97/15 99/1 99/3 116/5 121/13 200/20 206/10 206/12 206/13 214/8 215/3 215/9 215/18 Ms Forbes [3] 70/25 99/3 200/20 Ms Fraser [2] 116/5 121/13 Ms Freeman [4] 70/24 83/24 85/9 97/15 Ms Jeane Freeman **[1]** 97/9 Ms Lloyd [3] 89/1 92/20 94/15 Ms Mitchell [6] 86/4 88/23 92/18 206/10 206/12 214/8 Ms Sommerville [1] 70/25 Ms Sturgeon [2] my Lady [14] 1/4

71/11 99/1 **MSP [1]** 95/7 much [36] 12/17 15/7 16/4 20/13 22/7 22/19 23/10 28/1 30/12 31/22 37/22 38/13 39/15 51/10 68/15 75/22 80/18 87/12 93/24 94/15 97/24 119/19 139/3 148/6 150/25 154/8 155/6 158/2 160/3 164/2 171/22 172/11 176/20 176/23 205/13 214/9 multiple [6] 118/16 130/11 175/18 175/19 205/3 211/21 multitudes [1] must [2] 114/15 my [135] 1/4 1/15 6/15 7/6 13/4 13/24 13/24 13/24 15/23 16/13 21/10 22/5 28/1 28/3 29/13 29/14 32/5 32/7 37/1 37/8 43/12 50/10 50/13 51/4 52/14 57/21 59/3 59/9 60/3 60/15 60/24 61/16 62/22 63/25 65/23 68/16 68/17 68/21 69/3 71/24 72/1 navigate [1] 33/8 73/5 73/9 73/12 73/13 near [2] 147/24 148/2 NHS Lothian [1] 73/16 74/1 75/3 78/23 nearly [3] 37/22 81/17 86/2 87/9 87/9 87/9 87/9 87/21 87/25 89/3 89/22 92/17 93/21 93/23 94/11 94/12 95/6 95/14 99/22 100/2 100/8 105/24 106/8 107/7 108/1 114/5 119/18 123/20 124/5 124/13 126/17 126/18 128/4 128/6 130/25 131/4 132/16 135/2 135/20 137/3 138/23 140/1 144/17 147/4 147/8 147/22 149/24 150/7 153/16 153/21 154/8 154/11 155/23 156/25 159/3 162/12 162/13 163/17 164/14 166/6 167/5 167/15 168/3 168/7 176/8 177/5 178/20 181/1 182/12 183/6 183/9 183/10 192/13 192/17 194/6 204/5 204/20 206/8 208/24 209/19 210/6 210/8 211/12 212/3 214/7 214/7 214/14

37/1 61/16 62/22 68/21 86/2 92/17 95/6 194/24 95/14 154/8 206/8 212/3 214/7 214/14 my Lady's [1] 100/2 myriad [1] 174/20 myself [8] 10/6 32/4 58/20 104/24 130/7 137/12 159/5 191/18 name [3] 38/6 47/7 97/21 named [1] 60/11 naming [1] 59/10 **nation [2]** 80/7 141/3 national [11] 37/11

45/14 63/6 64/16 65/4 108/18 112/24 163/16 164/25 175/4 182/13 nationality [1] 142/12 nations [11] 8/5 46/20 47/3 48/15 63/13 140/12 140/20 141/24 143/20 156/4 171/16 Nations' [1] 120/3 **natural** [1] 177/5 nature [9] 72/4 99/12 100/17 103/7 108/3 108/6 111/8 125/2 175/14 172/13 197/4 necessarily [16] 17/23 24/8 24/19 26/25 29/7 39/20 48/12 59/19 62/12 137/24 138/15 138/20 141/7 160/1 160/25 179/23 necessary [10] 22/23 55/14 101/17 105/21 107/2 117/24 132/20 137/4 151/21 161/14 necessitate [1] 204/22 need [31] 7/4 7/11 13/4 27/16 34/23 35/13 35/20 36/24 38/18 45/19 54/5 62/9 66/2 73/10 74/7 78/13 83/9 89/7 100/17 117/15 138/3 140/20 141/14 144/5 158/24 162/25 188/12 202/22 needed [18] 34/15 36/8 44/5 52/5 54/19 64/4 93/25 99/23 101/18 110/6 122/22

139/7 175/17 176/5

needing [1] 19/5 needs [4] 7/15 73/13 76/1 191/1 neither [4] 5/17 13/18 166/4 205/4 **NERVTAG [1]** 178/10 net [1] 50/24 never [8] 37/18 40/23 82/11 160/11 166/2 183/13 204/20 204/20 nevertheless [1] 207/16 new [23] 11/3 11/8 51/1 109/1 109/21 124/6 124/7 158/4 159/12 160/21 162/3 174/15 178/4 182/8 188/2 189/5 198/9 198/10 198/23 199/2 202/21 205/11 205/11 New Year [1] 174/15 news [2] 63/10 91/13 next [13] 17/20 32/23 33/12 62/13 66/14 75/23 94/18 95/6 100/14 103/6 111/4 197/22 211/12 **NHS [10]** 64/10 173/21 174/17 179/3 179/6 181/15 204/3 204/14 210/17 211/10 64/10 **NHS' [1]** 204/10 Nicola [46] 3/7 3/17 6/6 10/20 11/3 11/7 11/13 12/7 12/18 15/5 185/11 15/15 20/9 20/18 20/23 21/11 25/1 26/7 26/11 27/6 37/13 37/20 38/9 38/11 39/5 39/11 43/19 47/10 47/21 47/25 48/14 50/3 52/10 69/5 69/9 75/5 79/1 79/6 81/23 82/23 83/21 96/21 119/6 Nicola Sturgeon [36] 3/7 3/17 6/6 10/20 11/3 11/7 11/13 12/7 12/18 15/15 20/9 20/23 26/7 26/11 27/6 212/2 37/13 37/20 38/9 38/11 39/5 43/19 159/15 162/12 162/13 48/14 50/3 52/10 69/5 none [3] 109/19 69/9 70/8 70/14 71/7 75/5 79/1 79/6 81/23 82/23 83/21 96/21 Nicola Sturgeon's [4] 15/5 25/1 47/25 normal [10] 8/1 73/18 12/22 20/14 22/7

178/4 181/8 185/7

night [4] 79/25 80/10 80/14 167/2 Nike [6] 56/13 57/18 58/4 61/24 62/23 67/7 no [93] 12/14 14/17 15/10 15/17 15/21 19/13 25/19 29/15 30/7 33/9 33/11 33/12 33/16 35/13 36/16 43/14 46/8 49/8 51/21 52/13 64/23 66/1 67/25 68/12 68/14 73/25 74/2 74/9 74/9 74/15 74/16 76/25 77/12 78/2 82/25 84/13 86/2 86/21 88/6 88/16 88/17 88/17 92/7 97/24 107/7 110/19 113/24 115/1 119/9 121/4 122/9 123/9 124/9 129/7 130/19 133/11 137/6 137/10 137/10 138/3 141/17 141/18 146/7 147/25 157/13 157/24 160/1 162/16 165/1 165/6 165/22 169/24 176/13 178/23 182/4 182/11 184/25 191/11 192/22 193/24 194/6 194/17 195/3 196/8 199/8 202/1 202/6 204/17 206/7 206/8 208/6 213/3 213/5 no one [3] 162/16 165/1 165/6 **No.2 [1]** 156/18 **nobody [2]** 148/9 non [12] 9/19 169/3 173/8 177/12 178/1 178/19 184/19 184/23 195/16 203/9 206/1 212/2 non-corporate [1] 206/1 70/8 70/14 71/7 73/18 non-Covid [1] 184/23 non-essential [1] 169/3 non-pharmaceutical **[6]** 9/19 177/12 178/1 178/19 195/16 203/9 non-specific [1] non-urgent [2] 173/8 184/19 109/24 120/11 nor [6] 5/17 10/14 127/11 133/16 205/5 213/3

207/20 207/25 209/23 140/25 153/18 154/5 Ν 210/21 211/15 212/5 158/15 166/2 183/18 normal... [6] 22/19 213/13 184/1 187/14 188/2 206/5 104/15 104/16 104/19 **NPIs [9]** 9/19 10/3 occasion [8] 101/2 often [32] 22/25 105/13 204/11 10/4 10/15 177/11 129/12 130/5 146/7 normality [2] 22/13 180/11 194/3 195/15 146/14 161/20 166/7 90/1 90/14 99/16 23/5 168/10 203/8 normally [4] 24/12 nuance [2] 163/20 occasionally [5] 74/4 29/3 30/3 80/23 165/7 84/6 84/24 85/8 Northern [8] 36/15 129/13 nuanced [1] 151/1 40/25 41/12 42/2 nuances [1] 163/18 occasions [19] 18/10 42/17 46/23 141/22 26/8 30/14 39/8 55/21 number [68] 12/19 143/25 14/18 16/9 20/9 23/20 81/2 100/23 104/15 Northern Ireland [8] 24/15 36/11 39/8 52/2 105/2 105/7 112/12 36/15 40/25 41/12 57/5 58/16 60/25 130/4 131/19 142/24 **oh [7]** 17/9 18/10 42/2 42/17 46/23 67/24 76/3 76/7 81/13 144/25 193/21 194/8 33/12 37/8 61/10 141/22 143/25 86/6 92/24 94/11 194/21 205/3 66/15 86/16 nosocomial [1] 102/4 102/5 102/5 occur [2] 42/11 66/17 **Okay [2]** 10/22 211/10 102/12 102/24 104/3 occurred [5] 17/3 131/19 not [313] 104/4 104/11 108/10 19/18 172/13 172/15 old [7] 43/17 43/24 **note [8]** 33/5 33/25 110/15 110/19 111/7 184/18 44/4 45/22 124/7 63/21 65/19 77/1 77/2 112/12 112/21 113/14 October [8] 32/20 124/14 211/20 77/14 130/23 120/6 120/6 124/6 37/9 37/15 120/8 notebook [5] 31/24 124/24 124/25 125/3 121/21 123/7 123/16 211/25 32/1 44/20 63/1 72/1 131/13 134/10 135/2 124/1 notebooks [1] 94/12 140/2 147/23 148/2 October 2020 [1] **noted [4]** 28/15 157/3 168/22 170/16 32/20 126/11 129/8 135/8 170/20 171/15 171/24 odd [3] 50/12 51/25 notes [19] 4/6 17/18 172/18 172/24 176/14 189/5 29/10 29/13 30/1 32/2 179/9 179/10 179/11 off [3] 47/8 137/8 32/11 32/17 33/2 184/20 185/23 186/12 138/4 33/20 40/1 86/9 88/17 187/2 187/13 193/21 offence [2] 151/15 129/9 129/13 129/14 194/21 196/19 208/23 151/19 129/19 129/20 130/17 211/9 offences [2] 150/22 205/15 nothing [5] 30/10 Number 10 [1] 92/24 152/9 73/13 76/23 85/2 offended [1] 38/7 numbers [22] 13/1 on [397] 200/5 17/2 20/16 21/23 57/8 offending [1] 38/4 on...FM [1] 190/13 notice [10] 105/17 57/11 68/2 77/25 offer [1] 100/8 148/25 150/2 150/12 102/3 112/21 132/19 offering [1] 80/7 150/16 151/16 151/22 135/7 171/15 172/5 office [21] 56/19 152/1 152/20 155/12 188/2 191/12 193/10 75/15 75/16 82/5 notices [7] 148/19 193/14 195/13 200/9 115/9 120/5 122/7 15/18 22/21 25/16 148/22 149/12 150/6 204/13 205/19 122/11 122/24 123/2 25/16 28/17 29/4 150/19 152/3 157/23 123/4 126/18 130/14 29/21 30/22 31/4 numerous [2] 132/5 November [14] 1/18 130/17 130/25 131/5 195/10 2/11 43/10 44/24 132/9 132/16 132/21 40/1 47/18 51/23 46/14 47/25 50/1 170/14 190/14 52/16 53/13 53/21 69/17 70/9 95/20 96/3 objective [1] 117/4 Officer [5] 9/10 10/16 53/22 57/6 57/25 162/5 197/21 198/11 objectives [2] 52/2 176/4 181/14 182/12 58/11 58/16 61/19 November 2023 [2] 52/4 officers [12] 149/1 69/17 70/9 **obligation [4]** 68/18 151/11 151/12 151/17 now [48] 2/21 3/21 83/5 85/11 122/24 158/23 160/16 167/18 82/8 82/10 82/12 3/23 6/13 27/23 31/24 obligations [2] 93/19 167/22 167/24 168/2 83/11 83/12 83/16 32/13 38/3 42/9 43/9 156/22 168/3 168/4 43/9 43/10 47/1 49/19 obliged [5] 68/22 official [16] 13/11 57/6 62/25 66/16 88/25 89/3 94/24 16/11 16/19 18/12 68/24 78/8 81/12 128/15 71/16 71/19 71/19 87/11 89/21 104/12 observe [1] 141/6 72/16 73/12 75/15 124/9 126/1 127/9 observing [1] 86/9 75/16 75/19 76/11 127/15 133/7 147/25 obtain [1] 155/3 77/13 90/1 122/8 153/15 180/22 182/8 obvious [4] 1/24 2/3 Officially [1] 162/16 185/7 188/2 188/7 41/18 140/20 officials [15] 6/19 190/10 193/7 202/5 obviously [13] 87/3 9/20 17/18 40/19 90/6 203/20 203/25 204/22 95/11 121/22 137/16 91/5 93/23 101/4

107/15 115/9 135/21 187/1 187/22 191/18 137/4 137/13 169/8 191/25 193/20 194/19 196/18 197/2 198/24 199/5 199/5 199/11 23/10 26/5 45/7 67/10 201/11 202/6 202/7 204/9 205/15 101/3 103/3 104/17 one day [1] 69/20 105/7 111/1 111/23 one-on-one [1] 25/16 122/6 141/5 144/23 one-way [2] 191/18 145/19 146/1 146/12 196/18 171/11 174/13 174/15 ones [5] 10/7 10/7 176/11 177/14 180/22 91/12 167/25 183/10 180/22 184/8 191/4 ongoing [1] 177/10 194/5 199/23 209/18 online [2] 81/15 153/20 only [19] 5/13 11/19 46/22 60/19 70/4 72/20 82/8 115/13 121/2 135/11 141/2 145/23 150/2 152/1 169/25 172/3 176/19 177/5 179/16 older [3] 64/9 207/2 onto [4] 49/3 121/18 132/13 133/7 olds [2] 155/16 157/2 open [11] 34/16 **Omicron [23]** 170/21 55/16 55/19 60/15 171/9 171/13 171/22 90/16 90/17 126/9 172/2 172/10 172/21 169/4 169/15 182/15 174/11 176/22 177/20 189/3 177/22 180/7 185/25 opening [5] 35/21 186/4 197/19 197/21 120/23 169/2 174/4 197/24 198/4 198/11 187/7 198/13 198/14 203/7 openly [2] 83/7 83/7 **operate [1]** 103/18 Omicron' [1] 203/21 operated [1] 98/15 operation [3] 40/16 94/11 140/21 once [8] 68/2 100/9 operational [6] 101/6 136/7 136/23 138/16 138/17 138/24 149/14 199/9 205/2 147/2 147/6 161/1 one [93] 4/7 6/9 9/10 opinion [1] 103/2 opportunities [2] 26/2 113/14 opportunity [2] 25/4 33/12 36/4 36/4 36/12 27/3 opposed [8] 4/10 18/15 25/13 101/5 120/5 141/7 160/10 214/6 66/13 67/3 67/7 69/20 opposite [1] 31/17 71/15 76/10 77/7 79/4 opposition [3] 31/21 84/7 188/8 option [2] 153/17 85/7 89/6 91/17 92/4 202/7 101/10 103/5 111/5 option C [1] 202/7 options [2] 202/4 112/2 114/23 116/4 116/25 117/8 122/6 202/5 128/22 134/21 137/2 opts [1] 202/6 137/23 140/19 150/24 or [231] 155/14 155/15 158/12 order [13] 54/19 78/5 162/6 162/16 164/8 117/4 118/1 126/5 165/1 165/6 166/18 139/18 153/1 156/3 168/9 173/17 176/15 156/9 158/4 161/3 179/16 181/18 183/8 179/22 183/23

0	ourselves [2] 36/6	103/6	paper [14] 20/12 21/9	
ordinated [2] 41/4	163/23 out [39] 7/5 7/8 16/18	page [27] 6/13 9/17 10/24 19/24 28/11	21/25 22/4 25/4 26/1 29/1 29/3 29/5 29/9	210/2 participants [1]
46/20	21/24 32/25 34/7	28/16 31/25 32/9	29/18 135/7 136/8	83/13
ordinating [1] 75/24	34/18 41/7 42/22 52/1	32/13 32/14 32/23	202/4	participating [1] 8/12
ordination [2] 53/19	53/18 54/3 61/6 73/5	37/7 43/9 47/1 51/25	papers [4] 16/17	participation [1]
134/14	75/3 80/3 83/22 85/12		30/13 154/19 198/20	113/17
organisation [2] 117/12 117/13	88/20 89/8 91/25 92/1	86/17 162/5 189/7	paperwork [3]	particular [46] 7/9
organisational [1]	97/25 123/8 124/12	193/4 197/20 199/19	175/11 176/12 182/4	7/14 7/25 13/2 18/5
115/11	126/1 128/16 154/16	203/17 215/2	par [1] 93/24	29/8 53/23 58/3 86/1
original [2] 107/14	155/8 161/13 169/23	page 1 [1] 59/5	paragraph [19] 1/23	89/22 90/4 90/6 90/18
122/14	177/19 188/9 196/18	page 13 [1] 28/16	1/24 6/13 9/17 28/16	99/15 100/25 103/13
originally [1] 125/5	197/8 198/5 199/24 200/21 211/8	page 142 [1] 32/9	89/6 99/5 99/7 120/23 134/24 145/14 152/10	1
originated [1] 58/3	outbreak [1] 56/23	page 17 [1] 193/4 page 20 [1] 37/7	157/12 158/11 174/18	l l
other [78] 6/25 7/6	outbreaks [1] 68/4	page 21 [1] 43/9	174/22 206/20 206/21	132/19 135/15 136/21
7/10 9/5 9/11 9/24	0.14door [4] 101/16	page 23 [1] 47/1	213/7	140/10 143/18 149/10
13/22 14/3 23/3 23/2	outside [1] 141/24	page 35 [1] 19/24	paragraph 13 [2]	161/8 163/18 163/21
24/5 24/6 24/7 24/22 25/16 28/4 30/3 30/6	outwith [1] 170/4	page 37 [1] 63/2	1/23 1/24	165/2 165/7 165/15
31/9 39/18 40/22	over [63] 6/3 12/17	page 45 [1] 197/20	paragraph 143 [1]	167/15 168/20 173/16
43/18 47/18 56/18		1. 0 . 1	134/24	176/18 184/5 186/6
63/6 66/10 71/23 76/8	44/18 47/4 49/2 49/12	1. 0 . 1	paragraph 20 [1]	187/7 198/24 210/11
83/1 89/16 91/4 94/19	51/16 69/20 79/15	page 9 [2] 9/17 10/24	1	particularised [1]
95/10 101/13 105/25	80/13 91/9 94/2 96/20	1. 0 11	paragraph 23 [1]	188/15
107/1 110/25 115/23	97/7 97/8 114/2 114/3 114/7 115/14 118/16	pages [1] 51/24 pages [2] 190/8	paragraph 29 [1]	particularly [28] 6/6 8/8 23/3 40/17 44/11
118/5 119/1 119/4	122/5 126/14 131/15	190/9	6/13	55/22 68/1 89/13
119/9 124/25 125/17	139/25 140/8 141/15	pages 12 [2] 190/8	paragraph 341 [1]	89/16 94/12 100/7
127/5 134/19 141/21	146/5 151/6 157/4	190/9	206/20	104/15 110/20 115/25
141/23 143/20 145/5 151/4 151/8 155/14	158/7 162/18 165/24	paid [1] 190/18	paragraph 35 [2]	142/2 145/1 161/21
155/15 159/24 162/22	168/19 171/7 171/8	paint [1] 171/18	99/5 99/7	163/9 173/10 176/1
169/22 170/8 171/16	172/9 172/17 173/17	pandemic [94] 1/21	paragraph 36 [1]	184/2 194/13 195/14
171/20 174/6 174/8	176/13 177/1 179/4	2/23 3/25 6/8 8/10 9/3		196/12 198/8 206/17
174/13 178/8 183/19	182/4 184/18 184/24 187/2 188/1 188/3	9/4 26/12 27/21 30/20	paragrapn 42 [1] 89/6	210/18 211/20
185/13 185/17 188/6	189/7 191/14 195/9	30/21 31/6 31/11 31/18 31/19 38/13	paragraph 53 [1]	parties [5] 9/24 31/9 31/17 84/7 174/15
191/19 193/3 193/14	195/22 197/17 202/19		145/14	partisan [1] 36/3
194/9 198/16 201/2	202/45 240/22 240/22		paragraph 56 [1]	partly [1] 37/4
201/14 210/20 212/24	211/1 211/13 212/21	49/24 52/10 52/15	28/16	partner [5] 6/21 6/24
213/10 others [17] 6/22 8/11	overall [2] 38/22	52/18 52/24 53/5	paragraph 63 [1]	8/20 10/5 19/2
67/25 73/23 83/8 99/2		55/22 66/21 67/1 69/1		partnership [1] 13/25
112/20 113/15 121/13	overcrowaea [1]	69/16 70/9 72/13 79/6		partnerships [2] 11/1
128/21 157/11 163/1	136/4	83/16 84/3 87/7 87/16		11/11
164/11 166/8 175/23	overload [1] 174/23	87/20 88/2 96/24 97/10 98/13 99/9	paragraph says [1]	parts [4] 32/6 78/4 93/14 131/11
175/24 182/13	overspeak [1] 165/5 overspeaking [2]	99/13 100/7 101/15	paragraphs [2] 31/4	party [2] 36/4 85/18
others' [1] 191/24	110/5 110/0	104/17 104/18 107/4	152/6	pass [6] 70/22 71/10
otherwise [1] 145/22	overstate [1] 18/15	108/11 110/1 110/23	Parliament [6] 11/4	74/1 91/9 131/4
ought [3] 153/14 183/4 199/12	overstates [1] 39/7	113/4 113/11 114/16	30/14 50/21 113/21	131/19
our [40] 44/14 44/16	overstepping [1]	116/1 118/13 119/3	138/13 138/14	passage [2] 162/10
63/12 66/5 87/17	84/22		parliamentarians [1]	198/5
87/20 88/10 99/13	overview [1] 138/23	129/16 130/1 131/12	134/5	passages [1] 194/19
103/24 107/10 116/19	overwhelmed [4]	132/11 134/8 135/12	Parliamentary [1]	passed [7] 71/3
117/7 118/24 140/19	173/5 173/24 174/1 178/14	146/23 148/13 163/25 166/25 168/21 169/22	l .	131/7 131/22 131/23 138/14 138/18 156/3
142/3 143/8 148/12	overwhelming [5]	170/4 170/20 176/10	8/9 9/14 9/15 17/14	passing [1] 130/13
150/7 150/7 152/19	149/21 164/5 164/15	177/7 177/18 178/16	17/25 18/22 22/3 28/3	past [2] 45/9 104/11
152/24 152/25 153/8	210/17 211/10	180/18 181/12 182/2	49/13 51/23 55/13	paste [1] 151/14
154/12 154/21 154/21	own [7] 21/7 87/19	183/16 185/22 187/1	65/17 71/19 72/19	pasting [1] 131/16
156/3 161/17 168/6 173/7 177/25 178/22	118/11 142/14 165/3	192/9 193/23 196/3	72/20 72/21 83/18	patience [1] 195/23
182/15 183/14 187/12	175/13 213/21	201/25 207/4 210/16	86/8 87/1 92/4 93/3	patient [12] 55/21
194/5 202/10 204/3	P	pandemic-related [1]		59/11 59/22 60/1
207/6 207/12	paced [2] 100/16	48/8	132/25 135/22 148/5	60/16 62/11 64/9 65/1
	paceu [2] 100/10	panic [1] 67/13	164/19 164/22 164/23	65/5 67/2 68/17 68/20
				(70)
				(78) ordinated - patient

120/25 121/21 128/11 167/11 167/12 167/17 P 82/11 82/20 118/11 **play [5]** 24/5 140/18 165/10 118/18 130/10 140/23 182/1 182/9 patients [2] 62/5 played [4] 6/18 53/3 perceived [1] 85/18 personality [1] 94/9 206/25 percentage [1] 188/4 **personally [2]** 4/15 141/12 196/15 patrols [1] 147/24 **perception** [1] 38/11 144/22 please [17] 1/4 1/16 Paul [2] 4/13 103/19 perfect [4] 33/6 99/5 108/15 118/20 perspective [2] pause [6] 20/15 134/24 158/10 158/11 37/21 173/18 174/1 149/13 177/5 21/18 32/24 43/23 Performance [1] perspectives [3] 162/1 166/14 167/3 57/2 119/13 46/1 104/5 104/6 168/14 187/17 187/18 112/24 peak [3] 172/2 172/3 199/18 203/16 206/19 Police Scotland's [1] perhaps [44] 7/20 pertinent [1] 179/24 174/8 8/22 9/1 10/5 10/8 pharmaceutical [7] plethora [1] 184/12 penality [2] 152/3 9/19 176/4 177/12 14/2 17/20 19/9 27/6 **plural [1]** 118/12 152/20 27/23 29/25 44/18 178/1 178/19 195/16 pm [8] 37/10 43/11 **penalties** [1] 157/16 55/20 56/3 58/6 58/9 203/9 47/5 95/2 95/4 153/24 penalties.Governme 58/14 66/15 67/8 **phase [11]** 139/15 154/1 214/16 **nt [1]** 152/9 68/10 74/19 80/16 142/19 177/7 177/18 point [59] 3/18 30/4 penalty [14] 148/19 83/14 90/12 94/1 177/21 178/15 178/17 33/18 36/16 42/8 148/22 148/25 149/12 110/4 110/9 112/15 178/24 179/1 181/1 42/12 42/20 43/4 43/5 150/2 150/6 150/11 114/18 116/24 132/10 181/12 44/2 45/24 57/6 57/25 150/16 150/19 151/16 66/9 71/5 74/3 76/17 137/7 141/6 154/16 phenomenon [2] 151/22 152/1 155/12 156/6 161/2 165/4 76/18 76/22 80/24 145/14 193/19 157/22 165/5 175/23 176/15 philosophy [1] 42/18 87/21 88/16 117/6 people [117] 9/1 9/5 184/17 193/5 205/13 phone [24] 49/3 117/16 122/18 126/8 10/25 13/2 16/9 17/13 209/19 70/13 71/2 73/12 132/23 138/3 138/24 18/10 20/9 20/17 period [67] 6/15 30/7 73/13 81/12 81/12 140/2 147/24 154/9 21/22 22/10 22/11 30/8 39/24 41/21 43/6 81/21 81/23 82/1 82/5 154/16 154/22 157/7 22/12 23/2 23/3 23/6 159/12 168/11 169/18 46/24 49/19 52/18 82/7 82/9 82/10 82/11 23/11 23/12 23/21 169/23 169/24 173/17 54/11 69/12 79/2 80/1 82/12 82/12 82/15 23/23 26/3 28/2 36/17 87/10 88/18 88/21 82/17 118/13 123/18 177/19 177/22 179/1 38/18 38/21 39/1 108/11 111/6 118/17 124/15 130/16 131/15 179/4 179/5 180/1 39/14 43/18 48/11 139/24 139/25 139/25 phones [6] 81/13 180/18 180/21 181/1 48/11 48/21 49/1 140/8 147/17 149/5 82/20 118/11 118/16 195/8 195/19 196/9 53/13 54/5 54/12 149/25 154/18 158/7 130/10 130/11 201/14 201/16 203/4 54/15 54/17 54/19 162/2 168/16 168/20 phrase [1] 178/24 210/7 210/15 214/4 54/21 54/22 55/7 170/10 170/11 170/14 phrases [1] 164/1 pointless [1] 39/23 55/10 55/24 56/3 171/7 171/8 171/9 pick [1] 37/12 points [37] 9/21 56/19 58/7 60/14 61/9 171/13 171/16 172/9 picking [1] 189/5 23/21 29/9 30/3 34/8 61/12 62/4 65/6 67/13 172/17 173/4 173/17 39/21 41/13 115/7 picture [3] 171/18 76/3 83/3 83/3 85/21 115/13 116/22 116/25 144/22 174/9 176/13 176/18 192/20 211/13 85/24 86/10 86/23 121/4 121/17 122/4 177/2 179/8 179/16 piece [6] 26/17 26/17 87/3 87/14 91/8 91/15 179/18 182/2 183/1 26/24 54/2 117/12 125/10 126/6 126/8 91/21 92/1 92/15 183/12 184/19 184/24 211/14 126/10 126/13 126/16 politicians [3] 5/24 102/5 124/25 133/3 185/19 187/2 197/3 pieces [1] 181/18 126/19 126/24 127/3 135/3 137/25 138/8 197/17 198/1 201/5 127/4 127/5 127/12 place [42] 7/4 18/20 143/5 144/2 144/12 202/2 202/19 203/14 29/19 32/12 35/11 127/25 129/18 130/8 150/11 150/12 153/19 203/15 210/22 210/23 35/16 35/19 35/24 130/22 131/3 131/14 155/21 156/8 161/4 131/18 132/12 133/13 84/10 204/21 42/19 49/25 56/15 periods [2] 146/23 161/9 161/22 165/9 171/14 64/20 69/3 72/7 75/10 152/22 170/9 165/9 167/21 172/2 permanent [2] 4/8 77/22 79/20 89/19 police [58] 136/4 174/14 181/23 183/22 89/24 90/24 91/4 136/5 137/14 137/19 4/10 184/6 184/24 185/1 **permission** [1] 100/2 106/15 134/11 137/17 138/11 138/16 138/17 185/15 186/13 186/19 **permitted [2]** 10/25 139/4 149/14 149/17 138/24 139/5 139/16 187/13 189/3 189/9 168/18 179/10 179/17 139/17 147/1 147/2 169/6 189/23 191/22 192/4 persistent [1] 212/9 181/10 191/18 191/19 147/5 147/8 147/16 192/4 195/7 195/10 person [22] 7/4 192/15 192/25 196/9 148/2 148/5 148/8 196/3 196/18 197/1 60/12 63/16 64/4 196/11 196/16 197/15 148/10 148/11 149/1 197/5 200/8 204/15 64/11 64/12 64/15 202/8 205/8 205/9 149/3 149/17 149/20 204/23 204/24 205/14 65/1 66/4 66/5 70/4 placed [3] 46/16 149/20 149/22 149/25 136/11 207/2 207/10 209/8 176/25 179/21 80/4 93/21 93/22 150/1 150/14 151/9 people's [9] 19/3 100/9 119/22 174/25 151/10 151/11 151/17 97/22 places [1] 58/9 23/17 55/9 90/21 183/7 201/9 205/15 151/17 151/21 151/25 **Plan [1]** 115/18 90/21 106/17 180/15 planned [1] 189/22 212/18 212/19 158/22 158/24 159/18 186/24 195/23 160/6 160/9 160/23 personal [9] 56/4 plans [1] 139/4 per [6] 119/8 119/24 81/20 81/21 81/23 **platforms [1]** 119/10 161/14 166/22 167/4

167/21 167/24 167/24 167/25 168/1 168/2 168/3 168/4 168/8 Police Scotland [11] 138/17 147/1 147/2 147/5 147/8 148/5 151/17 151/25 161/14 167/24 167/25 151/21 policies [3] 73/1 73/5 73/8 policing [5] 134/21 136/17 136/19 137/8 160/14 policy [34] 3/12 7/3 18/12 28/4 39/14 49/22 50/17 51/7 52/2 52/3 73/7 73/9 73/17 73/20 73/22 73/23 74/3 74/10 89/25 115/18 116/14 116/19 117/7 117/15 120/1 121/2 122/21 123/5 124/19 128/12 144/11 145/24 159/25 186/6 **politeness** [1] 39/9 political [28] 3/12 4/5 4/8 4/9 27/20 28/3 29/13 33/21 34/1 34/3 34/24 35/6 36/2 36/23 43/13 45/16 45/25 49/22 50/7 51/7 83/15 83/23 84/25 85/6 85/18 85/22 93/15 103/18 politically [2] 87/2 politician [2] 31/9 85/4 38/4 163/9 politicisation [1] 87/6 politics [3] 9/23 poll [1] 47/19 polling [1] 54/6 pools [1] 169/3 poor [1] 114/24 **population** [7] 136/3 136/21 136/25 137/21 137/22 137/25 211/20 port [1] 143/6 portfolio [5] 97/8 97/12 98/4 119/18 portfolios [2] 52/6 ports [1] 143/25 **posed [2]** 136/20 137/21 position [63] 10/2

41/22 41/23 42/25 130/1 130/19 133/23 procedures [1] 65/2 **Professor McVie's** 143/13 43/7 77/2 77/3 77/15 proceed [2] 64/19 **[1]** 157/24 position... [62] 10/11 pre [5] 75/9 177/22 77/16 93/7 188/18 **Professor Paul** 12/14 13/17 15/4 178/18 206/9 209/11 proceedings [1] Prime Minister [11] Cairney [2] 4/13 15/25 16/21 18/5 pre-21 April 2020 [1] 37/10 40/5 40/13 154/6 103/19 31/14 34/22 36/13 209/11 40/21 41/8 41/22 process [30] 5/3 13/4 Professor Smith [3] 36/14 36/15 44/16 pre-Covid [1] 75/9 41/23 42/25 43/7 77/2 15/7 16/17 17/15 54/4 57/16 58/15 47/23 48/2 48/3 48/6 pre-Omicron [1] 18/16 18/18 18/22 93/7 Professor Sridhar [3] 48/20 50/6 51/9 54/11 Prime Minister's [4] 19/15 19/16 19/17 83/1 84/1 84/14 177/22 59/18 59/20 61/13 pre-Rule 10 [1] 206/9 13/8 77/3 77/15 77/16 25/24 29/21 56/9 67/4 **profile [1]** 213/20 104/12 113/9 114/4 Princess [1] 137/24 72/19 72/20 72/21 profit [1] 190/23 precautionary [2] 114/5 114/6 120/10 principal [2] 50/13 74/24 101/10 101/17 199/6 202/22 programme [13] 31/1 120/14 120/15 120/21 precise [1] 108/5 50/14 117/2 123/15 126/1 31/3 51/20 51/22 52/1 121/25 122/12 123/13 precisely [2] 150/18 130/12 130/18 131/7 174/5 177/25 180/3 principle [3] 68/14 123/16 124/23 125/9 161/9 103/23 111/11 150/21 155/8 197/17 181/20 181/22 182/20 128/25 142/13 146/6 processes [4] 12/23 195/17 205/8 predictable [1] **principles** [8] 112/23 152/19 156/25 157/17 112/25 113/3 113/11 18/19 132/25 155/10 136/18 progress [1] 28/6 162/3 163/24 175/13 113/16 116/15 117/20 produce [1] 87/18 **prominent [3]** 141/13 predominantly [1] 176/18 184/12 186/15 133/2 **produced [5]** 78/25 176/15 182/25 135/23 187/17 190/1 191/5 proper [5] 13/3 18/16 prior [3] 26/2 97/16 117/13 118/22 123/6 preference [1] 60/24 193/9 194/5 194/6 19/14 19/15 114/15 **preferred [1]** 110/2 211/7 164/6 195/7 200/25 203/13 preliminary [2] 1/11 prioritising [1] producing [1] 128/16 proportion [1] 204/21 211/5 70/1 188/12 production [2] 118/5 197/12 positioning [1] 48/19 preparation [2] 50/17 priority [4] 52/9 129/4 proposal [9] 21/23 **positions** [1] 104/11 122/20 173/21 202/18 professional [3] 2/22 21/25 22/3 25/20 47/9 50/18 positive [3] 13/16 prison [14] 136/2 144/21 168/2 47/24 48/25 49/3 preparations [1] 53/8 77/7 197/12 prepare [1] 135/14 136/10 136/21 136/25 **Professor [51]** 4/13 160/21 **positively [1]** 15/13 35/3 54/4 54/8 57/16 prepared [2] 89/18 137/2 137/3 137/5 proposal...but [1] positivity [1] 112/21 135/16 137/9 137/15 137/21 58/15 83/1 84/1 84/14 47/12 possession [2] 71/8 137/22 138/4 139/9 84/16 84/25 103/19 prerogative [1] proposals [4] 7/3 7/3 123/25 145/10 139/10 108/17 109/11 109/15 10/15 41/7 possibility [18] 150/5 present [4] 9/7 9/8 Prison Service [3] 109/16 109/20 111/9 proposed [4] 23/1 152/16 194/20 196/1 134/10 212/1 137/5 138/4 139/10 125/1 127/8 128/20 24/14 29/3 29/4 199/7 207/19 207/21 presentation [1] **prisons** [6] 136/1 129/8 132/4 152/4 **prospect** [1] 60/15 207/23 208/11 208/20 88/11 136/15 136/17 137/1 152/20 155/18 157/12 prospectively [1] 209/7 209/12 209/15 137/6 139/5 157/24 162/7 162/8 170/10 **presented** [1] 25/1 210/1 210/7 210/14 private [24] 3/21 162/15 163/16 165/19 protect [4] 144/12 press [5] 31/8 31/12 211/4 213/25 84/4 146/3 209/3 34/21 35/18 74/4 175/2 175/8 175/16 180/2 185/15 185/15 possible [12] 57/12 175/23 175/25 176/11 protecting [1] 180/14 pressed [1] 94/14 75/15 75/16 82/5 59/25 105/17 126/2 115/9 122/7 122/11 182/17 189/16 190/5 pressure [17] 34/6 protection [2] 23/4 138/8 154/6 156/9 34/20 35/13 43/15 122/24 123/2 123/3 190/12 190/22 193/17 199/9 161/19 189/14 195/25 45/8 45/10 46/15 126/18 130/14 130/17 194/22 199/23 200/2 **protector** [1] 199/7 199/16 208/19 46/16 61/14 85/10 130/25 131/5 132/9 200/13 200/15 203/22 protocol [1] 106/10 possibly [7] 22/16 89/12 91/14 170/1 132/16 132/21 167/6 **Professor Devi** protocols [1] 180/6 43/15 53/16 117/11 173/7 174/17 179/3 167/8 168/12 **Sridhar [2]** 35/3 proven [1] 67/23 164/4 186/22 189/12 provide [10] 23/14 201/24 private office [14] 182/17 post [9] 3/2 50/10 pressures [3] 101/14 75/15 75/16 82/5 34/13 35/23 75/20 Professor Jason 50/10 139/22 146/15 174/8 186/16 115/9 122/11 122/24 Leitch [1] 108/17 76/20 78/18 81/4 146/19 170/11 170/25 presumably [1] 123/2 126/18 130/14 **Professor Leitch [33]** 87/15 99/6 124/23 181/25 130/17 130/25 131/5 54/8 84/16 84/25 provided [29] 1/17 213/7 potential [6] 32/18 pretty [2] 65/24 156/2 132/16 132/21 109/15 109/16 109/20 35/10 51/17 69/4 85/14 138/12 193/1 previous [10] 81/13 privately [4] 36/9 111/9 125/1 127/8 69/14 69/18 69/22 208/16 212/15 118/21 123/21 151/6 36/12 36/13 141/9 128/20 129/8 132/4 69/25 70/5 70/9 70/11 potentially [6] 34/11 157/4 159/14 167/12 privileged [1] 104/12 162/7 162/8 162/15 76/20 82/2 82/8 95/17 58/13 65/6 76/6 174/11 186/11 213/3 proactive [1] 13/17 163/16 165/19 175/2 96/2 108/9 118/16 150/18 185/17 proactively [3] 15/13 **previously [6]** 16/15 175/8 175/16 175/23 123/14 125/19 128/19 poverty [1] 50/25 22/14 124/18 127/16 176/11 189/16 190/5 128/23 153/22 166/17 30/11 30/12 power [1] 204/5 128/7 176/20 probably [10] 28/9 190/12 190/22 193/17 174/19 175/7 183/23 practicality [1] 51/23 54/3 56/11 60/8 194/22 199/23 200/2 192/11 198/20 primarily [2] 51/13 121/19 200/13 200/15 203/22 providing [4] 17/18 140/14 94/14 121/21 151/18 practice [14] 22/11 primary [1] 212/25 175/4 183/10 **Professor Leitch's** 36/22 57/17 182/22 74/18 76/5 77/9 **Prime [16]** 13/8 **[1]** 109/11 pub [2] 39/12 90/17 problem [3] 150/18 107/18 110/14 121/16 37/10 39/10 40/5 189/18 203/25 Professor McVie [2] **public [127]** 5/14 123/8 126/18 129/10 40/13 40/21 41/8 **procedure** [1] 64/7 155/18 157/12 5/18 5/20 5/24 6/16

38/20 40/20 41/20 purposes [3] 119/24 152/21 152/22 198/5 reading [5] 11/12 150/17 154/21 60/11 60/14 61/13 public... [122] 9/22 pursue [1] 14/1 61/20 67/10 91/20 41/10 48/25 74/3 11/14 12/9 16/7 16/22 push [6] 24/14 24/15 116/24 132/5 132/6 145/7 17/5 34/2 34/19 35/5 25/20 68/22 76/13 181/19 190/2 202/3 reads [1] 33/7 35/7 35/11 35/17 ready [1] 99/22 84/6 quote [2] 5/1 78/9 35/21 35/25 36/8 real [12] 19/3 23/2 push-back [1] 84/6 36/19 36/20 38/17 23/11 104/5 136/20 pushed [1] 194/2 44/6 44/7 44/23 44/24 R number [7] 23/20 pushing [4] 21/19 137/20 147/4 152/15 45/5 45/6 45/6 45/7 24/15 102/12 112/21 52/8 194/9 201/10 159/14 159/15 164/3 46/5 46/9 46/16 46/19 120/6 168/22 171/15 put [40] 11/19 26/19 177/17 46/21 49/1 52/24 53/2 Raab [1] 41/21 34/10 35/11 35/16 realisation [1] 41/16 54/2 54/10 54/13 Rachel [3] 1/4 1/6 35/24 48/23 62/9 realise [1] 125/6 54/23 54/23 54/24 215/3 67/21 68/5 68/15 really [16] 15/7 22/5 54/24 55/5 55/5 55/17 radio [2] 85/1 161/16 68/15 73/11 75/16 40/5 43/1 44/16 68/6 55/19 55/25 56/10 raft [1] 213/13 83/6 89/23 90/24 91/4 82/25 87/21 110/1 57/8 57/10 58/15 59/4 91/25 92/1 111/5 raise [5] 36/9 85/2 115/14 121/7 133/17 60/1 60/19 63/5 64/11 156/18 157/6 190/20 169/17 173/11 197/12 111/11 122/8 123/2 64/14 65/4 65/13 raised [7] 43/4 69/25 126/25 127/18 133/7 199/25 65/17 66/3 66/10 134/14 137/17 139/4 70/3 156/5 212/7 reams [1] 88/19 66/24 66/25 67/3 67/5 212/23 212/24 142/25 143/3 143/4 reason [13] 43/12 67/17 67/18 67/18 raises [1] 89/4 144/23 160/16 184/14 46/25 50/10 57/20 67/20 67/21 68/5 68/8 191/19 192/15 196/16 raising [1] 6/20 64/21 67/21 67/22 68/16 84/21 85/13 197/15 rammy [4] 43/17 71/18 103/4 104/13 85/20 85/24 85/25 87/18 88/9 98/6 113/9 putting [4] 34/5 43/24 44/4 45/22 156/6 177/21 186/2 ramp [1] 210/23 61/14 67/19 110/16 reasonable [3] 135/4 113/23 113/23 114/10 rampant [3] 185/21 136/8 150/25 114/12 115/2 115/21 195/2 204/15 reasonably [1] 116/8 117/25 129/21 quadruple [2] 163/7 rampantly [1] 138/2 133/14 133/19 142/9 142/10 163/17 range [4] 157/19 reasoning [1] 22/6 144/4 144/15 144/25 161/11 181/16 213/13 reasons [13] 4/7 9/9 qualified [1] 191/14 146/13 148/12 156/10 rapid [1] 211/1 qualify [1] 189/10 55/12 55/16 66/23 163/8 166/5 168/6 quality [1] 185/10 rapidly [1] 203/10 71/15 103/22 117/8 169/8 189/18 193/2 queries [1] 175/10 rare [7] 100/23 101/2 117/9 122/25 144/1 193/15 194/13 194/16 question [39] 61/19 102/16 102/16 105/6 201/2 201/3 195/1 195/4 196/24 62/8 75/20 76/14 77/1 105/6 130/5 reassurance [1] 19/9 202/18 203/19 204/8 83/11 83/12 83/14 rarely [2] 44/4 143/1 reassure [1] 58/8 204/19 205/1 205/4 86/4 87/21 87/25 89/8 rate [2] 169/11 reassuring [1] 57/7 205/6 205/20 211/22 89/23 94/8 100/3 198/16 recall [19] 26/10 211/24 100/4 100/15 103/14 rather [11] 25/8 25/9 26/25 31/12 42/6 public's [1] 60/22 111/9 111/22 113/20 37/5 67/12 83/4 90/2 49/15 64/23 65/2 public-facing [2] 142/11 143/14 150/23 107/5 110/16 118/13 120/1 129/11 159/3 5/24 113/9 151/1 155/1 158/15 159/24 175/1 169/8 173/19 198/1 publication [2] 51/20 162/7 166/11 182/8 ratified [1] 25/13 198/7 207/22 209/5 154/13 188/8 188/16 190/20 ratify [2] 25/18 212/10 212/14 212/17 recoverable [4] **publicised** [2] 63/15 192/17 199/20 201/7 107/12 receive [3] 7/1 57/12 63/18 208/9 208/14 211/12 ratifying [2] 25/12 181/25 publicly [6] 34/23 questioning [2] 89/4 107/5 received [9] 8/23 45/2 61/2 69/25 70/4 rationale [4] 99/14 134/4 14/4 59/13 70/18 88/18 questions [36] 1/7 133/21 134/1 135/11 129/9 135/6 136/7 published [4] 30/13 1/15 6/20 7/10 56/12 re [4] 13/5 41/23 184/14 206/23 61/6 106/4 106/7 64/18 69/3 83/10 169/4 208/5 receiver [1] 117/17 pubs [8] 20/24 21/5 85/11 86/2 86/3 88/24 re-engages [1] 41/23 receiving [2] 14/2 169/3 169/14 189/2 92/19 95/9 98/11 re-make [1] 13/5 23/9 191/23 192/4 200/9 100/13 104/4 116/4 re-open [1] 169/4 recent [1] 205/1 pulled [1] 200/21 134/7 148/16 162/4 re-trauma [1] 208/5 recently [3] 14/8 pulling [1] 21/24 168/14 187/2 192/2 reach [1] 36/16 104/21 159/13 **purely [2]** 43/13 reached [3] 17/2 76/6 reception [1] 165/8 205/21 206/8 206/9 45/25 206/13 206/17 214/7 116/9 reckon [1] 87/5 purports [1] 103/17 215/5 215/7 215/9 reaching [1] 50/24 recollect [4] 61/22 purpose [9] 32/1 215/11 215/15 215/18 react [1] 147/22 62/2 65/18 83/23 35/15 45/6 50/13 read [11] 20/7 28/18 quickly [3] 62/14 recollection [19] 50/14 51/5 60/3 67/4 66/14 198/15 32/25 33/4 37/15 16/10 29/14 52/14 114/10 quite [17] 18/14 37/6 46/10 89/8 128/14 53/15 57/22 59/3

150/7 155/23 156/25 171/2 172/7 172/16 173/1 recollection's [1] 64/1 reconsider [1] 199/6 record [59] 72/16 74/20 74/24 75/1 76/1 76/15 77/11 79/9 106/3 108/16 115/7 115/8 115/12 116/16 116/19 116/23 117/11 117/19 121/6 121/14 121/19 122/9 122/22 122/23 123/3 125/12 126/4 126/7 126/11 126/15 126/25 127/2 127/14 127/17 127/19 128/3 128/9 128/10 128/11 129/17 129/21 129/21 129/22 130/9 130/13 130/15 131/3 132/13 132/22 132/24 133/8 133/9 133/12 133/15 134/3 185/22 186/15 186/18 204/13 record-keeping [1] 116/16 recorded [31] 17/23 74/19 76/5 78/7 115/6 115/7 116/18 116/21 116/23 117/19 119/8 120/24 121/3 121/5 121/11 121/14 122/3 126/6 126/17 127/3 127/11 127/11 127/14 127/16 127/25 130/22 132/24 149/3 150/9 150/14 151/9 records [8] 73/6 73/9 73/12 115/17 117/7 117/15 127/3 128/11 122/15 124/11 124/16 124/21 recovered [1] 125/16 recovery [4] 177/3 177/21 178/24 179/1 red [2] 142/22 143/5 redacted [2] 38/6 47/7 redacting [1] 78/20 redactions [1] 78/23 reduce [1] 33/18 reduced [2] 196/15 201/17 reducing [2] 11/17 205/19 refer [4] 12/4 85/3 109/14 162/10 reference [10] 34/24 51/17 71/24 83/21

73/16 73/25 74/2

74/10 87/9 88/17

(81) public... - reference

149/14 150/6 150/24 69/2 71/21 74/9 75/19 reports [1] 90/9 100/24 164/3 R 153/3 156/2 159/20 107/2 128/8 represent [2] 36/17 response [34] 1/21 reference... [6] 86/7 reliability [1] 210/25 160/5 160/24 161/5 208/6 6/17 8/9 8/12 15/11 96/5 121/7 126/12 161/10 161/19 167/19 reliance [5] 176/24 representation [2] 27/21 31/11 35/4 200/20 212/3 167/22 177/13 177/16 179/21 120/13 120/20 38/14 38/16 41/15 referenced [1] 155/2 reimpose [1] 199/6 191/9 representations [1] 49/24 52/10 59/8 references [2] 31/1 relied [6] 167/21 69/15 69/17 70/7 70/9 157/9 reinforce [1] 4/7 51/24 167/25 177/6 192/18 84/3 113/4 113/20 reiterate [5] 113/16 representative [2] referendum [9] 28/20 114/20 115/2 207/25 192/20 192/23 184/8 208/1 114/16 116/11 119/2 29/17 30/8 30/23 50/4 134/15 135/12 148/12 208/2 relief [1] 49/2 represented [4] 51/9 52/9 52/11 86/13 **reiterated** [1] 113/3 relies [1] 152/11 120/9 127/16 168/2 162/20 179/22 201/7 referral [1] 24/12 207/7 209/6 213/8 reject [1] 193/24 **reluctance [4]** 48/18 184/4 referred [1] 161/4 relate [1] 64/24 48/24 91/8 148/5 **Republic [1]** 197/11 213/9 referring [1] 57/20 related [12] 30/25 request [8] 60/3 62/1 reluctantly [3] 47/22 responsibilities [3] refers [4] 21/23 46/19 48/8 78/8 78/19 48/1 48/16 69/18 70/7 70/19 134/21 146/15 146/19 38/15 63/20 109/23 responsibility [11] 126/16 126/19 127/13 rely [4] 178/6 178/12 74/14 106/13 154/24 reflect [2] 52/9 130/8 133/13 154/12 192/22 196/7 requested [3] 26/25 4/16 4/24 53/10 152/23 197/6 relying [1] 193/23 108/11 131/24 139/22 140/4 141/19 reflected [3] 87/13 relates [3] 11/9 89/6 remain [5] 14/19 27/9 requests [3] 106/25 141/20 142/7 146/10 208/13 209/22 76/7 95/25 96/10 114/25 173/15 146/25 207/16 125/19 reflecting [3] 22/15 relating [19] 69/1 remained [5] 3/16 require [11] 100/11 responsible [8] 28/21 86/14 70/8 109/4 113/4 42/7 52/15 171/4 116/16 116/18 117/3 16/11 48/11 96/16 reflection [10] 17/10 114/14 117/23 119/21 171/5 136/19 138/9 138/15 98/4 98/5 98/8 140/9 17/14 52/4 66/14 120/12 121/18 125/10 remaining [1] 188/4 150/1 201/1 204/22 212/11 91/10 91/14 99/18 125/20 126/4 126/10 213/19 rest [11] 99/12 100/1 remains [2] 114/6 156/10 157/9 209/17 127/1 129/15 132/12 143/11 required [21] 19/9 101/1 147/12 159/17 reflections [1] 90/25 132/23 182/22 188/17 160/7 169/5 171/6 remarks [1] 159/5 35/18 88/9 105/23 reflective [1] 75/8 106/2 115/14 121/2 relation [52] 26/15 remember [14] 27/7 171/12 185/22 185/23 reflects [2] 44/18 40/14 53/5 73/6 73/8 62/8 63/20 80/22 84/4 126/25 127/11 133/17 restarting [2] 28/20 87/5 92/21 99/8 99/21 86/16 153/8 163/24 144/14 150/2 160/7 86/13 refresh [1] 198/6 161/22 173/8 173/13 100/15 102/25 110/21 167/16 171/7 192/1 restaurants [3] 169/4 refuses [1] 45/17 114/25 115/6 115/19 201/5 212/20 213/9 175/15 175/22 176/5 169/14 200/9 regard [15] 16/10 115/20 117/10 121/4 180/18 199/5 restrained [1] 37/6 remembered [1] 73/6 97/22 113/17 requirement [5] 127/5 127/25 136/1 51/19 **restricted** [1] 212/8 139/4 146/4 147/9 116/11 137/19 140/11 138/15 139/19 145/1 remind [2] 74/5 **restriction** [5] 196/11 156/22 167/3 184/23 145/17 149/15 156/4 183/22 144/9 164/18 202/8 202/9 202/13 187/3 193/10 203/12 156/12 160/24 161/24 reminder [1] 54/5 requirements [2] 205/17 212/16 213/21 163/18 167/18 173/15 remit [3] 138/22 148/18 156/4 restrictions [43] 11/3 regardless [3] 115/4 175/10 176/2 177/10 138/23 183/18 research [1] 198/13 11/8 14/22 14/24 17/1 115/17 208/12 177/11 178/22 184/14 remotely [1] 9/8 reserved [2] 142/12 27/7 34/11 35/12 regards [5] 119/4 185/16 188/15 192/8 remove [1] 138/7 143/11 35/17 41/25 42/15 147/18 165/11 185/23 192/16 194/16 196/12 renewable [1] 50/24 residents [1] 212/1 42/16 42/19 44/12 192/9 196/17 198/9 201/18 Renfrewshire [2] 46/5 46/5 47/4 49/12 resignation [1] 3/16 regime [1] 207/6 206/18 206/24 208/9 77/8 89/14 89/19 109/6 112/6 Resilience [2] 8/4 regret [3] 79/9 81/5 211/13 214/3 repatriated [1] 64/4 134/18 99/20 102/3 110/22 167/9 repeat [1] 1/16 resolve [1] 36/12 119/22 131/12 133/20 relations [2] 144/10 regs [1] 200/17 139/22 140/12 141/15 repetition [1] 174/23 resolved [1] 36/12 155/9 regular [8] 139/16 145/17 158/25 159/16 relationship [17] 6/5 **rephrase [1]** 1/16 resort [2] 152/2 139/17 147/16 162/6 replaced [1] 98/1 26/14 39/4 40/11 159/22 169/14 193/15 194/3 168/10 175/8 180/23 194/13 195/10 195/23 40/12 43/2 91/2 93/23 replacement [1] resource [4] 51/2 180/24 94/3 94/3 94/4 94/13 185/6 159/19 160/6 160/23 196/5 196/9 201/21 regularity [1] 105/16 144/21 144/22 146/5 replies [9] 20/23 resources [5] 147/7 205/2 regularly [2] 133/22 167/10 168/9 148/8 148/10 158/22 21/11 21/16 37/20 restrictive [1] 205/7 187/22 37/24 43/19 47/10 relationships [2] 6/2 160/9 rests [2] 4/17 4/24 regulated [2] 191/17 23/19 47/21 109/17 respect [6] 104/7 result [8] 38/20 43/15 191/21 relatively [5] 124/21 reply [14] 11/18 149/1 157/15 168/5 87/18 107/19 145/14 **regulation [6]** 23/15 20/18 20/20 21/1 21/4 184/1 212/13 150/22 188/4 195/24 186/4 189/13 198/23 155/25 156/18 163/12 197/15 21/8 21/13 31/16 38/5 respective [1] 43/3 resulted [4] 172/12 164/6 191/24 respiratory [3] 170/6 | 172/24 183/3 186/12 relatives [1] 210/11 47/15 47/25 59/5 regulation 9 [1] 166/24 190/16 174/6 174/13 resulting [1] 171/23 release [2] 63/22 156/18 68/19 report [5] 4/14 57/23 respond [5] 20/12 results [1] 45/7 regulations [19] released [2] 154/17 145/15 157/12 196/25 76/21 100/4 182/14 resurgence [1] 17/21 22/14 22/25 154/19 reported [2] 147/10 207/20 159/11 36/8 148/18 149/9 relevant [7] 38/24 197/5 responding [2] retain [2] 71/24

171/11 202/22 164/5 167/13 168/9 96/14 106/14 125/21 R said [50] 3/11 13/20 risk [5] 136/20 15/24 16/10 16/19 168/11 170/14 171/4 135/3 137/7 137/14 retain... [1] 116/12 174/22 206/24 207/2 35/9 44/22 47/6 48/22 171/20 174/18 174/22 138/17 139/16 139/18 retained [11] 70/12 211/8 54/21 55/25 57/15 174/25 175/21 176/9 140/17 140/22 141/1 71/12 73/3 79/13 risks [3] 59/10 196/6 60/5 60/24 61/10 64/8 185/25 187/25 189/1 141/12 142/1 142/6 114/15 115/20 116/9 211/10 67/1 67/3 67/16 68/21 189/7 189/11 191/2 142/8 142/14 142/23 117/3 120/7 120/11 70/12 74/18 76/22 193/10 197/23 198/22 143/6 143/24 144/3 ritual [1] 73/24 123/20 76/24 78/9 78/21 79/1 200/6 200/11 200/18 144/3 144/12 145/21 robust [2] 167/14 retention [2] 2/13 168/10 81/5 81/17 87/13 203/19 204/1 204/7 146/16 146/20 147/1 68/25 role [47] 1/20 2/22 107/9 110/3 111/13 204/18 209/3 209/10 147/2 147/5 147/8 retrieve [1] 81/11 3/11 3/16 3/23 4/4 4/7 112/12 113/20 114/20 209/11 209/17 210/7 147/12 147/16 148/5 **retrograde** [1] 167/1 5/7 5/23 6/18 7/6 7/6 121/20 124/3 125/16 212/13 212/23 213/23 148/11 151/17 151/25 retrospective [1] 7/19 10/5 13/25 24/5 125/17 132/9 141/6 saying [26] 12/23 153/7 155/9 155/11 172/5 25/11 25/17 28/5 28/7 158/17 159/17 165/14 20/11 20/20 21/1 155/22 156/17 161/14 return [3] 22/12 49/20 49/21 51/6 178/21 179/25 181/2 21/13 31/21 38/5 167/24 167/25 169/5 62/17 154/9 51/13 53/3 64/19 189/8 189/18 56/24 58/22 59/1 169/12 171/6 171/15 returned [1] 3/10 89/25 92/23 92/24 59/14 59/18 66/11 171/24 172/2 172/12 salient [35] 71/21 revealing [1] 65/21 96/21 97/3 97/9 97/15 73/11 74/19 115/7 71/15 75/4 75/19 173/18 173/18 178/11 revelation [1] 125/24 97/16 97/23 134/8 115/13 116/22 116/25 76/12 92/6 92/10 182/2 184/24 189/10 review [5] 18/6 51/2 140/18 140/23 141/13 117/1 121/4 121/17 92/12 101/20 121/12 191/14 196/24 197/1 115/22 205/25 206/4 122/4 125/10 126/6 183/6 192/6 211/17 197/9 197/10 211/23 147/4 166/6 166/12 revise [1] 212/13 182/1 182/3 182/5 126/8 126/10 126/13 213/15 211/25 213/21 214/12 revived [1] 81/14 182/22 182/25 126/16 126/19 126/24 says [32] 4/14 11/13 **Scotland's [6]** 57/5 **Richard [1]** 83/18 roles [3] 96/25 127/3 127/4 127/5 13/6 28/18 33/9 33/15 58/17 151/21 155/16 Richard Leonard [1] 105/25 108/2 127/12 127/25 129/18 33/17 38/9 59/15 63/4 156/21 168/22 83/18 room [13] 8/4 9/2 130/8 130/22 131/2 87/8 119/3 158/15 Scottish [145] 1/21 rid [1] 74/8 131/14 131/17 132/12 158/17 162/11 162/15 2/24 3/10 5/12 8/3 8/4 18/13 41/20 57/25 right [71] 13/14 132/23 133/13 169/22 165/6 166/20 188/19 80/8 134/18 188/6 8/9 9/1 10/24 11/4 15/23 18/11 21/22 189/8 194/20 195/4 170/9 188/23 189/16 190/12 24/3 24/20 25/11 32/4 48/10 55/11 same [19] 39/19 196/1 204/9 190/14 190/22 190/25 27/21 27/23 27/25 62/17 74/8 87/11 193/15 193/17 197/14 rooms [1] 8/17 48/12 51/8 57/21 28/4 28/6 30/1 30/17 91/22 94/18 95/7 rough [1] 43/21 57/25 66/9 69/22 200/13 200/15 203/22 30/19 31/9 31/14 95/16 101/11 101/18 round [2] 184/13 70/10 70/23 75/10 206/21 33/25 34/12 35/4 108/22 109/12 109/21 201/9 78/2 79/20 124/6 scale [1] 187/3 35/11 38/12 39/16 112/3 112/18 119/15 route [5] 7/9 152/20 150/9 150/15 172/24 scenario [2] 135/5 40/8 40/10 40/14 42/7 119/16 120/20 122/14 152/24 153/11 180/11 190/9 197/20 211/19 45/22 46/6 48/4 48/11 136/8 123/19 124/1 125/15 50/17 53/4 54/9 60/22 routinely [4] 122/19 satisfied [1] 118/3 **scenarios** [1] 55/18 126/12 127/17 134/15 scenes [1] 141/10 207/9 209/20 211/6 64/14 64/18 65/4 **Saturdays** [1] 79/22 134/19 134/22 136/12 65/24 66/6 66/19 68/9 scheme [4] 45/12 rugby [13] 37/17 save [1] 90/20 138/22 139/23 143/16 63/12 63/17 63/25 saw [2] 137/23 188/1 69/15 70/2 70/5 71/4 45/17 45/20 46/13 145/10 147/13 148/23 64/6 64/17 64/25 65/7 say [120] 1/16 4/19 science [7] 24/4 24/5 71/9 71/10 72/11 73/1 150/17 151/13 154/25 65/9 65/20 65/21 66/6 4/25 6/5 6/9 6/11 6/14 24/9 24/10 24/17 73/5 77/24 78/11 156/11 156/11 156/16 66/9 7/25 8/8 8/25 9/17 24/18 24/19 78/14 78/20 83/19 163/14 164/23 165/12 9/18 10/14 11/20 84/2 84/8 84/12 85/15 rule [5] 55/15 114/24 science-based [1] 165/17 165/21 166/25 165/2 165/11 206/9 11/24 12/1 15/15 21/8 24/9 85/20 87/14 88/20 167/23 173/6 174/5 25/8 26/22 27/22 28/7 89/2 89/4 89/10 89/15 Rule 9 [1] 114/24 scientific [17] 7/18 175/18 177/19 178/25 rules [20] 10/25 11/2 30/18 31/17 36/17 14/4 15/1 19/13 22/20 90/5 92/7 93/23 94/6 179/17 180/1 187/9 11/10 13/15 15/18 37/16 38/2 39/4 43/11 22/21 23/9 49/9 67/23 96/17 97/6 98/13 189/15 189/24 190/6 21/21 25/2 99/16 43/21 44/25 45/2 47/5 84/11 85/16 174/20 103/17 107/4 107/22 192/14 193/12 194/4 113/22 137/20 151/4 49/20 49/23 51/15 177/1 198/8 198/13 110/18 112/25 113/8 199/10 200/20 203/19 161/22 162/25 163/2 52/25 53/2 56/2 58/3 198/18 206/23 113/15 113/21 113/23 214/3 163/6 163/23 164/15 59/9 60/4 60/7 60/24 scientists [3] 7/1 114/11 116/8 117/25 Right Honourable [1] 165/16 165/21 166/7 62/3 65/8 65/18 66/15 91/10 153/1 118/23 119/2 119/25 95/7 68/19 74/10 76/16 120/9 121/1 125/19 run [4] 21/9 173/10 **scope** [1] 212/15 rightly [3] 186/9 Scot [2] 119/9 120/25 195/2 204/15 77/2 79/9 79/14 81/7 132/25 133/3 134/13 190/5 212/23 run-up [1] 173/10 81/8 81/9 85/2 85/2 **Scotland [94]** 3/7 137/4 137/15 138/4 rights [4] 156/5 running [5] 85/1 85/6 88/4 88/15 89/9 99/7 138/13 138/14 139/9 3/17 13/18 38/22 156/13 157/4 157/10 153/23 154/2 180/3 107/13 110/19 111/11 38/24 39/1 39/11 42/1 141/19 142/6 143/19 rigour [1] 158/20 117/7 120/23 121/11 42/16 42/24 45/13 145/18 146/2 147/11 **RWCS [2]** 135/5 **rip [1]** 137/1 123/20 129/23 133/16 45/17 45/20 45/21 148/8 148/17 149/8 135/8 rise [2] 109/5 169/19 135/1 136/3 141/5 46/14 46/23 54/3 150/4 151/3 152/7 rises [2] 170/15 143/13 144/8 145/14 56/23 60/9 60/14 62/4 152/8 154/12 155/21 189/21 **SAGE [2]** 57/22 146/18 148/4 149/11 63/12 63/14 64/12 156/21 157/10 157/14 rising [3] 170/25 178/9 156/14 162/20 163/17 64/15 66/5 87/4 87/14 158/3 164/19 166/22

89/25 142/6 S 38/22 39/1 47/4 47/23 Shirley-Anne [1] 185/20 196/16 200/5 48/24 56/18 56/24 servants [3] 4/10 69/24 significantly [3] Scottish... [17] 167/3 59/6 61/11 63/2 63/3 93/17 116/5 **shops [2]** 90/17 170/25 181/20 201/17 167/10 167/12 168/1 63/8 75/21 86/10 87/2 serve [1] 170/11 169/3 similar [3] 71/25 168/8 174/20 176/12 106/18 119/1 133/7 served [2] 3/6 108/2 **short [9]** 3/2 17/3 110/11 155/12 201/22 204/14 205/25 133/9 138/7 139/13 service [16] 4/8 93/4 49/21 62/19 95/3 Similarly [1] 138/11 206/15 207/1 208/1 170/5 170/7 174/9 105/17 153/25 155/7 93/5 93/13 93/15 **simplify [1]** 164/12 211/18 212/6 212/22 174/13 189/13 190/11 93/18 137/5 137/15 193/13 simply [16] 4/25 213/4 191/17 195/3 199/23 138/4 139/10 169/15 **shorthand [2]** 65/15 14/20 25/18 53/24 Scottish Care [1] 202/25 207/12 213/6 170/2 178/22 184/19 66/12 75/25 107/12 121/8 211/18 214/13 201/13 203/25 shortly [5] 11/7 11/14 113/24 152/17 170/8 Scottish Inquiry [1] seeing [6] 47/19 48/2 services [2] 13/2 14/21 14/23 65/9 171/18 172/20 195/3 114/11 84/23 188/3 201/12 173/16 should [88] 2/1 7/11 196/7 198/22 214/2 **screen [6]** 1/19 6/13 205/10 11/10 14/19 14/19 session [1] 63/2 since [1] 6/7 20/1 32/15 35/14 41/9 seek [9] 102/6 105/7 set [14] 14/9 15/14 14/25 17/9 17/12 single [9] 100/9 script [1] 41/10 129/21 129/23 130/2 16/16 16/18 18/17 17/17 17/21 18/8 21/6 103/10 114/13 117/12 scrutiny [4] 163/8 21/12 28/19 30/5 32/6 130/6 133/15 138/8 130/3 132/17 175/24 22/1 22/24 29/3 52/1 163/11 165/16 166/5 175/24 73/5 75/2 126/1 41/3 45/13 46/7 47/12 151/11 181/1 searched [1] 81/14 seeking [10] 15/1 177/17 195/20 55/24 55/25 58/7 sipping [1] 166/1 sec [3] 57/1 57/12 setting [6] 34/18 61/10 64/25 68/10 23/4 30/1 109/11 sits [1] 93/12 57/20 43/12 45/15 139/8 115/16 150/5 165/11 68/13 72/3 72/16 73/3 sitting [2] 73/13 second [16] 2/10 171/18 172/20 175/12 156/23 159/10 76/7 85/8 86/12 87/8 162/12 17/22 32/14 37/11 seem [1] 89/18 several [1] 175/10 94/12 103/12 106/8 situation [23] 24/22 45/14 50/4 51/9 52/8 seemed [3] 23/10 severe [1] 205/13 106/11 106/12 111/10 35/9 38/18 45/23 46/4 52/11 58/1 73/4 89/22 109/6 203/14 111/10 111/14 114/7 48/22 54/17 87/17 severe' [1] 203/21 96/2 97/6 158/12 seems [6] 15/6 42/4 115/1 115/6 115/20 90/20 91/6 102/11 severity [1] 198/13 158/16 48/1 58/12 148/4 115/24 115/24 116/9 103/5 135/1 135/15 SGoRR [4] 32/3 secondary [1] 213/2 116/22 117/18 117/21 196/5 134/18 135/7 135/9 136/10 137/9 137/23 secretaries [11] seen [24] 15/17 shall [2] 62/17 117/22 121/5 126/11 169/21 173/18 191/8 28/13 74/4 96/18 31/20 34/1 39/23 153/22 126/17 127/13 127/16 192/18 201/2 205/24 105/20 110/25 115/4 47/11 49/3 53/12 shambles [1] 40/2 127/24 128/2 130/5 situations [2] 101/7 115/24 122/6 130/3 66/20 74/10 74/12 **shambolic** [2] 38/20 130/6 131/8 138/23 105/18 137/11 177/15 74/22 80/13 83/20 49/5 140/1 142/21 153/3 **six [5]** 63/13 69/12 secretary [52] 9/6 85/17 113/3 137/1 **shape [1]** 160/15 156/8 157/6 158/7 79/1 82/4 191/19 52/21 56/20 57/23 149/25 169/16 170/23 **share [2]** 53/10 53/24 158/16 159/23 160/21 six years [1] 82/4 58/13 58/19 96/25 172/1 172/9 178/24 161/5 163/13 164/8 size [2] 32/14 61/22 shared [1] 52/5 97/3 97/17 97/18 178/25 179/3 sharing [1] 120/5 179/21 180/17 181/8 slight [2] 23/22 97/23 98/3 102/8 188/16 188/18 202/2 153/10 sees [2] 111/6 she [66] 8/2 12/8 104/11 104/24 105/25 12/10 13/8 13/9 13/21 slightly [10] 22/17 208/6 208/25 209/18 187/22 108/1 108/21 111/6 14/1 14/2 15/10 15/22 209/19 210/7 213/24 **selected [2]** 10/14 39/23 42/21 126/22 112/19 119/14 127/22 15/23 15/24 16/1 17/1 shouldn't [1] 43/16 98/24 135/25 136/6 153/9 130/7 134/8 134/9 selling [1] 88/20 21/16 37/24 38/2 48/1 show [4] 74/23 88/11 153/10 166/15 202/3 137/12 140/17 140/22 send [2] 83/3 83/4 48/16 52/15 52/17 175/7 191/7 slipping [1] 54/7 141/1 141/12 146/11 senior [5] 59/22 52/19 59/21 59/22 **showing [2]** 73/2 **slow [2]** 137/8 139/8 146/11 162/3 162/24 93/22 116/5 142/5 59/22 60/14 60/16 slower [1] 17/20 131/8 163/5 163/10 165/14 70/9 70/11 70/13 71/1 206/5 shown [5] 32/14 45/9 slowly [1] 1/14 168/16 172/17 179/16 sense [5] 23/6 23/24 71/5 71/12 71/17 small [4] 67/24 167/1 192/8 205/10 182/6 183/7 183/11 38/3 212/9 214/1 71/17 73/19 76/13 **shows** [1] 54/6 110/15 112/8 197/12 185/19 186/7 193/25 sent [4] 30/24 43/21 76/14 76/21 79/25 sic [1] 178/10 **small' [2]** 109/18 194/4 194/6 201/8 127/9 196/17 80/2 82/1 82/7 82/8 sick [1] 43/18 109/23 206/22 208/13 212/4 sentence [4] 127/10 82/10 82/11 82/12 side [2] 19/1 147/11 smell [1] 212/10 secretary's [2] 51/3 sign [4] 47/14 48/16 133/16 159/18 160/7 82/15 83/7 98/5 98/8 Smith [11] 54/4 54/4 159/4 103/12 107/25 108/2 49/6 138/4 separate [2] 38/6 57/2 57/16 57/21 **section [1]** 135/17 109/19 109/24 128/25 58/15 58/20 59/13 152/10 sign off [1] 138/4 **sector [1]** 3/21 September [18] 11/2 152/6 152/10 152/11 **Signal [1]** 114/1 84/16 185/7 212/16 sectors [1] 160/4 11/4 11/13 14/11 182/17 182/18 185/7 signed [2] 95/22 96/8 SNP [2] 82/23 83/8 secure [1] 82/20 191/1 200/21 200/24 14/12 14/13 14/16 significance [4] so [235] securing [1] 9/24 14/17 32/12 32/19 she'd [1] 17/2 20/15 28/25 80/19 **So...it's [1]** 203/25 security [4] 82/22 44/21 50/3 51/19 she's [5] 11/14 12/11 social [25] 97/8 97/21 119/24 212/11 213/19 69/10 69/21 79/2 79/7 48/1 48/16 76/24 significant [16] 12/25 97/19 98/1 98/8 see [46] 9/5 12/10 79/15 shed [1] 80/16 46/15 46/24 106/16 108/22 111/7 138/6 14/17 15/5 16/14 19/3 serious [3] 23/25 112/22 125/18 129/15 139/12 146/12 152/13 shenanigans [2] 24/12 24/23 28/11 207/2 208/5 109/19 109/24 136/24 152/3 169/2 161/16 162/4 162/25 28/17 32/9 33/23 servant [3] 83/6 Shirley [1] 69/24 179/20 184/18 184/23 163/5 164/17 165/15

26/23 29/6 30/6 30/12 sourced [1] 79/11 148/18 158/4 S St [3] 9/12 79/21 36/18 38/23 43/18 **sources [1]** 145/5 80/23 stay-at-home [2] social... [9] 168/17 44/9 44/10 49/7 49/7 **South [1]** 198/14 St Andrew's House 148/18 158/4 174/14 181/16 183/8 50/19 55/7 55/8 55/12 South Africa [1] **[3]** 9/12 79/21 80/23 stenographer [1] 183/12 185/20 186/7 56/7 56/10 60/6 65/13 198/14 **stable [1]** 188/4 1/14 194/1 212/5 67/5 68/3 68/20 82/9 space [11] 19/14 staff [10] 3/6 4/21 6/7 step [3] 50/20 92/2 social care [3] 98/1 83/4 85/6 90/4 110/11 24/1 40/18 83/15 49/20 50/7 50/19 149/19 98/8 181/16 112/11 135/18 147/18 72/23 73/18 82/3 83/23 139/11 160/19 stepping [1] 94/2 social media [2] 166/12 200/21 168/12 191/17 191/21 82/16 steps [7] 18/7 30/22 161/16 164/17 191/25 stage [18] 5/1 44/23 46/9 135/13 201/1 **sometimes [26]** 7/3 socialise [1] 21/22 9/8 22/9 25/21 26/14 **spaces [1]** 191/22 45/13 48/3 70/3 71/1 201/3 212/13 societal [2] 23/6 26/15 26/16 38/16 83/16 123/6 139/5 **Spads [1]** 38/7 stepwise [1] 170/22 180/15 139/14 193/22 194/23 Stewart [1] 119/11 45/9 55/16 80/13 **spanning** [1] 79/4 societally [1] 23/23 84/21 85/5 98/22 99/2 195/25 197/21 199/5 stick [3] 14/5 15/2 |spat [8] 34/2 34/5 society [3] 160/4 36/1 44/23 44/24 45/5 204/13 211/22 212/12 76/23 100/19 100/24 103/2 174/4 182/15 131/25 132/10 164/10 45/6 45/7 stages [4] 97/10 still [22] 13/8 13/15 **solution [1]** 187/23 166/8 167/7 170/6 132/11 198/14 207/3 57/9 59/20 60/21 70/4 speak [10] 1/13 some [117] 6/1 10/18 175/10 213/1 26/19 71/14 73/21 122/15 123/25 124/14 stakeholders [11] 14/3 25/22 29/11 31/8 somewhere [3] 62/1 85/8 140/25 141/3 9/25 24/7 89/11 89/18 131/20 143/11 144/3 37/2 37/2 37/9 38/25 73/13 172/14 141/8 158/18 184/3 90/1 90/9 90/12 91/1 154/4 177/8 177/10 49/1 49/5 50/22 51/2 182/10 189/5 190/13 Sommerville [1] speaking [9] 54/1 92/5 135/21 174/21 52/7 53/12 56/12 70/25 54/2 62/23 83/21 stand [6] 91/17 198/14 201/24 203/6 59/13 60/4 64/6 64/18 soon [1] 65/24 165/4 165/9 170/16 162/18 165/25 193/16 210/2 67/12 69/13 69/22 **sooner [2]** 209/2 195/22 207/25 195/4 195/8 stir [1] 36/22 70/15 72/5 72/7 74/22 special [28] 2/23 3/3 stop [10] 31/10 31/21 209/21 **standing [2]** 162/13 74/23 74/23 75/17 3/13 3/23 4/1 4/4 4/9 165/8 66/7 127/10 130/21 sorry [20] 19/25 75/24 76/8 76/10 78/7 4/14 4/17 4/20 5/2 5/8 stands [1] 177/21 33/12 35/14 60/6 133/16 137/11 185/13 80/4 80/16 84/6 85/15 71/23 86/20 87/23 5/13 5/17 6/1 7/7 7/19 start [6] 11/12 50/4 186/19 204/10 85/21 86/10 86/23 123/23 146/19 153/18 18/11 24/6 28/15 94/23 145/7 156/23 **stopping [1]** 173/12 88/1 90/10 98/11 **storage [1]** 124/15 158/13 166/10 168/15 51/12 52/5 92/23 206/21 98/11 98/14 98/15 92/25 93/2 93/12 94/1 started [7] 41/2 168/22 180/25 185/4 storm [2] 173/19 98/16 99/15 101/21 199/19 203/17 213/5 101/3 134/12 169/19 170/25 174/1 101/23 105/24 108/16 214/11 **specific [9]** 9/19 10/3 | 173/5 182/20 197/21 **straight [2]** 100/12 108/24 109/2 109/18 **sort [37]** 10/14 16/12 17/25 31/25 68/4 **starting [2]** 31/12 100/12 111/25 112/15 112/16 17/5 17/10 18/4 22/16 76/10 110/8 207/15 33/18 straightaway [1] 118/21 121/22 121/23 starts [2] 37/13 193/7 65/16 23/13 24/12 27/10 212/2 122/10 122/15 125/4 specifically [7] 38/15 state [7] 18/4 31/5 34/3 38/24 40/19 strategic [4] 3/12 128/19 128/24 132/2 140/17 140/22 141/1 41/18 41/23 42/17 57/19 59/10 74/2 49/21 50/8 51/6 132/4 134/7 134/14 43/1 49/2 49/6 50/16 144/19 157/22 209/13 141/12 168/20 **strategies** [1] 196/2 134/25 135/22 135/22 51/18 55/18 64/3 **statement [50]** 1/19 speculate [1] 71/14 strategising [2] 136/1 137/19 137/22 67/12 71/21 81/13 speculation [1] 60/16 1/20 2/5 2/7 2/10 2/12 27/23 28/3 138/6 140/23 141/15 81/25 82/20 90/7 **speed [1]** 158/20 2/15 2/17 4/25 6/12 strategy [17] 27/20 149/13 151/13 152/4 90/15 91/4 91/9 93/24 speeding [3] 150/12 7/24 9/16 13/7 13/8 28/8 34/1 34/4 51/1 152/22 153/6 155/3 138/6 140/23 141/15 150/22 150/22 14/2 14/24 49/23 51/2 52/20 53/4 54/10 155/10 155/11 158/4 149/14 170/5 spend [1] 186/22 52/25 69/6 77/3 77/15 55/6 68/7 164/20 162/4 163/3 164/12 77/16 78/9 78/10 89/7 164/23 173/22 181/11 sort of [28] 16/12 spending [1] 51/2 166/16 168/14 168/18 17/5 17/10 18/4 23/13 spent [2] 27/22 28/3 95/19 95/20 95/22 182/23 198/3 169/16 170/5 170/23 27/10 34/3 38/24 **SPF [1]** 166/21 95/25 96/2 96/6 96/8 Strath [1] 176/3 170/23 172/1 173/12 40/19 41/18 41/23 spike [1] 105/11 96/10 96/16 98/17 straying [2] 83/14 174/6 178/9 178/11 42/17 49/2 49/6 55/18 **split [1]** 17/22 99/6 121/20 123/14 84/8 186/23 187/18 187/21 64/3 67/12 71/21 spoke [4] 84/1 168/9 134/4 134/24 139/21 strengthens [1] 189/6 190/18 193/6 81/13 81/25 90/7 175/4 175/5 140/1 140/6 140/10 45/18 196/14 197/24 197/24 90/15 91/9 93/24 140/14 147/15 148/21 stress [5] 7/8 7/20 **spoken [1]** 192/12 203/12 206/9 206/17 138/6 141/15 149/14 sport [4] 97/17 97/25 152/5 174/18 197/23 8/21 138/23 160/14 somebody [6] 63/22 170/5 98/2 206/22 **statements** [5] 1/17 **stretched** [1] 148/9 76/8 81/18 91/20 strict [2] 23/16 95/12 sorts [4] 26/10 31/12 **spot [1]** 148/25 1/18 30/14 85/24 104/10 155/2 spread [6] 33/19 95/17 73/2 84/4 strictly [2] 24/3 37/18 somehow [2] 75/14 sought [3] 16/2 53/24 54/20 136/2 138/1 statistical [3] 61/6 strike [1] 90/23 204/3 159/14 178/3 170/23 196/25 strikes [1] 30/4 176/24 someone [3] 150/23 striking [1] 176/16 **statistics** [1] 172/1 sounding [3] 6/21 spring [1] 170/4 162/18 165/24 8/20 19/3 **springing [1]** 58/8 **statutory [1]** 115/21 **stripes** [1] 163/9 Somerville [1] 69/24 stay [11] 12/3 12/11 strong [6] 15/22 sounds [1] 153/17 Sridhar [6] 35/3 83/1 something [35] 83/1 84/1 84/14 13/25 15/19 16/15 53/16 59/9 59/15 source [2] 65/10 17/17 24/11 24/14 42/7 42/7 55/8 83/22 81/18 182/17 60/16 89/11

132/5 132/11 139/8 19/13 24/16 30/7 37/13 145/6 S suspect [3] 151/11 148/18 151/9 151/25 194/4 200/23 71/19 89/20 97/25 ten years [1] 51/23 strongly [4] 18/4 155/21 157/24 173/21 suspend [2] 30/23 101/15 106/3 106/15 tend [8] 75/22 98/25 45/2 91/16 213/23 179/17 186/24 195/1 173/8 107/10 107/17 110/20 146/3 170/6 170/7 **structure** [7] 93/5 198/17 199/1 204/15 sustained [1] 169/10 114/15 118/2 118/3 174/8 174/14 178/17 102/22 103/8 103/16 sudden [1] 105/11 swear [1] 172/18 126/21 158/19 161/2 tended [2] 26/13 92/2 103/20 104/2 153/7 164/10 181/21 184/22 tenor [2] 6/16 127/6 suffered [2] 184/7 **swimming [1]** 169/3 **structures [6]** 29/20 198/21 199/13 199/14 term [2] 50/22 193/13 184/7 Swinney [7] 26/7 94/9 98/12 99/21 26/11 27/6 99/2 119/7 sufficient [1] 210/18 199/19 201/1 201/3 termed [1] 182/9 107/22 110/17 166/19 166/20 212/13 213/13 suggest [17] 15/7 terminology [2] struggles [1] 19/4 23/12 47/9 48/3 53/16 sworn [2] 95/8 takers [1] 5/2 126/22 182/10 **stuck [1]** 109/1 58/12 68/6 99/24 terms [34] 5/21 25/2 215/13 takes [1] 73/11 stuff [3] 71/22 74/8 28/13 29/22 34/19 137/7 137/18 146/4 sympathies [1] taking [13] 1/14 128/8 157/13 159/23 166/4 48/10 48/13 55/20 36/7 40/15 42/9 50/9 100/11 Sturgeon [43] 3/7 86/9 90/20 91/17 92/3 172/1 194/24 196/10 **symptom [2]** 213/20 54/9 55/5 102/11 3/17 6/6 10/20 11/3 **suggested [6]** 24/10 213/24 96/20 140/3 166/1 110/20 112/2 122/3 11/7 11/13 12/7 12/18 105/15 110/13 152/12 symptoms [17] 169/1 179/9 181/25 133/18 135/6 136/19 15/15 20/9 20/23 165/6 196/2 206/18 211/13 211/18 **talk [9]** 7/8 47/6 73/7 136/20 141/1 141/21 21/11 26/7 26/11 27/6 suggesting [7] 15/2 211/19 211/23 212/2 98/16 110/10 124/10 143/7 143/8 147/21 37/13 37/20 38/9 22/2 63/11 66/15 212/8 212/12 212/14 178/17 191/20 210/5 153/6 168/19 171/11 38/11 39/5 39/11 180/19 194/23 200/25 212/15 212/25 213/1 176/8 186/3 194/3 talked [2] 92/25 43/19 47/10 47/21 suggests [6] 15/18 213/2 213/12 213/25 211/3 197/4 198/4 210/14 48/14 50/3 52/10 69/5 33/25 152/6 152/7 214/3 talking [11] 2/4 14/13 210/24 69/9 70/8 70/14 71/7 152/11 157/12 system [25] 27/8 31/10 41/24 110/11 test [6] 7/8 7/20 71/11 75/5 79/1 79/6 suited [1] 48/7 71/22 73/14 75/14 111/19 126/23 155/7 112/21 180/2 188/3 81/23 82/23 83/21 78/5 83/6 103/25 162/13 163/25 209/3 summarise [1] 41/11 196/17 96/21 99/1 119/6 tested [1] 209/20 **summary [7]** 104/8 104/9 111/14 116/13 targeting [1] 188/11 Sturgeon's [5] 15/5 122/10 135/14 135/24 Tariq [2] 1/3 62/21 104/10 109/8 136/9 testing [22] 8/21 20/18 25/1 47/25 152/21 201/5 202/14 150/14 150/21 151/5 taste [1] 212/10 139/14 179/14 179/25 73/18 152/13 155/12 155/16 team [6] 3/13 4/20 180/2 181/3 181/5 **summer [5]** 51/16 subject [9] 2/4 30/18 170/17 170/24 171/9 155/20 155/21 155/22 13/1 30/24 118/23 188/12 189/17 192/16 47/12 48/25 74/13 171/13 180/2 195/18 205/9 154/12 195/18 196/17 205/9 85/7 109/15 148/15 207/6 207/9 207/10 summit [1] 50/16 **systems [10]** 118/25 teams [5] 16/11 152/5 **Sundays** [1] 79/23 119/5 137/16 137/17 75/18 77/19 89/14 208/14 208/25 210/21 **submission** [2] 73/4 supplementary [1] 149/3 151/8 181/10 89/17 210/21 210/25 211/6 107/14 191/18 191/18 196/19 technical [1] 124/11 123/14 testing/prioritising submissions [1] support [10] 5/3 9/24 technically [3] 93/1 **[1]** 188/12 177/15 13/20 34/13 36/4 46/7 tests [3] 189/19 93/3 157/18 **submitted [5]** 70/20 table [6] 10/4 10/17 96/17 158/24 201/19 technology [2] 154/7 211/1 211/1 70/21 70/24 71/2 118/21 119/1 162/12 201/20 206/2 than [42] 11/23 29/22 78/12 201/9 **supporters** [1] 27/25 **Telegram [1]** 114/1 30/1 30/6 37/5 37/23 **submitting [1]** 70/20 tackling [1] 50/25 supporting [1] 5/3 telephone [2] 131/5 38/13 42/11 43/4 subsection [1] tactic [2] 34/24 36/2 131/10 43/18 52/16 67/12 supportive [1] 158/14 tactics [3] 33/21 35/6 79/20 83/4 85/20 90/2 167/17 television [1] 161/16 subsequent [6] 35/7 tell [20] 6/23 12/11 **suppose [3]** 59/19 91/4 104/19 107/5 55/23 58/2 67/8 77/14 28/24 33/13 36/24 159/17 209/6 tagged [2] 197/4 110/16 115/16 118/13 114/10 138/19 197/7 135/25 136/6 140/23 53/17 55/4 56/3 58/7 **supposed [1]** 72/2 subsequently [5] sure [23] 11/17 12/11 tags [2] 197/10 59/25 66/3 67/3 72/6 151/4 153/9 153/9 87/12 128/16 156/1 197/11 13/12 15/16 16/25 78/13 111/17 129/23 159/13 159/24 170/8 156/9 157/8 19/9 74/7 90/24 91/3 tail [1] 66/13 135/13 153/1 191/3 171/16 174/11 175/1 substance [4] 1/12 take [29] 5/8 7/24 120/17 120/19 128/7 197/25 175/5 183/4 186/2 100/2 100/15 208/9 13/9 19/10 24/21 130/25 154/5 163/11 telling [11] 31/9 186/11 188/6 193/14 substantial [1] 100/4 34/17 44/22 46/9 48/7 163/19 171/14 179/2 209/2 211/2 48/21 58/15 63/22 **substantive [2]** 29/15 50/10 54/14 68/22 186/23 196/16 202/3 65/4 66/24 83/22 thank [33] 2/20 20/6 41/6 88/7 94/21 107/18 28/18 32/15 33/6 204/4 204/5 91/15 91/21 127/15 **subtle [1]** 116/25 111/8 121/25 139/19 surely [1] 65/12 165/24 86/16 86/22 88/22 success [1] 57/14 149/17 153/15 170/22 tells [5] 12/7 12/10 92/18 94/15 95/1 surge [1] 189/12 succumbed [1] 180/13 196/21 199/18 29/15 81/15 113/8 95/14 96/13 98/10 **surgery [2]** 173/9 85/10 200/7 202/22 203/14 99/5 108/14 116/3 185/1 temperature [1] such [29] 2/13 5/12 203/16 211/8 212/9 119/19 121/7 125/8 surprise [2] 189/6 9/25 94/6 102/12 taken [42] 6/16 6/18 134/6 148/14 153/22 202/6 temporary [1] 193/18 104/7 105/14 106/17 7/5 12/21 12/22 13/3 surprised [1] 157/5 ten [4] 37/13 51/23 154/8 155/6 158/2 106/23 112/24 114/11 14/9 14/11 14/25 15/3 166/9 168/13 187/24 susceptible [1] 62/14 145/6 115/23 116/1 120/6 15/13 18/8 19/11 ten minutes [2] 154/23 207/24 214/8 214/9

71/18 72/3 78/24 185/2 185/5 188/14 91/16 91/22 92/6 92/6 39/22 46/21 52/3 56/6 79/11 79/11 79/12 189/6 190/4 190/17 92/9 92/10 92/12 93/4 61/8 69/13 69/13 70/3 thank... [1] 214/14 79/13 80/5 80/22 81/6 190/18 205/4 205/14 93/6 93/19 94/1 96/12 70/12 71/8 71/22 thank you [25] 2/20 208/6 209/17 214/4 81/7 81/8 81/9 81/14 98/15 100/11 101/5 72/10 74/24 75/24 28/18 32/15 33/6 81/14 81/16 81/18 thereabouts [1] 101/6 102/20 104/7 77/21 78/2 79/10 86/16 86/22 88/22 83/4 84/21 85/3 89/20 19/20 106/4 106/4 106/11 80/14 80/21 81/2 81/3 92/18 95/1 95/14 90/2 90/8 91/7 91/18 thereafter [3] 121/22 112/3 115/24 117/22 81/11 81/20 83/2 84/4 96/13 98/10 99/5 91/18 91/23 92/9 118/3 119/13 123/7 86/1 91/8 91/9 91/18 122/1 131/18 108/14 116/3 121/7 93/19 93/24 101/14 therefore [29] 5/7 123/9 123/17 124/15 100/7 100/21 101/21 125/8 134/6 148/14 114/3 127/18 128/2 5/14 45/21 87/2 124/15 124/19 124/20 102/23 103/15 104/6 166/9 168/13 187/24 100/17 100/25 101/20 128/16 128/22 129/16 125/12 127/13 127/15 105/6 105/18 106/18 207/24 214/8 214/14 129/21 131/4 132/6 102/6 103/11 104/17 127/17 127/23 128/2 107/11 113/10 113/16 thankfully [2] 124/11 129/19 131/23 132/5 144/12 146/3 147/18 105/11 107/15 133/8 114/22 115/12 117/20 205/11 150/21 161/23 163/6 133/25 137/2 143/6 132/16 133/24 135/21 124/14 125/9 126/18 that [1487] 135/23 138/5 138/7 126/20 127/24 129/1 163/7 179/13 179/15 144/3 144/8 147/15 that's [78] 3/5 3/9 181/8 203/23 204/10 151/16 152/2 159/15 138/21 138/23 139/1 129/14 129/18 129/20 3/15 5/16 5/25 8/7 205/2 210/12 212/2 160/5 178/19 192/4 139/2 147/3 147/7 130/8 130/9 131/8 8/11 9/19 16/6 22/13 theme [1] 23/7 195/12 201/19 209/16 148/11 149/23 150/20 131/20 131/21 135/7 24/25 27/18 32/21 210/9 themselves [5] 5/9 151/14 151/14 151/18 136/6 137/13 138/9 33/5 33/6 33/10 33/12 61/2 84/18 137/14 these [53] 1/18 14/18 151/22 160/18 161/24 141/23 153/2 156/12 34/23 38/16 42/12 164/7 167/1 167/16 16/5 17/6 22/4 29/11 165/3 167/8 184/3 160/24 50/2 59/3 60/6 60/15 then [104] 3/2 3/6 32/10 32/17 35/6 36/9 167/19 168/6 169/9 184/4 184/8 184/9 60/20 63/3 68/24 69/8 3/10 10/16 11/20 37/2 40/25 47/1 58/10 171/4 171/5 171/12 184/15 185/17 190/21 69/11 71/18 79/2 90/4 11/24 12/1 13/20 67/23 69/1 69/9 69/20 173/11 173/25 176/17 192/24 193/14 196/6 94/3 96/15 98/7 98/9 20/18 21/6 24/16 33/9 69/24 71/12 72/5 73/2 176/19 176/19 178/2 197/7 197/12 198/17 101/10 101/12 110/25 83/10 85/24 90/14 184/7 186/20 195/8 33/20 34/9 35/12 201/3 207/9 208/5 115/8 115/21 118/4 95/18 98/14 112/25 195/11 197/3 197/4 208/15 208/25 209/20 37/24 38/2 38/25 118/14 119/16 124/2 40/10 47/21 50/18 113/3 126/4 128/14 200/9 203/20 203/20 210/11 213/12 214/7 125/7 125/21 128/18 58/2 59/5 59/15 69/17 128/17 130/11 130/16 204/11 208/12 211/2 though [8] 11/22 134/16 136/1 136/9 70/7 71/3 71/7 72/3 132/25 135/10 138/20 211/17 212/7 213/12 43/16 63/25 103/4 136/13 143/16 147/14 74/24 76/13 76/22 141/3 141/13 144/12 213/13 116/24 155/23 170/5 148/24 155/2 155/4 77/2 79/3 83/6 87/16 146/1 150/24 154/5 they're [10] 19/4 20/3 189/2 156/13 158/9 161/25 164/1 167/21 174/16 91/17 93/10 93/19 72/17 72/19 72/21 thought [32] 6/21 162/22 166/23 169/24 100/21 105/12 106/9 181/3 185/14 190/2 77/5 79/13 81/8 91/21 6/23 8/20 10/5 11/16 172/19 178/25 180/1 107/16 108/6 109/16 193/21 205/2 207/17 166/25 12/24 12/25 13/25 181/20 185/11 187/10 110/24 120/20 122/5 213/2 they've [1] 154/15 13/25 15/6 15/7 15/10 187/15 189/2 189/25 122/8 122/13 122/24 they [188] 2/9 2/19 15/12 19/2 20/24 25/5 thin [1] 195/24 190/23 202/24 204/18 124/23 126/18 126/20 7/1 7/4 7/10 7/11 7/11 28/2 37/6 42/24 58/6 thing [12] 52/16 205/9 209/22 212/23 127/21 129/19 129/20 10/15 11/16 11/21 66/13 80/8 89/6 90/4 58/21 61/11 72/3 their [42] 6/2 7/6 130/14 130/15 130/24 11/22 11/25 12/2 12/4 79/10 79/13 81/6 94/1 115/14 117/1 136/11 18/19 22/11 23/2 131/3 132/23 139/16 16/5 16/13 17/11 18/8 169/25 176/15 184/3 123/9 149/15 167/19 23/14 23/16 23/18 143/22 145/12 153/4 18/11 18/11 18/12 210/20 200/19 202/1 26/19 34/2 37/21 156/9 162/17 162/20 18/20 18/21 18/21 things [23] 10/17 thoughts [1] 132/3 37/25 39/3 45/9 45/11 166/2 170/21 171/20 20/1 23/1 23/19 25/7 22/22 33/21 44/6 44/8 thousands [2] 65/6 48/7 53/22 60/10 64/3 174/16 174/22 178/6 31/4 34/7 35/8 36/21 51/1 54/16 72/2 74/1 185/21 65/2 67/14 84/20 38/25 39/8 39/11 180/23 180/24 184/7 75/23 75/24 85/5 thrashing [2] 41/7 87/19 119/24 122/7 185/9 185/16 186/20 40/25 41/1 41/13 90/11 90/12 98/14 80/2 132/12 133/3 136/21 188/14 188/15 188/23 41/19 43/7 44/9 45/9 119/1 132/3 150/22 threat [8] 134/12 141/21 145/9 145/10 189/7 189/11 189/16 45/10 46/9 46/21 163/25 181/3 196/3 135/19 136/18 136/24 149/22 156/13 158/24 190/8 190/15 190/17 208/23 211/7 137/20 176/22 177/3 48/12 48/21 53/17 181/23 185/5 185/15 190/22 190/25 191/21 53/17 54/17 54/25 think [297] 202/21 186/13 196/4 204/10 194/15 195/11 197/16 55/9 57/24 61/14 thinking [8] 5/4 73/15 threats [1] 144/13 210/13 213/14 197/19 201/21 204/7 63/19 63/23 63/24 132/6 156/7 166/21 three [5] 41/11 58/5 them [93] 6/3 7/7 7/8 205/10 205/15 207/8 64/5 64/22 65/19 66/8 167/1 209/24 209/25 58/10 135/23 160/17 7/10 7/12 7/13 11/19 211/22 213/1 67/14 68/19 68/19 thinks [1] 59/14 threshold [2] 112/3 16/6 18/13 25/6 34/8 72/2 72/7 72/14 72/19 third [2] 172/12 112/4 there [334] 35/6 37/23 43/12 73/23 75/21 75/22 172/25 there's [38] 1/11 1/24 thresholds [1] 112/1 43/14 45/10 45/18 2/10 29/19 31/3 33/5 78/5 78/18 81/10 thirds [1] 197/5 through [35] 9/25 46/8 46/11 46/12 52/7 33/20 46/2 47/23 51/8 84/16 84/17 84/18 12/22 13/3 16/16 this [368] 53/25 54/14 54/15 84/19 84/22 85/2 85/9 **Thomson [2]** 9/10 51/16 65/6 76/10 22/10 32/2 66/10 71/8 55/10 55/11 55/13 76/23 79/3 83/25 86/2 85/11 85/12 85/21 142/5 74/1 79/18 80/10 57/24 58/6 58/8 61/14 92/25 108/24 116/24 85/22 85/23 87/16 those [97] 9/12 11/1 87/20 119/8 119/12 66/3 66/3 70/20 70/20 117/23 121/21 153/4 90/6 90/8 90/10 90/11 120/24 121/3 121/11 18/13 21/24 25/18 70/21 70/22 71/3 183/19 184/25 185/2 90/13 90/15 90/21 31/12 39/19 39/20 122/11 122/23 123/2

139/11 141/14 144/10 147/12 152/8 152/18 T 178/13 187/12 198/7 transmissible [14] 205/1 159/13 171/22 172/11 144/11 151/12 152/14 155/20 157/14 169/5 through... [15] 131/4 timing [3] 26/15 46/6 172/22 172/23 172/23 155/8 161/3 161/8 171/12 171/16 178/9 131/5 134/2 134/3 78/17 174/3 174/10 174/11 163/3 165/20 168/18 178/19 185/23 201/17 134/4 134/4 134/13 title [3] 97/25 98/2 180/9 181/18 186/1 183/23 185/11 186/21 212/11 213/19 214/2 137/1 137/2 166/25 98/2 186/9 186/11 186/23 195/25 197/16 214/4 171/19 195/10 208/21 200/22 201/19 210/5 **UK Government [21]** today [3] 77/17 85/6 transmission [10] 208/22 210/5 210/10 214/1 214/2 115/2 139/8 169/10 188/10 12/5 34/20 35/4 35/8 throughout [**9**] 28/5 today's [2] 95/25 191/23 198/16 206/24 trying [21] 22/13 36/5 36/10 38/13 40/15 113/3 136/2 146/23 36/5 36/23 42/8 63/24 207/5 208/20 209/16 43/25 44/8 44/25 45/8 96/11 147/17 157/2 171/12 **Todd [1]** 119/11 211/4 66/19 111/8 121/24 46/16 48/20 140/15 176/10 183/15 132/2 134/13 139/13 together [8] 9/13 141/25 143/2 143/23 transparency [7] **Thursday [2]** 1/1 19/5 41/3 108/5 112/23 116/7 116/15 151/4 157/3 160/2 145/20 146/10 155/20 26/24 134/14 146/9 174/2 117/4 117/10 117/20 160/2 164/3 177/8 201/17 thus [1] 163/13 174/16 133/2 198/2 198/22 211/9 **UK-wide** [1] 48/2 tighter [4] 105/20 told [9] 56/3 62/11 transparent [5] 55/5 Tuesday [3] 26/22 **UKHSA [1]** 178/10 110/6 110/7 110/10 55/17 55/19 68/8 64/14 70/18 70/19 47/16 47/16 ultimate [4] 10/12 til [1] 20/25 73/23 105/1 128/6 68/15 turn [16] 3/23 6/12 26/5 117/4 164/14 till [6] 21/2 23/8 47/8 155/10 transpire [1] 133/6 9/16 10/18 10/23 ultimately [39] 4/16 72/25 171/9 171/13 4/22 4/23 12/13 15/16 toll [1] 155/3 transpired [2] 118/15 19/22 27/20 28/10 time [95] 3/11 6/8 28/16 32/9 32/13 43/9 16/22 16/24 46/15 tomorrow [2] 43/21 124/19 11/5 12/9 16/8 17/4 transpires [1] 106/21 47/1 59/5 175/15 46/17 59/23 76/21 17/20 35/18 36/25 tonight [1] 200/22 transport [2] 140/3 175/22 77/22 98/3 103/9 38/14 44/3 44/11 46/5 too [8] 18/4 31/22 140/15 turned [2] 175/1 112/17 117/16 118/2 46/10 46/13 48/15 47/22 86/19 94/14 141/18 142/18 143/1 **trap [1]** 45/16 177/2 51/8 52/13 52/14 143/4 143/14 143/22 99/16 178/12 193/3 tweak [1] 23/22 trauma [2] 100/5 52/16 52/18 52/19 took [24] 32/11 38/25 146/8 147/1 153/11 208/5 **Twitter [1]** 83/17 52/20 55/23 57/18 46/22 49/25 56/15 travel [18] 49/13 two [22] 1/17 14/8 191/5 191/9 192/1 57/21 57/25 58/4 84/16 97/7 97/8 98/2 49/14 139/22 140/12 31/4 39/13 42/10 192/10 192/14 192/17 59/15 59/17 61/11 105/4 110/1 134/11 141/15 141/22 142/2 42/14 43/2 59/7 66/16 192/20 194/10 196/23 61/14 61/16 61/17 135/14 139/2 152/8 142/20 143/9 144/2 73/7 77/21 81/13 202/15 202/18 213/2 62/11 63/15 63/18 159/20 179/17 181/13 144/19 145/1 145/17 95/17 96/24 128/17 213/16 64/8 65/18 66/11 172/14 172/25 187/22 unannounced [1] 185/11 185/14 186/19 145/21 146/24 147/4 66/12 69/22 74/3 81/1 186/21 196/12 196/19 188/3 189/20 197/5 147/12 169/4 145/16 81/1 83/19 85/23 tool [1] 81/15 travelled [4] 63/16 205/21 unavailable [1] 85/25 88/5 88/11 top [6] 11/12 32/8 64/5 64/16 197/9 two days [2] 66/16 125/25 88/16 94/19 95/10 uncertainty [1] 32/10 63/3 122/19 travellers [1] 145/20 188/3 102/10 115/10 116/14 202/20 190/11 travelling [2] 65/7 two-thirds [1] 197/5 119/14 120/10 120/14 topic [2] 31/23 68/24 197/6 **type [4]** 101/10 **unclear [1]** 1/15 121/25 123/7 125/12 touch [1] 19/25 Treasury [2] 34/15 111/19 137/23 175/21 uncomfortable [2] 135/13 139/9 148/13 touched [3] 19/2 36/21 types [2] 127/6 127/7 64/18 66/20 149/5 158/5 158/8 136/14 173/3 treat [1] 78/2 typically [1] 149/1 uncontrolled [1] 161/8 164/3 164/10 towards [9] 51/9 52/8 treated [1] 78/3 169/9 typographical [1] 164/20 166/10 168/8 67/19 159/19 164/20 treatments [1] 176/2 1/25 **UNCRC [1]** 156/15 168/21 168/23 170/19 171/10 171/21 177/3 tricky [1] 189/15 undated [1] 63/3 174/12 175/20 176/4 U 182/20 tried [2] 66/7 139/10 under [21] 18/1 178/21 182/10 182/19 uk [74] 12/5 12/12 traced [1] 67/14 30/19 64/9 68/20 triggered [1] 46/22 191/14 197/25 198/19 15/11 17/16 17/19 tracing [3] 57/9 triple [3] 163/6 89/11 95/12 96/5 202/2 202/3 202/7 33/22 34/2 34/6 34/15 57/13 67/9 163/17 166/6 108/2 124/17 163/8 208/13 209/8 209/24 34/20 35/4 35/8 35/9 163/11 165/15 177/25 trajectory [2] 132/19 troubling [1] 93/9 209/25 211/2 211/7 35/23 36/10 38/13 188/20 true [6] 2/7 2/17 180/3 180/4 185/18 timeline [3] 42/9 38/21 40/11 40/15 tranche [1] 154/19 95/25 96/10 194/4 185/20 186/15 195/17 43/12 168/15 42/2 42/6 42/23 43/25 201/23 204/23 204/20 transcribe [1] 78/1 times [36] 25/12 44/8 44/25 45/8 45/16 under way [2] 177/25 transcribed [1] **trump [1]** 189/18 25/17 40/18 40/18 45/23 46/16 47/23 129/16 trust [12] 38/19 180/3 68/8 88/10 89/12 99/3 48/2 48/5 48/9 48/13 transcript [2] 153/13 54/12 54/22 55/4 underlined [1] 99/9 101/13 102/1 48/20 48/21 49/11 60/22 66/3 85/15 154/4 135/11 102/13 104/16 104/16 77/17 78/17 87/5 85/19 86/1 133/3 underneath [1] 13/6 transcript's [1] 104/19 105/6 105/13 133/10 133/18 103/21 113/22 135/4 153/12 underpinned [2] 107/9 110/6 127/21 140/15 140/20 141/2 transfer [5] 207/19 24/10 24/17 trusting [1] 67/18 141/16 144/17 161/20 141/9 141/25 142/25 207/23 209/7 210/2 try [35] 34/20 41/3 understand [39] 1/22 162/17 163/23 167/13 143/2 143/20 143/23 210/3 42/22 52/7 54/13 3/21 5/7 16/7 38/19 173/9 173/13 173/15 144/18 145/9 145/16 51/6 54/17 55/14 61/9 transferring [1] 54/22 84/20 85/12 175/10 175/18 175/19 145/20 145/23 146/10 121/17 135/14 138/5 139/7 61/20 62/3 72/10 77/9

(88) through... - understand

U understand... [26] 87/24 89/8 91/19 96/2 96/25 97/16 98/21 121/25 123/13 131/21 139/7 142/13 147/10 148/21 149/11 151/15 158/6 161/5 178/5 188/5 190/1 197/16 200/23 205/22 209/22 210/10 understandably [3] 191/8 195/23 198/12 understanding [40] 4/18 5/5 23/14 68/16 68/17 73/1 73/10 87/9 92/14 92/15 98/24 105/9 105/13 106/8 119/24 121/1 122/21 128/6 142/4 142/16 145/24 148/7 149/6 149/16 149/24 150/10 151/8 151/24 154/18 161/18 163/1 163/18 177/23 191/11 192/25 198/19 203/5 207/4 207/6 207/18 understood [18] 54/25 92/10 116/12 143/21 148/11 150/11 150/13 150/14 152/25 153/4 153/4 161/9 164/7 164/16 178/1 180/4 185/14 214/3 undertake [2] 54/19 130/17 undertaken [1] 155/8 undertook [1] 158/18 undoubtedly [5] 145/12 184/15 185/5 185/8 205/18 undue [1] 61/14 unhappy [1] 94/1 unhelpful [1] 167/20 **Union [1]** 87/4 unique [1] 22/24 unit [1] 53/11 **United [5]** 42/25 156/4 171/6 194/5 213/11 United Kingdom [4] 42/25 171/6 194/5 213/11 United Nations [1] unknown [1] 198/18 unless [2] 68/4 122/10 unlike [1] 5/24 unprecedented [1] 55/9

unreasonably [1]

188/9

unreservedly [1] 114/21 unsure [1] 198/12 until [21] 3/16 8/10 13/23 15/8 23/7 31/6 53/2 54/11 58/4 65/9 65/13 79/24 97/12 101/1 123/21 136/16 137/6 154/17 173/13 179/5 214/17 unusual [4] 55/9 102/16 163/15 187/14 **Unusually [1]** 51/22 unwell [1] 61/15 unwillingness [1] 91/12 **up [63]** 1/13 6/1 11/19 14/19 23/7 27/10 34/10 34/16 35/22 36/22 37/12 37/18 47/14 48/16 48/25 49/6 53/1 58/8 60/15 60/18 66/20 72/25 78/10 89/7 91/17 93/10 93/11 109/8 109/14 112/20 123/21 134/24 140/3 143/6 153/23 154/2 155/14 160/18 166/20 user [1] 118/8 169/2 170/11 171/5 173/10 174/4 177/17 179/5 180/2 182/15 187/11 187/24 189/5 190/11 192/4 195/7 196/7 196/8 198/2 199/25 202/4 206/19 210/22 210/24 213/7 update [5] 17/20 54/5 utter [1] 38/3 57/11 57/24 61/6 updated [3] 121/22 130/13 199/24 upholding [1] 133/1 uploaded [3] 74/25 77/10 125/11 upon [12] 19/2 89/21 106/16 107/21 133/2 148/23 152/11 152/18 vaccine [12] 177/11 157/8 167/21 173/3 209/22 urgent [4] 100/18 105/18 173/8 184/19 us [54] 11/23 28/24 33/13 34/17 34/18 37/18 41/1 41/19 43/13 43/23 45/3 45/4 46/9 47/17 49/5 49/14 58/23 66/15 71/16 80/20 99/6 105/1 109/19 109/24 113/8 118/22 120/9 123/6 181/18 182/8 186/1 124/23 125/19 126/2 186/2 186/5 186/11 126/4 128/6 128/23

130/12 133/17 134/25

135/13 141/19 145/3

145/5 151/24 152/22 153/1 154/7 155/10 156/3 156/14 166/17 194/2 197/25 203/2 203/20 208/12 usage [2] 118/25 119/25 use [21] 2/12 10/7 44/4 68/25 81/23 82/12 82/17 82/23 83/8 86/24 118/10 129/13 139/10 149/12 79/22 149/16 149/20 150/17 157/15 167/8 175/13 180/20 206/1 207/20 used [28] 1/25 37/3 81/12 81/14 84/17 84/19 116/21 118/11 119/2 119/6 119/10 119/20 120/5 120/12 123/21 130/10 150/8 150/20 157/18 159/7 164/2 178/23 180/21 182/10 194/19 196/2 209/13 213/14 useful [2] 51/15 75/13 useless [1] 73/12 using [5] 76/3 87/2 150/6 152/16 196/1 usual [6] 11/5 12/9 94/21 106/10 130/19 184/10 usually [6] 115/8 122/11 131/4 132/17 145/3 170/4 utterly [1] 43/1 vaccination [12] 174/5 177/25 180/3 181/6 181/23 182/1 182/7 182/14 182/19 195/17 203/11 205/8 177/13 181/20 183/2 198/18 199/8 203/5 203/7 205/12 205/12 205/14 210/19 vaccines [2] 188/12 199/1 vague [1] 45/3 value [1] 108/3 values [1] 67/17 variant [27] 159/12 170/21 171/1 171/23 172/10 174/3 174/10 177/20 178/5 180/9

197/18 197/19 198/9

198/10 198/23 199/2

205/11 205/11 variants [1] 174/12 variety [2] 102/23 108/2 various [11] 55/2 99/3 105/25 114/24 142/21 160/4 179/14 202/5 208/21 208/22 210/14 vast [7] 52/17 52/19 164/5 164/14 vein [1] 203/15 ventilation [1] 191/24 venting [2] 167/7 168/11 verbally [2] 58/24 132/9 verbatim [2] 78/2 130/21 versa [1] 143/21 versed [1] 84/23 versus [1] 197/10 vertical [1] 164/1 very [112] 8/25 9/7 12/17 14/7 16/4 16/18 16/18 17/3 18/9 18/17 22/20 23/10 23/16 23/16 34/18 35/22 36/6 38/17 39/2 40/4 40/22 41/2 42/4 46/3 48/14 48/22 49/6 51/4 viruses [3] 170/6 51/10 55/8 56/2 66/14 67/10 67/24 75/22 80/1 80/22 80/25 90/19 90/22 94/15 94/15 102/16 104/12 104/13 105/6 105/6 108/5 108/20 110/4 110/8 112/7 113/17 114/9 117/14 117/14 118/22 119/19 130/5 132/1 135/16 136/9 136/14 137/20 139/3 141/4 142/14 142/17 147/16 147/25 148/1 148/5 148/8 148/9 148/12 149/11 149/23 Wales [8] 40/24 42/1 150/10 152/22 153/16 154/8 155/6 158/2 159/21 160/12 160/12 walked [1] 169/21 160/13 160/13 167/14 want [27] 3/23 18/3 170/15 172/13 174/2 176/17 176/23 178/19 179/24 188/24 190/7 191/7 192/8 192/18 201/6 201/6 203/6 205/21 209/13 209/18 213/23 214/1 214/1 214/9 214/9 via [5] 115/8 115/9 120/2 128/22 149/4 vice [1] 143/21

199/16 202/21 203/8

vice versa [1] 143/21 video [1] 41/9 view [20] 7/6 12/20 13/4 13/21 14/5 17/2 22/5 25/1 40/4 61/11 67/14 76/6 78/24 87/9 150/16 167/4 192/13 208/24 209/19 209/23 viewpoints [2] 19/5 149/12 views [3] 9/21 26/19 94/11 virtually [4] 103/10 175/3 180/25 205/16 virulent [2] 172/11 172/21 virus [46] 23/5 54/20 90/18 102/12 103/7 103/13 105/10 111/2 136/2 136/22 137/1 138/1 139/8 143/7 159/12 159/12 159/15 164/20 171/1 171/23 173/23 173/24 174/4 177/3 177/9 177/10 177/24 178/2 178/3 178/18 180/7 180/9 182/15 182/24 182/25 183/4 185/21 186/9 191/23 194/17 195/1 195/9 195/22 204/15 207/3 208/20 174/6 174/14 voice [8] 1/13 129/9 129/13 129/14 129/18 129/20 130/16 130/22 voices [1] 104/3 voluntarily [2] 69/4 70/15 volunteer [1] 83/7 vulnerable [1] 61/13 W

wait [2] 78/21 185/7 waiting [8] 20/25 21/2 32/22 47/9 185/1 185/1 186/20 189/10 42/16 46/23 47/14 48/10 141/22 143/24 18/4 18/14 21/14 22/11 23/12 35/25 37/12 39/19 42/3 43/17 45/10 46/10 49/19 60/15 68/19 68/24 76/13 87/4 90/7 90/12 100/8 160/14 189/9 189/18 203/20 wanted [31] 1/11 1/23 2/21 13/8 14/1 24/11 25/23 25/23

156/20 159/7 159/9 124/8 125/7 125/12 W we'll [6] 27/18 31/23 well known [1] 60/11 95/12 108/24 120/16 well-established [1] 159/17 160/20 161/8 125/25 128/10 129/25 wanted... [23] 27/20 126/13 180/6 161/9 162/22 163/1 130/4 131/19 134/11 34/19 35/12 37/1 41/5 we're [25] 10/23 wellbeing [3] 184/2 165/11 167/3 167/6 138/11 138/12 139/19 43/10 44/3 44/12 19/23 32/13 36/23 184/6 186/25 168/19 168/20 171/8 139/20 140/8 141/3 44/17 52/23 56/12 37/7 37/21 42/8 42/21 Welsh [1] 36/14 171/20 175/19 175/23 142/18 142/19 142/24 56/12 59/7 62/25 48/25 57/4 57/8 58/23 Welsh Government 176/5 176/5 177/11 143/2 143/17 148/4 67/11 78/8 83/11 [1] 36/14 179/9 180/9 180/13 149/19 154/7 162/2 60/21 87/11 94/21 110/7 136/14 142/3 128/15 141/3 148/15 went [11] 25/19 180/19 181/21 181/25 162/24 163/23 164/6 163/19 202/14 203/2 165/5 165/7 165/8 34/14 61/6 118/21 182/6 182/9 182/22 153/16 154/2 177/8 wanting [2] 40/6 179/8 179/17 179/18 124/7 124/8 143/4 183/22 187/23 187/23 167/7 174/10 175/17 213/6 149/19 191/17 194/19 188/9 189/17 191/3 175/22 176/18 177/17 196/20 wants [8] 46/10 47/6 we've [26] 3/10 43/10 197/13 191/10 193/2 195/4 177/20 178/18 179/16 76/13 76/14 81/19 53/12 67/2 69/12 72/5 were [363] 196/3 196/11 196/21 180/10 182/3 182/8 109/19 109/24 190/13 72/6 74/22 80/13 weren't [9] 36/9 197/4 198/1 199/24 182/11 182/19 183/25 warned [1] 169/8 83/20 98/14 98/16 73/22 80/9 82/3 84/19 202/6 202/20 203/20 184/11 184/25 185/19 warning [3] 37/1 103/16 121/12 125/2 86/8 107/12 123/17 207/17 209/23 209/24 195/16 196/24 197/7 150/9 150/15 128/14 134/18 169/16 136/16 209/25 213/1 213/8 198/7 198/9 198/21 warnings [1] 151/9 213/9 170/22 172/1 172/9 what [207] 6/23 7/8 199/14 205/7 205/9 was [717] 10/9 11/17 12/11 13/1 what's [7] 16/20 176/14 176/22 204/8 205/10 207/18 207/21 wasn't [23] 14/4 15/7 208/3 211/15 207/22 208/10 209/3 14/12 15/16 16/13 20/15 23/24 29/22 16/25 24/3 24/19 wear [1] 164/18 16/25 17/19 18/7 18/7 47/2 57/13 133/17 209/3 209/5 209/25 27/16 30/5 39/20 wearing [2] 165/9 18/8 20/21 22/8 22/10 whatever [6] 73/10 211/3 211/4 213/18 39/21 40/5 41/8 52/13 195/24 22/12 22/13 22/15 86/10 114/1 139/10 whens [1] 72/11 68/6 137/10 156/10 23/15 23/17 23/18 139/11 141/24 Webinar [2] 153/13 where [77] 7/4 8/2 165/9 173/25 174/22 8/17 9/23 12/23 18/10 23/19 24/13 24/23 whatsapp [50] 2/14 153/13 180/21 196/10 196/20 24/24 26/10 27/12 19/3 19/8 26/5 26/8 weddings [14] 11/1 10/18 12/17 13/10 209/13 210/12 15/5 17/4 19/23 36/25 27/16 28/1 28/4 28/24 26/16 31/3 31/8 35/19 11/10 11/16 12/24 watch [6] 63/16 15/6 15/11 15/12 29/14 29/25 30/4 32/1 38/6 47/1 53/12 69/2 36/16 42/6 42/9 42/12 64/17 66/5 189/4 15/12 16/1 16/9 16/20 32/4 32/5 32/5 32/5 69/5 70/5 70/15 74/22 44/7 44/8 55/18 55/20 189/9 189/23 17/12 75/18 76/4 32/8 34/1 34/3 34/15 56/5 56/7 56/11 57/7 75/4 77/9 79/5 79/15 watched [4] 85/23 Wednesday [1] 47/17 34/18 34/19 36/23 80/13 80/19 81/15 67/25 72/15 73/23 85/24 133/24 161/11 week [7] 4/13 18/6 38/18 38/21 39/7 41/5 83/20 108/10 108/16 75/10 83/20 83/25 wave [10] 171/22 32/7 53/19 90/17 41/6 41/8 43/21 43/23 113/25 114/19 118/8 86/7 99/6 99/18 172/2 172/3 172/12 175/18 181/1 44/17 45/10 45/15 118/12 119/4 119/12 100/23 101/16 104/22 172/15 172/25 173/23 week's [1] 103/5 46/8 49/5 49/15 50/14 119/20 120/2 120/3 105/9 107/13 110/25 173/24 178/13 180/7 weeks [1] 168/23 53/17 53/17 53/25 120/12 124/5 124/8 111/8 112/1 117/16 waves [4] 170/20 53/25 54/9 55/17 124/12 126/14 128/19 123/18 132/1 132/8 weighing [1] 34/10 172/14 173/1 180/10 132/14 134/25 136/1 56/16 56/21 57/4 129/1 129/4 129/8 weight [1] 29/25 way [**57**] 10/24 21/9 131/16 166/16 166/17 137/1 137/4 138/1 well [74] 7/1 20/6 57/15 57/19 57/24 22/17 23/2 32/7 32/16 23/22 25/3 39/20 58/22 60/1 60/5 60/6 205/24 206/1 208/3 140/2 140/20 141/5 32/16 44/3 47/2 66/18 40/25 58/6 60/6 60/11 60/7 60/7 61/21 62/3 WhatsApps [6] 71/23 142/24 145/1 146/8 66/22 67/12 75/8 78/2 71/18 84/22 86/16 63/18 66/10 66/20 118/5 119/6 175/6 146/9 146/10 146/22 78/7 85/18 87/13 86/19 87/24 102/1 146/24 151/18 158/17 66/23 67/6 67/16 187/18 206/4 87/25 101/24 103/24 whatsoever [2] 102/9 103/2 110/23 70/17 77/5 80/3 81/3 160/5 161/14 163/25 110/2 113/11 114/14 111/2 112/3 122/16 81/7 81/11 82/1 82/1 113/24 149/18 168/9 171/14 174/12 118/3 121/12 122/10 129/13 131/3 133/24 83/3 85/21 85/22 when [127] 2/1 8/21 174/13 178/4 194/9 125/4 125/4 125/6 10/4 12/12 15/12 17/1 136/9 136/10 143/5 86/16 87/16 89/23 195/7 198/14 199/22 125/20 132/13 140/7 143/8 143/21 147/3 90/24 92/6 92/9 92/10 19/10 19/14 20/12 whereas [5] 150/2 140/9 143/12 146/1 148/16 150/13 152/25 92/15 93/2 98/18 22/9 22/24 27/7 30/18 150/14 150/20 150/23 148/18 149/10 158/6 153/3 153/4 160/6 99/24 100/17 106/14 35/18 39/10 39/15 172/3 160/15 165/4 167/19 161/11 161/15 161/17 107/14 111/24 114/20 41/5 41/22 44/12 wheres [1] 72/11 172/21 172/23 174/7 164/7 164/15 166/8 115/23 119/1 119/2 46/22 48/21 52/16 whether [55] 7/18 174/11 177/25 180/3 167/5 170/2 171/15 120/9 121/23 121/24 55/7 55/23 60/20 7/18 11/10 14/18 180/4 184/14 188/9 174/3 176/3 178/9 122/21 123/15 126/3 61/14 62/11 65/5 14/19 18/23 25/14 191/18 195/17 196/18 180/2 180/3 180/4 126/24 131/22 135/13 68/19 70/3 70/20 71/2 25/15 27/9 27/9 35/6 208/3 211/19 213/3 180/4 180/4 180/6 135/24 137/16 137/17 72/2 79/18 87/2 89/25 45/12 49/9 56/22 213/21 180/16 181/9 183/18 137/18 139/4 139/7 90/8 91/15 92/2 97/15 64/24 68/9 73/19 77/6 ways [3] 41/13 184/9 185/25 188/17 139/14 139/18 139/25 97/18 99/10 99/23 77/19 78/18 78/22 131/13 137/22 191/20 193/3 193/11 140/7 140/18 140/23 99/24 101/5 101/13 81/9 81/9 85/17 we [427] 195/17 195/18 195/18 141/1 141/6 142/3 102/1 102/13 110/3 107/20 112/2 117/18 we'd [7] 44/20 50/23 199/14 201/6 202/17 143/10 145/11 145/11 110/6 110/10 111/2 118/2 126/6 128/18 112/1 180/1 193/11 203/8 203/11 209/14 111/11 115/15 120/23 146/15 146/19 150/11 129/24 142/21 143/18 194/17 195/9 210/1 212/24 152/14 153/9 155/19 121/11 124/3 124/7 150/23 151/2 151/15

(90) wanted... - whether

W whether... [19] 151/19 152/17 153/14 157/6 159/7 182/9 188/16 188/17 190/2 190/20 191/16 192/17 198/25 202/11 208/12 209/18 210/17 212/20 213/6 which [157] 2/11 3/18 6/12 10/7 10/7 13/7 14/7 15/9 16/14 19/2 19/17 22/3 23/2 28/12 30/16 37/13 41/13 41/21 42/20 43/5 49/25 51/19 52/4 53/14 56/15 56/17 59/5 61/8 62/25 67/2 74/22 75/8 87/3 87/14 87/22 89/4 91/2 92/7 97/3 98/12 98/25 99/25 100/13 101/7 101/22 103/17 103/24 105/2 105/16 106/16 107/11 108/7 108/10 108/20 108/24 109/4 109/6 110/21 111/15 111/16 112/9 112/10 112/10 112/25 114/12 114/14 118/3 118/22 121/22 125/18 125/19 125/24 128/14 130/12 131/7 133/2 133/6 134/11 134/18 136/3 136/14 136/15 139/21 140/8 140/9 140/13 144/1 144/9 145/9 145/23 146/1 148/22 149/2 151/13 152/10 152/15 154/23 154/25 155/8 155/14 155/17 156/19 156/20 158/6 166/12 167/22 168/16 169/7 169/25 170/10 170/11 171/22 172/24 173/3 173/22 175/6 175/11 176/9 176/13 176/15 178/8 179/18 182/20 183/17 184/18 187/11 187/21 189/21 190/15 190/19 191/13 191/16 191/20 191/22 191/25 192/2 192/17 193/4 193/7 193/15 193/21 194/16 197/18 197/24 199/9 199/12 200/2 200/19 201/3 201/15 201/23 202/7 202/10 202/18 206/4 211/1 211/20 while [6] 38/23 148/15 169/4 177/8 189/4 198/15

whilst [2] 89/11 93/20 white [1] 151/14 who [71] 5/13 9/11 20/9 21/22 23/21 33/13 34/20 41/9 52/6 53/16 53/22 55/10 57/4 60/12 61/12 63/12 63/21 64/9 64/16 65/1 66/5 67/13 70/4 78/19 78/23 80/6 82/1 82/8 83/18 86/10 86/24 87/4 90/14 91/9 win [2] 45/23 45/23 91/12 94/19 97/9 100/8 100/9 104/10 108/2 108/17 112/9 114/22 119/13 122/8 130/14 140/16 142/5 143/14 156/12 175/3 176/3 176/5 183/7 184/4 184/4 190/21 192/7 197/7 198/17 202/6 207/10 207/15 207/17 208/15 208/25 209/1 209/21 210/11 213/4 who's [1] 210/9 whoever [1] 123/3 whole [10] 42/23 53/19 108/4 131/16 147/17 154/19 161/11 177/16 201/25 213/13 whom [5] 118/23 128/21 167/21 168/8 174/25 whose [3] 51/12 91/8 152/20 why [47] 16/6 16/8 17/12 25/9 35/21 36/7 36/17 36/24 38/18 54/15 54/25 55/14 58/22 60/16 61/9 63/14 71/12 72/15 78/13 79/14 87/24 89/19 89/19 89/22 90/3 90/10 90/11 90/16 104/9 115/2 115/21 133/21 141/16 149/8 156/6 156/13 173/23 178/15 180/21 181/21 185/11 186/3 196/4 202/24 207/8 213/18 213/20 whys [1] 72/11 wide [4] 47/23 48/2 161/18 188/13 wider [5] 38/12 46/10 107/21 110/17 121/8 wonder [2] 47/12 wife's [1] 210/8 100/3 will [52] 10/20 11/22 wondering [1] 16/19 16/19 17/17 153/14 18/9 20/1 20/19 22/10 word [5] 31/16 130/21 159/7 207/20 23/19 28/11 28/17

37/1 49/1 56/18 58/24

209/12

59/6 59/11 63/2 94/20 wording [1] 116/21 104/17 104/20 107/24 words [1] 66/2 114/1 116/19 117/16 121/25 126/13 126/14 28/20 30/23 30/25 127/1 127/6 133/25 134/3 142/5 147/22 154/3 160/23 171/14 189/8 189/12 190/14 190/16 195/6 196/22 199/24 200/22 206/4 206/5 208/7 208/16 208/22 214/13 win-win [1] 45/23 window [2] 199/25 200/3 winter [5] 173/10 174/9 174/12 179/5 179/6 wise [1] 189/22 wish [3] 81/7 169/23 206/17 wished [2] 106/14 113/10 withdrawn [1] 201/18 withdrew [2] 94/17 214/15 within [40] 3/13 9/1 16/25 17/3 29/20 42/23 52/2 61/5 77/8 89/10 89/15 92/11 98/12 99/11 102/21 103/17 103/21 103/24 would [418] 104/3 104/6 105/3 106/6 106/15 112/15 116/12 118/23 125/4 126/15 132/6 135/15 136/11 138/22 149/5 151/3 181/7 182/23 183/18 184/19 201/22 206/24 without [16] 7/5 14/25 23/1 24/22 47/13 60/1 102/17 102/18 105/3 105/4 149/17 149/21 150/6 150/25 169/1 204/16 witness [4] 94/17 94/18 95/6 214/15 witnesses [6] 27/19 35/2 100/12 118/22 155/15 171/20 wizardry [1] 124/12 won't [6] 7/24 47/13 78/9 122/1 195/4 195/8

work [29] 3/21 22/5 39/1 41/3 42/22 50/3 50/17 50/17 51/4 51/10 51/14 52/6 53/18 54/3 86/13 86/25 88/17 144/24 146/9 152/21 155/8 158/16 165/20 166/3 177/10 199/1 worked [9] 6/2 6/6 30/21 30/24 50/25 90/7 99/19 101/4 140/9 working [11] 9/9 31/19 40/11 40/12 53/25 65/3 80/10 119/14 144/21 146/4 200/12 works [1] 57/9 world [4] 23/11 34/7 46/10 75/9 worlds [2] 195/7 195/11 worry [1] 188/5 worst [4] 135/5 136/8 195/6 195/11 worst-case [2] 135/5 136/8 worth [3] 43/20 51/24 67/23 wouldn't [23] 17/5 18/14 24/8 26/25 35/8 55/18 65/14 85/19 106/23 107/7 123/20 130/20 131/14 137/24 138/9 138/14 141/5 160/25 164/22 175/24 180/5 181/4 193/16 wrap [1] 163/3 wrapping [1] 109/14 write [2] 75/3 190/14 writing [4] 26/19 51/21 190/15 212/18 written [5] 33/5 76/8 76/11 177/14 212/20 wrong [6] 91/21 91/22 147/23 155/24 191/4 196/10 wrote [1] 36/2 **XYZ [1]** 213/24 yeah [18] 3/9 9/15

93/8 109/13 119/16

199/21 213/22

119/17 124/2 170/13

123/24 155/16 157/2 171/10 171/21 174/15 179/4 181/24 185/8 195/9 195/22 201/25 years [9] 6/3 28/7 51/23 82/4 154/18 189/10 191/4 191/15 210/22 **Yep [4]** 47/16 190/23 200/16 203/23 yes [164] 1/24 3/1 3/15 3/22 4/3 4/22 5/10 5/19 6/8 6/8 6/11 7/23 7/23 8/14 8/16 8/19 8/24 10/11 10/14 12/6 19/8 19/19 19/21 20/5 26/9 28/5 29/1 29/24 33/6 33/13 33/24 34/25 37/4 37/9 40/3 40/7 40/9 43/16 44/20 45/4 46/3 49/13 53/6 53/11 57/3 58/21 58/25 63/9 65/25 71/5 71/10 72/18 72/22 72/22 72/24 74/21 75/2 79/8 80/25 81/22 104/1 106/20 108/24 109/22 110/12 111/20 113/2 114/5 114/7 116/19 117/6 118/4 118/14 118/18 118/19 120/22 121/10 121/15 121/20 123/11 124/22 125/7 125/14 125/23 126/8 127/19 127/20 128/10 131/23 133/5 135/20 139/24 139/25 140/1 140/6 140/25 143/16 144/1 144/7 144/7 144/14 144/20 146/22 147/8 147/14 148/24 149/7 153/11 154/19 154/21 155/1 155/1 155/4 155/23 156/1 156/2 158/9 158/13 159/9 161/24 161/25 162/16 164/21 164/24 165/7 165/13 165/18 170/3 170/18 170/22 171/3 171/11 171/25 172/8 172/18 173/2 173/7 173/15 175/3 175/9 175/14 175/15 183/21 186/12 187/5 187/8 187/16 187/24 190/9 192/7 198/5 199/4 199/5 18/25 33/1 39/2 43/20 199/11 200/17 202/14 55/1 55/3 56/14 58/19 202/24 203/18 206/3 206/11 209/10 209/10 210/5 213/10 yet [1] 90/18

year [17] 22/15 31/2

31/21 32/2 104/22

92/1 93/15 94/16 95/10 95/20 96/5 you [764] 96/16 97/22 98/16 you know [37] 7/2 99/6 103/14 105/15 7/10 13/19 14/8 19/13 108/25 109/6 109/14 23/15 36/3 41/19 44/5 109/21 113/16 113/17 45/1 48/25 54/2 55/8 114/4 114/6 116/11 58/24 60/10 60/12 118/5 118/11 119/4 61/10 62/13 64/23 120/10 120/13 120/21 67/22 67/23 67/24 121/1 121/25 122/12 68/3 71/25 74/7 75/6 122/21 122/23 123/2 75/22 76/13 76/20 123/3 123/13 123/16 77/3 78/1 78/6 78/20 123/25 125/9 125/17 80/25 87/12 88/19 126/5 128/2 128/5 93/25 128/7 129/4 129/8 you know: we [1] 130/10 130/14 130/15 49/16 130/16 130/17 132/1 you'd [2] 44/22 170/5 132/9 136/11 138/22 you'll [9] 27/7 32/9 139/21 140/10 140/14 42/5 47/4 109/16 142/15 145/15 146/5 141/14 169/7 176/13 147/15 148/21 149/6 196/13 154/18 155/1 159/2 **you're [39]** 1/8 5/17 160/20 162/3 162/6 22/13 22/25 28/14 162/17 162/18 165/25 28/15 35/21 41/24 166/1 166/12 167/4 45/15 45/24 45/25 168/18 168/21 169/18 52/17 55/20 56/5 170/14 170/24 171/2 66/11 66/15 77/23 172/7 172/16 173/1 78/1 81/3 83/7 91/6 174/18 175/11 175/12 91/16 101/20 117/6 175/13 176/7 176/7 126/11 126/23 127/15 179/8 183/2 183/18 132/2 142/22 144/18 184/13 186/10 186/18 151/12 156/16 162/11 190/1 193/18 193/20 162/17 166/1 175/17 194/22 197/23 198/6 177/19 184/12 198/22 202/14 203/13 205/22 you've [24] 1/17 19/1 207/18 208/9 209/6 19/1 28/7 29/19 53/1 209/23 209/23 209/25 59/13 61/1 74/18 yourself [17] 10/19 91/25 101/7 105/1 24/24 37/12 56/17 108/9 126/1 130/12 69/9 69/23 78/25 99/3 136/14 152/12 161/4 108/17 113/15 125/1 170/9 183/17 191/12 166/18 173/4 178/23 191/13 191/15 209/22 181/2 187/20 197/18 younger [1] 155/21 Yousaf [5] 95/7 95/8 your [185] 1/12 1/13 95/15 158/18 215/13 1/20 2/5 2/8 2/14 2/18 2/21 2/22 3/11 3/24 4/18 4/25 5/23 6/5 zero [1] 50/25 6/12 7/24 9/16 10/2 **zone [16]** 187/17 10/11 10/14 13/20 189/22 191/6 191/16 14/5 19/23 21/7 21/14 191/17 192/3 192/12 22/6 23/7 26/11 27/22 193/2 193/5 195/21 31/24 32/1 32/11 196/13 196/14 197/7 32/17 33/2 33/20 197/8 197/9 197/13 33/25 35/24 36/8 zones [1] 187/7 36/25 37/5 40/1 44/20 49/9 49/19 49/23 50/6 50/14 51/6 51/9 52/25 53/15 58/12 63/1 66/2 66/13 69/4 69/6 71/2 72/25 74/5 74/6 74/18 74/24 76/4 77/9 78/8 78/14 78/15 80/14 89/7 89/25 90/2 90/16